



International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC)



International  
Labour  
Office

## ***IPEC Evaluation***

**“Support to the Proposed National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures”**

**MON/05/P50/USA**

**P.270.13.335.050**

**An independent mid-term evaluation by a team of external consultants**

November 2007

**This document has not been professionally edited.**

## NOTE ON THE EVALUATION PROCESS AND REPORT

This independent evaluation was managed by ILO-IPEC's Design, Evaluation and Documentation Section (DED) following a consultative and participatory approach. DED has ensured that all major stakeholders were consulted and informed throughout the evaluation and that the evaluation was carried out to highest degree of credibility and independence and in line with established evaluation standards.

The evaluation was carried out a team of external consultants<sup>1</sup>. The field mission took place in November 2007. The opinions and recommendations included in this report are those of the authors and as such serve as an important contribution to learning and planning without necessarily constituting the perspective of the ILO or any other organization involved in the project.

*Funding for this project evaluation was provided by the United States Department of Labor. This report does not necessarily reflect the views or policies of the United States Department of Labor nor does mention of trade names, commercial products, or organizations imply endorsement by the United States Government.*

---

<sup>1</sup> **Tungalag Chuluun, MSW**

## **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

ACRONYMS AND GLOSSARY .....	1
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY .....	3
EVALUATION METHODOLOGY .....	6
BACKGROUND ON PROPOSED NSP-WFCL .....	8
EVALUATION FINDINGS .....	9
1. Project Design and Relevance .....	9
2. Project Implementation and Effectiveness .....	10
3. Project Efficiency .....	24
4. Project Sustainability .....	25
CONCLUSIONS .....	27
RECOMMENDATIONS .....	29
ANNEXES .....	33
ANNEX 1. Terms of Reference .....	33
Annex 2 .....	47
Achievements by areas of work .....	47
Annex 3 .....	63
Achievements by Action Programme (with direct services) .....	63
Annex 4 .....	75
Project target beneficiaries and the progress to date .....	75
Annex 5 .....	78
SERVICES PROVIDED TO CHILDREN AND THEIR FAMILIES .....	78
Annex 6 List of documents consulted .....	80

---

**“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.**

## ACRONYMS AND GLOSSARY

ADC	Adolescents Development Centre
AP	Action Programme
APSO	Action Programme Summary Outline
CL	Child Labour
CMTU	Confederation of Mongolian Trade Unions
CRC	Convention of the Rights of the Child
CSEC	Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Child
ECPAT	End Child Prostitution, Child Pornography, and Trafficking of Children for Sexual Purposes
EDCM	Education Donors' Consultative Mechanism
ESC	Equal Step Centre
FDC	Family Development Centre
IA	Implementing Agency
ILO	International Labour Organization
IPEC	International Programme for Elimination of Child Labour
GO BKH	Governor's Office of Bayankhongor aimag
GO DG	Governor's Office of Dornogobi aimag
GO DO	Governor's Office of Dornod aimag
GoM	Government of Mongolia
GO UVH	Governor's Office of Uvurkhangai aimag
GO TU	Governor's Office of Tuv aimag
GO UB	Governor's Office of Ulaanbaatar city
GO NA	Governor's Office of Nalaikh district
GO UBC	Government Office of the Ulaan-Baatar
LSP-WFCL	Local Sub Programme on Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour
MCRC	Mongolian Child Rights Centre
MDG	Millennium Development Goals
MoH	Ministry of Health
MoSWL	Ministry of Social welfare and Labour
MoESC	Ministry of Education, Science and Culture
MoFA	Ministry of Food and Agriculture
MoJHA	Ministry of Justice and Home Affairs
MCTU	Mongolian Confederation of Trade Unions
MoESC	Ministry of Education, Science and Culture
MONEF	Mongolia Employers Federation
MoRTT	Ministry of Road, Transportation and Tourism
NAC	National Authority for Children
NCC	National Children's Council
NFE	Non- Formal Education
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
NHRCM	National Human Rights Commission of Mongolia
NPDP	National Programme of the Development and Protection of Children
NSC-CL	National Steering Committee on Child Labour

---

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

NSO	National Statistical Office
NSP- WFCL	National Sub Programme on Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour
RCC UB	Red Cross Committee of Ulaanbaatar
SC	Service Contract
SC UK	Save the Children, UK
SSIA	State Specialized Inspection Agency
TBM	Time Bound Measures
TBP	Time Bound Programme
TPR	Technical Progress Report
WDACL	World Day Against Child Labour
WFCL	Worst Forms of Child Labour
UB	Ulaanbaatar (the capital of Mongolia)
UCDCY	Ulaan-Baatar City Department for Children and Youth
UN	United Nations
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund

## **GLOSSARY**

Aimag	Province
Soum	Administrative unit below aimag
Bagh	Administrative unit below soum
Khoroo	Administrative unit below district of Ulaanbaatar
Ger	Traditional felt dwelling
Local Representatives Hural	Local Parliament (at Aimag level)
MNT	Mongolian currency

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This report is the outcome of the mid term evaluation of the project **“Support to the Proposed National Sub-Programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time Bound Measures”** (September 30, 2005-December 31, 2009), MON/05/P50/USA, implemented by ILO IPEC, funded by the United States Department of Labour (USDOL). The project builds on the previous experiences of implementation of two phases of the country programmes (since 1999) in Mongolia and supports the national goals for elimination of the worst forms of child labour.

The intended primary audience of this report is ILO IPEC, its project management in Mongolia and the National Steering Committee on Child Labour (NSC-CL). It also intends to inform the USDOL and other key stakeholders of the project.

Child labour in Mongolia<sup>2</sup> is strongly underpinned by the country’s context of widespread poverty and increasing inequality<sup>3</sup>, and inadequate access to education services especially in rural areas and peri-urban areas of the capital. Children largely work in agriculture (including herding livestock for other families) and informal sectors. Commercial sexual exploitation of children is commonly believed to be increasing. Following a rapid extension of mining sector in recent years, the number of informal miners, including children, is on increase.

This is the first project in Mongolia has been designed and implemented with a time bound programme (TBP) approach to promote integrated and coordinated policies and initiatives at different levels to eliminate specified Worst Forms of Child Labour (WFCL). As such, the project set two interlinked strategic objectives of: i) strengthening the enabling environment (policy, legislation, knowledge development, capacity building) for national actions against WFCL; and ii) development of area based intervention models at local level targeting boys and girls at risk or engaged in WFCL for prevention, withdrawal and rehabilitation that could be replicated in different areas and or at a larger scale. While the efforts for strengthening the enabling environment take place at national level, the direct action programme interventions at local level take place in five Aimags<sup>4</sup> and Ulaanbaatar (UB)-the capital. Prioritized WFCL include mining, herding, child domestic workers, prostitution and child labour in urban informal sector.

The Immediate Objectives defined under the above two strategic objectives are as follows:

---

<sup>2</sup> According to the National Child Labour Survey (NCLS) 2002-2003, the country has an economically active child population of 68,580 children aged 5-17, which is 10.1% of the child population of this age group.

<sup>3</sup> Despite the reasonable macroeconomic stability and growth since 2000, poverty has stayed at roughly the same level for the decade. The latest poverty estimate indicated that 32.2 per cent of Mongolians still live in poverty. Between 2003 and 2006 there was a sharp increase in national inequality, as well as intra-urban and intra-rural inequality. (Gini coefficient, the national average, has increased from 0.329 in 2002 to 0.380 in 2006.)

<sup>4</sup> Mongolia is administratively divided into 21 Aimags (provinces) and the capital city Ulaanbaatar. Each aimag is divided into soums and then baghs. Ulaanbaatar is divided into districts which are further divided into khoroo.

- i) By the end of the project, coordinated policy responses will have been put in place and national, Aimag and local level capacities will have been rendered capable of planning, implementing, coordinating, and evaluating the NSP-WFCL;
- ii) By the end of the project, the government, employers and workers' organizations, NGOs, civil society, general public, media, parents and children at all levels in Mongolia will have become aware of the negative consequences of the WFCL and will have been mobilized to take coordinated time bound measures on WFCL; and
- iii) By the end of the project, an integrated, and sustainable area-based intervention model to combat the worst forms of child labour in Mongolia in selected areas will have been implemented and documented.

The purpose of the MTE was to determine the project role in supporting the national, time bound initiatives in eliminating child labour in the country. The evaluation objectives were to assess the overall progress of the project towards achieving its specific objectives set forth in supporting the national initiatives in eliminating child labour at both national and local levels, in light of the overall ILO evaluation concerns such as relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability; identify the main challenges and emerging issues in the project implementation process and provide specific recommendations on how to address them.

The evaluation was carried out during November 2007 involving a desk review of appropriate materials, field visits to action programmes in two Aimags and UB with a number of meetings with various stakeholders. The main methods of data collection in the field were semi structured interviews with distinct questions for different informants; focus group discussions with the Aimag/City, Soum project task force members; group discussions (and individual interviews where appropriate) with children involved in the project interventions, their parents; and community members at project sites. By using different sources of information, the collected data was verified and cross checked to the extent of possibilities existed. The tools used for data analysis include the ILO IPEC standard evaluation instruments for assessing achievements by areas of work and by action programmes, as well as comparison of resource allocation per project immediate objectives and per action programme components. The preliminary findings of the evaluation were presented to the project in-country stakeholders and validated.

The main limitation of the evaluation methodology was that selection of field visit sites in countryside was largely affected by the geographical location of the project Aimags and Soums; and that excluded the remote Soums from field visits. Therefore, there is a risk that the evaluation may not discover if there were any specific implementation issues in more remote places that might be of interest to the objectives of the evaluation.

An overall evaluation conclusion is that by successfully building upon the solid experiences of the previous two phases, in the first two years of the implementation the project has made considerable progresses towards achieving the objectives set forth. Besides having some very encouraging, concrete achievements in areas of policy mainstreaming and knowledge building etc, the project was able to build firm foundations of sustainable practice of area based integrated, time bound interventions in selected areas.

The project design proved to be highly appropriate to the developmental context, and the needs of the country, and consistent with and supportive of the national policies. Its well-defined strategic and

---

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures”.

immediate objectives clearly guide the project interventions. Overall, the project objectives appear to be achievable by the end of the project life. However the immediate objective 2, scaling up the awareness building at the national level and mobilizing all actors in combating the WFCL in the country, might be too ambitious given the project lifetime and the limited resources attached.

The project has been highly instrumental in establishing a sustainable mechanism for national level policy coordination and in strengthening the capacity and responsibilities of local governments in combating child labour. Ongoing capacity building efforts at both local and national levels found to be appropriate to the local needs and some encouraging results are emerging. Solid foundations of developing area based integrated intervention models have been successfully built in selected Aimags, with some emerging good practices in the field. However, development of such model in UB appears more challenging.

In the second year of the implementation, the project has made a good progress in relation to its target on preventing and withdrawing children from child labour. However, the internal monitoring and reporting systems need to be improved so that the number of children prevented or withdrawn is objectively defined apart from the number of children targeted for such purpose and have been provided with educational and other types of services.

As the project enters the latter half of its implementation period, the overall process needs to be accelerated rapidly by intensifying the technical support from the IPEC team. In the next two years, to the extent of possibilities exist, the project needs to widen its existing partnership and intensify networking with UN and other actors, promote a strong base of civil society support (including media), in combating child labour. Effective mobilization of media needs to be an ongoing process with relevant capacity building efforts enriched and linked with real cases of policy and practice responses coming out of the work in the field.

While the project has taken some very important steps in establishing a broad-base common understanding of child labour issues and in promoting actions required, there is still a need to do more. The process should be complimented with concrete advocacy efforts (by the IPEC team and other key stakeholders) for wider replications of the best practices and models developed under the project and public policy improvements.

For the remaining two years, the project will need to continue its strategic support to the National Steering Committee on Child Labour (NSC-CL), and take some proactive actions to facilitate the process, so that the Committee fully undertakes its lead role in national level policy development, mainstreaming, and coordination for the best results to eliminate the WFCL. With a strong leadership of the NSC-CL, the initiatives of the Government of Mongolia and its partners in combating child labour in the country are likely to be sustained.

Nevertheless while the sustainability of the project, as a whole, is likely to be high, the sustainability of a few individual action programmes may not be equally high as of this point of time. Concrete strategies and actions are required to effectively address the issue.

The project planned outcomes in relation to the attached resources are sufficient, and the progresses to date prove to be so. Successful delivery of the planned outcomes will continue to bring about considerable changes in the national policy and practice responses to child labour issues in the country and lasting improvements in the lives of the children targeted.



## EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

The evaluation focused on identifying and analysing project results through addressing key questions related to the main evaluation concerns and the achievements of the project immediate objectives using data from the logical framework indicators.

A desk review covered various types of the project documents including APSO, action programme technical and financial progress reports, four-monthly reports to the donor and related correspondence, previous phase evaluation report; and relevant reference materials from secondary sources such as relevant government policies, programmes, baselines and reports etc.

The field visits covered projects in selected two out of total five Aimags and all seven direct action programmed in UB. The two Aimags were selected upon consultation with the IPEC project management considering the implementing stage of the action programmes in Aimags, the types of the WFCL that the project addresses in each of Aimags, and geographical locations of Aimags. The latter had to be considered given the fact that the project Aimags are located in different regions of the vast territory of the country and the only way of travelling to and from was by a road. Within each of the selected two Aimags, three soums, including Aimag Centre Soum, were chosen for a visit, again with consideration of the type/s of WFCL in those localities, and the distance from the Aimag centre. In this way the field visits intended to cover as much as possible the project interventions addressing different types of the WFCL.

Data collection methods used were semi structured interviews with distinct questions for the project management team, the NSC-CL and its secretariat, implementing agencies, local government officials; focus group discussions with the Aimag/City, Soum project task force members; group discussions (and individual interviews where appropriate) with children involved in the project interventions, their parents; and community members at the project sites. A few home visits and a visit to a temporary shelter for girls involved in sexual exploitation were done. The project internal assessment and experience sharing workshop that was organized at the onset of the evaluation mission was another source of information. Representatives of the donor and the director of the ILO office for China and Mongolia were interviewed. By using different sources of information, the collected data was verified and cross checked to the extent of possibilities existed.

The tools used for data analysis include the ILO IPEC standard evaluation instruments for assessing achievements by areas of work (Annex 2. Achievements by areas of work) and by action programmes (Annex 3. Achievements by Action Programmes) as well as comparison of resource allocation per project immediate per objectives (Footnote 8) and per components of action programmes in Aimags (Annex 8. Budget Analysis: Aimag APs) and a few selected action programmes in UB. The preliminary findings of the evaluation were presented to the project stakeholders and validated.

The main limitation of the evaluation methodology was connected with the selection of Aimags and Soums for field visits. Because of the time factor, Soums reachable within up to 6 hours of drive from the Aimag centre were only considered for field visits excluding more remote ones. For the same reason of a distance, it is very likely that the Soums visited by the evaluation mission have been most closely monitored and supported by the Aimag Task Force and have had more access to information than the remote ones. Therefore, there is a limitation that the evaluation may not discover if there were any specific implementation issues in more remote places.

---

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures”.

Other limitations were that: i) Connected with the above, the evaluation findings on emerging good practices were limited to the ones that were clearly observed during the field visits although stakeholders expressed that there are some others. Therefore potential good practices that were not apparent at the time of visit or those in areas not visited may not be located by the evaluation; ii) Because of the circumstances, especially in countryside, the representatives of parents and local partners interviewed were located largely by the implementing agencies. So there was a chance of getting “selective” views and feedback of parents and local partners whom the implementing agencies work with; and iii) Depending on local circumstances in rural Soums, non-formal education classes were organized at different points of time with varying duration for each of the series of training<sup>5</sup>. So in a few places, the time of the evaluation mission did not coincided with the time of non formal classes, therefore there was a limited opportunity to meet the children benefited from those activities.

---

<sup>5</sup> In one case it was organized so that the same group of children was to attend non formal education classes three times a year, for a month each time. In another the case at mining site, it was organized only during the warm season.

## BACKGROUND ON PROPOSED NSP-WFCL

In order to meet the goal of eliminating WFCL established in the National Programme for the Development and Protection of Children (NPDPC, 2002-2010)<sup>6</sup>, Ministry of Social Welfare and Labour (MoSWL) in consultation with key stakeholders drafted a National Sub-Programme on Combating the Worst Forms of Child Labour (NSP-WFCL). The draft NSP-WFCL was submitted to the Cabinet for discussion and adoption. In June 2005, the NSP-WFCL was used as the basis for the development of a detailed national plan of action for the elimination of WFCL within a time-bound format.

However, the NSP-WFCL did not come into effect as per se due to the conclusion that a stand-alone NSP-WFCL was not necessary, instead that should be an integral part of the national action plan under the framework of the NPDPC. The government approved the NPDPC Phase II Action Plan (2005-2007) that included most of the actions proposed by the draft NSP-WFCL. Therefore, that action plan has been serving the role of the proposed NSP-WFCL to the extent that sets a general framework of government actions prioritized in regard to elimination of child labour and financial resources to be mobilized from both government and external sources.

A paradox is that the NPDPC target to reduce the number of children engaged in hazardous and intolerable child labour by 95%, by 2010 was set without a clear baseline for the year 2002, thus stayed largely un-measurable. Therefore, the estimation of the National Child Labour Survey (2002-2003) that some 68,000 children aged 5-17 (which is 10.1% of the child population in this age group) were engaged in child labour, is likely to serve for such baseline purpose.

The NPDPC Phase III Action Plan (2008-2010, to be to be developed) shall open a new window for the National Steering Committee on the Child Labour (NSC-CL) and the project, to advocate for more concrete and coordinated commitments of government and other actors for elimination of child labour.

---

<sup>6</sup> The National Programme of the Development and Protection of Children (2002-2010) provides the overall framework of actions to protect the rights and development of children. The programme has several goals related to education, health, development, participation and protection from exploitation and abuse. In addition, it sets the goal of eliminating the worst forms of child labour, through the implementation of measures such as nation-wide awareness raising and attitude change, training of officials, strengthening law enforcement through improved labour inspection and public monitoring.

## EVALUATION FINDINGS

### ***1. Project Design and Relevance***

This is the first project in Mongolia that has been implemented since the TBP approach was introduced.

It is a well designed project. The project objectives are clear, logical, relevant to the country's developmental context and the needs, consistent with and supportive of the national policies<sup>7</sup>. The logical framework of the project is designed well with clear link and logic between the strategic and immediate objectives, planned outputs and activities.

Based on the ILO advantage and the experience in the country, the project focuses its support on strengthening of policy framework, capacity building including knowledge development for planning and designing time bound measures, implementing programmes and evaluating, awareness raising and social mobilization.

Reviewing and harmonizing legislation and strengthening the policy framework, further mainstreaming child labour concerns into overall national development agendas and programmes, development of the knowledge base and establishment of national and local child monitoring systems are necessary for effective elimination of child labour in the country.

Scaling up the awareness building at the national level and mobilizing all actors in combating the WFCL in the country are highly relevant to the local needs, but appears too ambitious given the project lifetime and the limited resources attached<sup>8</sup>, unless its expected scope is limited to the project intervention areas only. While this objective is broad and ambitious enough, the scope of the planned outputs (actions) appears limited in regards to the objective set forth.

The strategy to promote integrated and sustainable area-based intervention models to combat the WFCL in selected areas is an excellent one. It is to deliver tangible impacts on the lives of the children that the project works with, and genuinely promote the local initiatives, coordination and ownership.

In terms of intervention strategies, possibly more straightforward strategies for rapid removal of children from scavenging on dumpsites could have been explored. In the evaluator's view, children scavenging on dumpsites must be considered for immediate removal rather than gradual withdrawal through provision of educational, health and other services alike in other cases. Children (and adults) are there basically for a survival so no surprise that the IA's internal assessment report highlights that

---

<sup>7</sup> Those include, but not limited to, the Economic Growth Support and Poverty Reduction Strategies (EGSPRS), the Government Action Plan, the National Programme on Development and Protection of Children, the National Programme for Gender Equality etc. The consistency is further witnessed by the UN Country Common Assessment 2005, and UN Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF), 2007-2011 as well as Mongolia Human Development Report 2007, MDG Report (2007) and the Government reports (currently pending for a submission) under UN CRC, ILO Convention 182 and 138.

<sup>8</sup> The financial resources (132, 000 USD) allocated for the this objective (Immediate Objective 2) composes only 9% of the total programme budget whereas, the budget share for the Immediate Objective 1 and 3 compose 29% and 62% respectively.

**“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures”.**

the efforts for removal without offering to them and/or their families other alternatives for income generation would have very limited results.

While the objectives, in general, can be considered realistic given the country context and the solid foundations built during the previous phases of the ILO IPEC interventions, the immediate objectives, particularly 1 and 2, could have been formulated in a “measurable” way. With the current formulation, with no quantified indicators setting the targets for the project lifetime it will be difficult at later stage to assess to what extent the objectives were met. Particularly, the immediate objective 2 (scaling up the awareness building at the national level and mobilizing all relevant actors in combating the WFCL in the country) is hardly measurable.

The number of good indicators are there that can indicate the overall progress in particular areas of interest to the project, but without quantified targets they would not necessarily indicate if the progress was good enough or to the extent that the project aimed to. For instance, the indicator (3.2. number of non-project Aimags/Soums, and or other agencies taking initiatives to apply the intervention models) will indicate only if the number of such Aimag/Soums and/or other agencies was on increase, but not what the project target was in this regard and to what extent that was achieved.

## **2. Project Implementation and Effectiveness**

### ***Start Up:***

It has been two years since the project launch in November 2005 and the mid term evaluation comes in. The project start up stage has been a lengthy process and the very first direct action programmes came into realization in October 2006 only (See Annex 1. Action Programmes Start Up). However it is understandable given the fact of the newness of the TBP approach, and the very need to promote local ownership through the process of consultation on and planning of local strategies and interventions in combating child labour in their localities.

As a whole, process wise, allocating adequate time for the consultation and planning stage proved to be worth for local governments to take their expected roles to lead the process. A pre planning consultative meeting was organized among project aimag representatives and consultative planning workshops were organized in all project Aimags and the UB. Through this process, the local actors – tripartite representatives, local governors and respective officials of local agencies (in charge of education, health, social welfare, employment and labor inspection etc), media and other civil society representatives gained common understanding of child labour issues and related problems in their localities, and made the first efforts of drafting their local strategies for combating child labour. Those draft strategies served later as a basis for development of the local (Aimag and UB) sub programmes on elimination of the WFCL (LSP-WFCL).

Besides the lengthy process of consultation, there were some delays in start up of a few action programmes, one in UB and two in Tuv and Dornogovi Aimags, largely due to the lack of local government initiatives. Those action programmes started only 12-13 months after the respective LSP-WFCL had been developed.

While the direct action programmes in UB started as planned, the one on capacity building and coordination started late due to a long delay in developing the project document. The contract of cooperation between ILO and the City Government was signed in June 2007 but the AP Task force has been established in November 2007 only during the evaluation mission.

After addressing the start up issues, the project is progressing well with some very encouraging results of work emerging. (See Annex 2. Achievements by Areas of Work; and Annex 3. Achievements by Action Programmes)

***Supporting the NSC-CL in its national level coordination and implementation of child labour policies***

As a response to the need of addressing child labour issues at the national level (beyond the projects and programmes supported by donor and international organizations), upon the initiatives of the project, the National Steering Committee<sup>9</sup> was renewed in May 2006 to serve as the National Steering Committee on Child Labour (NSC-CL).

The project provides ongoing support to the NSC-CL to build its capacity in its new role in promoting child labour policies, strategies and improvements of relevant legislations, mainstreaming child labour issues into national and sectoral agendas as well as mobilizing the efforts of social partners and civil society actors in the policy implementation. A tri-partite Secretariat was established to support the function of the committee. The roles of the committee members have been redefined to reinforce their roles as the focal points for their relevant institutions in linking with and improving the relevant policy coordination. (However no specific role was designated officially to the Deputy Chair of the Committee -National Authority for Children (NAC) so the NAC is not adequately empowered for taking a more proactive and lead role.)

The project technical supports to the NSC-CL are guided by the strategies of i) improving the familiarity of the members of the committee and its secretariat with the field implementation of existing policies and actions so that enable them to identify policy and programme gaps in the field; and ii) mainstreaming child labour concerns into actions of line Ministries and improving the linkages and coordination of sectoral policies.

Although the NSC-CL is not yet fully functional in its newly defined role, there are some clear signs that the Committee has made some solid steps into that direction under a steady leadership of the MoSWL and with great support of the project. The committee has been highly instrumental in promoting a tripartite partnership in combating child labour in the country, initiating a high profile awareness building campaigns throughout the country, making an effective use of the WDACL and obtaining the highest level of the government commitments for particular initiatives for addressing child labour issues in the country. The participation of the line ministries in the NSC-CL functions is gradually improving. As a result of increased understanding of child labour issues by line ministries, some concrete actions in regard to child labour have been undertaken by the line ministries, namely the Ministry of Education , Science and Culture (MoESC), Ministry of Food and Agriculture (MoFA), and Ministry of Justice and Home Affairs (MoJHA) with support of the project.

---

<sup>9</sup> It was first established in 2000 as IPEC National Steering Committee under the Ministry of Social Welfare and Labour.

Yet there is still a room for further strengthening the Committee's lead role in mainstreaming child labour concerns into national and sectoral policies and its capacity on coordination at national level.

The Committee Annual Action Plan 2007 and its meeting agendas suggest if the Committee is still largely focused on the IPEC project, while there were several important developments in the year 2007 alone (such as Government reporting on the implementation of the CRC, ILO Convention 182 and 138, and MDG Report) where the Committee could have concrete input. The committee's involvement in such developments would certainly increase their capacity and opportunities for further policy analysis and mainstreaming.

#### *The NSC-CL support to the project:*

The Committee provides great support to the IPEC project. Due to the nature of the project implementation stage, the Committee's main involvement to date was largely in areas of planning of project interventions and approval of relevant documents. As the project implementation accelerates, the Committee needs to review the progresses of the action programmes and other areas of work and see the implications for policy and practice responses at all levels.

The Committee reviews project plans and terms of references for service contract works, makes decision on selection of contractors, and endorses all APSO etc. However, the Committee did not have a role in selection of implementing agencies for UB direct action programmes. Instead the selection decision was made in consultation with the UB city authorities (Social Policy Division of the Governor's Office, Department for Children and Youth) upon the review of their work during the phase II. While the practicality of such decision making process can be understandable, it has some implications in terms of empowering the Committee and fostering its ownership over the initiatives combating child labour.

#### ***Capacity building on development of child labour knowledge base***

The project has taken some highly relevant initiatives for capacity building of relevant agencies on child labour data analysis and knowledge building and monitoring.

It provides excellent support to the National Statistical Office (NSO) in conducting the National Child Labour Survey (NCLS) 2006-2007 and updating database on child labour in Mongolia. The ILO's technical assistance on the survey design, execution, data analysis and reporting was highly valuable input for building of local capacity in this regard. The work is in good progress and a report is underway to produce a data on the extent and nature of children's economic activities in general and comparison with the main results of the NCLS 2002-2003. The project also advocates for use of age limits of 5+ in future LFSs by the NSO so that the data on children's economic activities is produced on regular basis. The project is also a member of the taskforce for an ongoing work of UNICEF with the NSO (2007-2011) to introduce a number of child protection indicators into the national annual statistics.

The project is making efforts to ensure that the planned and ongoing works on establishing child labour monitoring systems (CLMS) at the national and aimag levels are closely linked with the above initiatives, and this will be a valuable contribution in developing child labour data and knowledge base in the country.

The project has also been taking a proactive role in connecting the country with the Understanding Child Work (UCW) - the ILO, WB and UNICEF joint global initiatives. An UCW mission was fielded

---

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures”.

and some principal agreements have been made to take it forward. The process will yield in-depth data analysis on child labour in the country that can be used for evidence based policy formulation and or advocacy efforts for such responses. If feasible, this work will need to be linked with or built on the outcomes of the current studies on the WFCL undertaken by the National Human Rights Commission of Mongolia (NHRCM).

### ***Policy mainstreaming***

#### **Education:**

Jointly with the Save the Children, the project successfully advocated for the relevant amendments in the Education Law of Mongolia. The amendments (2006), amongst other principally important provisions, introduced a per student budget allocation for non-formal education delivery, and consequently the MoESC adopted a new regulation on delivery of primary and secondary education through non formal equivalency programmes and a joint decree by the Minister for Finance and Minister for Education was issued for the funding (Oct, 2007). With these changes funding for non formal education delivery is to increase significantly and logically so the access to non formal education. It also opens up new opportunities for private and non governmental organizations to be engaged in education delivery through such funding mechanism. The active involvement of the IPEC team in this advocacy process has brought outstanding results.

The team currently supports the MoESC on development of strategies for provision of educational services to children who are out of reach of the education system. The work is highly relevant to the context of the country targets on MDG, EFA and the Education Master Plan (2006-2015). The needs for improving the effectiveness of the education delivery has been witnessed by the persistent school drop out rate in the country especially in rural and remote areas, therefore the project initiatives to support the MoESC in undertaking a more strategic and proactive position in this regard are excellent and have a high potential value.

The work is in early stage of development, and the MoESC shows a good commitment. A working group was established to collect data, undertake relevant studies and develop the strategies. The draft methodology (as of Nov 2007) indicates that the process might benefit from paying more attention to policy and systems analysis and having wider participation and diverse perspectives of other stakeholders. There are a number of local and international organizations working in the field and some in-country experiences have already been accumulated.

Provision of educational services has been extensively used in the field as one of the effective interventions for preventing and withdrawing children from the WFCL. So if resources permit, the project direct support on (re)integration of working children into schools could be strategically backed up with other interventions at policy level as to promote better link between formal and non formal education and more “welcoming” environment and attitude at the receiving end, and better institutional support to the children who might be at a risk of child labour due to economic reasons<sup>10</sup>.

---

<sup>10</sup> A potential intervention in this regard could be support to the MoESC (and other stakeholders) in assessing the effectiveness of the existing government policy/programme on provision of school supply to children from poor families, and defining the ways to improve its targeting and the quality of supplies. Such interventions would have far reaching effects in supporting children's schooling, thus in preventing from school drop out and consequently from child labour.



By joining the existing Education Donors' Coordination Mechanism (EDCM)<sup>11</sup> in the country, the ILO/IPEC will have more opportunities for being regularly informed on the ongoing developments in the education sector, and make a voice for mainstreaming child labour issues into government and donor policies and plans of actions.

#### Youth employment:

There is a clear need for improving youth career counseling capacity in the country and the project implementing agencies rightly indicate the importance of the effectiveness of such services that potentially can have significant impacts on the lives of the youth. While planning is ongoing in this regard, as a response to the need of preparing youth for employment, the project has recently started a pilot training among school dropout children/youth and child workers using "Know About Business" (KAB) training module. This work has a high potential of being replicated into secondary and vocational training schools as well as non formal education classes for youth.

#### Child Jockeys:

The project had employed a highly effective yet culturally sensitive approach in sensitizing the issue of child jockeys, backed up with evidence based advocacy under the leadership of the key national actors such as the NHRCM and the NAC. The involvement of the concerned actors in the process including the National Sports Committee and the Horse Trainers' Associations had a crucial importance in effectively approaching this culturally sensitive issue and building an ally. Thus the issue of the safety of child jockeys has been successfully brought up to the public attention. A consequent policy response was the amendments made to the Regulations of Horse Races of the National Grand Festival (2006) to increase the responsibilities of the horse trainers and the owners for the protection of children's health and safety, and the award and recognition of the work of child jockeys.

Through this support, the project made a solid foundation for the issue of child jockeys being sensitized and accepted nationwide and addressed. The efforts proved to be highly sustainable with the high level of awareness of the issue across the country and the ongoing initiatives under the NAC leadership.

#### Child protection:

Child protection is a complex issue. The concept of child protection is relatively new in the country and the current opinion leaders are the UNICEF and SC UK. Thanks to their advocacy efforts the issue of child protection has been put on the government agenda, yet there is no commonly agreed or accepted concept of child protection and the child protection system that the country needs to develop in order to protect its children. In this context, the ILO/IPEC voice is important and its active involvement in the current developments of opinion formulation would add a value.

The project currently supports MoJHA (see below) in analyzing the relevant national laws and regulations and developing recommendations to bring them in line with international conventions concerning child labour is certainly an excellent contribution into the process.

---

<sup>11</sup> In the lights of Sector Wide Approach (SWAp) initiatives in the sector, at the initiatives of the MoECS, the EDCM was established in 2005. It serves as the principal mechanism for the partnership between government of Mongolia and external donors in support of the Education Sector Master Plan-2 (2006-2015), takes the lead in consultations on key sector and thematic issues and in providing a forum for such consultations. The EDCM currently serves as the Steering Committee for Fast Track Initiatives (FTI) grant and this role is likely to be extended to a Steering Committee for all donor funded projects and the ESMP.

### Legislation:

The abovementioned work with the MoJHA is at an early stage of development. It needs some technical advice and support from the project. There are some other ongoing reviews of legislation<sup>12</sup>, hence there is a potential to link the work with them.

The work of the NHRCM on undertaking studies and preparing a report on the WFCL for submission to the Parliament of Mongolia, is likely to input to the above process although that is not the primary purpose of the work undertaken. The work is in good progress and studies have been undertaken. A timely completion of this work is very important. There is still a great advocacy opportunity that it can serve for a role of an alternative report to the Government of Mongolia report on the implementation of the UN CRC and the ILO Conventions (that are currently pending for submission).

The development of a new list of the hazardous work<sup>13</sup> by the MoSWL has long been delayed and thus its strategic importance to the most awareness raising and advocacy components of the project is likely to be diminished. This area of work needs to be addressed urgently by the IPEC and the NSC-CL, with provision of relevant technical support as needed.

### ***Capacity building on law enforcement***

Capacity building support to the State Specialized Inspections Agency (SSIA) in improving Mongolian Labour Inspectorate towards new (internationally acceptable) principles and practice is of crucial importance. The work builds on the earlier support of the IPEC in this area including the support to the labour inspection audit in 2005. A labour inspectorate's New Policy has been drafted, consulted with social partners and submitted for approval for adoption, and capacity building actions have been taken a place.

Yet to be completed, the work has a very high potential of revitalizing the Labour Inspection System of the country, and making child labour monitoring as an integral part of the system. Following the adoption of the policy, specific strategies on enforcement of child labour legislation have been planned to be developed. Nevertheless, the draft National Labour Inspection Enforcement Policy does need some explicit provisions on child labour, especially in sections of labour inspection planning and reporting, and legal responsibilities of employers.

Legal protection of children whose rights are seriously violated because of the WFCL is a currently missing element in the implementation of the action programmes. Although some elements are planned, in most cases it is beyond the capacity of the implementing NGOs.

---

<sup>12</sup> The one of UNICEF is to review the national legislation and regulations in line with the UN CRC in general and its child protection provisions in particular (The review outcome is expected to be shared in Dec 2007). The other one is to be conducted shortly as a part of the UN joint project on prevention of violence of against women and children. It will review institutional mechanisms for implementation of the existing laws and policies (including the National Programme on Protection of Women and Children from Trafficking for Sexual Exploitation) and identify gaps.

<sup>13</sup> The list of jobs prohibited to minors exists adopted by the decree of the Minister for Health and Social Welfare in 1999. However, the list is outdated therefore does not respond to current problems.

---

**“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures”.**

Therefore, training for law enforcement agencies is underway (in a planning stage) in the view of strengthening legal protection of children, especially those, but not limited to, involved in commercial child sexual exploitation. It is important that this planning takes into account the training and capacity building of law enforcement officers planned under the UB action programme on capacity building coordination<sup>14</sup>.

### ***Child Labour monitoring at national and provincial levels***

The project inputs for establishing effective child monitoring systems at both national and local levels are clearly planned. The fact that MoSWL recognized the need for such system and is willing to lead the initiative is a very positive step. However, the work is yet to be done and there is a definite need for technical support from the IPEC project team.

The project manager is well aware of the constraints and has some good plans to make the best use of the upcoming UCW project in this aspect and link with other ongoing work by the NSO and other UN agencies, and with the development of the provincial level child monitoring system that is also at an early stage of development.

Development of community based child monitoring systems in selected areas such as mining, informal sector, agriculture and service establishments, is underway and to be supported by a consulting service contracted. There are existing good experiences of piloting community based child monitoring at a coal mining site in Nalaikh district. The system was developed during the previous phase of the project and is well sustained. But there was no indication observed that this experience was successfully replicated elsewhere.

Good plans and opportunities are there, but the biggest limitation is the time factor. Ideally those actions could have been taken at earlier stages of the project implementation, but apparently that was not feasible. However, as the project enters now its latter half of its lifetime (although the individual action programmes are at various stages of their implementation), it is utmost important that those developments proceed without a further delay. Delays in any of those developments would significantly diminish the practical importance of the systems, their sustainability, and potential to input to awareness buildings as well as relevant policy developments and advocacy efforts.

### ***Development of Advocacy Strategy on the Elimination of Child Labour***

The Advocacy Strategy on the Elimination of Child Labour was developed with participation of the key stakeholders. Process wise it was a valuable endeavor of learning for the participating parties. The strategy was officially endorsed in May 2007 by the National Children's Council headed by the Prime Minister. The implementation responsibility lies with the NAC. Discussions on further support to the NAC and other key stakeholders in this regard are ongoing.

In the evaluators' view, it is a broad framework for awareness raising, targeting various sectors/actors of the society through a deliberate and strategic use of information. As such, it is a very important resource document for all concerned stakeholders.

---

<sup>14</sup> It is also worth to explore opportunities to link or coordinate those efforts with the earlier mentioned UN joint project where training of law enforcement officers in prevention of child trafficking and sexual exploitation are underway.

While this is an important step in establishing a broad-base common understanding of child labour issues and actions required, it should not undermine the very need for the IPEC ( and other key stakeholders) of having concrete advocacy strategies and actions particularly for public policy improvements and wider replication of best practices and models developed under the project.

### ***Capacity building of partners in advocacy***

There is an ongoing work on developing a toolkit on advocacy against child labour. A small-scale study of the advocacy needs and demands of the project partners and other relevant organizations was undertaken and considered into account in developing a draft toolkit. The draft- in- progress was not available for a review, but it is believed that is the work to help the partners to bring the earlier mentioned Advocacy Strategy on Combating the WFCL onto the ground, equip them with a set of skills in planning, undertaking, monitoring and evaluating advocacy actions for a particular change purpose. As such, this capacity building efforts should benefit the IPEC project team too.

Nevertheless those advocacy capacity building initiatives need to be complimented with concrete, practical advocacy efforts (with close involvement of the IPEC) on particular issues that are interest to the project.

### ***Awareness raising at national level***

No doubt that the all aspects of the project implementation process contribute to public awareness raising in one way or another. However, there were some particular strategies and actions specifically planned and undertaken for such purpose.

The WDACL has been observed each year since 2005. Relevant documentations and the observations from the field visits suggest that the NSC-CL and the IPEC team make an excellent use of the observance of the day not only for awareness building but assuring the commitments of the government and other key actors in combating child labour. Nationwide campaigns on the WDACL 2006 contributed to raising a visibility of global and local efforts against child labour. The national consultation meeting with a tripartite participation adopted policy recommendations on the elimination of the worst forms of child labour. The WDACL 2007 had far reaching effects with the Prime Minister's special instructions issued to all local governments to initiate a year long campaigns locally to address child labour in agriculture. Follow up actions are ongoing across the country.

The efforts in mainstreaming child labour issues into university training have been successful. The textbook on child labour for university students, and teachers' handbook were endorsed by academic councils of four major universities for use. This was an excellent contribution in awareness building among university students and faculty (of various fields) on child labour, its complexity and the implications for various social actors and professionals.

Training and some other efforts were taken to establish sustainable partnership with the media that are operational at national level. However, effective mobilization of media in combating child labour needs to be an ongoing, alive process with relevant capacity building efforts enriched and linked with real cases of policy and practice responses coming out of the work in the field. There is a clear need in the field for the local awareness building efforts and interventions supported by key, user friendly media products that can be used or adjusted to the local contexts. Raising awareness on mercury hazards has been one of the pressing needs in some of Aimags where informal mining takes a place.

Establishing effective and sustainable partnership with local media at local (Aimag) level and promoting their active voice in combating child labour has not been fully successful yet.

A number of innovative interventions are planned in line with implementation of the Advocacy Strategy on Combating the WFCL. But there is also a limitation of the time factor on their potential contribution during the project lifetime in creating more enabling environment for combating the WFCL through changing the social attitude and behaviors.

### ***Local capacity building in policy making, implementation and monitoring***

From the very beginning the project has been providing ongoing support on planning and development of area based integrated interventions on combating the WFCL in UB and the selected five Aimags. (Annex 3. Achievements by Action Programmes)

#### **Development of area based, time bound intervention models in selected Aimags:**

There are varying degrees of maturity of local capacity and coordination largely depending on the particular stage of implementation of individual action programmes, the level of ownership and leadership of local government, and the extend of mobilization of human and financial resources. Overall, the solid foundations of area based integrated intervention models have been built and there are some signs of emerging good practices in the field.

Development of a proposed area based intervention model for elimination of the WFCL at the onset of the project had a paramount importance in shaping the visions. Proposed components, strategies and principals of actions were clearly spelled out<sup>15</sup>. Although not necessarily universally well grasped by all local partners up until this point, the proposed model of intervention has been serving as a building block for the entire process.

Thorough and thoughtful support provided to the Aimags, especially during the planning and strategy development stage has started yielding the fruits now. As mentioned earlier, having developed (by local people) a LSP-WFCL in each of the selected Aimags has been truly instrumental in mobilizing local initiatives, increasing the local government leadership and responsibilities in combating the WFCL and improving the accountability for the changes brought about.

The process of the LSP-WFCL being approved by the Local Representative Hural, and implementation of the action programmes in support to the LSP-WFCL provided excellent preconditions for effective linkage of the action programmes with the local development policies, building local ownership over the initiatives, and increasing the sustainability of the action programmes.

---

<sup>15</sup> **Components** proposed are: i) Policy coordination, implementation and capacity building; ii) Awareness raising and attitude change; iii) Knowledge base and research; iv) Child labour monitoring; v) Direct actions for removal of children from WFCL; vi) Law reinforcement; and vii) Social partnership and collaboration.

**Principals** proposed for actions are: i) Integrated and logically linked; ii) Linked with existing policy, structure and finance; iii) With priority attention on prevention of child labour; iv) With priority attention on elimination of WFCL; v) Based on tripartite partnership and collaboration; vi) Linked with State policy on informal employment; and vii) Respectful to child rights and privacy.

---

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures”.

With inclusion of the LSP-WFCL in Aimag Annual Socio-Economic Development Framework, and Aimag Governor's Action Plan, the Aimag and Soum governors and relevant officials are to be held accountable for the outcomes that are monitored through their annual, results based management contracts<sup>16</sup>.

The level of ownership and enthusiasm over the local initiatives in combating the WFCL was encouragingly notable in the Aimags (visited). The local action programmes have brought a new practice of a tripartite partnership at Aimag level. Although the very nature of involvement of employers' and workers' organizations in the implementation process is not necessarily yet in its ideal form (in line with their organizational mission and mission) in all places, there are some good signs that such knowledge and experiences are emerging (Uvurkhangai, Bayankhongor, Nalaih). The action programmes also helped the local governments to explore for opportunities of linking local initiatives with the ones supported by various international organizations locally.

The extent of the project reach varies from a place to a place. As a minimum, the project actions involve the Soums selected for the project direct support, but in areas where the LSP-WFCL has been most effectively used as an instrument to mobilize the local actions (Uvurkhangai), local capacity building and awareness raising efforts benefit all Soums (project and non-project) consequently leading to concrete actions. It was evident in the field that the earlier mentioned WDACL 2007 has successfully promoted the local actions on child labour in agriculture, thus broadened the scope of the local interventions on combating child labour.

It is not to say that everything is excellent, but these are the encouraging and emerging signs to suggest that area based intervention models can be developed locally and sustained.

It was commonly recognized that the main focus so far was on establishing the coordination mechanisms, capacity building and awareness raising, selection of children and services to provide. However, it is the time to have more strategic and thoughtful actions in all aspects of building of integrated intervention models that can be sustained with local efforts.

Local project implementing mechanisms appear to be the same - Aimag and Soum task forces established in every place following the local government structures. But the nature of the management, the level of participation and sense of ownership, the scope and depth of the understanding of the project objectives and intervention strategies vary from a place to a place, but in the most cases were adequate in the both Aimags visited.

A project management built onto the local government structure appears to be most effective and sustainable. There was a case that Aimag Task Force has been actively implementing the project activities by passing a Soum level. Perhaps that was grounded on the local context and might be a good solution for a short run. But the responsibilities shall be gradually delegated down to a Soum level.

The level of transparency in the project management (Uvurkhangai and Bayankhongor) proved to be positively influencing on the level of participation, ownership and enthusiasm of the stakeholders.

The action programmes in Tuv and Dornogovi Aimags, particularly the latter, need more attention and targeted support from the IPEC team. The evaluator did not visit those Aimags, but review of the available reports and interviews with the Aimag task force representatives indicate that the action

---

<sup>16</sup> It was reported to be happening so in two Aimags (Bayankhongor and Uvurkhangai) and witnessed at least in the latter.

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures”.

programmes are still in very initial stage of implementation. The reports and interviews with the relevant officials suggest that the project implementation in Dornod province is in good progress.

#### Development of area based, time bound intervention models in Ulaanbaatar:

(See Annex 3. Achievements by Action Programme; and Annex 4. UB APs)

The UB LSP-WFCL was developed and supported in the same way as with the Aimags. The sub programme approval process was also through the same mechanism- the City Representative Hural.

Nevertheless, development of an area based intervention model in UB appears to be much more challenging due to the following factors:

- The action programmes<sup>17</sup> in the city had been developed as an individual action programmes rather than as integral parts of the one whole. Due to the time factor, the direct action programmes were developed and operationalised much earlier than the one with a coordination and capacity building role. (See Annex1. Action Programme Start Up). So the link between them practically did not exist.
- The project document for the city action programme on capacity building and coordination does not have such aim explicitly stated; therefore it is questionable if the city officials have the same intention as the IPEC team.
- The UB districts hardly had institutional involvement in development and implementation of the action programmes that are operational in their localities, therefore have no ownership. Some working relationships between IAs and districts have been developed on ad hoc basis along the way of implementation but that are not institutionally supported yet.

In such context, development of an area based intervention model in UB would require much more proactive positioning of the city project task force (that has just been established as of November 2007).

Apart from the above, Nalaib district of the city has shown very progressive efforts in building an area based coordinated practice of eliminating the WFCL. The district had accumulated considerable level of experience in this area through the previous phases of the IPEC project.

#### Progress in Implementation of the Action Programmes in UB:

All seven individual, direct action programmes are in good progress of implementation.

The IPEC partnership with those organizations is highly valuable not only for delivery of well needed services to the children and their families but also in terms of capacity building of local government and non governmental organizations in combating the WFCL. All implementing agencies have shown great commitment in this regard and accumulated experiences in delivering particular type of services to the target groups and working with communities and local governments.

Because of the very nature and complexity of working with children at risk of or involved in sexual exploitation, an action programme faces some challenges in effectively reaching out to the target group and establishing a rapport and relationship thus having tangible results of the efforts being made.

---

<sup>17</sup> Seven direct action programmes and one with a coordination and capacity building role;

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures”.

Although cannot be generalized for all, but there were some signs observed among implementing NGOs that the project management might need to pay more attention to. Those include: i) the level of transparency in project management, participation and ownership of staff and key partners appear to be not adequate<sup>18</sup>; ii) the importance of reaching out to the target groups needs to be reinforced; and iii) the implementing agencies are largely focused on service delivery and less on other aspects of the project strategies<sup>19</sup>.

Other points:

- Alike in UB and Aimags, the importance and efforts of reaching out to the specific target group (for particular action programme/s) need to be reinforced. There were few cases that the criteria were applied not fully and with some slight diversions<sup>20</sup>. Such practice, in long run, might reduce the very value that the IPEC initiatives add (otherwise obviously children still do benefit).

(One of the factors for not being able to reach out to the target group/s, particularly in the case of working with children in sexual exploitation, appears to be connected to the availability of the relevant experiences in doing such outreach services. In-country expertise in this area is limited, so the learning opportunities.)

- Community outreach, awareness raising and mobilization particularly of those in mining sites call for specific attention from the project management and the partners. This was particularly evident at Ult mining site in Uvurkhangai Aimag. (Due to the newness of such community interventions in the country, this type of capacity building need can be common for other areas of the project implementation.) This requires training and capacity building efforts to support the staff directly working with communities but also some level of awareness raising among Aimag and Soum officials if they are to successfully support such interventions.
- It was also observed that there is limited experience in the field, in social work case management that deems to be essential especially as the project promotes integration of supports and interventions to bring the best results from the work with particular children and families.

---

<sup>18</sup> It was observed if the action programmes are almost solely managed by the directors of the IAs. There was no case observed that Project Task Force (as planned in the APSOs, consisting from representatives of relevant organizations (city and district government, concerned NGOs and other agencies) plays an active role in implementation of APs. To name a few examples that indicate the lack of transparency and ownership of key staff and partners include cases such as Deputy Director at ADC, never seen the AP project document and therefore was not able to distinguish the (IPEC) project activities from ones of other projects (with UNICEF, for instance); in the case of the FDC project, Director of the co-implementing kindergarten (in Sukhbaatar District) had no information about the project funds therefore the kindergarten does not get (from the FDC) a fair share of the project funds for organization of weekend classes at their kindergarten etc.

<sup>19</sup> The value of having direct services shall be seen not only the impacts they bring into lives of the children whom the project works, but also in terms of their potential for a wider replication and implications for policy responses. Paying not enough attention to the latter would certainly diminish the value, thus the efficiency of overall interventions in general sense.

<sup>20</sup> For example, in the case of FDC, the original target group for prevention from the WFCL was children aged 5-6 years, who are the siblings of the working children, whom the IA provides preschool education and facilitate their enrolment into schools. But the information on the current beneficiaries indicates that 47% of the children have no working sibling/s, and 38% are below the target age.



### The IPEC project support to IAs

It was evident that the project team is committed and working hard to provide advice and support to implementing agencies as much as needed. The project partners were pleased with the level of support they receive from the IPEC project team. Particularly the direct action programme implementing agencies highlight that there was notable extension of the support compared to the previous phases.

Nevertheless, as the previous sections of this report indicated, there is a need to intensify the project technical support in the particular areas identified. The support needs at this stage is more technical (specific) than generalist and may require more of specific expertise involvement in some areas, and has implications for IPEC project staff capacity development in general.

### ***The project target and progress to date on prevention and withdrawal from child labour***

The project team has a good, detailed data on the project targeted children and services provided to them and their parents.

According to the IPEC internal monitoring data, as of 31 August 2007, since the project start it has been working with 903 and 965 children for the purpose of preventing or withdrawing respectively from the child labour. That equals to 22 % and 35% respectively of the initial target of children to be prevented or withdrawn. This progress to date is satisfactory given the fact the action programmes with direct services are have roughly gone through only less than 1/3 of their lifetime.

As result of the project intervention, 43% of the above targeted children have been (re)integrated into schools or linked to non formal education institutions, and 22% have reduced their work hours.(For further details, see Annex 5. Project Target Beneficiaries and the Progress to Date; and Annex 6. Services Provided to Children and Their Families).

Nevertheless, there are two important issues in regard to monitoring and reporting of the project progress on the targets that need to be thoroughly addressed by the IPEC project management:

- i) Very clear target criteria for prevention and withdrawal from child labour were developed by the IPEC team and endorsed by the NSC-CL at the onset of the project implementation. It includes some general criteria and few more by type of the worst forms of the child labour in the country.

However, in the field, there was a common practice of distinguishing between children to be prevented or withdrawn from child labour based on if children were in school or not. So, many of the targeted children involved in labour (even in mining), were reported as to be “prevented” instead of “withdrawn” from the WFCL, if they were still in school. Perhaps this reality was reflected in the number of children with reduced hours of work. (See Annex 6. Services Provided to Children and Their Families, Column 29).

- ii) The project has a solid system in place to monitor children’s educational enrollment and their working status but only while children are with the project (i.e. while provided with particular type of support, for instance, enrolled in a non formal education training for 3-4 months, or vocational training for 1.5 month etc). However, tracking children (at least their working status) beyond the project intervention period is yet to happen. Without such tracking the project has no way to know if children were back to work, for instance after the project training completed. Currently the implementing agencies have varying degrees of efforts in place to track the status

---

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures”.

of children (both educational and working status) beyond the project intervention period. But those efforts are not yet systematic or methodologically guided so as to produce reliable data. The existing monitoring and reporting systems indicate the children's educational and working status before and during the project intervention but not after.

A service work has been contracted to develop methodology for and building capacity of the IAs in conducting needs assessment of the targeted children (and their families) and monitoring of project services provided and tracking of the project beneficiaries (both educational and working status). With this new system, tracking of (all) children after six months of completion of the project services will be required and a sample tracking beyond this timeframe will be optional.

There is no mechanism currently to distinguish the children actually prevented or withdrawn as a result of the project intervention from those who have been provided with educational and other services with the purpose to prevent or withdraw from child labour. So, the children targeted for withdrawal, are reported as 'withdrawn' and the ones targeted for prevention are reported as "prevented" although these children may have or yet to be prevented or withdrawn in reality, as the project management does not collect additional information on children's status after project interventions are completed which may have continued after the point of reporting by implementing agencies for the purpose of donor reporting.

### *Emerging good practices*

- Development of area based integrated intervention models on elimination of child labour under the leadership of local government in Uvurkhangai Aimag and Nalaih District of UB

There is strong sense of ownership over the LSPs-WFCL and the action programmes in support to that. The LSPs-WFCL are included in the Aimag/District Annual Socio-Economic Development Framework, and Aimag/District Governor's Action Plan, therefore the governors at all levels and relevant officials are to be held accountable for the outcomes that are monitored through their annual, results based management contracts.

A solid and sustainable implementation structure has been built through local government administrative structures supported with an active tripartite partnership. The roles of the Project Task Force members are clearly defined in line with their professional or organizational roles and functions. Supports to the targeted children are delivered in an integrated manner. Transparency in the project management is apparent, and the level of participation of various actors is high.

- Child- to- child approach

Although not yet formed adequately well, there are strong interests and some efforts in the field to promote child to child approach with active involvement of child led organizations in local initiatives in combating child labour.

Uvurkhangai Aimag makes the best use of its relative advantage (over other Aimags) of having child rights officer in every Soum. Aimag Children's Centre plays an important role in promoting public awareness and local initiatives (including the ones of child led organizations) in combating the WFCL.

- **Community Based Child Labour Monitoring System**

As mentioned earlier, there were good existing experience of piloting community based child monitoring at a coal mining site in Nalaikh district. The system was developed during the previous phase of the project and is well sustained.

- **Alternative form of delivery of preschool education**

A delivery of preschool education through organization of weekend classes in communities with a shortage of kindergarten facilities is an innovative pilot effort with great potential to be replicated in Mongolian context if successfully demonstrated and advocated.

### **3. Project Efficiency**

In overall, the planned outcomes of the project in relation to the attached resources are sufficient. Successful delivery of the planned outcomes shall bring about considerable changes in lives of children targeted and improvements in the national policy and practice concerning child labour issues.

The budget analysis indicates that the project interventions in Aimags are planned in a very cost effective manner, with minimal management costs (18%-21% of the AP total budget) and roughly a half (42%-51%) of the AP budgets going to direct services for children for the purpose of prevention and withdrawal from child labour. (See Annex 8. Budget Analysis of the Aimag APs)

There are a few minor points for the future consideration on cost- effectiveness issue:

- Tuv aimag AP has the shortest period of implementation and the lowest budget compared to other Aimag APs. Because of that and the greatest number of Soums (27), the costs (both absolute volume and the share) of establishment of the AP coordination mechanism and evaluating the AP outcomes are relatively high. Consequently it leaves a limited budget for awareness raising and community mobilization actions thus may have some implications for overall effectiveness and efficiency of the AP.
- The action programme budgets suggest that the approaches of establishing child labour database vary. There is a wide range from one off survey of head counting, and data collection through questionnaire, to integrating child labour data into the existing quarterly data collection system through local governments, or to establishing and training a specialized team to conduct a baseline data collection in all soums. While piloting community based CLMs is to be supported by an advisory service contracted, establishment of local child labour database also needs more guidance and unified approach to deliver reliable outcomes.
- The budget analysis of the UB APs shows a different picture. While some of the action programmes have relatively high cost service budgets (e.g., ESC and ADC), the action programme by RCC UB does not have adequate budget allocated for the services that deemed

---

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures”.

necessary. It appears essential for this action programme to have more financial resources for more support to children and families (with alternative opportunities offered for income generation, vocational training, mediation to safe works etc) if the project is to succeed in preventing and withdrawing children from scavenging at the dump sites.

It is understandable that the scope and nature of the services depending on the specific needs of the target children will dictate the costs. Nevertheless, in the case of the ADC and ESC, the returns of the high cost services are not yet clearly observable, especially with the current situation of having no reliable information (across the IPEC project) on the number of children who were actually prevented or withdrawn from the WFCL as result of their work.

Other than the above, the planned outcomes of the project (as a whole) in relation to the attached resources are adequate, and the progresses to date prove to be so. However, this low cost approach deemed to have some implications for the quality of consulting services, at least. It was mentioned several times during the evaluation mission (and the evaluator is keen to agree with) that the IPEC is well known to local consultants for its low cost approach, therefore the invitations for service works hardly attract a good enough number of adequately competent consultants.

#### **4. Project Sustainability**

It was clear that the issue of sustainability was considered thoroughly at the project design stage and the strategies were formulated to the highest possible degree of sustainability.

With the assumption that the project would not be affected badly by external factors that are out of control of the project management, based on the evaluation findings it is safe to say that the project sustainability is likely to be high. It is high in a sense that the initiatives of the Government of Mongolia and its partners in combating child labour in the country are likely to be sustained.

This conclusion is supported by the following evidences at this point of the implementation: i) child labour issues are on the national government agenda and have increasingly been mainstreamed into the national and sectoral policies; ii) the national level policy coordination mechanism is in place and has been operational with active participation of the key stakeholders; iii) a tri-partite partnership had been successfully developed during the previous phases of the project (although the recent changes of the top level leadership in the workers' organization have some implications for the NSC-CL and the project, for rebuilding the relationship with and the capacity of relevant officials in combating the child labour); iv) key government actors such as the NAC and NHRCM etc, have shown the capacity to challenge, support and influence the government to sustain the national efforts in combating child labour; v) local government capacities in combating child labour have been built through area based integrated intervention strategies; vi) capacity of (selected) local agencies in providing support to children and families in need have been strengthen; and vii) general public awareness on child labour issues have been increased.

While the sustainability of the project as a whole might be high, the sustainability of the individual action programmes especially the ones, that implemented by local NGOs might not be equally high, at least as deemed at this point of development. That attributed to the following factors. i) most of local NGOs' financial capacity is limited, so there is a little likelihood that they will continue the initiatives

on their own; ii) the participation and ownership of the relevant partners in the initiatives deemed not adequately high at this point; and iii) a wider replication of the models developed is yet to happen.

There is no doubt that the project will further increase its sustainability in the next two years with consideration of the above. The project also may wish to pay more attention to the fact that the present technical capacity within the project to effectively work with children involved or at risk of being involved in commercial sexual exploitation is limited, and there is a need for targeted capacity building in this area and wider involvement of the ECPAT national network member organizations.

There are some other ongoing developments<sup>21</sup> in the country that would positively influence on the sustainability of the project, but there is no major external factors observed at this point that may have damaging affect on it. Therefore, it is believed that the current level of sustainability can be sustained and more importantly increased in the next two years with consideration of the above and the recommendations given in the later part of this report.

---

<sup>21</sup> Those include: i) The Education Law amendments in 2006 introduced a per student fund allocation to delivery of primary and secondary education through non formal equivalency training programmes. Consequently, the MoESC has issued a new regulation (Oct, 2007) on the practical application of that legal framework that opens up new opportunities for private and non governmental organizations to be engaged in delivery of education through such funding mechanism.

ii) Similarly, the Social Welfare Law of Mongolia (2005) provided a legal framework for social service contracting opportunities to non governmental organizations. However the policy realization has been slow. In order to facilitate the process acceleration, upon the MoSWL request, the Save the Children UK provided technical support through an international consultancy service in May 2007. Clear and specific recommendations were given to the MoSWL along with the suggested Social Service Contracting Implementation Plan. Although it depends on how effective and efficient will be the MoSWL actions, in longer run this funding opportunity will be certainly opened up for relevant non-governmental organizations in the country.

## CONCLUSIONS

This is the first project in Mongolia that has been implemented since the TBP approach was introduced by ILO. Although happened for particular reasons, the fact that the proposed NSP-WFCL did not come into effect was a somewhat lost opportunity to bring about much needed impetus, the highest level of government commitment, synergy of efforts, and time bound clear measurable targets for national efforts in combating child labour.

Nevertheless, the move to the TBP approach has been of a crucial importance for the country as it was to build on the previous experiences and lift up the efforts into a new level of development and maturity. The progresses to date suggest that the move was a right one.

An overall evaluation conclusion is that by successfully building upon the solid experiences of the previous two phases, in the first two years of the implementation the project has made considerable progresses towards achieving the objectives set forth. Besides having some very encouraging concrete achievements in areas of policy mainstreaming and knowledge building etc, the project was able to build firm foundations of a sustainable practice of area based integrated, time bound interventions in selected areas.

- The project design proved to be highly appropriate to the developmental context, and the needs of the country, and consistent with and supportive of the national policies. Its well-defined strategic and immediate objectives clearly guide the project interventions.
- Overall, the project objectives appear to be achievable by the end of the project life. However the immediate objective 2, scaling up the awareness building at the national level and mobilizing all actors in combating the WFCL in the country, might be too ambitious given the project lifetime and the limited resources attached.
- The project has been highly instrumental in establishing a sustainable mechanism for national level policy coordination and in strengthening the capacity and responsibilities of the local governments in combating child labour. Ongoing capacity building efforts at both local and national levels found to be appropriate to the local needs and some encouraging results are emerging.
- Solid foundations of developing area based integrated intervention models have been successfully built in selected Aimags, and some emerging good practices are in the field. However, development of such model in UB appears more challenging.
- In the second year of the implementation, the project has made a good progress in relation to its target on preventing and withdrawing children from child labour. However, in the current internal monitoring and reporting system, there is no a mechanism to distinguish the children actually prevented or withdrawn as a result of the project intervention from those who have been provided with educational and other services with the purpose to prevent or withdraw from child labour.
- The actions taken to date on national level awareness building deemed well organized and effective, but the overall scope is limited. Advocacy efforts for replication of best models and practices

developed under the project appear to be not adequate given the fact that such experiences from the previous phase have not been replicated widely.

- Development of a new list of the hazardous work by the MoSWL has long been delayed and thus its strategic importance to the most awareness raising and advocacy components of the project is likely to be diminished.
- The project has taken some excellent initiatives in establishing child labour monitoring systems at national, local and community levels, but the technical support is yet to be intensified to enable the soonest realization of the initiatives.
- The initiatives of the Government of Mongolia and its partners in combating child labour in the country are likely to be sustained. While the sustainability of the project, as a whole, is likely to be high, the sustainability of a few individual action programmes may not be equally high as at this point of time. Concrete strategies and actions are required to effectively address the issue.
- The planned outcomes of the project (as a whole) in relation to the attached resources are sufficient, and the progresses to date prove to be so. Overall, the project interventions are delivered in cost-effective manner. However, there are some implications of such low cost approach especially for the quality of consulting services.

## RECOMMENDATIONS

### A. Recommendations to the NSC-CL on strengthening national level policy coordination and policy mainstreaming:

As the NSC-CL is still in a continuous process of undertaking its national lead role in national level policy development, mainstreaming and coordination in elimination of child labour, the following actions are recommended.

- With the view of its strategic role (as the NSC-CL), the Committee needs to have more focus on policy coordination and mainstreaming. The policy recommendations endorsed (2006) shall/ could serve as a practical guide for the committee's efforts in mainstreaming child labour issues into national and sectoral policies and practices. Therefore, a review of the progress in realization of the policy recommendations (2006) shall be a useful process for the NSC-CL in further positioning itself in its expected role.
- It is highly recommended that the Committee reviews the progress of the NPDPC (2005-2007), Objective 13 (concerning CL issues); and proactively proposes its input for the forthcoming 2008-2010 action plan. As a part of the review, it is recommended that the Committee analyses the current situation of government financial commitments<sup>22</sup> to date to the elimination of child labour and defines the ways moving towards more concrete and sustainable budget allocations for such purpose.
- Considering the importance of a strong, tripartite partnership at the national level, it is recommended that the NSC-CL proactively supports the MCTU in rebuilding its capacity at national level in combating child labour.
- It is recommended that the Committee reviews its composition and considers the following changes of:
  - Assigning a specific role to the Committee Deputy Chair (NAC);  
(For the sustainability reason, it is worth to explore the opportunities for strategic and systematic support for capacity building of the NAC in this regard.)
  - Expanding its membership with the representatives of the City Government and the State Specialized Inspection Agency given the importance of the role of those organizations in elimination of the WFCL and the need for a close coordination with;
  - Inviting of a few other organizations that are not affiliated with the IPEC project, but well concerned with child labour issues, to join the Committee; (It will help the Committee to widen its focus beyond the IPEC project.)

---

<sup>22</sup> It appears that no concrete data is available on government financial commitment to the implementation of the NPDPC or its sub components including the one on elimination of child labour. The Government of Mongolia report on "Plus 5" Review of the UN 2002 Special Session on Children and World Fit for Children Plan of Action (2006) indicates that the government committed some 1.07 million USD in 2005 for child development, protection, rights and leisure time activities and that was estimated to increase up to 1.21-1.22 million USD for 2006 and 2007.

---

**"Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures".**



- It is strongly recommended that the NSC-CL decides on selection of action programme implementing agencies, and through an open and competitive call of proposals.

Although it is true that the number of the relevant and interested agencies might still be limited in the country and an open call may not reveal much wider participation of other actors, such reasoning shall not surpass the principal importance of having an open tendering process. While requires more time it will contribute to the process of fostering the ownership of the NSC-CL. It will also allow the Committee (and the IPEC) to make well informed decision based on objective assessment and comparison of different implementing arrangements (mechanisms) in terms of their relative advantages, cost effectiveness, as well as potential replication and sustainability etc.

Connected with the above, the Committee shall introduce a practice of using a set of concrete, pre-approved criteria for assessment/endorsement of proposed action programmes. (The current practice is accounted on the experiences of the individual members of the Committee and its Secretariat, so more objective assessment against a set of pre-agreed criteria is essential.)

- As a matter of practicality, in order to avoid the risk of being captured by recurrent project issues, it is advised that the Committee introduces a practice of advance planning of a tentative, yearly schedule of issues to be reviewed by the NSC-CL (other recurrent items can be added as it goes).

#### **B. Recommendations to the ILO/IPEC project management on particular aspects of the project implementation:**

- As the project enters the latter half of its implementation period, the overall process needs to be accelerated rapidly by intensifying the technical support from the IPEC team<sup>23</sup>.
- In the next two years, to the extent of possibilities exist, the project needs to widen its existing partnership and intensify networking with other actors, promote a strong base of civil society support (including media), in combating child labour. Effective mobilization of media in combating child labour needs to be an ongoing process with relevant capacity building efforts enriched and linked with real cases of policy and practical responses coming out of the work in the field.
- While the project have taken some important steps in establishing a broad-base common understanding of child labour issues and the actions required, there is still a need to do more. The process should be complimented with concrete advocacy efforts (by the IPEC and other key stakeholders) in areas of public policy improvements and wider replication of the best practices and models developed under the project.
- It is the time to specifically reinforce the importance, and make the best use of the proposed model for an area based integrated interventions in eliminating child labour. In relation to the each of specific components of the proposed model, the IPEC project team will need to strategically define

<sup>23</sup> The IAs in need for more technical support include MoESC, MoJHA, SSIA and ADC.

The progresses of particular areas of work (APs implemented by GO UBC, GO TU, GO DG and MoSWL) needs to be reviewed, either jointly by the IPEC and IA or by the NSC-WFCL, so that next steps are clearly planned and required supports are clearly defined.

the scope and nature of the support needed for each of the selected areas, and provide specific guidance and targeted supports systematically. For development of such model in UB, the IPEC team needs to define the strategy and ways of working with the city, and act systematically.

- In addition to the support planned on community based child monitoring and tracking systems, the IPEC needs to provide specific training and capacity building support on i) reaching out to the target group -the most vulnerable; ii) community outreach (especially in mining areas) and community mobilization; and iii) social work case work practice.
- For the purpose of increasing the effectiveness and efficiency of a few of the UB action programmes, there is a need to review closely the progress and make necessary alterations in their operational and financial plans, within the permitted flexibility in managing the project resources. (See relevant comments in the Project Efficiency section of this report and Annex 3. Achievements by Action Programmes)

Linked with the above, for the sustainability reason, the IPEC project team and the implementing agencies need to pay special attention to the issues such as the transparency in action programme management, the participation and ownership of staff and key partners involved and replication of the models developed.

- Regarding the target beneficiaries, as a matter of priority, the project team needs to:
  - i) ensure that all direct action programme implementing agencies have clear understanding of the definitions of ‘children withdrawn’ and ‘children prevented’ (as defined in the IPEC reporting format for TPR to the USDOL, Section III.C) and use them correctly;
  - ii) improve the internal reporting systems so that the number of children prevented or withdrawn is objectively defined apart from the number of children targeted for such purpose and have been provided with educational and other types of services;
  - iii) once have the numbers corrected, reset the targets as per reporting periods remaining; and
  - iv) make sure that the currently ongoing development of a system for a tracking of the project beneficiaries sometime after the project intervention end, considers the above mentioned definitions.
- At this stage of the implementation, it might be worth for the project management to review the duties and responsibilities of the programme staff to see if any alteration shall be made in order to be well able to facilitate the implementation process acceleration. It appears important to do so especially in the light of the needs of the IAs for targeted technical supports, and forthcoming planned end of the position of a programme officer for social mobilization and advocacy while there is still to do much more in that aspects. Connected with the above, staff capacity building issue needs to be considered.

### **Lessons learned for broader application of the TBP concept**

- Having a specifically designed a NSP-WFCL (or its identical) is highly desirable or can be seen as a prerequisite for introducing the TBP approach in a country.

---

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures”.

Similarly time bound sub programmes at city/district and province levels are equally important especially in terms of promoting local initiatives and leadership, ownership and synergy of efforts.

- A project designing should take into consideration the fact that TBP process requires considerable investment (of time, efforts, and resources) for its planning stage so that local government and other key actors take the leadership role and build the sense of ownership over the local initiatives in combating child labour.
- TBP built onto local government structures appears to be more sustainable provided backed up with effective partnership with civil society actors.
- In the planning process, based on a country context, it is important to define appropriate balance and complimentary combination of various interventions (direct action support, advocacy for and support on policy improvements, and mainstreaming etc) with consequent resource allocation accordingly. In the case of the current project, it appears that while provision of educational services is considered and widely used as one of the key, effective interventions in the field for preventing and withdrawing children from the WFCL, the actions planned at policy level in this regard are somewhat limited.

## **ANNEXES**

### **ANNEX 1. Terms of Reference**

Final

**ILO/IPEC**

#### **Independent Mid-term Evaluation**

#### ***Support to the Proposed National Sub-programme to***

#### ***Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour:***

#### ***Time-Bound Measures (Mongolia)***

ILO Project Code	E-9-K-5-0018
ILO Project Number	MON/05/P50/USA
ILO Iris Code	
Country	Mongolia
Duration	52 month
Starting Date	30 September, 2005
Ending Date	31 December, 2005
Project Locations	National level and selected provinces (Aimags)
Project Language	English
Executing Agency	ILO/IPEC
Financing Agency	US DOL
Donor contribution	USDOL: US \$2,900,000

---

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

## Background

- The aim of IPEC is the progressive elimination of child labour, especially its worst forms. The political will and commitment of individual governments to address child labour — in cooperation with employers' and workers' organizations, non-governmental organizations and other relevant parties in society— is the basis for IPEC action. IPEC support at the country level is based on a phased, multi-sector strategy. This strategy includes raising awareness on the negative consequences of child labour, promoting social mobilization against it, strengthening national capacities to deal with this issue and implementing demonstrative direct action programmes (AP) to prevent children from child labour and remove child labourers from hazardous work and provide them with appropriate alternatives.
- ILO Decent Work Country Programmes (DWCPs) are being introduced in the ILO to provide a mechanism through which to outline agreed upon priorities between the ILO and the national constituent partners with a broader UN and international development context. For further information please see <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/decent.htm>
- The DWCP defines a corporate focus on priorities, operational strategies as well as a resource and implementation plan that complement and supports partner plans for national decent work priorities. As such DWCP are broader frameworks to which the individual ILO project is linked and to which it contributes. DWCP are beginning to be gradually introduced in various countries planning and implementing frameworks and in Mongolia.
- From the perspective of the ILO, the elimination of child labour is part of its work on standards and fundamental principles and rights at work. The fulfilment of these standards should guarantee decent work for all adults. In this sense the ILO provides technical assistance to its three constituents: government, workers and employers. This tripartite structure is the key characteristic of ILO cooperation and it is within this framework that the support to the national Time Bound Programmes (TBP) should be analyzed.
- A TBP is essentially a strategic program framework of tightly integrated and coordinated policies and initiatives at different levels to eliminate specified Worst Forms of Child Labour (WFCL) in a given country within a defined period of time. It is a nationally owned initiative that emphasizes the need to address the root causes of child labor, linking action against child labour to the national development effort, with particular emphasis on the economic and social policies to combat poverty and to promote universal basic education. This implies a commitment to mobilize and allocate national human and financial resources to combat the problem.
- The most critical element of a TBP is that it is implemented and led by the country itself. The countries commit to the development of a plan to eradicate or significantly diminish the worst forms of child labour in a defined period. The TBP

---

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

process in Mongolia is one of approximately twenty programme frameworks of such nature that are being supported by IPEC at the global level.<sup>24</sup>

- ILO, with the support of many development organizations and the financial and technical contribution of the United States' Department of Labor (USDOL) has elaborated this concept based on previous national and international experience. It has also established innovative technical cooperation modalities to support countries that have ratified C.182 to implement comprehensive measures against WFCL.<sup>25</sup>
- In recent years, Mongolia has taken concrete steps to demonstrate its commitment to eliminating the worst forms of child labour. The country has ratified all eight ILO core conventions, including ILO Conventions No. 138 (in 2002) and No. 182 (in 2001). In 1999, the Labour Code established a minimum age for employment at 16 and a list of Worst Forms of Child Labour (WFCL) forbidden for minors was officially accepted. The country has also ratified the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child; and Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child, on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography.
- As a follow up to the ratification, the government of Mongolia developed policies and efforts to meet its obligations. In December 2002, the Government approved the National Programme for the Development and Protection of Children (2002-2010) which provides the overall framework of actions to protect the rights and development of children. The National Programme built on the experience gained by IPEC through implementing two phases of country programmes in Mongolia.
- The National Programme has several goals related to education, health, development, participation and protection from exploitation and abuse. In addition, it sets the goal of eliminating the worst forms of child labour, through the implementation of measures such as nation-wide awareness raising and attitude change, training of officials, strengthening law enforcement through improved labour inspection and public monitoring.
- In order to meet the goal of eliminating WFCL established in the National Programme, the Ministry of Social Welfare and Labour drafted a National Sub-programme on Combating the Worst Forms of Child Labour (NSP-WFCL). The draft NSP-WFCL was submitted to the Cabinet for discussion and adoption. In June 2005, the NSP-WFCL was used as the basis for the development of a detailed

<sup>24</sup> The term "national TBP" normally refers to any national programme or plan of action that provides a strategic framework for or plan for the implementation of Convention 182 on the worst forms of child labour. TBP is a generic term for such frameworks and for a concept or proposed general approach which will be used in different ways in different national contexts. In many cases the terminology TBP is not used even though the process and the framework will have many of general characteristics of the approach. ILO/IPEC has formulated the TBP concept and approach based on the work of ILO and partners. ILO/IPEC is providing support to the TBP process as in the different countries through "projects of support", which is seen as one of the many component projects, interventions and development partner support to the TBP process.

<sup>25</sup> More information on the TBP concept can be found in the Time Bound Program Manual for Action Planning (MAP), at <http://www.ilo.org/childlabour>.

"Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures".

national plan of action for the elimination of WFCL within a time-bound format. This was the beginning of the process of further developing the NSP-WFCL.

- In November, 2005, ILO-IPEC launched a Project of Support (PoS) to build on the experience and to support the NSP-WFCL. The launch took place at the Chinggis Khaan Hotel and was attended by about 100 persons from governmental and non-governmental organizations, employers' and workers' organizations. During the launching ceremony, an MOU between the ILO and the government of Mongolia on the elimination of child labour was signed. The PoS has two strategic objectives that encompass a range of enabling interventions and direct action.
- Strategic Objective A is *Strengthening the enabling environment (policy, legislative, knowledge development, capacity building) for national action against WFCL in Mongolia*. This strategic objective has two Immediate Objectives:
  - Immediate Objective 1: By the end of the project, coordinated policy responses will have been put in place and national, Aimag and local level capacities will have been rendered capable of planning, implementing, coordinating, and evaluating the NSP-WFCL.
  - Immediate Objective 2: By the end of the project, government, employers and workers organizations, NGOs, civil society, general public, media, parents and children at all levels in Mongolia will have become aware of the negative consequences of the WFCL and will have been mobilized to take coordinated time bound measures on WFCL.
- Strategic Objective B is *Development of an area based intervention model at the local level targeting boys and girls at risk or engaged in WFCL for prevention, withdrawal and rehabilitation (direct action) that could be replicated in different areas and / or at a larger scale*. This strategic objective has one Immediate Objective:
  - Immediate Objective 3: By the end of the project, an integrated, and sustainable area-based intervention model to combat the worst forms of child labour in Mongolia in selected areas will have been implemented and documented

## Current Status of Project

- The Technical Progress Reports state that after addressing start-up issues, the new staff planned for and carried out a series of consultative workshops throughout the regions. Each workshop had tripartite participants and involved governors of *soums* and officials of Governor Offices. During the workshops, participants gained a common understanding on various child labour issues and problems in their respective regions. The participants also drafted initial regional strategies and actions to combat and prevent WFCL. Priorities for IPEC support were discussed and agreed upon, including the coordination mechanism for the implementation of the regional actions.
- With this information in hand, project management held meetings with previous and new Ministers to discuss specific issues in relation to expanding the support of the Ministry of

---

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

Social Welfare and Labour (MoSWL) to implement IPEC TBP Project of Support. It also established relationships with international organizations that could provide expertise that was not available within the country. For example, project management worked in close cooperation with the Save the Children Fund (UK) to develop a proposal and to advocate for amending the Law on Education to improve funding to provide non-formal education for dropouts, school safety, etc.

- Several high profile issues have been addressed such as the protection of child jockeys. The National Department for Children, National Human Rights Commission and the National Sports Committee of Mongolia organized a National Forum of Child Jockeys which involved, for the first time, child jockeys and horse trainers. One of the ways that the PoS supported Forum was to sponsor a study by the National Human Rights Commission. The study revealed that a substantial number of child jockeys had received serious, sometimes fatal injuries through falls. When this information was publicized it created mixed public response in newspapers, TVs, and internet portals.
- The PoS has also worked hard to build the capacity of its partners. For example, over 100 labour inspectors were trained to use a manual that was prepared for them by an international consultant. In addition, the project provided support for a secretariat which strengthened the function of the National Steering Committee on Child Labour (NSC-CL). This enabled the Committee to become more pro-active in endorsing Action Programmes, selecting institutions to carry them out, and reviewing the results. Finally, as of March, 2007, ten direct action programmes were under implementation (with the target of 6,080 children).

### Purpose and Scope of the Mid-term Evaluation

- The nature of the monitoring and evaluation processes will be decided in consultation with partners including US-DOL as the donor. The Design, Evaluation and Documentation (DED) Section of ILO/IPEC will coordinate the consultations, planning, and coordination of the evaluations. Appropriate partners, stakeholders, and US-DOL will be involved in the process and will receive a copy of all evaluation reports. At the outset of the mid-term evaluation process, input was solicited from key stakeholders.
- The main purposes for which the evaluation should be conducted are to:
  - Identify key factors affecting implementation
  - Identify key strategies that work well at the national and *aimag* level
  - Determine the PoS role in helping the TBP achieve its objectives and targets
- The object of the evaluation is the ILO-IPEC Project of Support (PoS) of the TBP in Mongolia—not the TBP itself. There is a subtle, yet very important distinction between the two. Therefore the evaluation will review what has been done for mobilizing national action on child labour, what type of actors have been prioritized, what is involved in the process of design, managing and implementing a TBP support process and how the ILO/IPEC project has contributed to the process.

---

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.



- Given that the broader TBP approach is relatively young (since 2001), the innovative nature and the element of “learning by doing” of the approach should be taken into account. The TBP concept is intended to evolve as lessons are learned and to adapt to changing circumstances. The identification of specific issues and lessons learned for broader application for the TBP concept, as a whole, would be a particular supplementary feature of this evaluation.

### Suggested Aspects to be Addressed

- The evaluation should address the overall ILO evaluation concerns such as relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability as defined in the ILO Guidelines for the Preparation of Independent Evaluations of ILO Programmes and Projects and for gender concerns see: ILO Guidelines for the Integration of Gender Issues into the Design, Monitoring and Evaluation of ILO Programmes and Projects, January 1995.
- In line with results-based framework approach used by ILO-IPEC for identifying results at global, strategic and project level, the evaluation will focus on identifying and analysing results through addressing key questions related to the evaluation concerns and the achievement of the Immediate Objectives of the project using data from the logical framework indicators. Answers to the key questions will be interpreted in light of relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, and sustainability—core values of ILO-IPEC.
- The following are the broad suggested aspects that can be identified at this point for the evaluation to address in the context of the evaluation concerns and immediate objectives of the project. Other aspects can be added as identified by the evaluation team in accordance with the given purpose and in consultation with ILO/IPEC Geneva's Design, Evaluation and Documentation Section (DED). The evaluation instrument prepared by the evaluation team will indicate further selected specific aspects to be addressed. The evaluation instrument should identify the priority aspects to be addressed in the evaluation.
- Immediate Objective 1: By the end of the project, coordinated policy responses will have been put in place and national, *Aimag* and local level capacities will have been rendered capable of planning, implementing, coordinating, and evaluating the NSP-WFCL.
  - How did the PoS support on line ministries and local government units' plans and programmes that incorporated or have plans for incorporating child labour interventions? Was the support relevant, efficient, effective, and sustainable?

---

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures”.

- How did the PoS contribute to making the sections of national policies and legal frameworks that deal with child labour issues more coordinated with international standards and more acceptable to various key stakeholders?
- How did the PoS build the capacity of staff at the national, *Aimag*, local level offices to plan, coordinate, and evaluate the NSP-WFCL? Was the support relevant, efficient, effective, and sustainable?
- Immediate Objective 2: By the end of the project, government, employers and workers organizations, NGOs, civil society, general public, media, parents and children at all levels in Mongolia will have become aware of the negative consequences of the WFCL and will have been mobilized to take coordinated time bound measures on WFCL.
  - How did the PoS support awareness raising programmes of concerned agencies? Was the support relevant, efficient, effective, and sustainable?
  - How did the PoS support WFCL initiatives of government agencies, workers' and employers' organizations, NGOs, civil society, communities, and media agencies? Was the support relevant, efficient, effective, and sustainable?
- Immediate Objective 3: By the end of the project, an integrated, and sustainable area-based intervention model to combat the worst forms of child labour in Mongolia in selected areas will have been implemented and documented
  - How did the PoS support the reduction in the incidence of WFCL in targeted areas? Was the support relevant, efficient, effective, and sustainable?
  - How did the PoS support attempts of non-project *Aimags*, *Soums*, and/or other agencies to apply the intervention models? Was the support relevant, efficient, effective, and sustainable?
- Cross-Cutting Questions
  - What has been done for mobilizing national action on child labour? What types of actors have been prioritized?
  - What is involved in the process of design, managing and implementing a TBP support process and how the PoS contributed to the process?
  - Taking into account factors such as the geography and the number of different sectors how logical and coherent is the project design?
  - Are the indicators and means of verification from the logframe useful for measuring impact?
  - To what extent are factors outside the control of project management affecting project implementation and attainment of the objectives/goal? For instance, the project noted that a lack in adequate staffing in key enforcement agencies was negatively affecting the project's effectiveness. Please provide recommendations on how the project might help to counteract this problem. How have personnel changes (Minister for Social Welfare and Labour) and legislative changes (new

---

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures”.

education law, issuance of birth certificates or coverage for school lunches) affected the project?

- What lessons were learned in the process of conducting baseline surveys for the identification of target children? Was this the most appropriate method?
- How effective were key strategies for dealing with opportunities and threats at the national and *aimag* level? Why?
- How efficient is the current action programme approval process? Would there be a more efficient method?
- Is the project workplan being implemented as planned? If not why not?
  - Do the workplan and timeline need to be reassessed?
  - If so, how should the project reallocate resources or adjust activities to help the TBP to meet its withdrawal and prevention targets?

### Methodology and Time Frame

- The following is the suggested methodology for the mid-term evaluation. The methodology can be adjusted by the evaluator if considered necessary in accordance with the scope and purpose of this exercise as described above. This should be done in consultation with the Design, Evaluation and Documentation Section (DED) of ILO/IPEC
- The methodology for the evaluation should consider the multiple levels involved in this process: the framework and structure of the national efforts to eliminate the WFCL in Mongolia and IPEC's support to this process through this project. Data gathering and analysis tools should consider this methodological and practical distinction
- The evaluation should include a **desk review** of appropriate material, including the project documents, progress reports, previous evaluation reports, outputs of the projects and action programmes, and relevant material from secondary sources. This includes baselines and any government documents such as National Plans or documents about the Time Bound Program in Mongolia.
- The evaluator is required to interview donor representatives through conference call early in the evaluation process. The evaluator will also interview key staff from the IPEC team in the country office in Beijing, China.
- Sources of Information are identified as follows:

Available at HQ and to be supplied by DED	Project documents  DED Guidelines and ILO guidelines
---	--

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

Available in project office and to be supplied by project management	<p>Progress reports/Status reports</p> <p>Evaluation and similar reports at the action programme level</p> <p>Technical and financial report of partner agencies</p> <p>Other studies and research undertaken</p> <p>Action Programme Summary Outlines Project files</p> <p>National workshop proceedings or summaries</p> <p>Country level planning documents</p> <p>SPIF documents</p> <p>Master list and records of beneficiaries</p> <p>Action Programme Progress Reports</p> <p>Baseline reports and information</p> <p>Reports, reviews and related material relevant to the National Plan of Action and the NAP/TBP</p>
To be located as appropriate	<p>Relevant national development programme and policy documents</p> <p>PRPS documents such as strategies, monitoring plans and reports, costing</p> <p>Relevant documents on the development situation in Mongolia and context of child labour</p>

- The evaluation will also include **field-work** in Ulaanbaatar and provinces of Mongolia, where interviews with governmental agencies, trade unions and employers' organizations, and NGOs at national, provincial, and district levels. It will also include site visits to Action Programs that are currently being implemented.
- In interviews, focus groups and other information gathering exercises, the evaluation consultant should solicit the opinions of a wide variety of stakeholders, including children, parents of beneficiaries, teachers, government representatives, professionals linked to the targeted sectors, representatives from trade unions and employers' organizations, partners, implementing agencies and all major stakeholders, including the donor (e.g., USDOL

---

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

project managers, representatives of the US Embassy in Mongolia including the Labour Officer and USAID. In addition, the evaluator should interview the managers of other child labour projects being funded by USDOL in Mongolia and implemented by Save the Children.)

- The evaluation process will include a one-day **stakeholder workshop** to present the preliminary findings, conclusions and recommendations to IPEC staff and key partners for feedback. The participants of the workshop will include those interviewed during the fieldwork, key stakeholders of the project, and national partners in the TBP framework, such as international development partners. The results of this meeting should be taken into consideration for the preparation of the draft report.
- Project management will provide a list of key stakeholders for possible participation in this workshop. This list will also serve as list of potential key informants to consult. Project management will prepare a detailed schedule of visits.
- In addition, the consultant will be involved in the internal review exercise by partners for the purpose of the evaluation. This will include commenting on the draft questionnaire for partners on internal review exercise and commenting on the draft programme of the partners experience sharing workshop (scheduled on 24-26 Oct) and participation in this 3 days' workshop to get information and knowledge on partners' work.
- The evaluation team will be asked to include as part of the specific evaluation instrument to be developed, the **standard evaluation instruments** that ILO/IPEC has developed for documenting and analyzing achievements of the projects and contributions of the Action Programmes to the project.
- The evaluation consultants will prepare a brief document indicating the methodological approach to the evaluation (the “evaluation instrument”), to be discussed and approved by DED prior to the commencement of the field mission.

### Expected Output and Timeline

- The evaluation report in draft form and in English should be presented to IPEC DED one week after the finalization of the field mission. The evaluation should be carried out in adherence with the ILO Evaluation Framework and Strategy, the ILO-IPEC Guidelines and Notes, the UN System Evaluation Standards and Norms, and the OECD/DAC Evaluation Quality Standards.
- The length of the report should not exceed 30 pages (excluding annexes). It is suggested to structure the report as follows:

---

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

- Executive Summary with key findings, conclusions and recommendations
  - Description of the project
  - Clearly identified findings
  - Clearly identified conclusions and recommendations
  - Lessons learned
  - Potential good practices and effective models of intervention.
  - Appropriate annexes including TOR
  - Standard evaluation instrument matrix
- The report should include specific and detailed recommendations solidly based on the evaluator's analysis and, if appropriate, addressed specifically to the organization/institution responsible for implementing it. The report should also include a specific section on lessons learned from this project that could be replicated or should be avoided in the future, in the same or in other IPEC projects.
  - The report will be circulated by DED to all relevant stakeholders for their comments. Comments from the key stakeholders will be consolidated and forwarded to the evaluation consultant. The evaluation consultant should consider the comments for the preparation of the final draft of the report.
  - Ownership of data from the evaluation rests jointly with ILO-IPEC and the consultants. The copyright of the evaluation report will rest exclusively with the ILO. Use of the data for publication and other presentations can only be made with the written agreement of ILO-IPEC. Key stakeholders can make appropriate use of the evaluation report in line with the original purpose and with appropriate acknowledgement.

## Resources and Management

- The evaluation will be carried out by an evaluator with extensive experience in the evaluation of development or social interventions, preferably including practical experience in assessing comprehensive policy/program frameworks or national plans. The team members should have an advanced degree in social sciences, economics or similar and specific training on evaluation theory and methods. Working experience on issues related to child labour, education and children's welfare will be essential. Full command of English as a working language will be required. The final selection of the evaluation team will be done by DED.

<b>Evaluator</b>
------------------

---

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

Responsibility	Profile
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Desk review</li> <li>• Analysing the documents, direct observation, interview notes, and information from the questionnaires</li> <li>• Prepare an evaluation plan</li> <li>• Act as independent evaluation consultant for the evaluation of the project and covering other evaluation related issues during a two-week in-country field visit.</li> <li>• Prepare evaluation report</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Extensive experience in evaluation of development projects, in particular with local development projects</li> <li>▪ Relevant regional experience in the region</li> <li>▪ Prior experience with or knowledge of the TBP project of support type of projects such as national level evaluations involving policy level work, institutional building. Linkages, partnerships and integrated programmes</li> <li>▪ Familiarity with and knowledge of specific thematic areas</li> <li>▪ Experience working with local organisations/local partners agencies</li> <li>▪ Experience in UN system or similar international development experience, including implementation of evaluations.</li> <li>▪ Experience evaluating gender issues.</li> <li>▪ Experience with policy analysis, strategic planning and design of country programmes desirable</li> </ul>

- The following are the resources needed for this evaluation (for detailed information see the Evaluation Timeline below):
  - Fees for one consultant during 35 working days
  - In-country travel expenses and daily subsistence allowances for consultants during field mission
  - Costs of organizing the stakeholders' workshop
- The DED responsible official in IPEC HQ will manage the evaluation process. In country management and logistics support will be provided by the CTA of the projects and the IPEC team as a whole.
- A detailed budget is available separately

## Evaluation Timeline

<i>Phases</i>	<i>Tasks</i>	<i>Responsible</i>	<i>Dates</i>	<i>Outputs</i>
<b>Phase One: Preparatory</b>	<b>Briefing with IPEC DED and preparatory desk review</b>	<b>Consultant with DED support</b>	<b>29 Oct – 2 Nov, 2007 (5)</b>	<b>Evaluation instrument</b>
	<b>Design of the evaluation instrument</b>			
<b>Phase Two: Data collection</b>	<b>Partners workshop</b>	<b>Consultant with DED support</b>	<b>24-26 Oct</b>	<b>Data</b>
	<b>Field work, interviews and data collection as part of normal mid-term evaluation</b>		<b>5-21 November, 2007 (17)</b>	
	<b>Stakeholder evaluation workshop</b>		<b>20 November, 2007</b>	<b>Feedback preliminary findings, conclusions and recommendations</b>

---

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.



<b>Phase Three: Report writing</b>	<b>Preparation and commenting on reports as per normal procedures</b>  <b>Consultation with key stakeholder on preliminary findings and to identify further issues for the final evaluation</b>	<b>Consultant with DED support</b>	<b>Report writing: 26 -30 November, 2007 (5)</b>  <b>Submission of draft report: 30 November, 2007</b>  <b>Revisions: 10-12 December, 2007 (3)</b>  <b>Submission of final version report: 12 December, 2007</b>	<b>Draft version evaluation report</b>          <b>Final version evaluation report</b>
------------------------------------	---	------------------------------------	--	--

---

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

## Annex 2

### Achievements by areas of work

Project Area of Work	AP in that area if any	Achievements of the project as per I/A report		Achievements as per project management (Comments, additions)	Comments/Observations by evaluation team	Proposed follow up Next steps
		Target Groups	Other Qualitative			
<b>Capacity building: Coordination of CL policies and implementation</b>	AP by Ministry of Social Welfare and Labour: Supporting National Steering Committee on Child Labour in its coordination function for policies and actions to combat child labour	No report is submitted yet by MoSWL		The committee is functioning quite well: regular meetings, the Secretariat provides good support to the NSC, clear roles of committee members, efforts to link with the policy and work of other relevant ministries, the function includes discussion on outcomes of approved works, visits to direct APs for monitoring etc	Very committed.  <u>Great support to the IPEC project.</u> So far, the main involvement was in the areas of planning and approval of relevant documents. ToRs for service contract proposals are approved by the NSC and proposals are assessed against the ToR.  <u>Approval of APs:</u> There was no agreed upon, specific criteria for assessment and endorsement of AP proposals (to be used by the secretariat and the NSC).  There was some good progress that the NSC is	As the project implementation accelerates now, needs to review the progresses.  Officially agree on assessment/endorsement criteria

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

				<p>taking more initiatives and responsibilities over CL issues and the participation of line ministries and other key stakeholders.</p> <p>However, the NSC Action Plan 2007 and meeting agendas suggest if the Committee is still largely focused on the IPEC project.</p> <p>NSC composition – most of members are affiliated with the IPEC project for years in one way or another.</p> <p>The NSC would benefit from having a clear roles designated to the Deputy Chair (NAC) so to position it in a more pro active role for</p>	<p>With the view of <u>its strategic role (as the NSC-CL)</u> in mind, have a tentative yearly plan of the NSC meetings/main issues to be reviewed and discussed (other recurrent items can be added as it goes). This will help the NSC to avoid the risk of being captured by recurrent project issues. (As matter of priority, the suggested items for the NSC review, are:</p> <p>-Progress of the NPDPC (2005-2007), Objective 13 (CL); and government financial resources allocated; and input for the 2008-2010 action plan;</p> <p>- Progress of NSC Action Plan 2007, agree on actions required to support the work delayed )</p> <p>It might be good to include representatives of orgs not affiliated with the IPEC project but concerned with CL issues. That will help to widen the focus of the NSC beyond the IPEC project.</p> <p>Explore the opportunities for strategic and systematic support for</p>
--	--	--	--	--	--

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

				the NSC sustainability reason (currently the IPEC is the main driving force in the NSC)	capacity building of the NAC in this regard.  Assign a more specific role the Deputy Chair
<b>Capacity building: Data and knowledge</b>	1. AP by National Statistical Office: National Child Labour Survey 2006-2007 and updating database on child labour in Mongolia	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>-Survey design</li> <li>-Data collection of 4 quarters completed</li> <li>- Quarterly reports were prepared</li> <li>- Final report is being prepared.</li> </ul>	1. IPEC supported NSO with technical assistance missions three times: on the survey design, implementation, data check, tabulations and report writing. The design of the survey has met the needs of the NSO. Now the NSO is preparing the final report. In addition to producing data on the extent and nature of children's economic activity and child labour, the final report will compare main results of the NCLSs of 2002-2003 and 2006-2007. IPEC NPM and ILO statisticians are advocating to NSO in using age limits of 5+ in future LFSs, which will enable to produce data on children's economic activity.	<p>Valuable input and excellent support of the IPEC, the work is in good progress and the <b>report is underway.</b></p> <p>Not directly related to this piece of work, but there is ongoing work of UNICEF with the NSO (2007-2011) on introducing sets of child protection indicators in the national annual statistics ( a set of information is intended to be relating to CL).</p>	<p>-ensure IPEC (and NSC) input</p> <p>- explore potential links with MoSWL work on developing NCLM system</p>

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

	2. In-depth data analysis to influence policies to address the WFCL		. IPEC has been in contact with the UCW project (jointly implemented by the ILO, WB and UNICEF) to implement in-depth data analysis and to respond to capacity building needs of relevant agencies on data analysis, knowledge building and CL monitoring. The first mission of the UCM is scheduled on 20-25 Nov 2007.	An UCW mission was fielded and some principal agreements are made to take it forward. Highly valuable initiatives.	
<b>Policy mainstreaming</b>	1. Education: Service Contract work by MoESC: Study on causes of school drop-out and development of strategies for provision of educational services to dropouts, including working children and children in remote areas		1. Ministry's commitment to implement the work is good. Study methodology and instruments are being developed at the moment. Consultation meeting on methodology and instruments was organized, IPEC provided comments.	Well needed work with very high potential of value.  Good commitment from the MoESC, and the work is in progress. A WG is established (mainly the Ministry officials).  The draft methodology ( as of Nov 2007) gives some indication that the MoESC needs more technical support.  The main focus appears to be	The process will benefit from wider participation and diverse perspectives of other stakeholder organizations. A technical consultation group (of representatives of different agencies, inc NGOs) can be established to support the WG.  International orgs may input on the best intl practices.  It might be good to start from review

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

				on the primary data collection through sample surveys, but might need more attention to policy and systems analysis.	and analysis of secondary data (study and review reports) and mapping of best practices (local and international).
	2. Youth employment:		SC work by Enlightenment Centre of in one the UB district and Equal Step Centre. Started recently. Pilot training started among school dropout children/youth and child workers (40 children).	The evaluator did not visit the pilot sites, but was informed.  Well needed work and a very valuable enrichment to the project.	Review the pilot results and see if wider replication is feasible.
	2.1. Introduction of “Know About Business” (KAB) training				
	2.2 Improving youth career counselling capacity		Discussions have been held with the officials of the Employment and Welfare Services of the UB and the Labour Exchange. This work has not started yet.	Well needed work if done properly. Need to take into account the lessons learnt from previous works, if any	
	3. Child protection:		3.1. Supported National Agency for Children in organising national child jockeys forum, related advocacy. The issue has attracted public attention and being more frequently raised. Discussion is ongoing on the further	Excellent initiatives with some visible awareness raising results across the country.	
	3.1 Child jockeys:				

---

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

			support of the IPEC on developing safety standards.		
	3.2 Support to Government's work on establishing effective child protection legislation and mechanism.		3.2 Given the focus of the government on this issue, IPEC is planning to clarify its role in supporting the ongoing work.	Child protection concept is relatively new in the country and there is no commonly agreed concept (Current opinion leaders are UNICEF and SCUK). So the ILO IPEC voice (and advocacy) is important and will add a value.	Take a more pro active position in ongoing debates/ discussions on formulating CP thus contribute to development of a proper system in the country.
<b>Legislation</b>	1. Service Contract work by Ministry of Justice and Home Affairs: Analysis of relevant national laws and regulations and development of recommendations to bring them in line with international conventions concerning child labour		1. Working group was approved by the decree of the SC of the MoJHA. Roles of working groups members are clarified. Desk review and information collection has started. TOR for visits to aimags for collecting information and cases has started. IA may need some consultation on this with IPEC.	Well needed work, and is in early stage of development. IA expressed the need for technical advice and support  There are some other ongoing reviews of legislation. The one of UNICEF is to review the national legislations in line with CRC and Child Protection requirements (the expected outcome is due Dec 2007) .	Make the best use of the UNICEF work and build on (not to reinvent the wheel)
	AP by MoSWL (Hazardous work list		MoSWL is in the process of establishing a working group to be consisted of	The work has been long delayed.	Review the progress at the NSC

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

	review)		representatives from related government agencies, Ministries and social partners. The implementation of this work has been slow, due to the heavy workload of the Ministry.		
	3. Service Contract work by National Human Rights Commission: Preparing report on the WFCL for submission to the Parliament of Mongolia		. Studies have been undertaken in 8 aimags. Interviewing relevant agencies and examining related legislation are ongoing. The work is being implemented according to the schedule	The work is in a progress	Timely completion is very important as there is still a great advocacy opportunity that the report serves a role of an alternative report to the Government of Mongolia report on the CRC and the ILO conventions (that are currently in preparation of submission).
<b>Capacity building: Law enforcement</b>	1.1 Service Contract work by State Specialised Inspections Agency: Improving the capacity of the Mongolian Labour Inspectorate towards new principles and practice		1.1 This work builds on the earlier support of the IPEC in this area, including the support to the labour inspection audit in 2005. Labour inspectors' manual developed by the international consultant has been printed and used as a resource material for the capacity building training (Sep 2007). Labour inspectorate's New Policy has been drafted, consulted	<p>Yet to be completed, the work has a very high potential of revitalizing the Labour Inspection System in the country, and making child labour as an integral part of the system.</p> <p>The draft National Labour Inspection Enforcement</p>	As matter of priority, take actions so to ensure the necessary CL specific provisions are included in the draft policy (in sections of labour inspection planning and reporting, and responsibilities of employers) before it gets approved.

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.



			<p>with social partners and now submitted for adoption by 2 Ministers (MoSWL and SSIA). SSIA now has a focal point responsible for CL enforcement issues. Following the adoption of the policy, strategies on enforcement of CL legislation were planned to be developed. This work has been slow. It is observed that the IA needs support of IPEC on this.</p>	<p>Policy (currently awaiting for approval) does need some explicit provisions on CL.</p>	
	1.2 Training of law enforcement agencies		<p>2 This work will be implemented in the view of strengthening legal. protection of children to address the cases /victims of the WFCL.</p>	<p>A legal protection of children whose rights are seriously violated through WFCL is a currently missing element in the implementation of the APs, in fact in most cases it is beyond capacity if the implementing NGOs. Therefore the role of government law enforcement agencies has a crucial importance in this aspect.</p>	

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

<b>Child Labour monitoring: National and Provincial level</b>	1. AP by MoSWL  Creating National Child Labour Monitoring System		1. The work by the MoSWL on CLM has been slow. It is observed that more technical assistance is needed from IPEC to support this work. IPEC management is planning to involve the upcoming UCW project on this aspect as well (in addition to data analyses and policy recommendations), organize regular meetings of concerned agencies to develop integrated and common understanding and linking with other ongoing work by the NSO and other UN agencies. Provincial level CLM needs to be linked with the national system.	<p>The fact that MoSWL recognized the need for such system and willing to undertake the initiatives is a very positive step. However, the work is yet to be done.</p> <p>MoSWL expressed the need for IPEC technical support.</p> <p>The NPM is well aware of the constraints and the need for support and link with other ongoing work.</p>	As mentioned earlier, see if it can be linked with an ongoing work of UNICEF with the NSO (2007-2011) on introducing sets of child protection indicators in the national annual statistics ( a set of information is intended to be relating to CL).
	2. Developing Community level CLM		2. TOR of this Service contract work has been discussed at the NSC meeting. Selection of implementing agencies has been made. TOR is being finalised. Care is given to	<p>Well needed work and has a high potential value for building a sustainable, local capacity. The work is in early stage of development.</p> <p>(There were some</p>	A special care needs to be given to ensure that the software system (to-be-developed) is user friendly (simple as much as possible)

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

			ensure the linkage between the NCLM and provincial/community CLM.	difficulties in identifying interested and suitable agencies to undertake these services)	
<b>Capacity building: Provincial policy making, implementation and monitoring</b>	UB + 5 aimags		This is being done through supporting area based interventions in UB and selected 5 aimags and trainings, workshops and consultations. Now UB and 5 aimags have adopted their SP-WFCL in their respective areas, established coordinating mechanism and taskforces, are conducting regular consultations. 13 APs are under implementation. Regular support is being provided by IPEC to implementing partners through consultations, trainings etc.	Extremely important area of work to ensure the sustainability of the project initiatives. The support is ongoing, and proved to be effective.  A solid foundations of local capacity is built in most project areas, but special attention and targeted support is needed to a few IAs ( GO UBC, GO DG, GO TU);	
<b>Building network partnership against the WFCL</b>			In design	There is a great need for such networking if the project is to mobilize a wider group of social actors against the WFCL.	Just a suggestion as an option to start with building on existing networks (eg, “Education and Child Rights Coalition” that was established during the advocacy campaign on Education Law Amendments)

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

<b>Capacity building of partners in providing quality services to the children, families and the community</b>	Service contract work with Mongolian Association of Professional Social Workers: Improving the capacity of IPEC partners in needs assessment and tracking of project beneficiaries		Draft version of the case management methodology and questionnaires are developed. Consultants are doing final polishing. Then software development will start soon.	<p>The work is in a good progress now after some delay.</p> <p>The evaluator's observation from the field visits is that there is a need for more than the current work contracted.</p>	<p>Assess carefully if such need is there. If it proves so, arrange more professional social work training on how to work on different cases of children, families and communities.</p> <p>Training on social work outreach (how to reach out to the hard to reach target groups and communities) is also recommendable for particular IAs.</p>
	Excol contract work on developing an inventory on schemes, projects and programmes supporting business development, income generation and micro credit and supporting ILO/IPEC partners and employment services in providing relevant information and counselling services		Microfinance demand and needs study (among families of working children) was conducted and its report was finalized. The consultant is working on the inventory and collecting related information from microfinance institutions.	The work is in good progress	
	SC work with ECPAT National Network: Empowering children and families and gender mainstreaming using ILO		Training materials are translated and edited and piloted by participating orgs, TOT training is	The work is in good progress	

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

	tool “Rights, Responsibilities and Representation”		scheduled on 10-14 Dec, 2007 to be be organised with the support of the consultant (author).		
	<u>Under development currently:</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Capacity building of partners in raising awareness on mercury hazards</li> <li>• Capacity building of partners in providing health education to working children</li> </ul>			It was observed during the field visits that such needs are there.	
<b>Development of Advocacy Strategy on the Elimination of Child Labour</b>	<p>SC with Press Institute: “Development of Advocacy Strategy on the Elimination of Child Labour”</p> <p>SC with NAC: “Promotion of Advocacy Strategy”</p>	Govt , employers and workers organizations, NGOs, civil society, media, children, parents, general public	<p>The strategy development lasted longer than expected due to a lack of experience of developing such strategy, the need to reach an agreement on core concepts, format of the document, etc.</p> <p>The strategy was developed with input of various stakeholders and endorsed by the NCC headed by Prime Minister, in May 2007.</p> <p>The strategy was officially presented to all stakeholders on WDACL 2007. The</p>	<p>In the evaluators’ view, it is a broad framework for deliberate and strategic use of information for awareness raising targeting various sectors/actors of the society. As such, it is a very important resource document for concerned stakeholders.</p> <p>The implementation of the Strategy lies with the NAC. Discussions on further support to the NAC and other key stakeholders are ongoing.</p>	While this is going to be an important step in establishing a broad-base common understanding of CL issues and the actions required, it should not undermine the need for concrete advocacy strategies and actions of the IPEC and stakeholders particularly in areas of public policy improvements.

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

			video presentation and the printed strategy were distributed to relevant organizations in aimags and UB.		
<b>Strengthening capacity of media</b>		Media, IAs	The media training for journalists from media organisations in Ulaanbaatar and selected aimags was organized. Both the IPEC partners and journalists had the opportunity to exchange their views on improving the role of media and strategies for effective mobilization of media. A call for action to all media organizations was issued by participants and disseminated to all media organizations. IPEC now has a pool of journalists and maintains with them regular communication.	This was a good start of the process establishing effective and sustainable partnership with the media for effective mobilization of media in combating CL.  It will be followed up with the current initiatives on nationwide awareness raising campaigns.	
<b>Nationwide awareness raising campaign in line with the national advocacy strategy</b>	Mini-Programme “Raising visibility of global and local efforts against child labour in observance of WDACL 2006”, National Human	Government, employers and workers organizations, NGOs, civil society, media, children,	Each year IPEC supported observance of WDACL as an excellent opportunity to increase awareness of all concerned. In 2006, the national consultation	Relevant documentations and the observations from the field visits suggest that the IPEC team makes an excellent use of the observance of the day not	

---

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

	Rights Commission	parents, general public	adopted policy recommendations on the elimination of the worst forms of child labour in the spirit of the II Global Report. Nationwide campaigns on WDACL 2006 contributed to raising visibility of global and local efforts against child labour.	only for awareness building but assuring the commitments of government and the other key actors.  The policy recommendations on the elimination of the WFCL (2006) are largely reflected in the earlier mentioned “Advocacy Strategy on the Elimination of Child Labour”	Strengthen efforts on follow up through ten SC structure.  The policy recommendations endorsed shall/ could serve as a practical guide for the NSC’s efforts in mainstreaming CL issues into national and sectoral policies and practices. Therefore, a review of the progress in realisation of the recommendations could be a useful process for the NSC in positioning themselves in their expected role.
	Mini-programme “Increasing visibility of CL issue in agriculture and animal husbandry and advocating for tackling child labour in this sector”, 2007, NAC		Action plan (2007-2009) outlining the main directions and roles of relevant government agencies concerning CL in agriculture was developed jointly by MOSWL, MoA, and MoESC. An official instruction was issued by the Prime Minister which set a starting point for a year-long nationwide campaign against child labour in agriculture.	The WDACL 2007 has far reaching effects with the Prime Minister’s special instructions being issued to all local governments on the primary actions addressing the CL in agriculture. Follow up actions are ongoing across the country.	
<b>Building advocacy capacity of partners</b>	SC with Association of Social Work Educator: “Building of partners capacity in advocacy skills”	IPEC partner organizations, child labour practitioners and main stakeholders	The manual on Child Participation (developed by IPEC and RWG –CL) was translated. Study on advocacy needs and demands of IPEC partners	The work is in a good progress.  (The training shall be also	This capacity building efforts need to be strengthened with concrete, practical advocacy efforts (with close involvement of the IPEC) on particular issues.

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

			and other relevant organizations were undertaken. The draft manual on advocacy against CL is being developed, and IPEC will support in tailoring the content to the country context. The initial introduction of the handbook and advocacy trainings are planned to be conducted in Dec.	useful for the IPEC staff).	
<b>Promotion of child labour subject in universities</b>	SC with Center for Social Development	Students, teachers, faculty, researchers in selected high school institutions	<p>The teachers' handbook for teaching child labour subject was endorsed by academic councils of 4 major universities and was praised by participating universities as an excellent resource material for teaching CL not only in social work departments, but also in other relevant courses. The textbook and handbook have been officially launched.</p> <p>The research paper contest organized among the students ensured broad and active participation of</p>	<p>An excellent contribution in awareness building among university students and faculty (of various fields) on CL issues, its complexity and the implications for social actors and professionals.</p> <p>The textbook can be used much widely beyond the initial purpose.</p>	

---

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.



			students and teachers from both the rural and urban universities.		
<b>Inclusion of child right to be protected from economic exploitation into secondary school curricular</b>		Children, teachers, parents	UNICEF has started work to include child rights into curricular of Education University. Initial meeting was held by Human Rights Commission on the issue of improving child rights education in secondary schools. IPEC is planning to be a part of this work.	<p>The work is in a planning stage.</p> <p>This should be promoted as a part of child rights and child protection education.</p>	

## Annex 3

### Achievements by Action Programme (with direct services)

Note:

\*- The numbers are as of 31 August, 2007

\*\*.-The observations that are common to all APs are not included here but reflected in the main report.

Action Programme	Achievements as per I/A report or statements made by I/A		Achievements as per project management (Comments, additions)	Comments/observations by evaluation team**	Proposed follow-up/Next steps*
	Target Groups*	Other Qualitative			
(A) Action Programmes in Aimags					
A1. Integrated response to WFCL in Bayankhongor aimag with increased social partnership	Withdrawn 187 Prevented 87 Total 274  365 parents and family members	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>- Aimag&amp; soum level teams,</li><li>- Workshops and seminars</li><li>- NFE trainings</li><li>- Skill trainings</li><li>- Referral to school</li><li>- Advocacy materials and activities</li><li>- Contracts</li><li>- Policies</li></ul>	AP has good achievements as planned. Aimag team works very well. There is a need to delegate responsibilities to soum level taskforces.	<p>A solid start with a very active task force at the Aimag level and the implementation is in a good progress.</p> <p>The current practice of the Aimag Task Force playing direct implementing role bypassing Soum level government might be good in short run in terms of delivery but not for the longer term sustainability.</p>	<p>Systematically delegate the responsibilities to the soum level.</p> <p>Reinforce the understanding that the project is support the Aimag SP_WFCL, thus increase the role of local governments at all levels.</p>
				T	

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

<b>A2. Integrated response to addressing WFCL in Dornod aimag</b>	<p>Withdrawn 189 Prevented 82 Total 271</p> <p>280 parents and family members</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Aimag&amp; soum level teams,</li> <li>- Workshops and seminars</li> <li>- NFE trainings</li> <li>- Skill trainings</li> <li>- Referral to school</li> <li>- Counselling</li> <li>- Advocacy materials and activities</li> <li>- Contracts</li> <li>- Policies</li> </ul>	<p>Activities and expected outcomes are being produced on time. Achievements are good enough as planned. It is needed to improve employers' and trade unions participation in activities.</p>	<p>he evaluator did not visit the Aimag. The reports and interviews with the relevant officials indicate a smooth and coordinated implementation process.</p> <p>Girls development centre works currently with girls at risk</p>	<p>Needs more attention and possibly some support (training) in reaching out to the children in sexual exploitation</p>
<b>A3. Integrated response to WFCL in Uvurkhangai aimag</b>	<p>Withdrawn 176 Prevented 58 Total 234</p> <p>201 parents and family members</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Aimag&amp; soum level teams,</li> <li>- Workshops and seminars</li> <li>- NFE trainings</li> <li>- Skill trainings</li> <li>- Referral to school</li> <li>- Advocacy materials and activities</li> <li>- Contracts</li> <li>- Policies</li> </ul>	<p>AP achievements are good. Soum project teams work very actively. Advocacy and NFE training activities in Ult mining site are needed to improve.</p>	<p>The implementation is in a good progress. The roles of Aimag Task Force members are clearly defined. There is strong sense of ownership over the Local SP-WFCL and the AP; and a solid implementation structure (through local govt administrative structure).</p> <p>The LSP-WFCL is on the agenda of all Soums (</p>	<p>As there are some emerging good practices both at Aimag and Soum levels, the Aimag will be a recommended site for study tour by other Aimags, if such tour is feasible.</p>

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

				<p>project and non-project Soums).</p> <p>Effective use of the Aimag relative advantage (over other Aimags) of having child rights officials in every Soum government and ACC plays a proactive role in combating the WFCL.</p> <p>There was a clear lack of community outreach work experience in Ult site.</p>	<p>Targeting of children needs to be tightened to reach the most vulnerable (those at mining sites).</p> <p>Training support on community outreach and community mobilization is needed</p>
<b>A4. Integrated response to WFCL in Dornogovi aimag</b>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Aimag and soum teams were established.</li> <li>- Training workshops to Soum Governors, Social workers and Trade Union Members were organized.</li> </ul>	<p>AP started on 2 April 2007. The first progress report is being reviewed. Capacity building activities are undertaken as planned. Data on working children are being collected from each soums. Direct action to targeted children and family members are just</p>	<p>The evaluator did not visit the Aimag. Reports indicate that the start up process was far too slow.</p> <p>An interview with the relevant officials reveals that the implementation process yet to be accelerated.</p>	<p>As a matter of priority, the IPEC team needs to work closely with the Aimag.</p> <p>Field a mission, if feasible with involvement of the NSC members/s.</p> <p>Possibly schedule a review of the AP at</p>

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

			starting now. It is delayed from the work plan. There is a need to support the aimag task force for improved coordination.		the NSC and agree on concrete steps on how to best support the Aimag.
<b>A5. To support local activities against WFCL in Tuv aimag</b>		Aimag team was established. Trainings to Soum Governors and Scoial workers were organized. Some advocacy materials were published	AP is started on 11 June 2007. The aimag team is working on the first progress report. Selection of project children is going on. Capacity building workshops are organized.	The evaluator did not visit the Aimag, there was no progress report available to review.  The start up process was far too slow.  An interview with the Aimag Task Force secretary indicates some initial progress.	This AP likely needs a close monitoring and support.  Take care of the efficiency of the project interventions.
<b>(B) Action Programmes in Ulaanbaatar City</b>					
B1.  <b>Governor's Office of Nalaikh District, Ulaanbaatar City</b>	Withdrawn 76, Prevented 76, total 152  76 parents	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The project activities are run under regular and sustainable management.</li> <li>• Increased awareness on WFCL.</li> <li>• Sustained system of CLM</li> <li>• District's Sub</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Implementation is successful. The management of the action programme is effective and sustainable.</li> <li>• Good coordinated actions against CL</li> </ul>	The implementation is in a good progress. The Aimag Task Force has strong sense of ownership over their sub-programme and the AP.  A local CLM system piloted in the previous	Would be a recommended site for other APs learning, especially for the AP of the UB City Government.

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

		<p>programme on elimination of WFCL</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Regular duties of social workers and social service agencies</li> <li>• Pro active participation of the local media and local agencies</li> </ul>		<p>phase is sustained.</p> <p>Has accumulated good experiences to share with others.</p>	
<p>B2.</p> <p><b>Removal and Rehabilitation of Children Working at Marketplace in Ulaanbaatar and mobilizing marketplace authorities against CL</b></p> <p>IA: Equal Step Centre</p>	<p>Withdrawn 128, Prevented 7, total 135</p> <p>110 parents</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Creating supportive environment for addressing the WFCL in the selected marketplaces,</li> <li>• Announcing work places without child labour</li> <li>• Innovative ideas to rehabilitate working children</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Implementation is satisfactory</li> <li>• Agency is good in fundraising and connecting to new ideas to support project activities</li> <li>• IA undertakes regular evaluation on the impact of their activities</li> </ul>	<p>The implementation is in a good progress.</p> <p>The IA does well the direct services for children, support family members, and awareness raising activities at the market places with some involvement of the market focal points.</p> <p>Although there is a task force is established with representatives of the selected markets (but no district level involvement), the</p>	<p>For the sustainability reason, the IA needs more efforts to ensure genuine, pro active involvement and ownership of the market management over the initiatives combating the WFCL. That is the area where the city coordination AP</p>

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

				project is solely managed by the Director of the IA.	should come in linked.
<p>B3.</p> <p><b>Removal, Rehabilitation and Prevention of Girls from Prostitution and Improving Public Awareness on Sexual Exploitation of Children</b></p> <p>IA: Adolescents Development Centre (ADC)</p>	<p>Withdrawn 36, Prevented 100, total 136.</p> <p>115 adult members</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• UB Khoroo social workers and police officers have been sensitized on WFCL</li> <li>• Public and community awareness has been raised through radio programmes and TV spot</li> <li>• Observations have been conducted in about 70 service establishments and delivered information on CSEC and sensitized employees. Police's attention was drawn on illegal operations of these service establishment</li> <li>• Journalists were trained and prepared to advocate messages on prevention from</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Implementation is progressive.</li> <li>• Expansion of local partners and regular activities at khoroo level are taking place</li> <li>• Extensive efforts to prevent children form SE;</li> <li>• Collaboration with the police on identifying children at risk and places imposing risks of sexual exploitation of children and women;</li> <li>• Staff of service establishments were informed about CSEC</li> <li>• Good established basis of cooperation with mass media</li> <li>• Provision of regular and qualitative social counselling</li> <li>• Good support is given to parents</li> </ul> <p><u>Need to be supported</u></p>	<p>The implementation is in progress, training and services are provided.</p> <p>However, despite the great commitment of the IA, due to the nature of the problem of the CSEC, there are some sign of difficulties that in long run may hamper the overall impact and the sustainability of the initiatives. Those include: - little returns from the outreach efforts</p> <p>-the returns result largely in one off visits by the target group children, and no continued relationship with the IA, so there is an issue of the quality and relevance of the</p>	<p>In overall, the objectives set by the AP appear to be exceeding the IA competence. The broadly defined objectives are hardly achievable unless there is solid link with the City AP, and more targeted support from the IPEC.</p> <p>All aspects of the implementation, with specific focus on the project effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability, needs</p>

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

		<p>sexual exploitation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Psychological counselling service is provided and operationalised</li> </ul>	<p><u>with</u> :</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Review of their outreach work</li> <li>• Technical capacity to legally protect children</li> </ul>	<p>services offered</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>-high turn over of staff</li> <li>-high cost services not yet with visible returns or signs of values added.</li> </ul> <p>(It should be noted here that the above is the observations made during the field work only. A thorough, objective review appears to be essential).</p>	<p>to be closely reviewed ASAP jointly by IA and IPEC; and if needed project document needs to be revised in consideration of the potential role of the ECPAC National Network.</p> <p>Given the very limited in-country expertise on dealing with CSEC, the support in learning from international experiences might be of crucial importance.</p>
<p>B4. <b>Preventing School Dropout Children from Child Labour and improving Response to Needs of Vulnerable Migrant Families</b></p>	<p>Withdrawn 12, Prevented 353, total 365 children</p> <p>165 parents</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• NFE classes organised in collaboration with Enlightenment Centres and schools;</li> <li>• Joint efforts of IA and schools to reintegrate children into regular schools.</li> <li>• Cooperation with</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Activities run as planned.</li> <li>• High coverage of children</li> <li>• Punctual reporting</li> <li>• Tracking of the reintegrated children through school social workers,</li> <li>• Support from students' council and social workers to</li> </ul>	<p>The implementation is in a good progress. The IA is experienced in providing or linking to NFE services for drop outs.</p> <p>However there was little sign that the IA explicitly targeted</p>	<p>Pay a closer attention on the targeting if new enrolment is to happen.</p>

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.



IA: Mongolian Child's Right Centre (MCRC)		school and khoroo social workers on identifying migrant families and integrating there children into schools	establish a child friendly school environment	migrant children. Some good work with and support to the schools where NFE classes operate, but with no involvement of the target children (those currently in NFE and intended to be integrated into schools).	
<p>B5.</p> <p><b>Preventing Young Children from Child Labor through Pre-school Education.</b></p> <p>IA: Family Development Centre</p>	<p>Prevented 140, total 140 children</p> <p>140 parents</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Development of a training curriculum for teachers to provide pre-school education to children aged 3-6 years</li> <li>• Introduction meetings on the training curricula and the alternative training for chairpersons of social development division, preschool education managers and khoroo governors of Bayanzurkh and Sukhbaatar districts</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Implementation is satisfactory.</li> <li>• Availability of good quality training materials</li> <li>• Good cooperation with district authority</li> <li>• Good potential for further replicating the alternative pre-school training</li> </ul>	<p>The implementation is in a good progress and the IA shows good efforts.</p> <p>However, the original targeting (of children aged 5-6 years, who are the siblings of the working children) is somewhat blurred. (Currently 47% of the children have no working sibling/s, and 38% are below the target age.)</p> <p>The new developments of the alternative</p>	<p>As the implementation arrangements are changed, the project budget needs to be revised accordingly in consideration of the project efficiency matter.</p> <p>IPEC's support and advocacy is essential in this regard.</p>

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Pre-school classes for very young children at risk of child labour</li> </ul>		<p>training modules need to be properly assessed, supported and endorsed by the relevant authorities if it is to be institutionally replicated. (Currently available assessments and recommendations are dated back to March 2005).</p>	
<p>B6.</p> <p><b>Removal and Prevention Children from Scavenging and Building Effective Partnership with Key Stakeholders on elimination of CL at major dumpsites in Ulaanbaatar</b></p> <p>IA: Red Cross Committee of Ulaanbaatar City</p>	<p>Withdrawn 28 children, total 28 children</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Sensitisation of district officials and education and health service providers</li> <li>• Close collaboration with khoroo governor and unit leaders</li> <li>• Sensitisation of red cross volunteers</li> <li>• Formed 2 watch groups of CL at the dumpsite</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Good collaboration with the district authority</li> <li>• Well formed team at the dump site</li> <li>• Number of beneficiaries is low currently.</li> <li>• Need to intensify prevention activities and increase number of children for removal actions.</li> </ul>	<p>The implementation is in a progress, and yet to be accelerated.</p> <p>Scavenging is one of the worst worms of child labour in Mongolia; and is used as a last resort for a survival. Therefore, as the IA indicates in its internal assessment report, the efforts for removal without offering other alternatives (for income generation) to their families would have very limited results.</p>	<p>Review the project strategies and the budget accordingly. Budget for more support to families (with alternative income generation, vocational training etc) and children with mediation to safe works. Proactively approach more resourceful organizations (e.g. WVI) and advocate to intensify joint efforts for removal from scavenging with alternative offerings.</p>

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

B7.	Withdrawn 133 children, total 133 children 61 parents	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Changing attitude of the police personnel and market inspectors towards working children.</li> <li>• Marketplace authorities' support in organising activities among inspectors, employees and police men and sensitising public</li> <li>• Improved support and positive perception of teachers, social workers and the district officials on prevention and support of working children</li> <li>• Regular NFE training at the district enlightenment centres and health check ups</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Implementation progressive</li> <li>• Eliminated 2 types of child work such as, loading carts by children and carrying heavy loads on children's back.</li> <li>• Changed attitude of market community, employees and police officers towards working children.</li> <li>• Reduction of working hours of children, almost 70 per cent of working children at the marketplace combines schooling and working</li> <li>• Good relationship of the working children at the marketplace with social workers</li> <li>• Supportive cooperation with the district social welfare division</li> <li>• Need to intensify support to families</li> </ul>	<p>The implementation is in a progress.</p> <p>Child Information and Development Centre at the market place have been operational there for years.</p>	<p>More concrete, innovative and progressive efforts might be needed to bring the work with the market community and management into a new and sustainable level.</p>
B8.		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Formed coordination team</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Implementation started recently</li> </ul>	<p>The city sub programme came into</p>	

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

<p><b>Increasing the Capacity of Ulaanbaatar Municipal Government in Implementing and Coordinating Actions to Eliminate the WFCL in the Capital City</b></p> <p>IA: Governor's Office of UB City</p>		<p>at UB level</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Workshop and consultation of officials working district level</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Structure to advocate and enforce city's sub programme on elimination of WFCL is formed</li> <li>• Focus shall be given to actions and coordination at districts level and learning from good practices and prevention from CL</li> </ul>	<p>effect in June 2006. However, there was a long delay in start up of the AP, thus with some opportunity costs. Timely operation of the AP would have been positively influenced the quality of some other APs in UB (eg, one with ADC).</p> <p>Although not explicitly expressed in the project document, it shall play a crucial role in establishing an area base comprehensive intervention mechanisms at the City and District levels, in combating the WFCL.</p> <p>For the cost effectiveness reason, the planned actions need to be closely linked and coordinated with other ongoing developments of the</p>	<p>Given the importance of the role of this AP, LSP-WFCL, and the City Government in elimination of the WFCL, the NSC-CL needs to be expanded with a representative of the GO UBC.</p>
--	--	--	--	--	--

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

				IPEC and UB APs (training for and capacity building of khoroo social workers, labor inspectors, and media etc)	
--	--	--	--	---	--

---

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

## Annex 4

### **Project target beneficiaries and the progress to date** (as of 31 Aug 2007)

	Project title	IA	Total # target children for the project life			Total # children have been targeted (As of Aug2007)			Total # children prevented and or withdrawn*		
			To prevent	To withdraw	SubTotal	To prevent	To withdraw	SubTotal	PREVENTED	WITHDRAWN	SubTotal
1	Integrated Response to WFCL in Bayankhongor Aimag	GO BH	485	395	880	87	187	274			
2	Integrated Response to Addressing WFCL in Dornod aimag	GO DO	350	270	620	82	189	271			
3	Integrated Response to the WFCL in Uvurkhangai aimag	GO UV	350	450	800	58	176	234			
4	Integrated Response to WFCL in Dornogovi aimag	GO DG	280	170	450	0	0	0			
5	Support to local action against WFCL in Tuv aimag.	GO TU	230	170	400	0	0	0			

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

	Subtotal Aimags		1695	1455	3150	227	552	779			
6	Removal and Rehabilitation of Children Working at Marketplace in Ulaanbaatar and mobilizing marketplace authorities against CL	ESC	270	430	700	7	128	135			
7	Removal, Rehabilitation and Prevention of Girls from Prostitution and Improving Public Awareness on Sexual Exploitation of Children	ADC	390	120	510	100	36	136			
8	Preventing School Dropout Children from Child Labour and improving Response to Needs of Vulnerable Migrant Families	MCRC	580	0	580	353	12	365			
9	Building Sustainable Integrated Action Against WFCL in Nalaikh District of Ulaanbaator and Removing/ preventing Children from the Worst Form of Child Labour	GO NA	140	160	300	76	76	152			
10	Integrated Responses to Worst Form of Child Labor at Narantuul Marketplace.	UCDCY	0	450	450	0	133	133			

---

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

11	Removal and Prevention Children from Scavenging and Building Effective Partnership with Key Stakeholders on elimination of CL at major dumpsites in Ulaanbaatar	<b>RD UCC</b>	670	130	800	0	28	28			
12	Preventing Young Children from Child Labor through Pre-school Education.	<b>FDC</b>	420	0	420	140	0	140			
	<b>Subtotal UB</b>		2470	1290	<b>3760</b>	676	413	<b>1089</b>			
	<b>TOTAL</b>		4165	2745	<b>6910</b>	903	965	<b>1868</b>			
	<b>Progress to date as % of the target</b>					21.68%	35.15%	27.03%			

*\*- The current monitoring and reporting system does not provide the actual number of the children prevented and or withdrawn*



# Annex 5

## SERVICES PROVIDED TO CHILDREN AND THEIR FAMILIES

SUMMARY SHEET As of 31 August 2007

	Info on children involved in the projcet								info on children at the time of joining the project				services provided to children							services provided to families					
	IA	Total number of children involved in the project	Sex		Age groups				literate	drop out from te primary school	engaged in CL	at risk of being engaged in CL	NFE	vocational and skills training	physicological counselling	health services, and insurance	lunch	legal counselling	training on CL awareness raising	Family members provided with vocational/skills trainparents/ng	Parents provided with lifeskills and business training	very poor HHs provided with assistance	Provided support on micro credit and income generation	training on CL awareness raising	
			male	female	<12	13-15	16-18	>18																	
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	11	12	13		14	15	17	18	19	20	21	22	23	24	25	26	
	GO BH	274	153	121	114	84	76	0	208	202	187	87	185	10	182	160	180	46	158	125	111	26	6	12	
	GO DO	271	154	117	43	123	105	0	239	196	189	82	176	7	186	178	124	154	138	21	60	20	17	18	
	GO UV	234	158	76	72	120	41	1	179	156	176	58	168	5	111	150	169	126	136	40	38	5	14	10	
	GO DG	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0		
	GO TU	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0		
	Subtotal	779	465	314	229	327	222	1	626	554	552	227	529	22	479	488	473	326	432	186	209	51	37	41	
	ADC	136	0	136	8	36	89	3	127	83	36	100	1	26	136	136	136	136	136	0	88	20	21	13	
	ESC	135	96	39	24	60	49	2	96	121	128	7	114	0	30	135	116	0	135	0	0	0	0	11	
	UCDCY	133	75	58	45	54	34	0	126	58	133	0	25	9	65	93	129	28	133	5	0	0	26	3	
	RC U	28	19	9	6	11	11	0	18	28	28	0	25	0	25	25	25	0	28	0	0	25	25	2	
	MCRC	365	200	165	261	98	6	0	125	365	12	353	204	0	2	182	212	0	365	0	0	0	0	16	

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures“.

	GO NA	152	108	44	48	63	41	0	138	43	76	76	45	10	72	148	45	71	152	0	71	0	0	10	
	FDC	140	61	79	140	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	140	0	0	0	140	0	140	0	0	0	0	14	
	Subtotal UB	1089	559	530	532	322	230	5	630	698	413	536	554	45	330	719	803	235	1089	5	159	45	72	71	
	TOTAL	1868	1024	844	761	649	452	6	1256	1252	965	763	1083	67	809	1207	1276	561	1521	191	368	96	109	112	
	%		55%	45%	41%	35%	24%	0%											10%	20%	5%	6%	60%		
	Total-FDC**	1728			621	649	452	6	1256	1252	965	763	943	67	809	1207	1136	561	1381						
	%				36%	38%	26%	0%	73%	72%	56%	44%	55%	4%	47%	70%	66%	32%	80%						

\* children returned home -- in UB, from a temporary shelter; in Aimags -- from mining sites

\*\* - FDC targets inclusively prechool age children, therefore not included in some of the indicators to avoid a deviation

## **Annex 6 List of documents consulted**

<b>General References</b>	
	The National Programme for the Development and Protection of Children (2002-2010)
	The NPDPC (2002-2010): Policy Framework for the Phase II (2005-2007)
	Mongolia Human Development Report 2007: Poverty and Employment
	Mongolia MDG Report 2007 (Draft under publication)
	Government of Mongolia Report under UN CRC (Draft as of Nov 2007)
	Government of Mongolia Report under ILO Convention 182 (Draft as 2007)
	Government of Mongolia Report under ILO Convention 138 (Draft as 2007)
	Government of Mongolia Report: “Plus 5” Review of the UN 2002 Special Session on Children and World Fit for Children Plan of Action, 2006, Ulaanbaatar
	National Policy on Informal Employment, 2006
	Education Law of Mongolia, 2006
	Education Master Plan of Mongolia, 2006-2015
	Draft Law on Artisanal Mining (2007 )
	Evaluation Report, UNICEF Project in Support for the ECPAT Mongolia, May 2007
	Recommendations for the Development of a Social Service Contracting System, 2007, SCUK
	ILO DED Briefing Package on evaluation
<b>Project Specific References</b>	
	Project document “Support to the Proposed National Sub-Programme to Eliminate the WFCL: Time Bound Measures”, MON /05/P50/USA
	Report of the Consultative Meeting with the Project Aimags , Jan 2006, Ulaanbaatar
	Reports of the Aimag Workshops on Planning on Local Strategies and Interventions on Combating the WFCL, (5 Aimags and UB)
	Aimag and City Sub Programmes on Elimination of the WFCL, 2006, (5 Aimags and UB)
	Action Programme Summary Outlines (APSO) and Service Contract ToRs
	AP Technical and Financial Progress Reports (2006-2007)
	AP Internal Assessment Reports, Oct 2007
	Project documents at Aimag level
	ILO IPEC Mongolia Technical Progress Reports to USDOL (March 2006, Sept 2006, March 2007, Sept 2007)
	The NSC-CL, 2007 Annual Action Plan
	ToR for the NSC-CL
	A proposed model for an- area based intervention on elimination of the WFCL, 2006
	Criteria for Selection of Children for the project interventions, endorsed by the NSC, 2006
	Documents on WDACL observations (2005, 2006, 2007)
	Government, employers and workers' documents concerning child labour
	Master list and service records of beneficiaries
	Project baseline reports
	Training and Operational Handbook for Labor Inspectors, ILO, 2006, Ulaanbaatar
	Advocacy Strategy on Elimination of the WFCL, 2007-2011, Ulaanbaatar
	Good Practices and Lessons Learned, ILO IPEC Mongolia, Phase II, 2006

“Support to the Proposed Mongolia National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time-Bound Measures”.

