November 25, 2020

Ms. Rose Zibert, Acting Regional Administrator
United States Department of Labor
Employment and Training Administration
John C. Kluczynski Building, 6th Floor
230 South Dearborn Street
Chicago, IL 60604-1505

Dear Ms. Zibert:

I am pleased to submit the State of Michigan’s Program Year 2019 Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act Statewide Performance Report Narrative. The information contained in the report was assembled in accordance with the United States Department of Labor Training and Employment Guidance Letter 05-18, issued on November 7, 2018.

If you have questions regarding the report, please contact Ms. Krista Johnson, Division Administrator, Talent Development Division at 517-582-1392 or via email at johnsonk2@michigan.gov. Thank you.

Sincerely,

Stephanie Beckhorn, Director
Workforce Development

SB:VB:ph
cc: Danielle Waddell
    Tommy Ouyang
    Mike Wurmlinger
    Krista Johnson
    Chelsea Mates
    Matt Shields
    WIOA State Coordinators
Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act

Annual Statewide Performance Report Narrative
Program Year 2019
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Michigan’s priorities include key actions necessary to improve equity and access to workforce programming resulting in greater opportunities for economic mobility for our state’s citizens. The Michigan Department of Labor and Economic Opportunity, Workforce Development’s (LEO-WD’s) goal is to promote a flexible, innovative, and effective workforce system within the State of Michigan. Enhancement strategies include developing, retaining, attracting, and matching an exceptional talent base using guidance based on the needs of Michigan’s employers. To accomplish this, WD supports a demand-driven workforce system, assists the structurally unemployed with financial independence, advocates for the integration of workforce development into the K-12 school system, and supports the alignment of workforce development with economic development efforts.

The Governor’s State Workforce Board plays a vital role in ensuring the Governor’s vision and strategic goals are achieved while working with the WD to meet regulatory responsibilities as prescribed by federal statute and regulation. This includes the development and updating of comprehensive state performance and accountability measures to assess the effectiveness of the Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) core program services to job seekers, customers, and employers.

This report is an assessment of performance outcomes for workforce investment activities involving four performance accountability indicators applied to adults, dislocated workers, and youth. Additionally, this report narrative describes progress toward meeting Michigan’s strategic vision and goals to ensure a skilled workforce which includes the alignment of policies, operations and administrative systems to avoid duplication of workforce programs and activities, as well as providing a way to leverage discretionary funding and formula-based investment across all programs. Our collaboration with workforce agencies, employers, economic developers, post-secondary education providers and other partners with shared interests provides us with opportunities to leverage partner funds for services not funded under the WIOA.

SERVICE DELIVERY

The Michigan Works! System was the first unified workforce development system in the United States and is an integral partner in developing Michigan’s economic future. The system is demand-driven, locally responsive, and ready to meet the needs of each community. Every year, the Michigan Works! System serves nearly four million customers. The WIOA Title I Adult, Dislocated Worker and Youth funds and Title III Wagner-Peyser funds are an integral part of that impact. The WIOA funding is annually allocated by formula to Michigan’s 16 local Michigan Works! Agencies (MWAs). The MWAs must submit annual plans to the WD for approval.

The WIOA programs are designed to strengthen and improve our state and nation’s public workforce system. The WIOA presents an extraordinary opportunity to improve job and career options for our state’s workers and job seekers through an integrated, job-driven public workforce system that links diverse talent to businesses through continuous improvement supported through evaluation, accountability, identification of best practices and data-driven decision-making.

Services

Eligibility for the WIOA programming is determined based on standards set forth in Part 680 of the 20 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) for adults and dislocated workers and Part 681 for youth. Program services are provided through the state’s American Job Centers. Services available under the WIOA for adults and dislocated workers include:

- Basic career services are available to anyone who comes in to the One-Stop center. Services include, but are not limited to, general and program information, outreach, intake and orientation, basic assessments and information and meaningful assistance in filing for unemployment compensation.
- Individualized career services include, but are not limited to, comprehensive and specialized assessments, development of an individual employment plan, individualized or group counseling, career planning/case management and short-term pre-vocational services.
- Training services for those who qualify include work-based training or occupational training activities. For occupational training activities, participants use an “individual training account” to select an appropriate training program from a qualified training provider.
- Business services include, but are not limited to, activities provided to WIOA participants such as screening and referrals of qualified participants to job openings employers may have, and activities provided to employers such as the development, convening or implementation of industry sector partnerships, and
working with training providers and businesses to develop in-demand training programs to address employer needs.

Services available to WIOA Youth include: tutoring; alternative secondary school offerings; paid or unpaid work experiences including internships and job shadowing; occupational skills training; education offered concurrently with and in the same context as workforce preparation activities; leadership development opportunities; supportive services; adult mentoring; follow-up services; comprehensive guidance and counseling; financial literacy education; entrepreneurial skills training; labor market information services such as career awareness, career counseling, and career exploration services; and activities that help youth prepare for and transition to post-secondary education and training.

**Benchmarks**

Success in accomplishing the purposes of the WIOA at the State, local, and regional levels will be assessed by whether:

- One-Stop centers are recognized as valuable community resources and are known for high-quality, comprehensive services for customers;
- The core programs and One-Stop centers provide seamless integrated customer service;
- Program performance, labor market information and related data drive policy and strategic decisions and inform customer choice;
- Youth programs reconnect out-of-school youth to education and jobs;
- Job seekers access quality career services either online or in a One-Stop center;
- One-Stop centers facilitate access to high-quality, innovative education and training; and
- Services to businesses are robust and effective, meeting business’ workforce needs across the business lifecycle.

These benchmarks, as measured by the WIOA performance measures, serve as indicators to track progress toward meeting the federal and State goals and vision for the workforce system. The performance accountability system is used by the State to assess the effectiveness of the State and local areas in achieving continuous improvement of workforce investment activities to optimize the return on investment of WIOA funds.

Additional related strategic goals and key actions necessary in alignment with Governor Gretchen Whitmer’s priorities and the State’s WIOA Unified Plan include:

- The implementation of evidence-based programs and strategies;
- Progress toward closing the economic inequity gap;
- Placing more of Michigan’s citizens on the path to high-wage skills;
- Assisting the structurally unemployed by offering services tailored to meet individual needs;
- Improving employment outcomes for individuals with disabilities;
- Meeting Governor Whitmer’s statewide post-secondary education goal of 60 percent of Michigan residents completing a post-secondary certificate or degree by the year 2030;
- Focus on K-12 education to improve achievement in Michigan schools; and
- Increased college readiness.

**Target Populations**

The WIOA prioritizes special populations, focusing on serving individuals with barriers to success in the labor market as defined in WIOA Section 3(24), and seeks to ensure access to quality services for these populations. For example, priority for adults receiving career and training services must be given to veterans, public assistance recipients, other low-income individuals and individuals who are basic skills deficient.
Key Partnerships
Strong partnerships help to leverage Michigan’s WIOA resources and increase opportunities for job seekers and businesses. They have enhanced the ability of our local workforce investment areas to access information and data, improved services, and increased efficiencies with regard to recruitment processes, referrals, and case management. Strong partnerships are critical to provide the most effective, targeted, and appropriate services for youth to maintain progress along a successful career pathway. Key partnerships of note in Michigan that continue to be crucial in Michigan’s success include those with:

- **Title II Adult Education Partners**: Michigan has a robust, integrated employment and training model to leverage Title I and II resources and funding. Further, co-enrollment of Title II participants is strongly encouraged across all Title I and III programs.
- **Title IV Partners**: Michigan’s Title I staff is actively engaged with Michigan Rehabilitation Services and the Bureau of Services for Blind Persons. Michigan partners in the Employment First State Leadership Mentoring Program with a goal to increase competitive integrated employment for individuals with disabilities. Current activities include establishing a common space for business community resources to highlight additional available assistance and streamline the process for the business community to find the resources they want and need to better recruit, employ, and retain individuals with disabilities.
- **Michigan’s Department of Education (MDE)**: Michigan’s Title I staff has partnered with MDE’s Career and Technical Education staff to establish a Career Readiness Initiative workgroup. This group focuses on a wide range of topics such as high-quality credentialing, school to work transitions and seamless connection to workforce services.

**GOVERNOR’S RESERVE FUNDED ACTIVITIES**
During Program Year (PY) 2019, Michigan provided Governor’s Reserve funding to support seven significant projects.

**Summer Young Professionals Initiative**
The purpose of the Summer Young Professionals initiative is to reduce youth unemployment and increase career preparedness by introducing underrepresented young adults, ages 14-24, to the world of work while providing participants and their families with income. Young adults were supported with stipends for career exploration and preparation or wages earned for participation in work experiences. Services provided through this initiative placed young adults on the right path to gain the skills necessary to achieve lifelong economic self-sufficiency.

In accordance with the WIOA, WD allocated WIOA Statewide Activities funding to support the Summer Young Professionals initiative for the timeline of March 1, 2020 through December 31, 2020. The MWAs, which were selected through a Request for Proposal process that concluded in January 2020, received awards of up to $250,000 in WIOA Statewide Activities funding to support the development and/or enhancement of a Summer Young Professionals employment program.

The Summer Young Professionals initiative is not limited to the work experience activity defined at 20 CFR 681.600. Additional activities that support career exploration and preparedness may be funded under the initiative and must be recorded under the appropriate activities in the State’s One-Stop Management Information System (OSMIS). It is permissible to provide services in a virtual capacity.

Although not an exhaustive list, examples of allowable expenditures with funding awarded in this initiative include:

- Wages/stipends paid for participation in a work experience.
- Stipends paid for participation in career exploration or career preparedness activities.
- Staff time working to identify and develop a work experience opportunity, including staff time spent working with employers to identify and develop the work experience.
- Staff time working with employers to ensure a successful work experience, including staff time spent managing the work experience.
- Staff time spent evaluating the work experience.
- Participant work experience and/or related activities orientation sessions.
- Employer work experience orientation sessions.
- Classroom training or the required academic education component directly related to the work experience.
- Incentive payments directly tied to the completion of work experience or classroom training.
• Employability skills/job readiness training to prepare youth for a work experience.
• Supportive services.
• Volunteer and/or community service.

Apprenticeship Success Coordinators
WD allocated funding in 2016 to establish the Apprenticeship Success Coordinators (ASC) function in each of Michigan’s 16 workforce development regions. ASCs drive Registered Apprenticeship (RA) expansion to help ensure Michigan’s short-term and long-term economic success through the cultivation of new RA opportunities in high-wage, in-demand industries, and occupations. They ensure both employers and career seekers gain the full benefit from the RA model by engaging and supporting employers, labor unions, industry and workforce intermediaries and other RA stakeholders to develop and implement comprehensive strategies to support RA expansion. ASCs conduct outreach, and work with employers with a focus on improving underrepresented population inclusion in new RA programs through employer reimbursements, system reform and innovation. ASCs also accelerate the apprentices’ ability to reach full proficiency in their chosen occupation through accelerated skills development in a growing number of sectors while reducing time, effort and cost expended by the employer on registration, recruitment and administration.

In 2019, in order to support continued ASC activities, WD-issued policies have provided WIOA Statewide Activities funding, State Apprenticeship Expansion Continuation Grant funding, and Penalty and Interest funding with a goal to cultivate at least 764 new Registered Apprentices by July 31, 2020. Through this work, as of June 30, 2020, the ASCs leveraged additional funding and resources to support 729 new Registered Apprentices and supported 746 individuals by July 31, 2020.

Michigan Industry Cluster Approach 2.0
The Michigan Industry Cluster Approach 2.0 (MICA 2.0) program is designed to develop new and support existing employer-led collaboratives that represent a variety of key industries around the state including: healthcare, manufacturing, energy, information technology and mobility. These collaboratives are an effective strategy to help fill talent gaps by bringing together employers, educators, and workforce partners.

In 2019, the WD Industry Engagement Division-Sector Strategies team awarded competitive MICA 2.0 grant funding to 16 grantees to support sector-based workforce development activities. MICA 2.0 has brought together over 200 employer representatives who are working together with educators, economic developers, workforce development and community-based partners to address critical talent needs.

By the end of the grant period of May 31, 2021, the following training outcomes are projected: 476 participants and 939 credentials, playing a key role in supporting Governor Gretchen Whitmer’s “Sixty by 30” goal, to increase the number of Michiganders with a post-secondary credential to 60 percent by the year 2030.

Apprenticeship Readiness Training
With many high-profile projects coming to the City of Detroit, including the construction of the Gordie Howe International Bridge, the WD and the Michigan Department of Transportation are committed to working in partnership with the City, the MWA (Detroit Employment Solutions Corporation [DESC]), educators and labor organizations to fill the need for skilled and general labor through an apprenticeship readiness training program; and in the process, assist Detroit residents – especially those who face significant barriers – with access to long-term employment. Services will be provided to approximately 1,000 participants. This funding is set to expire on December 31, 2020.

Funds are supporting:

- Occupational, classroom and/or work-based learning, including apprenticeships;
- Job readiness (soft/employability skills) training;
- Basic skills (literacy/numeracy) training;
- Wrap-around support services; and
- Job placement assistance.
**FastStart Just-in-Time Training**

The FastStart Just-in-Time Training ("FastStart") was created in 2008 via a partnership with Great Lakes Bay Michigan Works! and Delta College to meet local hiring demand for Chemical Process Operators. Since then, FastStart had expanded to include training for other occupations, including solar manufacturing, battery manufacturing, advanced manufacturing, business and customer service, diesel technicians and emergency medical technicians. Funding was awarded to Great Lakes Bay Michigan Works! to further expand the program. The MWA met with employers in a specific industry to determine unmet hiring need and then strategizes on potential training partners. The MWA brought in selected training partner(s) to establish the training and to assure the training was listed on Michigan Training Connect (MiTC), Michigan’s Eligible Training Provider List, as an eligible training provider. Generally, employment rates were around 90 percent for individuals participating in FastStart training, as employers were involved in identifying their hiring needs, the timing of the training, training curriculum and entry/exit requirements. The funding for this project expired on December 31, 2019.

**Fiat Chrysler Automobiles**

WD has established grants with DESC and the Southeast Michigan Community Alliance (SEMCA) for the purpose of supporting Fiat Chrysler Automobiles (FCA) in identifying, preparing and hiring Detroit residents to fill new positions at the Jefferson North Assembly Plant and the Mack Avenue Engine Plant. As a result of the expansion of the Jefferson North Assembly Plant and the Mack Avenue Engine Plant, FCA will be hiring more than 5,000 new employees in Detroit. DESC, the City of Detroit and the State of Michigan are committed to supporting FCA in identifying, preparing, and hiring Detroit residents and applicants surrounding Detroit to fill these new positions. The DESC will develop and implement a comprehensive plan for marketing, outreach, preparation, and screening to assist Detroit residents in obtaining employment with FCA. Detroiters had priority access to jobs for a four-week period in late summer/early Fall of 2019.

SEMCA has been designated as the single point of contact for recruitment outside of the City of Detroit for the skilled trades and salaried workforce needed to launch and sustain FCA’s new plant. Due to the high demand for workers with credentials, FCA anticipates recruitment for these positions will likely require a timeframe extending well into 2020 to reach full capacity. The targeted nature of the recruitment, the technical expertise required, as well as the scale and intensity of the project will require a significant amount of staff time and resources.

**Integrated Education and Training**

WD has allocated funding to support Integrated Education and Training (IET) programs that have already been developed by adult education providers and/or that will be developed jointly by our local MWAs and adult education providers. The intent of IET programming in Michigan is for WIOA Title II adult education providers to partner with a local MWA and/or an existing training provider to co-enroll participants in WIOA Title I and Title II services, when appropriate.

The IET program must be part of a regionally or locally defined career pathway. The IET program must include three required components: (1) adult education and literacy activities, (2) workforce preparation activities and (3) occupational training. The three required components must occur simultaneously within the overall scope of the IET program and must each be of sufficient intensity and quality.

**WIOA WAIVERS**

On January 2, 2018, the following waivers were approved through June 30, 2020, by the United States Department of Labor (USDOL).

**WIOA Youth Program**

On January 2, 2018, Michigan was approved for a waiver for the following:

- A waiver of the requirement to expend 75 percent of WIOA Title I Youth State formula funding on the Out-of-School Youth population.
- A waiver of the requirement that local WIOA Title I Youth funding must meet the 75 percent minimum expenditure requirement.
- A waiver of the requirement to expend 75 percent of WIOA Title I Statewide Activities funding on the out-of-school population.

Michigan was approved to lower the WIOA Out-of-School Youth expenditure minimum percentage to 50 percent for state and local reporting, as well as for the use of Statewide Activities funding to provide direct services to youth.
waiver allows local One-Stop centers to focus additional funding on proactive services to targeted, at-risk in-school youth, such as dropout prevention.

Each of Michigan’s local areas is meeting or exceeding a minimum of 50 percent for Appropriation Year 2019 in compliance with the waiver. The implementation of these waivers has not negatively impacted state or local area performance outcomes, as evidenced in the table below comparing PY 2019 data.

The State tracks these expenditures quarterly and annually in the Management of Awards to Recipients System (MARS). Should any area be identified as at-risk following a quarterly review, technical assistance is available and immediately provided. Contracts were already in place based on the 75 percent out-of-school minimum when the waiver was granted. Changes to program planning and contracts take time to implement, so the effects of the waiver will also take time to evaluate.

Receipt of these waivers has resulted in a significant increase in the percentage of In-School Youth (ISY) participation in work experience activities, as well as a significant increase in the facilitation of dropout prevention efforts. Forty percent of ISY participated in work experience activities in PY 2019 compared to 31.5 percent in PY 2018. Twenty-nine-point one (29.1) percent of ISY participated in tutoring, study skills and dropout prevention services compared to 19.4 percent in PY 2018.

Eligible Training Provider List

On January 2, 2018, Michigan was approved for a waiver of the obligation of eligible training providers to collect performance data on all students in a training program at WIOA Section 116(d)(4)(A) and 122, and 20 CFR 677.230(4) and (5). The waiver allowed the State time to implement reporting requirements for all students via automatic matches with other data sources (not just WIOA participants), while removing the burden on training providers.

Following receipt of the waiver, Training and Employment Guidance Letter (TEGL) 3-18, issued on August 31, 2018, stipulated that second and fourth quarter performance outcomes are not required retroactively, and will not be expected for the Annual Quarterly Reports in October 2020 and 2021 respectively, thereby invalidating the waiver. As of October 12, 2018, MiTC, Michigan’s Eligible Training Provider List, has implemented collection of all required data elements. System integration between Michigan’s OSMIS and MiTC has been implemented to provide the OSMIS with the provider and program information needed to aid the One-Stop centers in assigning approved training activities and to provide performance data needed to create the Employment and Training Administration (ETA) 9171 reports required each year, effective October 1, 2019.

System integration has ensured that accurate and reliable performance data is being obtained. Michigan developed a secure submission process for proprietary schools and other training providers that do not submit program data to the Center for Educational Performance and Information to provide student identifying information and data necessary for WD to match with Michigan wage records and calculate wage outcome information as required for WIOA 9171 performance reporting. The first wage outcome information, Second Quarter after Exit, was included in the Annual Report, due October 1, 2020. Training providers were required to submit student data from the July 1,
2018 through June 30, 2019 exit timeframe to MiTC by June 30, 2020, which allowed calculations to be provided on their behalf.

Providers and programs entered after August 13, 2019, have been notified that this data will need to be submitted and will replace self-reporting for all exiting students in the future to provide consistency and accuracy amongst training programs.

PROGRAM OUTCOMES SUMMARY

Prior to the application of the Department of Labor’s Statistical Adjustment Model, Michigan met all performance measures for PY 2019, and exceeded 11 of the 14 negotiated rates. The following charts show Michigan’s WIOA Title I and Title III actual performance results for PY 2017, PY 2018 and PY 2019, except for the first chart which only shows PY 2019 results. The percentages shown are calculated by dividing the actual performance rate by the target performance rate for each measure. The Measurable Skill Gains indicator is a baseline indicator and target performance rates were not established for PY 2019. The actual performance rate is displayed for the Measurable Skill Gains indicator. A description of each performance measure and analysis of Michigan’s results are included.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statewide</th>
<th>Adult</th>
<th>Dislocated Worker</th>
<th>Youth</th>
<th>Wagner-Peyser</th>
<th>Average Indicator Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employment 2nd Quarter After Exit</td>
<td>87.5%</td>
<td>101.5%</td>
<td>114.2%</td>
<td>101.8%</td>
<td>101.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment 4th Quarter After Exit</td>
<td>99.5%</td>
<td>103.3%</td>
<td>113.2%</td>
<td>102.9%</td>
<td>104.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median Earnings 2nd Quarter After Exit</td>
<td>94.2%</td>
<td>112.1%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>110.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credential Attainment Rate</td>
<td>115.5%</td>
<td>103.1%</td>
<td>125.5%</td>
<td></td>
<td>114.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Measurable Skill Gains</td>
<td>41.9%</td>
<td>49.0%</td>
<td>38.3%</td>
<td></td>
<td>43.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average Program Score</td>
<td>99.2%</td>
<td>105.0%</td>
<td>117.5%</td>
<td>110.1%</td>
<td>107.9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Michigan has several tools and reports in its OSMIS that are used by State and MWA staff to better serve our participants and attain the State’s performance goals.

9169 and 9173 Reports
The 9169 and 9173 performance reports are available in the OSMIS. These reports were created to mirror the federal reports generated from the Participant Individual Record Layout (PIRL) file in the Workforce Integrated Performance System (WIPS). Both these reports can be run as on-demand or quarterly reports. The on-demand reports use live data as of the previous night. The quarterly reports use the quarterly PIRL file that was submitted to the USDOL. Each report provides the State of Michigan and the MWAs with a comprehensive look at Michigan’s WIOA performance. Drill down functionality in the reports leads users to the participant records included in each measure. Both the 9169 and 9173 can also be run as negative performance reports. These reports keep the exact format as the original 9169 and 9173 but instead of displaying the counts for those that met the measure, they display those that did not meet. This allows case managers to pinpoint the participants that need additional assistance or follow up to meet their goals.

ETA Performance Matrix Score
The Performance Matrix report is a summary report that shows by WIOA program (Adult, Dislocated Worker, Youth and Wagner-Peyser) and Performance Measure (Employment Second and Fourth Quarter, Median Earnings, Credential Rate and Measurable Skill Gains) the negotiated performance target percentage, actual real-time performance percentage, and an overall matrix score. The report is color coded to help MWAs and
State staff gauge how well the public is being served, target areas for improvement, and better manage the success of the programs. This report can be run for the whole State of Michigan or by an individual MWA.

**ETA Performance Standard Report**
The ETA Performance Standard Report displays each MWA and the count of participants in each performance measure, those that met the performance measure, and percentage for the measure. The real-time report is color coded to help MWAs and the State see the measures that are met and areas for improvement.

**Employment Rate Second Quarter After Exit**
The Employment Rate Second Quarter after Exit is defined as the percentage of participants who are in unsubsidized employment during the second quarter after exit from the program. For WIOA Title I Youth, the indicator is the percentage of participants in education or training activities, or in unsubsidized employment during the second quarter after exit.

The line graph below indicates Michigan’s negotiated rate for Employment Second Quarter After Exit for each of the WIOA Title I and III programs. The bar graphs indicate Michigan’s actual performance. For PY 2019, Michigan exceeded the negotiated rates for WIOA Dislocated Worker by 1.3 percent, WIOA Youth by 10.2 percent, and Wagner-Peyser by 1.3 percent. Michigan met performance requirements but did not exceed the negotiated rate for WIOA Adult, performing under the negotiated rate by 10.7 percent.

![Employment Rate - Second Quarter After Exit](image)

**Employment Rate Fourth Quarter After Exit**
The Employment Rate Fourth Quarter After Exit is defined as the percentage of participants who are in unsubsidized employment during the fourth quarter after exit from the program. For WIOA Title I Youth, the indicator is the percentage of participants in education or training activities, or in unsubsidized employment during the fourth quarter after exit.

The line graph below indicates Michigan’s negotiated rate for Employment Fourth Quarter After Exit for each of the WIOA Title I and III programs. The bar graphs indicate Michigan’s actual performance. Michigan exceeded the negotiated rates for WIOA Dislocated Worker by 2.7 percent, WIOA Youth by 9.5 percent, and Wagner-Peyser by 2.0 percent. Michigan met performance requirements but did not exceed the negotiated rate for WIOA Adult, missing the negotiated rate by 0.4 percent.
Median Earnings
Median Earnings is the value of wages reported in the second quarter after the exit quarter that is the mid-point between the value of the lowest wage and the value of the highest wage. The Median Earnings performance measure was a baseline measure for the WIOA Youth program for PYs 2017, 2018 and 2019 and no target was set.

The line graphs below indicate Michigan’s negotiated rate for Median Earnings Second Quarter After Exit for each of the WIOA Title I and III programs. The bar graphs indicate Michigan’s actual performance. Michigan exceeded the negotiated rates for the WIOA Dislocated Worker program by $931 and the Wagner-Peyser program by $1,401. Median Earnings for the WIOA Adult program were $391 below the target rate established for PY 2019.

Credential Attainment Rate
The Credential Attainment Rate is the percentage of those participants enrolled in an education or training program (excluding those in On-the-Job Training [OJT] and Customized Training) who attain a recognized post-secondary credential or a secondary school diploma, or its recognized equivalent, during participation in or within four quarters after exit from the program. A participant who has attained a secondary school diploma or its recognized equivalent is included in the percentage of participants who have attained a secondary school diploma or its recognized equivalent only if the participant also is employed within four quarters after exit or is enrolled in an education or training program leading to a recognized post-secondary credential within 365 days of exit from the program.

The line graph below indicates Michigan’s negotiated rate for Credential Attainment for each of the WIOA Title I programs. Title III is not subject to the Credential Attainment measure. The bar graphs indicate Michigan’s actual performance. Michigan exceeded each of the negotiated rates – WIOA Adult by 11.5 percent, WIOA Dislocated Worker by 2.4 percent and WIOA Youth by 15.1 percent.
Measurable Skill Gains (MSG) metric is the percentage of program participants who, during a program year, are in an education or training program that leads to a recognized post-secondary credential or employment, and who are achieving measurable progress toward such a credential or employment. Only one of the following MSG is needed per program year to result in a positive for the MSG performance measure.

- Education Functioning Level (EFL) Gain – Documented achievement of at least one EFL gain/increase of a participant who is receiving instruction below the post-secondary education level.
- Secondary Diploma/Equivalent – Documented attainment of a secondary school diploma or its recognized equivalent. Exit is not required to count and can include participants at all levels.
- Progression Towards Milestone – Satisfactory or better progress report, towards established milestones, such as completion of OJT or completion of one year of an apprenticeship program or similar milestones, from an employer or training provider.
- Secondary/Post-secondary Transcript – Secondary or Post-secondary transcript or report card for a sufficient number of credit hours that shows a participant is meeting the State unit's academic standards.
- Skills Progression – Successful passage of an exam that is required for a particular occupation or progress in attaining technical or occupational skills as evidenced by trade-related benchmarks such as knowledge-based exams.

MSG is a baseline indicator of performance for WIOA Adult, Dislocated Worker and Youth and no target was set for PY 2019. Major changes were made to Michigan's OSMIS during PY 2018 to assist local areas in identifying which participants were subject to the MSG measure, and to allow them to enter data for MSG Attainments. The State also provided ongoing technical assistance to MWAs during PY 2019 to continue to assist in entering and tracking of MSG in the OSMIS. In PY 2019, Michigan increased reporting of MSG from 44.2 percent to 49.0 percent for the WIOA Dislocated Worker program, and from 28.2 percent to 38.3 percent for the WIOA Youth program. These increases could be due to further understanding of MSG reporting by local areas. MSG reporting has not increased for the WIOA Adult program, decreasing slightly from 42.3 percent to 41.9 percent.
In PY 2019, Michigan advertised further enhancements to the MSG Module in the OSMIS. The module displays a
detailed history of a participant's MSG information. OSMIS users can determine what year(s) a participant was in the
measure, if they had a successful outcome, and the negotiated status of each of the measures. Links in the module
lead users to the OSMIS screen where they can update participant data. This module allows case managers to
easily monitor the skill gain progress of a participant and has helped lead to improved MSG performance compared
to PY 2018 for most programs.

PROGRAM YEAR 2019 COST EFFECTIVENESS ANALYSIS
A cost effectiveness analysis calculates the impact a program achieves relative to the cost incurred, or conversely
the cost required to achieve a given impact. The value of cost effectiveness analysis is twofold: first, its ability to
summarize a program in terms of an illustrative ratio of effects to costs, and second, the ability to use this common
measure to compare multiple programs evaluated in different contexts and in different years. Cost effectiveness
analysis is useful and informative as it maximizes the comparability of elements within different programs without
straying from a correct and complete representation of the costs and effectiveness of each program as it was
evaluated.

Michigan has used three methods to measure the cost effectiveness of its workforce programs – Return on
Investment, Cost per Dollar Earned and Cost by Category of Service.

Return on Investment
The Return on Investment is calculated by dividing the return, or gain, by the investment, or expenditures. The gain
is calculated by subtracting the expenditures from the wages earned by program exiters. \( \text{ROI} = \frac{(\text{Wages Earned} - \text{Expenditures})}{\text{Expenditures}} \). This ratio will tell the amount of wages gained per dollar invested, thus revealing the
efficiency of the investment. Return on Investment is most useful when comparing current performance to past
performance, as opposed to comparing programs. It can be used to determine trends of increasing or decreasing
efficiency.
From PY 2017 through PY 2018, Title I programs saw a significant gain in their Return on Investment. This was primarily due to the continued transition from the Workforce Investment Act (WIA) to WIOA. The PY 2019 results were marginally better for Adult, despite expenditures remaining near the same level. Dislocated Worker and Youth Return on Investment fared slightly worse. The lower Return on Investment for the Dislocated Worker program can be partially attributed to increased expenditures while also exiting 105 less participants in PY 2019 compared to PY 2018. The Youth program also exited 89 less participants while expenditures remained constant. The lower number of exiters impacts the potential Gains in the Return on Investment calculations.

Return on Investment analysis identifies efficiency in program administration but is impacted overall by both wages and costs to generate those wages. As demonstrated in the charts above, a slight decrease in wages, coupled with a similar percentage increase in costs can have a significant impact on the Return on Investment. While wages earned by Participants had a small decrease from PY 2018 to PY 2019 ($4.3 billion vs $4.2 billion), when coupled with an increase in overall expenditures, the Return on Investment had a significant decline.

Cost Effectiveness by Program and Performance Measure
The following table (next page) displays the cost effectiveness by program and performance measure for the WIOA Adult, Dislocated Worker, and Youth programs. This analysis demonstrates the cost per participant, cost per exiter, cost per Credential and Cost per Measurable Skill Gain. Note that while all program expenditures are not dedicated to each data element, a consistent comparison across programs can still be seen. This allows us to analyze the volume of positive outcomes comparing each program to one another.
## Program Cost Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ratio</th>
<th>Calculation</th>
<th>PY 2019 Result</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cost per Adult Participant Served (CP)</strong></td>
<td>Program Expenditures: $27,416,640.67 / Participants Served: 12,065</td>
<td>$2,272.41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cost per Exiter (CE)</strong></td>
<td>Program Expenditures: $27,416,640.67 / Total Program Exiters: 6,702</td>
<td>$4,090.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cost per Employed in 2nd Quarter After Exit (CQ2)</strong></td>
<td>Program Expenditures: $27,416,640.67 / 2nd Quarter After Exit Employment: 5,967</td>
<td>$4,594.71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cost per Employed in 4th Quarter After Exit (CQ4)</strong></td>
<td>Program Expenditures: $27,416,640.67 / 4th Quarter After Exit Employment: 6,429</td>
<td>$4,264.53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cost per Credential Rate (CCR)</strong></td>
<td>Program Expenditures: $27,416,640.67 / Credential Rate: 4,310</td>
<td>$6,361.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cost per Measurable Skill Gain (CMSG)</strong></td>
<td>Program Expenditures: $27,416,640.67 / Measurable Skill Gains: 1,728</td>
<td>$15,866.11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ratio</th>
<th>Calculation</th>
<th>PY 2019 Result</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cost per Dislocated Worker Participant Served (CP)</strong></td>
<td>Program Expenditures: $13,590,723.00 / Participants Served: 3,776</td>
<td>$3,599.24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cost per Exiter (CE)</strong></td>
<td>Program Expenditures: $13,590,723.00 / Total Program Exiters: 2,113</td>
<td>$6,431.96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cost per Employed in 2nd Quarter After Exit (CQ2)</strong></td>
<td>Program Expenditures: $13,590,723.00 / 2nd Quarter After Exit Employment: 1,366</td>
<td>$9,949.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cost per Employed in 4th Quarter After Exit (CQ4)</strong></td>
<td>Program Expenditures: $13,590,723.00 / 4th Quarter After Exit Employment: 1,447</td>
<td>$9,392.34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cost per Credential Rate (CCR)</strong></td>
<td>Program Expenditures: $13,590,723.00 / Credential Rate: 577</td>
<td>$20,074.92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cost per Measurable Skill Gain (CMSG)</strong></td>
<td>Program Expenditures: $13,590,723.00 / Measurable Skill Gains: 543</td>
<td>$25,028.96</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ratio</th>
<th>Calculation</th>
<th>PY 2019 Result</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cost per Youth Participant Served (CP)</strong></td>
<td>Program Expenditures: $23,556,129.00 / Participants Served: 7,972</td>
<td>$2,954.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cost per Exiter (CE)</strong></td>
<td>Program Expenditures: $23,556,129.00 / Total Program Exiters: 2,224</td>
<td>$10,591.78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cost per Employed in 2nd Quarter After Exit (CQ2)</strong></td>
<td>Program Expenditures: $23,556,129.00 / 2nd Quarter After Exit Employment: 1,643</td>
<td>$14,337.27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cost per Employed in 4th Quarter After Exit (CQ4)</strong></td>
<td>Program Expenditures: $23,556,129.00 / 4th Quarter After Exit Employment: 1,781</td>
<td>$13,226.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cost per Credential Rate (CCR)</strong></td>
<td>Program Expenditures: $23,556,129.00 / Credential Rate: 1,002</td>
<td>$23,509.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cost per Measurable Skill Gain (CMSG)</strong></td>
<td>Program Expenditures: $23,556,129.00 / Measurable Skill Gains: 632</td>
<td>$37,272.36</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The graph below illustrates each of the “Cost Per” calculations stacked together by program. The relatively smooth slopes for the Cost Per Employment, Cost Per Exiter and Cost Per Participant demonstrate the Cost Effectiveness has been fairly consistent from PY 2017 to PY 2019. The peaks observed in the Cost Per Measurable Skill Gain and Cost Per Credential measures demonstrate less consistent attainment data from year to year. Additional focus on Measurable Skill Gain and Credential Attainment targets would contribute to more consistent Cost Effectiveness by Performance Measure.

Cost Per Dollar Earned
The Cost per Dollar Earned is the inverse of the Return on Investment. It calculates the investment required by the workforce system to result in one dollar of wages earned by a participant that exits the program. Cost per Dollar Earned is calculated by dividing the expenditures by the wages earned by exiters. Wages earned drive Cost per Dollar Earned, while also demonstrating program efficiency in placing individuals in employment. Overall cost increased above last year but is still well above PY 2017 numbers and is expected to improve going forward as the economy recovers.

Cost by Category of Service
The following three charts compare the cost of providing different levels of service to program participants. The categories of service referenced in this analysis are Career Services and Training Services for WIOA Adult and Dislocated Worker programs. The WIOA Youth program categorizes services as Occupational Skills Training or Services other than Occupational Skills Training.

For the WIOA Adult program, Career Service Expenditures ($16,118,233) are divided by the number of participants who received Career Services (7,244) to calculate the Cost Per Participant for Career Services. The Career Service Expenditures ($16,118,233) are divided by the number of exiters who received Career Services (4,043) to calculate the Cost Per Exiter for Career Services.
The Training Service Expenditures ($11,298,408) are divided by the number of participants that received training services, and the result is added to the Cost Per Participant for Career Services to calculate the Cost per Participant for Training Services. The Training Service Expenditures ($11,298,408) are divided by the number of exiters that received training services, and the result is added to the Cost Per Exiter for Career Services to calculate the Cost per Exiter for Training Services.

The Cost per Dislocated Worker Core Services chart utilizes the same calculations as the Cost per Adult Core Services Chart. The Career Service Expenditures ($9,720,403) are divided by the number of participants who received Career Services (2,436) to calculate the Cost Per Participant for Career Services. The Career Service Expenditures ($9,720,403) are divided by the exiters who received Career Services (1,369) to calculate the Cost Per Exiter for Career Services.

The Training Service Expenditures ($3,870,320) are divided by the number of participants that received training services, and the result is added to the Cost Per Participant for Career Services to calculate the Cost per Participant for Training Services. The Training Service Expenditures ($3,870,320) are divided by the number of exiters that received training services, and the result is added to the Cost Per Exiter for Career Services to calculate the Cost per Exiter for Training Services.

For the WIOA Youth program, the expenditures for Services other than Occupational Skills Training ($22,526,601) are divided by the number of participants who received Services other than Occupational Skills Training (4,258) to calculate the Cost Per Participant for Services other than Occupational Skills Training. The expenditures for Services other than Occupational Skills Training ($22,526,601) are divided by the number of exiters who received Services other than Occupational Skills Training (1,835) to calculate the Cost Per Exiter for Services other than Occupational Skills Training. The Occupational Skills Training Expenditures ($1,029,528) are divided by the number of participants that received Occupational Skills Training, and the result is added to the Cost Per Participant for Services other than Occupational Skills Training to calculate the Cost per Participant for Occupational Skills Training. The Occupational Skills Training Expenditures ($1,029,528) are divided by the number of exiters that received Occupational Skills Training, and the result is added to the Cost Per Exiter for Services other than Occupational Skills Training to calculate the Cost per Exiter for Occupational Skills Training.
Training, and the result is added to the Cost Per Exiter for Services other than Occupational Skills Training to calculate the Cost per Exiter for Occupational Skills Training.

**CATEGORY OF SERVICE IMPACT**

There are three levels of services provided to participants in the WIOA Adult and Dislocated Worker programs – Basic Career Services, Individualized Career Services and Training Services. A participant is reported in the highest category of service they received. For example, an individual who received Basic Career Services and Individualized Career Services would be reported in the Individualized Career Services category, since Individualized Career Services are more intense than Basic Career Services. Similarly, an individual who received Basic Career Services, Individualized Career Services, and Training Services would be reported in the Training Services category.

There are two levels of services provided to participants in the WIOA Youth program – Services Other than Occupational Skills Training and Occupational Skills Training. Occupational Skills Training is considered the more intense service, therefore participants who receive both categories of services are reported in the Occupational Skills Training category.

The following series of charts demonstrate the impact that the category of service provided has on the participants’ employment related outcomes for each of the WIOA Title I programs. The Second Quarter and Fourth Quarter Employment charts utilize column bar graphs to show the number of participants included in the measures. They also utilize a solid line graph to show the performance level (percent of positive outcomes) for each category of service. The Median Earnings charts compare the median earnings by category of service. Each of the charts in this section compare performance between PY 2017, PY 2018 and PY 2019.

**WIOA Adult**

The chart below displays the Employment Rate in the second quarter after exit in each program year. The chart demonstrates higher employment rates for participants who only receive Basic Career Services or receive Training than for participants who receive Individualized Career Services. This may be attributed to participants who are more job-ready requiring less intense services. Participants who lack job-readiness skills or experience greater barriers to employment require Individualized Career Services and may face additional challenges to post-exit employment. Those participants who receive Training services increase their skills and employment outlook, leading to increased employment rates. This may explain why individuals who received a Training service in PY 2019 were 10 percent more likely to be employed in the second quarter after exit than those who received Individualized Career services.
The chart for Employment Rate in the Fourth Quarter after Exit shows similar results to the second quarter after exit performance. Employment rates for participants who received Basic Career services increased 5.4 percent from PY 2018, while employment rates for participants receiving Individualized Career services and Training services decreased from the previous program year.

The chart for Median Earnings for WIOA Adults shows in PY 2019 participants who received Training Services earned significantly higher wages than participants who received Basic or Individualized Career Services. In PY 2019, participants who received Training services earned on average five percent more than those that received only Basic Career services.
WIOA Dislocated Worker

The chart below demonstrates that in PY 2017, PY 2018 and PY 2019 the category of service had little impact on the Employment Rate in the second quarter after exit for the WIOA Dislocated Worker program. Program participation in PY 2019 decreased, so although the number of unemployed exiters who received Individualized Career services decreased from PY 2018 to PY 2019, the lower number of program participants results in a lower employment rate percentage.

The fourth quarter after exit employment percentage decreased slightly as participants were provided more intensive services in PY 2017, PY 2018 and PY 2019. Participants who received training services were approximately five percent less likely to be employed in the fourth quarter after exit than those who only received Basic Career Services. However, a smaller sample size of participants who only received Basic Career Services offers more opportunity for the results to be skewed in one direction.
The chart below shows less variation between the Median Earnings for participants in the WIOA Dislocated Worker program than what was observed in the WIOA Adult program. It also demonstrates that Dislocated Worker program participants that receive Training services consistently earn higher wages than WIOA Adult program participants that receive similar Training services.

**WIOA Youth**

The chart below demonstrates the Employment Rate in the second quarter after exit in PY 2019 was significantly higher when youth participants receive Occupational Skills Training. The employment rate of Youth participants who received Occupational Skills Training increased about two percent from PY 2018 to PY 2019, which is notable considering the number of participants receiving Occupational Skills Training also increased. There is a significant difference in the volume of participants that received each category of service, which should be considered when making program decisions.
The chart below shows about a five percent decrease in Employment Rate during the fourth quarter after exit compared to the second quarter after exit in PY 2019 for those that received occupational skills training. This may be attributed to the fourth quarter measure only containing six months’ worth of exiters due to the availability of wage record data. It is also worth noting that, despite a significant difference in participation rates between participants who received Other Services in 2019 and those who received Occupational Skills Training, the data shows a 2.5 percent increase in employment rates for those who received Occupational Skills Training in PY 2019.

The chart for Median Earnings for WIOA Youth shows that the median earnings for participants who received Occupational Skills Training were over $1,100 more than the median wages of participants who did not receive Occupational Skills Training in PY 2019. Although the sample size is much smaller for individuals who received Occupational Skills Training, this measure will be monitored in future program years to determine whether this observation is consistent from year to year.
STATUS OF STATE EVALUATION ACTIVITIES
For PY 2019, Michigan is currently evaluating any noticeable shifts in the characteristics of the customers currently served under the WIOA compared to customers served under the WIA. The PY 2013-2014 WIA cohort and PY 2017-2018 WIOA cohort information from the Adult and Dislocated Worker programs will be used for the evaluation. To better understand how Michigan is serving individuals with barriers to employment, the evaluation is analyzing how many barriers to employment workforce program participants reported and how this distribution of barriers varied between WIA and WIOA. The evaluation is also reviewing the level of service workforce participants received and how it changed between WIA and WIOA, particularly the level of service received by those with barriers to employment compared to those without barriers.

Michigan is also creating a WIOA Program Dashboard. The pilot dashboard was created and is currently being tested by WD leadership. The dashboard visualizes PY 2019 participant demographic data for each workforce program, including information such as gender, race, and barriers to employment. This dashboard also visualizes PY 2018 employment outcomes for each program, with the option to drill down further and examine outcomes by barrier to employment.

In October of 2020, Labor Market Information and Strategic Initiatives (LMISI) released a special issue of Michigan’s Labor Market News 2019 Annual Economic Analysis Report. This report is a useful general narrative on trends in the Michigan labor market in 2019. This issue was repurposed to review key labor market indicators for 2019 and describe the pandemic’s impact on the state’s labor market in 2020. It also spotlights the economic forecasts from the University of Michigan’s Research Seminar in Quantitative Economics and lists Michigan’s Relevant Rankings that looks at job losses between 2009 and August 2020 among the states and in Michigan’s metropolitan statistical areas. The report can be found here.

LMISI issues monthly publications highlighting workforce data which incorporates relevant ongoing evaluations. Monthly publications can be found at: https://milmi.org/publications.

STATE’S APPROACH TO CUSTOMER SATISFACTION
Job Seekers
Continuous improvement of services to both employers and job seekers is crucial to Michigan’s workforce productivity and competitiveness. As part of the certification process for Michigan Works! Service Centers, Michigan requires that local Workforce Development Boards (WDBs) and Chief Elected Officials (CEOs) have a process in place to evaluate One-Stop service centers for the purposes of monitoring customer service levels and implementation of service improvement to employers and job seekers.
At the local level, there are different methodologies used to gather information about customer satisfaction, including:

- Surveys completed by participants at the end of each program or workshop and during on-the-job training and work experience site reviews.
- On-line customer satisfaction surveys available on resource room computers that individuals can complete at any time.
- Informal real-time feedback is utilized at all service centers, based on employees’ daily interactions with customers and business service members’ interactions with employers. Feedback is used to identify new opportunities or improvements to the way training, recruiting, and networking processes are completed.
- Program participants and service center customers are provided a customer satisfaction survey. Information is then analyzed and shared with management and administrative staff at least quarterly.
- Employers participating in local job fairs or hiring events are given surveys to gauge their satisfaction with the event or services being provided by Michigan Works! These surveys provide greater insight on employers’ needs.
- The MWAs may also utilize specialized tracking systems, such as G*Stars, which allows individuals to complete surveys about their experiences.

Based on feedback and information received from the surveys, potential actions taken toward continuous improvement include:

- Identifying ways to improve service delivery or addressing customer service training for staff based on trends or patterns identified in the surveys.
- Feedback received following workshops helps guide changes to curriculum for future workshops and/or the establishment of new workshops where individuals have identified that services are lacking or based on employer feedback as to whether potential job seekers need additional assistance to meet their hiring needs.
- Tracking customer traffic has resulted in decisions about service center location and staffing, including expanding hours, additional staffing during busy hours, service center layout, etc.
- Reviewing customer service through mystery shopper calls and on-site visits.

Based on feedback from the MWAs, voluntary response rates to surveys are low as individuals whose needs have been met are unlikely to respond to surveys as opposed to individuals who received exemplary services.

**Effectiveness in Serving Employers**

Michigan has chosen to report the expected level of performance for the Effectiveness in Serving Employers Indicator Pilot by utilizing the following approaches. The chart below compares Michigan’s performance in each of the employer measures in PY 2017, PY 2018 and PY 2019.

1. **Retention with the same employer**, measured by the percentage of participants who exit and are employed in the second and fourth quarters after exit. The orange section of the bar graph represents the total number of participants who had the opportunity to be employed four quarters after exiting a WIOA program. The blue section of the bar graph represents the number of participants that were employed with the same employer in the second and fourth quarters after exit. Michigan experienced a one (1) percent increase in retention with the same employer in PY 2019.

2. **Repeat business customers**, based on the percentage of repeat employers using services within the three previous years. The orange section of the bar graph represents the group of employers served during the program year. The blue section of the bar graph represents the group of employers that also received services during the previous program year. Michigan primarily reports repeat business customers for training related services reported into the OSMIS because the state does not utilize a common customer relationship management tool across the workforce system.

3. **Employer penetration rate** based on the percentage of employers using services out of all employers in the State. The orange section of the bar graph represents the total number of employers in Michigan as defined by the Quarterly Census of Employment and Wages. The blue section of the bar graph represents the number of employers who received services during the program year.
DATA VALIDATION

Michigan’s Data Validation process covers both the accuracy of aggregate reports submitted to the USDOL on program activity and performance outcomes and the accuracy of individual data elements. Michigan conducts participant file review in compliance with the requirement to regularly monitor subrecipients of funding in accordance with 2 CFR 200.331(d). Michigan monitors the activities of the subrecipient regularly to ensure that the subaward is used for authorized purposes, in compliance with Federal statutes, regulations and the terms and conditions of the subaward; and that subaward performance goals are achieved. Source documentation is reviewed at this time to verify participants’ eligibility, services received, case management activities and outcomes. Failure to produce acceptable source documentation to validate the aforementioned data results in a finding. Corrective action and/or technical assistance are required as a result of review findings.

Michigan has implemented several tools and reports in the OSMIS that are used by State and MWA staff to validate the data submitted in the WIPS.

Quarterly Report Analysis

Quarterly Report Analysis (QRA) is a data integrity tool that ensures information provided in reports is accurate and reliable. The USDOL selects data elements across the WIOA Title I and III programs related to eligibility, program participation, performance outcomes and other program requirements and sets initial targets based on assessment of national trends. If set targets are not met, states must provide a description of what necessary changes will be made to resolve or improve these rates. Michigan was selected as a QRA pilot state and is therefore regularly analyzing data elements to improve individual metric results and support data accuracy. This report is generated on a quarterly basis.

Aged Enrollment Emails

To further ensure the validity of data and manage aged records in the OSMIS, aged enrollment report emails are sent to all applicable MWAs on a quarterly basis. For purposes of these email reports, aged enrollments are defined as participations entered over two years from the email send date that are still active with no recent activities and either no recent case notes or case notes indicating that no successful contact has been made with the participant in over 90 days. MWAs are encouraged to review and assess these participations to determine whether efforts are needed to re-engage individuals or determine an exit strategy.

User Dashboard

Recently, the OSMIS added a multi-level customizable User Dashboard. This new method to enter OSMIS features enhanced Case Management capability, quick navigation to favorite OSMIS screens, an intuitive task function and access to on-demand data, all customized to the user. This modern tool allows users to easily make informed decisions based on their own data.
**Participant Individual Record Layout Admin Utility**
The PIRL Admin Utility allows State and MWA staff to view records that did not pass edit checks. The participant’s name is displayed with the exact edit check rule that was broken is displayed. Links within the utility lead directly to the errored record. The record can be researched and, where applicable, updated before the PIRL file is submitted in the WIPS quarterly. This facilitates more accurate data and identifies possible updates to the OSMIS system.

**Participant Reports**
The participant reports allow OSMIS users to run on-demand, real-time reports for the individuals served in the WIOA Adult, Dislocated Worker, Youth and Wagner-Peyser programs. For each of these programs, reports are available for active individuals, registrations, participations, activities, exiters and performance. The flexibility in the filtering/criteria allows users to customize the criteria for each report. The State and MWAs use these reports to find participant lists, answer questions, and better serve customers.

**Performance Summary**
The performance summary is a robust tool that provides a summary of an individual’s Common Measures participation. Links within this tool take OSMIS users directly to the registrations, activities and MSG information that is included in the Common Measures participation. This summary helps OSMIS users identify which activities may be holding a common measures participation open and what other case manager(s) are serving this customer so together they can assist the participant in reaching their goals.

Additionally, the OSMIS team is creating the following tools to assist with data validation:

**Online Enhancements**
Specific improvements include identifying the PIRL Data Element number along with the acceptable source documentation per data validated field. Additionally, a random sampling feature will be accessible to all state level staff, and administrators at the local level.

**Data Field Mapping Document**
A data validation mapping document will designate the data fields that are subject to federal data validation per program, along with the acceptable source documentation per data field. Additionally, the mapping document will lead OSMIS users to the exact screen, tab, and location of the actual data fields subject to data validation.

Michigan’s programmatic reviews of local areas are on a regular monitoring schedule and cover samples of data validation elements within the randomly selected individual file review. Acceptable source documentation requirements align with data validation guidance and are the standard which programmatic elements are assessed against.

Standard and ongoing training on the State’s monitoring efforts, including updates regarding data validation is held during various times throughout each program year. In PY 2019, a WIOA Title I Program Review Overview: Best Practices and Opportunities training session was conducted at the annual Michigan Works! Conference. This training included discussion on a portion of data validation requirements referenced in the combined TEGL 07-18, issued December 19, 2018. This discussion also included the difference between our State’s Comprehensive Programmatic Review and data validation reviews, as well as the elements that are included in both types of State reviews. Regular updates and discussion occur during State internal staff meetings as new information is made available.

Regular assessment of Data Validation protocols is and will continue to be ongoing, as per TEGL 23-19 received at the end of PY 2019, issued June 18, 2020.
APPENDIX 1: SUMMARY OF LOCAL PERFORMANCE

WIOA Adult
The chart below displays the local performance outcomes for each of the 16 Michigan Works! Agencies.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Row</td>
<td>Num</td>
<td>Den</td>
<td>Rate</td>
<td>Num</td>
<td>Den</td>
<td>Rate</td>
<td>Num</td>
<td>Den</td>
<td>Rate</td>
<td>Num</td>
<td>Den</td>
<td>Rate</td>
<td>Num</td>
<td>Den</td>
<td>Rate</td>
<td>Num</td>
<td>Den</td>
<td>Rate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Statewide</td>
<td>7,843</td>
<td>4,034</td>
<td>Target</td>
<td>85.3</td>
<td>75.2</td>
<td>$5,700</td>
<td>74.0</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>5,987</td>
<td>7,999</td>
<td>84.6</td>
<td>6,429</td>
<td>8,596</td>
<td>74.1</td>
<td>$6,925</td>
<td>73.8</td>
<td>4,310</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>02 - Region 7B</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>Target</td>
<td>83.9</td>
<td>78.0</td>
<td>$5,200</td>
<td>75.0</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>89.5</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>80.0</td>
<td>9,300</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>04 - Great Lakes Bay</td>
<td>569</td>
<td>224</td>
<td>Target</td>
<td>87.4</td>
<td>79.4</td>
<td>$5,990</td>
<td>73.8</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>373</td>
<td>390</td>
<td>95.6</td>
<td>334</td>
<td>384</td>
<td>87.0</td>
<td>$6,598</td>
<td>193</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>05 - Berrien/Cass/Van Buren</td>
<td>207</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>Target</td>
<td>87.5</td>
<td>79.4</td>
<td>$7,847</td>
<td>79.7</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>91.5</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>89.5</td>
<td>$8,521</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>06 - UP Michigan Workst</td>
<td>429</td>
<td>262</td>
<td>Target</td>
<td>88.2</td>
<td>78.0</td>
<td>$8,336</td>
<td>80.0</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>239</td>
<td>293</td>
<td>81.6</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>207</td>
<td>74.5</td>
<td>$6,703</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>07 - Detroit Emp Solutions</td>
<td>1,475</td>
<td>772</td>
<td>Target</td>
<td>89.0</td>
<td>65.0</td>
<td>$4,916</td>
<td>47.0</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>2,628</td>
<td>4,247</td>
<td>81.0</td>
<td>3,027</td>
<td>4,669</td>
<td>65.0</td>
<td>$5,351</td>
<td>2,137</td>
<td>2,538</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>13 - GST Michigan Works</td>
<td>878</td>
<td>607</td>
<td>Target</td>
<td>86.7</td>
<td>73.3</td>
<td>$5,522</td>
<td>71.3</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>513</td>
<td>604</td>
<td>84.9</td>
<td>554</td>
<td>659</td>
<td>82.8</td>
<td>$7,985</td>
<td>426</td>
<td>592</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>14 - Southwest</td>
<td>161</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>Target</td>
<td>88.8</td>
<td>83.6</td>
<td>$8,300</td>
<td>74.0</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>93.5</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>90.7</td>
<td>5,324</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>18 - West Central</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>Target</td>
<td>85.3</td>
<td>76.2</td>
<td>$6,555</td>
<td>80.3</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>82.7</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>91.4</td>
<td>7,292</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>17 - Capital Area</td>
<td>298</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>Target</td>
<td>87.0</td>
<td>80.0</td>
<td>$5,700</td>
<td>82.0</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>93.3</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>92.0</td>
<td>8,322</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>19 - Macomb/St. Clair</td>
<td>739</td>
<td>263</td>
<td>Target</td>
<td>87.5</td>
<td>79.0</td>
<td>$5,901</td>
<td>72.1</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>289</td>
<td>319</td>
<td>90.0</td>
<td>272</td>
<td>413</td>
<td>89.0</td>
<td>$8,943</td>
<td>329</td>
<td>386</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>21 - Northeast</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>Target</td>
<td>85.0</td>
<td>80.0</td>
<td>$5,900</td>
<td>74.0</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>87.3</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>86.3</td>
<td>$8,083</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>22 - Northwest</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>Target</td>
<td>88.9</td>
<td>83.9</td>
<td>$8,359</td>
<td>79.8</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>86.8</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>78.7</td>
<td>7,986</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>23 - Oakland County</td>
<td>763</td>
<td>346</td>
<td>Target</td>
<td>88.4</td>
<td>81.3</td>
<td>$7,000</td>
<td>75.4</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>397</td>
<td>439</td>
<td>90.4</td>
<td>368</td>
<td>443</td>
<td>89.8</td>
<td>$8,364</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>30 - SE Michigan Consortium</td>
<td>555</td>
<td>389</td>
<td>Target</td>
<td>88.9</td>
<td>80.4</td>
<td>$7,629</td>
<td>79.5</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>251</td>
<td>262</td>
<td>95.5</td>
<td>267</td>
<td>287</td>
<td>93.0</td>
<td>7,972</td>
<td>115</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>31 - SEMCA</td>
<td>378</td>
<td>225</td>
<td>Target</td>
<td>86.4</td>
<td>80.0</td>
<td>$7,026</td>
<td>73.4</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>215</td>
<td>226</td>
<td>95.6</td>
<td>204</td>
<td>223</td>
<td>91.5</td>
<td>7,429</td>
<td>136</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>33 - West Michigan Works</td>
<td>983</td>
<td>890</td>
<td>Target</td>
<td>87.8</td>
<td>79.7</td>
<td>$7,035</td>
<td>79.3</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>551</td>
<td>552</td>
<td>84.5</td>
<td>557</td>
<td>555</td>
<td>84.9</td>
<td>7,105</td>
<td>298</td>
<td>342</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>50 - HRDI</td>
<td>Target</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
WIOA Dislocated Worker
The chart below displays the local performance outcomes for each of the 16 Michigan Works! Agencies.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Row</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Statewide</td>
<td>2,447</td>
<td>1,372</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>88.9</td>
<td>82.4</td>
<td>$7,697</td>
<td>77.0</td>
<td>543</td>
<td>1,109</td>
<td>49.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>02 - Region 7B</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>77.8</td>
<td>82.7</td>
<td>$7,887</td>
<td>66.6</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>04 - Great Lakes Bay</td>
<td>284</td>
<td>151</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>86.5</td>
<td>88.7</td>
<td>$7,295</td>
<td>62.0</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>40.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>05 - Barren/Cass/Van Buren</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>81.0</td>
<td>81.0</td>
<td>$7,304</td>
<td>76.2</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>34.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>05 - UP Michigan Workforce</td>
<td>152</td>
<td>119</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>78.1</td>
<td>78.1</td>
<td>$7,899</td>
<td>78.1</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>07 - Detroit Econ Solutions</td>
<td>171</td>
<td>136</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>86.5</td>
<td>88.7</td>
<td>$7,295</td>
<td>62.0</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>13 - GST Michigan Workforce</td>
<td>178</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>80.6</td>
<td>80.6</td>
<td>$7,899</td>
<td>78.1</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>14 - Southwest</td>
<td>176</td>
<td>136</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>79.2</td>
<td>79.2</td>
<td>$7,899</td>
<td>78.1</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>16 - West Central</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>88.0</td>
<td>88.0</td>
<td>$7,899</td>
<td>78.1</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>17 - Capital Area</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>78.1</td>
<td>78.1</td>
<td>$7,899</td>
<td>78.1</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>19 - Macomb/St. Clair</td>
<td>460</td>
<td>143</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>86.5</td>
<td>86.5</td>
<td>$7,899</td>
<td>78.1</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>21 - Northeast</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>82.4</td>
<td>82.4</td>
<td>$7,899</td>
<td>78.1</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>22 - Northwest</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>86.5</td>
<td>86.5</td>
<td>$7,899</td>
<td>78.1</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>23 - Oakland County</td>
<td>215</td>
<td>130</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>86.5</td>
<td>86.5</td>
<td>$7,899</td>
<td>78.1</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>30 - SE Michigan Consortium</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>86.5</td>
<td>86.5</td>
<td>$7,899</td>
<td>78.1</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>31 - SEMCA</td>
<td>338</td>
<td>213</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>86.5</td>
<td>86.5</td>
<td>$7,899</td>
<td>78.1</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>33 - West Michigan Workforce</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>86.5</td>
<td>86.5</td>
<td>$7,899</td>
<td>78.1</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>HRDI</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>86.5</td>
<td>86.5</td>
<td>$7,899</td>
<td>78.1</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The chart below displays the local performance outcomes for each of the 16 Michigan Works! Agencies.

### A. AGGREGATE INDICATORS OF PERFORMANCE BY MWA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Row</th>
<th>Participants Served (07/01/2019 - 06/30/2020)</th>
<th>Exiters¹</th>
<th>Employment Rate (Q2) (07/01/2018 - 06/30/2019)</th>
<th>Employment Rate (Q4) (01/01/2018 - 12/31/2019)</th>
<th>Median Earnings (07/01/2018 - 06/30/2019)</th>
<th>Credential Rate² (01/01/2018 - 12/31/2019)</th>
<th>Measurable Skill Gains³ (07/01/2018 - 06/30/2020)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Column</td>
<td></td>
<td>Employment Rate (Q2)</td>
<td>Employment Rate (Q4)</td>
<td>Median Earnings</td>
<td>Credential Rate</td>
<td>Measurable Skill Gains</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Statewide</td>
<td>1,841</td>
<td>4,282</td>
<td>72.0</td>
<td>60.0</td>
<td>1,334</td>
<td>38.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>02 - Region 7B</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>82.2</td>
<td>64.7</td>
<td>2,348</td>
<td>45.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>04 - Great Lakes Bay</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>260</td>
<td>89.5</td>
<td>88.9</td>
<td>3,132</td>
<td>42.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>05 - Berrien/Cass/Van Buren</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>81.8</td>
<td>72.4</td>
<td>2,204</td>
<td>41.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>06 - Upper Peninsula</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>142</td>
<td>79.1</td>
<td>74.0</td>
<td>1,952</td>
<td>32.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>07 - Detroit Emp Solutions</td>
<td>310</td>
<td>761</td>
<td>80.4</td>
<td>69.8</td>
<td>4,224</td>
<td>29.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>13 - OST Michigan Works</td>
<td>288</td>
<td>326</td>
<td>80.7</td>
<td>72.0</td>
<td>3,856</td>
<td>65.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>14 - Southwest</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>260</td>
<td>95.3</td>
<td>81.1</td>
<td>2,766</td>
<td>60.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>15 - West Central</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>90.8</td>
<td>69.4</td>
<td>1,952</td>
<td>47.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>17 - Capital Area</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>223</td>
<td>89.4</td>
<td>74.0</td>
<td>3,856</td>
<td>60.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>19 - Macomb/Stclair</td>
<td>154</td>
<td>321</td>
<td>84.1</td>
<td>72.3</td>
<td>5,205</td>
<td>59.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>21 - Northeast</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>81.0</td>
<td>69.4</td>
<td>2,001</td>
<td>47.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>22 - Northwest</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>84.6</td>
<td>69.4</td>
<td>4,386</td>
<td>62.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>23 - Oakland County</td>
<td>109</td>
<td>248</td>
<td>85.6</td>
<td>72.4</td>
<td>4,068</td>
<td>72.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>30 - SE Michigan Consortium</td>
<td>149</td>
<td>419</td>
<td>87.1</td>
<td>87.7</td>
<td>4,304</td>
<td>72.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>31 - SEMCA</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>501</td>
<td>90.6</td>
<td>89.8</td>
<td>2,746</td>
<td>54.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>33 - West Michigan Works</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>371</td>
<td>82.8</td>
<td>72.0</td>
<td>3,866</td>
<td>51.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>50 - HRDI</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

¹ Exiters represent the number of participants who exited from the program.
² Credential Rate refers to the percentage of participants who obtained credentials.
³ Measurable Skill Gains refer to the percentage of participants who demonstrated measurable skill gains.
Wagner-Peyser

The chart below displays the local performance outcomes for each of the sixteen Michigan Works! Agencies.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Row</th>
<th>Participants Served (07/01/2019 - 06/30/2020)</th>
<th>Exits $^1$</th>
<th>Employment Rate (Q2) (07/01/2018 - 06/30/2019)</th>
<th>Employment Rate (Q4) (01/01/2018 - 12/31/2018)</th>
<th>Median Earnings (07/01/2018 - 12/31/2018)</th>
<th>Credential Rate (01/01/2018 - 12/31/2018)</th>
<th>Measurable Skill Gains (07/01/2018 - 06/30/2020)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Column</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Slatswide</td>
<td><strong>170,052</strong></td>
<td><strong>141,287</strong></td>
<td><strong>70.5</strong></td>
<td>Target</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td><strong>69.9</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>02 - Region 7B</td>
<td><strong>3,447</strong></td>
<td><strong>3,536</strong></td>
<td><strong>71.8</strong></td>
<td><strong>71,442</strong></td>
<td><strong>59,439</strong></td>
<td><strong>71.9</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>04 - Great Lakes Bay</td>
<td><strong>8,609</strong></td>
<td><strong>9,132</strong></td>
<td><strong>65.0</strong></td>
<td>Target</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td><strong>60.2</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>05 - Berrien/Cass/Van Buren</td>
<td><strong>7,365</strong></td>
<td><strong>1,653</strong></td>
<td><strong>74.7</strong></td>
<td><strong>74.5</strong></td>
<td><strong>74.7</strong></td>
<td><strong>74.7</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>06 - UP Michigan Works!</td>
<td><strong>7,642</strong></td>
<td><strong>3,872</strong></td>
<td><strong>66.2</strong></td>
<td>Target</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td><strong>64.3</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>07 - Detroit Emp Solutions</td>
<td><strong>13,419</strong></td>
<td><strong>13,229</strong></td>
<td><strong>65.1</strong></td>
<td>Target</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td><strong>65.5</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>13 - GST Michigan Works</td>
<td><strong>13,522</strong></td>
<td><strong>14,553</strong></td>
<td><strong>72.7</strong></td>
<td><strong>74.2</strong></td>
<td><strong>74.2</strong></td>
<td><strong>74.2</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>14 - Southwest</td>
<td><strong>2,463</strong></td>
<td><strong>2,485</strong></td>
<td><strong>69.0</strong></td>
<td>Target</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td><strong>69.0</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>16 - West Central</td>
<td><strong>3,275</strong></td>
<td><strong>3,113</strong></td>
<td><strong>72.5</strong></td>
<td>Target</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td><strong>67.0</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>17 - Capital Area</td>
<td><strong>1,781</strong></td>
<td><strong>726</strong></td>
<td><strong>73.3</strong></td>
<td><strong>70.2</strong></td>
<td><strong>70.2</strong></td>
<td><strong>70.2</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>19 - Macomb/St. Clair</td>
<td><strong>20,520</strong></td>
<td><strong>20,378</strong></td>
<td><strong>66.2</strong></td>
<td>Target</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td><strong>66.0</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>21 - Northeast</td>
<td><strong>3,998</strong></td>
<td><strong>4,146</strong></td>
<td><strong>73.1</strong></td>
<td><strong>73.1</strong></td>
<td><strong>73.1</strong></td>
<td><strong>73.1</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>22 - Northwest</td>
<td><strong>6,686</strong></td>
<td><strong>7,019</strong></td>
<td><strong>68.3</strong></td>
<td>Target</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td><strong>64.4</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>23 - Oakland County</td>
<td><strong>19,683</strong></td>
<td><strong>12,461</strong></td>
<td><strong>72.2</strong></td>
<td><strong>72.2</strong></td>
<td><strong>72.2</strong></td>
<td><strong>72.2</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>30 - SE Michigan Consortium</td>
<td><strong>18,322</strong></td>
<td><strong>12,663</strong></td>
<td><strong>66.8</strong></td>
<td>Target</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td><strong>62.0</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>31 - SEMCA</td>
<td><strong>38,530</strong></td>
<td><strong>23,505</strong></td>
<td><strong>68.5</strong></td>
<td><strong>68.1</strong></td>
<td><strong>68.1</strong></td>
<td><strong>68.1</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>33 - West Michigan Works</td>
<td><strong>8,801</strong></td>
<td><strong>8,527</strong></td>
<td><strong>69.0</strong></td>
<td>Target</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td><strong>69.0</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>50 - HRDI</td>
<td><strong>4</strong></td>
<td><strong>0</strong></td>
<td><strong>74.3</strong></td>
<td><strong>74.4</strong></td>
<td><strong>74.4</strong></td>
<td><strong>74.4</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX II: RAPID RESPONSE ACTIVITIES AND LAYOFF AVERTION

The State of Michigan Rapid Response (RR) and Trade Adjustment Assistance (TAA) programs are administered through the Department of Labor and Economic Opportunity, Workforce Development (LEO-WD), with services delivered locally by 16 American Job Centers, referred to as Michigan Works! Agencies (MWAs).

In collaboration with local MWA partners, WD executes effective, adaptive, and comprehensive service strategies to actively support dislocated workers throughout Michigan. In Program Year (PY) 2019, the WD-RR and TAA teams reorganized as one section to ensure consistent service across both programs. The WD-TAA/RR Section cultivated strong relationships with the MWAs and regional partners. TAA/RR Section staff completed Business Solutions Professional (BSP) training and attained certifications. The BSP training is a requirement for certain MWA staff and emphasizes solution-oriented business engagement with a focus on talent pipeline management and employee retention. Additionally, TAA/RR Section staff attended regional workforce development convenings and Business Resource Network meetings which presented networking opportunities and facilitated a deeper understanding of business and community needs to ensure the implementation of effective rapid response and/or layoff aversion strategies. Cross-training and networking opportunities have contributed to increased communication and timely service response. These strong partnerships enable TAA/RR Section staff to continue fostering relationships across programs and creating opportunities for dislocated workers throughout Michigan.

In PY 2019, Michigan’s workforce received 219 Worker Adjustment and Retraining Notices (WARN) that impacted 37,938 employees. There was a total of 41 WARN Notices that impacted 5,363 employees from the beginning of the PY through mid-March. The COVID-19 pandemic then exacerbated the number of WARN Notices received after March 17, greatly affecting the airline, retail, restaurant, hotel, and hospitality industry sectors. A total of 175 WARN Notices were received through the end of the program year impacting 32,575 employees. The TAA/RR Section coordinated Rapid Response events with companies such as United States Steel, AK Steel, International Automotive Components, Delta Airlines, Detroit Metropolitan Airport and restaurant and retail vendors. Although major industry sectors such as manufacturing and their suppliers were impacted by the pandemic, the events were largely temporary furloughs with most workers being recalled to work.

In addition to Rapid Response services, the TAA/RR Section conducted at least 24 TAA Worker Benefits Orientations for adversely affected workers. TAA benefits such as On-the-Job Training and classroom training allow for eligible adversely affected workers opportunities to upskill and obtain suitable employment. The TAA/RR Section filed 44 TAA petitions on behalf of workers from affected companies, of which 26 petitions were TAA certified.

Michigan continues to provide comprehensive Rapid Response services despite the unexpected change in mode of delivery. Restrictions enacted due to the COVID-19 pandemic have forced the TAA/RR Section staff, MWAs and their partners to develop online platforms to meet worker needs. The use of virtual conferencing, digital portals and electronic forms have been created and implemented to engage job seekers. Additionally, MWAs have concentrated efforts on the expansion of online services, which has proven to be a seamless and successful transition of accessibility for dislocated workers. For example, MWAs have implemented innovative strategies to provide dislocated workers with employment opportunities such as virtual job fairs, connecting machinists, computer operators, skilled trade apprentices and many more with hiring businesses. Fiat-Chrysler, General Motors, Allstate, Yanfeng, Detroit Thermal, Lowes, Modular Automotive Systems, Diversitak, Martin Technologies and Magna Seating are some of the companies participating in virtual job fairs across Michigan.
APPENDIX III: NATIONAL DISLOCATED WORKER GRANTS SUMMARY

**Trade & Economic Transitions Grant - $3,200,000**  
Period of Performance: 10/1/18 – 9/30/21

Awarded in September 2018, the Trade and Economic Transitions Grant encompasses two distinct components; development of a predictive analytics tool through the Upjohn Institute in collaboration with the Michigan Bureau of Labor Market Information and Strategic Initiatives, and career and training support for dislocated manufacturing workers as well as retail trade and finance and insurance workers with job loss tied to E-commerce.

When fully operational, the analytics application will provide job seekers and career planners with customized information about employment prospects and an effective sequence of services. The application will combine real-time employment data with information about skills required by occupation with predictive analytics. The tools will be embedded in a seamless series of informational screens that enhance the operation of Michigan's One-Stop Service Centers.

Funding also provides workers displaced from manufacturing, retail trade and finance and insurance positions with reemployment services including career planning, training, placement and all other career and supportive services allowable under WIOA.

**National Health Emergency Grant - $1,770,000 (Initial Allocation $780,125)**  
Period of Performance: 4/1/19 – 3/31/21

Awarded in April 2019, the National Health Emergency grant focuses on the criminal justice involved population with an opioid use diagnosis through Macomb Community Corrections and the 16th Circuit Court Drug Court. A secondary but substantial emphasis is on providing workforce services to those recovering from substance abuse that may not be involved in the criminal justice system. The goal is to establish that a targeted approach connecting those most affected by the opioid crisis with training and employment services will result in lowered recidivism, increased employment, and reduced occurrences of relapse.

A formal relationship has been established between the Macomb-St. Clair Workforce Development Board, Macomb County Community Corrections, the 16th District Drug Court and CARE, a Community Recovery Organization. The grant allowed CARE to hire five Peer Recovery Coaches to work directly with referrals from Community Corrections and the Drug Court to support people on their path to recovery. Additionally, three staff were hired by Michigan Works! and dedicated to the project; two Career Planners to provide case management and employment support, and a Business Account Manager to recruit local employers for job placements and on-the-job training opportunities.

As individuals with a history of opioid abuse, especially those with a criminal record, often struggle to identify and maintain employment, Peer Recovery Coaches work in tandem with their Career Planner counterparts on holistic solutions for participants. Referrals can be generated from any partner dependent on the participant’s needs with the goal of self-sustaining employment. Other local recovery centers may also refer individuals to Michigan Works!

**COVID-19 Recovery Project Grant - $3,330,000**  
Period of Performance 5/6/20 – 9/30/22

On May 5, 2020, Michigan requested a $10,000,000 Disaster Recovery Dislocated Worker Grant to support the fight against COVID-19 and expected workforce disruptions related to the pandemic. On May 29, the USDOL conditionally awarded Michigan $3,330,000. After extensive discussions with leadership from the 16 Michigan Works! Agencies and other interested parties, a plan to distribute funding to best accommodate the varied needs of each local area while providing more support to areas of higher concentrations of COVID-19 cases was enacted.
Approximately 29 percent of grant funds will be used to employ temporary workers to assist with contact tracing, sanitizing, test-site facilitating, and other jobs directly tied to the COVID-19 relief and recovery effort. All temporary workers will receive additional employment services and, potentially, training to enable them to transition into full-time employment when the crisis ends.

Recognizing not all temporarily laid off workers will return to their previous employment once the COVID-19 pandemic concludes and given the expected contraction and evolution in the state’s economy, approximately half of the funding will be used to support those with no job to go back to. Funding will provide essential reemployment services such as assessment, career counseling, training, and supportive services to this group with the expectation they will return to full-time employment in growth industries.

The final funding component will directly impact the delivery of services through the Michigan Works! system. The crisis uncovered several areas where upgraded technology could greatly enhance the system’s ability to better serve participants going forward, particularly when there are larger numbers of individuals seeking services. Technology upgrades to meet new demands include supporting virtual service delivery models, electronic registrations, website upgrades, virtual talent tours and equipment necessary to accommodate virtual learning.
APPENDIX IV: SUCCESS STORIES

Name: Jessica Dobb  
Employer: Mid-Michigan Medical Center  
Program: WIOA Adult

When Jessica Dodd first came to Great Lakes Bay Michigan Works!, she was underemployed working part-time as a Medication Aide at a local assisted living facility. Overworked and underpaid, Jessica was barely able to cover her living expenses. She had come to Great Lakes Bay Michigan Works! seeking tuition assistance to complete her Bachelor of Science Degree in Nursing (BSN) at Saginaw Valley State University.

Jessica was scheduled to begin her BSN clinicals. The most significant barrier to her long-term career goal of becoming a registered nurse was the lack of funds for the completion of clinical rotations. Case Management worked with Jessica to complete all pre-training requirements and quickly obtained approval for training assistance. As a result, the Adult program was able to provide the costs of tuition, books and supplies to complete the nursing program.

Jessica successfully completed the BSN program at Saginaw Valley State University. She began working as a Registered Nurse at Mid-Michigan Medical Center in Midland. Jessica was hired full-time at the hourly rate of $29.62 (includes $2.50 overnight differential) and received a generous benefits package.

“It’s unbelievable how fortunate I realize I am when I think about my unique experiences throughout college and I cannot thank Michigan Works! enough, especially Beth, for helping me advance myself into a career I truly have passion for. Being the first in my entire family to attend college, I have provided for myself since the age of eighteen and struggled to pay bills each month, knowing there was not an option to fail when it came to school. After reaching out to Michigan Works! I came across a woman that had impacted me and who I will remember dearly for the rest of my days, Beth. Beth has encouraged me every step of the way and in nursing school, which was the most stressful chapter of my life thus far. I always had Beth at my side supporting me and ensuring me she could help me obtain necessities from books to scrubs and class fees. This team I had on my side is one of a kind and I cannot thank them enough for all the time and energy they supported me with…I DID IT!!”
Katie Leaym, a Delta County resident with a bachelor's degree in Biology, was gainfully employed in 2019 by the Delta County Conservation District where she handled administrative duties and seasonal park activities. When the organization’s funds constricted, Katie received the difficult news that she would be permanently laid off. Through the process of applying for unemployment benefits, Katie was referred to the Reemployment Services and Eligibility Assessment program through Upper Peninsula Michigan Works! (UPMW). At UPMW, Katie met with a Talent Specialist who quickly recognized Katie was struggling to find a new career that aligned with her experience and education.

Katie was eligible to be enrolled in the Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act’s Dislocated Worker program, which jump-started the process for Katie to find a new path. During this time, Katie explored options she had not previously considered and was open to new opportunities.

UPMW routinely asks Talent Specialists to review and consider current clients as potential matches for internal openings. Just such an opportunity presented itself, and Katie was referred to interview for a Talent Specialist opening in the Delta County American Job Center. During the interview, Katie’s cheerful personality, soft skills and education showed through, and Katie landed the Talent Specialist position. During her career search, Katie learned that persistence is key. UPMW is proud to have Katie on the team!

“In the Fall of 2019, I unexpectedly lost my job and found myself on unemployment and in my local Upper Peninsula Michigan Works! Office. During my required RESEA appointment, I met the person who would become my case manager. She explained the WIOA Dislocated Worker Program as well as what UPMW could offer. Over the next several months my case manager, Jen, helped me transform my resume, guided me on interview skills, sent me countless job leads, and was always there for a pep talk when I needed it most. She made me realize how important the job of Michigan Works! really is, helping someone get back on their feet when they feel like there is nowhere left to turn. When a temporary Talent Specialist position opened with UPMW Jen quickly informed me, and I jumped at the chance to become a part of this organization. Fast forward to today, I have moved from a temporary to a permanent role allowing me to help people in the same situation I was, and it is truly rewarding. I have been on both sides of UPMW and I can confidently say I would not be where I am today without the help of my case manager, Jen. Michigan Works! is so much more than just finding somebody a job, it’s building a relationship along the way and in the end finally getting to watch them succeed.”
Rickey Heavner wanted to build his future. He wanted to go to college and become a Police Officer, but he was facing some significant financial challenges. He lacked parental support and often found himself in a transient state, staying with friends. His future career plans were on hold because he could not get the financial documentation needed to qualify for financial aid.

Rickey worked closely with a Youth Career Advisor at Michigan Works! Northeast Consortium and enrolled in their Out-of-School Youth program. Rickey received assistance with post-secondary prep and transition activities to help him get qualified for Free Application for Federal Student Aid (FAFSA), followed by training activities to pay for tuition when FAFSA was denied. In addition, he participated in paid and unpaid work experiences, job shadowing activities at Shawono Center and the Crawford County Sheriff's Department. Northeast Michigan Works! was also able to assist with support services, including mileage reimbursement and tutoring activities.

Since working with Northeast Michigan Works!, Rickey has completed his first year of college and has his FAFSA in place for his second year. He has also secured a job as a Marine Patrol Officer with the Crawford County Sheriff's Department. Thanks to the assistance of the WIOA Youth Program, Rickey has a promising future in Public Safety. He is establishing connections that will lead him to a successful future.

This experience has taught Rickey “that there are people and organizations out there who can help and that it’s ok to ask for help if you can’t figure something out on your own.”
Joel first came to Upper Peninsula Michigan Works! (UPMW) looking for summer employment. He was running out of options and struggling to find a place that would hire someone so young. Joel spoke with a Talent Specialist at the American Job Center and was enrolled into the Youth program. His case manager determined Joel would make a great Work-Based Learning candidate. This opportunity would provide Joel with valuable work experience and start building his resume and skills. UPMW created a Work-Based Learning contract with Northland Lawn & Sport, with Joel working full-time as an employment trainee. He was able to start a bank account and participated in financial literacy courses through Michigan Works!

Joel’s supervisor spoke highly of his work ethic. He said that Joel is doing extremely well and scores high on his weekly evaluations. He shows up to work on time and goes above and beyond to perform all requested tasks. Joel was scheduled to start work the Monday after the Copper County Father’s Day flood. Even though his road was washed out, he found an alternate route to work. Even a month after the flood, Joel’s road was still impassable, but he continued to show up for work on time.

Joel’s pride and contribution to the company was obvious. The owner of Northland Lawn and Sport wants to keep Joel employed through the school year and throughout the end of Summer 2019.

Joel is on the right path to becoming well-established in the workforce. He is finding his confidence and learning skills that will help him successfully hold a job in his future.
CBS Solar in Copemish, Michigan is a solar installation company and installer of Tesla Power Walls. In July of 2019, the company was having difficulty finding a solid, dependable individual to join their solar installation team, so the owner reached out to his Northwest Michigan Works! Business Liaison for assistance.

The Business Liaison and a Michigan Works! Career Advisor identified a candidate for the position at CBS Solar. That individual was hired and qualified for On-the-Job (OJT) training funds which offset some of the cost of his wages while he was learning the skills needed for his new job. The new employee is working as a Solar Installation Coordinator and is handling staging, inventory, site evaluation, redesigning schematics as well as installation and reevaluation of site design and systems. He is also on track for a leadership position as he learns more about both solar and Tesla Power Walls.

“Many small businesses need a little help to grow and add new employees and ours is no exception,” said Allan O’Shea, the owner of CBS Solar. “Sometimes a good employee comes along at the wrong time of the year or at a time where cash flow is tight and training expense is a stretch. The extra OJT funding is a perfect solution for any small business. Michigan Works! was a perfect and welcomed partner for taking our efforts ‘over the top.’ We consider Michigan Works! as part of our team to hire, grow and thrive in rural Michigan. Thank you, Michigan Works!”