

BRB No. 97-1387 BLA

JOHN K. HOLMES)
)
 Claimant-Petitioner)
)
 v.)
)
 ISLAND CREEK COAL COMPANY) DATE ISSUED:
)
 Employer-Respondent)
)
 DIRECTOR, OFFICE OF WORKERS')
 COMPENSATION PROGRAMS, UNITED)
 STATES DEPARTMENT OF LABOR)
)
 Party-in-Interest) DECISION and ORDER

Appeal of the Decision and Order of Edward Terhune Miller, Administrative Law Judge, United States Department of Labor.

John K. Holmes, Oakwood, Virginia, *pro se*.

Douglas A. Smoot (Jackson & Kelly), Charleston, West Virginia, for employer.

Before: SMITH, BROWN and McGRANERY, Administrative Appeals Judges.

PER CURIAM:

Claimant, without the assistance of counsel,¹ appeals the Decision and Order (96-BLA-1668) of Administrative Law Judge Edward Terhune Miller denying benefits on a claim filed pursuant to the provisions of Title IV of the Federal Coal Mine Health and Safety Act of 1969, as amended, 30 U.S.C. §901 *et seq.* (the Act). The administrative law judge found, and the parties stipulated to, at least twenty-two years of coal mine employment.

¹ Tim White, a benefits counselor with Stone Mountain Health Services of Vansant, Virginia, filed an appeal on behalf of claimant but is not representing him on appeal. See *Shelton v. Claude V. Keen Trucking Co.*, 19 BLR 1-88 (1995)(Order).

Based on the date of filing, the administrative law judge adjudicated the claim pursuant to 20 C.F.R. Part 718 and concluded that the evidence of record was insufficient to establish totally disabling pneumoconiosis arising out of coal mine employment.² Accordingly, benefits were denied. On appeal, claimant generally contends that he is entitled to benefits. Employer responds, urging affirmance of the denial. The Director, Office of Workers' Compensation Programs, has filed a letter indicating that he would not participate in this appeal.

In an appeal filed by a claimant without the assistance of counsel, the Board considers the issue raised to be whether the decision and Order below is supported by substantial evidence. *McFall v. Jewell Ridge Coal Corp.*, 12 BLR 1-176 (1989); *Stark v. Director, OWCP*, 9 BLR 1-36 (1986). We must affirm the administrative law judge's Decision and Order if the findings of fact and conclusions of law are rational, supported by substantial evidence, and are in accordance with law. 33 U.S.C. §921(b)(3), as incorporated by 30 U.S.C. §932(a); *O'Keefe v. Smith, Hinchman & Grylls Associates, Inc.*, 380 U.S. 359 (1965).

In order to establish entitlement to benefits in a living miner's claim pursuant to 20 C.F.R. Part 718, claimant must establish that he suffers from pneumoconiosis; that the pneumoconiosis arose out of coal mine employment; and that the pneumoconiosis is totally disabling. *See* 20 C.F.R. §§718.3, 718.202, 718.203, 718.204. Failure to establish any of these elements precludes entitlement. *Trent v. Director, OWCP*, 11 BLR 1-26 (1987); *Perry v. Director, OWCP*, 9 BLR 1-1 (1986).

After consideration of the administrative law judge's Decision and Order, the arguments raised on appeal and the evidence of record, we conclude that the administrative law judge's Decision and Order is supported by substantial evidence and contains no reversible error therein. The administrative law judge, in the instant case, permissibly found that the evidence of record was insufficient to establish the existence of pneumoconiosis pursuant to 20 C.F.R. §718.202(a). *Piccin v. Director, OWCP*, 6 BLR 1-616 (1983). The administrative law judge rationally found that the existence of pneumoconiosis was not established pursuant to Section 718.202(a)(1) as the preponderance of the x-rays were read as negative by physicians with superior qualifications. Director's Exhibits 16, 17, 23, 25, 26, 31, 33, 39, 43, 44, 57; Decision and Order at 12; *Edmiston v. F&R Coal Co.*, 14 BLR 1-65

² Claimant filed his claim for benefits on November 23, 1994, which was denied by the district director on October 25, 1995 and May 15, 1996. Director's Exhibits 1, 35, 51.

(1990); *Roberts v. Bethlehem Mines Corporation*, 8 BLR 1-211 (1985); *Scheckler v. Clinchfield Coal Co.*, 7 BLR 1-128 (1984). The administrative law judge also properly found the evidence insufficient to establish the existence of pneumoconiosis pursuant to Section 718.202(a)(2) and (3) as there is no biopsy evidence or evidence of complicated pneumoconiosis in the record in this living miner's claim filed after January 1, 1982. *See* 20 C.F.R. §§718.202(a)(2), (3); Decision and Order at 12; *Langerud v. Director, OWCP*, 9 BLR 1-101 (1986).

Further, the administrative law judge considered the entirety of the medical opinion evidence of record and permissibly found the opinions of Drs. Michos, Sutherland and Forehand, diagnosing pneumoconiosis, outweighed by the contrary opinions of Drs. Sargent, Dahhan, Fino, Abernathy and Morgan, as their opinions are better supported by the objective evidence of record, *i.e.*, physical findings, negative x-rays, negative CT scans and detailed objective test results, and better reasoned and documented. Director's Exhibits 9, 25, 28, 42, 50, 56; Employer's Exhibits 8, 13, 15, 18, 19; Decision and Order at 13-14; *Dillon v. Peabody Coal Co.*, 11 BLR 1-113 (1988); *Fields v. Island Creek Coal Co.*, 10 BLR 1-19 (1987); *King v. Consolidation Coal Co.*, 8 BLR 1-167 (1985); *Piccin, supra*. The administrative law judge is empowered to weigh the medical evidence and to draw his own inferences therefrom, *see Maypray v. Island Creek Coal Co.*, 7 BLR 1-683 (1985), and the Board may not reweigh the evidence or substitute its own inferences on appeal. *See Clark v. Karst-Robbins Coal Co.*, 12 BLR 1-149 (1989); *Anderson v. Valley Camp of Utah, Inc.*, 12 BLR 1-111 (1989). Consequently, we affirm the administrative law judge's finding that the evidence of record is insufficient to establish the existence of pneumoconiosis pursuant to Section 718.202(a) as it is supported by substantial evidence and is in accordance with law.

Inasmuch as claimant has failed to establish the existence of pneumoconiosis, a requisite element of entitlement pursuant to 20 C.F.R. Part 718, entitlement thereunder is precluded. *Trent, supra*; *Perry, supra*.

Accordingly, the administrative law judge's Decision and Order denying benefits is affirmed.

SO ORDERED.

ROY P. SMITH
Administrative Appeals Judge

JAMES F. BROWN
Administrative Appeals Judge

REGINA C. McGRANERY
Administrative Appeals Judge