

8/1/19

Ashley Soevyn CSR# 12019

U.S. Department of Labor

Office of Federal Contract Compliance Programs
Greater San Francisco/Bay District Office
90 7th Street, Suite 11-100
San Francisco, CA 94103



March 11, 2016

**VIA CERTIFIED MAIL,
7015 0640 0001 2393 5541
(RETURN RECEIPT REQUESTED)**

Safra A. Catz
Mark Hurd
Chief Executive Officers
ORACLE America, Inc.
500 Oracle Parkway
Redwood Shores, CA 94065

**RE: COMPLIANCE EVALUATION OF ORACLE AMERICA, INC.,
REDWOOD SHORES, CALIFORNIA; OFCCP NO. R00192699**

Dear Ms. Catz and Mr. Hurd:

The United States Department of Labor ("DOL"), Office of Federal Contract Compliance Programs ("OFCCP"), is conducting a compliance evaluation of ORACLE America, Inc. ("ORACLE") in Redwood Shores, California pursuant to 41 Code of Federal Regulations ("C.F.R.") Chapter 60: Executive Order 11246, as amended ("E.O. 11246"); Section 503 of the Rehabilitation Act of 1973, as amended ("Section 503"); and the Vietnam Era Veterans' Readjustment Assistance Act of 1974, as amended ("VEVRAA").

OFCCP found that ORACLE violated E.O. 11246. Consequently, OFCCP is issuing this Notice of Violations to ORACLE. ORACLE's violations, and the corrective actions required to remedy them, are set forth below.

HIRING DISCRIMINATION (VIOLATION 1)

1. VIOLATION:

During the review period from January 1, 2013 through June 30, 2014, ORACLE discriminated against qualified African American, Hispanic and White (hereinafter "non-Asians") applicants in favor of Asian applicants, particularly Asian Indians, based upon race in its recruiting and hiring practices for Professional Technical 1, Individual Contributor ("PT1") roles, in violation of 41 C.F.R. 60-1.4(a)(1).

Specifically, during the period of January 1, 2013 through June 30, 2014, ORACLE recruited approximately 6800 applicants to PT1 roles. Of those applicants, ORACLE recruited 2% African

Americans, 2.5% Hispanics, 19% Whites and 76% Asian applicants. Of the Asian applicants, Asian Indians were nearly 70% of Asian applicants and over 50% of all applicants in PT1.¹

An analysis of ORACLE's applicant data and appropriate workforce availability statistics² show that ORACLE favored Asian applicants, particularly Asian Indians, in recruiting at a standard deviation as significant as +85. ORACLE disfavored non-Asian applicants in recruiting, particularly African American, Hispanic and White applicants, at standard deviations as significant as -8, -10, and -80, respectively.

Additionally, during the period of January 1, 2013 through June 30, 2014, ORACLE hired approximately 670 applicants into PT1 roles. Of those hires, ORACLE hired 1% African Americans, 2% Hispanics, 14% Whites, and 82% Asian applicants. Of the Asian hires, Asian Indians were nearly 60% of Asian hires and 45% of all hires in PT1.

An analysis of ORACLE's hiring data and appropriate workforce availability statistics³ show that ORACLE favored Asian applicants, particularly Asian Indians, in hiring at a standard deviation as significant as +30. ORACLE disfavored non-Asian applicants in hiring, particularly African American, Hispanic and White applicants, at standard deviations as significant as -4, -3, and -28, respectively.

Evidence gathered during the compliance evaluation demonstrates that ORACLE's discriminatory recruiting and hiring practices skewed the racial composition of the applicant flow data to favor Asians, particularly Asian Indians, and disfavored other racial groups for PT1 roles. In order to further analyze ORACLE's recruitment and hiring practices for PT1 roles, OFCCP made multiple requests to ORACLE for copies of all application materials for all expressions of interest, including but not limited to names of hiring managers, employee referrals, requisition dates, hire dates, and copies of job postings and job requirements. Because ORACLE failed to provide complete and accurate information in response to OFCCP's multiple requests, OFCCP presumes that the information not produced would have been unfavorable to ORACLE.

Based upon the analysis conducted and the evidence gathered during the compliance evaluation, OFCCP finds that ORACLE recruited, selected and hired Asian applicants, particularly Asian Indians, for PT1 roles at a rate significantly greater than their non-Asian counterparts who were equally or more qualified for the roles. ORACLE's recruiting and hiring practices resulted in unlawful discrimination against non-Asian applicants based upon race, particularly African American, Hispanic and White applicants.

¹ Asian Indians make-up less than 1% of the U.S. population. *Asians in the U.S. labor force: profile of a diverse population*, U.S. DOL, Bureau of Labor Statistics, Monthly Labor Review, November 2011, <http://www.bls.gov/opub/mlr/2011/11/art1full.pdf>.

² Availability statistics for the Software Developers, Applications & Systems Software Occupation in the United States is based upon 2006-2010 Census and/or 2013-2014 DOL, Bureau of Labor Statistics' Labor Force Statistics.

³ See footnote 2.

CORRECTIVE ACTION:

ORACLE must agree to revise its personnel practices and procedures to ensure that the qualified non-Asian applicants for the PT1 roles are afforded equal employment opportunity for recruitment and selection. ORACLE must also agree to provide the following "make-whole relief" to the non-Asian applicants.

- a) **Notice:** Send notification to the class members to inform them of their rights and the potential remedies.
- b) **Job Offer:** Make bona-fide job offers on a priority basis at the rate of pay that class members would now be earning had ORACLE hired them on the date of the first opportunity following their application.
- c) **Monetary Settlement:** Provide back pay plus quarterly compounded interest at the IRS underpayment rate for the class members. Back pay will be calculated from the date class members should have been hired to the date the violation is resolved in a signed Conciliation Agreement or a bona fide job offer is made to the respective class members. Provide any and all employment benefits that the class members would have received had it not been for the discrimination described above; and
- d) **Policies and Training:** Develop recruitment and hiring policies that comply with Executive Order 11246, as amended, and its implementing regulations; provide mandatory training on the policies to supervisory, management and recruitment professionals involved in ORACLE's recruitment and selection process; and evaluate performance and compensation of supervisory, management and recruitment professionals based upon compliance with the policies.

COMPENSATION DISCRIMINATION (VIOLATIONS 2-5)

2. VIOLATION:

Beginning no later than January 1, 2013, and continuing thereafter, ORACLE discriminated against female employees in Information Technology, Product Development, and Support roles based upon sex by paying them less than comparable males employed in similar roles, in violation of 41 C.F.R. 60-1.4(a)(1).⁴

During the compliance review, OFCCP reviewed employment policies, practices, and records; interviewed management, human resources, and non-management employees; examined employee complaints; analyzed individual employee compensation data and other evidence; and conducted an onsite inspection of the worksite. Based upon the evidence gathered during the compliance review,

⁴ ORACLE refused to provide OFCCP with complete compensation data for all relevant employees, including contract and contingent employees, for the full review period. ORACLE also did not provide any data demonstrating that its continuing compensation disparities have been remedied. Accordingly, OFCCP presumes such data would be unfavorable to ORACLE.

OFCCP evaluated and analyzed ORACLE's compensation system and, through regression and other analysis, found statistically significant pay disparities based upon sex after controlling for legitimate explanatory factors. The results of OFCCP's regression analyses are attached. (Attachment A).

Based upon the analysis conducted and the evidence gathered during the compliance evaluation, OFCCP finds that ORACLE paid male employees in Information Technology, Product Development, and Support roles at a rate significantly greater than their female counterparts who were equally or more qualified. ORACLE's compensation practices resulted in unlawful discrimination against female employees based upon sex.

CORRECTIVE ACTION:

ORACLE must agree to take steps to ensure that its compensation system is nondiscriminatory to all of its employees, regardless of sex. This applies to all aspects of compensation, including but not limited to, salary at the time of placement into roles, annual salary adjustments and incentive compensation in Information Technology, Product Development, and Support roles. ORACLE agrees to: 1) cease the discriminatory compensation practice(s) resulting in lower pay and adverse impact against females in Information Technology, Product Development, and Support roles; 2) provide make-whole remedies to the class of females to include back pay, interest, and other employment benefits; and 3) provide training to employees involved in setting and increasing compensation to ensure that the violation does not recur.

3. VIOLATION:

Beginning no later than January 1, 2013, and continuing thereafter, ORACLE discriminated against African Americans in Product Development roles based upon race by paying them less than comparable Whites employed in similar roles, in violation of 41 C.F.R. 60-1.4(a)(1).⁵

During the compliance review, OFCCP reviewed employment policies, practices, and records; interviewed management, human resources, and non-management employees; examined employee complaints; analyzed individual employee compensation data and other evidence; and conducted an onsite inspection of the worksite. Based upon the evidence gathered during the compliance review, OFCCP evaluated and analyzed ORACLE's compensation system and, through regression and other analysis, found statistically significant pay disparities based upon race after controlling for legitimate explanatory factors. The results of OFCCP's regression analysis are attached. (Attachment A).

Based upon the analysis conducted and the evidence gathered during the compliance evaluation, OFCCP finds that ORACLE paid White employees in Product Development roles at a rate significantly greater than their African American counterparts who were equally or more qualified. ORACLE's compensation practices resulted in unlawful discrimination against African American employees based upon race.

⁵ See footnote 4.

CORRECTIVE ACTION:

ORACLE must agree to take steps to ensure that its compensation system is nondiscriminatory to all of its employees, regardless of race. This applies to all aspects of compensation, including but not limited to, salary at the time of placement into roles, annual salary adjustments and incentive compensation in Product Development roles. ORACLE agrees to: 1) cease the discriminatory compensation practice(s) resulting in lower pay and adverse impact against African Americans in Product Development roles; 2) provide make-whole remedies to the class of African Americans to include back pay, interest, and other employment benefits; and 3) provide training to employees involved in setting and increasing compensation to ensure that the violation does not recur.

4. VIOLATION:

Beginning no later than January 1, 2013, and continuing thereafter, ORACLE discriminated against Asians in Product Development roles based upon race by paying them less than comparable Whites employed in similar roles, in violation of 41 C.F.R. 60-1.4(a)(1).⁶

During the compliance review, OFCCP reviewed employment policies, practices, and records; interviewed management, human resources, and non-management employees; examined employee complaints; analyzed individual employee compensation data and other evidence; and conducted an onsite inspection of the worksite. Based upon the evidence gathered during the compliance review, OFCCP evaluated and analyzed ORACLE's compensation system and, through regression and other analysis, found statistically significant pay disparities based upon race after controlling for legitimate explanatory factors. The results of OFCCP's regression analysis are attached. (Attachment A).

Based upon the analysis conducted and the evidence gathered during the compliance evaluation, OFCCP finds that ORACLE paid White employees in Product Development roles at a rate significantly greater than their Asian counterparts who were equally or more qualified. ORACLE's compensation practices resulted in unlawful discrimination against Asian employees based upon race.

CORRECTIVE ACTION:

ORACLE must agree to take steps to ensure that its compensation system is nondiscriminatory to all of its employees, regardless of race. This applies to all aspects of compensation, including but not limited to, salary at the time of placement into roles, annual salary adjustments and incentive compensation in Product Development roles. ORACLE agrees to: 1) cease the discriminatory compensation practice(s) resulting in lower pay and adverse impact against Asians in Product Development roles; 2) provide make-whole remedies to the class of Asians to include back pay, interest, and other employment benefits; and 3) provide training to employees involved in setting and increasing compensation to ensure that the violation does not recur.

⁶ See footnote 4.

5. VIOLATION:

Beginning no later than January 1, 2013, and continuing thereafter, ORACLE discriminated against Americans in Product Development and Support roles based upon national origin by paying them less than comparable non-Americans employed in similar roles, in violation of 41 C.F.R. 60-1.4(a)(1).⁷

During the compliance review, OFCCP reviewed employment policies, practices, and records; interviewed management, human resources, and non-management employees; examined employee complaints; analyzed individual employee compensation data and other evidence; evaluated public disclosure files and related wage determination memoranda; and conducted an onsite inspection of the worksite. Based upon the evidence gathered during the compliance review, OFCCP evaluated and analyzed ORACLE's compensation system and, through regression and other analysis, found statistically significant pay disparities based upon national origin after controlling for legitimate explanatory factors. The results of OFCCP's regression analysis are attached. (Attachment A).

Based upon the analysis conducted and the evidence gathered during the compliance evaluation, OFCCP finds that ORACLE paid non-American employees in Product Development and Support roles at a rate significantly greater than their American counterparts who were equally or more qualified. ORACLE's compensation practices resulted in unlawful discrimination against American employees based upon national origin.

CORRECTIVE ACTION:

ORACLE must agree to take steps to ensure that its compensation system is nondiscriminatory to all of its employees, regardless of national origin. This applies to all aspects of compensation, including but not limited to, salary at the time of placement into roles, annual salary adjustments and incentive compensation in Product Development and Support roles. ORACLE agrees to: 1) cease the discriminatory compensation practice(s) resulting in lower pay and adverse impact against Americans in Product Development and Support roles; 2) provide make-whole remedies to the class of Americans to include back pay, interest, and other employment benefits; and 3) provide training to employees involved in setting and increasing compensation to ensure that the violation does not recur.

AFFIRMATIVE ACTION VIOLATIONS (VIOLATIONS 6-8)

6. VIOLATION:

ORACLE failed to perform an in-depth analysis of its total employment processes to determine whether and where impediments to equal employment opportunity exist as required by 41 C.F.R. 60-2.17(b)(3). Specifically, ORACLE failed to identify problem areas in its compensation system(s) to determine whether sex or race based disparities existed.

⁷ See footnote 4.

CORRECTIVE ACTION:

ORACLE must agree to perform in-depth analyses of its total employment processes to determine whether and where impediments to equal employment opportunity exist. ORACLE must agree to evaluate its compensation system(s), specifically base salary, bonus programs, starting wages, pay increases, restricted stock units (RSU) or other stock awards, promotions relative to pay, and any other benefits, to determine whether there are sex, race or national origin based pay disparities. ORACLE will incorporate these analyses and determinations into its current AAP and will update these analyses at least annually and incorporate them into future AAPs.

7. VIOLATION:

ORACLE failed to demonstrate good faith efforts to develop and execute action-oriented programs designed to correct pay disparities as of January 1, 2013. Specifically, ORACLE was unable to demonstrate that it had conducted any pay equity analyses, or otherwise attempted to correct the problem areas identified in 41 C.F.R. 60-2.17(b)(3) in violation of 41 C.F.R. 60-2.17(c).

CORRECTIVE ACTION:

ORACLE must agree to conduct an in-depth analysis of its total employment processes to determine whether any impediments to equal opportunity exist. ORACLE must then develop and implement action-oriented programs designed to remove any identified impediments and institute salary adjustment procedures to determine where and how equity adjustments should be made to ensure nondiscrimination.

8. VIOLATION:

ORACLE failed to develop and implement an internal audit and reporting system that periodically measured the effectiveness of its total affirmative action program as required by 41 C.F.R. 60-2.17(d). Specifically, ORACLE failed to monitor its records of all personnel activities, such as compensation, at all levels to ensure its nondiscriminatory policy was carried out.

CORRECTIVE ACTION:

ORACLE must agree to implement an internal audit and reporting system to periodically measure the effectiveness of its total affirmative action program. ORACLE must agree to take the following corrective actions:

- a) Monitor records of all personnel activity, such as all components of compensation, to ensure the non-discriminatory policy is enforced;
- b) Require internal reporting on a scheduled basis as to the degree to which equal employment opportunity and organizational objectives are attained;
- c) Review reports with all levels of management;

- d) Advise top management about the effectiveness of the equal employment opportunity program and submit recommendations to improve any unsatisfactory performance; and
- e) Provide training to all employees who participate in any component of ORACLE's compensation system(s).

RECORDKEEPING AND ACCESS VIOLATIONS (VIOLATION 9-10)

9. VIOLATION:

ORACLE failed to collect and maintain personnel and employment records and conduct adverse impact analyses in accordance with the requirements of 41 C.F.R. 60-1.12(a) and Part 60-3. Additionally, ORACLE failed to conduct the adverse impact analyses required by 41 C.F.R. 60-3.15A and 60-3.4.

CORRECTIVE ACTION:

ORACLE will ensure that its records are collected and maintained in accordance with the requirements of 41 C.F.R. 60-1.12(a) and Part 60-3. ORACLE will conduct adverse impact analyses on at least an annual basis for the purpose of determining whether adverse impact exists against applicants based on race, sex, or national origin/ethnic group in hiring, promotion, termination, and other personnel activities. These analyses will be done by job for each group constituting more than 2% of the labor force in the relevant labor area or 2% of the applicable workforce. If adverse impact is identified in the total selection process, ORACLE will evaluate each individual component of the selection process for adverse impact. If adverse impact is found to exist in any of the individual components of the selection process, ORACLE will validate each such component in accordance with the Uniform Guidelines on Employee Selection Procedures or utilize selection procedures which do not result in adverse impact.

10. VIOLATION:

ORACLE denied OFCCP access to records, including prior year compensation data for all employees and complete hiring data for PTi roles during the review period of January 1, 2013 through June 30, 2014, which are relevant to the matter under investigation and pertinent to ORACLE's compliance with Executive Order 11246, as amended, and the regulatory requirements at 41 C.F.R. 60-1.12; 60-1.20; 60-1.43; 60-2.32 and 60-3.4.

CORRECTIVE ACTION:

ORACLE must immediately provide to OFCCP all relevant compensation and hiring data, which was requested on April 27, 2015, May 11, 2015, May 28, 2015, July 30, 2015, October 1, 2015, October 14, 2015, November 2, 2015, and December 15, 2015.

Finally, please note that nothing herein is intended to relieve ORACLE from the obligation to comply with the requirements of E.O. 11246, Section 503, and/or VEVRAA, their implementing regulations, or any other equal employment opportunity/ nondiscrimination statute, executive order or regulation. In addition, this Notice of Violation in no way limits the applicability of the revised regulations implementing Section 503, 41 C.F.R. Part 60-741 (2014) and the revised regulations implementing VEVRAA, 41 C.F.R. Part 60-300 (2014).

In order to come into compliance, ORACLE must enter into a binding Conciliation Agreement with OFCCP that encompasses all of the corrective actions described above. It is our desire to avoid enforcement proceedings. You may contact me at (415) 623-7839 within five (5) business days of receipt of this letter if ORACLE would like to begin conciliation and resolution of the specified violations.

Sincerely,



Robert Doles
District Director

cc: Shauna Holman-Harries (via email: shauna.holman.harries@ORACLE.com)
Director Diversity Compliance, Oracle America, Inc.

Juana Schurman (via email: juana.schurman@ORACLE.com)
Vice President and Associate General Counsel, Oracle America, Inc.

Gary R. Siniscalco (via email: grsiniscalco@orrick.com)
Orrick Herrington & Sutcliffe LLP

Enclosure

ATTACHMENT A

COMPENSATION DISCRIMINATION (VIOLATIONS 2-5)

Analysis of Employees' Annual Salary and Gender

The United States Department of Labor, Office of Federal Contract Compliance Programs ("OFCCP") conducted statistical analysis of the employment records Oracle America, Inc. ("Oracle") provided to OFCCP during its equal employment opportunity investigation of Oracle's facility in Redwood Shores, California. OFCCP analyzed Oracle employees' compensation data by Oracle job function using a model that included the natural log of annual salary as a dependent variable, and accounted for differences in employees' gender, work experience at Oracle, work experience prior to Oracle, full-time/part-time status, exempt status, global career level, job specialty, and job title.

As displayed in the table below, the results of the analysis show a statistically significant salary disparity adverse to female employees in *Information Technology*, *Product Development*, and *Support* roles.

**Regression Analysis of Female and Male Employees'
Salary Difference at Oracle**

Year ¹	Class	Number of Female Class Members	Standard Deviations
2014	Female Information Technology Employees	133	-2.71
2014	Female Product Development Employees	1,207	-8.41
2014	Female Support Employees	47	-3.67

¹ Oracle provided OFCCP with one year of compensation data that included Oracle employees who were employed at the relevant facility on January 1, 2014. Oracle refused to provide OFCCP with its prior year compensation data.

Analysis of Employees' Annual Salary and Race

The United States Department of Labor, OFCCP conducted statistical analysis of the employment records Oracle provided to OFCCP during its equal employment opportunity investigation of Oracle's facility in Redwood Shores, California. OFCCP analyzed Oracle employees' compensation data by Oracle job function using a model that included the natural log of annual salary as a dependent variable, and accounted for differences in employees' race, work experience at Oracle, work experience prior to Oracle, full-time/part-time status, exempt status, global career level, job specialty, and job title.

As displayed in the table below, the results of the analysis show a statistically significant salary disparity adverse to African American and Asian employees in *Product Development* roles.

Regression Analysis of African American and White Employees' Salary Difference at Oracle

Year ²	Class	Number of Black Class Members	Standard Deviations
2014	African American Product Development Employees	27	-2.10

Regression Analysis of Asian and White Employees' Salary Difference at Oracle

Year ³	Class	Number of Asian Class Members	Standard Deviations
2014	Asian Product Development Employees	3,086	-6.55

² Oracle provided OFCCP with one year of compensation data that included Oracle employees who were employed at the relevant facility on January 1, 2014. Oracle refused to provide the Agency prior year compensation data.

³ Oracle provided OFCCP with one year of compensation data that included Oracle employees who were employed at the relevant facility on January 1, 2014. Oracle refused to provide the Agency prior year compensation data.

Analysis of Employees' Annual Salary and National Origin

The United States Department of Labor, OFCCP conducted statistical analysis of the employment records Oracle provided to OFCCP during its equal employment opportunity investigation of Oracle's facility in Redwood Shores, California. OFCCP analyzed Oracle employees' compensation data by Oracle job function using a model that included the natural log of annual salary as a dependent variable, and accounted for differences in employees' national origin, work experience at Oracle, work experience prior to Oracle, full-time/part-time status, exempt status, global career level, job specialty, visa status, and job title.

As displayed in the table below, the results of the analysis show a statistically significant salary disparity adverse to American employees in *Product Development* and *Support* roles.

Regression Analysis of American and Non-American Employees' Salary Difference at Oracle

Year ⁴	Class	Number of American Class Members	Standard Deviations
2014	American Product Development Employees	3,501	-7.07
2014	American Support Employees	185	-3.65

⁴ Oracle provided OFCCP with one year of compensation data that included Oracle employees who were employed at the relevant facility on January 1, 2014. Oracle refused to provide the Agency prior year compensation data.