Final Evaluation of the Forced Labor Indicators Project (FLIP) in Ghana

Evaluation Contractor: Sistemas, Familia y Sociedad Ltd. (SFS)

**Objective**

The project’s objective is to improve the capacity of companies, employers, governments, civil society, and workers to use ILO indicators of forced labor to understand and address forced labor and labor trafficking in Ghana.

The project aims to generate (outcomes): 1. An improved understanding of indicators of forced labor, including indicators of labor trafficking; 2. An improved monitoring of working conditions by labor stakeholders to identify indicators and address incidents of forced labor and labor trafficking; and 3. A strengthened capacity of the Labor Inspectorate to address forced labor and labor trafficking.

**Period of Performance**

December 2017 – December 2022

**Funding**

$3,490,318 USD

**Project Award Number**

IL-31474-17-75-K-25

**Implementer**

Verité, Inc.

**Key Findings**

### Relevance

- The project was clearly defined across all three outcome indicators following a well-structured Theory of Change that all stakeholders were simultaneously working toward in alignment with the government’s Ten-Year Action Plan to mitigate forced labor and labor trafficking.

- Stakeholders viewed the project as timely, relevant, and productive, with appropriate strategies, actively engaging stakeholders, and providing pertinent resources for ongoing use.

### Coherence

- FLIP built on its coordinated efforts with the ILO and maximized the expertise on child labor and forced labor within the region, enabling FLIP to expand into neighboring Côte d’Ivoire.

- FLIP focused on existing structures and mechanisms, such as child labor monitoring systems, to support the integration of forced labor indicators.

**Effectiveness**

- By the time of the evaluation (November 2021), FLIP was effective in achieving its targets in Ghana. Activities are ongoing to January 2022, and FLIP will continue to increase its results against its targets.

- Under Outcome 1, FLIP sensitized a total of 255 individuals (against a target of 150) of which 96 demonstrated improved knowledge of FL indicators (against a target of 55).

- Outcome 2, on the integration of forced labor indicators into existing monitoring systems has shown limited achievement, due to delays resulting from COVID-19, with 3 out of the 4 targeted labor monitoring systems aligned. However, 15 institutions (against a target of 8) are participating in the consultation processes, and six institutions (against a target of 4) have drafted action plans to adopt the FL indicators approach.

- Under Outcome 3, FLIP trained 96 Labor Inspectorate staff (against a target of 100), and nine targeted senior labor officers commenced training for other Department of Labor staff.

**Sustainability**

Several factors favor project’s sustainability:

- Stakeholder interest and commitment to the forced labor indicators approach is high, particularly among the officials of the Labor Inspectorate.

- Collaboration across ministries, and with a wide range of stakeholders, represented in the projects Technical Working Group, is also an effective approach.

- However, stakeholders acknowledge that effective sustainability is contingent upon availability of resources: As people become more aware of forced labor and labor trafficking, this would lead to an increased demand for monitoring of workplaces and actions to redress this situation at all levels.

Image credit: Verité, Inc.
### Outcome 1 (OTC1)
- **Achievement:** Improved understanding of indicators of forced labor.
- **Achievement and Sustainability:** HIGH

### Outcome 2 (OTC2)
- **Achievement:** Improved monitoring of working conditions by labor stakeholders to address incidents of forced labor.
- **Achievement and Sustainability:** MODERATE

### Outcome 3 (OTC3)
- **Achievement:** Strengthened capacity of the Labor Inspectorate to address forced labor.
- **Achievement:** HIGH
- **Sustainability:** ABOVE-MODERATE

### RESPONSE TO COVID-19
COVID-19 changed the way in which FLIP staff communicated and interacted with partner organizations and government officials, with both positive results and challenging aspects. From March 2020 and well into 2021, due to travel and social restrictions, FLIP adapted its trainings transitioning from face-to-face meetings to online virtual trainings. After participating in a training of trainers course online, staff from the Department of Labor conducted face-to-face, step-down trainings.

### Promising Practices
1. **PP1:** The establishment of a Technical Working Group (OTC1) was an effective communication and decision-making mechanism to support FLIP implementation.
2. **PP2:** Adaptation of training to include practical activities to support theoretical and technical sessions (OTC3) helped the project to adapt to COVID-19-related restrictions.
3. **PP3:** Step-down training by paired TOT trainers, working in teams of four people (OTC3) was an effective and constructive way of sharing knowledge, comprehensively covering all topics.

### Lessons Learned
1. **LL1:** Forced labor indicators are universal across all sectors (OTC1).
2. **LL2:** A collaborative and inclusive Technical Working Group is effective for networking, information sharing, and decision-making to support project outcomes (OTC1).
3. **LL3:** Designing a project with a minimal number of specific and clearly defined objectives aids implementation, monitoring, and evaluation, as well as stakeholder support (OTC1).
4. **LL4:** Endline project outcome indicators need time to monitor, record, and document results (OTC1-3).

### RECOMMENDATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recommendation</th>
<th>USDOL</th>
<th>Verité</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>1</strong> Continued Support to Ghana MELR Action Plan:</td>
<td>USDOL</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2</strong> Support a Labor Rights Project:</td>
<td>USDOL</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support a project on labor rights as a progression from child labor to forced labor and beyond. ILAB should consider including issues on labor and workers’ rights in general, while continuing the mitigation of forced labor and labor trafficking in the next phase of a future labor project in the region.</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3</strong> Introduce a GESI strategy:</td>
<td>USDOL</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Establish a project requirement, in future projects, to explicitly detail a gender and social inclusion (GESI) strategy with targets, goals, and outcomes, and to regularly report against these.</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4</strong> Transfer the Responsibility for the Technical Working Group:</td>
<td>Verité</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hand over the chair role and responsibilities to the government or appropriate entity to ensure sustainability.</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>5</strong> Replicate the Ghana Technical Working Group model in Côte d’Ivoire</td>
<td>Verité</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Replicate the Ghana model in Côte d’Ivoire.</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>6</strong> Online Learning Platform:</td>
<td>Verité</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promote the online learning platform, its accessibility and use as a training and reference resource.</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Funding for this evaluation was provided by the United States Department of Labor under contract number 47QRAA20D00045 | Task Order: 1605C2-20-F-00027 with SFS. This material does not necessarily reflect the views or policies of the United States Department of Labor, nor does the mention of trade names, commercial products, or organizations imply endorsement by the United States Government.