
**INDEPENDENT MIDTERM EVALUATION
OF
ENGAGED, EDUCATED, AND EMPLOYED
ETHIOPIAN YOUTH
E4Y**

FUNDED BY THE UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF LABOR

No. IL-26683-14-75-K-11

**FINAL
JUNE 2017**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF CONTENTS	1
LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES.....	1
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	2
LIST OF ACRONYMS	3
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	5
I. CONTEXT AND PROJECT DESCRIPTION	10
1.1. Country Context.....	10
1.2. Legal Framework.....	12
1.3. Project Description.....	14
1.4. Project Objectives	15
1.5. Geographic Coverage.....	15
II. EVALUATION PURPOSE AND METHODOLOGY	16
2.1. Purpose of the Interim Evaluation.....	16
2.2. Methodology	16
III. FINDINGS.....	20
3.1. Project Design and Relevance.....	20
3.1.1. Baseline Data – Child Labor Prevalence Study	20
3.1.2. Theory of Change	22
3.1.3. From Design to Results Framework	23
3.2. Project Management and Administration.....	23
3.2.1. Project Staffing	24
3.2.2. Monitoring and Evaluation Function	25
3.3. Project Achievements and Results	26
3.3.1. Laying a Broad Foundation	27
3.3.2. Education	28
3.3.3. Youth Employment.....	32
3.3.4. Livelihoods	37
3.3.5. Youth Leadership.....	39
3.3.6. Social Protection	42
3.3.7. Research and Publications	45
IV. POTENTIAL FOR SUSTAINABILITY	48
V. MAIN CONCLUSIONS	51
VI. RECOMMENDATIONS.....	53
6.1. Education	53
6.2. Youth Employment and Technical Vocational Training.....	53
6.3. Livelihood.....	55
6.4. Youth Leadership.....	55
6.5. Social Protection	55
6.6. Project Design and Management	56

VII. LESSONS LEARNED AND BEST PRACTICES	58
7.1. Lessons Learned.....	58
7.2. Best Practices	61
ANNEXES	62
Annex A: List of Documents Reviewed	63
Annex B: Itinerary	65
Annex C: List of Persons Interviewed.....	68
Annex D: Stakeholder Meeting Agenda And Participants	69
Annex E: Key Evaluation Questions and Response Matrix	71
Annex F: Terms of Reference.....	74

LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES

Table 1: Overview of E4Y Project Accomplishments.....	6
Table 2; Overview of Child Protection/Child Labor Legal Framework in Ethiopia	13
Table 3: Population, Methodology, Sample Size, and Sample Characteristics	17
Table 4: Targeted Accomplishments of E4Y Project at Midterm	26
Figure 1: Regional Map of Ethiopia	15
Figure 2: Bankbooks for Youth	35
Figure 3: Girls Club Toolkit	41
Figure 4 The Account Books for VSLA and VSAY.	50
Figure 5: A Master Mentor and school psychologist.....	61

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This report describes in detail the independent midterm evaluation of the Engaged, Educated, and Empowered Ethiopian Youth Project: E4Y. The fieldwork was conducted from February 6-17, 2017. Lou Witherite, independent evaluator, conducted the evaluation in collaboration with the project team and stakeholders and prepared the evaluation report according to the terms in the contract with the United States Department of Labor. Ms. Witherite would like to express sincere thanks to all parties involved in this evaluation for their support and valuable contributions.



**O'BRIEN &
ASSOCIATES**
I N T E R N A T I O N A L

Funding for this evaluation was provided by the United States Department of Labor under Task Order number DOL-OPS-16-T-00108. Points of view or opinions in this evaluation report do not necessarily reflect the views or policies of the United States Department of Labor, nor does the mention of trade names, commercial products, or organizations imply endorsement by the United States Government.

LIST OF ACRONYMS

ADP/AP	Area Development Program/Area Program
BETA	Business Entrepreneurship Technical Advisor
BO	Business Organizations
BoLSA	Bureau of Labor and Social Affairs
CBO	Community Based Organization
CCC	Community Care Coalitions
CCL	Center for Creative Leadership
CDG	Community Dialogue Groups
CL	Child Labor
CMEP	Comprehensive Monitoring and Evaluation Plan
COC	Certificate of Competency
CPC	Child Protection Committee
CRC	UN Convention on the Rights of the Child
CSA	Central Statistics Agency
CT	Child Trafficking
DBMS	Direct Beneficiary Monitoring System
DCT	Data Collection Table
DfID	Department for International Development, United Kingdom
E4Y	Engaged, Educated, Empowered, Ethiopian Youth Project
EDHS	Ethiopia Demographic Health Survey
EE	Entrepreneurship Education
ES	Education Specialist
ETB	Ethiopian Birr
FDRE	Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia
FGD	Focus group discussions
FOA	Funding Opportunity Announcement
FTC	Farmer Training Centers
GoE	Government of Ethiopia
HCL	Hazardous Child Labor
HH	Households
IAFE	Integrated Adult Functional Education Centers
ICT	Information and Communications Technology
IGA	Income Generating Activities
ILAB	Bureau of International Labor Affairs
ILO	International Labour Organization
INGO	International Non-governmental Organisation
IO	Immediate objectives
IRC	International Rescue Committee
LCM	Learner-Centered Methodology
LHS	Livelihood Specialist
LOP	Life of Project

M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MFI	Micro Finance Institution
MFP	Micro Franchise Program
MoE	Ministry of Education
MoLSA	Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs
MOU	Memorandum of Understanding
MoWCYA	Ministry of Women, Children and Youth Affairs
MPG	Management Procedures and Guidelines
MTE	Midterm Evaluation
NAP	National Action Plan
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
OCFT	Office of Child Labor, Forced Labor, and Human Trafficking
OSH	Occupational Safety and Health
PD	Project Director
PMP	Project Monitoring Plan
PSC	Project Steering Committee
PSNP	Productive Safety Net Program
PTSA	Parent Teacher Student Association
SNNPR	Southern Nations, Nationalities, and Peoples Region
SPS	Social Protection Specialist
STMP	Short Term Marketing Program
TESL	Teaching English as a Second Language
ToC	Theory of Change
TOR	Terms of Reference
ToT	Training of Trainers
TPR	Technical Progress Report
TVET	Technical and Vocational Education and Training
UN	United Nations
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
UoG	University of Gondar
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
USDOL	United States Department of Labor
USG	United States Government
VSAY	Village Savings Association for Youth
VSLA	Village Savings and Loan Associations
WFCL	Worst Forms of Child Labor
WDACL	World Day Against Child Labor
WV	World Vision
WVE	World Vision Ethiopia
YALI	Young African Leaders Initiative

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Introduction

In December 2014, World Vision was awarded a Cooperative Agreement grant from the Office of Child Labor, Forced Labor, and Human Trafficking (OCFT) within the United States Department of Labor (USDOL) to implement the “Engaged, Educated, Empowered, Ethiopian Youth (E4Y)” project to put target youth aged 14-17 on a path to acceptable and decent work in two regions of Ethiopia.¹ The four-year Cooperative Agreement for \$10,000,000 USD began December 15, 2014 and will end December 14, 2018. The project plan calls for an independent evaluation to assess the performance and experiences at midterm. After document review and initial preparation in late February 2017, a field site visit was conducted from March 4 - March 21, 2017.

The findings from the evaluation are described in this report along with recommendations. E4Y project documents use the terms youth, young worker, young person, and child interchangeably to describe those for whom project activities are intended to benefit.² To avoid confusion and conform to the project name, the term **youth** is given preference when describing E4Y beneficiaries in this report, except where informants, documents, organization names, or other references specifically used another term.³ The term **child** may be used in the case of persons aged 14 years and below, particularly E4Y beneficiaries in primary school, and in accordance with relevant Ethiopian laws and policies, and some USDOL terms, e.g., child labor.

World Vision collaborates with sub-grantee International Rescue Committee (IRC), contractor Center for Creative Leadership (CCL), and research partner University of Gondar (UoG) to implement E4Y in the Amhara Region and the Southern Nations, Nationalities, and Peoples’ Region (SNNPR). The project works closely with pertinent government ministries, especially the Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs (MoLSA), and services at all administrative levels. Non-governmental stakeholders include employers, businesses, local and international organizations, and local youth organizations. E4Y aims to help 12,000 Ethiopian youth aged 14-17 with formal education or vocational training in marketable skills to secure decent work and build leadership capabilities. The project also targets 7,500 households with services to create economically strong families, and trains both youth and adults in business start-up and entrepreneurship. The social protection component involves strategies such as establishing and organizing child

¹ E4Y Project Document Revised 16 February 2017, p. 4

² E4Y Project Performance Monitoring Plan (Annex 5) states, “The term youth is used interchangeably with children. Therefore, beneficiary children/youth are those children who are only 14 to 17 years old and who are engaged or at high risk of entering into child labor that are eligible to receive services from the project.”

³ Technically and in international law, the terms *youth* and *child* are used interchangeably, but, as noted by the United Nations (UN) Secretary General in 1981, the meaning of the term ‘youth’ varies in different societies around the world. Since 1985, the UN system has used the age cohort 15-24 to collect statistical data on youth. Ethiopia’s National Youth Policy (2004) defines youth as those “who are between 15 and 29 years. p. 4. The [international] Convention on the Rights of the Child, article 1, and [regional] African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child, article 2, define a child as “every human being below the age of eighteen years.”

protection support committees, community dialogues and volunteer networks, as well as strengthening the capacity of social protection services in the geographical target areas.

Key Findings

The evaluation found that the E4Y project is *relevant*, in that it addresses an important national problem around child labor, which there is widespread government and non-government consensus. The target beneficiary group of youth aged 14-17 is documented as highly vulnerable to exploitative child labor and trafficking. Factors that contribute to their vulnerability are related to the poverty and lack of awareness among families. The project addresses these factors and *effectively and* efficiently provides interventions and inputs to improve communities and household economies, theorizing that child labor will be reduced. The evaluation found evidence that youth are receiving appropriate educational and vocational training. Many are already engaged in youth employment and savings activities. In addition, there is ample evidence, based on interviews, focus groups and field site visits, that household economies are improved due to E4Y’s interventions. Families of target beneficiaries have received training in areas such as financial literacy and agricultural innovations and farming practices.

In its *implementation*, E4Y is on track to achieve its overall outcome and output indicators. Original project targets of 12,000 Ethiopian youth between the ages of 14 and 17 in the two target regions, and 7,500 households, have been met and surpassed since the project began. Particular targets specified in the original project document were that more than half of the beneficiaries (54%) should be girls, and at least 400 (3.3%) of the targeted beneficiaries would have disabilities.⁴ At the midpoint, the project has met these targets in some measure.

Table 1: Overview of E4Y Project Accomplishments

Beneficiaries and Objective	Target	Actual
Youth ages 14 to 17 placed into educational or employment activities	12,000	12,445
7,500 households with improved livelihoods	7,500	11,125

The project has already had a significant impact on direct and indirect beneficiaries at midterm.⁵ While concentrated in a limited geographical area, reaching a select sampling of Ethiopia’s population, the project is seen to have a positive effect on the surrounding neighborhoods in both urban and rural settings. The objectives are pragmatic and feasible, and the activities are

⁴ According to the E4Y Project Document Revised 16 February 2017, nearly all youth with disabilities, regardless of the potential impact on their education, leave school by the age of 14.

⁵ Indirect Beneficiaries are individuals not officially enrolled in a project who receive some tangible advantage from living within the project zone of influence. They may receive information and acquire knowledge through media or local presentations that motivates them to change behavior or otherwise acquire benefits from the project activities.

replicable. Capable project staff work in teams in both regions visit households and are visible and accessible to communities and stakeholders.

There is clear evidence of achieved deliverables. School supplies and backpacks, goats and sheep, and youth trainees working on masonry projects at Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) centers in project-supplied boots and jumpsuits are testimony to the project’s inputs. Village Savings Association for Youth (VSAY) and Village Savings and Loan Associations (VSLA) account books, small coffee shops, graduation photographs, and pyramids of tomatoes en route to market reflect the positive outcomes of those inputs. Equally exciting is the evidence of less palatable, but tangible nonetheless, inputs: poised and eloquent young people - E4Y beneficiaries - who fearlessly lead classroom discussions about harmful traditional practices, debate over climate change, and explore ways to be tolerant to youth with disabilities. Through focus group discussions, the evaluator heard evidentiary testimonies of attitudinal and behavioral change directly attributable to E4Y interventions from adults and youth in the target sites.

The evaluation found that the project’s creation of Community Dialogue Groups (CDG) and other community support structures as vehicles for families and communities to understand the complex issues surrounding child labor is an important foundation for sustainable change. Effective and transparent training for steering committees (formed at regional and woreda levels) and Child Protection Committees (CPC) at the kebele level built representative bodies which offer the potential for the gains of the project to be sustainable, and possibly replicated.

Recommendations

At midterm, E4Y is an effective and relevant project that is performing optimally. Areas where the project could improve or modify are listed here as recommendations. Some recommendations can be implemented within the context of the normal project activities. Others should be considered and discussed by project management before making changes.⁶

Education

1. Encourage teachers to utilize all of the various methods that they learned in the functional and learner-centered teacher methodology training that they received through E4Y.
2. Continue working with government officials to address the legal issues that create barriers for young entrepreneurs. This should be a priority for E4Y, and the project should document the process to achieve regulations designed for youth running their own business.
3. Consider offering English language training to students in hospitality and computer and information technology vocational education courses.
4. Continue support to the micro-franchise participants, and explore opportunities for innovation.

⁶ These recommendations are found in the body of the report under Section VI. (Recommendations) except for number 11, which is found under Section IV Potential for Sustainability.

5. Closely monitor the E4Y households and youth who have launched new businesses and are saving in Village Savings Association for Youth (VSAY) and Village Savings and Loan Associations (VSLA) for the remaining two years of E4Y. The newly acquired skills in business, livelihood, education, trades, and attitudes are still fragile. The project should continue to celebrate, acknowledge and reward volunteers, exemplary youth leaders and stakeholders.

Youth Leadership

6. Explore how the summer camps can be institutionalized and held nationally.
7. Create opportunities for club members to meet nationally and produce more modules for their Boys and Girls Club toolkits with E4Y guidance. Social Protection
8. Convene a consultative meeting or conference with government, institutions and relevant organizations to help roll out new youth employment programs. This may be considered a modification from the planned capacity building policy-connected indicators, but it would benefit the government at an opportune time.

Project Design and Management

9. Consider placing Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) Officers in regions in future similar projects. It would lighten the workload of E4Y sector specialists. Since the budget is probably allocated, it may not be possible to place anyone in this position at this time. However, it is worth considering this for future programming.
10. In project design, target vulnerable youth, but do not apply target numbers to disabled or marginalized young people without a comprehensive and deep study in advance. E4Y project staff members suggest that it may be better to identify the broader target (14-17 year old vulnerable youth), and then seek ways to make the programs inclusive.⁷
11. Exit strategy planning meetings with stakeholders should be held in advance of the project’s termination date.⁸ The project should continue to concentrate on building sustainability and autonomy for E4Y groups and participants. Exit strategy planning meetings with stakeholders should be held in advance of the project’s termination date, December 2018.

Best Practices

The E4Y project specialists set a good example with their commitment, accessibility and professionalism. Other good practices implemented in the context of E4Y include:

1. Graduate students from UoG Psychology Department volunteer to counsel E4Y beneficiaries in Gondar town.
2. The marketing assessment studies conducted at the outset helped place children in vocational skills training that were appropriate for urban or rural settings.

⁷ For more on disabled and marginalized youth, see Lessons Learned in the body of this report.

⁸ This recommendation is found under Section IV. Potential for Sustainability and, as such, is a strong suggestion.

3. The special Certificate of Competency (CoC) designed for the Short Term Marketing Program (STMP) gives credibility to the newly skilled youth, easing their search for jobs.
4. School directors and teachers using innovative methodology and classroom management techniques report improved attendance retention and the academic performance.

Conclusion

As the project enters into the second half, it is well situated. All of its youth beneficiaries are involved in project activities. Some youth have completed the E4Y activity that was deemed most appropriate for him or her. Others are still in school, vocational training, or apprenticeships, with good prospects for employment. According to an expert in labor and occupational safety and health (OSH) at the University of Gondar, the E4Y beneficiaries are 6 times more likely to land decent employment. He made two important points: (1) the employment or business training that the E4Y beneficiaries receive is appropriate, high quality (for the short period of time), and market-driven; and (2) the project -- through its stakeholders, including E4Y staff members, kebele officials, Project Steering Committee (PSC) or CPC members -- stands behind each beneficiary (youth and households), ready to help out.

The project starts the next two years in the position to provide follow-up with the aim to ensure continuity. The demands on E4Y staff members that will most likely be present in the last two years of the project are:

- youth in the process of receiving suitable training;
- retaining and guaranteeing completion of students in high quality formal education;
- trained youth seeking employment;
- newly empowered trained, disabled young people;
- teachers and educators persisting in using new techniques; and
- households and youth navigating through new income generating activities, savings and loans, and behavior change regarding exploitative child labor.

There is high incidence of exploitative employment, migration and trafficking among the 14 -17 year old youth in the E4Y geographical areas of operation. There is also a lot of anecdotal information spread across the E4Y target areas (and stories published in the international press), which relates to youth migration and illegal trafficking of Ethiopian boys and girls to other countries. Young men who have returned from harrowing experiences, and the survivors of those who did not, live in the two regions and actively participate in E4Y project activities. Most people who have been affected by the project’s awareness raising efforts understand that migration in search of work is not a practical antidote to poverty. The project brought these needy families into proximity of services, and sensitized and trained government officials who, when interviewed, committed to giving on-going encouragement and assistance. The E4Y households and their neighbors are less likely to turn to child labor as a livelihood strategy even if they fall on hard times.

In summary, E4Y is building a foundation for transparent, intelligent, collaborative, results-producing development in vulnerable communities.

I. CONTEXT AND PROJECT DESCRIPTION

In international law, the terms **youth** and **child** are used interchangeably to designate people under the age of 18. This conforms with definitions from the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child, (CRC) and the African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child that a **child** is “every human being below the age of eighteen years.”⁹ However, as noted by the United Nations (UN) Secretary General in 1981, the meaning of the term **youth** varies in different societies around the world.¹⁰ Since 1985, the UN system has used the age cohort 15-24 to collect statistical data on youth, without prejudice to other definitions by member states. Ethiopian law’s National Youth Policy of 2004 defines youth as those “who are between 15 and 29 years.”¹¹

E4Y project documents use the terms youth, young worker, young person, and child interchangeably to describe those for whom project activities are intended to benefit.¹² To avoid confusion and conform to the project name, the term **youth** is given preference when describing E4Y beneficiaries in this report, except where informants, documents, organization names, or other references specifically used another term. The term **child** may be used in the case of persons aged 14 years and below, particularly E4Y beneficiaries in primary school, and in accordance with relevant Ethiopian laws and policies, and some USDOL terms, e.g., child labor.

1.1. Country Context

A country with a rich history and culture, Ethiopia is located in the Horn of Africa.¹³ Ethiopia’s estimated population of 99.4 million is the second highest in Africa, and the average annual growth rate is calculated at 2.5%.¹⁴ It has a burgeoning young adult population; children under 15 years of age have accounted for more than a third of the total population for more than a decade.¹⁵ One of the poorest countries in the world, Ethiopia ranks 174 out of 187 on the 2016 United Nations Development Program’s Human Development Index, which measures, among other things, life expectancy, education, and per capita income indicators.¹⁶ According to UNICEF, more than a quarter of all children between the ages of five and 14 are in the labor

⁹ UN General Assembly, Convention on the Rights of the Child, 20 November 1989, article 1; Organization of African Unity, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child, 11 July 1990, article 2.

¹⁰ Report by UN Secretary General to UN General Assembly (A/36/215, A/40/256).

¹¹ National Youth Policy (2004). p. 4.

¹² E4Y Project Performance Monitoring Plan (Annex 5) states, “The term youth is used interchangeably with children. Therefore, beneficiary children/youth are those children who are only 14 to 17 years old and who are engaged or at high risk of entering into child labor that are eligible to receive services from the project.”

¹³ World Bank, worldbank.org, country report on Ethiopia. The following other sources of information were used to compile this section (Project Context): World Bank 2016 at data.worldbank.org/country/Ethiopia, African Economic Outlook 2016, BBC Country Profiles (www.bbc.com), CIA World Factbook on Ethiopia, Deloitte Ethiopia Economic Outlook 2016: The Story Behind the Numbers, and UNICEF/UNDP country information.

¹⁴ Ibid. World Bank.

¹⁵ The Ethiopia Demographic and Health Survey (EDHS) reported more than half were under 15 in 2005; in 2011 that figure was one-third. Central Statistical Agency (CSA) [Ethiopia] and ICF. 2005, 2011.

¹⁶ The 2016 UNDP Human Development Report, Human Development Index, (HDI).

force.¹⁷ The Ethiopia Demographic and Health Survey (EDHS) of 2011 concludes that most youth work for a family business. Agriculture is the foundation of the economy, employing 80% of the population, and accounting for approximately all but ten per cent of the country’s exports.¹⁸

Approximately 80% of Ethiopian youth are out of school and in the job market by age 15.¹⁹ Children of all ages often become engaged in some aspect of farming and floriculture.²⁰ Other areas of labor in which youth become involved throughout the country include fishing, domestic service, traditional weaving, portage, construction, small-scale manufacturing, domestic work and some prostitution. Growing, harvesting, and selling the stimulant, khat (pronounced chat) has expanded dramatically in Ethiopia over recent years and its cultivation is becoming a major area of exploitative child labor because it relies on the agile picking ability of small hands or the strength of older youth to carry the harvested plants. Even primary school pupils are reportedly dropping out of school to work in khat fields.²¹ Some informants report on farmers changing from coffee cultivation, a major cash crop, to khat-growing as it has become more lucrative.²²

Lack of employment among youth is a major problem not only for the youth. Family members and local government officials report that adolescents (15-17 years) unable to continue in school or engage in steady employment raise the specter of petty crime, terrorism, and mischievous idleness.²³ The allure of finding work away from home has resulted in many vulnerable youth being trafficked internally and to countries such as South Africa and Saudi Arabia, sometimes in collusion with families.²⁴

Ethiopia has a federal parliamentary system of government consisting of nine regional states and two city administrations. The regional states have considerable authority and responsibility, which they exercise through councils at regional, zonal (in some cases), woreda and kebele

¹⁷ UNICEF, from the Ethiopia Demographic and Health Survey (EDHS) 2011.

¹⁸ Ibid. World Bank.

¹⁹ E4Y Project Document Revised 16 February 2017, p. 1 (quote from Background and Problem Statement). See also, OECD Report, Key Issues affecting Youth in Ethiopia, stating, “Ethiopia has the world’s third-largest out-of-school population.”

²⁰ Ibid. World Bank.

²¹ Several E4Y beneficiaries interviewed during the midterm evaluation had worked in khat fields as primary school students and had friends still engaged in the work. The widespread use of child labor on khat plantations is visible on the road between Bahir Dar and Gondar and throughout the SNNPR.

²² See, “Resolving the Khat Conundrum: When a Profitable Crop has Downsides,” by Cathy Watson and Danyell Odhiambo, published in *Agroforestry World*, August 5, 2016; “Khat and livelihood dynamics in the Harar highlands of Ethiopia: Significance and challenges,” pp. 153-170 by Kassa, H. included in *Khat in Ethiopia: Taking the place of food*. Gebissa, E. (ed), Red Sea Press, 2011; [Ethiopian farmers swap coffee for khat - BBC News - BBC.com](#), July 21, 2011. Aljazeera television broadcast “Khat tops coffee for Ethiopia farmers,” on its Business & Economy program on January 30, 2014.

²³ From interviews with those stakeholders during the MTE

²⁴ See, E4Y Project Document Revised 16 February 2017, and 2015 Findings on the Worst Forms of Child Labor (USDOL), <https://www.dol.gov/sites/default/files/documents/ilab/reports/child-labor/findings/2015TDA.pdf>. Also, the draft E4Y.

levels.²⁵ Government of Ethiopia (GoE) programs have resulted in increased primary school attendance nationwide, but obstacles related to accessing education, both primary and secondary, persist. Harassment of girls, incidences of sexual abuse, traditional attitudes regarding early marriages and the value of girls learning are barriers to girls’ continued education.²⁶ Disabled youth are often eclipsed from the schools, sometimes by family choice, or because the facilities make access impossible. In rural areas, harmful traditional practices persevere, including segregating certain ethnic groups into social sub-strata, like castes. Also called marginalized peoples, adults from these sub-strata are reportedly discriminated against in work places and children are bullied or ignored by teachers so that they do not attend school.²⁷

1.2. Legal Framework

Young Ethiopians are permitted to work at age 14, but the minimum age for *hazardous work* is set at 18 years.²⁸ The GoE, working with United States Department of Labor (USDOL), UN agencies, and non-governmental organizations (NGOs) has addressed child labor issues for many years. There has been significant policy development and national awareness concerning both child labor and trafficking in the country. The National Action Plan to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labor and the Young Worker’s Directive are among the legal instruments adopted since 2012. In 2015, a comprehensive anti-trafficking law was passed to tighten existing anti-trafficking legislation, punish trafficking offenses, and provide support to victims of trafficking. An Overseas Employment Proclamation calls for penalties for illegal recruitment, increases oversight of overseas recruitment agencies, and extends more protection to potential victims.²⁹ At the beginning of 2017, Ethiopia’s Parliament approved a 10 billion Birr (around \$435 million United States Dollars) Youth Entrepreneurship Initiative, also called the Youth Fund. The fund aims to maximize the engagement of young people in the economy through training, finance support, work areas, and other, as yet unspecified, activities. More than 2.9 million unemployed youth in urban and rural areas have been identified as potential recipients of support.³⁰ Table 2 below identifies some of the key legal instruments that guide Ethiopia’s policies regarding child trafficking and youth employment, but the list is not exhaustive.

²⁵ After the nine regions, the administrative levels are: (1) *Zone* - a sub-unit of a regional state; (2) *Woreda* (districts) - administrative sub-unit of a zone; and (3) *Kebele* - local administrative unit (a sub-unit of a woreda, also considered a neighborhood, in every town with a population of 2,000 or more.). There are 68 zones. The 2 administrative states are Addis Ababa and Dire Dawa.

²⁶ USDOL ILAB Fact sheet of Ethiopia, at www.dol.gov/ilab/reports/child-labor/findings/2012TDA/ethiopia.pdf

²⁷ See, [School violence and Bullying Global Status Report, UNESCO](#) (2016), and *Hidden in Plain Sight: A Statistical Analysis of Violence Against Children*, UNICEF (2014).

²⁸ Articles 89, (4), 90, and 91 of the Labour Proclamation 377/2003, Working Conditions for Young Workers, provide protective measures.

²⁹ Called the Overseas Employment Proclamation, No. 923/2016. Feb 19, 2016. See also, US State Department 2016 Trafficking in Persons Report, <https://www.state.gov/j/tip/rls/tiprpt/countries/2016/258765.htm>

³⁰ The Minister of Youth and Sports, Ristu Yirdaw, is quoted in “Joint Efforts Needed for Proper Utilization of Youth Fund,” an article published by the government-run Ethiopian News Agency (ENA), February 18, 2017.

Table 2; Overview of Child Protection/Child Labor Legal Framework in Ethiopia

Policy Instrument	Status
Ethiopian Constitution, Article 36 – Rights of Children; Article 90	1995. Gives children general protection from exploitative labor practices, access to education
GoE: Protocols/Guidelines for Identification, Withdrawal, Rehabilitation, Integration of Victims of the Worst Forms of Child Labor in Solid Waste Management and the Traditional Weaving Sector (2010)	Protection for children engaged in garbage scavenging and in the traditional weaving sector
GoE: National Action Plan to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labor	2016-2020. Second phase NAP is currently approved by the council of state minister
GoE: Labour Proclamation #377/2003, Part Six, Working Condition of Women and Young Workers, Chapter Two, Working Conditions of Young Workers, Article 89.	Also called Young Worker’s Directive
GoE: National Youth Policy of Ethiopia	2004. The policy aims ensure the active participation of youth in the “country’s development [...] building of a democratic system and good governance [...] and to enable them to fairly benefit from the results.” A wide range of priority actions is identified, including democracy and good governance, health, education, culture, sport and entertainment. ³¹
GoE: National Social Protection Policy of Ethiopia	2014. Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs (MoLSA) is responsible for policy implementation and the National Social Protection Committee
GoE: Universal Free Education	Free, compulsory primary school enrollment for 7 year old children; exams at grades 8, 10, and 12 ³²
Local Government administrations	By-laws, ordinances, which protect youth, exist in E4Y target areas, with enforcement protocols
UN Treaties: CRC Optional Protocols [Armed Conflict; Sale of Children, Child Prostitution and Child Pornography]	Ratified 2014
UN Treaties: Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children	Under review, Not signed
UN Treaties: Protocol Against the Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Sea and Air	Accession 2012
African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child	Ratified 1998/ Proclamation 283/2002

³¹ National Youth Policy, http://www.youthpolicy.org/national/Ethiopia_2004_National_Youth_Policy.pdf , p .4
See, <http://www.oecd.org/dev/inclusivesocietiesanddevelopment/youth-issues-in-ethiopia.htm>

³² FHI 360, Education Policy and Data Center.

1.3. Project Description

In December 2014, World Vision was awarded a cooperative agreement grant from the USDOL’s Office of Child Labor, Forced Labor, and Human Trafficking (OCFT) to implement the Engaged, Educated, Empowered, Ethiopian Youth (E4Y) project. The four-year Cooperative Agreement for \$10,000.000 USD began December 15, 2014 and will end December 14, 2018. Working in two regions, Amhara and the Southern Nations, Nationalities, and Peoples’ Region (SNNPR), E4Y aims to address exploitative child labor in Ethiopia by promoting education and vocational training opportunities, enhancing livelihood opportunities, and strengthening access to social protection programs for youth and their households.

World Vision and its partners implement the E4Y project. The partners include (a) sub-grantee International Rescue Committee (IRC), contractor the Center for Creative Leadership (CCL); and (b) a research partner, the University of Gondar (UoG). The project works closely with pertinent government ministries, especially the Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs (MoLSA), and services at all administrative levels. Non-governmental stakeholders include employers, businesses, local and international organizations, and local youth organizations.

To address the factors that cause youth to become engaged in exploitative labor, E4Y project activities provide youth aged 14-17 with formal education or training in marketable skills to secure decent work, and build leadership capabilities with the aim that they will help their communities; raise awareness and understanding about child labor and decent work; create economically strong families; strengthen social protection; support formal and vocational education; and train youth and adults in business start-up and entrepreneurship. The social protection component involves strategies such as establishing and organizing child protection support committees, community dialogues and volunteer networks.

Since it was launched, the project targeted 12,000 Ethiopian male and female youth, both in school and out of school, between the ages of 14 and 17 in the two target regions. Particular targets specified in the original project document were that more than half of the beneficiaries (54%) should be girls, and at least 400 (3.3%) of the targeted beneficiaries would have disabilities.³³ The project planners calculated that an additional 10,000 youth would receive indirect support through activities such as summer camps, school clubs and youth groups.

The project has also targeted 7,500 households (primarily families representing youth beneficiaries) to receive assistance in economic strengthening activities since it began. Household beneficiaries will also receive enrollment in local savings and loan groups, financial literacy training, and training and inputs to improve agricultural methods.

³³ According to the E4Y Project Document Revised 16 February 2017 compiled by World Vision, nearly all children with disabilities, regardless of the potential impact on their education, are out of school by the age of 14.

1.4. Project Objectives

With an overall goal to reduce child labor among youth aged 14-17, especially among adolescent girls in target regions of Ethiopia, the E4Y project has the following Immediate Objectives (IO):

1. Increased retention and completion of formal school by youth, especially females ages 14-17.
2. Youth secure decent work.
3. Improved livelihoods for target households.
4. Increased youth engagement and leadership on issues affecting their communities and their future.
5. Social protection systems with improved capacity to address child labor.

1.5. Geographic Coverage

As noted, the project works in two of Ethiopia’s nine regional states, **Amhara** and the **Southern Nations, Nationalities, and Peoples’ Region** (SNNPR). Within Amhara Region, the project works in 3 zones (in 5 woredas: Chilga, Gondar Zuria, Libo Kemkem, Dera, Yelmana Densa) and 2 towns, Gondar and Bahir Dar. In the SNNPR, the project works in 2 zones, encompassing 6 woredas: Kedida Gamela, Quacha Bira, Damboya, Lemo, Gombora, Shashego) and the town of Hossana.³⁴

Figure 1: Regional Map of Ethiopia



³⁴ Map of Ethiopia from Wikipedia

II. EVALUATION PURPOSE AND METHODOLOGY

2.1. Purpose of the Interim Evaluation

The project Performance Monitoring Plan (PMP) and the Comprehensive Monitoring and Evaluation Plan (CMEP) call for external implementation evaluations, at mid-point and at the project end.³⁵ Among other things, the midterm evaluation (MTE) assesses and analyzes the progress against objectives, and identifies which interventions appear to be promising in improving the living conditions of households while reducing child labor. This midterm evaluation makes recommendations, especially regarding the sustainability of E4Y activities for USDOL and the project.

2.2. Methodology

An independent evaluator carried out the evaluation. The field site visit was conducted from March 4 - March 21, 2017. In the field, project staff members were present only to provide introductions to key stakeholders and beneficiaries.³⁶ One translator assisted in each region, where interviews with beneficiaries, as well as government representatives and other stakeholders frequently required Amhara, Hadiya, or Kambata translation to ensure effective dialogue and understanding. The methodology used was both qualitative and quantitative. Through visits to the project sites, involving interviews and focus group discussions (FGD) with beneficiaries (parents, youth, teachers, among others), all partners, and stakeholders, substantive qualitative information was collected, while tangible deliverables were also visibly verified. Quantitative data was obtained from the project’s Technical Progress Reports (TPRs), status reports, as well as contextual research and publications. Data collection methods included:

- Review project documents and reports; review files in offices.
- Visit and observe a feasible sample of benefitting individuals and participating communities, various levels of government stakeholders, benefitting educational institutions.
- Site visits to both regions where the project operates (Amhara and SNNPR), and Addis Ababa.
- Interviews with USDOL, E4Y project staff, partners, as many stakeholders as possible.
- Examination of the Monitoring and Evaluation systems set up to calculate the impact of helping individual beneficiaries.

³⁵ See, E4Y Comprehensive Monitoring and Evaluation Plan (CMEP), p. 36

³⁶ Key stakeholders include E4Y project implementation staff, relevant government line ministry officials at all levels (including local government), educators, employers, volunteers, US Embassy representative, USDOL DC-based staff, and other contextual informants; and project beneficiaries, including youth, members of income generating, micro-franchise and Village Savings and Loan (VSLA) groups. See Annex C for People interviewed and contacted during the MTE.

Specific evaluation questions were posed by the OFCT, which were reviewed by the evaluator and the E4Y project implementers at World Vision, who also approved the methodology. See the attached data matrix in Annex E for the evaluation questions and where the answers may be found in this report.

Sampling Methodology. The evaluator used a purposeful, non-random sampling methodology to select the interviewees. Below, Table 3 summarizes the populations interviewed, the interviewing methodology, the sample size, and characteristics of the sample.

Table 3: Population, Methodology, Sample Size, and Sample Characteristics

Population	Method	Sample Size	Sample Characteristics
USDOL	Group interview	3	Project managers and evaluation officer
E4Y project staff	Group, dyads, triad, and individual interviews	44	Project management and technical teams, including partner IRC BETA specialists; 2 E4Y presentations were made to the evaluator by regional directors, and 1 group presentation
Partners	Interviews	1	University of Gondar; also benefited from meeting with IRC Children and Youth Protection Coordinator at briefing meeting but not an interview
Federal Government MoLSA	Interview	2, 1	Paired interview with Head, Harmonious Industrial Relations Directorate and Child Labor Prevention Desk Co-Coordinator; also benefited from substantive opinions put forth during briefing meeting by the Labor Inspector Team Leader, MoLSA
Project Steering Committees (PSC) [Local governments]	Focus group discussions (FGD)	40	Regional, woreda and kebele levels. Most, but not all, members of the PSCs are government officials.
Educators	FGD	46	School directors and teachers representing 7 schools in 3 FGD; Deans, Vice-deans and instructors from 3 Polytechnic Colleges and Technical and Vocational Education (TVET) Centers
Educators	Interviews	12	Teachers using LCM, Master Mentors, Tutors, TVET instructors
Teachers using new methodology	Classroom Observation	4	Observation comprised one teacher per school using the methodology in a class of 35-60 pupils; 2 English, 2 Science
Formal school student beneficiaries	Interviews	72	Meeting in small groups of no more than 9 students, where each child was given the opportunity to answer questions
Formal school student beneficiaries with disabilities	Interviews	16	Recipients of assistive devices, special help
Clubs	FGD with	88	Observed 3 Clubs, 1 debate; 1 FGD with Girls Club

Population	Method	Sample Size	Sample Characteristics
	members, Observation		(17 participants); 1 Interview with Girls Club member
TVET students	FGD	106	74 girls, 1 girl with disability
E4Y youth employed, in business, TVET graduates	Interviews	17	2 girls, 1 boy with disability, all members of Village Savings Association for Youth (VSAY)
Micro-franchise participants	FGD, interviews	19	3 Micro-franchise groups
Child Protection Committees (CPC)	FGD	21	Leadership of 3 Child Protection Committees
Community Dialogue Groups (CDG)	FGD	50	5 Community Dialogue Groups
Employers/potential employers	Individual interviews	9	Hotel Manager Manager, East African Tiger Brands Sales Manager, Organic milk processing 2 Building Contractor Azikon Construction, Hossana Cashier/Store Manager, Business Berchaco Ethiopia, PLC, Owner, Bakery Wood and Metal Employer Furniture Maker
Village Savings and Loans Associations (VSLA)	FGD	104	VSLA officers (president or chair, secretary, box keeper, 3 key holders) and members
Household producers	Interviews and visits to businesses	19	10 women, 9 men. All of the VSLA members were also E4Y household producer beneficiaries.
TOTAL		623	

The evaluator interviewed 170 individuals. The majority of the individual interviews were conducted with E4Y beneficiaries in formal school, vocational education, or youth employment programs. In addition, focus group discussions were conducted among (a) students in formal education who had received school materials, tutoring, or other types of E4Y scholastic support; (b) students in vocational training; (c) micro-franchise participants; and (d) youth who had completed training and were engaged in, or seeking, employment. The evaluator also interviewed 71 representatives from community-based Child Protection Committees (CPC) and Community Dialogue Groups (CDG). Some members of CDGs and CPCs are also beneficiaries of E4Y household support and are members of Village Savings and Loan Associations (VSLA). They are differentiated in these calculations so there is no duplication. Several E4Y staff members were also interviewed multiple times in dyads, triads, and individually.

Limitations and Opportunities of Methodology

Despite postponement of the evaluation by a week due to visa procedures, the fieldwork encountered no problems. Transportation to and from a broad sample of evaluation venues was safe and efficient. Meetings were held on time and in locations where discussions were held in an atmosphere of transparency, confidence and trust. The field visit portion of the evaluation extended beyond the original date to accommodate meetings with a representative of E4Y’s research partner, University of Gondar, and the US Embassy representative. The evaluator used supplemental time in Addis Ababa to prepare for the briefing, and interview contextual informants.

The midterm evaluation is limited in scope in that it is not a formal impact assessment and the findings are based on the information gathered through the described methodology. The E4Y staff members understood the purpose and utility of the midterm evaluation results, which contributed to the credibility and confidentiality that was established in the exercise.

Evaluation Scope

The evaluation reviewed all of the activities that occurred during the first two years of project implementation through document review and the field site visits. The field site visit was conducted over 16 days.³⁷ In the course of the field visit, the evaluator met with a wide range of stakeholders in both regions, four towns (including Addis Ababa), and seven of the eleven project site woredas. Interviews were conducted in government offices at kebele, woreda, regional and national levels; educational facilities, particularly primary schools, vocational colleges and TVET facilities; and workplace and agricultural venues.

³⁷ See Annex B for itinerary details.

III. FINDINGS

3.1. Project Design and Relevance

The E4Y project has a number of characteristics, which contribute to its successful achievements. Firstly, it targets a narrow segment of highly vulnerable youth between the ages of 14 and 17. This age group is especially important in Ethiopia, where an individual fourteen years of age and older is employable in non-hazardous work. At age 18, he or she can enter the workforce along with adults. Thus, the intermediary age grouping is largely unregulated in the workplace and represents adolescence, a period of immature judgment, risk-taking, and high-susceptibility to exploitation.³⁸ With a single focus on that segment of working youth as its target beneficiaries, the project can concentrate on providing a scope of appropriate benefits, especially as pertains to vocational and formal education.

Secondly, the project introduced programs to create self-awareness and encourage activism on a personal level for both youth and families through summer camps and community dialogues. Further, the project provided effective and transparent training for steering committees (formed at regional and woreda levels) and Child Protection Committees at the kebele level. These representative bodies have the potential to sustain, and possibly replicate, project outcomes.

The E4Y project design consists of tangible, pragmatic inputs that promote the creation of income generating and savings activities for individuals and families and build academic and entrepreneurial capabilities among youth. An abundance of high-quality training for various constituencies has resulted in institutional development and support at the regional, woreda and local community levels.

3.1.1. Baseline Data – Child Labor Prevalence Study

The project had a comprehensive baseline data study (BLD) done to clarify the incidence of child labor in the target areas and help identify potential beneficiaries.³⁹ Referred to as the Child Labor Prevalence Survey, the BLD found pervasive and exploitative child labor among youth aged 14 -17 in the two project operational areas. The BLD report cited “almost no difference in engagement in hazardous work by gender.”⁴⁰ The results revealed that, among the surveyed children in the E4Y operational areas, slightly more than two-thirds of the children (70.1 percent)

³⁸ The writer is not a child development expert, but consulted with child psychologists with sub-Saharan Africa experience who support this defining characterization. There are many texts on the subject. Brain research done at McLean Hospital in Belmont, MA states, “The brain undergoes major remodeling during adolescence, including alterations in cerebral structure and function that lead to improved cognitive control and decision-making, as well as reduced impulsivity and risk taking. These behavioral components are mediated in part by the frontal lobe, which is the last brain region to mature in humans.

³⁹ Baseline Survey on Engaged, Educated and Empowered Ethiopian Youth (E4Y) Project, Final Version, Submitted by Abamela Business PLC, Development Research and Training Center, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia, December 2016. Hereafter called BLD.

⁴⁰ Ibid. p. 75

in Amhara and a little more than one-third of the children (34.4 percent) in the SNNPR were engaged in hazardous work.

In Chapter Three of the BLD, Socio-Demographic Characteristics of the Study Population, the migration of children in the target age group in the two regions is segmented according to reasons, ranging from seeking education, adoption, trafficking, to family dysfunction (such as divorce). Nearly one-fifth of the children migrated after “being given up for adoption.” These adoptions, typically done outside of any legal structure, more realistically mean handing a child over to become a domestic servant. Abuse is not uncommon.

The search of job opportunities was reported as the major cause of child migration (38 percent in Amhara and 48 percent in SNNPR). According to the study and substantiated in the course of the midterm evaluation, international migration of children in the SNNPR is very high. Most young people are determined to migrate to South Africa and desperate parents aspire to send their children in hopes of receiving needed remittances for survival.⁴¹ What is termed migration should be considered trafficking in many cases because the movement of adolescents, particularly across borders to destinations such as South Africa and Saudi Arabia, is often arranged through agents who have little regard for the safety of their clients. Money is exchanged to facilitate the travel, and the journeys are dangerous. Community members, parents, and former trafficked young adults who were interviewed in the course of the midterm evaluation were emphatic on this point: “We are nothing but commodities,” said one interviewee during the MTE. The BLD study quotes one official in Hosanna: “Every week we receive at least one body from South Africa, sometimes it reaches up to three. . . . Our children are not dying from natural causes at this scale.”⁴²

More than two-thirds of adult informants interviewed in the context of the midterm evaluation reported that the country is in the throes of a national crisis attributed to the employment needs and vulnerabilities of its youth. Youth employment is publicly discussed as one of the highest policy priorities in the country. The source of violent unrest, especially as occurred in 2016, is explained as discontent by adolescents and young adults who lack employment and engagement in meaningful activities.⁴³ The government response, a “Revolving Youth Fund,” is still in the process of being defined. The Youth Fund program, promising to support youth in employment and entrepreneurship, is cited widely, especially at the federal level, as one of the major policy priorities for the country.

The E4Y project goals, therefore, are extremely relevant, as well as critical. There is solid documentation of extensive child labor and trafficking in target sites, especially among youth aged 14-17. Interviewed beneficiaries and stakeholders consistently acknowledged the factors that drive child labor and child trafficking, especially desperate poverty. Stakeholders at local and national levels specifically mentioned (a) the inability for young people to continue in school due to financial reasons, traditional attitudes, or low academic performance; (2) general hopelessness about the future, coupled with feeling a lack of control over life directions; (3)

⁴¹ Ibid. p. 37. Also confirmed in focus group discussions during the MTE.

⁴² Ibid.

⁴³ “Ridding Youth Entrepreneurship Initiative Of Backward Practices,” The Reporter, Ethiopia, Feb 25, 2017.

scarcity of resources and family income; (4) absence of employment opportunities for youth and adults; (5) unfamiliarity with existing social protection services, and (6) the need for policies and programs that address child labor issues as escalating and urgent reasons to serve the target group.

3.1.2. Theory of Change

The Comprehensive Monitoring and Evaluation Plan (CMEP) details a theory of change (ToC) that, by providing specific interventions and inputs to improve communities and household economies, child labor will be reduced.⁴⁴ The theory is supported by careful analysis of the factors which drive families and children to exploitative labor, including: poor school attendance and drop-out; lack of employment opportunities and decent work for youth; low household income; and weak distribution or extension of social protection services. Limited opportunities for young people (children, adolescents, youth), to experience leadership and life skills; and low awareness and limited opportunities among adults to discuss and understand critical issues, such as community engagement, legal and detrimental consequences of child labor and trafficking are two less tangible factors that are mentioned in the CMEP analysis.

The theory unambiguously posits that community dialogues and community support structures are vehicles for families and communities to understand the complex issues surrounding child labor; and that training for a wide range of stakeholders will lead to getting children into the education system or employed in decent work with a long term potential for sustainability. The underlying belief is that enlightened educators and a welcoming school environment, coupled with necessary supplies will keep children in school and out of child labor. Similarly, vocational skills institutions or other types of vocational training can help children not fully qualified for the normal programs gain useful income-earning skills. Within the rubric of educating the young people, leadership development is supposed to engage them to be involved in building durable communities and somehow positively affect their future. Household economies will improve and access to social protection increased through specific inputs, including income generating products and establishment of savings and loan mechanisms.

⁴⁴ CMEP, p. 14

The E4Y project ToC provides a roadmap to reaching the ultimate project objective of “reduced child labor among youth ages 14-17 in target areas of Ethiopia.”⁴⁵ The ToC is depicted in the following graphic by the project in the Comprehensive Monitoring and Evaluation Plan as follows:

Reduced CL among youth aged 14 to 17 = Increased retention and completion of formal school by youth, especially aged 14 - 17 + Enabling youth to secure decent work + Improving HHs livelihoods + Engaging youth in leadership, community issues & their future + improving social protection system to address CL

High dropout & low performance of children+ Low access to decent work + HH poverty + inadequate social protection system

At midterm, the project has remained true to the ToC, implementing key activities in a logical progression as identified in the CMEP. As described in this report, project components of education (formal and vocational), ensuring decent work for young people, and strengthening family economies complement one another. Activities were effectively designed to systematically and chronologically take place, building on one another. The activities are dependent on one another. Understated in the ToC is the hypothesis that is played out daily by the E4Y specialists: In order for the project to have a long-lasting effect, (1) vulnerable communities need to be involved, sensitized, trained and respected; and (2) target beneficiary youth (14-17 years) need intensive nurturing, one-on-one supervision, and support.

3.1.3. From Design to Results Framework

Given the ToC, the project addresses problems with practical and logical activities. The Results Framework is consolidated, and the number of indicators (41) seems reasonable. In realistic terms, the nature of the tasks is feasible and linked to the ToC.⁴⁶ The indicators, while ambitious, emerged in the participatory exercise by project staff members in developing the CMEP. E4Y staff confirm that they are motivated to address them, and at the project’s mid-point have a good chance of meeting them.

3.2. Project Management and Administration

Overall, the project management is coherent and well organized. The project is fully staffed, per the project document. There seems to be good communication across the two regions and a high degree of professionalism. Technical Progress Reports submitted to USDOL are punctual and contain clearly written details about the progress of activities. The project adheres to financial guidelines. Resources, such as vehicle use, time, equipment, and human resources, were observed to be used efficiently. The project offices in Addis Ababa are housed in the World Vision Ethiopia (WVE) complex. Staff members share one large working space that encourages sharing of information. There is a large meeting room available to the project, which contributes

⁴⁵ Ibid., p. 14

⁴⁶ See, CMEP, Annex 2 – Full Results Framework with Outputs included (or Outcome Tree with Outputs)

to the overall efficiency of the activities. When it is necessary to hold a meeting, the project is not distracted with having to spend time and money arranging for it.

In the regions, the project operates separate from nearby World Vision Area Development Programs (ADP/AP), but the presence of the parent organization is helpful. World Vision built some of the schools where E4Y works and transport needs are sometimes provided in the regions when needed. Although E4Y has an office in Bahir Dar, the WVE office was also used as a meeting place with vocational skills graduates and Micro-franchisees for the midterm evaluation. Some of the sponsoring businesses who employ project beneficiaries expressed confidence in the project because of their own past experiences with WV and the organization’s reputation for integrity.

According to the project implementers, the budget is adequate for the planned activities. Furthermore, the project leadership spends funds prudently and economically. There are several instances where money has been saved, or the budget modified, which has helped keep the project focused on its goal to reduce child labor. For example, care is taken to hold the many E4Y meetings and trainings purposefully, at opportune and reasonable times and locations, without paying unnecessary per diem to attendees.

3.2.1. Project Staffing

The staff comprises a Project Director based in Addis Ababa with a team of Sector Specialists, a Monitoring and Evaluation Manager (M&E), and administrative support staff, including a driver for one vehicle. The World Vision Ethiopia country office provides significant backstopping in, for example finance, human resources, communication, and transportation.⁴⁷ Regional Coordinators in each region supervise field level sector specialists: (a) Business, Entrepreneurship Technical Adviser (BETA), 2 in each region; (b) Education/Vocational Training Specialist (7 in each region); Livelihood Specialist (7 in each region); and a driver for the one vehicle per region. In each of the eleven woredas, E4Y project specialists share one motorcycle. The project has hired temporary workers to enter data information.

Based on interviews and observations during the field site visits, the midterm evaluation found that the E4Y staff members are highly effective. Nationally, the team is qualified and competent. The project director demonstrates a professional, uncomplicated managerial approach. Staff members respect and learn from him. The compassion needed for the nature of the work, coupled with a firm knowledge and understanding of the phenomena of child labor and trafficking in a poor nation, is evident as well.

E4Y partners International Rescue Committee (IRC), Center for Creative Leadership (CCL), and the University of Gondar brought specific expertise to the project, so that work could begin immediately. The IRC is responsible for the livelihood component of the project (household livelihood and youth employment); CCL implements the leadership component; and WVE is responsible for the overall project administration and implementation in the two regions, including the education, social protection and monitoring and evaluation sections. All staff

⁴⁷ E4Y is a recipient of a matching grant of \$1,108,635 USD from World Vision Ethiopia.

members have been through several rounds of training, so that there is consistency in message and implementation approaches. Regardless of their sponsoring organization, the WV, IRC and CCL staff work smoothly together, sharing office space, and tasks in the national office and in the regions. The country is large, but the project does not seem to suffer with two separate regions. The project headquarters is centrally located in Addis Ababa, and the two regions are within relatively easy traveling distance from the office, and even one another.

Field staff members sometimes face difficult challenges. They are on the road daily, visiting sites and beneficiaries, sometimes in isolated places. They deal with needy, exposed, impoverished clients, and often work on weekends. For example, the micro-franchise youth participants in Gondar meet with E4Y staff members every weekend to review marketing strategies and upgrade their knowledge about savings. The specialists’ knowledge of the individual beneficiaries and the minutiae of project components (education, livelihood, village savings and loans associations, for example) is impressive.

The M&E requirements seem onerous for the load of work that these specialists already carry. As noted, they are very connected to the beneficiaries, as well as to the volunteers who collect the data for the Direct Beneficiary Monitoring System (DBMS). They offer added scrutiny to the data collected, and the information collected helps them to do their own jobs well. However, information and communication technologies (ICT) in Ethiopia can be unreliable, which interferes with the collection and transmission of database information in the regions, and between the capital and the regions, thus interrupting the specialists’ ability to attend to their own areas of expertise. It would seem that if each region had a specialist for project M&E functions, it would alleviate the programmatic specialists’ tasks as well as those of the M&E Manager based in Addis Ababa.

3.2.2. Monitoring and Evaluation Function

The overall Monitoring and Evaluation of the project is supervised by the Project Director and implemented by the M&E Manager, who oversees all of the reporting and data collection. At the time of the midterm evaluation, the DBMS was running smoothly after several months of development and testing. The World Vision information technology (IT) department staff and E4Y technical staff at the head office in Addis Ababa received training on the use and management of the DBMS. It is an exceedingly user-friendly program. Data about beneficiaries – youth and households – were collected by E4Y staff members and project-trained volunteers on project-designed intake forms. The forms are easy to understand and are designed to be added to over the life of the project. The collected data is still in the process of being entered at midterm, although much has been inputted so that the M&E department is able to begin running analysis. Temporary data entry clerks were hired to input data, but stacks of files several feet high still await filing. While these temporary workers are very fast at entering data, a permanent staff member would ensure timely and consistent M&E recordkeeping. The project staff, particularly those in the field and the M&E Manager, are good at reviewing files and noting issues challenging accuracy. There is regular field supervision to ensure accuracy in monitoring and to provide needed back up to field staff members, who are otherwise involved in programmatic implementation.

The M&E Manager makes monitoring visits to field level staff members and keeps in contact with them to support their project implementation, but also to gather data. He has developed a number of forms that can be filled out by field staff members to facilitate data gathering and reporting. Regional Project Steering Committees and Child Protection Committees (CPC) members, E4Y technical staff, and implementing partners hold monthly meetings to review project progress and impacts and discuss needed adjustments.

3.3. Project Achievements and Results

The project begins the second half of its implementation on a carefully constructed and established foundation, so that from now on efforts can be exerted on ensuring quality of the benefits and project deliverables for the remainder of the project. At the time of the midterm evaluation, E4Y had met and exceeded its numerical targets in withdrawing or preventing children aged 14 through 17 from exploitative child labor. In the first year, 40% of the targeted number of youth received services. As the second year closed, all 100% of the target beneficiaries were identified and receiving some services, or were set to be launched in business or employment. According to data entered in the DBMS, most of the 12,445 target beneficiaries had been engaged in difficult and hazardous employment previous to being enrolled in E4Y.⁴⁸ More than half (52%) of those beneficiaries are girls, and 431 are children with disabilities. At the time of the mid-term evaluation, E4Y project leadership calculated that the project had served more than 20,000 children (12,445 direct beneficiaries plus another 8000 indirect beneficiaries) since project implementation began.⁴⁹

Table 4: Targeted Accomplishments of E4Y Project at Midterm

E4Y Beneficiaries	Target	Actual Girls	Actual Boys	Actual TOTAL	TOTAL
Youth in formal education (not disabled)	7,732	4,711	4,301	9,012	9,293
Youth with disabilities in formal education	268	154	127	281	
Youth in TVET (not disabled)	2,560	985	1,335	2,320	2,791
Youth with disabilities in	132	25	22	47	

⁴⁸ Source: Statistical information from the DBMS and for Table 4 was supplied by E4Y Monitoring and Evaluation Manager, April 10, 2017.

⁴⁹ Indirect Beneficiaries are individuals not officially enrolled in a project, but receive some tangible advantage by living within the zone of influence of the project. They may receive information and acquire knowledge through mass media or local presentations that are an impetus for them to change behavior or acquire some benefits from the project activities.

According to the E4Y Project Document Revised 16 February 2017, p. 16: “Indirectly benefiting from this project and through capacity development programs designed to assist MoLSA and the Ethiopia Ministry of Women’s, Children and Youth Affairs (MoWCYA) are the various GoE institutions and youth aged 14 – 17 beyond the geographic targets of Amhara and SNNPR through strengthened reporting, awareness and inspection around WFCL.” Other examples of indirect beneficiaries that the evaluator found included non-beneficiary children participating in school clubs and gardens associated with E4Y, and patrons in a café run by an E4Y beneficiary reporting awareness about child labor due to the project.

E4Y Beneficiaries	Target	Actual Girls	Actual Boys	Actual TOTAL	TOTAL
vocational education (TVET)					
Youth in line for TVET training ⁵⁰				424	
Youth in micro-franchise (not disabled)	100	37	59	96	96
Micro-franchise Youth with disabilities	0	0	0	0	
Youth engaged in Business Organizations (BO)				265	265
TOTAL E4Y Beneficiaries					12,445

3.3.1. Laying a Broad Foundation

The E4Y project took significant, strategic steps before launching its various component activities, which contributed to the continued success of the project. Substantive groundwork on raising awareness among key stakeholders, such as school directors, teachers, local leaders, and woreda officials, helped build widespread local investment in meeting project objectives. E4Y project leadership relied on woreda government officials to help identify the kebeles where the most needy and vulnerable children and their families lived. Through a community self-study exercise, stakeholders uncovered evidence of adolescents engaged in harsh, exploitative working conditions in their own locales. The project team offered comprehensive training workshops introducing technical concepts related to child labor, child trafficking, and the project’s theory of change to E4Y personnel and partners; government officials; community leaders; parents; and teachers. The collected baseline data brought potential beneficiaries to the surface, but also served to create a body of sensitized volunteers that will help sustain the efforts in the long run. Project Steering Committees (PSC) in the regions and woredas were formed and trained. CPCs were also formed and received similar fact-based and practical training. A network of volunteers for tasks ranging from child monitoring to leading summer camp programs were selected and trained.

Once the first group of youth was identified as potential beneficiaries, they attended five-day summer camps designed to prepare them for returning or re-enrolling in formal school. According to all youth interviewed during the evaluation, these camps were transformative for them. They felt better prepared to go to school, and the leadership and life skills that they learned gave them greater confidence. During focus group discussions and confidential interviews with the E4Y beneficiaries, it was evident that these participants were self-assured and newly empowered, qualities that they themselves credited to the summer camps and leadership training.

⁵⁰ No target/g/b figures were given for supplementary children receiving career orientation and entering TVET, or for children in business organizations.

The interviewed beneficiaries reported improved academic performance and a greater willingness and access to schools. In addition, target E4Y youth beneficiaries are in the forefront, leading clubs and classroom activities.

The E4Y staff, government and community stakeholders, and volunteers noted that the “door-to-door” approach, in which personal relationships were established between the project and the communities, was the key to making the project successful. Relationship-building cannot stand alone, and those initial efforts were backed up with training and inputs that were evidently of a durable quality. School materials, boys’ and girls’ club toolkits, agricultural and non-farm products, village savings and loan equipment, bicycles and brightly colored reflective vests for micro-franchisees, carpentry tools, and explanatory manuals, all accompanied by training in some form or another, were some of the important inputs.

3.3.2. Education

The education component helps E4Y beneficiaries to stay in and complete formal education through a variety of approaches, which make the schools a welcoming environment where they can learn without worrying about financial burdens. Interviewed target beneficiaries and their families reported that, because they could not afford to pay for educational related costs, especially uniforms and shoes, they were inclined to drop out or miss class. Most, though not all, youth begin to work at small income producing jobs, sometimes requiring them to physically move to other centers. Some described spending school breaks shining shoes in Addis Ababa or hauling heavy loads of rocks, wood, or commercial goods in nearby towns. Some did not return to school while others did. The youth considered it an unhappy, unhealthy experience, but necessary, as it resulted in an income sufficient to purchase pens and books for school. Others sit idle at home, or hang out with other truants. Even if they have not formally dropped out, their poor academic performance and attendance results in failure to pass to the next grades.

Findings

The midterm evaluation found that the implementation of the project’s key strategies had a significant impact on youth, schools, educators and communities. More than 9,000 students received project inputs such as schools supplies and tutoring. The strategies carried out were to:

- provide **school materials** and, if possible, relief from supplementary school fees, to youth engaged in or at-risk of various forms of child labor;
- train educators in **learner-centered methodologies** (LCM) that help improve academic performance;
- offer after-hours tutoring to struggling E4Y-supported pupils, after providing refresher training to participating teachers;
- increase access to education for **disabled youth** through appropriate supports, such as assistive devices and schools supplies, as well as raising awareness among teachers and pupils;
- extend **equipment and supplies** to schools with learning aids, books for school libraries;
- encourage **after school activities** including clubs, sports, and debates;

- enhance the experience for **girls** through provision of hygiene education, sanitary napkins, and rest rooms; and
- increase attention to the psychosocial needs of pupils.

Formal school progress

At the time of the midterm evaluation, there was documented increased retention and completion of formal school by E4Y youth, especially females. School directors enthusiastically reported improved academic performance among E4Y beneficiaries, often showing files that demonstrated dramatic reversals of previously problematic pupils, positively changed attendance records, or success for the whole grade in tests scores. In focus groups with the evaluator, children proudly showed their report cards and certificates demonstrating passing grades. In the Quacha Bira woreda primary schools (SNNPR), all target students successfully passed grade 8 national examinations. Masbira primary school in Lemo woreda, also in the SNNPR, received the regional award for having the highest high pass rate where 98% of its students passed. “We have obliterated truancy,” the school director said.

The evaluator visited four schools in the two regions, and met with nearly one hundred students, including beneficiaries from five other nearby E4Y project schools to participate in focus group discussions. The evaluator observed four classes in session and attended several youth club meetings. There was abundant evidence of project deliverables: school teaching supplies, reference materials, after-school recreation materials for schools, uniforms, shoes, pens, text books, exercise books, math tools, and good quality durable backpacks, pencils, pens, exercise books, school bags, school uniforms and mathematical instruments. During classroom observations, children were noticeably comfortable in working in small groups, with youthful leaders reporting back to the larger class.

With the project’s interventions, the schools established menstrual hygiene rooms for girls, created functioning boys’ and girls’ clubs, and furnished libraries with essential reference books. The special attention paid to create space for girls, coupled with heightened awareness about gender bias in the classroom (a subject of the teacher training) has paid off, as school directors report that girls are having remarkably better attendance. Girls interviewed in the context of this evaluation were unequivocal in their appreciation for the “rest rooms,” as well as having shoes and uniforms provided. Some girls mentioned that before the project, their parents were disinterested in supporting them to attend school. Now, they excel academically and receive recognition from teachers and school directors, and as a result, their parents are more encouraging. They also noted that their parents had received animals and agricultural products through the project and were members of Village Savings and Loans Associations (VSLAs), activities that added incentives to support their children’s education.

Teacher Training

The project trained more than 3,000 school directors, teachers, cluster education supervisors and other educators in new instructional methodologies (interactive child-centered pedagogy and inclusive education). The project used a Trainers of Trainers (ToT) approach, which they call “cascading” so that the trained instructors would fan out beyond the project beneficiaries to have an impact on all children. With the cascading, the project has reached more than 2,500 formal

education teachers. The project education specialists report that most of the project-trained teachers use some level of interactive child-centered instructional pedagogy. The methodology is used by teachers in all of the schools visited during the course of the midterm evaluation. Teachers who had received training were observed in classrooms and interviewed. They were found to use some techniques consistently, particularly small group collaborative learning, interactive lessons, use of visual aids, time management and lesson planning consistently. In Aykel, the science teacher noted that the training had helped her transform her classroom into an exhibition site decorated with children’s science projects and inspirational slogans.⁵¹

According to the project, Results Assessment Reports from target woredas state that most of their education offices and schools have adopted the child-centered instructional methodology as part of General Education Quality Improvement Program (GEQIP).⁵² As positive as the inputs are, all of the teachers and their directors wanted more training.

Tutoring

Recognizing that many of the beneficiaries were expected to perform poorly in school since they had either been frequently absent or dropped out, the project developed tutorial guidelines and oriented target school teachers in basic systematic tutoring. The training included student selection, setting benchmarks, running a tutorial session, and tracking results. The tutorials are part of the GoE educational program, but have been somewhat sporadic in application. The tutorial classes are held after school hours. Tutorial classes consist of between twenty and forty pupils who need extra help. They are often arranged in small learning groups of five. At 129 E4Y-supported schools, the project beneficiaries sit alongside non-beneficiaries in the tutorial classes. E4Y education specialists ensure the E4Y beneficiaries are enrolled in tutorial classes if necessary, and monitor their attendance. More than 19,000 target youth and non-target youth have received tutorial help from teachers who received E4Y tutorial training.

There are clear indications that the tutorials have contributed significantly to keeping E4Y beneficiaries in school and improved grades. Steering committee members and educators are enthusiastic about the program. One problem is that teachers have voiced an interest in receiving extra pay for their participation, although it is considered part of their regular duties. Woreda education officers reported that, while the teachers’ economic situations should be considered, the training and tutorial guidelines increased the value and capacity of the whole school and that extra pay was not warranted.

Assistance to Youth with Disabilities

School directors, teachers, and parents also noted that E4Y schools offer a more welcoming environment for youth with disabilities, promoting tolerance by abled classmates, and ensuring their comfort so that they will be able to continue attending school and do well. The project

⁵¹ Aykel is the administrative center of Chilga woreda, Amhara Region

⁵² The General Education Quality Improvement Program Project (GEQIP) is a World Bank-funded program for Ethiopia to shape quality education. Among its interventions is helping in school improvement planning and aligning key performance indicators, such as increased learning outcomes and completion rates.

aimed to include 400 youth with disabilities as benefit recipients. Most, but not all, of these children have been in formal education at some point. Like children without disabilities, the pupils received backpacks and other scholastic materials. If determined necessary, children received assistive devices such as hearing aids, Braille devices, wheelchairs, crutches and eyeglasses. In SNNPR, three girls who received crutches reported how they now attend school regularly, and reach school on time. However, two children complained of ill-fitting crutches and continued to carry their walking sticks. Wheel chairs also present a problem, as schoolyards are rocky and the ground is uneven.

The evaluator traveled the route from home to school for some students, noting that it is perilous even for youth without walking disabilities. However, rather than give up, there has been an effort among teachers and students to help bring those children to school even if it means someone carries the disabled child and someone else carries the wheel chair. Cheshire Services Ethiopia is the project’s main resource on measuring or fitting beneficiaries for specific assistive devices, training them to use them, and providing follow-up.⁵³ At the evaluation briefing meeting, the WVE Integrated Programmes Director shared that WVI had Guidelines on the Inclusion of Persons with Disabilities, with reference to special circumstances such as disabled children’s needs in rural areas. The project was unaware of the in-house World Vision materials, but expects to use it as E4Y personnel try to resolve some of the problems associated with meeting the target for involving youth with disabilities.⁵⁴

Equally important to serving disabled youth are the training workshops that the project held for school principals, some instructors, and members of Parent Teacher Student Associations (PTSA) focusing on inclusive education and changing attitudes towards the value of girls’ education and youth with disability. The awareness raising training also encompassed topics of harmful traditional practices such as early marriage; worst forms of child labor (WFCL); and child trafficking. Participants who were interviewed during this evaluation actively commended the project for the training and for introducing these issues to the community. Teachers and youth confirmed that there were visible changes in the way in which youth with disabilities and girls were perceived at schools. Tolerance and new ways of understanding youth’s particular disabilities are discussed in class and clubs, disabled youth are encouraged to participate as much as possible in sports and games, and the schools have new facilities for girls.

⁵³ Cheshire Foundation Ethiopia is an independently managed disability organization that works for the betterment of persons with disabilities, across all regional states of Ethiopia.

⁵⁴ The WV website (www.wvi.org) posts a preliminary description of the materials on line and they appear to be practical guidelines, which is consistent with what the WVE, Integrated Programmes Director suggested. Topics covered in the WV materials include: WVI Guidelines on Inclusion of Persons with Disabilities; Four Key Disability Questions for WV Programmes; DADD (Do/Assure/Don’t Do) for Disability Inclusion; and Travelling together: How to include disabled children on the main road of development.

3.3.3. Youth Employment

The project achieved replicable progress in the area of youth employment, especially in advancing conditions for decent work. The youth who were identified to become E4Y beneficiaries and enrolled in the youth employment component often came from a position of great vulnerability. Floundering in formal education, or totally dropped out, they were unambiguously involved in child labor or just at the point to become employed. Much of the activity was exploitative. Of the beneficiaries interviewed in the course of the midterm evaluation, several had been living on the streets because they had left their families’ homes in their villages to seek work in nearby towns. Girls frequently reported having served in extremely abusive circumstances as house servants, in bars, or as street vendors. Underage, and consequently ineligible for sales registration, the girl and boy vendors described tactics to escape the “red stick-carrying enforcers” who routinely chased them. When they ran, they were forced to leave all of their products behind, resulting in a loss of revenue. Boys also worked piecemeal, selling gum, sunglasses or odd trinkets on the street, shining shoes, or as day laborers used to carry loads beyond their capacity for cruel employers.

Findings

The youth employment strategies applied by the project offered hope and some degree of financial self-sufficiency to the youth enrolled in E4Y. Through a variety of offerings, the project participants benefitted (and continue to benefit) from support packages that combine training in business/entrepreneurship and life skills; savings-focused financial services; start-up assistance; and on-going supervision. After attending the summer camps, youth who selected the short-term vocational skill training received career guidance counseling in workshops where they were able to articulate and prioritize their interests to choose vocational training areas. Some youth were enrolled in vocational training at government-run vocational education Polytechnic Colleges or TVET Centers, while others were selected (and self-selected) to participate in micro-franchises.

SUBJECTS CHOSEN FOR E4Y VOCATIONAL EDUCATION
Automotive engine and electric servicing
Bakery and pastry
Electric equipment
Electrical -- building installation
Finishing work (building construction, including painting, installing hardware
Furniture making)
Hospitality and catering
Information technology (computer maintenance, keyboard, photocopying, Internet café)
Metal fabrication
Mobile phone maintenance
Poultry production
Retail trading
Basic plumbing and sanitary installation
Sheep and goat production
Youth recreation (DSTV)

The E4Y Business/ Entrepreneurship Technical Adviser (BETA) in each project region is the lead field staff member for the Youth Employment component, but, as in all of the E4Y objectives, the entire E4Y team of specialists collaborates in ensuring a smooth implementation.

At the time of the evaluation, some graduates of the youth employment tracks were employed. In addition to meeting with some youth who were running small businesses on their own, the evaluator also met with business owners who are employing E4Y beneficiaries, or were poised to

do so within the next few months. Those who have hired the graduates are very satisfied. Some jobs are temporary contracts for a specific project, such as furniture manufacturing and housing construction. While they may not be permanent hire, they do promise some continuity, and the opportunity for the youth to gain on the job experience and build credibility.

The business development programs, including micro-franchising, are proceeding successfully. The diversity of employment is worth noting. Members of the Damboya Project Steering Committee (PSC) cited the “mobile phone maintenance” of one E4Y youth entrepreneur as a best practice in filling a needed business gap.⁵⁵ A young woman in Dera, Amhara Region, acquired skills in sheep-raising. Launched in the on-going business of providing fattened sheep to the local population for holidays and celebrations, she used her earnings to open a small kiosk out of her home where she sells sundry products. Most students who took small animal husbandry received sheep after finishing the program and have successfully launched their sheep-raising enterprises. A wheelchair bound young man was among the sheep-raising group, but has not yet begun his enterprise because the project is trying to find him a place to keep the animals. Hospitality students received supplies such as cups and coffee pots to outfit their small cafés. The project procured hand tools for carpentry and furniture making youth, but intentionally delayed the distribution until they work as apprentices to gain additional skills from their employers. According to the project, carpentry tools were distributed after the midterm evaluation field site visit. With their earnings, successful youth entrepreneurs contribute to their households and financial support for their younger siblings.

Technical Vocational Education and Training

The project works with ten Technical Vocational Education and Training centers (TVETs). The evaluator visited Bahir Dar Polytechnic College and Addis Zemen TVET College in Limo KemKem in Amhara region, and the Hossana Polytechnic College in the SNNPR.⁵⁶

Twelve Steps to a Short Term Marketable Skill Training Program (STMP)

1. Use Market Assessment Study results to identify available subject areas at the government-run TVET Centers
2. Design STMP curriculum tailored to the needs and abilities of the 14-17 age group
3. Create a standardized list of achievable and marketable proficiencies for a Certificate of Competence to be awarded to course completers
4. Provide sensitization training (and ToT) and work closely with TVET administration and instructors to understand special vulnerabilities of the trainees
5. Teach business skills and promote saving money
6. Conduct support and supervisory visits during program
7. Assess graduates for the CoC
8. Work with TVET instructors and other stakeholders to seek job placements for graduates
9. Hold graduation ceremonies complete with caps and gowns
10. Advise on proposed business plans, possible employment, provide assortment of start-up materials
11. Follow-up young entrepreneurs routinely
12. Involve Steering Committees in follow-up

⁵⁵ Damboya is a woreda in the Southern Nations, Nationalities, and Peoples' Region of Ethiopia.

⁵⁶ The ten TVETs involved are: (1) Amhara Region: Chilga (Aykel), Anbesame, Bahir Dar, Adet, Maksegnt, Gondar, Gondar Zuria; and (2) in SNNPR region: Hosanna (Hadiya Zone), Durame, and Shinschio (Kembata Tembaro Zone).

At the onset, the project conducted a market assessment study to identify suitable skills where youth would find employment. After establishing a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) with each of the TVET Centers, E4Y staff specialists worked with TVET leadership and instructors to create the special Short-Term Marketable Skill Training Program (STMP) for the target beneficiaries.

Further, since the E4Y vocational education program was entirely new to the TVETs, project specialists worked with the senior experts from the regional education bureau and TVET staff members to devise a list of learning objectives and achievable units of measurable competencies so that trained E4Y youth would have a certificate when they left the center, and so that future employers would know what their level of skill was. As it is a short-term training program, the graduates do not qualify to be full-grade construction builders, welders, chefs, computer technicians, or similar trades workers at the end, as those who attend the full vocational education term do. Nonetheless, the E4Y beneficiaries leave the TVET with some superior abilities so that they may successfully acquire jobs. Together, TVET and E4Y staff members created the Certificate of Competence (CoC). The project believes that the certificate may even motivate youth to continue their vocational education. Of the first cohort of STMP trainees, 95% qualified for their CoC.

The project provided 174 TVET staff members with capacity building in curriculum development and entrepreneurship education, and some instructional materials. The STMP curriculum considered the academic abilities, educational status, and the physical and physiological readiness of the beneficiaries, as well as the capacity of the TVET institutions. In consultation with E4Y project team, the TVET instructors developed a Teacher Training and Learning Manual (TTLM) for nine training fields in Amhara region and eleven training fields identified in SNNPR. Students received coveralls, gloves, uniforms, work boots, goggles and other utility clothing as appropriate to the subjects that they pursued. They were trained in financial literacy, basic business, and life skills training, and enrolled in a money savings program. The evaluation found the TVET instructors to be highly professional and compassionate. Most of the interviewed instructors expressed concern that their E4Y trainees would find jobs. Some wished E4Y had provided more equipment and materials for the TVET Centers, as some of the institutions are worn-out and sparsely equipped. All instructors agreed that while “too short” to produce very proficient trades-people, the courses did supply useful skills that would be employable. In addition, all were satisfied with their relationship with E4Y and appreciated the training that they received.

Micro-Franchise Opportunities

An interesting and innovative feature of the E4Y employment offerings for youth is the micro-franchise program (MCP). Primarily implemented by the Business and Entrepreneurship Technical Advisors (BETAs) who used models developed by the IRC in other countries, the program links enthusiastic self-starters with local small businesses interested in expanding their markets. While there was an element of self-selection, the project also used criteria to determine who might be the best candidates to engage in this project component and depended on local CPCs to participate in the selection process as well.

Implementing the micro-franchise component required laying intensive groundwork with both the youth beneficiaries and the micro-franchise businesses. E4Y partner IRC conducted a micro-franchising assessment in four targeted towns (Durame, Hossana, Gondar and Bahir Dar), identified several prospective businesses, and negotiated MOUs. The MCP started with the East Africa Business Group, also called East Africa Tiger Brands, a company that furnishes a broad range of products throughout Ethiopia. Some of the other businesses that have since joined include Nigat Bakery, Evergreen Organic Dairy Milk, and Fasil Dairy Product Cooperative Association. All of the micro-franchise groups participated in Entrepreneurship Education (EE) sessions, which comprised basic marketing skills, such as planning, budgeting, accounting, and saving; sales techniques and customer service; and product management.

The evaluator met with three groups of micro-franchisees in Bahir Dar, Gondar, and Hosanna. All of the participating youth are enthusiastic and content with their new employment. They meet regularly with each other and work individually, in partnership, or in teams. As part of the routine of replenishing their stock, they meet regularly with the business owners or company representatives, who seem to be extremely pleased with the arrangement. In Gondar, the youth sell their products door-to-door, but also have select sites, such as the university and a laundry, where they have determined a steady market. In Hosanna, they have a copasetic relationship with a bakery, and deliver fresh bread to cafes and homes. Through the training and sharing of ideas amongst one another, they strategize to expand markets, perfect their customer service skills, and manage their “Savings for Youth” account.

Youth Savings

The E4Y programs help the project beneficiaries learn to become entrepreneurs. Once they begin to see income and assets materialize, they need money management tools, which the project provides. Children involved in project-sponsored youth employment strategies reported complete unfamiliarity of the concept of saving money before they received business, entrepreneurship and financial literacy training from the project. The project staff devised a means for youth to begin saving as soon as they began the vocational training or the micro-franchise businesses by starting Village Saving Associations for Youth (VSAY). These associations encourage and promote positive savings behavior among youth, so that they will be able to accrue capital and



Figure 2: Bankbooks for Youth

access financial services relevant to their situation. Unlike savings groups for adults, the VSAYs are not lending groups; instead, they collect and accrue savings with the objective to either share-out their savings at the end of a cycle (usually one year), or to start a group business/income generating activity at the end of the short-term vocational skill-training program.

The youth groups are linked to Amhara Credit and Saving Institution (ACSI) or other financial institutions. Extremely receptive to helping the youth, the bank has a special teller for them to go to when they go to the bank. When first designated as E4Y beneficiaries, many of these children were isolated, unsupported, with little direction. They spent their days engaged in agricultural work (including harvesting khat), cattle herding, domestic service, and carrying goods for customers and merchants in local markets. The notion that they would ever save earnings in a bank was beyond their comprehension. Now, they display maturity and resourcefulness.

Of 208 youth savings groups developed by the project, 104 are already generating \$78,000 USD in savings. They have by-laws that detail, among other things, meeting requirements, fines for tardiness, and organizational structure. Records are kept in a transparent way and the field-level E4Y Livelihood Specialists and BETAs supervise. Members agree to use 80% of their savings deposits to finance their business plan, as part of creating decent self-employment opportunities.

Legal Issues for the Young Entrepreneur

Due to the target ages of 14-17, there are some legal issues, which pose problems for youth entrepreneurs, or for those youth wishing to engage in businesses such as micro-franchises and vending. Normally, government regulations on commerce and licensing exist to protect businesses, as well as children, especially when linked to matters related to child labor. However, in this case, where E4Y and government officials are working together to create healthy and safe employment alternatives for youth, regulations limit the establishment of businesses for the under-18 E4Y participants. Youth under age 18 are ineligible under normal government and banking restrictions to qualify for normal vending licenses, interest-bearing bank accounts, or enter into any contracts. They are excluded from entering into regulatory requirements that would benefit them in the same way that normal businesses benefit, with occupational licenses or health codes.⁵⁷

Alert to the issues, the woreda government officials are consulting with the project to develop special age-appropriate programs that will address these concerns. Already, they have issued identification badges to the micro-franchisees to lend credibility (a sort of quasi-legitimacy) to the youth as they sell their products.⁵⁸ Further, woreda PSC members reported plans to erect sheds or kiosks in towns where youth can either store their tools or conduct their businesses. This is a significant example of how the project aims and the government policies are coming together for the benefit of young workers.

⁵⁷ For more detail about policies and regulations concerning youth, *See*, Handbook on the Rights of the Child in Ethiopia, Save the Children Norway, by G. Alew and Y. Birmeta. 2012 Addis Ababa University Press.

⁵⁸ The badges demonstrate to citizenry that local government sanctions and supports the youth employment activities.

Decent Work Conditions

As has been noted, E4Y targets youth between 14 and 17 years of age. While children are legally allowed to work at age 14, this age group lies outside certain protections offered older working youth aged 18. E4Y hoped to ensure decent work conditions for youth 14-17 in the target areas that were already employed. The project found that since most working youth were involved in the informal sector, in the coffee industry, livestock herding, and urban labor, it was challenging to find the proper forum to raise the awareness of employers and young workers. The project held workshops on occupational safety and health (OSH) where some youth workers were introduced to issues related to workplace hazards, job health and safety, and national labor laws.

In two woredas in SNNPR, the project held consultative meetings with local business owners to develop a code of conduct with established standards related to OSH, wages, working hours, and relations between employee and employers. Two business owners signed the code of conduct. This activity is valuable, especially since it sensitizes business owners and employers about concepts of decent work. For the E4Y project, organizing meetings for business owners who may or may not employ E4Y youth requires efforts, which, though creditable, fall slightly outside of the other activities.

3.3.4. Livelihoods

The project plan originally targeted 7,500 households to receive livelihood inputs based on a calculation of about 1.6 E4Y beneficiaries per household. However, as identification of beneficiaries began, it was determined that most households had only one at-risk or working 14-17 year-old. As the project attained its youth target, they represented more households. The targeted number for households increased, and ultimately the project has been able to reach 11,125 households.

Recognizing poverty as the underlying factor driving children into early and exploitative employment, E4Y theorized that by strengthening parents’ incomes, their vulnerable children would be able to remain in school. Dependence on child labor in economic and/or domestic activities would be reduced. Of the more than one hundred individual heads of households who were interviewed in focus groups during the evaluation, nearly everyone had faced serious, life-threatening poverty. Having their children employed was a strategy that was used to supplement family income, pay for younger siblings, or in some cases remove the working child from family life altogether by allowing them to become independent. At the beginning of the project, some E4Y youth lived apart from their families, and some prepared to migrate to cities and abroad.

Findings

The evaluator found that E4Y helped improve the economic stability of beneficiary households. Beneficiary households have at least one child enrolled in the project. The project introduced social protection, financial literacy, agricultural and non-farming inputs, and training. These key interventions were important steps towards resolving problems associated with insufficient household income.

The hallmarks of E4Y’s livelihood component are:

- Greater participation in the market economy by previously vulnerable families
- Adults and youth trained in business skills and improved production methods
- Income generating activities (IGA) and start-up inputs offer protection from economic shocks
- Village savings and loan groups with social funds promote structure and economic stability for adults
- Youth with employable skills receive job placement assistance
- Savings groups established for targeted youth (VSAY) provides financial literacy and potential for sustainable livelihoods
- Integrated adult functional education centers (IFAE) and farmer training centers (FTC), involved in the IGA and financial literacy components, received support from E4Y.
- Government and E4Y specialists nearby to provide on-going encouragement and assistance.

To help needy households, the project focused on helping them gain access to income, through improved agricultural practices and technologies to increase their agricultural productivity, diversify their products, and expand markets. Following an assessment of the household economic situations in the target areas, which were both rural and urban, the project provided the following inputs to needy families: seeds (maize, sorghum, carrot, cabbage, garlic, spinach, tomato, potato); livestock (poultry, sheep and goats); and sales products (teff flour to make injera, onions, potatoes, barley).

All household beneficiaries received business and basic financial skills training. Project staff specialists and government experts trained 117 (96 female-headed) households in improved small livestock husbandry. The training consisted of raising improved breeds, feeding and grazing, disease control and prevention, and animal sheltering. Another 3,397 households received training in improved agricultural practices, such as land preparation, seeding, fertilizer application, weed management, and pest and disease management. For those without access to (or interest in) farming, E4Y taught basic marketing strategies for engaging in income generating activities such as selling ready-to-eat injera, vegetables, and other products.

Participants in the IGA activities reported success and satisfaction in the course of focus group discussions and individual interviews. One evaluation meeting with the VSLA in Aykel town was held in the newly renovated home of a woman who had improved her financial situation dramatically through the sales of potatoes and onions. The initial input from the project was sufficient for her to get on a stable footing, invest in the VSLA, borrow money, and make the needed repairs to her home.

Savings mechanisms promote sustainable livelihoods

Families of vulnerable youth who received project support were introduced to the concept of saving money. As simple as this sounds, most of the families interviewed had never saved any money beyond a few days. Their habits were to earn only enough money as one needed and had

not thought of making more than what was needed and putting some aside. This was particularly true in villages. If a larger amount of money was needed, they would seek out a local moneylender and be obligated to repay at high interest.

Those households that benefitted from E4Y household livelihood support were also helped to establish VSLAs as part of the whole livelihood enhancement package, which included financial literacy, business skills training, and linkages with government-sponsored Integrated Functional Adult Education programs (IFAE), where available. VSLAs are basically community-based village banks, where members save together and take small loans. A social fund, or special emergency fund, is part of the savings and is available to members in time of need. The highly structured mechanism is extremely transparent and participatory. Each VSLA has about twenty-five members who meet weekly to purchase low-cost shares, or take out or repay three-month loans, all done in a very public forum. The materials, passbooks, loan fund and a social fund, especially created for member emergencies, are kept in a lock-box, with three padlocks, which is safeguarded by the group box-keeper between meetings. Besides the elected executive committee members, who do recordkeeping, three members of the group are responsible for the keys to the padlocks. Members appreciate the high degree of formality, accountability, and protection associated with their weekly meetings.

Of the 347 VSLAs established by the project, 247 have already generated just over \$33,000 USD in savings, and more than 475,000 Birr (more than \$20,000 USD) have been issued to members of the VSLAs as loans. The average savings mobilized per member is 243 Ethiopian Birr, about \$10 USD. The novelty of saving money has become a savings habit, according to VSLA members interviewed during the midterm evaluation. With names such as Growing Together and New Flower, the VSLAs are monitored and counseled frequently by the village-based E4Y voluntary facilitators and project staff specialists.

Members of VSLA, household beneficiaries of E4Y, are consistent in their assessment that now because of the inputs and training, they are unlikely to perceive child labor and child trafficking as a livelihood strategy. They are vocal in condemning the process and reported incidents where potential traffickers or questionable job recruiters have been roused out of the community. The savings activities are so well regulated that there is a high likelihood that they will continue as sustainable activities.

3.3.5. Youth Leadership

The effect of E4Y interventions in developing and nurturing youth leadership and community engagement is striking. From the first cohort of E4Y beneficiaries, leadership development and

In Lemo, SNNPR, an eighth-grade girl named Kbinesh explained the value of summer camp to her as she ticked off her newly acquired skills in a rapid-fire, uninhibited way:

“I learned effective leadership, communication skills, mental models, problem solving, life journey mapping, emotional intelligence, time management.”

“ I learned that social responsibility requires direction, commitment and alignment.”

“Social identity has seven core values. One of these is responsibility towards other people.”

“In one session, we discussed My Career:

I hope to be a chemist, but I have a hidden interest. I want to help poor families.”

community engagement have been key. Strategies for building leadership among youth have been:

- summer camps;
- Boys and Girls Clubs; and
- training and on-going support from E4Y staff members to beneficiaries in youth employment and vocational education programs.

Community engagement approaches include promoting community structures, such as Community Dialogues and Child Protection Committees; involving youth in community development; and holding training workshops that encourage discourse and discussion. The result of these efforts by the project is a growing cadre of poised, self-assured young people assuming leadership positions in formal education, as leaders of micro-franchise groups, running small businesses on their own, and speaking publicly in community meetings.

Findings

Youth Leadership activities

It may be in the leadership development and strengthening activities where the E4Y will have its most lasting effects, although it may be difficult to measure. The youth and adults who participated in the various activities should be proud and will no doubt remember their experiences.

Summer Camps

As a vehicle to prepare beneficiaries for readiness in formal education, the project held 631 Summer Camps in September 2015 and August 2016 at schools across the two regions. Over a period of five days, youth participated in games and drama to explore topics of basic life skills, leadership frameworks, communication, the value of education, self-discovery, community mapping, and issues related to child labor, child trafficking and child abuse.⁵⁹ While obviously compressed in time, by the end of the week, participants new-found confidence, technical skills and were capable of “anything.” **Youth and teachers mentioned the summer camp experience as the most important input of E4Y for motivating pupils return to, and consequently, remain in school.**

Youth mentors come from a broad range of child service organizations and agencies, including university students, civil servants, YALI volunteers, private businesses, and local community at the camps after receiving training from E4Y.⁶⁰ The involvement and commitment of mentors has

⁵⁹ E4Y utilizes a community self-study technique called community mapping. Participants collect data that identifies assets, or resources, within their locale. Frequently, community mapping results in identifying projects that are needed to improve the community. In E4Y, youth developed and implemented small projects after mapping their communities.

⁶⁰ The Young African Leaders Initiative (YALI) is program of the United States Department of State launched in 2010 to train and inspire youth leaders and build national and continental networks. Among other things, they volunteer for country-based community events.

strengthened child protection efforts in the kebeles and woredas, having a lasting impact throughout the year, as evidenced by regular meetings and activism against trafficking.

Boys and Girls Clubs

In schools, the project launched 826 boys and girls clubs. These groups bring together all project beneficiaries as well as non-beneficiaries regularly to participate in organized activities. At each meeting, there are four youth leaders. Responsibility for leading club meetings rotates, so that all members can be leader at least once over the school year. The main activity revolves around the toolkit, an intriguing, brightly painted box that holds module packets. Each packet envelope contains structured activities, exercises and discussion outlines. The meetings, which were observed in several schools during the course of the MTE, are, on the one hand, the site of serious discussions on subjects such as health and hygiene, climate change, or child rights, but simultaneously are clearly fun for the members. The leaders take their roles seriously, acting like a teacher or older sibling to the group. The activities are varied, with small group discussions, question and answer sessions, and opportunities to discuss feelings as well as acquire basic knowledge. A debate held in Lemo pitted two boys clubs from different schools to address the pros and cons of “doctor or teacher: which is most valuable?” Besides the debate team members, youth leaders also participated in the judging. The classroom was packed with girls and boys who sat respectively engrossed during each presentation, while teachers and even members of the PTSA, who had come to meet that day, stood at the door and peered through the windows.

Figure 3: Girls Club Toolkit



Selected teachers, called Master Mentors, provide oversight to the clubs, but they do not lead the meetings. CCL trained them in mentorship, communication and facilitation skills, as well as ToT for other teachers to help as mentors and guidance counselors. Among the mentors interviewed, many reported feeling more empowered as teachers, having a greater interest in their school, and feeling perceived as important to the overall academic performance in the schools. At some of the E4Y schools, the project helped start Aflatoun, a school-based child-rights club that encourages social values and financial responsibility. It offers bankbooks and promotes saving money.

In the opinion of school directors and teachers participating in E4Y activities, the project fosters leadership development among youth in other school activities as well. They cite the assistance from E4Y in support to libraries, sports activities, and learner-centered methodologies as areas where youth leadership is allowed to flourish. Teachers point to the emphasis on building leadership as a major ingredient in the progressive changes in their schools, which they maintain would not have been happening (at the time of the evaluation) without the presence of E4Y.

Community engagement - Mapping and service

During the summer camps, youth participated in project-led community mapping exercises. Community mapping is a very useful experiential and visual technique for building community involvement while highlighting strengths and weaknesses that exist in local neighborhoods. In the context of the project, the exercise gave people a chance to explore ideas and opinions about their communities, especially in looking at the incidence and consequences of family economies, child labor and youth migration. As follow-up to the camp mapping activity, youth were encouraged to present their findings to their communities. Through the presentation, leaders from their kebeles and woredas learned what mattered to their local youth. According to E4Y staff members, youth developed community projects, which included repairs to the door on a schoolgirls’ toilet, cleanup of a school playground, and water point maintenance at a primary school. This activity is seminal in exposing youth leadership abilities to their communities, and creating or strengthening relationship between youth and adults.

Family Audio Toolkit

E4Y partner CCL heads the Family Audio Toolkit component, an effective and creative product designed to teach and strengthen families and communities about social protection, community development, and family life. The solar-powered digital audio MP3-type device that contains 15 dramatic episodes focusing on child labor, child trafficking, youth decision making, early marriage and education. A narrator asks questions at the end of each episode to assist families in discussing and applying the material to their own lives. In addition to the device, the package includes a guidebook. The dramas, which were carefully reviewed and validated by local cultural and education experts, are spoken into languages of the project sites, Amharic, Kembategna and Hadiyigna. At the time of the evaluation, the toolkit had been distributed to several E4Y beneficiary families on a sharing basis, and the project was poised to distribute them throughout the target sites. Families interviewed during the evaluation that had used the kits were enthusiastic in their description of the weekly gathering to listen to a single episode and discuss the questions in the guidebook. They also confirmed the contribution of beneficiary youth in the discussions. The process, they observed, is fun and a completely novel activity. One informant reported that usually children are left outside to play or do chores until bedtime, but these activities bring them into the house, and they feel heard and valued.

3.3.6. Social Protection

The social protection component of E4Y aims to help strengthen those government services that exist to help vulnerable families that are most likely to be involved in child labor and child trafficking and to connect services with the general population, especially E4Y constituents. The project addresses social protection locally by creating or reinforcing committees to advocate for

and service poor populations, and regionally and nationally by facilitating training and coordination workshops and forum, and addressing policy.

Findings

Working with MoLSA and local government authorities, E4Y identified where gaps occur between the existing services and the populations who need them. Inadequate referral systems, cultural barriers, and insufficient institutional capacity were considered as areas where the project could provide support. The lack of coordination and strength in law enforcement (including, but not limited to, labor inspectors) especially as it pertained to child labor, youth employment, decent work, child migration and trafficking was noted as an area that would welcome capacity support. Through training workshops, E4Y committee members learned of government programs available to help the poor. Then, the project compiled referral directories listing all social protection structures available in the target areas, one per woreda, and a consolidated directory for the two regions. The directories are routinely utilized and greatly appreciated by the E4Y steering committee members.

Birth registration is an important tool for school enrollment and to avoid exploitation by employers and traffickers, who try to say that children are older than they really are. While birth registration has been a GoE priority policy since 2013, the Vital Events Registration Agency is not able to meet the demand. At the time of the midterm evaluation, the project had helped 1,068 children obtain birth certificates. Those numbers will likely increase since the project staff members intend to continue offering this service.

The project created or reinforced structures at the regional, woreda and kebele-levels to serve in advisory capacities to the project, and to promote and help implement project activities. The composition of the committees is representative of the constituency they serve, and share mutual aims with the project. These groups include: Project Steering Committees (PSC), Child Protection Committees (CPC), and Community Dialogue Groups (CDG).

Project Steering Committees

The project created **Project Steering Committees** at various levels to operate as advisory boards. There are 14 woreda level project steering committees and 92 at the kebele level. In meetings with woreda level Steering Committees in Bahir Dar City, Libo KemKem, Gondar Zuria, Hossana, and Damboya, the midterm evaluation found evidence of engaged individuals representing their respective agencies, including the religious and non-governmental sector.

Since the activities of E4Y rely upon the support of many crosscutting government services, it is helpful to have these structures where government service deliverers can share ideas and plan collaboratively. Initially, they helped to recruit and select youth and their households as project beneficiaries, and continue to provide oversight and help when social protection services are warranted for targeted youth and families. The PSCs meet quarterly, and CPCs meet monthly or more often if needed. The kebele-level CPCs are very engaged in the affairs of their communities, and thus meet on an ad hoc basis if something comes up, such as information about a trafficker in the area, a problem with a beneficiary family, or a celebratory event at schools receiving E4Y help.

The civil unrest and government review that followed prompted personnel changes in the cabinet all the way to the woreda levels. These changes had some impact on the project. However, although some people were relieved of duties or moved to other regions, many were simply reshuffled. Although there were changes in the membership of the PSCs, those visited by the evaluator demonstrated an understanding of the aims and activities of the E4Y project for the most part, and a willingness to continue working with the project.

Child Protection Committees

Overall, the project has formed 438 local **Child Protection Committees**. Some were recruited from existing cross-sector groups, such as Core Community Committees (CCCs) or local Harmful Traditional Practices groups (HTP). These groups comprise local volunteers who have a commitment to their communities and an interest in ensuring protection for children from abuse, neglect and exploitation. The membership is a mix of kebele administration, some local government civil servants (such as teachers or police officers), community elders, religious leaders, and other respected community members. In a series of intensive training workshops, these members received fact-based and practical information on legal and social issues concerning child labor and child trafficking.

At first, their most important task was helping to identify the E4Y target youth beneficiaries and enrolling them into the summer camps, and enlisting their families for livelihood activities. They learned the criteria and procedure for enrolling beneficiaries. This included, among other things, ascertaining age, school record, and working situation; making physical observations; and holding probing conversations with parents and teachers. The CPC members learned to assess children who are engaged in labor and at high risk of entering to child labor. For the most part, CPC members adhered strictly to the criteria, seemingly consumed with finding “the poorest of the poor.” Now, the CPC role is primarily follow-up and monitoring of project beneficiaries, checking the status of household beneficiaries, and seeking ways to provide access to social protection services for targeted youth/HHs. Those interviewed clearly see their role as more than a project advisory committee; they serve their communities, and have adopted tasks such as general child protection and child rights tasks as their responsibilities. Adults and youth now report cases of child abuse, such as not sending a child to school, not giving a child enough food, beating, or forcing a child into early marriage.

The E4Y project team holds monthly review meetings with CPCs and kebele Project Steering Committees, and quarterly review meetings with PSCs at the town and woreda levels to update the progress and challenges of the E4Y project in all target areas. Capacity building trainings for members of woreda and kebele level PSCs continue to be provided to them so that they can coordinate, lead, and monitor the community dialogue programs in their respective areas. The training equips members of these groups with knowledge and skills to be able to ensure that children remain in school and that they do not go back to child labor. Members follow up child labor issues and child trafficking in their communities. Interviewed members expressed an interest in understanding more about child development and parenting, and greater oversight regarding trafficking. The burden is on the project to put its efforts into supporting the local CPCs with the goal of leaving them at the end of the project as fully functioning service-oriented committees.

Community Dialogue Groups

The project formed 294 **Community Dialogue Groups**, which are community-based study groups with membership formed from E4Y household beneficiaries and community activists. Using a project-created manual and led by project-trained facilitators, they discuss issues that should lead to strengthening community-based child protection systems. The yearlong program has around twenty-five discussion issues, which range from child labor, human trafficking, and migration, to discrimination against youth with disabilities and early marriage. Nearly five hundred (493) respected and committed volunteer community dialogue facilitators lead the community dialogue programs in their specific kebeles. The project calculates a total of 9, 871 community members, representing diverse community groups, participate regularly at all project sites. The groups are highly structured and impose small fines if a member is absent without cause or comes late to the meetings.

The evaluator found focus group members of the CDGs to be extremely vocal and adamant that the community dialogue exercises add value to their personal lives, the lives of their children, and their communities. While most of the members are E4Y household beneficiaries emerging from extreme poverty and often semi-literate, their analysis of issues such as the consequences of exploitative child labor and youth migration and trafficking, were profound and thought-provoking. In every focus group discussion with members of CDGs and VSLAs (many have the same membership), at least one individual shared a heart-wrenching story of having been trafficked and imprisoned in South Africa or Tanzania, or witness to the death of a fellow traveling companion. Further, every focus group discussion also featured a story of community activism taken to curb recruitment of young people to migrate in search of jobs. Particularly poignant is the story told by the E4Y project director of the CDG in Damboya that meets next to a cemetery where trafficked youth whose bodies were repatriated from abroad are buried --- “as a means to remember.” These personal experiences serve as powerful examples to educate the community about child labor and trafficking issues.

The CDGs permit adults to discuss and analyze the harsh realities of migration. Community members reported reversing their decisions to search for jobs abroad, or supporting their children in making the dangerous choice as a result of the dialogues. The community dialogue program is designed and implemented in a way that builds the capacity of the community, to establish good relations (strengthen social capital), identify concerns in the community, with a special emphasis on child protection and child labor, plan and implement response mechanisms and monitor progress.

3.3.7. Research and Publications

The collaborative work among all of the E4Y partners -- World Vision, International Rescue Committee (IRC), Center for Creative Leadership (CCL); and the University of Gondar (UoG) -- has contributed to a larger body of knowledge through research and data collection activities, and has produced impressive toolkits and several manuals worth mentioning.

University of Gondar (UoG)

The main research partner for E4Y is the University of Gondar’s College of Medicine and Health Sciences, which has a strong unit focused on environmental and occupational health and safety, people with disabilities, and other public health issues. Data from the University’s research has helped guide E4Y’s programs in youth employment and helping youth with disabilities. Its report, “*Youth Employment Promoting Decent Work and Addressing Gender Equality and Disability in the Workplace in Ethiopia*” contained interesting and useful information about the circumstances and coping mechanisms of Ethiopian children born with disabilities, many of whom are isolated, abandoned, or living on the streets. The report made suggestions to the project for integrating girls and disabled youth into appropriate employment tracks. The project is now preparing research on “*The Effects of Early Marriage on Girls Education, Health and Women empowerment in Ethiopia, Particular Emphasis in Amhara Regional State.*” Early marriage is considered a barrier to girls’ education, a point of concern to E4Y.

As research partner for E4Y, the UoG produced a training manual for labor inspectors and TVET personnel on technical issues regarding identification and reporting on child labor, among other things, that was used in E4Y project training sessions. The UoG also developed “*Workplace Health and Safety Training Module and Awareness Creation Materials*” for E4Y which contain awareness raising materials such as leaflets on decent work, decent work conditions for young workers, health and safety and stickers on decent work.

Baseline Survey

At the start of the project, a research firm, Abamela Business PLC, was hired to gather baseline data. Their report, *Baseline Survey on Engaged, Educated and Empowered Ethiopian Youth (E4Y) Project*, also called the Child Labor Prevalence Survey, proved helpful to the project in its identification of beneficiaries. The comprehensive study also functioned as an important opportunity for public discussion regarding child labor. The study found pervasive and exploitative child labor among youth aged 14-17 in the two target regions. It cited “almost no difference in engagement in hazardous work by gender.”⁶¹ The results revealed that, among the surveyed children, slightly more than two-thirds of the children (70.1 percent) in Amhara and a little more than one-third of the children (34.4 percent) in the SNNPR were engaged in hazardous work. The survey assessed attitudes toward child labor among families in the two regions and found low awareness regarding child labor legal and social policies, the dangers and effects of child labor on education, effective parenting techniques, and the availability of vocational skills training.⁶² The survey established that the need to supplement household income and the subsequent need for children within the family to work are among the main reasons that cause children to engage in child labor.

⁶¹ BLD Ibid. p.75

⁶² BLD Ibid. p. 86

Market Assessment Study

In the first year of the project, IRC’s Business and Entrepreneurship Technical Advisors (BETAs) conducted a market assessment study across the E4Y target areas. The study provided pertinent information on the labor market, identifying growing sectors and offering an overview of youth engagement.⁶³ Follow-up studies were also done. The market assessments informed the design for the youth employment objective. The studies identified occupational trends and training opportunities that were incorporated into the E4Y plan for vocational training, apprenticeships, and business programs for target beneficiaries.

Development of Manuals, Modules and Curriculum

As mentioned in other sections, the project has held many workshops and training sessions on a broad range of related subjects. In several instances, the project created or modified publications, training materials and manuals that continue to be used, and may be replicated or adapted for use in other regions. Among these are:

- summer school (camp) module and curriculum;
- TVET short-term marketing curriculum;
- social protection service directory;
- financial literacy; and
- Learn to Earn, a business and life skills training manual that was created by E4Y partner IRC to introduce difficult concepts and sound business methodologies to young people in a creative and fun way.⁶⁴

In addition, E4Y partner CCL created unique and compelling toolkits and other materials for various project components, including:

- *Leadership, Communication and Mentoring* training manual for the Girls and Boys Clubs Master Mentors;
- peer learning toolkit;
- Girls and Boys Club toolkit; and
- Family Audio Drama toolkit.

⁶³ The Market Assessment study in 2015 found that the government is the main employer of youth as daily laborers on road, railway and building projects, followed by private sector businesses, such as hotels, restaurants, construction companies, horticulture farms, garment factories, and garages. Factories employ youth as day laborers and seasonally. Only a limited number of youth are engaged in entrepreneurship and/or self-employment.

⁶⁴ Adapted by the IRC from Street Kids International’s (SKI) Street Business Toolkit (2001).

IV. POTENTIAL FOR SUSTAINABILITY

The E4Y target youth benefits from multiple project inputs, many of which hold the promise of being sustainable. Naturally, the project staff members wish to concentrate on building sustainability and autonomy for E4Y groups and participants. Exit strategy planning meetings with stakeholders should be held in advance of the project’s termination date, December 2018. Questions that address the project indicators should be considered in open forum. Issues of concern are:

- What should be the future of mobilized and trained community committees and volunteers?
- How can the enthusiasm and accomplishments be sustained?
- What is the status of the livelihood enhancements? Will they continue?
- Is the habit of savings sufficiently inculcated among the constituents?
- What opportunities for youth leadership can be replicated and institutionalized?

The experiences of the E4Y children in **formal education** lay groundwork for important habits: asking for and receiving extra help, after school study programs, regular attendance, and setting goals regarding scholarship. The **E4Y clubs and summer camp** continue to build and support communities of motivated and happy children, and introduced leadership skills and values that cannot be forgotten. Even if the children experience hard times, as they become adults, the lessons learned in the clubs and at summer camp included problem solving and coping skills. The clubs will likely remain in some form if the school directors and Master Mentors promote them. The CCL toolkits are well organized and will probably be used for some time after the project ends, as will the sturdy family audio kits with their dramas of enduring interest. The future of the summer camps is less certain, unless E4Y takes measures to create a mechanism for their continuity.

Initially, E4Y **target parents** were inexperienced in business, misunderstood issues surrounding child labor, did not have the habit of saving money, were unaware of possible government safety net programs, and lacked problem solving skills. Some were isolated from their communities. The project has accomplished a lot in bringing these families into the mainstream as they are involved in **earning money in markets** and have become leaders to some extent in their own constituencies, such as VSLAs and CDGs. The VSLAs have a good chance of continuing, especially if E4Y can help them institutionalize over the next two years. All beneficiaries learned about saving earnings. The **savings activities** are so well regulated that there is a high likelihood that they will continue as sustainable activities, among adults as well as the youth. The savings behavior is becoming the savings habit. The support to families is important because there is less dependence on the working child, and as parents benefit from income generating activities, they can put money aside into the VSLA to meet routine household needs, support other children, or resolve emergency financial needs. The VSLAs appear to be organized and effective enough that they offer reasonable expectation that they will continue.

Ethiopia is witnessing a lot of building construction nationwide, and after its preoccupation with **youth employment**, the creation of industrial parks and affordable housing are two areas of

public priority. This bodes well for the E4Y graduates who are learning skills, especially in construction, basic electrical installation, painting and finishing skills, but in other technical skills as well. Where there is building, there are contiguous needs as well, such as catering, restaurants, photocopying, mobile phone maintenance, and mechanics. Coupled with the business and entrepreneurship techniques furnished, the E4Y beneficiaries will be well placed for finding work.

Although still in a somewhat experimental phase, the **micro-franchises** depend on the energy and initiative of the youth and the continued cooperation with businesses. At this point, they have a good chance of being sustainable and replicable if the E4Y project team members can devote their time over the next two years to backstop the participants with moral and professional support. The varied educational options that the E4Y children receive are enough to upgrade their employability and, in some cases, greatly enhance their incomes. They are also inculcated with the concept of saving their earnings, which will help in times when there may be less money coming in.

As has been noted, the project held many **training workshops**. The sustainable value of the training is not yet realized, but since teachers and school directors see the payback of using learner-centered methodology, they are more likely to continue using those methods. School directors and the deans of TVET Centers have been implicated in what they describe as “a door opening,” and will likely be more interested in continuing to seek teaching methodology upgrades as the opportunities arise. Administrators at schools and vocational colleges who were interviewed in the course of the evaluation demonstrated an appreciation for innovation and expansive thinking, and talked about ways to make their schools centers of excellence. E4Y support to clubs, banking, and gardens make schools more appealing to children, but also open them up to the larger community. The special rest rooms and provision of sanitary napkins for girls have proven effective for keeping them in school. Regional and woredas government officials, particularly education, labor and social affairs representatives, are aware of the E4Y activities to the point where they may implement them in other localities.

Training on **decent work principles** helped children and families. E4Y beneficiaries tend to enter less exploitative trades and are unlikely to return to hazardous work until they are older. Some youth who received vocational training are not yet practicing their trades. They are engaged in work that they had done before, such as hauling heavy loads or working at construction sites. In their own words, the difference is that, as they have “aged out to 18” and have learned about decent work and safety, they feel in control of what work they will take on, even to the extent of wearing helmets and goggles. Those who reported going back into work that they had done before were using it as a bridge until they could begin their own businesses with other group members or alone. They remain in touch with E4Y staff members, so they reported feeling confident of their destinies.

After receiving E4Y training in OSH and WFCL concepts, local kebeles and community groups created **by-laws and guidelines** to monitor them in their communities. These by-laws and guidelines for CDG, CPC, VSLAs and the other community institutions are essential to the continuing work begun by the project. The kebele officers, PSC members and CPC representatives reported that they are committed to **enforcing the by-laws and guidelines**. The project sensitized communities on the need to recognize and aid youth with disabilities or from

marginalized communities and children who are neglected or abused. By-laws and guidelines do not necessarily standardize behavior towards these issues so they are more difficult to institutionalize. Project Steering Committees were not created as sustainable institutions expected to endure after the project ends. However, the format of multi-sector meetings can become a feature of local governments, and are likely to continue where the woredas and kebele leaders see their value. E4Y has the potential to influence this.



Figure 4 The Account Books for VSLA and VSAY.

V. MAIN CONCLUSIONS

The project has already had a significant impact on direct and indirect beneficiaries at midterm. While concentrated in a limited geographical area, reaching a select sampling of Ethiopia’s population, the project is seen to have an effect on the surrounding neighborhoods as well in both urban and rural settings. The objectives are pragmatic and feasible and the activities are replicable. Project staff members in both regions work tirelessly. They visit households and are visible and accessible to communities and stakeholders. Overall, they are very capable and work well together as a team in each of the regions and in the capital city.

There is clear evidence of achieved project deliverables. School supplies and backpacks, goats and sheep, and youth in boots and jumpsuits working on masonry projects at the TVET centers are testimony to the project’s inputs. Account record books for VSLA and VSAY, small coffee shops, graduation photographs, and pyramids of tomatoes en route to market mark the outcome of those inputs. Equally exciting is the evidence of less palatable, but tangible nonetheless, inputs: poised and eloquent young people - E4Y beneficiaries - who fearlessly lead classroom discussions about harmful traditional practices, debate over climate change, and explore ways to be tolerant to youth with disabilities. Through focus group discussions, the evaluator also heard evidentiary testimonies of attitudinal and behavioral change among the target populations (both adults and youth) directly attributable to E4Y interventions.

As the project enters into the second half, it is well situated. Its youth beneficiaries are involved in project activities. Some youth have completed the E4Y activity that was deemed most appropriate for him or her. Others are still in school, vocational training, or apprenticeships, with good prospects for employment. According to a UoG expert on labor and OSH at the University of Gondar, the E4Y beneficiaries are 6 times more likely to land decent employment. While the evaluator considers this to be an overstatement, he made two important points: (1) the employment or business training that the E4Y beneficiaries receive is appropriate, high quality (for the short period of time), and market-driven; and (2) the project -- through its stakeholders, including E4Y staff members, kebele officials, PSC or CPC members -- is behind each beneficiary (youth and households), ready to help out.

The project starts the next two years in the position to provide follow-up with the aim to ensure continuity. The demands on E4Y staff members that will most likely be present in the last two years of the project are:

- youth in the process of receiving suitable training;
- retaining and guaranteeing completion of students in high quality formal education;
- trained youth seeking employment;
- newly empowered trained, disabled young people;
- teachers and educators persisting in using new techniques; and
- households and youth navigating through new income generating activities, savings and loans, and behavior change regarding children in labor.

There is high incidence of exploitative employment, migration and trafficking among the 14 -17 year old youth in the E4Y geographical areas of operation. There is also a lot of anecdotal information spread across the two E4Y target areas (and stories published in the international press), which relates to youth migration and illegal trafficking of Ethiopian boys and girls to other countries. Young men who have returned from harrowing experiences, and the survivors of those who did not, live in the two regions and actively participate in E4Y project activities. Most people who have been affected by the project’s awareness raising efforts understand that migration in search of work is not a practical antidote to poverty. The project brought these needy families into proximity of services, and sensitized and trained government officials who, when interviewed, committed to giving on-going encouragement and assistance. The E4Y households and their neighbors are less likely to turn to child labor as a livelihood strategy even if they fall on hard times.

In summary, E4Y is building a foundation for transparent, intelligent, collaborative, results-producing development in targeted vulnerable communities.

VI. RECOMMENDATIONS

At midterm, E4Y is an effective and relevant project that is performing optimally. It is meeting targets and E4Y staff members capably keep activities on track. Areas where the project could improve or modify are listed here as recommendations. However, it should be noted that the project activities move rapidly, albeit in a well-coordinated fashion, and major modifications to the activities as scheduled are not recommended. Some of these recommendations can be implemented within the context of the normal project activities. Others should be considered and discussed by project management before making changes.

6.1. Education

1. Encourage teachers to utilize all of the various methods that they learned.

Teachers appreciated the LCM, which they described the training as modern, functional, and learner-centered. The training introduced no less than twenty-five different techniques to manage large classrooms, motivate pupils, and improve academic performance, according to teachers who received the training. Further, these trainees learned training of trainer (ToT) techniques so that the methodologies could be passed on through a process called “cascading.” Trainees were enthusiastic, but most professed to sticking with only a handful of the methods because they work well. One teacher in Aykel was impressive in her embrace of all of the various suggestions to build teacher-student relations. Her classroom was filled with exciting student projects, charts, tables set up in a way to encourage classroom discussions. Project education specialists should encourage the educators to persist in using all techniques to keep the classroom experience vibrant.

6.2. Youth Employment and Technical Vocational Training

2. Continue working with government officials to address the legal issues that exist for young entrepreneurs.

As mentioned, there are few clear legal protections or regulations related to being a youth entrepreneur, or engaging in businesses such as micro-franchises and vending for the E4Y target beneficiary because of their ages (14-17). Regulations protect businesses, and also children, especially when linked to matters related to child labor. For the moment, the climate for youth entrepreneurship in Ethiopia is less than favorable because of the legal, policy and regulatory frameworks that are in place to protect entrepreneurs in general. Besides age limitations, problems involve registration (time and cost), complexity of procedures, minimum capital requirements, and rights to property where they can have a business. The work that E4Y has done to bring youth beneficiaries into an employable environment is noteworthy. As trained E4Y youth beneficiaries become engaged in small businesses and micro franchises, the project team and regional and woreda government officials are actively seeking ways to improve the legal and regulatory environment, with an emphasis on the specific barriers and burdens faced by young entrepreneurs. This should be a priority for E4Y, and the project should document the process to achieve regulations designed for youth running their own business.

3. Consider offering one week to one month of English language training to students in hospitality and computer and information technology vocational education courses.

This suggestion emerged from TVET teachers, who recognized that their short-term (STMP) graduates would never attain the same level of competency compared to traditional full-term vocational graduates. They were emphatic nonetheless that a rapid short course in English would improve the job opportunities for E4Y beneficiaries in specific sectors. The bar is set realistically and pragmatically low, they contend.

E4Y hospitality graduates are not expected to find work in tourist hotels; rather, they will open catering businesses or run small cafes. Indeed, one of the evaluator’s visits was to a cheerful, successful café in a suburb of Hosanna (SNNPR) run by a trio of E4Y graduates. Situated near a secondary school and close to an industrial park of warehouses, these girls would clearly struggle if they were in a setting where English might be required. On the other hand, the Jacaranda Hotel manager in Bahir Dar (Amhara Region) was pleased with an E4Y hospitality graduate he had hired to work the bar and was convinced she would excel in her job, but noted that upward mobility may be limited due to her lack of formal education. A TVET hospitality graduate with limited English-speaking skills, she had passed the initial probation period at the time of the evaluation and was now earning about 1100 Birr a month, or almost \$50 USD per month, a reasonable salary for food and drink servers, even trained ones, in Bahir Dar.

According to two TVET teachers who taught computer technology (IT) to E4Y pupils, mostly girls, the lack of basic English hindered their choices. They proposed one week of orientation to English lessons to give students a chance to become accustomed to the keyboard, which is in English. As it is now, E4Y graduates of the short-term program in IT are able run a small photocopying and printing shop, but with increased skills in using an English keyboard, their business opportunities would be greater. In the words of one of the teachers, “*a week of English might be the difference between making photocopies as a business and a more lucrative enterprise, such as a cybercafé.*”

The Universities of Bahir Dar, Gondar and Wachama all have Teaching English as a Second Language (TESL) programs. These programs typically are experiential in nature, so students needing practicums could be enlisted for the TVET programs where English could be useful.

4. Continue support to the micro-franchise participants, but explore opportunities for innovation.

The micro-franchise program is in an incubation stage. The Business Entrepreneurship Technical Advisors (BETAs) should continue the work that they are doing to help participating youth explore new markets. This could mean going beyond selling household goods. Members of the three groups interviewed in the course of the evaluation demonstrated expansive thinking, and the BETA and other EY4 staff members expressed an interest in seeking new possibilities. Household goods can be expanded to hardware and building supplies, for example. Other sectors, such as agriculture, health and education might have sought after products as well. Each MF group has its own personalities and strengths. As has been noted, the participants are motivated and clever individuals. It is up to the business experts in the project to find the right

balance over the next two years between providing continued support of the groups as they are, or introducing (or suggesting) innovations.

6.3. Livelihood

5. Closely monitor the beneficiaries who have launched new businesses and are saving in VSLAs for the remaining two years of E4Y.

Until E4Y enrolled them into savings associations, the participating families were not inclined to save money. The transparency of the VSLA meetings offers the opportunity for communities to propose solutions together, and also impose sanctions on money saving habits. Still, it is reasonable to expect some problems and conflicts to arise over money for individual members or within a VSLA group. The kebele representatives, and especially the E4Y staff (which brings a completely objective point of view), can help these communities as they move forward running the VSLAs.

In considering the sustainability of the project interventions, the origins of the beneficiaries must be remembered. As PSC members, and even the beneficiaries themselves, said, they came from the “poorest of the poor.” The newly acquired skills in business, livelihood, education, trades, and attitudes are still fragile. Young people need emotional support and recognition, especially children from marginalized families. The project should continue to celebrate, acknowledge and reward volunteers, exemplary youth leaders and stakeholders.

6.4. Youth Leadership

6. Explore how the summer camps can be institutionalized and held nationally.

Since the summer camps have an obvious benefit for retention and improved academic performance perhaps the program could be incorporated in the World Bank funded General Education Quality Improvement Program Project (GEQIP).

7. Create opportunities for club members to meet nationally and produce more modules for their Boys and Girls Club toolkits with E4Y guidance.

The toolkit modules take about four to five weeks to complete. The clubs are expected to continue to meet together, have debate sessions, and craft their own modules after they finish the modules. Stakeholders expressed the hope that some of the young E4Y leaders in formal education could meet one another across regions. The project could facilitate a meeting where E4Y youth participate in designing and producing their own club modules with expert guidance from E4Y partner CCL. The project should also look for other opportunities where young people are invited to participate across regions, such as Children's Parliament or 4-H Ethiopia.

6.5. Social Protection

8. Convene a consultative meeting or conference with government to help roll out new youth employment programs.

The project has many impressive achievements to share at a time when the Ethiopian government is preparing to invest a massive amount of funds into creating opportunities for youth. In an interview with the evaluator, a researcher from E4Y partner University of Gondar suggested, and the evaluator concurs, that E4Y sponsor a consultative meeting reviewing, in detail, project accomplishments and outlining recommended steps for implementing meaningful programs for youth. Consultative meetings should include all key stakeholders of E4Y, especially MoLSA, woreda officials, TVET administration, and project partners.

While this recommendation may be considered a modification from the policy-connected indicators (IO 5), it is something that would benefit the government at an opportune time. A key challenge would be how to transfer *specific project attributes* that resulted in success, such as the twenty-four hour nurturing and sympathetic approach of staff members towards youth and adult beneficiaries, to a government bureaucracy. It is worth noting that local government E4Y stakeholders in the regions, woredas and kebeles are already demonstrating that they are motivated (and effective) when they help in addressing legal issues for young entrepreneurs or designing concentrated vocational courses, for example.

There are many groups working on youth projects in Ethiopia, among them the Women’s Caucus of the Amhara Regional Parliament or Women (also called Children and Youth Standing Committee), UNICEF, DfID, and USAID. These groups, along with representatives from nearby countries facing the same issues, could share best practices on youth employment. This would be the appropriate time for E4Y to invest in capacity building and raising awareness in order to share successful strategies and assist the government as it rolls out its youth employment programming.

6.6. Project Design and Management

9. Consider placing M&E Officers in regions in future similar projects.

The E4Y project collects a lot of data on its 12,000 plus youth beneficiaries and 11,175 households. The M&E Manager has created user-friendly reporting mechanisms for the project team in the field. The sector specialists and volunteers collect the information and submit it to the M&E Manager. The workload is considerable. Sector specialists work long hours servicing the beneficiaries and, while they need to be current on the information that goes into the database, their workload would be substantially lightened if a regional M&E staff member entered (and analyzed) data. The M&E department should be able to track all graduates in their work places. Data clerks hired on a temporary basis enter data into the DBMS, but it would probably improve efficiency and alleviate the workload for M&E requirements if there were M&E officers in the two regions. Since the budget is probably allocated, it may not be possible to place anyone in this position at this time. However, it is worth considering this for future programming.

10. In designing projects, target vulnerable youth, but do not apply target numbers to disabled or marginalized youth without a comprehensive and deep study in advance.

In designing programs to fight child labor among children aged 14-17, it is good to recognize the invisible constituencies, such as youth with disabilities or those who come from marginalized

populations.⁶⁵ While USDOL specified a target percentage to be female, it left targets concerning special needs open. The language of the Funding Opportunity Announcement (FOA) was as follows:

“Youth targeted by the project must be ages 14 to 17. Applicants must propose strategies aimed at ensuring that at least 50 percent of the targeted youth are female. Applicants must target youth who face one of more of the following factors that contribute to making them vulnerable to or engaged in exploitative child labor:

- engaged in hazardous work;
- deficient in basic literacy skills;
- school dropouts;
- head of households; and
- in need of additional assistance to complete educational programs or to secure and retain employment (including youth affected by a disability).”

In a footnote to the FOA, USDOL made the following provision: “This could include youth with disabilities or youth who are at risk of exploitative labor as a result of a parent’s disability.”⁶⁶

Rather than applying a target number to a specific target group, it is better to emphasize providing access and being inclusive to youth who are sidelined due to disabilities or ethnic discrimination. While the project specified targets for disabled youth, they later discovered that actual target numbers were difficult to apply. E4Y project staff members suggest that, in locating and identifying target beneficiaries in a specific geographic locale as was done in the E4Y project, it may be better to identify the broader target (14-17 year old vulnerable youth), and then seek ways to make the programs inclusive. For more on disabled and marginalized youth, see Lessons Learned, below.

⁶⁵ In Ethiopia, this included children from what was called the “pottery caste,” but included all families ostracized due their historical social strata

⁶⁶ Taken from an explanatory email from ILAB April 4, 2016.

VII. LESSONS LEARNED AND BEST PRACTICES

7.1. Lessons Learned

The E4Y project leadership shares information amongst its team across regions, and has learned a lot about its constituency as well as good techniques. Some are listed here along with lessons and good practices uncovered in the context of this evaluation.

1. Raised awareness and changed behavior may be possible to achieve without fanfare.

The project was successful in sensitizing a broad range of constituents: educators, government officials, employers, families and youth without spending a significant amount of money on **awareness raising** materials such as banners and T-shirts, as some child labor projects do. The project did use radio programs, manuals, World Day Against Child Labor (WDACL) events and some publicity materials to spread messages confronting attitudes and practices about child rights, child labor, trafficking.

However, it was in training workshops, especially those disseminating facts and providing practical support, and in solidly nurturing of community groups where tangible benefits, such as VLSAs and Community Dialogues, proved most effective in building adherents. The emphasis on building leadership and creating opportunities for community-based discussion and analysis was exemplary.

2. The emphasis should be on providing access and being inclusive to youth who are marginalized due to disabilities or ethnic discrimination.

Supporting youth with disabilities represented an important intervention for E4Y. These youth are frequently isolated, ostracized, and sometimes abused. Few of them have opportunities to attend school. According to the draft E4Y project document compiled by World Vision, “nearly all children with disabilities, regardless of the potential impact on their education, are out of school by the age of 14.”⁶⁷ If not for the E4Y involvement, the disabled target beneficiaries would continue to be isolated. In its implementation, E4Y learned three lessons specific to Ethiopia, but perhaps applicable elsewhere, which should be considered in implementing a project to be inclusive:

Specify the nature of the disability

The project found it extremely difficult to locate the target number of disabled youth, as specified in the original proposal, which did not fully specify the nature of disabilities to be addressed. In fact, the list of disabilities can be exhaustive, ranging from physical systemic infirmities; cognitive and learning impairments; mental, psychological and neurological problems; and hearing and vision loss, to name a few.

⁶⁷ E4Y Project Document Revised 16 February 2017, p. 11

After exerting what project staff members called “a lot of effort,” in discovering disabled youth who fit the E4Y age and working status criteria, the project prudently decided to focus primarily on those specific disabilities which require assistive devices, such as orthopedic, visual, speech and hearing impairments.⁶⁸ The challenge remained, but eventually, more than 400 youth were enrolled in the project. Some, but not all, of the identified children were fitted for crutches, wheel chairs, white sticks, Braille devices, eye glasses and hearing aids. Project staff members worked with organizations dedicated to helping disabled children, for example Cheshire Services Ethiopia which furnishes aids for the disabled.⁶⁹

Unless an organization has as its primary focus supporting disabled populations (100% of its target beneficiaries), it does not seem practical to apply percentages of targets to beneficiaries. Searches of reputable sources reveal vastly different figures for the amount of disabled children in Ethiopia, which would make predicting a feasible target number problematic.⁷⁰ The project should continue to seek ways to assist all of its enrolled beneficiaries who have special physical needs. There are many low cost and inventive products available and, in addition to Cheshire Services, the World Vision International headquarters may have resources to help locate aids that are most appropriate for E4Y beneficiaries. The project should consider engaging a consultant to identify less visible disabilities among the E4Y beneficiaries.

Disabled children and older youth may have no fixed residence

The University of Gondar researchers involved in identifying E4Y beneficiaries found disabled youth to be very independent, autonomous, and mobile, despite physical infirmities. They moved from place to place and it was never very clear where they actually spent the night. It was difficult to do follow-up on previously identified beneficiaries who were disabled. By custom, children with disabilities, especially those with multiple problems, are often abandoned by their poor parents, who cannot afford to keep them. They frequently live on the streets. The physical environment is not accommodating, even in the larger cities, and public awareness concerning the real obstacles faced by people with disabilities is low.

The E4Y team members, through their implementation of routine project activities as well as project-contracted data collection, noted that the target youth in general is very mobile. “In big towns like Bahir Dar, Gondar, Hossana and pre-urban towns Addis Zemen and Aykel, target adolescents were found to live in rented houses with their parents, or individually, which

⁶⁸ The project enrolled children with other disabilities, for example, epilepsy, but the majority had visible physical incapacities.

⁶⁹ Cheshire Services has a widespread network of medical facilities that work at the heart of communities to treat orthopedic disabilities and help the community remove the social stigma associated with disability through social rehabilitation services.

⁷⁰ Compare the World Report on Disability jointly issued by the World Bank and World Health Organisation: “...an estimated 15 million children, adults and elderly persons with disabilities in Ethiopia, representing 17.6 per cent of the population;” [https://www.usaid.gov/ Wheelchairs Transform Life For Ethiopian Children](https://www.usaid.gov/Wheelchairs Transform Life For Ethiopian Children) article states 7.37 million people living with disabilities face challenges related to discrimination, exclusion from mainstream society, and extreme poverty;” and The ILO International Labor Organization cites 11 million... People with Disabilities in Ethiopia : http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/@ed_emp/@ifp_skills/documents/publication/wcms_112299.pdf.

prompts them to change their residential area often and makes sustaining savings group memberships difficult.”⁷¹ During this evaluation, disabled and non-disabled youth reported living on the streets and changed their domicile often. It remains a problem, but because it is recognized, E4Y staff members are alert to the possibilities when they involve youth, and exert extra effort to be certain how and where they can find beneficiaries.

Marginalized populations have special needs

Like youth with disabilities, children from “marginalized groups” are ostracized and sometimes abandoned to fend for themselves. The residue of traditional social stratifications, also called caste systems, is still found in some ethnic groups in Ethiopia. People from essential occupations like pottery making, blacksmithing, and leather tanning comprise historically socially excluded groupings in some rural areas, including where E4Y operates. Even E4Y staff members are struck by the institutionalized subservient, low self-esteem demeanor that emanates from these groups, especially evident among the children. E4Y reached out to these youth and, while there is noticeable transformation in their abilities to interact as a result of the emphasis on leadership at summer camps and in clubs, more needs to be done to encourage their classmates and teachers to include them in activities. It is a complex situation, like that of youth with disabilities. Again, as they strive to be inclusive in programming, those designing projects to stop child labor can seek ways to make the programs accessible and appropriate for special needs without applying elusive target numbers.

As reported in TPRs, the project also learned:

Combining **livelihood support** with business skills and financial literacy gave participating families with a further avenue to use their earned income more efficiently; and

Working with **business owners** requires patience and steady efforts to build mutual trust and confidence as well as clarify the project expectations and avoid suspicion.

⁷¹ October 2016 Technical Progress Report, p. 35

7.2. Best Practices

- Graduate students from UoG Psychology Department volunteer to counsel E4Y beneficiaries in Gondar town. The students gain practical skills, and the youth asserted that they were very grateful to have the counseling.
- The marketing assessment studies conducted at the outset helped place youth in vocational skills training that were appropriate for urban or rural settings. The PSC in Damboya cited the “mobile phone maintenance” as a best practice among innovative employment for youth. The E4Y beneficiary is a teen-aged boy who has set up a business where he can replace broken cellphone covers and perform other somewhat technical tasks related to cellphone ownership, which are essential to the public. It was noteworthy that among steering committees and CPCs, many members were aware of the accomplishments of specific beneficiaries.
- The Certificate of Competency (CoC) designed for the Short Term Marketing Program (STMP) gives credibility to the newly skilled youth and eases the job search. Holding a graduation ceremony for the STMP graduates solemnizes and motivates the E4Y beneficiaries. The badges and vests for micro-franchise youth have a similar effect, ensuring trustworthiness to their clientele in their door-to-door sales efforts, while affirming their sense of self-worth. E4Y supplied volunteers with raincoats and stationary supplies. These inputs, while utilitarian, serve to recognize the volunteers’ civic value to the community.
- School directors and teachers using innovative methodology and classroom management techniques report improved attendance retention and the academic performance.



Figure 5: A Master Mentor and school psychologist stand outside the school building with space for tutoring classes, Boys and Girls Club supplies, and a menstrual hygiene room for girls.

ANNEXES

Annex A: List of Documents Reviewed

Project Documents

1. Cooperative Agreement
2. Technical Progress and Status Reports
3. Project Logical Frameworks and Monitoring Plans
4. Work plans
5. Correspondence related to Technical Progress Reports
6. Management Procedures and Guidelines
7. Research or other reports undertaken (baseline studies etc.) and
8. Project files (including school records) as appropriate.
9. Performance Monitoring Plan (PMP)
10. Comprehensive Monitoring and Evaluation Plan (CMEP)
11. CMEP, Annex 2 – Full Results Framework with Outputs included (or Outcome Tree with Outputs)
12. Ethiopia E4Y Project Summary
13. E4Y Project Document, Revised February 2017
14. Technical Progress Reports
15. *October 2015* Technical Progress Report Cover Sheet
16. *April 2015* Technical Progress Report Cover Sheet
17. *October 2016* Technical Progress Report Cover Sheet
18. *April 2016* Technical Progress Report
19. Modifications
20. Approved Budget – Modification 2
21. IL26683 Modification 1 NOO
22. IL26683 Modification 2 NOO
23. OCFT Approval Letter
24. OCFT Approval of Key Personnel Change
25. Baseline Data and Evaluation Materials
26. Terms Of Reference for Consultancy Service to Conduct a Baseline Survey on Engaged Educated and Empowered Ethiopian Youth [E4Y] Project in Amhara and SNNP Regions May 2015 Addis Ababa
27. Baseline Survey on Engaged Educated and Empowered Ethiopian Youth (E4Y) Project Final Version, (Also called BLD in report), Abamela Business PLC Development Research and Training Center, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia, December 2016
28. Ethiopia Midterm Evaluation ToR
29. Ethiopia Midterm Evaluation ToR Questions

30. Report Forms for M&E Department, E4Y
31. Contextual Literature
32. Silvery MM, Sneider JT, Crowley DJ et al. Frontal Lobe GABA Levels during Adolescence: Associations with Impulsivity and Response Inhibition. *Biological psychiatry*. 2013;74(4):296304. Published online 2013 Mar 14.
33. Jan 21 2017 CBE Ministry to administer 10 billion birr revolving fund, www.thereporterethiopia.com
34. Dec 10 2016 Ridding youth entrepreneurship initiative of backward practices, www.thereporterethiopia.com
35. Feb 18 2017 House Approves Ethiopian Youth Revolving Fund, and Joint Efforts Needed for Proper Utilization of Youth Fund, www.ena.gov.et/ Ethiopian News Agency (ENA)
36. World Report on Disability, jointly issued by the World Bank and World Health Organisation
37. <https://www.usaid.gov/> Wheelchairs Transform Life For Ethiopian
38. International Labour Organisation:
http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/@ed_emp/@ifp_skills/documents/publication/wcms_112299.pdf.
39. Country Profiles and Fact sheets
40. World Bank, worldbank.org, country report on Ethiopia.
41. data.worldbank.org/country/ethiopia
42. African Economic Outlook 2016
43. BBC Country Profiles (www.bbc.com)
44. CIA World Factbook on Ethiopia (on-line)
45. Deloitte Ethiopia Economic Outlook 2016: The Story Behind the Numbers
46. UNICEF/UNDP country information.
47. The 2016 UNDP Human Development Report, Human Development Index, (HDI).
48. USDOL 2015 Findings on the Worst Forms of Child Labor,
<https://www.dol.gov/sites/default/files/documents/ilab/reports/child-labor/findings/2015TDA.pdf>.
49. USDOL ILAB Fact sheet of Ethiopia,
www.dol.gov/ilab/reports/childlabor/findings/2012TDA/ethiopia.pdf
50. FHI 360, Education Policy and Data Center (EPDC)

Annex B: Itinerary

E4Y Project Field Visit Itinerary and List of Stakeholders for Midterm Evaluation

March 4-21, 2017

Field Visit Dates	Place	Details of Activities	Participants
March 3	Boston	Bos – Dubai	Evaluator
March 4	Addis Ababa	Dubai-Addis	
March 5	Addis Ababa	Rest	
March 6 Monday	Addis Ababa (World Vision E4Y) MoLSA	-General discussion with project core team (Morning) -Discussion with MoLSA (Afternoon)	Core team E4Y Head of Harmonious Industrial Relation Directorate and Child Labor Desk Point Person
	Bahir Dar		
March 7 Tuesday	Bahir Dar (World Vision Bahir Dar Office)	Flight to Bahir Dar, late Afternoon -Amhara region project status briefing by Regional Coordinator -Interview and discussion with Bahir Dar City Administration Project Steering Committee - Bahir Dar Polytechnic College -Discussion with TVET graduate Youth in business and decent work -Interviews with employers Meet with micro-franchising partners and youth	WVE Amhara regional Director and E4Y Staff PSC: Labor and social Affairs, Police, Education, Women and Children, Youth, Justice Offices, City Mayor Dean and instructors of the college Beneficiary youth Employers/potential employers Youth in MF East African Tiger Brands/ Evergreen Organic Milk processing
March 8 Wednesday	Dera /Hamusit (Morning)	Bahir Dar to Dera -Hamusit/Goh School (class observation, Educators FGD, Girls and Boys Clubs -FGD with VSLA, beneficiary HH -Visit self-employed project beneficiaries -Home visit	Educators Beneficiary HHs Club members Member of VSLAs Beneficiary youth (Girls and Boys)
	Libo Kemkem (Afternoon) Gondar	Dera to Libo Kemkem -Addis Zemen TVET College -Visit beneficiary youth who are enrolled in TVET programs Libo KemKem to Gondar town	College Dean and TVET Instructors Beneficiary youth
March 9 Thursday	Gondar Zuria (Morning)	-Discussion with GZ Woreda Steering Committee -Youth with disability, girl beneficiaries -FGD with VSLA groups -Community Dialogue Groups Gondar Zuria to Gondar	Members of GZ steering committee Beneficiary youth (Girls and Boys) Girls and youth with disabilities Members of VSLA group Community dialogue participants and facilitators
	Gondar town (Afternoon)	-FGD with Azezo Elementary School teachers -Observe class session with E4Y project beneficiaries and teacher using LCM -Meet direct beneficiary youth who	Target school teachers, principals and cluster supervisors Master mentors and mentors Girls and Boys Club members Beneficiary youth

Field Visit Dates	Place	Details of Activities	Participants
March 10 Friday	Chilga (Morning)	received scholastic material, tutorial and assistive devices -Observe Girls and Boys Clubs Gondar town to Chilga -Observe road to Sudan (trafficking) -FGDs at target schools (Aykel, etc.) - Observe class session with E4Y project beneficiaries -FGD with beneficiary youth -FGD with VSLA -Visit beneficiary HHs Chilga to Gondar	Teachers, Beneficiary youth enrolled in formal education Beneficiary youth Direct and indirect beneficiary youth Non-beneficiary youth VSLA members Beneficiary HHs
March 11-12 Saturday Sunday	Gondar (Afternoon) Addis Ababa	-Meet Micro-franchising partners MF Group of youth, E4Y staff Gondar to Addis Ababa	East African Tiger Brands Youth with MF Rest
March 13 Monday	AA to Hossana (Morning)	Addis Ababa to Hossana -Meet with SNNPR E4Y project regional Coordinator (Regional progress report)	Project coordinator and E4Y Project staff
	Hossana (Afternoon)	-Discussion with Hossana town Project Steering Committee -FGD with VSLA	Members of Hossana PSC VSLA Members
March 14 Tuesday	Hossana (Morning)	-Meet with micro-franchising partners and MF youth -Discussion with Hossana Polytechnic College -Visit beneficiary youth enrolled in the TVET	Partners in MF Youth with MF College Dean and Instructors Beneficiary youth (Boys and Girls)
	Hossana (Afternoon)	-Visit self-employed and employed beneficiary youth -Visit employers/potential employers	Beneficiary youth (Boys and Girls) Employers
March 15 Wednesday	Damboya (Morning)	Travel to Damboya -Discussion with Woreda Project steering committee -FGD/Interview with beneficiary HHs and VSLA group members -Visit community dialogue groups and CPCs	Members of woreda PSC Beneficiary HHs VSLA group members Community dialogue participants Community dialogue facilitators
	Quacha Bira (Afternoon)	Travel to Quacha Bira -FGDs with E4Y beneficiary school students, youth with disabilities -Observe Boys Club Debate with other school -Visit school Club garden -Visit HH marginalized groups Q B to Hossana	Beneficiary youth (Boys and girls) Marginalized youth, youth with disability Members of boys and girls clubs Master mentors, Mentors Beneficiary HHs
March 16	Lemo (Morning)	Hosanna to Lemo	

Final Interim Evaluation Report of “Engaged, Educated, Empowerd Ethiopian Youth: E4Y”

Field Visit Dates	Place	Details of Activities	Participants
Thursday	Lemo (Afternoon)	-FGD with Masbira. school teachers, principals and school supervisors -FGD with beneficiary youth who are enrolled in formal education -Visit tutoring classroom, Boys and girls club, Rest room for girls -FGD with CPCs and community dialogue participants Lemo to Hossana	Teachers, principals and school cluster supervisors Beneficiary youth CPC members Community dialogue participants Community dialogue facilitators
March 17 Friday	Addis Ababa	Hossana to Addis	Finish up in Hossana and travel
March 18-19 Saturday Sunday	Addis Ababa	-FINAL FOLLOW-UP; Report compilation and preparation for stakeholders’ workshop -Meeting with US Embassy personnel	US Embassy person Vice Consul
March 20 Monday	Addis Ababa	-Briefing with project partners (MoLSA, IRC, CCL, UoG) World Vision Offices, Addis Ababa -Meeting with Univ. of Gondar representative	Representatives of MoLSA, IRC, CCL, UoG and project core team Univ. of Gondar representative
March 21 March 22	Addis Ababa Boston	Addis to Dubai Dubai to Boston	Evaluator

Annex C: List of Persons Interviewed

This page has been left intentionally blank in accordance with Federal Information Security Management Act (FISMA) of 2002, Public Law 107-347.

Annex D: Stakeholder Meeting Agenda And Participants

STAKEHOLDERS MEETING

REPORT ON PRELIMINARY FINDINGS OF MID-TERM EVALUATION OF E4Y PROJECT

20 March 2017

World Vision Ethiopia Offices, Addis Ababa

Stakeholder Meeting Agenda And Participants		
Time	Activity	Responsible
9:00	Arrival and Registration	All
9:15	Opening Remarks	World Vision
9:30	Introduction to Midterm evaluation	Evaluator – Lou Witherite
10:15 -10:30	Tea/Coffee Break	All
10:30 - 12:00	Presentation of findings Discussion	Evaluator – Lou Witherite All Participants
12:00	Closing	Samuel Sugamo

List of E4Y Midterm Evaluation Workshop Participants		
Name	Position	Organization
Assefa Eshete	Associate Director	WVE - Amhara RO
Tigist Teketel	Youth Livelihood Manager	IRC
Shewaye Tike	Child Youth Protection and Development Coordinator	IRC
Dejene Tessema	Labor Inspection team leader	MoLSA
Samuel Tilahun	Program Management and support team leader	WVE - HO
Adane Melese	E4Y - Education Specialist	WVE _Ho
Adam Tekeste	E4Y - Youth employment and livelihood Specialist - IRC	IRC
Temesgen Alemu	E4Y - Amhara Regional Coordinator	WVE - Amhara
Tsion Asmare	E4Y - Leadership specialist - CCL	CCL
Hannan Endale	E4Y - Social Protection Specialist	WVE - HO
Beleteshachew Aynalem	E4Y - M&E Officer	WVE - HO
Alex Whitney	Integrated Programs Director	WVE - HO
Yifokire Tefera	Professor - Gondar University	Gondar University
Tariku Dirbaba	E4Y - SNNP Regional Coordinator	WVE - SNNP
Tiblet Alemayehu	Assistant to social protection specialist	WVE - HO
Desta Elias	E4Y - Finance Manager	WVE - HO

Annex E: Key Evaluation Questions and Response Matrix

USDOL and the evaluator decided on specific questions to be answered in the course of the final evaluation. The answers are found on the page numbers listed next to the questions in the following chart. The subsequent data matrix identifies how data was collected and analyzed to answer the questions.

Evaluation Questions	Section and Page Number where addressed, and Supplemental Notes
<p>1. At midterm, is the project on track in terms of meeting its targets/objectives? Assess the factors contributing to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. delays, and how far behind are they in terms of target numbers and objectives; b. successes and challenges; c. impact of instability in the north: what impact is it having on project activities. 	<p>pp. 16, 27, 43 Unexpected locally-based unrest in Chilga caused delays in some project implementation, with no lingering effects. National unrest was mostly felt in the north, although the entire country was impacted. It hindered project activities nationally, especially with bans on meetings and free movement of staff, but the project is now on schedule.</p>
YOUTH EDUCATION & TRAINING	
<p>2. Assess project progress with achieving Outcome #1: increased retention and completion of formal schools by youth, especially females aged 14-17?</p> <p>3. Identify successes and challenges for working with a youth-aged population (14 – 17)? What has worked well, what could be improved?</p> <p>4. Are there specific trends or factors that lead to youth dropping out? Preventative measures, and what motivating measures</p> <p>5. Is the project addressing those areas?</p> <p>6. How is the learner-centered training methodology being applied?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. How are toolkits being distributed and utilized? b. Are youth and teachers receptive to the toolkits? c. What are some of the notable impacts? 	<p>Retention: pp. 18-21, 45, 51 pp. 17-25, 20, 43-44 Factors leading to dropping out and preventative measures: pp. 17, 19, 20-21, 29 E4Y project preventative and motivating measures: Summer camp, tutoring, uniforms, assistive devices, E4Y staff and local committee monitoring</p> <p>LCM and toolkits: pp. 18-2017, 30-32, 37-38, 45</p> <p>Notable impacts: pp. 29-30, 41</p>
DECENT WORK	
<p>7. Assess the vocational and apprenticeship training components of the projects strategy for targeting youth including retention strategies.</p>	<p>pp. 23-24, 26-41</p>
<p>8. Is the project implementing a “business in a box” or other strategy for supporting youth achieving long term and successful employment? Describe.</p>	<p>pp. 13, 29, 46 VSAY-creation, financial literacy, and Learn to Earn, a business and life skills training manual created by E4Y partner IRC</p>
<p>9. What strategies has the project used to engage youth</p>	<p>pp. 17-20, 29; Tutoring, school -readiness</p>

Evaluation Questions	Section and Page Number where addressed, and Supplemental Notes
as they transition into formal education?	program at summer camps
10. What are the employment prospects for youth graduating from TVET, vocational training and apprenticeships?	p. 41 PSC involved in helping graduate youths with kiosks; CoC
11. Are youth adequately prepared with the skills needed to enter decent jobs?	pp. 21-27, CoC
LIVELIHOODS	
12. How do household livelihood interventions impact youth?	22,27,38
13. Does the project have viable long term sustainability plans?	pp. 8, 38-40; Need exit strategy workshops; Highlights for sustainability: VSAY and VLSA
LEADERSHIP AND ENGAGEMENT IN COMMUNITIES	
14. What progress has been made to build leadership?	pp. 29-32
15. What effect have the summer camps had in helping direct and indirect beneficiary youth to exercise leadership capabilities and engagement in community works?	pp. 28-32 Highlights: Community mapping and community service projects
SOCIAL PROTECTION AND CAPACITY IMPROVEMENT	
16. What progress is being made towards achieving the project’s goals in social protection (Outcome #5 Social protection systems with improved capacity to address child labor)?	pp. 12, 32, 34, 37 Highlights: Referral Directory of Social Services , Birth Certificates
17. What progress has been made with MoLSA to increase awareness and understanding of OSH standards among local government stakeholders, business owners, and legally working children?	pp. 26,39
18. What progress is being made to establish two bylaws in two zones?	pp. 3, 25, 32-35, 39,
19. Are M&E systems in place sufficient to meet the needs of the project and DOL guidelines?	p.15
20. Is the DBMS system fully functioning?	p.15
21. Have the indicators developed helped to effectively monitor the implementation of the project?	pp. 12-13, 15-17,41-43
MARGINALIZED OR UNDERSERVED GROUPS	
22. What is the project doing to address the most marginalized populations?	pp. 39-40, 45-50 Sensitizing the population, teaching tolerance, enrolling affected children and providing assistive devices to YWD; aiding parents from ethnically marginalized groups.
23. What interventions target these groups specifically to ensure smooth transitions back to formal school environments?	pp. 19-21, 29-30 Summer Camps, Tutoring
24. What are some of the challenges or successes so far?	
25. The project targets girls as 50 per cent of its beneficiaries. Highlight successes and challenges, and specific interventions that have a gender focus.	pp. 16, 19-20, 31, 35-36 Intervention highlights Establishing menstrual hygiene rooms for girls in schools; TVET training;
26. What are specific barriers for girls identified by the	Leadership development

Evaluation Questions	Section and Page Number where addressed, and Supplemental Notes
project? Assess the activities specifically designed for girls to address these barriers.	The special attention paid to create space and special programs for girls has paid off, as school directors report that girls are having remarkably better attendance.
27. How does the project target disabled youth, and what types of social protections are being utilized for them? Are both physical and learning disabilities addressed in the project?	pp. 20-21, 45-50
PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION AND IMPACT	
28. What successes and challenges have there been in the two regions? What adjustments can be made? Are there differences in approaches in the two regions? If so, with what results?	pp. 10-11 While there are marked cultural differences, the economic situation of families and youth is similar. Both regions are dealing with high incidence of youth trafficking to areas outside the country (South Africa, Saudi Arabia, Middle East, Sudan) and to large towns and cities in the country. Both regions have similar deeply-rooted ethnic practices which negatively affect youth, girls, marginalized populations, children with disabilities. Clashes between ethnic groups also sometimes arise in both regions.
29. Are there considerations regarding project implementation effectiveness and efficiency which should be noted in the evaluation?	pp. 37, 46-47

Annex F: Terms of Reference

Terms of Reference Independent Interim Evaluaton Engaged, Educated and Empowered Ethiopian Youth (E4Y) Project

Background and Justification

The Office of Child Labor, Forced Labor, and Human Trafficking (OCFT) is an office within the Bureau of International Labor Affairs (ILAB), an agency of the U.S. Department of Labor (USDOL). OCFT activities include research on international child labor; supporting U.S. government policy on international child labor; administering and overseeing cooperative agreements with organizations working to eliminate child labor around the world; and raising awareness about child labor issues.

Since 1995, the U.S. Congress has appropriated over \$900 million to USDOL for efforts to combat exploitive child labor internationally. This funding has been used to support technical cooperation projects to combat exploitive child labor in more than 90 countries around the world. Technical cooperation projects funded by USDOL range from targeted action programs in specific sectors of work to more comprehensive programs that support national efforts to eliminate child labor. USDOL-funded child labor elimination projects generally seek to achieve five major goals:

Reducing exploitative child labor, especially the worst forms through the provision of direct educational services and by addressing root causes of child labor, including innovative strategies to promote sustainable livelihoods of target households; Strengthening policies on child labor, education, and sustainable livelihoods, and the capacity of national institutions to combat child labor, address its root causes, and promote formal, non-formal and vocational education opportunities to provide children with alternatives to child labor; Raising awareness of exploitative child labor and its root causes, and the importance of education for all children and mobilizing a wide array of actors to improve and expand education infrastructures; Supporting research, evaluation, and the collection of reliable data on child labor, its root causes, and effective strategies, including educational and vocational alternatives, microfinance and other income generating activities to improve household income; and Ensuring the long-term sustainability of these efforts.

USDOL-funded child labor elimination projects are designed to ensure that children in areas with a high incidence of child labor are withdrawn and integrated into educational settings, and that they persist in their education once enrolled. In parallel, the program seeks to avert at-risk children from leaving school and entering child labor. The projects are based on the notion that the elimination of exploitative child labor depends, to a large extent, on improving access to, quality of, and relevance of education. Without improving educational quality and relevance, children withdrawn/prevented from child labor may not have viable alternatives and could resort to other forms of hazardous work.

In FY 2010, Congress provided new authority to ILAB to expand activities related to income generating activities, including microfinance, to help projects expand income generation and address poverty more effectively. The addition of this livelihood focus is based on the premise that if adult family members have sustainable livelihoods, they will be less likely to have their dependent children work and more likely to keep them to school.

The approach of USDOL child labor elimination projects – decreasing the prevalence of exploitive child labor through increased access to education and improving the livelihoods of vulnerable families – is intended to nurture the development, health, safety, and enhanced future employability of children engaged in or at-risk of entering exploitive labor.

Project Context

A country with a rich history and culture, Ethiopia is located in the Horn of Africa.⁷² Its population of 99.4 million is the second highest in Africa, and the average annual growth rate is calculated at 2.5%.⁷³ It has a burgeoning youthful and young adult population; children under 15 years of age have accounted for more than a third of the total population for more than a decade.⁷⁴ One of the poorest countries in the world, Ethiopia ranks 174 out of 187 on the 2015 United Nations Development Program’s Human Development Index, which measures, among other things, life expectancy, education, and per capita income indicators.⁷⁵ According to UNICEF, quoting the Ethiopia Demographic and Health Survey of 2011, more than a quarter of all children between the ages of five and 14 are in the labor force. The survey also concludes that most children work for a family business.

Government of Ethiopia (GOE) programs have resulted in increased primary school attendance nationwide, but there continue to be obstacles related to education. Sexual abuse, harassment of girls, and traditional attitudes regarding early marriages and the value of girls learning are barriers to girls’ continued education.⁷⁶ For boys and girls leaving primary school in both rural and urban areas, there is less access to education and there are few opportunities for steady employment. Approximately 80% of Ethiopian youth are out of school and in the job market by age 15. The legal minimum age for work is 14 while the Minimum Age for Hazardous Work is 18 years.

The majority of Ethiopians live in rural areas and their main occupation is farming. The agricultural sector is the foundation of the economy, employing 80% of the population, and

⁷² World Bank, worldbank.org, country report on Ethiopia. The following other sources of information were used to compile this section (*Project Context*): World Bank 2016 at data.worldbank.org/country/ethiopia, African Economic Outlook 2016, BBC Country Profiles (www.bbc.com), CIA World Factbook on Ethiopia, Deloitte Ethiopia Economic Outlook 2016: The Story Behind the Numbers, and UNICEF/UNDP country information.

⁷³ Ibid. World Bank.

⁷⁴ DHS reported more than half were under 15 in 2005; in 2011 that figure was one-third.

⁷⁵ The UNDP *Human Development Report, Human Development Index, (HDI)*.

⁷⁶ USDOL ILAB Fact sheet of Ethiopia, at www.dol.gov/ilab/reports/child-labor/findings/2012TDA/ethiopia.pdf

accounting for approximately all but ten per cent of the country’s exports.⁷⁷ Children and youth under age 17 often become engaged in farming and floriculture. Other areas of labor in which youth become involved throughout the country include fishing, domestic service, traditional weaving, prostitution, portage, construction, small-scale manufacturing, domestic work and some prostitution. The allure of finding work away from home has resulted in many vulnerable youth being trafficked.⁷⁸

The GOE, working with UN agencies, NGOs, and USDOL has addressed child labor issues for many years, and has seen some significant successes in its policy development and national awareness concerning both child labor and trafficking.

Project Specific Information

In December 2014, World Vision was awarded a four-year cooperative agreement grant of USD \$10 million from the USDOL’s Office of Child Labor, Forced Labor, and Human Trafficking (OCFT) to implement the Engaged, Educated, Empowered, Ethiopian Youth (E4Y) project.⁷⁹ Working in two regions, Amhara and the Southern Nations, Nationalities, and Peoples’ Region (SNNPR), E4Y aims to address exploitative child labor in Ethiopia by promoting education and vocational training opportunities, enhancing livelihood opportunities, and strengthening access to social protection programs for youth and their households.

World Vision and its partners implement the E4Y project. These include (a) sub-grantees: International Rescue Committee (IRC) and the Center for Creative Leadership (CCL); (b) research partner: University of Gondar; and (c) service providers: Techno Brain, BCaD, Vision Fund Ethiopia (VFE). The project also works closely with government ministries and services at all administrative levels. Non-governmental Stakeholders include trade unions, employer agencies, international organizations, and local youth organizations.

The E4Y project will target 12,000 Ethiopian male and female youth, both in school and out of school, who are between the ages of 14 and 17 in both target regions. Of the youth targeted, 54% will be girls and at least 400 of the targeted beneficiaries will have disabilities.⁸⁰ Nearly all children with disabilities, regardless of the potential impact on their education, are out of school by the age of 14. An additional 10,000 youth will receive indirect support through activities such as summer camps, school clubs and youth groups. The project aims to assist youth 14-17 develop marketable skills to secure decent work and serve as community leaders. Of the target group, 2,500 youth will be targeted for training in business start-up and entrepreneurship. The E4Y project will also provide 7,500 households with livelihood and income-generating activities

⁷⁷ Ibid. World Bank.

⁷⁸ 2015 Findings on the Worst Forms of Child Labor, <https://www.dol.gov/sites/default/files/documents/ilab/reports/child-labor/findings/2015TDA.pdf>. Also, the draft E4Y project document.

⁷⁹ Information in this section (*Project Specific Information*), was mostly derived from the draft E4Y project document provided by USDOL and World Vision website and promotional materials obtained by the evaluator.

⁸⁰ According to the draft E4Y project document compiled by World Vision, nearly all children with disabilities, regardless of the potential impact on their education, are out of school by the age of 14.

through participation in local savings and loan groups, microfinances services, and financial literacy training. Households will also receive training and inputs to improve agricultural methods as a means to increase their incomes. As of March 31, 2016, the project has provided education or vocational services to 6,392 children; livelihood services to 3,031 households.⁸¹

E4Y project activities include awareness raising, social protection of children, vocational training center support, and strengthening institutional capacity and policies. E4Y aims to utilize community conversations to promote positive behavior change. The project works with partners to operationalize a database and monitoring system that can track the use of child labor.

With an overall goal to reduce child labor among youth aged 14-17, especially among girls in target regions of Ethiopia, the project has the following objectives:

1. Increased retention and completion of formal school by youth, especially females
2. Improved access to acceptable and decent work opportunities for target youth.
3. Improved livelihoods for target households
4. Increased engagement and leadership opportunities for youth on issues affecting their communities and their future
5. Social protection systems with improved capacity to address child labor

Purpose and Scope of Evaluation

The main purposes of the mid-term evaluation are:

- To review the on-going progress and performance of the Project (extent to which immediate objectives and outputs are being achieved),
- To examine the likelihood of the Project achieving its objectives and targets,
- Identify ways to improve delivery and enhance coordination with key stakeholders,
- To identify promising practices and ways to promote their sustainability.

The midterm evaluation should provide key stakeholders with information to assess and revise, as it is needed; work plans, strategies, objectives, partnership arrangements and resources.

Intended Users

The evaluation will provide OCFT, the grantee, other project stakeholders, and stakeholders working to combat child labor more broadly, an assessment of the project’s experience in implementation, its effects on project beneficiaries, and an understanding of the factors driving the project results. The evaluation findings, conclusions and recommendations will serve to

⁸¹ USDOL Technical Cooperation Project Summary Project

inform any project adjustments that may need to be made, and to inform stakeholders in the design and implementation of subsequent phases or future child labor elimination projects as appropriate. The evaluation report will be published on the USDOL website, so the report should be written as a standalone document, providing the necessary background information for readers who are unfamiliar with the details of the project.

Evaluation Questions

1. At midterm, is the project on track in terms of meeting its targets/objectives? Assess the factors contributing to:
 - delays, and how far behind are they in terms of target numbers and objectives;
 - successes and challenges;
 - impact of instability in the north: what impact is it having on project activities.

YOUTH EDUCATION & TRAINING

2. Assess project progress with achieving Outcome #1: increased retention and completion of formal schools by youth, especially females aged 14-17?
3. Identify successes and challenges for working with a youth-aged population (14 – 17)? What has worked well, what could be improved?
4. Are there specific trends or factors that lead to youth dropping out? Preventative measures, and what motivating measures
5. Is the project addressing those areas?
6. How is the teacher-centered training methodology being applied?
7. How are toolkits being distributed and utilized?
8. Are youth and teachers receptive to the toolkits?
9. What are some of the notable impacts?

DECENT WORK

10. Assess the vocational and apprenticeship training components of the projects strategy for targeting youth including retention strategies.
11. Is the project implementing a “business in a box” or other strategy for supporting youth achieving long term and successful employment? Describe.
12. What strategies has the project used to engage youth as they transition into formal education?
13. What are the employment prospects for youth graduating from TVET, vocational training and apprenticeships?
14. Are youth adequately prepared with the skills needed to enter decent jobs?

LIVELIHOODS

15. How do household livelihood interventions impact youth?
16. Does the project have viable long term sustainability plans?

LEADERSHIP AND ENGAGEMENT IN COMMUNITIES

17. What progress has been made to build leadership?
18. What effect have the summer camps had in helping direct and indirect beneficiary youth to exercise leadership capabilities and engagement in community works?

SOCIAL PROTECTION AND CAPACITY IMPROVEMENT

19. What progress is being made towards achieving the project’s goals in social protection (Outcome #5 Social protection systems with improved capacity to address child labor)?
20. What progress has been made with MoLSA to increase awareness and understanding of OSH standards among local government stakeholders, business owners, and legally working children?
21. What progress is being made to establish two bylaws in two zones?
22. Are M&E systems in place sufficient to meet the needs of the project and DOL guidelines?
23. Is the DBMS system fully functioning?
24. Have the indicators developed helped to effectively monitor the implementation of the project?

MARGINALIZED OR UNDERSERVED GROUPS

25. What is the project doing to address the most marginalized populations?
26. What interventions target these groups specifically to ensure smooth transitions back to formal school environments?
27. What are some of the challenges or successes so far?
28. The project targets girls as 50 per cent of its beneficiaries. Highlight successes and challenges, and specific interventions that have a gender focus.
29. What are specific barriers for girls identified by the project? Assess the activities specifically designed for girls to address these barriers.
30. How does the project target disabled youth, and what types of social protections are being utilized for them? Are both physical and learning disabilities addressed in the project?

PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION AND IMPACT

31. What successes and challenges have there been in the two regions? What adjustments can be made? Are there differences in approaches in the two regions? If so, with what results?
32. Are there considerations regarding project implementation effectiveness and efficiency, which should be noted in the evaluation?

Evaluation Methodology and Timeframe

The evaluation methodology will consist of the following activities and approaches:

Approach

The evaluation approach will be qualitative and participatory in nature, and use project documents including CMEP data to provide quantitative information. Qualitative information will be obtained through field visits, interviews and focus groups as appropriate. Opinions coming from beneficiaries (teachers, parents and children) will improve and clarify the use of quantitative analysis. The participatory nature of the evaluation will contribute to the sense of ownership among beneficiaries.

Quantitative data will be drawn from the CMEP and project reports to the extent that it is available and incorporated in the analysis. The evaluation approach will be independent in terms of the membership of the evaluation team. Project staff and implementing partners will generally only be present in meetings with stakeholders, communities, and beneficiaries to provide introductions. The following additional principles will be applied during the evaluation process:

Methods of data collection and stakeholder perspectives will be triangulated for as many as possible of the evaluation questions. Efforts will be made to include parents’ and children’s voices and beneficiary participation generally, using child-sensitive approaches to interviewing children following the ILO-IPEC guidelines on research with children on the worst forms of child labor (<http://www.ilo.org/ipeinfo/product/viewProduct.do?productId=3026>) and UNICEF Principles for Ethical Reporting on Children (http://www.unicef.org/media/media_tools_guidelines.html). Gender and cultural sensitivity will be integrated in the evaluation approach. Consultations will incorporate a degree of flexibility to maintain a sense of ownership of the stakeholders and beneficiaries, allowing additional questions to be posed that are not included in the TOR, whilst ensuring that key information requirements are met. As far as possible, a consistent approach will be followed in each project site, with adjustments made for the different actors involved, activities conducted, and the progress of implementation in each locality.

B. Evaluation Team

The evaluation team will consist of the international evaluator. As appropriate an interpreter fluent in necessary languages will travel with the evaluator. One member of the project staff may travel with the team to make introductions. This person is not involved in the evaluation process.

The international evaluator will be responsible for developing the methodology in consultation with (Contractor), USDOL, and the project staff; assigning the tasks of the national consultant and interpreter for the field work; directly conducting interviews and facilitating other data collection processes; analysis of the evaluation material gathered; presenting feedback on the initial findings of the evaluation to the national stakeholder meeting and preparing the evaluation report.

The responsibility of the interpreter in each provincial locality is to ensure that the evaluation team is understood by the stakeholders as far as possible, and that the information gathered is relayed accurately to the evaluator.

C. Data Collection Methodology

Document Review

Pre-field visit preparation includes extensive review of relevant documents. During fieldwork, documentation will be verified and additional documents may be collected. Documents may include:

- CMEP documents
- Baseline and endline survey reports
- Project document and revisions,
- Cooperative Agreement,
- Technical Progress and Status Reports,
- Project Results Frameworks and Monitoring Plans,
- Work plans,
- Correspondence related to Technical Progress Reports,
- Management Procedures and Guidelines,
- Research or other reports undertaken (baseline studies, etc.), and
- Project files (including school records) as appropriate.

Question Matrix

Before beginning fieldwork, the evaluator will create a question matrix, which outlines the source of data from where the evaluator plans to collect information for each TOR question. This will help the evaluator make decisions as to how they are going to allocate their time in the field. It will also help the evaluator to ensure that they are exploring all possible avenues for data triangulation and to clearly note where their evaluation findings are coming from. The Contractor will share the question matrix with USDOL.

Interviews with stakeholders

Informational interviews will be held with as many project stakeholders as possible. The evaluation team will solicit the opinions of children, community members in areas where awareness-raising activities occurred, parents of beneficiaries, teachers, government representatives, legal authorities, union and NGO officials, the action program implementers, and program staff regarding the project's accomplishments, program design, sustainability, and the working relationship between project staff and their partners, where appropriate.

Depending on the circumstances, these meetings will be one-on-one or group interviews. Technically, stakeholders are all those who have an interest in a project, for example, as implementers, direct and indirect beneficiaries, community leaders, donors, and government officials. Thus, it is anticipated that meetings will be held with:

- OCFT staff responsible for this evaluation and project prior to the commencement of the field work

- Implementers at all levels, including child labor monitors involved in assessing whether children have been effectively prevented or withdrawn from child labor situations
- Headquarters, Country Director, Project Managers, and Field Staff of Grantee and Partner Organizations
- Government Ministry Officials and Local Government Officials who have been involved in or are knowledgeable about the project
- Community leaders, members, and volunteers
- School teachers, assistants, school directors, education personnel
- Project beneficiaries (children withdrawn and prevented and their parents)
- International NGOs and multilateral agencies working in the area
- Other child protection and/or education organizations, committees and experts in the area
- U.S. Embassy staff member

Field Visits

The evaluator will visit a selection of project sites. The final selection of field sites to be visited will be made by the evaluator. Every effort should be made to include some sites where the project experienced successes and others that encountered challenges, as well as a good cross section of sites across targeted CL sectors. During the visits, the evaluator will observe the activities and outputs developed by the project. Focus groups with children and parents will be held, and interviews will be conducted with representatives from local governments, NGOs, community leaders and teachers.

Ethical Considerations and Confidentiality

The evaluation mission will observe utmost confidentiality related to sensitive information and feedback elicited during the individual and group interviews. To mitigate bias during the data collection process and ensure a maximum freedom of expression of the implementing partners, stakeholders, communities, and beneficiaries, implementing partner staff will generally not be present during interviews. However, implementing partner staff may accompany the evaluator to make introductions whenever necessary, to facilitate the evaluation process, make respondents feel comfortable, and to allow the evaluator to observe the interaction between the implementing partner staff and the interviewees.

Stakeholder Meeting

Following the field visits, a stakeholders meeting will be conducted by the evaluator that brings together a wide range of stakeholders, including the implementing partners and other interested parties. The list of participants to be invited will be drafted prior to the evaluator’s visit and confirmed in consultation with project staff during fieldwork.

The meeting will be used to present the major preliminary findings and emerging issues, solicit recommendations, and obtain clarification or additional information from stakeholders, including those not interviewed earlier. The agenda of the meeting will be determined by the evaluator in consultation with project staff. Some specific questions for stakeholders may be prepared to guide the discussion and possibly a brief written feedback form.

The agenda is expected to include some of the following items:

- Presentation by the evaluator of the preliminary main findings
- Feedback and questions from stakeholders on the findings
- Opportunity for implementing partners not met to present their views on progress and challenges in their locality
- If appropriate, Possible Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities and Threats (SWOT) exercise on the project’s performance
- Discussion of recommendations to improve the implementation and ensure sustainability. Consideration will be given to the value of distributing a feedback form for participants to nominate their “action priorities” for the remainder of the project.

A debrief call will be held with the evaluator and USDOL after the stakeholder workshop to provide USDOL with preliminary findings and solicit feedback as needed.

Limitations

Fieldwork for the evaluation will last two weeks, on average, and the evaluator will not have enough time to visit all project sites. As a result, the evaluator will not be able to take all sites into consideration when formulating their findings. All efforts will be made to ensure that the evaluator is visiting a representative sample of sites, including some that have performed well and some that have experienced challenges.

This is not a formal impact assessment. Findings for the evaluation will be based on information collected from background documents and in interviews with stakeholders, project staff, and beneficiaries. The accuracy of the evaluation findings will be determined by the integrity of information provided to the evaluator from these sources.

Furthermore, the ability of the evaluator to determine efficiency will be limited by the amount of financial data available. A cost-efficiency analysis is not included because it would require impact data which is not available.

Timetable

The tentative timetable is as follows. Actual dates may be adjusted as needs arise.

Task	Date
Evaluation launch call	
Background project documents sent to Contractor	
Email OCFT with CVs of 2 proposed evaluator candidates	
Evaluation purpose and questions submitted to Contractor	
Logistics call-Discuss logistics and field itinerary	2/10
Contractor sends minutes from logistics call	
Evaluator selected	
Draft TOR sent to OCFT	

Task	Date
Identify a list of stakeholders	
Finalize field itinerary and stakeholder list for workshop	
Cable clearance information submitted to USDOL	
Finalize TOR with USDOL and submit to Grantee	
Interview call with USDOL & Project Staff	2/13
Fieldwork	
Post-fieldwork debrief call	
Draft report to contractor for Quality Control review	
Draft report to USDOL & Grantee for 48 hour review	
Comments due to Contractor	
Report revised and sent to Contractor	
Revised report to USDOL	
USDOL and stakeholder comments after full 2-week review	
Final report to USDOL	
Final approval of report	
Editing	
508 compliance review	
Final edited report to COR	
Final edited report to grantee and stakeholders	

Expected Outputs/Deliverables

Ten working days following the evaluator’s return from fieldwork, a first draft evaluation report will be submitted to the Contractor. The report should have the following structure and content:

- Table of Contents
- List of Acronyms
- Executive Summary
- Evaluation Objectives and Methodology
- Project Description
- Evaluation Questions
 - Answers to each of the evaluation questions, with supporting evidence included
- Findings, Recommendations and Conclusions
 - Findings – the facts, with supporting evidence
 - Conclusions – interpretation of the facts, including criteria for judgments
 - Key Recommendations - critical for successfully meeting project objectives – judgments on what changes need to be made for future programming
- Lessons Learned and Best Practices
- Annexes - including list of documents reviewed; interviews/meetings/site visits; stakeholder workshop agenda and participants; TOR; etc.

The total length of the report should be approximately 30 pages for the main report, excluding the executive summary and annexes.

The first draft of the report will be circulated to OCFT and key stakeholders individually for their review. Comments from stakeholders will be consolidated and incorporated into the final reports as appropriate, and the evaluator will provide a response to OCFT, in the form of a comment matrix, as to why any comments might not have been incorporated.

While the substantive content of the findings, conclusions, and recommendations of the report shall be determined by the evaluator, the report is subject to final approval by ILAB/OCFT in terms of whether or not the report meets the conditions of the TOR.

Evaluation Management and Support

The Contractor will be responsible for Evaluation Management and Support.