

**THE PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOUR IN HAZARDOUS  
WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND  
FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
CMB/01/P51/USA**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION  
JUNE 2003**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION FINAL REPORT**

by

Rebecca F. Catalla, Ph.D., Rafael Norberto F. Catalla  
& Khlok Seima\*

---

\* Consultants are affiliated with *JBJ Consulting, Inc.* - Philippines, with local address at #11A, Street 29, Chamcar Mon, Phnom Penh, Cambodia.

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>Executive Summary .....</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>Evaluation Background .....</b>	<b>3</b>
PROJECT BACKGROUND .....	3
SCOPE AND PURPOSE OF THE EVALUATION .....	4
EVALUATION METHODS .....	4
LIMITATIONS OF THE EVALUATION .....	6
<b>SPECIFIC ASPECTS ADDRESSED BY THE EVALUATION .....</b>	<b>7</b>
PROGRAM DESIGN .....	7
Program Strategies .....	7
Identification of Beneficiaries .....	8
Project Indicators .....	8
EFFECTIVENESS .....	9
Assessment of Start-up Phase .....	9
Review of Delivery Modes .....	14
Project Responses to Difficulties .....	14
Project Progress against Project WorkPlan .....	14
Project Technical and Administrative Guidance .....	22
Factors Affecting Implementation .....	27
Extent of Achievement of Immediate Objectives .....	30
EFFICIENCY .....	32
PROJECT SUSTAINABILITY .....	33
Sustaining Mechanisms .....	33
Project Progress .....	33
Concerns that should be addressed .....	34
Other Possible Improvements .....	34
Sub-cultural concerns .....	34
Stakeholders Ideas and Suggestions to promote the sustainability of the program: .....	35
Program Thrust in the Succeeding Phase in Relation to Project Sustainability and Impact .....	36
SPECIAL CONCERNS ADDRESSED BY THE EVALUATION .....	37
Sector-Based Strategies .....	37
Facilitating/Hindering Factors in Project Implementation Across Sectors .....	37
Assessment of local committees for child labor (PCCL/MCCL) .....	39
Child Labor and OHS Monitoring Mechanism .....	40
Strategy for mobilizing NGOs .....	41
Government Commitment .....	41
Legislative Measures .....	42
Project Linkages .....	43
Gender Mainstreaming .....	43
<b>Conclusions and Recommendations .....</b>	<b>45</b>
STRENGTHS OF THE PROGRAM .....	48
GAPS IN IMPLEMENTATION .....	49
RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE REMAINING PERIOD OF THE PROJECT .....	49
Policy, Program Planning and Research .....	49
Capacity-building of Implementing Agencies .....	50
Social Protection and Community Monitoring .....	50
Strategies to address gaps in program implementation in the sectors .....	51
Management and Coordination Measures .....	51

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

**LIST OF TABLES**

Table 1. Program Areas of Intervention and Implementing Measures	10
Table 2. Training Conducted for Stakeholders	14
Table 3. Status of Completion- MoSALVY Action Program	15
Table 4. Status of Accomplishmentss of Sector Action Programs	16
Table 5. Program Components and Progress	22
Table 6. Institutional Arrangements - Sector-level	25
Table 7. Composition and Role of the Local Committees on Child Labor	39

**LIST OF ANNEXES**

Annex 1. Terms of Reference	54
Annex 2. Indicators of Achievement	65
Annex 3. Baseline Survey Instruments	75
Annex 4. Overall Project Targets and Accomplishments	92
Annex 5. Immediate Objectives & Preparatory Activities for Outputs	97
Annex 6. Project Coordination	186
Annex 7. External Factors	188
Annex 8. Checklists for Self-Monitoring and Assessment on OHS	189
Annex 9a. Guidelines On Prevention/Elimination Of Child Labor In Hazardous Works (SALT SECTOR)	200
Annex 9b. Guidelines On Prevention/Elimination Of Child Labor In Hazardous Works (FISHING SECTOR)	207
Annex 9a. Guidelines On Prevention/Elimination Of Child Labor In Hazardous Works (RUBBER SECTOR)	212

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

**ACRONYMS**

ACLEDA	- Association of Cambodian Local Economic Development Agency
ADHOC	- Cambodian Human Rights and Development Association
AP	- Action Program
APSO	- Action Program Service Outline
CAS	- Center for Advanced Study
CCBO	- Catholic Child Bureau Organization
CCPCR	- Cambodian Center for the Protection of Children's Rights
CL	- Child Labor
CLC	- Community Learning Center
CLM	- Child Labor Monitoring
CLU	- Child Labor Unit (MoSALVY)
GO	- Government Organization
IA	- Implementing Agency
ILO	- International Labour Organization
IPEC	- International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labor
KTO	- Kak Sekor Thmey Organization
KWCD	- Khmer Women's Development Association of Cambodia
LAC	- Labor Advisory Council
LICADHO	- Cambodian League for Promotion and Defense of Human Rights
MCCL	- Municipal Committee on Child Labor
MDEYS	- Municipal Department of Education, Youth and Sport
MDSALVY	- Municipal Department of Social Affairs, Labor, Vocational Training and Youth Rehabilitation
MoSALVY	- Ministry of Social Affairs, Labor, Vocational Training and Youth Rehabilitation
NFE	- Non-Formal Education
NGO	- Non-Government Organization
NPM	- National Program Management
NSC	- National Sub-Committee on Child Labor and Other Forms of Commercial Exploitation
OHS	- Occupational Health and Safety
OSY	- Out of School Youth
PAC	- Provincial Advisory Committee
PCCL	- Provincial Committee on Child Labor
PDEYS	- Provincial Department of Education, Youth and Sport
PDSALVY	- Provincial Department of Social Affairs, Labor, Vocational Training and Youth Rehabilitation
RHAC	- Reproductive Health Association of Cambodia
SHG	- Self-Help Group

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

SPC	- Sector Project Coordinator
TNA	- Training Needs Analysis
TOR	- Terms of Reference
WG-CL	- Working Group for Child Labor

## Executive Summary

The International Labour Organization-International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (ILO-IPEC) is currently implementing the Project to Combat Child Labor in Hazardous Work in Salt Production, Rubber Plantation and Fishing Sectors in Cambodia. The development objective is to contribute to the progressive elimination of child labor in the 3 sectors by removing children from hazardous employment and working conditions and preventing more children from entering workplaces through direct assistance and capacity building programs.

The project intends to reach approximately 3,500 working children through direct action programs. Some 900 of these children will be removed from hazardous work and its conditions. Some 2,600 working children, on the other hand, will be prevented from moving into hazardous work considered as the worst forms of child labor. It also aims to heighten the capacity of national and community level agencies and organizations in Cambodia to plan, initiate, implement and evaluate action to prevent and progressively eliminate child labor, especially those in hazardous work situations. The strategies to be employed are: policy, program planning, research and documentation; capacity building; targeted social protection; and, community empowerment and community-based child labor monitoring.

The project started in November 2001 and is expected to run for 30 months. It has now completed six preparatory activities towards this objective and has begun 10 action programs in the three sectors and at the national level.

This review serves as a mid-term evaluation of the project. It serves as a management and learning tool for project management and key stakeholders, as an information base by which stakeholders can assess the achievements made and possibly revise work plans, strategies, objectives, partnership arrangements and resource allocation and recommendations for the way forward, as a review mechanism on external factors affecting project implementation and on necessary inputs that may be required for project success. It also aims to address over-all ILO evaluation concerns on project relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability, and behavior changes among the stakeholders and beneficiaries.

The evaluation noted considerable progress in Social Protection Measures through educational services and incentives for families to send children to school, child and OHS monitoring, capacity building of implementing partners, and the establishment of local committees. Project backlog was in the formulation of national policies and laws to support local action plans on child labor.

The project has invested a lot of time in establishing program linkages and structures for implementing partners, mobilizing staff and resources, setting benchmark and workplans

***FINAL REPORT:***

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

such that delivery of services were made mainly in the last two quarters. Catch-up plans focused more on ensuring quality of services rather than quantitative targets may be necessary.

The significant concerns that must be addressed to ensure sustainability of initial efforts relates to policy-development at the national and local level, and enhancing social protection through more viable non-formal and skills training activities geared towards market demands and local economic prospects. The project could also benefit from a thorough analysis of viable enterprises for SHG and improvement and sustained awareness-raising to commit community participation to sustain the program.

Program administration needs to be enhanced in relation to resource allocation, documentation of implementation processes, and strategizing with partners for difficult-sectors. Technical support should be enhanced for policy-development and for broadening support groups.

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

evaluation background

*Project Background*

The salt production (SP), rubber plantations (RP), and fishing/shrimp processing (FSP) sectors in Cambodia represent the economic sectors where, very visibly, children and youth are engaged in exploitative and hazardous child labor. These three sectors are the targets for concerted action by the ILO-IPEC funded Project to Combat Child Labor in Hazardous Work in the country.

The project is made up of four different components: Policy, Program Planning, Research and Documentation; Capacity Building; Targeted Social Protection (direct action); and Community Empowerment and Community-based Child Labor Monitoring Schemes. Its development objective is to contribute to the progressive elimination of child labor in the salt, rubber and fishing sectors in Cambodia by removing children from hazardous employment and working conditions and preventing more children from entering workplaces through direct assistance and capacity building programs. The project intends to reach approximately 3,500 working children through direct action programs.

The immediate objectives are two-fold:

*Immediate Objective 1:* At the end of the program, the capacity of national and community level agencies and organizations in Cambodia will have been strengthened to plan, initiate, implement and evaluate action to prevent and progressively eliminate child labor, especially those in hazardous work situations.

*Immediate Objective 2:* At the end of the project, an estimated 900<sup>1</sup> working children in salt production in Kampot province, rubber plantations in Kampong Cham, and fishing/shrimp processing industry in Sihanoukville Municipality will have been removed from hazardous employment and working conditions; and 2,600<sup>2</sup> working children will be prevented from moving into hazardous work considered as the worst forms of child labor in the same locations.

Thus far, the project has carried out:

- a national seminar on child labor in the salt production, fishing and rubber plantation where action plans have been recommended for addressing child labor in the three sectors (November 28-29, 2001)
- a profiling of working children in the three sectors. Consisting of rapid assessments and baseline surveys, the findings were presented to the provincial committees on child labor in the three respective provinces and gained feedback on how to effectively address those problems (December 2001 to June 2002).
- a training activity on project design, management and evaluation among the 10 intended implementing agencies (June 2002).
- a training workshop on capacity building for non-formal educators from provincial education offices and NGOs in the three provinces was held (August 2002).

---

<sup>1</sup> Salt sector at 300 working children; fishing sector at 400 working children; and rubber sector at 200 working children.

<sup>2</sup> Salt sector at 600 part-time working children; fishing sector at 1,250 part-time working children; and, rubber sector at 750 part-time working children.

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

- capacity building and enhancing among implementing partners to effectively run income generating/seed money activities (February 13-15, 2003).
- the revision and printing, as well as the conduct of training on and dissemination of a child labor advocacy kit to help combating child labor in the three hazardous sectors (February 2003).

The project started on November 1, 2001 and is expected to run for 30 months. Ten (10) action programs are being implemented to date<sup>3</sup>, the first two APs of which commenced implementation in September 2002.

The present evaluation serves as the mid-term evaluation stipulated in the project document. Following the participatory process stipulated in the IPEC evaluation process, all key stakeholders were consulted in developing the present Terms of Reference (**Annex 1**). Content focus of the Terms of Reference resulted from discussions with the donor, project management and the ILO/IPEC Design, Evaluation and Database Unit. Also based on consultations with key stakeholders and taking into account that two out of the three sectors had not started its activities at the time of the scheduled evaluation in November 2002, the mid-term evaluation had been re-set to April-May 2003.

*Scope and Purpose of the Evaluation*

The evaluation covers the start-up phase of the project as well as project activities that have taken place to date in the three sectors and at the national level (MoSALVY).

As it is too early to assess impact, this mid-term evaluation aims:

- To serve as management and learning tool for the project management team as well as other key stakeholders. These include lessons learnt and good practices identified to date, highlighting successes to be maintained and/or replicated in the rest of this phase and in future possible phase.
- To provide all stakeholders with the information needed to assess the achievements made thus far and possibly revise work plans, strategies, objectives, partnership arrangements and resource allocation as well as to provide recommendations for the way forward.
- To review external factors (if any) that may not have been taken into account at the time of project formulation which requires project attention or adjustments.
- To assess what supplementary inputs, that project may need in reaching the project objectives for the rest of this phase and in reaching the development objective in eliminating worst forms of child labor in the three sectors.
- To address the overall ILO evaluation concerns such as relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability, behavior changes among the stakeholders and beneficiaries.

*Evaluation Methods*

As suggested in the Terms of Reference, the following methods were utilized to obtain a good understanding of the Project and of the ongoing action programs.

---

<sup>3</sup> Salt sector (3 APs), fishing sector (3 APs), rubber sector (3 APs), and at national level (1 AP).



**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

- A review of all materials and documents pertaining to or related to the 10 action programs being implemented in the salt, fishing, and rubber plantation sector and in the national level. This included program documents of each AP including their workplans, available progress reports, minutes of trainings/seminars/workshops in building the capacities of staff of the implementing agencies/partners;
- Interviews with key staff of the implementing agencies, with members of provincial/municipal committees on child labor (P/MCCL), with key stakeholders (employers), with targeted beneficiaries and their parents, and discussions with the Sector Coordinators (SPCs) and the NPM; and
- Observations and informal exchanges during site visits to the target communes and villages in the salt (Kampot Province), fishing (Municipality of Sihanoukville), and rubber plantation (Kampong Cham Province) sectors.

Quantitative and qualitative data provide the picture for the ongoing action programs in all three sectors. In addition to drawing upon the specified data collection methods noted above, information from related publications and studies, as well as the results of the 3 sectoral workshops held from May 12-14, 2003 provide the basis for the discussions in the report. A listing of information sources is attached to this Report.

*Review of project documents*

At the outset of the mid-term evaluation work, the ILO-IPEC- National Program Manager (NPM) provided the evaluation team with project documents<sup>4</sup>, namely:

- The Master Project Document (Project Proposal)
- List of all on-going Action Programs and Service Agreements
- All Action Programs of Implementing Agencies and Partners, including their respective workplans
- Action Program of the MoSALVY and its workplan
- Service Agreements
- First Technical Progress Reports of Several IAs
- Technical Progress Reports, Dec. 2001 to Mar. 2003
- Minutes, proceedings, and other documentations of:
  - the National Seminar on Child Labor in the Salt Production, Fishing, and Rubber Plantation Sectors of Cambodia
  - Training Workshop on Occupational Health and Safety (OHS) for Child Labor Monitors in Hazardous Occupation
  - Training Workshop on Child Labor Monitoring (Draft)
  - Training Workshop on Community Savings and Small Business Strategy to Help Combat Child Labor in Hazardous Sectors (Draft)
  - the Training Workshop on Project Design, Management and Evaluation of Action Program on Child Labor in Hazardous Sectors of Cambodia
  - The Training Workshop on Project Training Course of Using of Non-Formal Primary Curriculum for Working and Out-of-School Children
  - Occupational Health and Safety (OHS) Publication (Draft)

---

<sup>4</sup> Project documents were forwarded to the evaluation team March 20, 2003.

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

The NPM likewise gave the team a half-day project briefing on March 24, 2003. Copies of his presentation documents were given to the evaluation team.

*Interviews and Observations*

The evaluation team visited and held the interviews and exchanges in the 9 target communes of the 3 project sectors. The interviews proceeded from pre-formulated guide questions (attached to the background reports), with probe questions being employed to clarify responses. Generally, the interviews took place as group discussions<sup>5</sup>. That is, target respondents (e.g. parents, SHG members, community monitors) sat in front of the evaluation team while they were being interviewed one at a time. To enhance data gathering, discussions were frequent with the Project Coordinators and the Sector Coordinator especially in relation to the work plans and program targets and outputs. The Sector Coordinator and Project Coordinators were present in almost all interviews and meetings. The interview results per sector are attached in the individual background reports for each sector.

*Limitations of the Evaluation*

Time was the main limitation in the evaluation work. Visits to the program areas/ sites and exchanges with implementers and beneficiaries were effectively on for 3 days<sup>6</sup>. Because of this, some of the interviews had to be conducted in the form of group discussions where several respondents were interviewed at the same time<sup>7</sup>. Questions then were sometimes repetitive and a few respondents tended to repeat what they earlier heard. There were instances where the responses resulted from reminders and suggestions from the program implementing staff (who accompanied the evaluation team) and from other people who were present during the interviews.

The latest available periodic progress reports of the action programs were prepared January 2003, and necessarily reflect the project progress in the subsequent two months. Considerable time therefore was spent with project coordinators for a discussion of the actual status of program work-plan and outputs.

It should also be noted that some information obtained in the field were not consistent with those from the SPCs. Further, problems and issues raised during field interviews were contradicted or became trivial information during the workshops. Additional requests for certain data summaries (e.g., best practices) and more in-depth analyses of specific issues (e.g., gender concerns such as changes in workloads in the home, impact of beneficiary involvements on gender relations) were also not accommodated given the limited information and the extremely limited time allocated for this work.

---

<sup>5</sup> Sector Coordinator with Project Coordinators requested target respondents to be present at the CLCs during the time of visit by the research team. Prior to field visit, a copy of the guide questions was furnished to ILO-IPEC.

<sup>6</sup> Factoring in travel time (to and from and within project sites) and time allotted for translations.

<sup>7</sup> This arrangement was proposed by the Sector Coordinator in order for the Research Team to meet more stakeholders.

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

specific aspects addressed by the evaluation

*Program Design*Program Strategies

The program aims to strengthen national and local level capacity to address work by children in hazardous and harmful situations. The program focus is on a) creating the enabling conditions that allow action on children in hazardous sectors, such as policy reform; b) raising the capability of key stakeholders; c) demonstrate how children can be removed and prevented from hazardous work.

The basis for the project remains sound and relevant. The baseline studies on the salt, fishing and rubber sectors verified the continuing engagement of children in various forms of hazardous labor. The protective legislation, which would deter various enterprises from taking on child workers, is not as yet in place. There is a continuing lack of educational support mechanisms (e.g., skills training programs within enterprises, study-now-pay later programs, enterprise scholarship programs and in-house training within the enterprises) which complement ongoing responses to the issues of child labor.

The involvement of stakeholders (government, employers, workers and NGO's) has been set in place through partnership among key implementing agencies at the village level through local committees and the national working group. Beneficiaries have been organized through community watch schemes and direct assistance.

The key objective of strengthening the capacity of national and community level agencies to plan, initiate, implement and evaluate action to progressively eliminate child labor remains relevant. This is so in light of a situation where there is lack of clear national and local action plans, and defined policies and guidelines that employers can abide with for allowable child work and for changes in the work place towards non-hazardous conditions.

The key objective of removal and prevention of children from hazardous working conditions has been validated through baseline studies. The results of these identified a higher number of children that are out-of-school because of work, thus, the need for mechanisms to mainstream them into formal education activities.

The project components worked on political backing for direct action for removal and prevention through policy and enforcement, and an education component for beneficiary and implementing agents through awareness-raising and capacity-building. The implementation is on the right track but the components' paces are not in step. This is because policy-development came slow in the existing political context. The policy-making component should be spurred through more resources or through advocacy initiatives from support groups.

The program strategies have effectively combined educational support programs addressing incentives for continuing presence of children in school on-site (CLC-NFE) and in learning vocation-directed skills and with family income-generating measures (SHG) which address the root cause of children's participation in hazardous labor. The program

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

also integrated awareness-raising with back-up government policy for effective legal basis against child exploitation and the improvement of working conditions (OHS) in the work place.

The adjustments noted in project objectives related to the changes in the target number of children for removal or prevention from entry into hazardous work. This adjustment was established by the baseline surveys. This was not notably reflected in terms of project costs, however, such as in the cost of skills training among the target children. Minor changes were indicated in the change of the Provincial Advisory Committee to a more comprehensive PCCL/MCCL.

#### Identification of Beneficiaries

Project implementing structures were directed towards getting participation from employers, parents, labor groups, teachers, labor monitors, village leaders and non-government agencies and encouraging local ownership over the program. The programs have effectively identified sub-groups among child/family beneficiaries in terms of residence status (i.e., settled or migrant), work assignments, age disparities, family responsibility (e.g. child-head of household, widow-headed households) and gender. These variations were defined specifically from the baseline studies.

The lack of baseline information on the nature and status of enterprises employing children and of youth-related facilities in the communities has resulted in a lack of definitive targets on these sub-groups.

Generally, the strategies indicate a good grounding on beneficiary needs. But problems and needs are dynamic. The program strategies will have to be defined progressively. Capacity building activities during start-up (orientational) phase, for instance, will necessarily differ from the sustaining phase (managerial) for program partners.

#### Project Indicators

The Action Plan defined the indicators of achievement relative to the project's objectives<sup>8</sup>. These are translated into achievable output indicators measurable through baseline number and comparative growth, the frequency of usage of systems and procedures, structural growth, comparative absence vs. presence of mechanisms combating child-labor or promoting children rights. There is adequate attention to the mainstreaming of gender concerns in the indicators developed.

The quantitative measures for awareness-raising and sensitization on children's rights have to be firmed up. The conduct of a Training Needs Analysis (TNA) among project partners and participants in the activities can be resorted to. Pre-testing and post-testing activities during the launching of the materials on Child Labor awareness should be considered as part of this activity.

---

<sup>8</sup> See Annex 2, Indicators of Achievement.

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

*Effectiveness*Assessment of Start-up Phase

The start-up phase of the project involved establishing the policy-support and organizational structures, and laying down information requisites and sourcing materials/resources for project implementation. During this period, the National Program Management (NPM) Office was expected to lay down the program framework, structures, technical inputs and resources geared towards the formulation and eventual implementation of action programs by partner agencies.

The major outputs for the NPM unit and MoSALVY for this period are the following:

- Convening a national action planning activity among key stakeholders to gain project support and define project thrust and key interventions;
  - Defining baseline information on program beneficiaries and implementing partners;
  - Establishing project management units and systems of managements (planning, operational systems); and
  - Initiating capacity building of key stakeholders
1. Organizing the national seminar on Child Labor in the hazardous sectors and the recommended action plan to address child labor in the three sectors

The national seminar on child labor in the salt production, fishing and rubber plantations sectors of Cambodia was held in Phnom Penh on November 28-29, 2001. A working group comprised of the MoSALVY and collaborated by the Center for Advanced Study (CAS) and ILO-IPEC organized this activity.

The seminar was attended by some 106 participants coming from the various national and local governmental institutions in Cambodia, employers and workers' associations, local and international NGO's, community members and research institutes, mass media and representatives from international aid agencies.

The activity had the objective of bringing together national and local level stakeholders in understanding the issues of children in hazardous work. It aimed to identify areas of cooperation and collaborative action within selected communities and national organizations in formulating policy and programs for implementation. It hoped to facilitate the development of a broader alliance between national and local level stakeholders in taking joint action against child labor in hazardous sectors.

The seminar outlined the salient features of children's involvement in the hazardous sectors of salt production, rubber plantations and the fishing/shrimp processing sectors. This was done through a review of the findings on the incidence of child labor in the 3 sectors conducted by the CAS and LICADHO.

Through group workshops and plenary, the activity drew up promising interventions that could be adopted for working children in the three sectors. It categorically firmed up institutional support for the implementation of the national Action Program. Based on the proceedings, Table 1 below catalogues the broad areas for promising interventions:

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

**Table 1.** Program Areas of Intervention and Implementing Measures

<b>Areas of Intervention</b>	<b>Measures</b>
Social Mobilization and Protection	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Community, employer mobilization through sensitizing programs</li> <li>Formation of PCCL and local working groups</li> <li>Promote role of communities in child labor monitoring, reporting and coordinating CL related issues</li> <li>Promote roles of trade unions and employers concerning child labor issues</li> </ul>
Law & Policy Improvement	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Determine specific work for children</li> <li>Ratification/enforcement of ILO Convention 182</li> <li>Wider dissemination of labor laws, legislations, re : child labor</li> <li>Labor inspection, labor education for employers, workers and capacity strengthening for labor inspectors</li> <li>Improve information systems of responsible institutions</li> </ul>
Education & Skills Training	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Establishment of schools</li> <li>Establishment of libraries</li> <li>Flexible school schedules for migrant school children</li> <li>Promotion of NFE through community learning centers, NFE classes and community libraries</li> <li>Find means re: problem of transport</li> <li>Establishment of dormitories in areas where schools are distant from families</li> <li>Develop programs for inclusion in regular curriculum on working children, health care and life-skills</li> </ul>
Community Empowerment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Alternative job training re: market demands</li> <li>Awareness promotion re : jobs</li> <li>Income generating/seed money programs</li> <li>Provision of capital, technology, seeds and resources for income-generating activities</li> <li>Promote families of working children to develop family-business plans</li> <li>Create community credit &amp; savings groups</li> </ul>

The national seminar paved the way for the assignment of labor inspectors or workplace monitors for the child labor monitoring program, the establishment of 3 Sectoral Committees on Child Labor, the formation of village working groups and participation of the non-government organizations in the program. At the national level, it defined the role of MoSALVY in the formulation of Ministerial Orders on Child Labor and advocacy for ratification of the ILO Conventions.

## 2. Gathering of Baseline Information

The initial basis for the program were the two CAS studies on Child Work and Child Labor in Chub Rubber Plantation and in the Fisheries in Sihanoukville, and a Situation Analysis of Rapid Assessment Findings in Salt Production in Kampot<sup>9</sup>. The project proposed for micro-researches which would support the design of services in the 3 sectors.

<sup>9</sup> CAS, Child Work and Child Labor, September 2001 and Gourley, Steve, Child Labor and Salt Production in Kampot Province, Cambodia, May 2000.



**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

The on-site research included:

- an assessment of education and skills training requirement of children and the quality of available programs in livelihood and practical skills training;
- an analysis of the income and expenditure patterns of families and the availability of credit and livelihood services;
- a market feasibility of alternative employment for young people; and,
- an assessment of occupational health and safety conditions.

The baseline surveys were contracted to short-term consultants. The start-up of hiring of consultants for the baseline survey was on December 2001. Profiling of the Salt sector was completed on March 2002. Another consultant conducted the baseline surveys for the Fishery and Rubber Sectors. The completion of the profiles for the 3 sectors was done June 2002.

A review of the baseline survey instruments<sup>10</sup> used for profiling of working children in the rubber, salt and fishery sectors indicated adequate data-collection on the following concerns: Demographics, Status of Employment, Living Situation, Education, Current and Past Work History, Work Hazards, Life Goals and Aspirations.

The data requirements could have been improved to look at activities at home, off-work and leisure, including skills and talents the children or households may have. This could locate activity schedules and possible directions for skills training.

The instruments were pre-tested in the salt sector. The location and prospective number of households were key inputs from village leaders and key informants. The scope and final form was determined in consideration of comments from enumerators from PDSALVY and participating NGOs<sup>11</sup>, and the ILO-IPEC offices. The final instruments were in the local language.

There were delays in the completion of the results of the baseline survey due to the magnitude of the information processed. The delay resulted in the formulation of APSO per Sector based initially on the pre-program rapid assessments. The number of children targeted for removal from hazardous work and children to be prevented from entering hazardous work had to be adjusted upon completion of analyses of data from the baseline surveys.

The baseline surveys were limited to the status of children and their families. The status of enterprises employing children, the conditions of education and educational facilities, status of support services with significance to children such as nutrition and health, sports facilities, status of child-welfare programs and youth groups should be studied as part of the over-all program context. The program specifically targeted the sectors of employers, teachers, labor unions and youth-related groups as part of its implementing structures, yet a significant reading of their conditions has not been integrated in the program context. For purposes of programme strategies, baseline studies of beneficiaries

---

<sup>10</sup> Survey Instruments: Child/ Parent Survey for Fishing Sector in Sihanoukville of Cambodia. Adapted from revised instrument in salt sector and revised for rubber sector survey. Survey was conducted among 3,266 working children: 1,678 in fishing, 650 in salt, and 948 in Chub rubber plantation.

<sup>11</sup> Participating NGOs in the baseline surveys for fishing and rubber plantation sectors are the same NGOs that are presently implementing the action programs.

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

included a stakeholder analysis of agencies or groups serving the beneficiary sector. The stakeholders analysis defined the condition of these agency/groups in terms of their organizational capabilities, services they render to the beneficiaries, and possible areas of collaboration with the proposed programme. For example, health-related agencies have programmes for medical assistance to children, NGO's may have functional literacy programs or sports-related programme, business can come up with children scholarships, all of which when coordinated with the program against child labor can enhance programme strategies and foster institutional support.

The project hired the Occupational Safety and Health Department of MoSALVY to conduct the assessment in February 2003. The reports are available in the Khmer language and are used to formulate the special announcements for the three sectors. The said reports were not part of this present review.

The results of the micro-researches for viable livelihood activities in relation to the income generation/seed money activities and market feasibility for skills training for children have yet to be submitted to the ILO-IPEC. However, the programs have already started activities for vocational skills training and the organizing of self-help groups, including provision of seed money for families of working children to start/expand their businesses. The concepts of these activities would need to be anchored on the results of the two researches.

### 3. Staff Recruitment

The regular project staff consists of the National Programme Manager, 2 Sector Coordinators and 1 Administrative staff. Short-term consultants are hired for technical requirements (research, training, data-banking, etc.)

There had been a delay in the recruitment of 2 Sector Coordinators (SC) for the Project. The recruitment process took some four months, with the SPC for the Rubber Sector on-board only in June 2002<sup>12</sup>. The delays caused undue workload on the NPM, who was burdened with other responsibilities from separate country Action Programs. The transition period meant that the NPM was responsible for setting up the mechanisms for project implementation. Considering that the project has three sectors, an effect would be that of having some sector concerns sidelined (e.g., coordination work with employers in the rubber sector was not immediately followed-up after the national workshop).

Short-term consultants for the baseline profiling, capacity building and database installation had been hired. But research consultants for the micro-researches on job market analysis and the legal consultant for policy development are not as yet on-board.

The operations of the sectoral offices effectively commenced March 2002 and were facilitated through the MoSALVY. However, project equipment, motorcycles and computers were installed late in the 3<sup>rd</sup> quarter of 2002.

---

<sup>12</sup> An SC had been hired in March but this person resigned a day after his recruitment. It took another 2 months to hire a replacement for this person.



**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

#### 4. Formation of Local Committees on Child Labor

Partnership arrangements were made after the conduct of the national seminar on child labor. Initially, the institutional arrangement called for the establishment of Provincial Advisory Committee (PAC). This was referred to the Department of Labor to draft warrants for the PAC establishment, but the pace was slow in firming up such groups. It was eventually referred to the MoSALVY and adopted by the provinces but adjusted to reflect more comprehensive concerns related to child labor, education, nutrition, healthcare and a broad base composition. The Provincial/ Municipal Committee on Child Labor and other forms of Commercial Exploitation on Children were later adopted.

The formation of the PCCL/MCCL in the salt and fishery sectors was completed in March 2002 and in the rubber sector in May 2002. However, the committee functions are dependent on the Governor as the Chair, and whose absence diminishes committee operations. There are indications of absences from member-representatives. To make the committees functional, operational guidelines would have to be drafted, including a clearer direction through the Local Action Plan on Child Labor.

#### 5. Partnerships with Government and Non-Government Organizations

The program relies on partnerships with the government and non-government implementing agencies for the delivery of services. At the national level, this partnership is evident with the MoSALVY as lead unit. The program coordinates closely with the Child Labor Unit (CLU). At the local level, this partnership is with the PDSALVY/MDSALVY, the PDEYS/MDEYS and NGOs.

The program sought the participation of local non-government organizations with services in the target sector. The partner NGO's include the following: CCPCR, CCBO and the KTO. For the rubber sector, initial problems were met in identifying a partner NGO that had experience and presence in the area. The KTO was tapped to play the role for the rubber sector. The program guideline for NGO partners stipulated that they should have proven success in working in development issues and that they are experienced in conducting training and awareness raising activities with stakeholders and target communities.

#### 6. Training of Stakeholders

Building the capacities of the stakeholders proceeds from the objective of bringing together relevant government and non-government organizations in the project locations in learning about the program for progressive elimination of child labor and the conduct of program strategies within their particular concerns. As indicated by the training schedules (Table 2), capacity building measures had not been in place during the project's start-up phase from November 2001-June 2002.

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

**Table 2.** Training conducted for stakeholders

Course	Schedule	No. of Participants
▪ Training/Workshop Use of NFE Primary Curriculum for Working and OSY Children	August 2002	13
▪ Training on Child Labor Monitoring	Sept 2002	34
▪ Training/Workshop on Occupational health & Safety for Child Labor Monitors	Sept 2002	28
▪ Training on Project Design, management and Evaluation of Action Program on child Labor	June 2002	16
▪ Training on Community Savings and Small Business Strategy	Feb 2003	17
▪ Participatory Training on Child Labor Sensitizing	November 2002	12

Review of Delivery Modes

## 1. Stakeholder Participation in the Start-up Phase

The formulation of Action Programs for each sector had been undertaken through initial consultations with key implementing agencies. The national workshop on child labor provided this opportunity at the national level. Stakeholders' consultations were conducted primarily in the salt and fishing sector. The stakeholders' consultation in the rubber sector was delayed due to initial difficulties in the selection of the Sector Coordinator and an NGO partner. Beneficiary participation was through the baseline surveys. Training Needs Analysis has not been included in the design and was not conducted at the implementing agency level.

Project Responses to Difficulties

The difficulties in the start-up phase primarily involved the delays in setting up the program management offices in the sectors and in setting-up the inter-agency structures in the project areas and at the provincial level.

Corrective actions taken to resolve the challenges during this period entailed seeking the assistance of the ILO-IPEC Regional office in hiring the 2 SCs and two consultant teams to undertake the baseline surveys. The initial delays with the baseline study in the salt sector were resolved through ILO-IPEC design sessions with the consultant. The lessons from the salt sector baseline survey were the basis for improved baseline studies in the rubber and fishing sectors which were undertaken by another consultant. To short-cut bureaucratic procedures at the provincial level relative to the setting up of the local committees on child labor, direct consultations were conducted with provincial/municipal departments.

Project Progress against Project WorkPlan

## 1. National Action Program of MoSALVY

The MoSALVY submitted the Action Program for implementing the program sub-component on the formulation, reform and enactment of policies and measures to ensure

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

the sustainability of child labor prevention and action to strengthen the existing mechanisms to combat child labor (Table 3).

**Table 3.** Status of Completion MoSALVY Action Program

Strategy/measure	Identified Outputs	Status of completion
Child Labor Policy Development and Enforcement	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Draft of Ministerial Order on hazardous work and occupation prohibiting employment of young workers</li> <li>Draft Ministerial Order on special working conditions for young workers in rubber, salt, fishing, footwear and brick-making sectors</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Finalized 2 draft <i>Prakas</i> on hazardous work and occupations prohibiting employment of young workers and on special working conditions for young workers in identified sectors</li> <li>The 2 Ministerial Orders for submission to the Labor Advisory council for discussion before signing by the Minister of MoSALVY</li> <li>Compiled Occupation Health Safety Assessment for rubber, salt, fishing sectors</li> <li>Received draft announcement on child labor from Committees on Child Labor from 3 sectors for inclusion into the 2 draft <i>Prakas</i></li> </ul>
Ratification of ILO Convention 182 and effective enforcement of Convention 138	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Sensitization on Convention 182 to advocate for its ratification</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Series of workshops conducted in March 2003</li> </ul>
National Action Plan Against Child Labor in Hazardous Sectors	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Draft National Plan of Action on Hazardous forms of Child Labor</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Work still in the planning and preparatory stages. Monitoring mechanism expected to be tested August 2003</li> </ul>
National Mechanism and Child Labor Working Group	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Develop national plan monitoring</li> <li>Strengthening/enhancement of child labor mechanisms</li> <li>Production of media campaign materials</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Held 1 day meeting with NSC and WG-CL. Busy schedules affecting on-site visits schedule</li> <li>Draft leaflet and posters have been prepared, printing to be completed</li> </ul>

## 2. Sector Action Programs and Outputs

Nine Action Programs have been developed with regards to the Components for Social Protection and Community Empowerment & Community-based Child Labor Monitoring. Implementing these are the local units of the P/MDSALVY, P/MDEYS and non-government organizations (CCPRC, CCBO, KTO) based in the identified fishing, salt and rubber sectors.

The comparative outputs for the three sectors are summarized in Table 4. A quantitative report per sector is attached separately as **Annex 4**.

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

**Table 4.** Status of Accomplishment of Sector Action Program <sup>13</sup>

COMPONENT/IDENTIFIED OUTPUTS	STATUS OF ACCOMPLISHMENT
<b>Target Social Protection</b>	
Education: transitional literacy, return to school assistance, support education services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Baseline studies identified 930 children for removal and 1,279 children for prevention from working in hazardous conditions</li> <li>85 children removed from hazardous work</li> <li>15 Community Learning Centers (CLC) established</li> <li>Of 700 target children for NFE, 360 currently attending</li> <li>Of 2,603 target children for return to school assistance, some 400 given support in terms of uniforms and school materials</li> </ul>
Skills training program for parents; skills training program for 13-17 years age	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Of 200 children for vocational training, some 127 are currently attending</li> </ul>
Income-Generation: employment & seed money programs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>From a target of 90 groups or 620 families, some 95 groups involving 591 families have been organized</li> <li>Of above target, 70 families received Seed Money with some 68.8% initiating repayment</li> <li>Seed money used for fishing materials, for animal-raising and for small business</li> </ul>
Improving Working conditions: OHS training, improvement of working conditions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Occupational health &amp; Safety Assessment conducted for the 3 sectors</li> <li>OHS Monitoring instrument completed</li> <li>CLM Training conducted for 34 community monitors</li> <li>Training on OHS conducted for 38 monitors</li> <li>Initial improvement of working conditions for fishing/ salt sectors observed (work tables, water, first aid, rest areas)</li> </ul>
Primary Health: providing health, nutrition program	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Not yet integrated</li> </ul>
<b>Community Empowerment &amp; Child Labor Monitoring</b>	
Awareness-raising & advocacy	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Some 9,703 children are target for awareness-raising through formal and NFE classes. Activities have been conducted.</li> <li>Participatory training on CL sensitizing conducted</li> <li>Awareness raising and sensitizing activities have been conducted for some 566 employers, parents and the children in the salt and fishing sectors</li> </ul>
Socialization activities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Not yet integrated</li> </ul>
Community mechanisms	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Six local government units (PDSALVY, PDEYS) and 3 NGOs have been tapped as partners</li> <li>36 community monitors have been tapped as community implementing staff</li> <li>Some 673 teachers from 43 schools have undergone 2 training</li> </ul>
Community child labor Watch Scheme	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Baseline survey identified 930 children for monitoring; the same number being actually monitored</li> </ul>

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

## 2.1 Review of Strategies

The program strategies for the social mobilization and community monitoring for the elimination of child labor in hazardous conditions in the rubber, salt and fishing sector are the following:

- Child Labor Monitoring and OHS Monitoring;
- Educational support through non-formal education, children reintegration to formal schools and vocational training;
- Seed money and savings mobilization for income-generating activities of families through functional Self-Help Groups; and
- Awareness raising and advocacy.

### Child Labor Monitoring and OHS Monitoring

The program has firmed up an integrated CLM/OHS work schedule which integrated awareness raising with employers and parents. The mechanisms for implementing monitoring at the project start-up are the labor inspectors/ workplace monitors of the PDSALVY, teachers from the PDEYS and community monitors from the NGO based in the sectors. Capacity building for CLM has been limited to training on CLM and OHS for 36 monitors. Monitoring checklists have been provided for target children for removal from hazardous work and on OHS standards for work conditions in the salt, fishing and rubber sectors. Monitoring work has yet to be mainstreamed as an activity of project beneficiaries from employers, trade unions and parents.

OHS monitoring indicated limited improvement in the work conditions in the 3 sectors. There have been provisions of working tables, rest areas, improvement of pathways/ aisles and provision of drinking water in the work areas. In the fishing sector, employers have encouraged take-home work for shrimp/fish peeling which are later sold back to the employers. In a few cases, employers have agreed to set up a CLC near the work places. However, the number of participating employers is still minimal and significant reduction of work hours and hazardous work for children has not yet been complied with. This is attributed to the lack of clear regulations and sanctions enacted at the local government and at the national level.

There is need to firm up strategies for monitoring children who work in the rubber sector and in fishing boats. The CLMs have yet to gain participation from employers in said sector.

Some 90% of target children for monitoring are currently being monitored. This task has been systematically divided between those monitoring children in the workplace and those in the schools and the community. This eased up the quota given some 36 CLM for 900 children. The division of work was such that workplace monitors took the assignment of monitoring children in the workplace, while community monitors assumed responsibility for children within the community and schools. Monitoring maps and CLM worksheets are in place and a database system has been installed.

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

### Non-Formal Education (NFE)

The mechanisms for removal of children from hazardous labor and prevention of children from entering hazardous work and mainstreaming into formal education involve a four-pronged approach combining awareness-raising with support educational assistance through non-formal education, vocational skills training and supporting materials for “at risk” children.

At program onset, 43 formal schools in the project sectors, of which 50% provides schooling beyond primary level (grade 3), have been mobilized. These have student attendees of about 14,442 for the fishing and salt sectors. There are a total of 773 teachers in the three program sectors. Most of the school facilities are far from the villages for the salt and rubber sectors, at an average distance of 4-5 km. There are 4 non-formal education schools for 80 students in the rubber sector.

The program has established 15 CLCs for non-formal education during the first quarter of 2003. Initially, this was scheduled for CY 2002. In the rubber sector, the initial commitment for use of sites within company premises did not materialize. The CLCs were set up in sites that were volunteered by employers and the community, with construction materials and labor coming from the community and learning materials from donor Country Programmes, e.g., UNESCO. The construction materials are basically bamboo and wood with coconut thatch or plastic sheet roofing and bare flooring. Wooden or plastic tables and chairs are provided along with reading materials from donor Country Programs.

The CLC for the salt and fishing areas accommodate about 50 students/class and in the rubber sector about 30/class. These are located in the village centers for easy access. Educators are hired by the PDEYS or the CCBO for the fishing sector, with about 13 having completed a 10-day course on NFE facilitated by the MDEYS. The basic curriculum for NFE is basic literacy and numeracy and awareness-raising on children rights, and adjusted where called for to the levels and ages of the children attendees. Some 360 children are currently attending the program, equitably distributed among females and males. Class schedules have been set around children's off-work hours with some 2 hour-class periods in the early morning, noon-time, afternoon and near evening classes based on agreements with parents and the children working activities. Mobile classes are also planned for those working children far from the villages. As part of awareness-raising, CLC Support Committees will be organized for sustaining the CLCs.

### Vocational Training

Vocational training has been provided for a target of 200 working children, majority being females. Current accomplishment rate run to 127 children or some 63%.

The initial skills taught are related to motorcycle, motorboat and car engine repairs, hairdressing and sewing. The selection of skills is based primary on fields of interest of prospective students and interviews on market demand with prospective private contractors who are willing to provide jobs after training. This is also influenced by availability of trainers on-site and costs of training. Skills provided were based on the children's choice from the courses that were identified.

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

Gender balance in the vocational training favors females (89 females against 38 males). This built upon the objective of giving more opportunities to females outside of male dominated work in the target sectors. The selection of skills for females, however, reflected home-/village-based vocations rather than open opportunities for female in male-dominated job opportunities.

Based on the selection criteria for the salt and fishing sectors, those availing skills training are poor children, aged 15-17 years, working full time, whose parents allow their completion of training and who are willing to pay back training costs if their children dropped out. Again, females are given priority.

#### Support Assistance for Children

Support assistance in the form of school materials were provided for the target number of children "at risk" of dropping out of school and entering hazardous work conditions. Some 400 children from a target of 2,603 were given uniforms and school materials.

The general criteria for those "at risk" were: children are under 18 years old, working part time in production works, are relatives of full-time working children; belong to poor families engaged in salt/fishing works, and are from women-headed households (in which case they are given priority). Additional criteria that are equally given importance in identifying those "at risk" are those who do not have school materials and are often absent from school due to their poor conditions and are prevailed upon to help their family earn income, they live far from school, they are mobile/migrant children who are with their families to work in salt production activities; and, they are orphaned children or head-of-household by themselves.

#### Seed Money Activity and Savings Mobilization through Self-Help Groups

Increase in income for families of working children is addressed through the program by targeting 620 families to be organized into self-help groups (SHGs). Current progress reveals 591 families organized in 95 SHGs. This program aims to start-up income-generating activities and savings mobilization assisted through seed-capital in a Grameen-type approach.<sup>14</sup> The members of the SHG are predominantly women, which is based on a prevailing view that women are generally responsible for the family finances and look after the schooling needs of children. They are also thought to have more time to engage in the program rather than full-time working males. The major activity where seed capital was used was for fishing materials, animal raising and small business.

The overriding principle for the SHG is to build the capabilities of members to understand the value of seed money, to analyze and decide, and to set up business to increase income and improve living conditions allowing thus their children to go to school. The strategy is also directed towards establishing village banks for future use. The groups are composed of 3-5 persons who voluntarily join the group. The groups elect their leader. The use of seed-capital is approved by the group and guaranteed by the group through peer-pressure to ensure repayment. Of total seed-capital provided to a member, a total of 3% is deducted (1% is deducted for inflation, 1% for managerial costs and 1% for savings of the community). Seed money ceilings are 10,000-250,000 Riels and



**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

available only after completion of training on credit principles. The SHGs are organized by the participating NGO's whose members have (a) completed Training on Community Savings and Small Business Strategy as placed in the context of combating child labor, and (b) have provided such training for the SHG members.

#### Awareness-raising and advocacy

Awareness raising and sensitizing is integrated in all the strategies of community monitoring, education assistance and SHG. This is conducted through community consultations or workplace visitations and linked to the above strategies. A training for awareness-raising and sensitizing work has been conducted for the program's implementing agencies, namely the PCCL, labor inspectors, teachers and the NGO.

Interviews with implementing agencies and beneficiaries showed there is a good grasp on the general objectives and measures of the project. This is indicated primarily through strong community support for the CLC, child enrolment in the educational program and some employer's limited improvements in the children's working conditions. However, the program has yet to institute mechanisms for collating the results of awareness-raising activities from all the activities. This can be addressed by improvements in the database system for community monitoring. The program has to develop a progressive approach for awareness-raising with measurable indicators in terms of beneficiary participation, community action plans for combating child labor, integration of the program in school curriculum and in work policies, etc. and definitive information-education content and methods. A test-case can be done with the expected release of information materials on Child Labor under the Action Program of the MoSALVY.

#### 2.2. Review of the start-up Activities

The delivery process for project services has been laid down during the start-up phase. An over-all framework has been laid out during the national workshop on child labor which defined program thrusts and promising interventions and pulled in support from partner institutions. The framework was brought into the local level through the PCCL/MCCL and verified through the baseline survey and initial consultations with village work groups and translated into 10 Action Programs by implementing agencies. This period focused on the setting up of community working structures through partner agencies involved in labor inspection, formal and non-formal education and NGO's.

The Action Programs (AP) developed from the National Action Program and the suggested promising interventions during the national workshop show the measures by which the project's main objectives would be achieved. The Action Program went through verification measures involving project partners through the Provincial Committee on Child Labor (PCCL) which is a representation of government agencies, employers, labor unions and civic groups.

While the APs have clear beneficiaries and a work plan, the delay in the completion of the baseline surveys meant that most of its findings have not been integrated in the initial APs. There are some strategies that need to be refined based on a review of the baseline information, such as the strategies to address children working in boats, and a review of



**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

off-work seasons where NFE schedules can be situated. There is also need to improve some criteria on the provision of seed money to reflect support for the poorest of the poor but within viable small business, so as not to dissipate limited funds.

### 3. Main Difficulties

The main difficulties in the start-up phase primarily focused on the delays in mobilizing personnel and resources (funds, equipments) and coordination with various program partners. The formulation and adoption of program policies at the national level have been stymied by bureaucratic procedures and the lack of familiarity with general content of the policy and the processes for its adoption.

The significant technical input during the start-up phase was the baseline survey. There was a delay in the preparation of the surveys, in its conduct and completion, and in its adoption into the program database system. The target number of children for removal and prevention was not firmed up until the baseline studies were completed. This is notable in the two data indicators for target social protection and community monitoring and empowerment. Skills/vocational training provided to older working children were principally based on information provided in the profiling. However, the lack of detailed needs assessment could affect the current efforts.

The initial difficulties concerning personnel and resources have been resolved. The IPEC-Regional Office has provided initial personnel support and with the approval of the APSOs from the implementing partners, resources have been released for project activities. The entry of the technical consultants for the legal requirements of the CLU and the other researches are planned.

There have been some adjustments in the cross monitoring of children among the workplace monitors and community monitors but this was for the purpose of keeping better pace in lieu of the number of children assigned for monitoring. The regularization of monthly meetings between them should serve as mechanism to harmonize their results.

### 4. Project Progress against Work Plan

The program progress had been slow in the first six months. This stemmed from the difficulty in the recruitment of staff, in accessing resources for the program measures and the relative lack of familiarity of the government structure with the program, including slow procedures in putting into place the mechanisms for its implementation.

There has been a remarkable pace in meeting the target activities by the 4th quarter of 2002 and by the 1st quarter of 2003. This was spurred primarily by the establishment of the implementing structures, the approval of Action Programs and related release of funds and the firming up of the methodology and guidelines in the conduct of work brought about by initial capacity building work. Measures for capacity building, social protection and community monitoring have been considerably implemented.

**Table 5** provides an analysis of the program's progress<sup>15</sup> across the program sub-components:

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

**Table 5.** Program Components and Progress

Component	Progress to date
Start-up Activities	Completed, except for additional micro-researches and database output
Policy, Program Planning and Research	Slow. 2 Policies still at review stages; national action planning to commence; consultants for engagement
Capacity Development	On-time. five major training/workshop activities completed; sensitizing work in communities conducted
Social Protection	99% target children monitored 63.8% of target children in NFE 16.2% of target reintegrated in schools 63.5% of target in vocational training 15.4% of target for prevention, assisted
Community Empowerment and Community-based Child Labor Monitoring System	36 community monitors in place 673 teachers trained 100.5% of target families in SHGs

Project Technical and Administrative Guidance

## 1. Institutional and management arrangements

The institutional and management arrangement for program implementation are as follows:

- National Steering Committee shall serve as project Advisory Committee, shall formulate project-related strategies & guidelines, and review project activities and progress.
- The MoSALVY shall lead in advocacy for child labor policy development & enforcement, the ratification/enforcement of ILO Conventions 182 and 138, the development of a national action plan and activities geared to strengthen national mechanisms. The national office functions are coursed through the Child Labor Unit (CLU) with 3 staff.
- Three Provincial Committees on Child Labor shall provide guidance on project implementation in the Salt, Rubber, and Fishery Sectors, mobilize community ownership of the project and promote sustainability of project effects. The PCCL is chaired by senior official of local government and the local MoSALVY acts as the secretariat. The Committee is composed of representatives of employers, workers, relevant GOs & NGOs with a sit-in status for ILO-IPEC Sector Coordinator and NPM.
- Local Working Groups are organized at the site-level and comprised by representatives of implementing partners, employers, workers, local leaders and NGOs. These facilitate project activities on social protection at local level and assist in eliminating obstacles in program implementation. The service personnel are the workplace monitors, NFE educators, credit agents and community monitors of the NGOs and the Area Coordinators.

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

The project is managed by the ILO-IPEC through a National Program Manager. The NPM is supported by 2 Sector Project Coordinators and an administrative staff. For technical inputs, the hiring of short-term consultants is resorted to.

The project management team shall be responsible to put in place ILO-IPEC financial, administrative, programming, reporting and evaluation procedures, the training of project staff in said functions, ensuring the quality of research, rapid assessments, surveys and other program activities, and is responsible for planning the capacity building component, including legal reforms and policy level interventions. The project staff shall undertake regular field visits to assess progress, identify implementation problems and take corrective measures

## 2. Review of Capacitation and Guidance Provided

### 2.1 Technical inputs

The technical requirements of the project may be viewed in terms of the human resources that compose it as well as the information base against which the project can proceed. Personnel-wise, two Sector Project Coordinators were hired, with one being assigned to the salt and fishing sectors and the other to the rubber sector. The NPM also recruited a short-term consultant for the completion of the baseline studies, a database programmer for the monitoring reports, a consultant for the OHS Assessment, and contracted trainers for the capacitation activities. ILO Labor Standard Specialists have provided technical inputs to MoSALVY.

To further build up the project's manpower, the management unit of the IPEC and the Child Labor Unit (CLU) have jointly capacitated stakeholders and personnel on the over-all framework and objectives of the program and related orientation on tasks (CL monitoring, sensitizing, seed money, NFE, AP-design) which are requirements to jump-start implementation. It was observed, however, that a Training Needs Analysis (TNA) of partner implementing agencies has not been included in the baseline studies or during their participation in the conduct of the training. The TNA would be a significant input to defining a progressive Capability-building Program at the national level.

The technical inputs required for effective Action Planning are the Situational Analysis as basis and Project Sustainability as direction. The delay in the completion of the baseline information meant that the results were not fundamental inputs in submitted/approved Action Programs by implementing strategies. The OHS Assessments, the market/demand analysis and study of income& expenditures and economic alternatives have not caught up as basis for policy-development and social protection strategies.

There would be a need to complete and review the results of the researches on the baseline information, alternative income and marketable skills with implementation partners so as to serve as context for planning continuing program strategies. Likewise, the input of legal consultants has not been factored into policy-development at the national and PCCL levels. The management unit should focus on analysis and strategy planning sessions directed towards making more efficient and effective the program services.

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

The formulation of the 9 APs during this period was observed to have been done independently by the concerned P/MDSALVY, P/MDEYS and the NGO's. This does not provide for a comprehensive review of project activities and the local situation. Put another way, the 9 APs were designed before the results from the baseline studies came out and without a deeper stakeholders' analysis and other stakeholders' participation in the formulation of the AP's. As earlier noted, the stakeholders consultations held after the National Workshop were mainly in the fishing and salt sectors. The lack of mention on a review of the rubber sector points to an inadequate stakeholders' analysis.

A collective forum for review and planning would facilitate understanding among implementers of the project's over-all progress and shared experiences

## 2.2. Mechanisms for Coordination

The NPM Office indicated that the major mechanisms for technical support and guidance with partners and beneficiary groups is through weekly/ monthly meetings, telephone communications, e-mail, field visits and direct communication with people and partners by Sector Coordinators. The SPC also serve as an advisory role to PCCL/MCCL.

The effective guidance systems such as policies, procedures, problem-solving, monitoring, personnel guidance and resource allocations have to be regularized. The evaluation noted the formulation of CLM and OHS monitoring mechanisms, the AP indicators and the database program as part of program monitoring.

But the absence of reports and meetings-related documents coming from local implementing partners was noted. In this regard, the NPM unit should firm up monitoring activities and enhance documentation at the sector level. This could include process documentation and case studies to highlight developments at the beneficiary level.

For monitoring of personnel relative to their output, it would be important to firm up job specifications, especially of the Sector Coordinator and the CLU. This could serve as basis for ensuring that guidance to local partners is regularized. Target activity against time-lapse mechanisms through the GANTT chart can be used.

The management unit should help out in defining the measures for social protection and community empowerment. At the sector level, there were criteria for selection of children for skills training and selection of families for seed-capital to SHGs<sup>16</sup>. But there were no defined criteria or guidelines for selection of skills, developing curriculum, selection of instructors, the selection of children accessing training and other support services based on the job market analysis and prevailing child aptitudes. For the self-help groups (SHG), there should also be established criteria and conditions for selection of families/groups obtaining seed-capital, including viability of enterprises or seed money-use activities, seed money-repayment scheme, business plans, etc. The program also requires support services in business planning, practical business management, savings mobilization, etc, in effect, the NFE and SHG programs could be integrated.

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

### 3 Institutional Coordination (implementing agencies)

At the sector level, the local department of the MoSALVY (i.e., PDSALVY) and MDEYS have a partnership with local NGO's and serves as program implementers (see Table 6). Among the partner NGO's, the CCPCR in Kampot Province and the CCBO in Sihanoukville have established programs in the sectors and had worked with earlier child programs. KTO in the rubber sector was called in after initial difficulties in setting up a partner NGO.

**Table 6.** Institutional Arrangement-Sector Level

	Salt Sector	Fishing	Rubber
Agency/staff	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>PDSALVY/ 7 staff for 123 enterprises</li> <li>PDEYS/ 6 NFE teachers</li> <li>CCPCR: 1 PC, 2 monitors, 2 credit agents</li> <li>Community monitors:6</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>MDSALVY/ 8 staff for 86 enterprises</li> <li>MDEYS/ 33 NFE educators</li> <li>CCBO: 1 PC, 2mnts, 2 credit agents</li> <li>Community monitors: 6</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>PDSALVY/ 9 staff for 65 enterprises</li> <li>PDEYS/ 11 NFE educators;</li> <li>KTO: 1 PC, 2 monitors, 2 credit agents</li> <li>Community monitors: 6</li> </ul>
Field of previous experience	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>PDSALVY enforcement of labor related legislation &amp; inspection</li> <li>PDEYS-non-formal education</li> <li>CCPCR-project re: prevention of trafficking of children; vocational skills training since 1994</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>MDSALVY enforcement of labor related legislation &amp; inspection</li> <li>MDEYS-non-formal education</li> <li>CCBO-improving child living conditions; child peer groups since 2000</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>PDSALVY enforcement of labor related legislation &amp; inspection</li> <li>PDEYS-non-formal education</li> <li>Kak Sekor Thmey Organization (KTO) established in1993; experience in credit &amp; savings, agriculture, health education and advocacy</li> </ul>
Geographic location	Office-Central Kampot CCPR have 2 previous ILO projects in Sihanoukville <sup>17</sup>	Office : central Sihanoukville; previous project in 12 villages Sihanoukville	Office –Kampong Cham
Mechanisms for Communication, learning, problem-solving	Provincial Committee on Child Labor	Municipal Committee on Child Labor	Provincial Committee on Child Labor
Linkages provincial & national level	Linkages with 1 Sector Coordinator; CLU maintain close contact with MoSALVY; regular visits by NPM		1 Sector Coordinator; CLU maintain contacts with MSALVY; regular NPM visits
Improvements made in institutional framework	Conducted stakeholder consultations; NGO-LICADHO involvement in community capacitation; teachers involvement		Involvement of teachers from the formal sector

The local offices of the PDSALVY/MDSALVY and PDEYS/MDEYS have established networks for labor monitoring and non-formal education and have formal backing by their respective ministry. Administrative consent to the program meant that measures agreed on at the department level can easily reach the community network, as in the case of training on the NFE and CLM which was eventually reiterated among all districts and teachers in the area.

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

The implementing agencies tapped community monitors from the communes and villages to increase the number of personnel and to effectively keep track of the working children. At present, there are some 67 sector implementing personnel directly involved in the program (36 community monitors; 6 seed money agents, 16 NFE educators and 9 project coordinators). These are backstopped by some 673 public school teachers and district coordinators. There was ease in community and children sensitizing activities through 10-minute inclusion in the formal classes, through workplace monitor-employee meetings and through community meetings (see also Annex 6b. Institutional Arrangements).

There are monthly meetings noted in the salt and fishing sectors among Coordinators and direct personnel from the 3 implementing agencies. Monitoring teams meet every month and NFE teams every week. NFE educators, seed money agents and community monitors interact with village committees on a daily basis.

Coordination with the NPM office is through weekly/monthly meetings with Sector Coordinator in the salt and fishing sector and monthly in the rubber sector. Communication is facilitated by telephone, e-mail and interview/discussion sessions.

Documentation is through periodic reports; program monitoring records of targets and accomplishments and minutes of meetings/training/seminars. The submission of periodic reports to the NPM is done quarterly; updates are done weekly with SPCs.

#### 4. Awareness and Understanding Among Beneficiaries

There is a good awareness and knowledge of the project in general among all sectors involved, especially among beneficiaries.

Children interviewed in the Community Learning Centers and in their homes are aware of the purpose of the project. They can describe child labor and child rights and talk about the value of education in relation to their future perspectives. All the children talked to prefer to study or continue vocational training rather than work in the salt fields, in fisheries or rubber plantations. But at the same time they also value the contribution of their continuing work to their family's income.

Parent-members of the SHG, are also generally well-versed about the purpose of the project in their community. They are well aware of child labor and child rights and the reasons why the project aims to remove children from hazardous works. They understand as well why seed-capital is being provided them and their responsibilities in relation to seed money use and repayment. Their children below 18 years of age are currently attending NFE classes or are vocational trainees, but most are still working part-time or full time. Some parents said they would remove their children from these work and put them to school as soon as their seed money and start-up business will earn. As mentioned, there were some behavioral changes in the decrease of domestic violence among parents.

The project has conducted seminars for employers in Sihanoukville and in Kampot province. Some employers have become aware of the project and have made minor changes in their work places like providing water, rest areas, hats and crude latrines in



**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

the salt fields or provision of working tables, chairs, electric fans and first aid kits in the fishery sector. Despite initial acceptance, most employers have not dissuaded child labor or lessened work hours. In the case of the rubber plantation operator, there is still a need to persuade them to accept the reality of child labor and cooperate with the project activities. Employers in the fishing boats have yet to be brought into the project.

### Factors Affecting Implementation

The overwhelming issue that bears on program implementation is the pervasive poverty in the target sectors. The salt and rubber sectors are isolated areas with limited employment opportunities, seasonal work and few alternative occupations, while the fishing sector, although near urban areas, have limited employment in the fish factories and fishing boats. Economic problems of low income, unemployment, malnourishment and household headship by widows or by children are manifest. Related social problems have been encountered, such as bad health and nutrition, large family size and domestic violence.

#### 1. Issues Among Beneficiaries

Among the beneficiaries, the following issues continue to bear on the implementation of the program:

- a. Parents hesitate to stop their children from working and concentrate on their studies because of the accompanying effects on their impoverished situation. They put more value on their immediate needs rather than on their future if their children have completed their studies. They also have a bleak regard that finishing primary school can better their situation. Their poverty encourages children to help out in increasing their income.
- b. The employers in the Chub Rubber Plantation deny that there are working children in the plantation. Because of this position, the programs concerning the working children have not been given attention, assistance or cooperation. This is particularly seen in their lack of cooperation in the setting-up of CLCs in the communities. Since the plantation operator wields considerable influence over the people working in the rubber plantation, it is critical for the project implementers, including the MoSALVY, to obtain their support and assistance. It is necessary to address this issue through the Ministry of Finance and the Ministry of Agriculture, which oversees the plantations operations.

Employers in the salt fields and the crab/shrimp meat extraction are not very receptive to initiatives for changes in the workplace but favorably respond to education support programs. They do not readily allow children to stop work or lessen hours of work. They refuse to accept that such is an act of exploitation. Rather, they see it as one of charity because they give work to the poor people. They are upset about monitoring work which distracts the children from their tasks. It would appear, however, that employers will comply if the changes proposed in the workplace are formal regulations or have legal sanctions.

- c. The continuing work by children poses persistent difficulties for Public and Non-formal Education. Some children are busy working in the salt fields, fishing and

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

plantation works to attend formal schooling and NFE. There is a high drop out rate because children tend to go back to work to help with the family income and children who work overtime cannot attend to their classes. Their frequent absences lead to their not being able to catch up with other children.

- d. Initially, there were some difficulties in locating the children for monitoring activities in some areas because there is no definitive database indicating complete child names, parentage, addresses, names of present and transient employers and work & school schedules. Some target children and their families often change residences where opportunities for work are available. In the rubber plantation, places of assignment of working parents in the rubber plantation are flexible, often far from the main village. Children are not listed employees so plantation and sector employees cannot locate their areas. In the same manner, monitoring work among boat-working children poses difficulties because of their indefinite departure/arrival and impermanent status. Monitoring requires time because of the distances being covered.

## 2. Project Responses

- a. In response to the above difficulties, awareness-raising and sensitization work is done with parents and employers when monitoring children in the workplace, in the CLCs or at home and during the establishment of the SHGs. The establishment of CLCs serves as an effort to integrate employers and parents participation, while criteria in the selection of SHG seed money beneficiaries include commitments from parents to continue their child's participation in the CLC-NFE and Vocational Training.
- b. The project has installed database systems which will collate information on children being monitored. The CLM also adopted monitoring maps and the division of assigned children between workplace monitors and community monitors, with the former doing monitoring tasks in the workplace and the latter in the CLC and the villages.
- c. Program support from the Rubber Plantation operators needs to be encouraged. A rubber union representative participated in the national workshop on child labor and the governor from the Sector has given political commitments. The Rubber Plantation is also within the jurisdiction of government agencies for Finance and Agriculture. A strategy workshop involving these sectors should be conducted to firm up program support. The key would be to convene the PCCL with representation from the key agencies.

## 3. Internal Issues Affecting Implementation

- a. Workplace monitors/ labor inspectors brought out their issues on their low salary, lack of safety and insurance and lack of resources for more widespread monitoring. The number of workplace monitors against the target of children to be monitored, with distances and time factored in, should be looked into. Workplace monitors are not exclusive to the project, they have regular jobs to tend to like mediation or arbitration work between labor and management.



**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

- b. There is an on-going difficulty in regularizing the meetings of the Committees on Child Labor (MCCL/PCCL). This is related to several concerns: the busy schedule of the chair of the committee, the lack of representation from the communes/sectors, the lack of grounding of the members on the conditions of the communities and workplace, the delays in firming up the local operational guidelines, the distance of meeting sites and consequent transport expense.
- c. There is a continuing delay in the issuance of the Ministerial Orders on child Labor. The drafts have been reviewed by the Working Group and the NSC-CL and revisions are being conducted by the CLU-MoSALVY. The Child Labor Unit (CLU) consists of a CLU chief serving as Adviser to the Minister of MoSALVY and 2 Assistants. Assisting staff have no formal training on child labor and on technical requirements of their present's positions. In addition, the CLU has inadequate budget for hiring support personnel and for over-all operations.

The program should now provide a short-term consultant for the CLU who could provide legal input as well as familiarize the CLU with the procedures, including getting support from the LAC.

#### 4. Recommended Project Responses

- a. There is need to strengthen the capacity of community-based monitors who are residents or live in proximity to the work sites and are more knowledgeable of the schedules and conditions of children at work. The venues for community monitoring can be expanded in relation to activities concerning the CLC and the SHG's, while workplace monitors could focus on the actual vicinities where the children work.
- b. Secretariat work for the Provincial/Municipal Committees on Child Labor could be jointly handled by the implementing agencies of the PDSALVY, PDEYS and the NGOs through their periodic action planning sessions. The venues can be rotated at the project site-level to afford the Committee visits to the program areas. Operational guidelines can be drafted to resolve the issues of absenteeism and the lack of quorum. Part of the responsibilities for liaison work with the Governor should be shouldered by the Project Sector Coordinators.
- c. The functionality of the CLU should be reviewed as basis for incorporating more efficient operational mechanisms. The existing resources, job specifications and capabilities of staff, and plan of action for identified program of action (activities, processes, schedules, and resources) should be considered. To a large extent, the delays in project progress stems from the lack of experience and technical capabilities of staff in relation to actual policy studies and development and coordinative mechanisms with partner agencies, including tact for negotiations and advocacy. The program provided for the hiring of short-term consultants for the policy development. These should be on-board to assist the functioning of the CLU. The terms of reference of consultants can be expanded to provide supplemental capability building for CLU staff, including inputs on more efficient documentation, advocacy and monitoring measures.

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

### Extent of Achievement of Immediate Objectives

1. Considerable progress has been noted:

- Social Protection Measures have been introduced through educational services and incentives for families to send children to school, as well as child and OHS monitoring in the communities and workplace. This has resulted in the participation of working children and their families in program services.
- The capacitation of the project partners, particularly at the level of local implementing agencies, has been initiated. Awareness-raising work among beneficiaries has been extensive.
- The implementing mechanisms through partnerships with partner agencies and local committees on child labor have been established.

Catch-up work has to be done in policy-development at the national and local levels.

2. Quantitative Progress against Project period

The project has used up some 20 months of its term. About 6 months have been utilized to establish program linkages and structures for implementing partners, mobilize staff and resources, establish benchmark information and formulate work plans (APSO). Most of program services to beneficiaries begun in June 2002 while capacitation among the implementing agencies was realized in September 2002. This indicated that mobilization of implementing agencies for the delivery of program services were initiated from the 4<sup>th</sup> quarter of 2002 to the present. This is noted in the quantity of community activities during the 1<sup>st</sup> quarter of 2003.

In terms of quantitative targets for social protection, monitoring targets of some working children have been identified and assigned for monitoring. About 930 have been actually monitored. Of the total target, 470 were placed in NFE (63%). Some 25 children from the fishing sector were integrated in formal schools (3.4%). About 101 were enrolled in skills training or 50.5% of target. For children at risk, some 400 (15%) of target have been provided assistance and further catch-up on the progress for this sub-group is necessary.

There has been minimal progress in the removal of children from hazardous work for full-time schooling. Most of those placed in the project's educational measures were partial removal, since most children in NFE and skills training still work part-time. But for this target (in NFE and skills training), the difference in project progress could be met within the project period *if the present pace applies in the remaining period*.

In terms of capability building, the target numbers of community monitors, teachers and implementing agencies have been substantially met. Reiteration of training on child labor sensitizing in formal schools to prevent at risk children from dropping out was done for 673 teachers. Five other trainings were conducted related to community and workplace monitoring, sensitizing work, NFE and seed money and savings. There were no conclusive data provided on the awareness-raising activities but extensive work has been conducted through the program services.

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

The lag in policy-development is still substantial. The Ministerial Orders are still draft policies and needs some revision. A review of the Ministerial Orders showed penal provisions in terms of imprisonment comparative to other crimes. In other instances, penal provisions for businesses engaged in child labor are less severe – e.g., revoking of licenses to operate, payment of fines, or at worst, suspension or forced closure. In terms of content of the Ministerial Orders, provisions could be made on OHS major concerns on over-all work conditions including provisions for functional equipment, trained and experienced personnel, standard operational systems, fail-safe measures, hazard signs, and first aid/risk-responses.

The review of the labor code for loopholes have yet to be made and a draft for a national action plan on child labor has yet to undergo reviews and consultative processes. The remaining program period will not be adequate to complete outputs in this component.

Except for the lag in policy-formulation at the national and local levels, quantitative indicators show that the program progress can meet the measurable indicators set by the project.

#### Quality of Outputs

The quality of strategies for social protection and community monitoring determines project impact and sustainability. This is the more significant indicator of project success beyond realizing the numerical targets.

The adoption of social protection measures has been done without a clear grounding on the context of the areas and the beneficiaries and seemingly, without careful thought about sustainability.

- The non-formal classes in the CLCs have to firm up its curriculum, target beneficiaries and range of activities in terms of its set objective of being the transitional learning center towards mainstreaming children in school or as continuing support measure for literacy/ numeracy education in the communities.
- The content of the skills training programs have not been linked with emerging job prospects and alternative economic activities within the sector. For example, how competitive is the job market for hairdressers in the area given the low savings for personal services against demand for radio assemblers/repairmen? What existing local economic activity can be improved by skills improvement? What will the program do, for example, for “skilled but unemployed” children-graduates?
- The delivery process, direction and support mechanisms for the SHGs have not been adequately addressed based on an analytical framework. It was observed across sectors, for instance, that economic activities identified for use of seed-capital (animal-raising, fishing materials, stores) were similar. The identified activities have to consider the particular and/or distinct contexts of the different program sites.
- The capacity building initiatives conducted to date were largely orientations on the basis of the project and agency tasks within the program. It is not yet directed towards agency/community initiatives on child labor.

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

Overall, the measures by which families are encouraged to remove and prevent their children from work have been initiated but without a clear study of the prevailing context, of the processes required, of possible interventions and on the community initiatives that can be integrated. Fast-tracking such measures without adequate conscientization and safeguards can create problems which the implementing agencies were not prepared for. An example of this is conflict resolution within SHG groups regarding the use and repayment of seed capital given the co-guarantee clause in this Grameen-type of lending.

The program should adequately conduct risk assessment studies before expanding coverage. For example, studies could be made for livelihood projects within the income generating and seed money in relation to return of investment (ROI). SHG-related planning should factor in social conditions like people's attitude towards seed money which may divert use of seed-capital for immediate family needs. A clearer understanding of these by income generating agents would ensure that measures can be put in place to ensure the quality of strategies for social protection.

### 3. Review of APSO in the succeeding project phase

The program should initiate reviews of the original APSO and collectively discuss this with the implementing partners at this point. Subsequently, it could identify measures to be considered given some positive changes in their quantitative targets. Attention should also be given on how to keep the lagging activities in cadence.

#### *Efficiency*<sup>18</sup>

The process for development of the Action Programs by Implementing Agencies started from the results of the national seminar on child labor in November 2001. The general recommendations for promising interventions were developed into local interventions within the general objectives and strategies of the ILO-IPEC Proposal. The activities for implementation by the IAs were subsequently selected and developed into local actions. Action Planning is initiated by the agency of the MoSALVY at the national level and at the local level, the PDSALVY/MDSALVY, PDEYS/MDEYS and partner NGO in the sectors, with NPM guidance. The NPM, through short-term consultants, contract activities requiring technical inputs (training, research, development of database systems, legal) through separate TORs. Local APSO's are referred to the PCCL for endorsement then submitted to the MoSALVY and the NPM for review and approval in March 2002.

The APSO's for the sector-level were cleared and funded in November 2002. The AP for the national level (MoSALVY) was approved earlier in September 2002. The reason for a seven month processing period for sector-level APs was the delay in finalization of profiling, recruitment of staff, and approval process in the country and at ILO. According to the NPM, there were no budget revisions in the project. The original costing was used in approval of cost for project activities.

The delay in the release of funds for the APSO also influenced the delays in the implementation of the projects. The IAs in general do not have operational budgets for new initiatives and is largely dependent on the release of the program funds. The lack of funds contributed to the long time-lapse where activities should have been conducted.

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

Overall, the efficiency of the project needed improvement. When the activities are reviewed against the schedule, the slow mobilization of key NPM unit personnel (SPC and consultants) and the slow release of funds (including purchases of equipment) were main factors why the established network (PDSALY/MDSALVY, PDEYS/MDEYS and the NGO's in the salt and fishing sectors) was not optimized.

*Project Sustainability*Sustaining Mechanisms

The project strategy was to localize the implementation to institutions already in place in the target sectors and at the national level. The mechanisms for localizing implementation is through the following:

- At the national level, capacity building and networking among stakeholders to formulate and advocate for the adoption and enforcement of policies and a national action plan to combat child labor
- In the 3 sectors, local committees on Child Labor are established and their capacity strengthened for policy-making at the local level and the adoption of local action plans on child labor
- Also in the 3 sectors, set up the implementing mechanisms for the action plans on child labor through partnerships among the workplace monitors, teachers and local NGO's
- Involve concerned employers, worker's groups, village leaders, parents and children in the implementation activities of the program for removal and prevention of children in hazardous work.

Project Progress

The overall progress of program implementation is evident in the following:

- 3 PCCL/MCCL have been established with local government, employers, labor unions, teachers and civic groups as representatives
- 6 local government units (PDSALVY/MDSALVY, PDEYS/MDEYS) and 3 NGOs have been tapped as partners
- 36 community monitors have been tapped as community implementing staff
- Some 673 teachers from 43 schools have undergone 2 trainings
- About 566 employers, parents and children have undergone sensitizing work on children rights
- Capacitation activities for community monitors, NFE teachers and NGOs have been conducted on Child Labor Monitoring, Occupational Health & Safety, Design and Management & evaluation of Action Programs, Integrating NFE in the formal curriculum, Credit and Savings Systems for small Business and CL Sensitizing
- Seed money for income-generation have been established in the form of self-help groups among parents of target children
- Programs for non-formal education, skills training and educational materials support are functioning in 15 Community Learning Centers constructed through employer-parents participation

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

- The program has formulated, based on Occupational Health and Safety Assessment of the rubber, salt and fishing sectors, the CLM and OHS checklists and is currently engaged in monitoring 930 children in a target of 100 working establishments.
- Access to educational support services, SHG and capability-building activities have consistently involved women and placed the poorest as priority beneficiaries.

#### Concerns that should be addressed

The pace of completion of project deliverables hastened within the last six-months. There are still significant concerns that must be addressed to ensure sustainability of initial efforts. These concerns relate to the following:

- Finalization, adoption and enforcement of Policy against Child Labor at the national and local government levels to provide legal and political backing for project activities
- A more thorough study of the market/demand for skills as basis for course offerings in vocational education
- A more thorough analysis of viable enterprises for SHGs based on commodity production, market, skills analysis and subsequent skills training for small enterprise management. Since the purpose of small enterprises would be to generate profits from production or sales, there is further need to integrate functional numeracy and literacy for illiterate parents managing the enterprise. There are available modules adapting numeracy and literacy into skills training for small enterprise management.
- Improvement of guidelines in the use of SHG seed-capital to ensure that expected seed money-use shall be followed and that seed money repayment would be assured.
- Sustained program for awareness-raising to commit community participation to sustain the program.

#### Other Possible Improvements

There are other significant improvements that can further sustain project services. These include the following:

- Support activities that enhance physical, social and psychological well-being of children such as sports, recreational activities, counseling, youth camps, career counseling, school-in-a garden, etc.
- Involvement of parents in learning activities through counseling and skills training on income-generation/ earning projects
- Fund-raising programs and participation and contribution of parents, employers
- Coordination with other stakeholders and action programs for support projects like study-now-pay later schemes for vocational training, scholarship grants, apprenticeship programs with companies, youth-led businesses, and nutrition and health education.

#### Sub-cultural concerns

- The program has targeted limited beneficiaries based on the findings of the baseline studies, the limited resources and the criteria established to ensure measurable achievements. There were calls for inclusion in the program activities by other interested families, particularly in the savings and seed money activity . At this point, the awareness-raising activities have yet to integrate sensitivity to grudges among



**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

excluded families which the project limitations may generate. The continuing program for awareness-raising should look at means to address such issue.

- The provision of cash for seed money among poor families is not generally encouraged. Instant cash for impoverished families who have not developed viable options for its use and have no compelling pressure to pay oftentimes result in its use for immediate purposes (e.g., food, payment of outstanding obligations) rather than for what it is intended. The program should carefully design means by which to monitor and direct the use of seed money. This design should be based on viable business after careful study, within a range of diverse economic activities to prevent competing activities, with combinations of partnerships within the SHG rather than solo or single-family projects, or in association with other funding agencies for capital-intensive activities. Pilot projects should also be considered. The seed money and savings program should therefore be supplemented with training on business management, skills training and fiscal management. Correspondingly, this would warrant closer counseling by community monitors and seed money agents who by themselves have none or limited business expertise. Therefore, the implementing agencies should also consider mechanisms for capacitation in this regard.
- The program services have favorably selected and involved women. While this offers women better opportunities to develop their numeracy/literacy abilities, vocation-related and skills in enterprise and finance management, the gap in gender balance should be addressed to afford males the same opportunities. The related strategies should integrate awareness-raising on gender to respond to gender-related issues. Current efforts reflect a "women-in-development" approach and tend to be based on numerical representation rather than a sound perspective on gender as a development issue.
- The NPM unit should develop take steps to firm up the context, contents and methodology of the capacitation program. The general flow has been, initially, to familiarize the project implementing units and beneficiaries on the overall conditions and general program strategies. The succeeding phase should build on the impact of awareness-raising and direct it towards particular community actions/responses. This could also reduce the likelihood of people regressing or falling back into their familiar solutions of having children contribute to the family income at the expense of the child's health and education.

Stakeholders Ideas and Suggestions to promote the sustainability of the program:

- The key to sustainability would be continuing community support. These are anchored on heightened awareness about the value of education, the importance of keeping children in school and keeping them from hazardous work and improving their working conditions. These would be engendered through multi-media sensitizing and successes in soliciting the cooperation of parents, employers and support agencies and successes in self-help activities.
- The operations of the Community Learning Centers should be integrated into the P/MDEYS program.
- Advocate and expand NGO and other agency support for the project.
- The SHG Committees could use savings and interest money to continue and help poor families in the community.

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

- The PCCL/MCCL should continue to coordinate the activities and efforts of all relevant institutions in order to plan for the succeeding activities and lobby for continuing government policy in support of the project.

The common idea in sustaining the programs is to continue the project through community and local government resources. This is a good indication and reflects an acceptance of and ownership over the project. It is vital, however, that employers are brought in to help out in the needed resources to sustain the program. This idea would require practical incentives for employers to support the project. The implementers affirm their commitment to use their experience and knowledge in continuing what they are doing provided they have the means and resources to do so. But it was also noted that contingent outside assistance would be required considering the limited resources of government and the impoverished communities. This could be considered in the sustaining period of the programme after the end of this present duration.

Program Thrusts in the Succeeding Phase in Relation to Project Sustainability and Impact

The program thrust for the next phase should be the following:

- Address program gaps in policy-making and enforcement at the national and local levels; enhance the functionality of the local committees on child labor and the CLU
- Firm-up progressive contents, methodologies and beneficiaries of the capacity building program; link up the program with prospective partners
- Improve and develop supplemental strategies for social protection and community empowerment
- Enhance program partnership through improving and applying management systems for situation analysis, program planning, monitoring and documentation systems, problem-solving and closer linkages with project beneficiaries and combating Child Labor allies/support groups



**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

*Special Concerns Addressed by the Evaluation*Sector-Based Strategies

Based on the Action Programs submitted by sector-based implementing units, there were no significant differences in program strategies across the rubber, fishing and salt sectors. The AP for the fishing sector has included children in fishing boats as part of its target for monitoring. In the case of children in the salt fields, the program strategies for migrant children tend to focus more on those children for prevention (i.e., those in school but have a high risk of dropping out). No clear strategies are evident for the migrant children who are working part-time (i.e., not attending school, working in salt fields and in fishing) or full-time in the salt fields. More focus is given on 'settled' children as the target group for removal objectives.

The measures for the removal and prevention of children from hazardous work are similar across the three sectors: NFE, vocational training, school materials support, establishment of CLCs and SHGs. Vocational courses are also almost similar with sewing, hairdressing, and engine repair as courses for skills training. The SHGs in the fishing and salt sectors have proceeded with seed-capital for fishing materials, community stores and small business.

In terms of implementation progress, there is an almost even pace between the salt and fishing sector. But the implementation in the rubber sector has lagged.

Facilitating/Hindering Factors in Project Implementation Across Sectors

1. Salt Sector: Kampot Province

Program activities in the Salt Sector are implemented by the PDSALVY as the focal government agency for social and labor welfare of children and other vulnerable groups. The labor domain was established in 1997 and has 7 staff enforcing labor legislations in 123 enterprises. The PDEYS is the provincial agency responsible for education. It has established an office in Kampot since 1987 and has since implemented 45 NFE classes with 903 students. The CCPCR is the NGO implementing agency and has been operating in Cambodia since 1994. It has been involved in earlier projects with the ILO-IPEC in Sihanoukville. It is experienced in vocational skills training and reintegration work, as well as in projects on the prevention of trafficking and commercial exploitation of children.

The facilitating factors in project implementation were the ease in the acceptance of the program in the target communities resulting in effective start-up activities. This is indicated in the community participation in the establishment of the CLCs and in the sensitizing activities. There was also a positive development in the credit and savings program, with identified business going smoothly leading to ease in seed payments collection.

In monitoring work, the formation of the PCCL is seen to have a positive effect on employers. This resulted to good cooperation between employers and labor inspectors.

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

The delays in the release of budget for the APs proved to be the main difficulty. Budget limitations have also been noted since there has been an increase in their target of children for removal /prevention from work.

## 2. Fishing Sector: Sihanoukville

The MDSALVY serves as the focal agency. Its labor domain was established in 1991 and presently has 8 staff enforcing labor laws in 86 enterprises. The MDEYS is the agency for education and has established 33 NFE educators in the province since 1987. It implements 29 NFE classes with 552 students. The NGO partner is the Catholic Child Bureau Organization (CCBO) which started work in Sihanoukville in March 2000 to improve child conditions by combating sexual abuse, trafficking and commercial exploitation. It works with child peer groups in some 11 villages in the area.

The facilitating factors identified include the warm acceptance of the program among target communities. This indicated adequate capacities of implementing partners and good cooperation. From among the implementing agencies, familiarity with the localities due to their involvement in the baseline survey may have facilitated their entry into the communities as well as their rapport with the children they are monitoring. The MCCL is also seen as major factor in sustaining the program.

The difficulties brought out were in the monitoring of children working in boats. The program has yet to improve strategies on how to address this sub-sector. Problems are also being met in setting up the vocational skills training in Tomnop Rolok due to the high training fees being charged by the trainers. Additional problems cited were the insufficiency of seed money and the delay in its release for SHG activities.

## 3. Rubber Sector: Kampong Cham Province

The PDSALVY is in charge of social and labor welfare for children and vulnerable groups. Its labor and vocational training office was set up in the area in 1994 with 9 staff. The PDEYS is the provincial agency for education. It was set up in 1980 and has 11 staff and runs 157 NFE classes for 4386 students. The Kak Sekor Thmey (KTO) was engaged as the locally-based NGO in January 2002. It was established in 1993 and has experiences in credit and savings schemes, agriculture, health education and advocacy programs.

Facilitating factors to project implementation in this project site are few. One is the relative familiarity of the PDSALVY and KTO staff with the villages as a consequence of their participation in the baseline survey. This familiarity eases the monitoring work. Another is the interest with which some community members assisted in the establishment of the CLCs in their localities.

An important factor that delayed coordination work in the area was the late entry of the Sector Project Coordinator in June 2002. This has necessarily contributed to the lateness in initiating the project activities.

To date, the targets for capacity-building, mobilization and empowerment strategies have not been reached resulting in low levels of awareness of the project in the villages. Considerable work has to be done for the prevention aspects. Self-help groups have not

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

as yet received seed-capital. Sensitizing work in schools has yet to start and CLC activities have just begun.

The main difficulties in this sector are the lack of support from rubber plantation operators for the program owing to their denial of use of child labor. The relative isolation of the area and distances of the villages from the center of the plantation and from each other pose robbery and security risks for community and workplace monitors who have to work in groups. The practice of changing children's names in the work lists and lack of significant data on mobile target children pose problems in monitoring. For vocational training, trainers are having difficulty with the low levels of literacy. The operators have not been providing space/structures for CLCs as originally agreed on.

### Assessment of local committees for child labor (PCCL/MCCL)

The local committees set up in the 3 sectors have the role of evaluating activities relating to child labor and other forms of commercial exploitation of children (see Table 7). They are expected to resolve issues arising from program implementation through referral systems among the responsible departments. They are tasked to formulate policy at the local level and enforcement of national policies. They also review Action Programs for the project and develop local action plans combating child labor. The committees are chaired by the Governor and composed of representatives from the M/PDSALVY, local department for education, agriculture, women, health, rural development, information and environment, from employers, workers, community council and the NGOs.

**Table 7.** Composition and Role of the Local Committees on Child Labor

Sector	Fish/Shrimp Processing	Rubber Plantations	Salt
Role	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Evaluate activities related to child labor</li> <li>By referral system, initiate problem-solving</li> <li>Policy formulation/adoption</li> <li>Report to the NSC</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Evaluate activities related to child labor</li> <li>By referral system, initiate problem-solving</li> <li>Policy formulation/adoption</li> <li>Report to the NSC</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Evaluate activities related to child labor</li> <li>By referral system, initiate problem-solving</li> <li>Policy formulation/adoption</li> <li>Report to the NSC</li> </ul>
Composition	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>18 persons headed by Governor</li> <li>8 government, 2 employees, 2 fishermen, 2 NGO, 1 Community Council, 1 Secretariat (PDSALVY)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>19 persons headed by Governor</li> <li>11 government, 1 rubber plantation, 3 communes, 2 workers, 2 NGO; Secretariat (MDSALVY)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>22 persons headed by 3<sup>rd</sup> Governor</li> <li>13 government, 2 salt employer, 2 employee, 2 NGO, Secretariat PDSALVY</li> </ul>
No. of Meetings	4	3	3 (every 2 mos.)
Main Outputs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Draft Guideline on Prevention/elimination of Child Labor and Working Conditions in the Sector</li> <li>Formulation of AP</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Draft Guideline on Prevention/elimination of Child Labor and Working Conditions in the Sector</li> <li>Formulation of AP</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Draft Guidelines ready but not signed</li> <li>Formulation of AP</li> </ul>
Capacitation	Preparation is on-going for training workshop	Preparation is on-going for training workshop	Preparation is on-going for training workshop
Difficulties	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Employee representation from Tomnop Rolok only</li> <li>No regular attendance</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Governors schedule is busy</li> <li>No site visits</li> <li>No regular attendance</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Chair has no approving authority for regulations and legislation but can sign directives</li> </ul>

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

---

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>▪ Busy schedule of governor</li><li>▪ Short on staffing and budget</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>▪ No support staff</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>▪ No staff, PDSALVY overload with work</li><li>▪ No regular meetings</li></ul>
--	--	--	--

---

---

The local committees have been established August-Sept 2002 and have 3-4 meetings conducted every 2 months. These meetings primarily focused on their formation, the review of Action Program for approval within the project and the review of the draft Guideline on Prevention/ Elimination of Child Labor and Working Conditions in their respective sector.

The identified problems were common among the 3 sectors. These concern the lack of quorum and lack of concrete outputs when the governor fails to chair the committee. The functions of the committees are tied to a hierarchal process and may be relegated by politically pressing issues of the coming July 2003 elections.

There is still a need to build capacities among the members of the committees. The planned workshop should focus on the conditions of child labor based on the OHS Assessment and conditions of the sector, and geared towards policy measures and operations of the committee. It would also be significant if visits to the workplaces could be included to give Committee members concrete understanding of the conditions of the workplaces in their sector.

The key to the functioning of the committee at the sector level would be the legal framework through the formal announcement and draft local action plan. This would require information coming from baseline studies, the OHS Assessment and results of community monitoring.

To lessen winded deliberations, the Committee could compose a working group in between sessions which could prepare drafts, research and suggest actions for study by members prior to formal sessions. The PDSALVY plays the key role with support from the PDEYS and the NGO program partners, the CLU and the NPM. This work relates primarily to their local policy advocacy, which are backstopped by a short-term technical consultant.

Once the key policies and the Local Action Plan are formulated, the sustaining steps would be enforcement. This should integrate the mechanisms of community monitors organized through the supporting measures and the networks brought about by program capacity-building activities.

#### Child Labor and OHS Monitoring Mechanism

The monitoring forms for children for removal and prevention from hazardous work and the Occupational Health and Safety Checklists have been developed<sup>19</sup>. The use of the forms has been discussed in 2 trainings for Child Labor Monitoring in September 2002. The initial outputs from monitoring have been entered into the database system. Monitoring reports against total target children for monitoring is not as yet completed as of writing time of this report. This is yet to be collated for review on behavioral changes and changes in the workplace.

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

### Strategy for mobilizing NGOs

The strategy for working with non-government organizations in the target sectors is integral to the program. The pre-program phase defined the presence of the Association of Cambodian Local Economic Development Agency (ACLEDA) in the fishing sector primarily involved provision of seed-capital, RHAC for reproductive health, LICADHO, ADHOC and CCPCR for human rights and the KWCD on trafficking of women.<sup>20</sup> Some 62 International organizations and local NGO's indicated operations in the target sectors.<sup>21</sup>

The program start-up phase was able to immediately mobilize the CCPCR and the CCBO in the salt and fishing sectors, respectively. Through referral, the KTO was tapped for the rubber sector. NGO support for project activities was initially mobilized during the national seminar on Child Labor, with several local NGOs in attendance. At the fishing and salt sectors, stakeholder analysis to situate NGO participation and assistance to the project were conducted. The LICADHO presence in the training for project implementers and beneficiaries is observable. In the rubber sector, however, there were no stakeholder consultations and other NGOs' participation was not noted.

Program strategies for the succeeding phase would require NGO's expertise in sustaining activities such as savings and seed money activity, educational incentives, policy-development and capacity building work. Child labor is located within a comprehensive response to the issue of poverty reduction and should not be constrained by defined program focus. A program should be seriously considered to galvanize support for the project.

### Government Commitment

The country is signatory to the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child. In 1997, it adopted a new labor code establishing the minimum age of employment at 15 years old and hazardous work limited to persons above 18 years old. In 1999, the government ratified seven of the eight Fundamental ILO Conventions. Convention 182, on the Worst Forms of Child Labor, was forwarded to the National Assembly for final endorsement. A 5-Year Action Plan for non-formal education has been developed and the Cambodian National Council of Children was set up to address issues on children, including child labor. A 5-Year Plan against Trafficking and Sexual Exploitation of Children has been in effect since 1999.

The government commitment to address the issue of child labor is indicated in the 1997 National Framework of Action for child labor measures to address abuse of children. This national framework needed to be updated to focus on children working in the hazardous sector. A more recent articulation of this commitment is in the National Poverty Reduction Strategy (NPRS) for 2003-2005.<sup>22</sup> As in 1997, the MOSALVY is the lead agency to enforce child-related legislation through its network of inspectors. The NFE department of the MoEYS is the lead agency for programs on non-formal education. The government has also established the National Sub-Committee on Child Labor and other forms of Commercial Exploitation (NSC) to set national policy guidelines to respond to the issues review and endorse child labor action program and monitor their implementation. MoSALVY chairs the NSC and coordinates the Working Group for Child Labor (WG-CL) to

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

involve government and non-government responses. The Ministry has set up a Child-Labor Unit (CLU) composed of three personnel.

The present commitment of government in the program is evident in the following:

- 18 labor inspectors from the local departments of the MoSALVY are engaged in child labor monitoring
- 673 teachers have been engaged for sensitizing on children rights, community monitoring and non-formal education
- 3 local committees on child labor have been set up, chaired by 3 Governors and with some 32 government representatives and coordinated by the PDSALVY
- The Child Labor Unit of the MoSALVY is currently implementing an Action Program for strengthening and enhancing the role of MoSALVY in Combating the Hazardous Forms of Child Labor
- Provision of educational facilities and office space for the Sector office of the program
- Occupational Health and Safety Assessment for the 3 sectors conducted by the MoSALVY.
- Development of information materials on child labor
- Implementation of the Education for All Program which provided for free education especially in the 3 sectors.
- Through its National Institute of Statistics, the government's conduct of the Cambodia Child Labor Survey 2001
- Actionable measures specified in the government's NPRS 2003-2005 (e.g., strengthening the NSCCL; the design, implementation and monitoring of child labor programs, conduct of research on labor issues)

Government commitment is hampered primarily by the lack of resources and the slow procedures in the finalization of the 2 draft Ministerial Orders on hazardous work and occupations and on special working conditions for young workers. At the local level, draft announcements on child labor in the rubber, salt and fishing sectors are stymied by the irregular meetings and lack of experience, as well as by the heavy workload of MoSALVY personnel. There were observable problems with earlier counterpart funding for the program implementation during the first 6 months.

Overall, there are good indications of government support for the project. However, the situation of the government bureaucracy in the country is such that local government is dependent on resources from the national government, which also has limited budget. At the local level, the government lacks legislative councils, lacks comprehensive development framework does not have revenue-generation measures to support its operations and department personnel have no latitude to advocate initiatives. The situation does not bode well for career personnel. They have little experience in development planning and are not familiar with the development framework and the various studies within their fields of work or interests. Low pay and a bleak career advancement, unless politically connected, are reasons for them to seek second jobs.

#### Legislative Measures

The government committed to the formulation of two Ministerial Orders on the prohibition of hazardous child labor and on types of light work for children aged 12-14

---



**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

years. The present *Prakas* or Ministerial Orders are still in draft form and for subsequent review by the project's legal consultant prior to the consideration of the WG-CL and endorsement to the Labor Advisory Committee<sup>23</sup>.

A cursory review of the draft document shows that it still has to be based on significant inputs from the OHS Assessment in the target sectors (salt, rubber, fishing, garments, bricks, agriculture). The legal basis, related legislations and allowable penal provisions require the study of legal experts familiar with Cambodian and international jurisprudence of similar concern.

The processing of national Ministerial Orders would require some time. Its definitive content requires negotiations between employers and labor unions. This undergoes procedural requirements by other groups beyond the control of the CLU. At the provincial/local level, the results of the July 2003 elections would be a significant factor in the operations of the local committees. There are also delays in the organizing of process activities for preparation and documentary review and coordination with other departments.

The 3 draft Provincial Announcements/Guidelines for the sectors need to proceed from the results of OHS Assessments and actual visits in the work places including inputs from the child labor survey of the Ministry of Planning and the baseline surveys of the program. It would be necessary for the program to provide venues for a workshop on the results of these studies.

The review noted the outputs of the PCCL/MCCL through local notices (i.e., Provincial Guidelines on Child Labor—"Special Announcement" annexed in the background reports) and regulations referring to its formation, functions and internal protocol (also annexed in the background reports).

#### Project Linkages

As part of the National Plan of Action on Child Labor, the government through a partnership with ILO is also supporting several actions:

- Information campaign against child labor
- Capacity building for labor inspectors
- Development of curriculum and training materials for NFE
- Conduct of child labor surveys through the Ministry of Planning
- Labor monitoring for brick-making factories and garment factories

Coordination work among action programs is primarily through national workshops and through the Working Group on Child Labor and community consultations. There was no observable local coordination through the PCCL/MCCL at present. Local coordination has been noted in the salt and fishery sector with other NGOs like the LICADHO. Prospects to tie up savings and seed money activities are being considered with the ACLEDA.

#### Gender Mainstreaming

The program objective indicators have been noted as gender-focused. The participation of women is evident both on the side of implementing units and the beneficiaries, albeit a



**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

little less in the former at the management level. There is comparative balance in women monitors. Female children have a comparative balance as well among those targeted for removal from hazardous work or prevented from entering hazardous work and directed towards school and vocational studies. Majority of beneficiaries and group leaders in the self-help groups organized were women. The latter, through the self-help groups, would be responsible for the use of seed money, removing their children from work, engaging in some income-generating enterprise, ensuring repayment of seed money and the generation of family/community savings. While these are potentially empowering for the women, the other half of the gender issue seems overlooked, however. That is, how the men are being involved or enlightened on their roles in preventing the incidence of child labor and in supporting their female family members' participation in SHGs are not clearly articulated by the implementing agencies and the beneficiaries.

The sensitizing activities have integrated awareness-raising against domestic violence, the significant role of parents in encouraging children to study and reproductive health, all issues close to the gender sensitivity issue. However, sensitizing is generally among females (mothers through SHGs) and children (in NFE) with the participation of men only in community meetings which focuses on community support and assistance to program activities. There is an initial observation that domestic violence has decreased among some families in Koh Kjong commune in the fishing sector, suggesting that awareness of the issue is being internalized and practiced.

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

conclusions and recommendations

## Conclusions

The purpose of the mid-term evaluation of the project is to serve as a management and learning tool for project management and key stakeholders; as an information base by which stakeholders can assess the achievements made and possibly revise work plans, strategies, objectives, partnership arrangements and resource allocation and recommendations for the way forward; and as a review mechanism on external factors affecting project implementation and on necessary inputs that may be required for project success. It also aims to address over-all ILO evaluation concerns project relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability, and behavior changes among the stakeholders and beneficiaries.

### A. Management Consideration

The over-all design of the project provided for sufficient guidelines in its implementation. Measures of the design were definite about the significant requirements for effective project implementation. Specifically the start-up phase provided for measures to:

- define the objective conditions by which the project shall operate;
- define the conditions of its beneficiaries and stakeholders;
- set up structures for implementation; and
- provide initial capacity building to effect orientation and technical requirements for delivery of services.

The succeeding phase of services implementation should have the management focus on monitoring systems and problem-solving measures. The subsequent phase would have its thrust putting in place sustaining measures.

While the phasing of the project was ideal, it did not foresee the context by which the project would be coming into. Specifically, the problems related to the slow movement within the Cambodian government for structures and policies for new initiatives. This should have been defined further as part of the basis for capacity building.

The key factors for the slow start-up lie in the lateness of the baseline surveys (and its inclusion within the project duration), the absence of sector coordinators, and the slow movement for fiscal and material support for the APSOs. It would be of interest for the evaluation, for example, to know the experience of the Programme Coordinators and key players of the Implementing Agencies/Partners (IA/Ps) in community organizing, capability building and policy-development which serves as the project's main milieu. This is crucial in terms of the quality of services rendered (e.g., quality of awareness-raising: did seed money agents focus on provision of seed-capital and not project's desire for removal and prevention of children from child labor?). Key staff provide the impetus to the project direction. The start-up phase is the time by which the key staff are unified in terms of project objectives, strategies and corresponding requirements from them in terms of technical input and coordination. This period should have put in place systems which would move the project efficiently: financial, monitoring, controls, documentation

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

procedures and other policies. The project evaluation was not able to look into this aspect at the level of the NPM unit and key IA/Ps.

The significant capacity building work, as related to methodologies in delivery of services, has been well-provided by the Project Management, although late during the second half of 2002. Understanding how to deliver the services is important but these methods should be located within the conditions where the project will operate. This should have been firmed up in program planning (AP preparation). It was noted that generally, the AP translated the national Project Proposal into local activities. It did not dwell on the local conditions which should define and/or shape strategies. The baseline studies could have provided this, but the study results also came late.

As the program goes into high gear in its delivery of services (NFE, vocational skills training, educational support, monitoring, community seed money and savings scheme and awareness-raising), program management would shift towards program monitoring—this would look into quantity and quality of outputs relative to the program design against the capacity of the structures established for implementing the services. This period would demand more participation of key staff in terms of hands-on management and problem-solving.

For this reason, the evaluation recommends that the management unit conducts an assessment among key staff to define status relative to the plan they made (AP), define their own capabilities, and foresee issues within the present tasks. This would refocus their plans and define management interventions in terms of additional capacity building and other technical inputs. This shall also give management leeway in trouble-shooting problems, for example in policy-development.

#### B. The Information base as Monitoring Mechanism

Monitoring serves primarily as a tool to provide information to management on the status of program implementation. This information is the basis for making corrective measures to strengthen positive factors and lessen the impact of negative factors.

Generally, the evaluation gave significant information which management should consider:

- Relative to the project phasing (time), start-up activities lapsed by 2 quarters. It would be important for management to assess if the remaining period is still feasible against the programme targets given concrete contextual conditions (e.g., upcoming elections).
- Relative to the progress across program components, policy-development is lagging behind the three components of capacity-building, social protection and community development. Seen within the timeframe, this component will not be able to deliver its targets on time.
- Relative to progress across the target sectors, the sector for rubber plantation work is lagging behind that of the fishing and salt sectors. Given the unresolved issue of cooperation from the plantation operator, this sector shall continue to lag in its targets.
- Relative to the main objective of removing and preventing children from hazardous work, the measures for their removal are in place (NFE, skills training, education

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

support, seed money assistance to parents) but sustaining their participation in the program measures are not yet well thought out. The program has to look into defining objectives, methods, contents and direction of these activities.

The monitoring mechanism has to define indicators for project successes beyond the quantitative targets. For example, for capacity building, it should begin at the present capacity level of beneficiaries (benchmark) then gauged using indicators based on quantity, initiatives, attitudes, skills learned, program understanding.

To improve the mechanisms for collection of information and data on program progress, the following could be proposed as part of basis for information for effective monitoring:

- The reporting format for the progress of APs submitted is qualified in terms of actual progress vs. target (time, quantity, budget) across program work schedule (GANTT chart);
- The progress reports available at the sector level should include discussions on management and contextual issues affecting progress and how these were resolved;
- Documentation mechanisms like journals, interviews, process documentation should be in place;
- Minutes of monthly meetings between IA/Ps, among the CLU and WG and NSC, periodic assessment/planning and results of area visits were not appended to the periodic reports;
- Results of database on baseline information, child status, attendance records of schools, mapping of measures on ground, etc. should be provided. The database program reveals that there is room for improvement in terms of these items; and
- Information flow-chart to define authority and intervening actions may also be included as part of defining program information systems management.

The information generated would be valuable if management can situate its significance within the program design. The evaluation noted several problems/ issues-raised but without deeper understanding of its causes. Some of these included the following:

- Delay in funding. This needs to be studied in terms of where bottlenecks are located and what agency should take action.
- Absences in the PCCL/MCCL. Is this related to the lack of understanding about the program, the structure or issues like schedules, lack of coordination? "But why?" methods can be used to ferret out the cause and for its resolution.

In relation to this, the program should look into capacity building with regard to the issues of analysis and problem-solving and through workshop with IA/Ps, define areas by which present monitoring mechanism can be improved.

### C. Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency, and Sustainability

The fundamental reasons for the program still apply. This was validated by the baseline study and proven by the acceptance of the beneficiaries of the program services.

The implementing structures organized as delivery systems of the program were effective. The implementing agencies at the sector-level were found to have established

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

a network and functional programmes by which the services on child labor can be channeled. This provided ease in making the project acceptable to its beneficiaries and enhanced participation in awareness-raising and sensitizing, community monitoring, support educational activities and seed money activities. However, the operations of implementing structures at the provincial and national level have yet to be improved.

While the delivery of program services have been initiated on a wider scale, this has to be continued and regularized as part of the IA/Ps regular activities. Effective monitoring systems should be established so that the IA/Ps can regularize their operations relative to child labor. This demand that the project services should be defined further in terms of objectives, methodologies, contents and direction. This would raise current activities into more sustaining measures against child labor, including defining agency initiatives as part of activities to define an action plan on CL.

The initial activities located actions on child labor within defined IA/Ps. These activities have to be mainstreamed to be part of their regular functions, thus according agency responsibilities for its sustainability. But this should be broadened with other agencies not yet directly related to the program but have concerns on children and their parents. The representative agencies in the PCCL/MCCL should define their own initiatives through the local action program. It would be important for program management to define stakeholders' areas of intervention within the present program and in sustaining actions for the project. For example, the Ministry of Health can play a role in nutrition and health education, the Ministry of Planning in the database on child labor and enterprises employing children, etc.

The key to sustaining the project is to mainstream the program as part of regular functions of the MoSALVY and the MoEYS, and broadening support through local action plans on child labor in support of the national action plan. The program also has to initiate linkages among the NGO network, employers, labor groups and church and civic organizations. The government, after concrete policy and laws have been installed, should also put measures to define sanctions, punitive actions and incentive programmes for enterprises supporting the program.

## **Recommendations**

Based on the findings and the above conclusions, this section offers recommendations and alternative strategies for project management and stakeholders to consider for the rest of the project phase and future possible phase.

### *Strengths of the Program*

- The program has been successfully promoted in the project communities.
- The start up activities on awareness-raising, sensitizing, community organizing and networking have been done effectively.
- The educational support activities through the NFE, vocational training program and support materials for school children are in place to enhance the removal and prevention of children from hazardous work.
- The credit and savings program has been jump-started.

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

- Community dialogues between labor inspectors and employers, between implementing agencies and beneficiaries have brought about understanding of each other's roles and of the program objectives
- The program has recognized and involved women in all the program activities and processes

*Gaps in Implementation*

- There is a need to fast-track policy development at the national and local level
- There is a need to complete studies on job markets/ demands and economic alternatives as inputs to sustaining the program measures
- There is a need to fast-track program implementation at the rubber sector
- There is need to improve measures in child removal and prevention measures
- There is a need to improve the measures to sustain the program, suggestions for which are noted in the succeeding sections.

*Recommendations for the remaining period of the project*Policy, Program Planning and Research

- The ILO has fast-tracked the hiring of legal consultants who will assist the CLU in the review of the existing national labor code and in drafting the 2 Ministerial Orders. The legal consultants should provide inputs in terms of the results of the OHS Assessment to define conditions in the work places where the draft policy would be applicable. The inputs should consider that the main purpose of the Ministerial Orders is to foster a good environment for business and to regulate enterprises rather than be punitive of errant enterprises. In line with this, a review of the penal provisions for the Ministerial Orders should be considered.
- The NPM should formulate a catch-up plan with the CLU that would clarify procedures in meeting their outputs. The Terms of Reference of the legal consultants can integrate some familiarization of the CLU on similar directives based on other country experiences.
- The formulation of the national action plan on child labor in hazardous sectors should be a coordinated effort among stakeholders involved in work among children. Initial input from various agencies should be solicited as preparatory to the conduct of a national workshop. The national workshop is a significant forum by which the program can build a wide alliance among those involved against child labor and enhancing conditions of children. It is also a good venue by which the program can present its experience in combating child labor and removing or preventing children from hazardous work and mainstream them to educational activities.

In consideration of the larger issue of enhancing a viable business climate to build up the Cambodian economy, the national workshop should encourage a larger participation of the business community. This serves to inform them that the main objective of the laws against child labor is to regulate business conditions rather than disrupt them, and that regulation have the objective of betterment of work within the concept of more humane conditions, including respect for child rights.

- The information materials produced by the CLU should be maximized as means of measuring awareness on child rights and on child labor among beneficiaries. Pre-testing and post-testing activities should be promoted by program implementers

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

- Capacity building measures should be designed to assist personnel of MoSALVY, the CLU and key members of the PCCL/MCCL involved in formulation of national laws and local policies. The legal framework and other country legislations are significant backgrounds that would complement their local grounding in workplace visits/monitoring.

#### Capacity-building of Implementing Agencies

- The capacity building strategy has not been developed based on a reading of the present capabilities and needs of the implementing agencies. While the criteria for NGO selection, for example, defined experience in implementation of related activities, it is not logical to assume that present personnel have the capacity to resolve emerging issues from project implementation. A workshop with sectoral IAs noted that problem solving and planning capabilities, including understanding of prevailing conditions, was a major gap that should be responded to. The program for capacity-building in the remaining period should also address the concern of awareness-raising and networking program initiatives with other support groups with the prospect of sustaining the initiatives in support of national action plan against child labor.
- Measures aimed at improving the strategies in the rubber sector should be conducted through strategy workshops with implementing partners including rubber plantation operators.
- IAs should be encouraged to come up with more collaborative initiatives with other non-IPEC entities which are into issues not currently covered by the project, or themselves to fill the gap in implementation. For example, it is clear that in most target areas, family planning promotion work is seriously needed. If IAs in the area are not covering this, they should look into collaborating with others who do so, in whatever way that is appropriate. The same thing can be done with other intervening issues such as domestic violence, drug abuse, etc.

#### Social Protection and Community Monitoring

1. Improvements in the measures for removal and prevention of children through educational support through non-formal education, children reintegration to formal schools and vocational training should be considered. These imply:
  - the need to improve criteria for selection of children for skills training, selecting skills based on demand/market analysis or for local income-generation/earning opportunities, selecting trainers, apprenticeship programs.
  - that the skills training should not be limited to skills for employment but also for income-generating activities within the project area. It could offer courses for small business management or for other productive endeavors which opens better income prospects for the children than returning to hazardous work.
  - that the program for provision of seed capital could pilot programs for children who graduate from skills training. The premise is that these children come from poor families and have no seed capital for establishing enterprises using skills learned. Children's self-help groups can also be organized from training batches (i.e., those with common skills).
  - support activities that enhance the children's physical, social and psychological well-being such as sports, recreational activities, counseling, youth camps, career counseling, etc. This could be included in the skills training or CLC activities.



**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

- the involvement of both parents in learning activities through counseling and livelihood-related skills training.
  - fund-raising programs and participation and contribution of parents, employers; and
  - coordination with other stakeholders and action programs for support projects like study-now-pay later schemes for vocational training, scholarship grants, and apprenticeship programs with companies or support for youth-led businesses.
2. Improvements in the implementation of program for seed money activities and savings mobilization for income-generating projects of families through functional Self-Help Groups should also be considered:
- Selection of SHG seed money-use activities through analysis of viable enterprises based on commodity production, market, skills analysis and subsequent skills training for small enterprise management.
  - Improvement of guidelines in the use of SHG seed-capital to ensure that expected seed money-use shall be followed and that seed repayment would be assured.
  - Sustained efforts for awareness-raising to commit community participation to uphold the program through the proactive involvement of fathers and other male community members and empowering SHG members, especially women, in small enterprise management skills.
3. Encouraging community participation Child Labor Monitoring and more effective monitoring through:
- Monitoring roles for CLC Support groups and cooperating employers
  - Implementing mobile NFE activities in distant villages/ rubber plantation
  - Database profiling/monitoring of target children

#### Strategies to address gaps in program implementation in the sectors

- The program management should look at means by which cooperation by plantation operators for the project could be improved. The Coordinators of the Implementing Agencies would have definite possibilities for resolving this impasse: liaison work among the plantation representatives in the PCCL and member government agencies related to its operation (Provincial Department for Agriculture) may offer practical means or third-party presence through the PCCL chair in scheduled dialogues with plantation operators and government supervisor may also be an option.
- The program should review its initial targets in relation to difficult sub-sectors like migrant children. It should indicate if it can still meet target within the remaining program period. This would decide mechanisms to allow or let go of such sub-sectors.

#### Management and Coordination Measures

The partnership established within the program should be enhanced by improving and applying management systems for situation analysis, program planning, monitoring and documentation systems, problem-solving and closer linkages with project beneficiaries and combating Child Labor allies/support groups. This would also require improved mechanisms for allocation of finances and resources.

**FINAL REPORT:**

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA  
ILO – IPEC

---

- The management office should respond to the issue of delays in the releases of budgets for the Action Programs. This is crucial given the pace of community activities. Flow-charting the process for approval and releases of budget should be conducted to identify bottleneck and rectifications in the process or the requirements.
- The management office should sit down with key partners to discuss the issues surrounding the need for support in the CLU and the PCCL, particularly to see if such tasks can be responded to by the short-term consultant provided for or if such tasks require new staff, and if it is within the program's ability to fund.
- The results of the baseline studies should be provided to the implementing agencies so that this can serve as input in policy formulation and continuing planning.
- The program management should systematize documentation of the activities and its impact on the beneficiaries. This should not be limited to bland quantitative instruments but should also include process documentation, minutes and journals that would serve to document the challenges in program. Documentation should be encouraged among implementing agencies as a way of relating their experiences and summarizing lessons learned. This is important for model development. Participatory documentation should also be conducted with beneficiaries for them to relate their own growth within the program. For example, during art classes in the non-formal education.
- Program activities that would bring together sector-based IAs should also be conducted. This would bring about a comprehensive view of the program across sectors and the national level. It affords chance for change agents to meet each other, exchange experiences, be informed about their similar or distinct lines of work and break sectoral or bureaucratic walls.
- The activities of the PCCL/MCCL could be enhanced by the conduct of its training workshop, through meetings with beneficiaries and suggested working group to prepare the issues for its deliberation.

\*\*\*\*\*

***FINAL REPORT:***

**MID-TERM EVALUATION:** PROJECT TO COMBAT CHILD LABOR IN HAZARDOUS WORK IN THE SALT PRODUCTION, RUBBER PLANTATION, AND FISHING SECTORS IN CAMBODIA

ILO – IPEC

---

## **ANNEXES**



**TERMS OF REFERENCE  
for  
Mid-Term Evaluation  
Of**

**The Project to Combat Child Labour in Hazardous Work in the Salt Production,  
Rubber Plantation, and Fishing Sectors in Cambodia CMB/01/P51/USA**

**Project number: CMB/01/P51/USA**

**Financing Agency: US-DOL**

**Type of Evaluation: Mid-term**

**Geographical Coverage: Sihanouk Ville, Kampot, Kampong Cham provinces and  
Phnom Penh of Cambodia**

**Date and Duration of the Evaluation: April-May 2003**

**Preparation Date: Jan. 2003**

**I. PROJECT BACKGROUND AND JUSTIFICATION:**

The salt production, rubber plantations, and fishing/shrimp processing sectors in Cambodia represent the economic sectors where, very visibly, children and youth are engaged in exploitative and hazardous child labor.

This project targets these three sectors for concerted action to eliminate the worst forms of child labor. It deepens national efforts against child labor by devolving programs at the local district levels and strengthening grassroots capacity to meet and address the problem of child labor. The community level agencies and organizations in Cambodia will have been strengthened to plan, initiate, implement and evaluate actions to prevent and progressively eliminate child labor, especially those in hazardous working situations. The project initiates interventions aimed at the systematic withdrawal of children from full-time or/and hazardous work while simultaneously promoting local participation and ownership.

The project is made up of four different components:

- Policy, Program Planning, Research and Documentation
- Capacity Building
- Targeted Social Protection (direct action)
- Community Empowerment and Community-based child labour monitoring schemes

Thus far, the project has carried out:

- Organizing a national seminar on child labor in the salt production, fishing and rubber plantation where action plan has been recommended for addressing child labor in the three sectors (Nov. 28-29, 2001)

- Profiling of working children in the three sectors. The findings were presented to the provincial committees on child labor in the three respective provinces and gained feedback on how to effectively address those problems (Dec. 01 to June 2002).
- Ten intended implementing agencies received training on project design, management and evaluation this past year (June 2002).
- A training workshop on capacity building for non-formal educators from provincial education offices and NGOs in the three provinces was held (August 2002).
- Capacity building and enhancing implementing partners to effectively run credit scheme activities (Feb. 13-15, 2003).
- Revision, printing, training and dissemination of child labor advocacy kit to help combating child labor in the three hazardous sectors (Feb.01).
- Drafting ministerial orders (PRAKAS) on hazardous child labor and light work at the national level.
- There are 9 action programmes are being implemented to date<sup>1</sup> while another action program is in the process of approval at IPEC (the first two APs started in Sept. 2001).

The action programs have been implemented at different speed in sectors depending on various factors including the completion of baseline surveys in the three sectors, recruitment and the re-recruitment of project staff, the setting up of provincial committees on child labor (original idea was Provincial Advisory Committee “PAC”) is fast or slow, building up social alliances with employers and parents is hard or difficult, identification of implementing partners (in particular for salt sector) and the experience of partners to work with international organizations, the approval procedures within the ILO and general capacity within the sectors concerned.

The operational objective of this project is to contribute to the progressive elimination of child labor in the salt, rubber and fishing sectors in Cambodia by removing children from hazardous employment and working conditions and preventing more children from entering workplaces through direct assistance and capacity building programs. More specifically the project intends to reach approximately 3,500 working children through direct action programs. 900<sup>2</sup> of these children will be removed from hazardous work and its conditions; 2600<sup>3</sup> working children will be prevented from moving into hazardous work considered as the worst forms of child labor.

The immediate objectives are two-fold:

*Immediate Objective 1:* At the end of the program, the capacity of national and community level agencies and organizations in Cambodia will have been strengthened to plan, initiate, implement and evaluate action to prevent and progressively eliminate child labor, especially those in hazardous work situations.

*Immediate Objective 2:* At the end of the project, an estimated nine hundred working children working in salt, production in the Kampot province, rubber plantations in Kampong Cham, and fishing/shrimp processing industry in Sihanoukville Province will have been removed from hazardous employment and working conditions; and two thousand six hundred working

---

<sup>1</sup> Salt sector (3 APs), fishing sector (2 APs + 1 pipeline AP), rubber sector (3 APs), and at national level (1 AP).

<sup>2</sup> Salt sector (300 working children), fishing sector (400 working children), rubber sector (200 working children).

<sup>3</sup> Salt sector (600 part-time working children), fishing sector (1,250 part-time working children), rubber sector (750 part-time working children).

children will be prevented from moving into hazardous work considered as the worst forms of child labor in the same locations.

### **Evaluation background:**

The project duration is 30 months (project start date September, 2001). The present evaluation serves as the mid-term evaluation stipulated in the project document. Following the participatory process stipulated in the IPEC evaluation process all key stakeholders were consulted on creating the present Terms of Reference. Contents of the Terms of Reference are the result of discussion with donor, project management and ILO/IPEC Design, Evaluation and Database Unit.

Based on consultations with key stakeholders and taking into account that two out of the three sectors had not started its activities at the time of the scheduled evaluation (Nov. 2002), the evaluation date for the mid-term was postponed and is now scheduled for April -May 2003.

## **II. SCOPE AND PURPOSE**

The present evaluation will cover the start-up phase of the project as well as project activities that have taken place to date in the three sectors and at the national level (MoSALVY).

This mid-term evaluation should aim:

- To serve as management and learning tool for the project management team as well as other key stakeholders. These include lessons learnt and good practices identified to date, highlighting successes to be maintained and/or replicated in the rest of this phase and in future possible phase.
- To provide all stakeholders with the information needed to assess the achievements made thus far and possibly revise work plans, strategies, objectives, partnership arrangements and resource allocation as well as to provide recommendations for the way forward.
- To review external factors (if any) that may not have been taken into account at the time of project formulation which require project attention or adjustments.
- To assess what supplementary inputs, that project may need in reaching the project objectives for the rest of this phase and in reaching the development objective in eliminating worst forms of child labor in the three sectors. For example, if there is a need for an infrastructure or services which IPEC cannot financially support, who/how may be able to help the project on this.
- To address the overall ILO evaluation concerns such as relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability, behavior changes among the stakeholders and beneficiaries.

The following are the broad suggested aspects that can be identified at this point for the evaluation to address. Other aspects can be added as identified by the evaluation consultant(s) in accordance with given purpose.

## **III. SPECIFIC ASPECTS TO BE ADDRESSED:**

### **Design:**

- An assessment of the design of the project and its relative appropriateness in the Cambodian context and in the three sectors concerned.
- Examine whether the beneficiaries were clearly identified (sub-groups, age, socio-economic status, etc. 'poor' or 'women' is not a homogenous group so were more details needed to identify target groups?) or did the subsequent profiling/baseline

- activities resolve any concerns regarding identification of beneficiaries? Was data collected relevant to the project? Was it gender/poverty sensitive?
- Evaluate whether the problems and needs were adequately analyzed.
- Determine whether the needs, constraints, resources and access to project services of the different beneficiaries were clearly identified taking gender issues into concern.
- Assess how appropriate the original project indicators were.
- Evaluate the indicators to see if they were gender sensitive

### **Effectiveness:**

#### Delivery process

- Review and assess the relative efficiency of the start-up phase of the project, including:
  - Organizing national seminar on child labor in the hazardous sectors and the recommended action plan to address the child labor problem in the three sectors;
  - Gathering of baseline information;
  - Recruitment of staff;
  - Establishment of three provincial committees on child labor and
  - Trainings of stakeholders
- Assess whether a delivery mode for different beneficiary sub-groups were identified (different times for project activities for ‘poor men versus men’ or ‘women versus men’ and location of planned activity, methodology etc.)
- Address whether there was sufficient involvement by ‘vulnerable groups/hidden groups’ and stakeholders and beneficiaries in the preparatory phase or start-up phase of the delivery process.
- Examine project response to difficulties in the start-up phase.
- Evaluate project progress against workplan and discuss discrepancies (early completion vs. late completion).
- Review whether technical and administrative guidance and support provided by key stakeholders and IPEC staff were adequate.
- What were the internal and external factors that affected the implementation phase of the present project and whether the project’s response to them was timely and appropriate.
- Recommend where appropriate how the project can overcome factors that have led to delays in implementation.

#### Project output level

- Assess extent of achievement of immediate objectives
- Examine project outputs in terms of quality and quantity
- Will APSOs, either approved or in pipeline, allow project to achieve the outputs and immediate objectives?
- Evaluate extent of major impacts made or likely to make on the target groups

### **Efficiency:**

- Examine the efficiency of the process by which Action Programmes are being reviewed and approved.
- Evaluate whether the major strategies of the project sufficiently reflects the budget in terms of staffing, outputs and activities



- Examine any budget revisions the project has requested and determine whether there is sufficient justification in terms of contributing to an improved and more effective implementation of the project i.e. a more justified allocation of a budget in relation to strategies and outputs as formulated in the project document.

#### **Sustainability:**

- Look at the project's strategy for promoting local ownership thus leading to sustainability, including policy development...etc;
- The progress actually achieved in promoting local ownership of the project i.e: capacity building of stakeholders in the provinces, local non-formal educators, OHS checklist practice, self-help groups, child labor monitors, child labor sensitizing activity in targeted local schools, provincial committee on child labor, employers as well as any other relevant groups;
- Are there any activities not yet included in the strategy that would promote sustainability?
- Identify whether actions have been taken to ensure the access of women/other vulnerable groups to services and resources;
- Examine whether social-cultural and gender aspects endanger the sustainability of the project and assess whether actions have been taken to sensitize local institutions and target groups on these issues; and
- Examine what might be a role for the rest of this phase and in future possible phase for the project's sustainability and impact.

#### **Special Concerns to be addressed:**

- Strategy for addressing child labour in each of the targeted sectors and project's progress in addressing child labor in the targeted sectors:
  - How each sector's progress differs from the others
  - Difficulties or positive developments in each of the sectors i.e: in the salt sector the rapid assessment found three distinct types of working children, settled child workers, migrant child workers, child heads of households. What strategies are being employed to ensure their needs are met within project scope. How does this affect project implementation for this sector...etc.
- Assess the role of the provincial committees set up by the project and the make-up of these committees, and its sustainability.
- Assess the child labor and OHS monitoring mechanism that is being developed under the project. For example assess of the behavioral changes among stakeholders and especially of the beneficiaries.
- Issue concerning mobilizing NGO's. A lack of NGOs has led to some delays in project implementation according to the progress reports, what is the project's strategy for mobilizing existing NGOs?
- Examine the level of government commitment to and support for the project.
- Assess the legislative measures that is being developed under the project, in particular in regarding to the development of ministerial orders on hazardous work and light work at the national level (MoSALVY) as well as setting up special work conditions for children aged less than 18 years old in the three targeted sectors.
- The relationship between the project and other child-focused projects in Cambodia, both those supported by IPEC as well as projects supported by other organizations.

- The project document states that gender concerns are of prime importance, assess if gender has been mainstreamed in all aspects of the project implementation stage and if collected data are gender sensitive.
- Benefits/difficulties of combining three different sectors into one project. The additional sector specific focus should be emphasis, for example interaction between employer/owner and the project (for rubber), the issue of withdrawing children completely from work vs. withdrawing children from hazardous work (for fishing), and the education interventions (for salt sector).
- If any unexpected/unanticipated effects were noticed on target groups but also on non-target groups, (i.e: unanticipated problems/changes in gender relations) review the causes and if negative whether it could be alleviated with a specific strategy for the remaining project duration.

**Recommendations:**

- Based on the findings, recommendations, alternative strategies for project management and stakeholders to consider in the rest of this phase and in future possible phase.

#### **IV. EXPECTED OUTPUTS OF MID-TERM EVALUATION**

1. Evaluation background report for each of the three sectors plus MoSALVY at the national level:
  - Salt
  - Fishing/Shrimp processing
  - Rubber Plantations

The report should contain findings, conclusions, recommendations and areas of lessons learnt, including possible good practices and model interventions. If recommendations are put forward for the rest of this phase and in future possible phase, it should be clearly indicated to whom and how these are addressed.

2. Stakeholder meetings in IPEC office in Phnom Penh<sup>4</sup> to discuss the individual findings/reports followed by field visits to project sites and talk to stakeholders and targeted beneficiaries.
3. A consolidated evaluation report by consulting group.
4. Follow up action by project management based on the findings of the evaluation report

All drafts and final outputs, including supporting documents, analytical reports and raw data, should be provided both in paper copy and in electronic versions compatible with either WORD for Windows or WordPerfect in both English and Khmer version.

The final report will be distributed to key stakeholders in Cambodia by project management and in ILO-HQ by IPEC-DED in both English and Khmer version.

---

<sup>4</sup> Stakeholder in Phnom Penh (MoSALVY) will be reintegrated with one session among three sessions in Phnom Penh.

## V. EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

The proposed evaluation methodology, taking into consideration the complexity of the project is to have a consulting group. Consulting group should then write a background reports covers the three sectors based on their findings. This background report will be discussed in stakeholder meetings in Phnom Penh, and the comments of stakeholders and outcomes of the meeting using the background report as a base will be the draft mid-term evaluation report. The consulting group will be responsible in facilitating the stakeholders' consultation meetings, including writing up the minute meeting and interpreting/translating.

Consulting group will be responsible for putting together all information and finalize the mid-term evaluation report. Other relevant documents such as the project document and progress reports should also be taken into account.

The methods to be used should include:

- A review of documents and materials;
- Interviews with staff, partners, key stakeholders, NSC-CL members at national level and members of provincial committee on child labor, targeted beneficiaries and their parents; and
- Site visits in three sectors and meeting with officials in MoSALVY at national level.

## Timeline for the evaluation 2003-----

	January	February	March	April	May	Consultants' Days
Comments on draft ToR by all key stakeholders, including consulting group	Last week of Jan	- Feb. 14				
CV's obtained		Feb. 21				
Consulting group Signed agreement			Mar. 15			
Consultant briefed by PM			Mar. 24			1/2
Consultant collects and reviews existing reports, project-related documents; prepare interview and observation guides			Mar. 25			1/2
Mission to appropriate project sites, including MoSALVY, by Consultant			Mar. 27	until April 8		12
Consultant draft qualitative and quantitative report				April. 10-17		8.0
Submission draft report to ILO-IPEC in Cambodia (in English electronic version and hard copy)				April 23 (1 day)		
IPEC in Cambodia shares report with US-DOL, DO HQ, IPEC-DED and stakeholder (both English and Khmer)				April 24		
Project evaluation team visit project sites					May 6-9	
Submission of draft report to ILO-IPEC in Khmer version					May 7	
Stakeholder workshops to discuss reports (1 day/sector in Phnom Penh)					May 12-14	3 days
Consultative meeting for final comments/recommendations					May 15	1 day
Consulting group consolidates draft evaluation report					May 20-21	2 days
Draft submitted to DED and project management					May 28	
Final report including comments submitted					By end of May	

## Responsibilities:

Comment on draft TOR by all key stakeholders	<b>US-DOL, Desk Officer HQ, Project Management and IPEC-DED Regional and HQ</b>
Receive, finalize and circulate TOR with comments incorporated	<b>NPM with input from IPEC-DED</b>
Obtain CV's and recruit local consulting group in consultation with IPEC-DED	<b>Project management &amp; IPEC-DED</b>
Brief to consulting group	<b>Project management</b>
Missions to project sites and MoSALVY (at national level)	<b>Consulting group</b>
Draft individual reports (English and Khmer)	<b>Consulting group</b>
Stakeholder Meetings to discuss reports	<b>Consulting group, Project Management, USDOL, Desk Officer HQ, IPEC-DED Regional and HQ and stakeholders</b>
Consolidate reports (Khmer and English)	<b>Consulting group</b>
Circulate draft to IPEC-DED	<b>Consulting group</b>
Provide methodological input to draft report	<b>IPEC-DED</b>
Finalize draft with comments	<b>Consulting group</b>
Incorporate the comments and finalize report	<b>Consulting group</b>
Circulate finished evaluation report to key stakeholders (Khmer and English)	<b>Project management and IPEC-DED</b>

## Composition of the Evaluation Team

The local consulting group (Appointed as team leader)

The team leader is responsible for incorporating the comments and finalizing the report.

The ideal candidate for team leader will have:

- ✓ Proven extensive evaluation experience
- ✓ Broad knowledge of and insight into development issues in Cambodia
- ✓ Some knowledge and experience in one of the above mentioned sectors, and has expertise in hazardous work issues
- ✓ Technical knowledge of child labour and WFCL
- ✓ Excellent report writing skills
- ✓ Knowledge of and experience evaluating gender concerns
- ✓ Preferably experience as team leader and working closely with other evaluators on the same team
- ✓ Knowledge of Khmer language and its cultural context.

## VI. SOURCES OF INFORMATION

- Project document and information used in creating project document, data, Log frames etc.
- Progress Reports to the donor
- Interviews with project management and other relevant ILO officers
- Mission to project sites
- Discussions with key stakeholders, beneficiaries, and other services providers as appropriate.

## VII. BROAD OUTLINE OF THE EVALUATION REPORT

The consulting group may wish to follow the following outline in completing the evaluation report.

1. Title page (Please include full project title, project code and dates, type of evaluation, Composition of the evaluation team and preparation date)
2. Executive Summary: brief overview of the project, purpose and scope of MTE and methodologies used and sources of information
3. Evaluation Background and Justification
4. Aspects addressed specifically Project Design, Relevance, Efficiency, Effectiveness, Sustainability and Mainstreaming and Emerging Opportunities
5. Special Concerns
6. Conclusions/Lessons learnt/Good Practices
7. Recommendations (for the current phase “until April 2004” and for future possible phase)
8. Annexes

## VIII. RESOURCES, TERM OF PAYMENT AND MANAGEMENT:

The project funds for conducting the midterm evaluations is as follows:

Particulars	Unit	Quantity	Unit Price (Dollars)	Amount (Dollars)
<b>1. Consultant's Fees</b> (Including translator-interpreter for consultant and consultative meeting, consultant's assistant, data processing/encoding, document assistant for stakeholder meeting and editing of report)	per day	27 days	200	5,400.
<b>2. Direct Cost</b>				
<b>2.a:</b> Food and accommodation of mission to project sites	per day	12 days	24 x 2ps	576.
<b>2.b:</b> Transportation				
-Car rental in provinces (\$20 x 12days)	per day	12 days	20	240.
-Transportation from Phnom Penh to provinces and vs. (8\$ x 6trips x 2ps)	per trip	6 trips	8 x 2ps	96.
<b>2.c:</b> Interviewees' refreshments; token items for child and parent respondents; rental of venue for on-site stakeholder meetings and other expenses in three provinces and Phnom Penh (MoSALVY)	per site	4	15	60.
<b>2.d:</b> Photo documentation	per site	3	7	21.
<b>3. Translation Cost</b> Translation of draft MTE report for Stakeholders' meetings (into Khmer version)	per page	70	7	490.

<b>4. Stakeholders' meetings in Phnom Penh</b>	per meeting	4	646.75	2,587.
<b>5. Car rental for field visits of project team and overseas evaluation team</b>	Per day	4	70	280.
<b>6. Contingency (photocopying and translation of final report)</b>				250.
<b>TOTAL</b>			<b>US\$10,000.</b>	

### **Terms of Payment**

An external collaboration agreement will be made between ILO and the consultant who will be responsible for submitting final mid-term evaluation report on the project to combat child labor in hazardous work in the salt production, rubber plantation, and fishing sectors in Cambodia CMB/01/P51/USA.

Of the total budget of US\$10,000: 35 % will be paid upon signing the contract, 35 % (for organizing consultative meeting) will be paid upon completion of the first draft report (which is the draft individual report) and 30% will be paid upon submission of the final report (which is the consolidated report after all comments/recommendations were reintegrated) to the satisfaction of the ILO. Please be advised that demanding revisions may be required of the report if the justification for it arises.

### **Management**

The team leader will be responsible for the coordination of the overall activities of the team. He/she must make sure that an effective system is set up to work with the IPEC officers in all stages of the evaluation. IPEC project officials in Cambodia will provide necessary support during the evaluation mission.

The consulting group will report to the project management in Cambodia.



## **ANNEX 2 - INDICATORS OF ACHIEVEMENT**

### **INDICATORS OF ACHIEVEMENT (Kampot: AP-CCPCR)**

#### *Indicators for Objective 1 and related Outputs:*

- Existence of a good community mechanism that is recognized by the community members and local authorities, and that community members, employers, governmental institutions have demonstrated their advocating against the hazardous forms of child labor and have the ability to manage, and have the capacity for decision making and problem solving issues related to the elimination of child labor in the salt production communities. The community networking and monitoring teams have the capacity to work against the worst forms of child labor. The monitoring sheet will be used for recording salt production children and put all information into the computer database management.
- Community networking and monitoring teams that have the capacity to develop monitoring timetables, and carry out awareness raising activities. The employers, workers, working children, parents, teachers and community members are aware of child labor, governmental legislation and international conventions.

#### *Indicators for Objective 2 and related Outputs:*

- The structure of self-help group exists and 30 group leaders selected. The self-help group members will be aware of child labor, legislation and international conventions and as a result they continue to monitor those at risk children in their communities.
- Seed money and saving policy developed with the participation of all members of self-help groups and that the target families' income increasing through vocational training and income generation activities.
- Target families of working children have reduced dependency to hazardous work of their children and have the ability to support and allow their children go to school regularly.
- Social cohesion is well in the society.

#### *Indicators for Objective 3 and related Outputs:*

- 60 salt working children and their parents that received the vocational/skills training have started their business and able to earn regular and additional incomes.
- Those at risk children continue their education, and more children from the salt communities are registered into formal education.
- School tracking system is in placed, and continued to be used by local schools.

## **INDICATORS OF ACHIEVEMENT (Kampot: AP-Edu)**

### *Indicators for Objective 1 and related Outputs:*

- Indicator 1: Child labor sensitizing campaign is operational in 16 primary and secondary schools. School-dropout rate among high-risk group will be reduced, and number of school enrolment will be increased, according to school record.
- Indicator 2: At risk-school children tracking system has been put into practice in 16 primary schools. The number of at-high risk children who have continued their education as a result of school sensitizing and awareness raising activities.

### *Indicators for Objective 2 and related Outputs:*

- Indicator 1: The number of children who have been withdrawn from hazardous work and reintegrated into formal school continue their education as a result of the AP.
- Indicator 2: 6 Community Learning Centers established and operational. They have become the places where children and community members can learn and play.

## **INDICATORS OF ACHIEVEMENT (Kampot: AP-Labor)**

Indicators for the immediate objective 1 and its outputs.

- Indicator 1: Workplace monitoring system is operational through regular and systematic workplace monitoring by trained monitors. Based on this periodic monitoring, the achievement will be measured.
- Indicator 2: The child labor database monitoring system has been put into practice by the labor inspectors/officials. Based on this database, the achievement will be measured.
- Indicator 3: Employers', salt farm owners' and community members' attitudes, including parents towards the involvement of their children in hazardous salt production work have been changed. The number of employers/owners and parents who have committed to not involve children in hazardous conditions will be measured.
- Indicator 4: Numbers of working children in hazardous work will be progressively reduced as a result of greater understanding among employers, working children and their parents.
- Indicator 5: Ministerial order (Prakas) on hazardous activities and its special conditions for children aged less than eighteen in salt production work will be established and enforced.

Indicators for the immediate objective 2 and its outputs.

- Indicator 1: Regular meetings of CCL in reviewing, consulting, monitoring and evaluating have been regularly organized. Members of CCL have mainstreamed child labour and its related issues into the regular programs and strategic policies of their institutions.
- Indicator 2: The use and implementation of formulated action plan to combat child labor in the hazardous salt work in according to recommendations of the national workshop on child labor in the hazardous sectors.
- Indicator 3: The use of action plan to combat child labor in the hazardous salt work as paper for consultation in formulating national action plan to combat child labor in hazardous sectors of Cambodia at the end of this project.

## **INDICATORS OF ACHIEVEMENT (Sihanoukville: AP-Edu)**

### *Indicators for Objective 1 and related Outputs:*

- Indicator 1: Child labor sensitizing campaign is operational in 7 primary and secondary schools. Teachers' attitude towards at risk children will be changed and school-dropout rate will be reduced, and number of school enrolment will be increased.
- Indicator 2: 1,250 school children are well aware of child labour, international convention and its related issues. The at risk-school children monitoring system has been put into practice by 135 trained school teachers which will result in lower school-dropout rate and it is strongly recognized and participated by all fishing community members.

## **INDICATORS OF ACHIEVEMENT (Sihanoukville: AP-MDSALVY)**

Indicators for the immediate objective 1 and its outputs.

- Indicator 1: Workplace monitoring system is operational. Employers' attitude in using children will be changed and working conditions will be improved for those allowable young workers.
- Indicator 2: The child labour database monitoring system has been put into practice by the labor inspectors/officials. This system will be used as model for child labour monitoring system by labor domain through out the country in the future.
- Indicator 3: Employers', boat owners' and community members' attitudes, including parents towards the involvement and using children in hazardous fishing work have been changed and number of working children will have been decreased.
- Indicator 4: Numbers of working children in hazardous work will be progressively reduced as a result of greater understanding among employers, working children and their parents.
- Indicator 5: Ministerial order (Prakas) on hazardous activities and its special conditions for children aged less than eighteen in fishing work will be established and enforced.

Indicators for the immediate objective 2 and its outputs.

- Indicator 1: Regular meetings of CCL in reviewing, consulting, monitoring and evaluating have been regularly organized. Members of CCL have mainstreamed child labour and its related issues into the regular programs and strategic policies of their institutions.
- Indicator 2: The use and implementation of formulated action plan to combat child labour in the hazardous fishing work in according to recommendations of the national workshop on child labour in the hazardous sectors.
- Indicator 3: The use of action plan to combat child labor in the hazardous fishing work as paper for consultation in formulating national action plan to combat child labour in hazardous sectors of Cambodia at the end of this project.

## **INDICATORS OF ACHIEVEMENT (Sihanoukville: APSO-CCBO)**

### *Indicators for Objective 1 and related Outputs:*

- Existence of a good community mechanism that is recognized by the community members and local authorities, and that community members, employers, governmental institutions have demonstrated their advocating against the hazardous forms of child labor and have the ability to manage, and have the capacity for decision making and problem solving issues related to the elimination of child labor in the fishing community. The community networking and monitoring teams have the capacity to work against the worst forms of child labor. The monitoring sheet will be used for recording fishing children and put all information into the computer database management.
- Community networking and monitoring teams that have the capacity to develop monitoring timetables, and carry out awareness raising activities. The employers, workers, working children, parents, teachers and community members are aware of child labor, governmental legislation and international conventions.

### *Indicators for Objective 2 and related Outputs:*

- The structure of self-help group exists and 40 group leaders selected. The self-help group members will be aware of child labor, legislation and international conventions.
- Seed money and saving policy developed with the participation of all members of self-help groups and that the target families' income increasing through vocational training and income generation activities.
- Target families of working children have reduced dependency to hazardous work of their children and have the ability to support and allow their children go to school regularly.
- Social cohesion is well in the society.

### *Indicators for Objective 3 and related Outputs:*

- 3 Community Learning Centers established and operational. Each center has appropriate materials and equipments for its operation.
- 320 fishing children can read and write and are mainstreamed into the formal education system.
- 80 fishing children and their parents that received the vocational/skills training have started their business and able to earn regular income.

## **INDICATORS OF ACHIEVEMENT (Kampong Cham: AP-KTO)**

### *Indicators for Objective 1 and related Outputs:*

- Number of joint monitoring visit. The project monitoring record will be used to measure this indicator.
- New initiatives initiated the community networking not funded by the action program to combat child labor in hazardous conditions. Community network plan, minutes and action program monitoring records will be used to measure this indicator.
- Increased understanding on the issues of child labor including relevant legislation by the community networking and monitoring teams. The pre and post assessment on their understanding on the issues will be carried out and used to measure this indicator.

### *Indicators for Objective 2 and related Outputs:*

- Better understanding of child labor related issued and hazardous working condition among the families of the working children, children and community members. The pre and post assessment on their understanding on the issues will be carried out and used to measure this indicator.
- Number of families who have access to seed money and savings scheme. The project monitoring record will be used to measure this indicator.
- Number of people (working children, families, VDCs) benefited from the awareness raising and advocacy activities. Project monitoring record will be used measure this indicator.
- Number (or percentage) of families with increased income. The pre and post data on families' livelihood conditions need to be developed.
- Other new interventions or activities to fight against child labor initiated by the self-help groups not funded by the action program.

### *Indicators for Objective 3 and related Outputs:*

- Number of working children who have been removed from the hazardous conditions with new employment or start their business. The project monitoring record will be used to measure this indicator.
- The number of part-time working children being reintegrated into formal education. The project monitoring records, school records will be used to measure this record.
- Increased enrolment rate in schools. The school records will be used to measure this indicator.
- School tracking systems are in placed and continue to be used by local schools.
- Number of schools with improved quality facilities. The project monitoring record will be used to measure this indicator.



## **INDICATORS OF ACHIEVEMENT (Kampong Cham: AP-DoE)**

### *Indicators for Objective 1 and related Outputs:*

- Indicator 1: Better understanding of child labor related issues and hazardous working condition among school teachers in primary and secondary schools. The pre and post assessment on their understanding will be carried out and used to measure this indicator.
- Indicator 2: Number and name of risk groups have been identified and recorded. The project monitoring records will be used to measure this indicator.
- Indicator 3: Number of other school teachers who have been sensitized by previous train teachers. The pre and post assessment on their understanding will be carried out and used to measure this indicator.
- Indicator 4: Number of school children has attended the awareness - raising program. The project monitoring record will be used to measure this indicator.
- Indicator 5: Better understanding of school children of child labor related issues, hazardous condition, and consequences of dropping out of school at an early age.
- Indicator 6: At risk school children tracking system has been put into practice in 20 primary and secondary schools. The numbers of at high-risk children who have continued their education as a result of school sensitizing and awareness raising activities.

### *Indicators for Objective 2 and related Outputs:*

- Indicator 1: Number of community learning centers has been established. The program monitoring record will be used to measure this indicator.
- Indicator 2: Number of community members (parents, children and working children) has access to these CLCs. The program monitoring record will be used to measure this indicator.
- Indicator 3: Number of full-time working children removed and reintegrated into formal education. The program monitoring and school record will be used as measure to this indicator.
- Indicator 4: Number of schools with improved quality/facility thanks to the programs' support. The program monitoring record will be used to measure this indicator.
- Indicator 5: Increased enrolment rate in schools. The school record will be used to measure this indicator.

## **INDICATORS OF ACHIEVEMENT (Kampong Cham: AP-DoL)**

### **Indicators for the immediate objective 1 and its outputs:**

- Indicator 1: Workplace monitoring system is operational through regular and systematic workplace monitoring by trained monitors. Based on this periodic monitoring, the achievement will be measured continuously.
- Indicator 2: Database monitoring system on child labour has been put into practice by staff of PDSALVY. Based on this database, the achievement will be measured.
- Indicator 3: Employers', community members', including parents' attitudes towards the involvement and using children in hazardous activities in rubber plantation work have been changed. The number of employers/owners and parents who have committed to not involve children in hazardous conditions will be measured.
- Indicator 4: Numbers of working children in hazardous work will be progressively reduced as a result of greater understanding among employers, working children and their parents.
- Indicator 5: Ministerial order (Prakas) on hazardous activities and its special conditions for children aged less than 18 in rubber plantation work will be established and enforced.

### **Indicators for immediate objective 2 and its outputs:**

- Indicator 1: Regular meeting of CCL in reviewing, consulting, monitoring and evaluating have been organized regularly. Members of CCL have mainstreamed child labour and its related issues into the regular programs and strategic policies of their institutions.
- Indicator 2: The use and implementation of formulated action plan to combat child labour in the hazardous rubber plantation work in according to recommendations of the national workshop on child labour in hazardous sectors.
- Indicator 3: The use of action plan to combat child labour in hazardous rubber plantation work as paper for consultation in formulating national action plan to combat child labour in hazardous sectors of Cambodia at the end of this project.

## **INDICATORS OF ACHIEVEMENT (AP-MoSALVY)**

Indicators for the immediate objective 1 and its outputs.

- Indicator 1: Loopholes in the existing national labor code has been complemented and put into practice as a result the hazardous forms of child labor in the prioritized sectors will be reduced and eligible working children will be properly treated by employers/owners.
- Indicator 2: Policies and measures to address hazardous forms and worst forms of child labor have been formulated as result numbers of working children in hazardous work will be progressively reduced.
- Indicator 3: Ratification of the Convention No. 182
- Indicator 4: The use and implementation of formulated national plan of action to combat child labor in the hazardous sectors in according to the recommendations of the national workshop on child labor in the hazardous sectors. This plan will be implemented by all stakeholders both governmental and non-governmental organizations.

Indicators for the immediate objective 2 and its outputs.

- Indicator 1: Regular meeting of NSC-CL, WG-CL and PCCL in reviewing, consulting, monitoring and evaluating child labor programmes and policies. Members of those mechanisms have mainstreamed child labor and its related issues into regular programmes and strategic policies for their institutions.
- Indicator 2: Mass movement against worst forms of child labor will change the way that all working children are treated as a result of wider and greater understanding among policy makers and members of the whole society.

## ANNEX 3 - BASELINE SURVEY INSTRUMENT

### CHILD SURVEY FOR FISHING SECTOR IN SIHANOUKVILLE OF CAMBODIA (Child respondent below age of 18 years)

Greetings! My name is \_\_\_\_\_ and I am working as an interviewer for a research institution that is undertaking a study on children and other young people who are working in the fishing and rubber plantation sectors. The results of the study will be used for possible interventions among the children/young people and their families. In order to determine what may be appropriate interventions, we are looking into the children's/ young people's living conditions, the nature of their work, their educational levels, and their life goals and aspirations.

We have a number of questions that we would like to ask you but please be assured that your responses will be treated in complete confidence. The interview will take approximately 1 to 1 ½ hours during which time we will be noting down your answers. Would you have the time to help us with our study?

-----

**Name of Enumerator** \_\_\_\_\_  
**Enumerator ID** \_\_\_\_\_  
**Name of Child** \_\_\_\_\_  
**Gender of Child** M / F [encircle one]  
**Name of Child's Household Head/  
Parent Interviewee** \_\_\_\_\_  
**CHILD ID** \_\_\_\_\_

To be filled out by the enumerator:

<b>Date of Interview</b>	
<b>Province of Interview</b>	
<b>District of Interview</b>	
<b>Commune of Interview</b>	
<b>Fishing Area</b>	
<b>Household ID No</b>	
<b>Current address of home</b>	



**1. DEMOGRAPHIC DATA about the child's family****Ask child about ALL family members including the child's data, even if the child is living and working away from family home.**

Member #	1.1 Name of Family Member	1.2 Sex [USE CODE]	1.3 Alive (yes/no) [USE CODE]	1.4 Age (if alive; note 0 if otherwise) (INDICATE YEARS)	1.5. Status of employment of each family member [USE CODE]	1.6 Relationship to child [USE CODE]	1.7 Are you living with this family member (yes/no)? [USE CODE]

**Codes for Q. 1.2**  
Sex: 1=Male; 0=Female

**Codes for Q. 1.3 & 1.7**  
1=Yes  
0=No

**Codes for Q. 1.4**  
0=Died  
99=Don't know

**Codes for Q. 1.5 for children assuming that the child is engaged in Child Labour:**

0=not employed  
1=school full time  
2=school full time (work part time)  
3=in school part time (work full time)  
4=in school part time (work part time)  
5= not in school (work full time)  
6=not in school, not employed  
7=working/ employed  
8=homemaker  
9=cannot work/ disabled  
10=others, specify

**Codes for Q. 1.6**  
1=father  
2=mother  
3=siblings (brother/sister)  
4=grandparents (grandfather/grandmother)  
5=others (ask child to elaborate relationship to him/her)  
99=self

**Codes for Q. 1.7**

In case child explicitly says he does not live with father and mother, please prompt for reason. Indicate one of following codes:

01=divorced/separated      02=abandoned family      03=left home for work      04= others, specify

**2.1 Living situation of child during busy fishing season (ask child to respond)**

2.1 (a) Who do you live with? [USE CODE]	2.1 (b) In whose house? [USE CODE]

**2.2 Living situation of child during off-peak fishing season (ask child to respond)**

2.2 (a) Who do you live with? [USE CODE]	2.2 (b) In whose house? [USE CODE]

***Codes for question 2.1(a) and*****2.2 (a) :**

1=On my own  
 2=with father only  
 3=with mother only  
 4=with both parents & family

5=not with immediate family but  
 with other relatives  
 6=with friends  
 7=employer  
 8=others, specify  
 9=combination, specify

***Codes for question 2.1 (b) and 2.2 (b):***

1=in family/relative's rented house  
 2=in owner provided house/garage  
 3=renting with friends  
 4=in own house

5=combination, specify  
 6=others, specify

**3. Seasonal Migration**

3.1 Did you migrate to this village for work (yes/no)? [USE CODE – IF NO, GO TO Q. 4]	3.2 If <b>yes</b> to Q.3.1, how many times a year do you migrate for work from home village? [USE CODE]	3.3 From which province? SPECIFY.	3.3a. From which district? SPECIFY.	3.4 Who sends you away from home? [USE CODE]	3.5 How often do you visit family/ village? [USE CODE]

***Codes for Q. 3.2***

1=Once a year  
 2=More than once a year  
 3=others, specify

***Codes for Q. 3.4***

1= nobody, came on my own  
 2=parents encouraged it  
 3=employer encouraged it  
 4=relatives encouraged it  
 5=friends encouraged it

6=combination, specify  
 7=others, specify

***Codes for Q. 3.5***

0=does not visit  
 1=once a month  
 2=once in 3 months  
 3=once in 6 months  
 4=once a year

5=more than once a year  
 6=combination, specify  
 7=others, specify



**4. Educational status of the child**

4.1 Can you read and write (yes/ no)? [USE CODE]	4.2 Did you ever attend formal or non-formal school (yes/no)? [USE CODE] – IF <u>NO</u> , GO TO Q.4.5]	4.3. Are you currently attending formal school (yes/no)? [USE CODE] IF <u>YES</u> , GO TO Q4.3a & 4.3b. IF <u>NO</u> , GO TO Q4.4 & 4.5.	4.3a In which grade are you? [USE CODE].	4.3b Where do you attend school? INDICATE CODE, THEN GO TO Q4.8 & 4.8a.	4.4 What is the highest grade you completed? [USE CODE]	4.5 Why aren't you in school? IF RESPONSE IS <b>9</b> FROM CODES BELOW, ASK Q. 4.6, 4.6a, AND 4.7. IF OTHER CODES, GO TO Qs. 4.8 & 4.8a.

4.6 At what age did you drop out? INDICATE AGE.	4.6a Approximately when did you drop out? INDICATE YEAR	4.7 Why did you drop out? Give reasons. [USE CODE]	4.8 Have you attended any vocational/skills training course (yes/no)? If yes, for what skill? [USE CODE]	4.8a When did you attend the vocational/skills training course? NOTE HOW MANY MONTHS OR YEARS AGO.

<b>Codes for Q. 4.3a and Q.4.4</b> 0=Not currently attending school 1=Primary School (Grade 1 to 6) 2=Lower-Secondary School (Grade 7 to 9) 3=Upper-Secondary School (Grade 10 to 12) 4=Technical Education and Vocational Training 5=Universities/Institutions 6=Others, specify 7=Combination, specify	<b>Codes for Q. 4.3b</b> 0=not currently attending school 1= in home village 2=in fishing village 3=others, specify 4=combination, specify	<b>Codes for Q. 4.5 and Q. 4.7</b> 1= Not enough money for school fees 2= Work full time (too tired) 3= Too old/shy to return to school 4=School too far from workplace 5= School interferes with work 6=School is too hard 7=Don't want to attend school 8=I was never enrolled in school 9=I dropped out 10=Others, specify 11=Combination, specify <b>12=Help/ take care of family</b>	<b>Codes for Q. 4.8</b> 0=did not attend skills training course 1=bicycle repair 2=motorcycle repair 3=carpentry 4=sewing 5=animal raising 6=agriculture training 7=others, specify 8=combination, specify
--	---	---	---

**5. Current Work History of Child**

5.1 How were you recruited to work here? [USE CODE]	5.2 How old were you when you started working here? [INDICATE AGE IN YEARS]	5.3 Do you work full time in the fishing sector (yes/no)? [USE CODE]	5.4 <b>BUSY/ PEAK SEASON:</b> On average, how many hours do you work per day? [INDICATE HOURS]	5.4a <b>BUSY/PEAK SEASON:</b> How many days/week? [INDICATE DAYS]	5.5 <b>SLOW/OFF-PEAK SEASON:</b> How many hours do you work per day? [INDICATE HOURS]	5.5a <b>SLOW/OFF-PEAK SEASON:</b> How many days/week? [INDICATE DAYS]

5.6 Which tasks do you perform? [USE CODE]	5.7 What is your work arrangement? [USE CODE]	5.8 What is your payment rate arrangement? [USE CODE]

<b>Code for Q. 5.1</b> 1=parents 2=other relatives 3=Recruited by employer 4=Heard of job through other employees 5=No one, I decided by myself to work here 6=friends 7=Others, specify 8=Combination of above ways, specify combinations	<b>Codes for Q 5.6</b> 1= Fishing on a small boat 2= Fishing on a large boat for two or three days 3= Fishing on a large boat for two to three weeks 4= Fishing on a large boat for one or two months in a row 5= Repairing fishing nets 6= Shrimp peeling in a factory 7= Peeling boiled shrimps and/or crabs at the seaside (hired by the wharf owner) 8= Peeling boiled shrimps or crabs at home or in market 9= Working at the wharf to freeze sea products 10= Steaming fish 11= Sorting fish 12= Combination of above tasks, specify combinations 13= Others, specify 14= Catch/gather crabs, shrimps, shells, snails	<b>Code for Q. 5.7</b> 1=Full-time staff (Manager/ Supervisor) 2=Daily labourer 3=Group work 4=Piecework (sub-contracting) 5=Family labor 6=Sharing arrangement (% on sale of fish, specify % sharing) 7=Others, specify 8=Combination, specify	<b>Code for Q. 5.8</b> 1=per hour 2=per day 3=every two weeks 4=per month 5=per Kg. 6=percent of sale on catch 7=unpaid family labor 8=employer does not pay 9=others, specify 10=Combination, specify
--	---	---	--

**Current Work History Continued**

5.9. How much do you get paid? [INDICATE ACTUAL AMOUNT IN RIEL]	5.10 What do you do with your income? List all options. [USE CODE]	5.10a What percent of your income do you give to your family? [INDICATE PERCENT]	5.11 Do you do any other work apart from the fishing, in the slow season? [USE CODE]	5.12 What do you do when not working on the fishing? [USE CODE]

<b>Code for Q. 5.9</b> 0=Not being paid	<b>Code for Q. 5.10</b> 1=Pay rent 2=pay for school fees, books, uniforms 3=give to parents/family 4=pay some back to employer 5=keep some for pocket money (to spend on cigarettes, buy marbles etc) 6=pay debts (besides employer) 7=food 8=clothing 9=others, specify 10=combination of several of above, specify combinations	<b>Codes for Q. 5.11</b> 0=No work apart from fishing 1=Help on family farm 2=Small business/selling 3=Domestic helper 4=Gathering food 5=Gathering rattan from forest (to sell) 6=Others, specify 7=Combination of above activities, specify combinations 8=Housework	<b>Code for Q. 5.12</b> 1=work (specify above) 2= attend school 3=others, specify 4=combination, specify 5=none/ free time 6=housework
--	---	---	--

**6. Work Hazards associated with current job**

6.1 In general, which of the following health problems have you experienced most frequently? [USE CODE]	6.2 How often? [USE CODE]	6.3 Have you ever had to take time off from work because of a health problem (yes/no)? If yes, describe problem. [USE CODE]	6.3 (a) For how long, if taking time off from work because of a health problem? [USE CODE]

**Code for Q. 6.1 & 6.3**

0=None/ no health problem  
 1=Cuts from peeling shrimps and crabs or from the strings of the heavy fishing nets  
 2=Accidents with the engine of the boat  
 3=HIV/AIDS infection  
 4=Lower back aches  
 5=Swollen hands

6=Stomach aches  
 7=Breathing problems and headaches due to bad smell of rotten fish and hard work  
 8=Falling into water  
 9=Fear for storm, big waves, sharks  
 10=Violent piracy at sea  
 11=Combination of above, specify combinations  
 12=Others, specify  
 13=Headache/fever/colds/cough

**Code for Q. 6.2**

1=Often (several times per week/month)  
 2=Seldom (once-twice per season)  
 3=Others, specify  
 4=Combination, specify

**Code for Q. 6.3(a)**

1= from 1 hour to 2 hours  
 2= half-day  
 3= one day  
 4= two days  
 5= three to four days  
 6= one week  
 7= two to three weeks  
 8= one month  
 9= two month  
 10=Others, specify  
 11=Combination, specify

**Work hazards continued...**

6.4 What treatment was prescribed? [USE CODE]	6.5. Do you have access to medical services (yes/no)? If yes, where? [USE CODE]	6.6 Do you wear any protection while working? If yes, which ones? [USE CODE]	6.7 Do you get breaks at work (yes/no)? If YES, how long? [USE CODE]	6.8 Do you have access to latrines (yes/no)? Ask where. [USE CODE]	6.9 Do you have access to drinking water at work (yes/no)? If yes, where? [USE CODE]

<b>Code for Q. 6.4</b> 0=No treatment 1=Rest only 2=Rest & medication 3=Visit to doctor/ clinic 4=buy medication at pharmacy 5=Others, specify 6=Combination, specify	<b>Code for Q.6.5.</b> 0=No access 1=Private health workers in village (traditional treatment) 2=Private health workers in village (modern medicines) 3=Health clinic in commune 4= Pharmacy in village 5=Combination of above, specify combinations 6=Others, specify	<b>Code for Q. 6.6</b> 0=Does not wear any protection 1=Life vest 2=Boots while working at factory and wharf 3=Gloves 4=Others, specify 5=Combination, specify	<b>Code for Q.6.7.</b> 0=No breaks 1= 10-15 minutes 2= 30 minutes 3= Lunch break 4= Others, specify 5= Combination, specify	<b>Code for Q.6.8.</b> 0=No 1=Within immediate vicinity of work area 2=Facility provided by owner 3=Others, specify <b>4= Combination, specify</b>	<b>Code for Q.6.9.</b> 0=No 1=Provided by owner 2=Bring own water 3=Others, specify 4=Combination, specify
--	---	--	---	---	---

**7. Past work history of child**

7.1 How old were you when you first started working? [INDICATE AGE IN YEARS]	7.2. Where did you work before this? [USE CODE]	7.3. Why did you change to fishing work? [USE CODE]

<b>Code for Q. 7.2</b> 0=did not work before 1=rice farm of another family/farmer 2=different families/ establishments doing odd jobs 3=others, specify 4=combination, specify	<b>Code for Q. 7.3</b> 1=low remuneration in previous job 2=punishment/harassment 3=not allowed to go to school 4=insufficient food 5=fired by employer 6=combination of above reasons, specify combinations 7=others, specify
---	---

**8. LIFE GOALS AND ASPIRATIONS**

8.1. Why are you working in fishing sector? List from most important to least important. [USE CODE]	8.2 Do you like working in the fishing sector (yes/ no)? [USE CODE]	8.3 If yes, why? If no, why not? [USE CODE]	8.4 Would you stop working, if you could (yes/no)? [USE CODE]	8.5 What would you do if you didn't have to do fishing work? [USE CODE] IF RESPONSE IS 5 FROM CODES BELOW, ASK Q. 8.5a	8.5a If returning to home province (Code 5 in Q8.5), what would you do there? [USE CODE]	8.6 What do you need in order to be able to stop working? [USE CODE]

<b>Code for Q. 8.1</b> 1=Need to help with family income 2=Parents need help working in fishing 3=Work because I don't attend school 4=Work because parents sick/cannot work 5=Combination, specify 6=Others, specify	<b>Codes for Q. 8.3 (if YES)</b> 1=Can help support family 2=Can earn money for school 3=Have fun working with friends 4=Others, specify 5=Combination, specify	<b>Code for Q. 8.3 (if NO)</b> 1=work hazards make me sick 2=can't go to school, too tired 3=don't like work 4=don't like employer 5=others, specify 6=combination, specify	<b>Code for Q. 8.5</b> 1=Go to school full-time 2=Take non-formal education course (literacy) 3=Participate in skills training/ apprenticeship 4=Start a small business 5=Return to home province 6=Play/ free 7=Others, specify 8=Combination, specify	<b>Code for Q. 8.5a</b> 1=Find a job within village 2=Help in family farm 3=Help mother at home 4=Go to school 5=Others, specify 6=Combination, specify	<b>Code for Q. 8.6</b> 1=More money for family 2=More farmland for family 3=Money for school 4=Money for medical/health care 5=Learn a different skill or job 6=Others, specify 7=Combination, specify
---	--	---	---	---	---

**Life goals and aspirations continued...**

8.6a. Do you want to continue studying (yes/ no)? IF <b>YES</b> , GO TO Q8.7 TO 8.11. IF <b>NO</b> , GO TO Q8.9 TO 8.11	8.7. Why do you want to continue studying? [USE CODE]	8.8. What do you need in order to keep studying? [USE CODE]	8.9 Would you attend non-formal education (e.g., literacy classes) (yes/no)? [USE CODE]	8.9a Would you attend skills training (yes/no)? IF <b>YES</b> GO TO Q 8.9b.	8.9b What kind of skills training will you attend? [USE CODE]

8.10 What do you do in your free time (not working in fishing sector, not working at home)? [USE CODE]	8.11 What work do you want to do when you are older? [USE CODE]

<b>Code for Q.8.7</b> 1= Enjoy studying 2= Play with friends 3= Obtain higher grade 4= Want better job and income 5= Parent ask to continue studying 6= Employer ask to go to school 7= Combination of above reasons, specify combinations 8= Others, specify	<b>Code for Q. 8.8</b> 1=Better transportation to school 2=More money for school fees 3=Food 4=Uniforms, books, pencils 5=Better teachers 6=Would require nothing 7=Combination of above, specify combinations 8=Others, specify	<b>Code for Q.8.9 and Q8.9a</b> 1= yes 0=no	<b>Code for Q.8.9b</b> 1=bicycle repair 2=machine (engine, TV, radio, etc.) repair 3=carpentry 4=sewing 5=animal raising 6=agriculture training 7=others, specify 8=combination, specify 9=barber, beautician, hairdresser	<b>Code for Q. 8.10</b> 0=No free time 1=Study 2=Play 3=Relax 4=Combination, specify 5=Others, specify	<b>Code for Q. 8.11</b> 1=Teacher 2=Tailor 3=Doctor/Nurse 4=Small business/selling 5=Police 6=Rice farmer 7=Other government worker 8=Others, specify 9=Combination, specify 10=Boat owner/ fisherman 11=Machine (engine, TV, radio, etc.) repair
---	--	---	---	--	--



**PARENT SURVEY FOR FISHING SECTOR IN SIHANOUKVILLE OF Salt Fields in  
CAMBODIA**

(Parent/household head respondent)

Greetings! My name is \_\_\_\_\_ and I am working as an interviewer for a research institution that is undertaking a study on children and other young people who are working in the fishing and rubber plantation sectors. The results of the study will be used for possible interventions among the children/young people and their families. In order to determine what may be appropriate interventions, we are looking into the children's/ young people's living conditions, the nature of their work, their educational levels, and their life goals and aspirations.

We have a number of questions that we would like to ask you but please be assured that your responses will be treated in complete confidence. The interview will take approximately 1 to 1 ½ hours during which time we will be noting down your answers. Would you have the time to help us with our study?

-----

**Name of Enumerator** \_\_\_\_\_

**Enumerator ID** \_\_\_\_\_

**Name of parent/  
household head** \_\_\_\_\_

**Gender of parent/  
household head**      **M / F** [encircle one]

**Name of child/children  
interviewed** \_\_\_\_\_

**Respondent ID** \_\_\_\_\_

**Note to Enumerator: Please be explicit and make a note as to whether Respondent is father only, mother only, both or some other head of household.**

To be filled out by the enumerator:

<b>Date of Interview</b>	
<b>Province of Interview</b>	
<b>District of Interview</b>	
<b>Commune of Interview</b>	
<b>Fishing AreaSalt Field Area</b>	
<b>Household ID No</b>	
<b>Current address of home</b>	

Serial No. of Survey:

ADDITIONAL CODES: 88 = Missing; 99 = Don't know

# 1. DEMOGRAPHIC DATA about the child's family

**Ask PARENT (or head of household) about ALL family members who live with them.**

Member #	1.1 Name of Family Member	1.2 Sex 1=M 0=F	1.3 Alive (yes/no) 1=Yes 0=No	1.4 Age (if alive; write <u>0</u> if otherwise)	1.5 Primary occupation of each household member [USE CODE]	1.6 Do you consider this member to be a dependent? i.e. not economically active or disabled. [USE CODE]	1.7 Relationship of each household member to the child [USE CODE]	1.8 Education level of each household member including the respondents'. [USE CODE]	1.9 If in school now, please ask where? [USE CODE]

## Code for Q. 1.5

1=Worker in fisheries  
2=Farmer  
3=Unemployed/too young  
4=Civil servant  
5=Construction  
6=Military/Police  
7=Moto-dop  
8=Small trader  
9=Teacher  
10=Housewife  
11=Tailor  
12=Small trader  
11= Tailor  
12= Fishing  
133=Domestic labourer  
144=In School  
155=Others, specify

## Code for Q. 1.6

1= dependent  
2 = otherwise/ not dependent

## Codes for Q. 1.7

1=father  
2=mother  
3=sibling  
4=grandparent  
5=other relatives  
6=others, specify  
99=child interviewed

## Code for Q. 1.8

1= no formal education, but cannot read and write 2=no formal education, but can read and write  
3=Pre-School  
4=Primary School (Grade 1 to 6)  
5=Lower-Secondary School (Grade 7 to 9)  
6=Upper-Secondary School (Grade 10 to 12)  
7=Technical Education and Vocational Training  
8=Universities/Institutions  
9=Others, specify

## Code for Q.1.9

0=not in school  
1=in village  
2=in nearby villages  
3=others, specifysalt prodn site

**2. Ask parent or head of household about the following:**

2.1 What is the family's main source of income? [USE CODE]	2.2 Who earns this main source of income for the family? [USE CODE]	2.2a In general, what is the average income of each family member on the income-earning activity?	2.3 Total family Income per month in Rhieleil	2.4 Do you think this is a sufficient amount to support your family (yes/no)? [USE CODE]	2.5 Are you a migrant family (yes/no)? [USE CODE] IF NO, GO TO Q2.8.	2.6 If yes to Q.2.5, why are you migrating? [USE CODE]	2.7 If yes to Q. 2.5, what is your home district and province?	2.8 Are you divorced? [USE CODE] This question tries to capture whether parents of working child are together or not.

**Code for Q. 2.1**

1=Worker in fisheries  
 2=Farmer  
 3=Civil servant  
 4=Construction  
 5=Military/Police  
 6=Moto-dop  
 7=Small trader  
 8=Teacher

9= Tailor  
 10=Fishing  
 11=Domestic labourer  
 12=In School  
 13 =Combination of above, specify combinations  
 14=Others, specify

**Code for Q. 2.2**

1= Children  
 2= Father  
 3= Mother  
 4= Grandparents  
 5= Combination specify  
 6= Others, specify

**Code for Q. 2.6**

1=political reasons  
 2= economic hardships in home village  
 3= Others, specify  
 4=Combination, specify

**Code for Q. 2.8**

0=No  
 1=Yes  
 2= I am single

**3. REASONS FOR CHILD/CHILDREN WORKING**

3.1 Are you happy with your child/children working (yes/no)? [USE CODE]	3.2 Why, if yes? Why, if no? List reasons. [USE CODE]

**Code for Q. 3.2 (if Yes)**

1=Family needs more income  
 2=Child has reached working age  
 3=Parents cannot pay for child's education  
 4=Child does not want to go to school

5=Child gets a meal there  
 6=Parents are not interested in sending child to school because quality is bad  
 7=Combination, specify  
 8=Others, specify

**Code for Q. 3.2 (if No)**

1= Children should be at school  
 2= Children should stay at home and look after their younger siblings  
 3= Combination, specify  
 4=Others, specify

**4. Parents' opinion about the WORKING CONDITIONS faced by their children.**

	Heat/ exposure to sun [USE CODE]	Amount of time per day for rest. [USE CODE]	Amount of drinking water available at salt fieldwork place [USE CODE]	Condition of saltwork places/fields for walking [USE CODE]	Difficulty of the work [USE CODE]	Amount of hours worked per day.	Amount of days worked per week.
Working Child 1							
Working Child 2							
Working Child 3							

**Code for Q. 4**

1=Bad      2 = Fair      3 = Good

**5. Parents perception about:**

	5.1 Employer treatment of child. [USE CODE]	5.2 Wages received by child. [USE CODE]	5.3 Health risks faced by child. [USE CODE]	5.4 How tired the child is due to work? [USE CODE]	5.5 Do you think that the current working situation is acceptable for the child/ children? If <b>Yes</b> , ask why? If <b>No</b> ask why? [USE CODE] Prompt for reasons	5.6 What condition/s would allow the child to stop working? List in order of importance. [USE CODE]
Working Child 1						
Working Child 2						
Working Child 3						

<b>Code for 5.1</b> 1=Harsh 2=Moderate 3=Good 4=Child works for family	<b>Code for 5.2</b> 1=Low 2=Moderate 3=High 4=Child works for family	<b>Code for 5.3</b> 1=High risk 2=Moderate risk 3=Low risk	<b>Code for 5.4</b> 1=Very tired 2=Moderate tired 3=not very tired	<b>Code for 5.5</b> If <b>YES</b> : 1= Need additional income 2= Work conditions not abusive 3= Others, specify 4= Combination, specify  If <b>NO</b> : 5= Bad for health 6= Can't go to school 7= Others, specify 8= Combination, specify	<b>Code for Q. 5.6</b> 1=Enough income for family 2=Enough money for child's education 3=Enough land for farming 4=Enough money for medical/ health care 5=Schools closer to home/workplace 6=Better quality schools 7=Combination, specify 8=Others, specify
--	--	---	---	---	---

**6. Quality of housing and assets:**

6.1 Who provides housing? [USE CODE]	6.2 Do you own home/ land in your own village (yes/no)? [USE CODE]	6.32 How would you rate quality of housing here compared to your own home in your village? [USE CODE]	6.43 How would you rate the quality of this housing objectively (keep in mind space, privacy, roofs, walls, latrines etc)? [USE CODE]	6.54 Do you have any assets? [USE CODE]	6.65 Do you have access to drinking water? [USE CODE]	6.76 What is your source of cooking fuel? [USE CODE]	6.87 Do you have electricity? [USE CODE]	6.89 Do you have access to medical centers? ASK WHERE IF YES [USE CODE]

<b>Code for Q. 6.1</b> 1=employer (thus free) 2=rented 3=we own it 4= we share with relatives or others	<b>Code for Q. 6.32</b> 1=Better than my own house 2=same as own house 3=worse than own house	<b>Code for Q. 6.34</b> 1=poor 2=fair 3=good	<b>Code for Q. 6.54</b> 0=no assets 1=land 2=TV 3=radio 4=VCR 5=vehicles/ bicycles 6=fans 7=agricultural equipment 8=animals, specify 9=trees 10=combination of above, specify 11=others, specify	<b>Code for 6.66</b> 0=No access to drinking water 1= At own house 2=Nearby house 3=In village 4=Nearby village 5=Others, specify 6=Combination, specify	<b>Code for 6.7</b> 1= gas 2=electric 3=firewood 4=charcoal 5=others, specify 6=Combination, specify	<b>Code for 6.9</b> 0=No access to medical centers 1=Nearby pharmacies 2=Pharmacies at the market 3=Hospital in village 4=Hospital in nearby village 5=Combination, specify 6=Others, specify
---	--	---	---	---	--	--

**7. EDUCATIONAL AND LIFE ASPIRATIONS**

	7.1 (a) Would the child/children have to stop working if they wanted to go/ to /continue with schooling (yes/no)? [USE CODE] If <b>NO</b> go to Q. 7.1(b)	7.1 (b) Provide reason. [USE CODE]	7.2 What level of education do you want your child to have, if child currently attending school? [USE CODE]	7.3 What kind of training/informal education do you want your child to have, if child is not in formal school? [USE CODE]	7.4 How important do you think education is for your child's/ children's future? [USE CODE] For Girls: For Boys:	7.5 What do you wish your child or children to do when older? [USE CODE]
Working Child 1						
Working Child 2						
Working Child 3						

<b>Code for Q. 7.1 (b)</b> 1=economic hardship 2=primary income earner is disabled 3=school fees too high 4=combination, specify 5=others, specify	<b>Code for Q. 7.2</b> 0=does not like child to study 1=Pre-School 2=Primary School (Grade 1 to 6) 3=Lower-Secondary School (Grade 7 to 9) 4=Upper-Secondary School (Grade 10 to 12) 5=Technical Education and Vocational Training 6=Universities/Institutions 7=Others, specify	<b>Code for Q. 7.3</b> 1=bicycle repairing 2=machine (engine, TV, radio, etc) repairing 3=carpentry 4=sewing 5=Animal raising 6=Agriculture training 7=Others, specify 8=Combination, specify	<b>Code for Q. 7.4</b> 1=not so important 2=somewhat important 3=very important	<b>Code for Q. 7.5</b> 1= Work on farm 2=Become civil servant 3=Work in fisheries 4=Have own business 5=Become fishing boat owner 6=Become policeman/ policewoman 7=Become teacher 8=Others, specify 9=Combination, specify
---	--	---	--	--



## ANNEX 4. OVER-ALL PROJECT TARGETS AND RATE OF ACCOMPLISHMENT

### **1a. Children for Removal**

Sector	Target*	Identified	Gender (Actual)	
			F	M
Salt	300	264	153	111
Fishing	400	473	252	221
Rubber	200	200	123	77
<b>All Sectors</b>	<b>900</b>	<b>937</b>	<b>528</b>	<b>409</b>

\*based on APs

### **1b. Children for Prevention**

Sector	Target*	Identified	Gender (Actual)	
			F	M
Salt	600	603	319	284
Fishing	1250	1250	563	687
Rubber	750	750	397	353
<b>All Sectors</b>	<b>2600</b>	<b>2603</b>	<b>1279</b>	<b>1324</b>

\*based on APs

## **2. Implementing Staff**

Sector	Monitors/Inspectors		Seed Money Agents	NFE Educators	Project Coordinators	Totals	Gender	
	IA/P	C-B					Female	Male
Salt	6	6	2	6	3	<b>23</b>	8	15
Fishing	6	6	2	4	3	<b>21</b>	8	13
Rubber	6	6	2	6	3	<b>23</b>	9	14
<b>Total</b>	<b>18</b>	<b>18</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>67</b>	<b>25</b>	<b>42</b>

## **3. Monitoring Targets**

Target Sectors	Number of target children		Total number of children	Girls	Boys
	GO*	NGO			
Salt	105	159	<b>264</b>	153	111
Fishing	271	196	<b>467</b>	252	221
Rubber	82	118	<b>200</b>	123	77
<b>Total</b>	<b>458</b>	<b>479</b>	<b>931</b>	<b>528</b>	<b>409</b>

**3a. Identified and Monitored**

Target Sectors	Number of target children		Total number of children	Gender		Accomplishment (%)
	GO	NGO		Girls	Boys	
Salt	105	159	<b>264</b>	153	111	100
Fishing	271	196	<b>467</b>	250	217	98.7
Rubber	82	118	<b>200</b>	123	77	100
<b>Total</b>	<b>458</b>	<b>473</b>	<b>931</b>	<b>526</b>	<b>405</b>	<b>99.6</b>

**4. Non-Formal Education at CLCs\***

Target Sector	Number of Children		Gender		Accomplishment Rate (%)
	Target for NFE	Actual in NFE	Girls	Boys	
Salt	204	254	139	115	124.5
Fishing	393	146	95	51	37.2
Rubber	140	70	46	24	50.0
<b>Total</b>	<b>737</b>	<b>470</b>	<b>280</b>	<b>190</b>	<b>63.8</b>

\*There are 15 CLCs (6 in Salt, 3 in Fishing and 6 in Rubber sector)

**4a. Reintegration to Formal Schools**

Target Sector	Number of Children		Gender		Accomplishment Rate (%)
	Actual in NFE	# Reintegrated	Girls	Boys	
Salt	204	0	0	0	0.0
Fishing	393	25	16	9	6.4
Rubber	140	0	0	0	0.0
<b>Total</b>	<b>737</b>	<b>25</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>3.4</b>

**5. Vocational Training**

Target Sector	# of Children		Gender		Accomplishment Rate (%)
	Target	Actual	Girls	Boys	
Salt	60	25	20	5	41.7
Fishing	80	42	35	7	52.5
Rubber	60	34	26	8	56.6
<b>Total</b>	<b>200</b>	<b>101</b>	<b>81</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>50.5</b>

### 5a. Vocational Training by Type of Training

Target Sector	Types of Vocational Training					Total	Gender	
	Hair dressing	Sewing	Motorcycle Repair	Car Engine Repair	Boat Engine Repair		Girls	Boys
Salt	10	10	0	5	0	25	20	5
Fishing	14	21	5	0	2	42	35	7
Rubber	0	26	8	0	0	34	26	8
<b>Total</b>	<b>24</b>	<b>57</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>101</b>	<b>89</b>	<b>38</b>

### 6. SHG Groups (number of families)

Target Sector	Target*		Actual		Accomplishment (%)	
	Groups	Families	# of Groups	# of families	Groups	Families
Salt	30	200	30	201	100	100.5
Fishing	40	250	41	222	102.5	88.8
Rubber	20	170	24	168	120	98.8
<b>Total</b>	<b>90</b>	<b>620</b>	<b>95</b>	<b>591</b>	<b>100.5</b>	<b>95.3</b>

\*minimum targets based on APs

### 6a. SHG Groups with Seed Money

Target Sector	Actual		With Seed Money		Accomplishment	
	Groups	Families	# of Families	# who have paid	Usage Rate (%)	Payment Rate (%)
Salt	30	201	44	44	21.9	100
Fishing	41	222	26	4	11.7	15.4
Rubber*	24	168	0	0	0	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>95</b>	<b>591</b>	<b>70</b>	<b>48</b>	<b>11.8</b>	<b>68.8</b>

\* Seed money has not been provided yet to the targeted families.

### 6b. Use of Seed Money

Target Sector	# of families with Seed Money	Existing purpose / use of Seed Money		
		Fishing Materials	Animal Raising	Small Business
Salt	44	19	11	14
Fishing	26	23	0	3
Rubber	0	0	0	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>70</b>	<b>42</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>17</b>
<b>% Distribution</b>		<b>60%</b>	<b>16%</b>	<b>24%</b>

**7. Children for Prevention: Type of Assistance**

Target Sector	Actual # for Prevention	Assistance Provided		Gender		Accomplishment Rate (%)
		Uniforms	School Materials	Girls	Boys	
Salt	603	150	150	108	42	24.8
Fishing	1250	100	100	Na	Na	8.0
Rubber	750	150	150	Na	Na	20
<b>Total</b>	<b>2603</b>	<b>400</b>	<b>400</b>			<b>15.4</b>

**8. Training of Teachers**

Target Sector	Targets		Training of Teachers				Ratio of Teachers to Children to be Informed
	# of Schools	# of Teachers	1 <sup>st</sup> Training	2 <sup>nd</sup> Training		Total Trained	
				Target	Actual		
Salt	16	30	30	240	251	281	1 : 6
Fishing	7	30	30	135	154	184	1 : 7
Rubber	20	40	40	169	168	208	1 : 32
Total	43	100	100	544	573	673	1 : 14

**8a. Children to be Informed**

Target Sector	Number of Children		Gender (Actual Number)		Increase From Targets
	Target # of Children	Actual	Girls	Boys	
Salt	1,020	1,605	722	883	57.3
Fishing	1,250	1,250	563	563	0
Rubber	6,514	6,848	3,136	3,712	5.1
<b>Total</b>	<b>8,784</b>	<b>9,703</b>	<b>4,421</b>	<b>5,158</b>	<b>10.5</b>

**8b. Children Informed**

Target Sector	Actual Targets	Number of Children Informed	Gender		Accomplishment Rate (%)
			Girls	Boys	
Salt	1,605	Na	-	-	-
Fishing	1,250	Na	-	-	-
Rubber	6,848	Na	-	-	-
<b>Total</b>	<b>9,703</b>	<b>Na</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>-</b>

**8c. Risk Group**

Target Sector	Actual	Gender	
		Girls	Boys
Salt	966	396	570
Fishing*	1250	563	687
Rubber*	750	397	353
<b>Total</b>	<b>2,966</b>	<b>1,356</b>	<b>1,610</b>

ANNEX 5 - IMMEDIATE OBJECTIVES 1 & 2  
pages 97-185

Please use the following links to access Annex 5 in Microsoft Excel:

- [Immediate Objectives 1](#)
- [Immediate Objectives 2](#)

## ANNEX 6 - PROJECT COORDINATION

	Salt	Fishing	Rubber
Awareness and understanding of project among beneficiary groups (children and their families) <sup>1</sup>	<p>Generally there is good understanding and acceptance of the project among beneficiaries.</p> <p>Most of the families know about and support the project activities (NFE, SHG, Monitoring work) and participate in awareness raising and sensitizing activities. This is evident in the establishment of the CLCs where the land, materials and labor were contributed by the communities during the start-up stage of the programs.</p> <p>Most of the children in NFE know about child labor and child rights. Parents are active in the SHG activity</p> <p>In both salt and fishing APs, the indicator for this aspect is stated as "the employers, workers, working children, parents, teachers, and community members are aware of child labor, governmental legislation and international conventions". Information on how this indicator has been measured was not accessed by the evaluation team.</p>		<p>Generally, there is fair awareness and understanding of the project among project beneficiaries.</p> <p>Of the 6 children interviewed, 3 knew about child labor and child rights. Among parents/ SHG members, low understanding of the seed money/ savings program was observed.</p> <p>The CLCs were established through the cooperation of the NFE educators but the community provided labor.<sup>2</sup></p> <p>A pre and post assessment of on beneficiaries understanding of the project is mentioned as an indicator in the Action Program. However, this document was not reviewed by the evaluation team.</p>
<p>Awareness and understanding of project among:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- implementing agencies, NPM, CLM, Teacher</li> <li>- Employers<sup>3</sup></li> <li>- Provincial Governor and Provincial Committee on CL)</li> </ul>	<p>Awareness and understanding among implementing agencies/partners and staff is high.<sup>4</sup> People in project and program management are well-versed on and seem to have a thorough understanding of the background, objectives, strategies and activities of the project in general and of the sector programs in particular.</p> <p>Employers in the salt sector appear to be aware and understand the project. They accept that child labor is not good for children and that children should be in school and not working. However, a low level of support is evident especially with regard to time for NFE for working children. In terms of improvements in workplace conditions, some 39% employers have instituted some positive changes</p> <p>In all three sectors, the CCL members (excluding the project coordinators and directors of the programs) have not yet conducted site visits. Their exposure to the project is based on project documents (action program, reports, regulations and announcements. Some absences are also evident during their regular meetings. The provincial Governor is also normally very busy to attend the meetings of the CCLs. Given this situation, the awareness and understanding of the CCL members may not be at the level that is expected of such a mechanism.</p>	<p>Employers in the fishing sector have a good awareness and understanding of the project. They say that children who work for them come voluntarily and are not forced / required to work a set number of hours per day. The children can leave anytime to attend classes or just go home. Currently, 4 employers have improved conditions in their workplaces.</p>	<p>Representatives of the plantation management met were middle-to-high level officials. They are educated, well-spoken and well-mannered men. It seems they are aware of and understand the project. However, they maintain that the company does not employ child workers or laborers. Support to project activities is minimal i.e. no direct action to support project activities were observed or learned from interviews with beneficiaries or program implementers.</p>

<sup>1</sup> Based on interview results.

<sup>2</sup> CLCs are established on lots owned by the educators. When asked why they agreed to set-up the CLCs there, those interviewed (2) said they agreed because the PDEYS hired them as Educators.

<sup>3</sup> Based in interviews.

<sup>4</sup> Interviews were conducted with program staff. Discussions and interactions were experienced with program and project management.

Way of communicating with partners and beneficiary groups	Weekly and monthly meetings, communication through telephone and email, and interviews/discussions	Monthly meetings, telephone and email, visits to offices of implementing partners, reports and field visits to talk directly with beneficiaries.
Role and efficiency of Sector Coordinator / Frequency of meeting with partners and beneficiary groups	<p>Role: Coordination between and among 3 program implementers in 2 sectors; coordination between sector programs and national program and project management; support and advisory role to the provincial and municipal mechanisms.</p> <p>Frequency of Meetings with IA/Ps: Weekly and monthly meetings.</p>	<p>Role: Coordination between and among 3 program implementers in the sector; coordination between sector programs and national program and project management; support and advisory role to the provincial and municipal mechanisms.</p> <p>Frequency of Meetings with IA/Ps: Monthly meetings.</p>
Ways of solving problems encountered	The regular monthly and/or weekly meetings serve as the forum for discussion and solving of problems. Through frequent communications, problems that arise are immediately known by concerned parties. If necessary, sector coordinators visit the project sites to discuss and resolve problems. In all cases, the NPM is informed about problems and the proposed solutions. Within each sector, program implementers also regularly meet e.g. monitoring teams meet every month, NFE teams meet every week, and seed money agents and community monitors interact with village committees on a daily basis.	
Documentation and reporting	<p>Documentation: periodic progress reports; program monitoring records of targets and accomplishments; minutes of meetings/trainings/seminars</p> <p>Reporting: submission of periodic progress reports (quarterly); monthly meetings between sector coordinators and IA/Ps</p>	



## **SALT PRODUCTION**

Checklist is a useful tool. It contains all the relevant general information related to simple, effective and low cost implementation approaches to improve productivity and at the same time occupational health and safety of workers in the salt production.

For this purpose, checklist is the only tool that helps us to understand about policy on occupational health and safety for the salt production sector where many children are always involved in those working activities. Additionally, information filled in this checklist is not only for monitoring the problems, but also for taking action for improvement.

In this case, if your answer is **Yes**, it means that salt field's owners or employers fulfill the basic occupational health and safety standards as expected. For verifying the answers, therefore, we suggest the workers to also fill this checklist to see if their assessments are the same as those of owners or employers.

However, if the answers of some questions were **No**, this means that something can be done to further improve safety and health standards of the salt production. In this case, you will need to decide:

- What action needs to be taken?
- Who will do it?
- When will it be done?

This checklist aims to ensure that working children under hazardous conditions are prohibited, and assist us in assessment on occupational health and safety.

**Name of Workplace Monitoring Team Leader:**.....

**Name of employer/owner:**.....

**Address:**.....

**Date of monitoring:**.....

**Number of monitoring:**.....

## General

1. Is there any measure to protect workers under 18 years old be written and communicated to workers and/or their parents?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

2. Are names of workers under 18 years old listed?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

3. Are children under the age of 15 years old prohibited to lift, pull, push, and move weight in salt production fields? Is the prohibition written and communicated to employers and workers?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

4. Has weight lifting, pulling, pushing and moving in the salt production fields of workers aged between 15 to 18 years old been practiced in according to the manual weight lifting PRAKAS of the Ministry of Social Affairs, Labor, Vocational Training and Youth Rehabilitation? Is the instruction written and communicated to employers and workers?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

5. Are children aged less than 15 years old prohibited to work not to exceed more than 2 executing hours per day in the salt production fields? Is the prohibition written and communicated to children and their parents?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

## Placing and using of materials and tools

6. Have push-carts been used to carry salt in and out of the where-house to reduce manual labor and increase productivity?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

7. Have boots, gloves, hats and working clothes been used while working in the salt production field?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

8. Have equipment and tools been kept in a good order?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

9. Are workers properly trained in the safe use of equipment and tools?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

## Means for Welfare Facilities

10. Is there a sufficient supply of safe drinking water?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

11. Are there a sufficient number of toilets separately for men and women at the workplace?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

12. Are toilets regularly cleaned?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

13. Are soaps and toilet tissues provided?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

14. Do workers, who worked with hazardous substances, wash their hands with soap before eating or drinking?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

15. Are there sufficient washbasins with fresh water in the work complex?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

16. Are there a sufficient number of first aid-boxes and be accessible in emergency?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

17. Does salt production fields have infirmaries or a doctors and/or nurses on duty during working hours?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

18. Are worker properly trained in the safe use and maintaining protective gears and in regular checking of those protective gears?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

## Workplaces

19. Is there any resting corner provided for workers to take a short break?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

20. Have suitable passageway been prepared for moving salt in and out of the warehouse?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

21. Have rooms for placing personal belongings and changing clothes of workers been made?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

## Housing

22. Have sufficient number of proper houses for families, by separating between families or between men and women been made?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

23. Have proper windows, roofs, walls and ceilings been made? and has electricity at night been provided?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

## Lighting

24. Has sufficient light been provided for the warehouses while the workers are working in?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

## CRABS/SHRIMPS PEELING HOME-BASED-WORKPLACE

Checklist is a useful tool. It contains all the relevant general information related to simple, effective and low cost implementation approaches to improve productivity and at the same time occupational health and safety of home-based workplace.

For this purpose, checklist is the only tool that helps us to understand about policy on occupational health and safety in fishing sector where many children are always involved in those working activities. Additionally, information filled in this checklist is not only for monitoring the problems, but also for taking action for improvement.

In this case, if your answer is **Yes**, it means that children and their parents fulfill the basic occupational safety and health standards as expected. For verifying the answers, therefore, we suggest another member of the family to also fill this checklist directly to see if his/her assessment is the same as others in the family.

However, if the answers of some questions were **No**, this means that something can be done to further improve safety and health standards of family. In this case, you will need to decide:

- What action needs to be taken?
- Who will do it?
- When will it be done?

This checklist aims to ensure that working children under hazardous conditions are prohibited, and assist us in assessment on occupational health and safety.

**Name of Com. Monitoring Team Leader:** .....

**Name of parents/hh head:**.....

**Address:**.....

**Date of monitoring:**.....

**Number of monitoring:**.....

## General:

1. Have parents prohibited their under 15 years- old- children to be involved in crabs/shrimps peeling for more than three consecutive hours per day?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

2. Do all the under- 15- years- old- children go to the public school or non-formal class?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

3. Are children aged less than 18 years old prohibited to work at night after 2100 hour?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

## Placing and using materials and tools:

4. Have unnecessary materials been taken out of the workplace?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

5. Have equipment/materials use for fishing work been maintained/kept in a good order and condition?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

6. Have gloves been used to peel crabs/shrimps?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

7. Have the iron traps been used to pick up the sea products to avoid any cutting and burning injuries?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

## Workplaces

8. Have workplaces been cleaned and dried to avoid slippery?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

9. Have more windows been made on the wall to increase natural ventilation ?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

10. Has sufficient light been provided at the workplace?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

11. Has proper and safe electric wiring system been prepared to avoid electrical accidents at the workplace and in household?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

12. Are suitable chairs provided in compliance with home base situation?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

## RUBBER PLANTATION

Checklist is a useful tool. It contains all the relevant general information related to simple, effective and low cost implementation approaches to improve productivity and at the same time occupational health and safety of workers in rubber plantation.

For this purpose, checklist is the only tool that helps us to understand about policy on occupational health and safety in rubber plantation where many children are always involved in those working activities. Additionally, information filled in this checklist is not only for monitoring the problems, but also for taking action for improvement.

In this case, if your answer is **Yes**, it means that owners or managers of plantation fulfill the basic occupational safety and health standards as expected. For verifying the answers, therefore, we suggest the worker's representatives, union's representatives and workers to also fill this checklist directly to see if their assessments are the same as those of owners or employers.

However, if the answers of some questions were **No**, this means that something can be done to further improve safety and health standards of the rubber plantation. In this case, you will need to decide:

- What action needs to be taken?
- Who will do it?
- When will it be done?

This checklist aims to ensure that working children under hazardous conditions are prohibited, and assist us in assessment on occupational health and safety.

Rubber plots no.:..... Name of supervisor of rubber plot:.....

Sub-monitoring team: ..... Date of checking:.....



## General

1. Is there any measure to protect workers under 18 years old written and communicated to workers and/or their parents?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

2. Are names of workers under 18 years old listed?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

3. Are workers under the age of 16 years old prohibited to climb up the ladder? Is the prohibition written and communicated to workers?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

4. Are children aged less than 15 years prohibited not to work for more than 3 hours per day? Is this prohibition be written and communicated to those children and their parents?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

5. Are working children aged less than 18 years prohibited to work with acids and chemical substances?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

## Placing and using materials and tools:

6. Have special equipment (such as push carts) for loading and moving heavy materials such as latex containers and ladders been used?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

7. Have the height of equipment been improved to avoid bending down or using hands at higher position while working?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

8. Have ladders with corrected height and hand been made and provided?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

9. Have acid and chemicals ointments been stored in covered and safe containers or cans?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority  
Note:.....  
.....

10. Are workers properly trained in the safe use of equipment?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority  
Note:.....  
.....

## Means for Welfare Facilities

11. Is there a supply of safe drinking water?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority  
Note:.....  
.....

12. Are there a sufficient number of toilets for men and women reasonably close to the main working area?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority  
Note:.....  
.....

13. Are toilets regularly cleaned?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority  
Note:.....  
.....

14. Is soap and toilet tissues provided?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority  
Note:.....  
.....

15. Do workers, who worked with hazardous substances, wash their hands with soap before eating or drinking?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority  
Note:.....  
.....

16. Have raincoats, boots and working cloths been provided to workers?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority  
Note:.....  
.....

17. Are there a sufficient number of first-aid stations/boxes be available under emergency case?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority  
Note:.....  
.....

18. Does rubber plantation have an infirmary or a doctor and/or nurse on duty during working hours?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority  
Note:.....  
.....

19. Are workers properly trained in the safe use and maintaining protective gears and in regular checking of those protective gears?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

## Workplaces

20. Have unnecessary materials been taken out from workplaces?

☐ No ☐ Yes ☐ Priority

Note:.....  
.....

## **ANNEX 9a: Guidelines on Prevention/Elimination of Child Labor in Hazardous Works (SALT SECTOR)**

KINGDOM OF CAMBODIA  
NATION RELIGION KING

Kompot Committee of Child Labor and  
Forms of Child Exploitation

No:.....

Date:.....2003

### **Guidelines on prevention/elimination of child labor to hazardous works**

Kompot Committee of Child Labor and Forms of Child Exploitation has seen that: At the salt production sites, the implementation on measures of prevention and elimination of the form of hard labor of children has not been carried out effectively and fruitfully yet.

Kompot Committee of Child Labor would like to guide the measure implementation on prevention and elimination of the form of hard labor of children properly and effectively to ensure the legitimate interest for relevant parties:

1. All sites of salt production in Kompot province with child workers participation, even in any circumstance, should be listed and registered the date of birth of them properly.
2. Employers or owners of salt production sites, parents or guardians of under-aged 18 children should facilitate them to access to public school or non-formal school between 13:30 pm to 17:00 pm.
3. Any use of under-aged 15-17 workers and employees should ensure that all works would not affect health, moral or children development and feeling.
4. In any circumstance, under-aged 12 children should definitely be prohibited to participate in salt production.
5. Any participation of under-aged 12-14 children should not be over 4-hour a day or 5 days a week.
6. Should give instructions and provide safety materials to keep work security and sanitation such as hats, gloves, boots, clean water, latrines, relax shelter and accommodation to workers from the far distance and health care for employees.
7. Kompot Department of Social Affairs, Labor, Vocational Training and Youth Rehabilitation should carry out the inspection of work upon the guidelines of Ministry of Social Affairs, Labor, Vocational Training and Youth Rehabilitation.
8. Department of Education, Youth and Sport should facilitate the child workers to access public school, non-formal school, and other vocational trainings, especially children traveling with their parents or guardians to access continuous education upon the guidelines of Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport.

9. In case of difficult issues to deal, they should send a report to provincial city hall to take action and seek a resolution.

Kompot Committee of Child Labor and Forms of Child Exploitation strongly hopes that you, ladies and gentlemen, employers and owners of salt production sites will pay attention to carry out the above guideline.

This guideline comes into effective from the date signed.

Labor and

Kompot Committee of Child

Forms of Child Exploitation  
Director

C/O

- Ministry of Interior “for information”
- Ministry of Social Affairs, Labor, Vocational Training and Youth Rehabilitation “for information”
- Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport “for information”
- National Council for Children “for information”
- Subcommittee of National Child Labor “for information”
- Kompot Department of Social Affairs, Labor, Vocational Training and Youth Rehabilitation “for dissemination and implementation”
- Kompot Department of Education, Youth and Sport “for dissemination and implementation”
- Relevant institutions of Kompot Committee of Child Labor “for implementation”
- Chronicle and Archive

KINGDOM OF CAMBODIA  
NATION RELIGION KING

Ministry of Interior  
City Hall of Kompot  
No. 55  
March 2002

Kompot, 22

**Notice on establishment of Kompot Committee of Child Labor  
and Forms of Child Exploitation**

- Seen the Royal decree No. 0801/276 dated August 18, 2001 of His Majesty King Norodom Sihanouk of Kingdom of Cambodia on the appointment of city/province governors.
- Seen sub-decree No. 56 dated June 24, 1999 of Royal government on the establishment of the Cambodian National Council for Children.
- Seen the declaration No. 031 dated February 15, 1994 of Interior Ministry on duties, rights and structure of city/province administration.
- Seen the decision No. 18 dated April 10, 2000 of Cambodian National Council for Children on the establishment of Sub-Committee of Child Labor and Forms of Child Exploitation.
- With reference to necessity of Kompot province.

Decided

**Para 1:** Establish the Provincial Committee of Child Labor and Forms of Child Exploitation comprising of components as follows:

- |   |            |
|---|------------|
| 1. Third Deputy Governor of Kompot  | Chairman   |
| 2. Director of Department of Social Affairs, Labor,<br>Chairman<br>Vocational Training and Youth Rehabilitation | First Vice |
| 3. Deputy Director of Department of Education,<br>Vice Chairman<br>Youth and Sport                              | Second     |
| 4. Director of Department of Women<br>Affairs and Veterans  | Member     |
| 5. Director of Department of Industry,<br>Mine and Energy   | Member     |
| 6. Deputy Director of Department of Health  | Member     |
| 7. Director of Rural Development Department   | Member     |
| 8. Deputy Director of Information Department  | Member     |
| 9. Governor of Kompot district  | Member     |
| 10. Governor of Kompong Bai district  | Member     |
| 11. Representative of salt production community<br>of Troi Koh commune  | Member     |
| 12. Representative of salt production community<br>of Chum Kriel commune  | Member     |
| 13. Representative of salt production community<br>of Kon Sat commune   | Member     |

14. Representative of salt production employees of Troi Koh	Member
15. Representative of salt production employees of Chum Kriel commune	Member
16. Representative of salt production employees of Kon Sat commune	Member
17. Representative of UCC	
18. President of Khmer Union Federation Kompot	Member
19. Chief of Troi Koh commune	Member
20. Chief of Chum Kriel commune	Member
21. Chief of Konsat commune	Member
22. Deputy Director of Social Affairs, Labor, Vocational Training and Youth Rehabilitation	Member

**Para 2:** Committee of Child Labor and Forms of Child Exploitation has its duties as follows:

- Consult on action plan, policy and programs related to hard labor of children in Kompot upon the national action plan, policy and international norms that the Kingdom of Cambodia ratified.
- Consult and advise the program operation on form of hard labor of children in salt production to be ownership and keep sustainable programs through producing and implementation of related programs.
- Choose, consult and approve program suggestions of Child Labor in framework of budget and co-finance, which are suggested by government institutions, NGOs and civil society to seek support from donor organizations and individual assistance in the framework of national program on elimination of Child Labor and Forms of Child Exploitation.
- Consult and advise the draft of crucial local and national policies related to Child Labor, which is the priority policy related to the fields of work, social affairs, education and health care of child workers.
- Discuss, facilitate, monitor and assess all programs related to forms of hard labor of children in salt production in Kompot province in collaboration with the relevant key role players.
- Quarterly report to Sub-Committee of Child Labor and Forms of Child Exploitation and the National Council of Cambodia for Children, and Ministry of Social Affairs, Labor, Vocational Training and Youth Rehabilitation in order to report the Royal government of Cambodia.

**Para 3:** Provincial Committee of Child Labor and Forms of Child Exploitation uses the Department of Social Affairs, Labor, Vocational Training and Youth Rehabilitation Kompot province as permanent secretariat. The budget for meetings and administrative cost of Committee of Child Labor and Forms of Child Exploitation is a part of budget of provincial Department of Social Affairs, Labor, Vocational Training and Youth Rehabilitation and also co-finance of Ministry of Social Affairs, Labor, Vocational Training and Youth Rehabilitation to participate in program against form of hard labor of salt production child workers.

**Para 4:** Representatives of UN, local and foreign NGOs and individual who are interested could join as observation members and meetings upon the invitation from the committee.

**Para 5:** Committee of Child Labor and Forms of Child Exploitation has the right to use stamp of Kompot City Hall.

**Para 6:** Any provision contrary to this notice shall be abrogated.

**Para 7:** City Hall of Kompot and relevant departments as said in Para 1 have duty to carry out this notice effectively.

**Para 8:** This notice comes into effective from the date signed.

First Deputy Governor

C/O

- Ministry of Interior
- Ministry of Social Affairs, Labor, Vocational Training and Youth Rehabilitation
- Cambodian National Council for Children
- National Sub-committee of Child Labor and Form of Child Exploitation “for information”
- As Para 7 “for implementation”
- Chronicle and Archive



KINGDOM OF CAMBODIA  
NATION RELIGION KING

City Hall of Kompot  
Committee of Child Labor and  
Forms of Child Exploitation Kompot  
2002

Kompot, 8 August

## **Regulations**

**Para 1:** Kompot Committee of Child Labor and Forms of Child Exploitation shall hold extra-ordinary meeting every two months. In case of necessity, the extra-ordinary meeting shall be held upon the invitation requested by Chairman of Kompot Committee of Child Labor and Forms of Child Exploitation.

**Para 2:** In case of absence of Chairman of Kompot Committee of Child Labor and Forms of Child Exploitation, the first deputy chairman shall organize the meeting.

**Para 3:** Permanent secretariat of Kompot Committee of Child Labor and Forms of Child Exploitation should send an invitation letter or documents to its members at least three days ahead, except the necessity unable to do.

**Para 4:** In case of member(s) of Kompot Committee of Child Labor and Forms of Child Exploitation could not attend a meeting upon invitation or delegate anyone, he/she should inform in an official letter or written letter to permanent secretariat at least 24 hours before meeting started.

**Para 5:** Members of observation of Kompot Committee of Child Labor and Forms of Child Exploitation could attend a meeting upon the invitation of permanent secretariat of committee of Child Labor.

**Para 6:** Participants of meeting should sign their names and signature in the attendance list regularly in all meetings.

**Para 7:** Meeting participants and observers of Committee of Child Labor and Forms of Child Exploitation could express his/her opinions when the meeting chairman allowed or upon the agenda submitted.

**Para 8:** Meeting participants should not speak off topics set.

**Para 9:** Ideas of participants raised in the meeting of Committee of Child Labor and Forms of Child Exploitation shall consider opinions of departments or units that represent.

**Para 10:** All decisions of any issue in the meeting of Committee of Child Labor and Forms of Child Exploitation shall be made by raising hands or secret vote upon the decision of meeting chairman.

**Para 11:** All decisions of any issue shall be based on majority (half +1) of meeting participants (regardless of quorum), in case of the equal votes/numbers, chairman of the meeting shall make a decision.

**Para 12:** In case of necessity, chairman of Committee of Child Labor and Forms of Child Exploitation has the right to add members or change any member of membership institutions.

**Para 13:** Before closing a meeting, members of Committee of Child Labor and Forms of Child Exploitation could make a suggestion for the next agenda of the meeting to committee for making a decision.

**Para 14:** This regulation comes into effective from date signed.

Committee of Child Labor and Forms  
of Child Exploitation

Chairman

**ANNEX 9b: Guidelines on Prevention/Elimination  
of Child Labor to Hazardous Works (FISHING SECTOR)**

**KINGDOM OF CAMBODIA  
NATION RELIGION KING**

Child Labor Committee and other  
Forms of Child Exploitation  
In Sihanoukville  
No:.....

Date:.....

Announcement about the Proceeding  
of elimination of child labor in the hazardous works

Forms of commercial exploitation in Sihanoukville have Seen that; In the working place crab/shrimp peeler, port, fishing boats the proceeding of elimination the hazardous work of child labor are not efficiency and good input yet.

Municipal committee of child labor, have this announcement to help the proceeding of elimination the hazardous work of child labor to be better and more efficiency, in order to guarantee the legal benefit to all party are relevant such as:

1. All working place crab/shrimp peeler, port, fishing boats in Sihanoukville, that have child labor with any conditions should have a clear list all the name and date of birth of those children.
2. Employers or the owner of working place crab/shrimp, port, fishing boat and parents that have child under 18 year olds; they have to help those working children to have time for schooling in the public and non-formal in the period is; in the morning from 7:00 am to 11:00 am and evening from 2:00 pm to 5:00 pm.
3. For employers of employee that have children age from 15 to 17 years old, should guarantee that those works are not effect to the child health, morality, body and psychology development of the child.
4. Absolutely, not allow all the children, who were under 12 years old to work as crab and shrimp peeler, even in any farm.
5. Absolutely, not allow all the children, who were under 16 years old to work on the fishing boat, even in any farm.
6. For the children who were age from 12 to 14 year olds that works as crab/shrimp peeler not allow to work more than 4 hours per day and 5 days per week.
7. Should teach and provide the protection material to those children, for occupational health and safety according to the real works as: gloves, boots, safety jacket (swimming), clean drinking water, toilet, working seat, and other health care of employee.
8. Municipal department of social affair, labor, vocational training and youth rehabilitation of Sihanoukville, have to practices of labor inspector through the principle of labor law and international convention that related the children, and also was ratification by the government of Cambodia.
9. Municipal department of education, youth and sport have to prepare/organize enough place for working children, that they want to continue their schooling in

public school, non-formal and vocational training. Especially for the children who more the residents with their parents to continue their schooling as in the principle of national policy of the government of Cambodia education.

10. Department of Agriculture, forest and fishing have to practice their inspector on the fishing boats according to the policy of Ministry of Agriculture, forest and fishing.
11. In case of facing difficulty that could not be solved, report it to the municipal of Sihanoukville, to find the solutions.

Child Labor Committee and other forms of commercial exploitation to children in Municipal/Provincial have very strong belief to the employers or owner of crab/shrimp peeler working places, ports, fishing boats would pay more attention and good practices according to what was mentioned above.

This announcement has efficiency and practices from signing date.

Child Labor Committee and other forms  
of commercial exploitation to children in  
Municipal

The Chairman

Receiver:

- Ministry of Interior (known)
- Ministry of Social Affairs, Vocational Training and Youth Rehabilitation (known)
- Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport (known)
- Ministry of Agriculture, Forest and Fishing (known)
- National Council for Children (known)
- National Sub-Committee of Child Labor (known)
- Municipal Department of Social Affair, Vocational Training and Youth Rehabilitation of Sihanoukville (propaganda and practices)
- Municipal Education, Youth and Sport of Sihanoukville (propaganda and practices)
- Municipal Department of Agriculture, Forest and Fishing of Sihanoukville (propaganda and practices)
- Relevant institution of Child Labor Committee of Sihanoukville (propaganda and practices)
- Documents

KINGDOM OF CAMBODIA  
NATION RELIGION KING

Ministry of Interior  
Municipality of Sihanoukville  
No: 90

***Prakas* of Formulation of Child Labor Committee  
and other Forms of Commercial Exploitation to Children in Sihanoukville**

**Municipal Governor**

- In relation to the Royal decree No. made in March 12, 1999. Concern about the delegation of the representative of Government, Municipality/provincial governors
- In relation to the sub-decree No. 69 made in March 11, 1999. Of the government of Cambodia about the delegation of Municipality/provincial governors.
- In relation to Pass No. 031 made in February 15, 1994 of the ministry of Interior. Concerned about the Right and administration of Municipality/provincial governors.
- In relation to the sub-decree No. 56 made in June 28, 1999. Concerned about the Cambodia National Council for Children
- In relation to the decree No. 18 in April 10, 2000 of Cambodia National Council for children. Concerned about the formulation of National sub-committee of child labor and other forms of commercial exploitation to children.
- According to the municipal of Sihanoukville necessary need

**Accomplishments**

Article 1: Municipal Child Labor Committee and other forms of commercial exploitation to children are compounding by:

1.	Provincial Governor	PCCL chief
2.	Director of Municipal Department of Social Affair, Labor, Vocational Training and Youth Rehabilitation	First deputy
3.	Director of Municipal Department of Education, Youth and Sport	Second deputy
4.	Deputy Director of Municipal Department of Agriculture, Forest and Fishing	Member
5.	Director of Municipal Department of Women Affair and Veteran	Member
6.	Deputy Director of Municipal Department of Public Health	Member
7.	Director of Municipal Department of Rural Development	Member
8.	Director of Municipal Department of Information	Member
	Director of Municipal Department of	

9.	Environment	Member
10. Representative of employers	Employer of fishing sector (2 persons)	Member
11. Representative of Fishman	Fishman (2 persons)	Member
12. Representative of NGOs	NGOs (2 persons)	Member
13. Representative of Commune Council	Commune council members (2 persons)	Member
14.	Representative of Municipal Department of Social Affair, Labor, Vocational Training and Youth Rehabilitation	MCCL Secretary

Article 2: Municipal Child Labor Committee and other forms of commercial exploitation to children have roles and responsibilities which are:

- To discuss the activities plan, policy, and other programs that were related to the hazardous of child labor for municipal of Sihanoukville. According on the activities plan, national policy and other international standard that was ratified by the Kingdom of Cambodia.
- To have discussed and counseled to implementation of the hazardous works of child labor project, in CHUP rubber plantation. To encourage as the project owner and sustains of the project through the activities and plan of other relevant institutions.
- Recruit and counsel, and assent to the project, offer the program on child labor in term of budget, contribution that were requested by the institutions, NGOs, community and other civil society to looking for the support from NGOs, agencies and individual donors in terms of national program to eliminate child labor and other forms of commercial exploitations to children.
- To have discussed and counseled on the draft policy in national level and community base that involved with the child labor and relevant policy to social affair and labor, education and child public health.
- To discuss, facilitate, review and evaluate to all relevant programs of child labor, in fishing sector,, municipal of Sihanoukville that were cooperation with others related to this works.
- Report once every 3 months, to the national sub-committee of child labor and other forms of commercial exploitations to children of the national council for children and ministry of social affair, vocational training and youth rehabilitation, and report to the government of Cambodia.

Article 3: Provincial child labor committee and other forms of commercial exploitation to children, use the municipal department of social affair, vocational training and youth rehabilitation as the steering general secretarial. Budget for meeting and administration of municipal child labor committee and other forms of commercial exploitation to children is a part of the Municipal Department of Social Affair, Vocational Training and Youth Rehabilitation's budget. To contribute to the program of elimination of hazardous work of child labor in fishing sector.

Article 4: Municipal child labor committee and other forms of commercial exploitation to children, has right to use the seal/stamp of Municipal of Sihanoukville.

Article 5: Every principle that is contrary to this process, are considered as to be repeated/abrogated.

Article 6: Municipal of Sihanoukville, offices and other relevant institutions, as in the Article 1, should be achievement and effectiveness works.

Article 7: This process is completing performance from the signing date.

2002 Sihanoukville Date: 27 March,

Municipal Governor

Receivers:

- Ministry of Interior
- Ministry of Social Affair, Vocational Training and Youth Rehabilitation
- National Council for Children
- National Sib-committee of Child Labor and other Forms of Commercial Exploitation to Children
- District governors

(Known)

- Article 6 "for implementation"
- Documents

**ANNEX 9c: Guidelines on Prevention/  
Elimination of Child Labor to Hazardous Works (RUBBER SECTOR)**

KINGDOM OF CAMBODIA  
NATION RELIGION KING

Child Labor Committee and other Forms  
Of Commercial Exploitation of Children  
In Kampong Cham Province  
No:.....

Date:.....

**Announcement about the Proceeding  
of elimination of child labor in the hazardous works in CHUP rubber plantation**

Kampong Cham Province has 7 rubber plantations (Chup, Krek, Peam Cheang, Me Mot, Ta Pao, Chamcar Ondoung, and Beoung Kek), was exploitation. And it shows that children were participants in CHUP rubber plantation as family works. Some children help their family works one for a while or part time works that they can regularly attending schooling. Other children work part time or full time, they have not time for their schooling and some works are hazardous works too.

Child Labor Committee and other forms of commercial exploitation to children in Kampong Cham province, have this announcement to help the proceeding of elimination the hazardous work of child labor to be better and more efficient, in order to guarantee the legal benefit to all party are relevant such as:

1. All rubber plantations in Kampong Cham that have child labor with any conditions should have a clear list of all the names and dates of birth of those children.
2. Absolutely, not allow all the children, who are under 12 years old to work in the rubber plantation, even in any farm.
3. For the children whose age is from 12 to 15 years old that works in the rubber plantation, have to be sure that the work is light, does not affect their health, bodies and psychological development of the children and not affect the schooling of children and vocational training that was limited by the authority.
4. For the employ of employee that have age from 15 to 18 years old, should guarantee that those works are not effect to the child health, morality of adult.
5. Absolutely, not allow all the children, who are under 18 years old to work in the rubber plantation, climb the ladder to chisel.
6. All rubber plantation employers, parents of the children who are age under 18 years old should help those children to have schooling in public school, non-formal and vocational training.
7. All rubber plantation employers have to provide the protection material to those children, such as working uniform, raincoat, boots, gloves...etc.
8. All rubber plantation employers have to provide enough clean drinking water to the workers/children in the rubber plantation-working sector.
9. Have to organize a First Aid Box, with the working sector and group leader in each working sectors to emergency aid, before sending to the health center.
10. Provide plastic ladder to the working children, it should be fit to the higher of rubber trees to chisel (because some plastic ladders have to add the bamboo in order to fit to the higher of chisel).
11. Re-organize the water basin in the villages to have more sanitation, cover of basin, draining water place, and eliminate the hold and muddy surrounding the water basin.



12. To build the toilet in each village for the workers/employees in order to have good sanitation in the village.
13. Provincial department of social affair, labor, vocational training and youth rehabilitation of Kampong Cham, have to practices of labor inspector through the principle of Ministry of Social Affair, Labor, Vocational Training and Youth Rehabilitation.
14. Provincial Department of Education, Youth and Sport, have to prepare/organize enough place for working children, that they want to continue their schooling in public school, non-formal and vocational training. Especially for the mobilize children (who more the residents), to continue their schooling as in the principle of Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport.
15. In case, face the difficulty that could not be solved, all department and rubber plantation should report it to the provincial child labor Committee and other forms of commercial exploitation to children, to discuss and find solutions on time.

Child Labor Committee and other forms of commercial exploitation to children in Kampong Cham province have very strong belief to the employers of rubber plantations, representation of all departments would pay more attention and good practices according of what was mention above.

This announcement has efficiency and practices from signing date.

Provincial Governor and Chairman  
Child Labor Committee and other forms of  
Commercial Exploitation to Children

Receiver:

- Ministry of Interior (known)
- Ministry of Social Affair, Vocational Training and Youth Rehabilitation (known)
- Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport (known)
- Ministry of Agriculture, Forest and Fishing (known)
- National Council for Children (known)
- National Sub-Committee of Child Labor (known)
- Provincial Department of Social Affair, Vocational Training and Youth Rehabilitation (propaganda and practices)
- Provincial Education, Youth and Sport (propaganda and practices)
- All rubber plantation in Kampong Cham (propaganda and practices)
- Relevant institution of Provincial Child Labor Committee (propaganda and practices)
- Documents

KINGDOM OF CAMBODIA  
NATION RELIGION KING

Kampong Cham Provincial  
No.: 52

Kampong Cham date: 29 May 2002

**Process of Formulation of Child Labor Committee  
and other Forms of Commercial Exploitation to Children in Kampong Cham**

**Provincial Governor**

- In relation to Royal decree No. made in March 12, 1999. Concern about the delegation of the representative of Government, Municipality/provincial governors.
- In relation to Pass No. 031 made in February 15, 1994 of the Ministry of Interior. Concerned about the Right and administration of Municipality/provincial governors.
- In relation to sub-decree No. 56 made in June 28, 1999. Concerned about the Cambodia National Council for Children.
- In relation to decree No. 18 in April 10, 2000 of Cambodia National Council for Children. Concerned about the formulation of National Sub-Committee of Child Labor and other forms of commercial exploitation to children.
- According to the provincial necessary need.

**Accomplishment**

Article 1: Provincial Child Labor Committee and other forms of commercial exploitation to children are compounding by:

1.	Provincial Governor	PCCL chief
2.	1 <sup>st</sup> Deputy Provincial Governor	PCCL deputy
3.	Director of Provincial Department of Social Affair, Labor, Vocational Training and Youth Rehabilitation	Permanent deputy
4.	Director of Provincial Department of Education, Youth and Sport	Member
5.	Director of Provincial Department of Women Affair and Veteran	Member
6.	Director of Provincial Department of Public Health	Member
7.	Director of Provincial Department of Rural Development	Member
8.	Director of Provincial Department of Agriculture, Forest and Fishing	Member
9.	Director of Provincial Department of Information	Member
10.	Director of Provincial Department of Industry	Member
11.	Grand Manager of Chup Rubber Plantation	Member
12.	Representative of Chup rubber plantation workers	Member
13.	Representative of Chup rubber plantation workers	Member
14.	KTO (NGOs)	Member
15.	LICADHO (NGOs)	Member
16.	Chup commune chief	Member

17.	Shoung commune chief	Member
18.	Vihea lounng commune Chief	Member
19.	Deputy-Director of Provincial Department of Social Affair, Labor, Vocational Training and Youth Rehabilitation	PCCL Secretary

Article 2: Child Labor Committee and other forms of commercial exploitation to children has roles and responsibilities which are:

- To discuss on the activities, plan, policy, and other programs that were related to the hazardous of child labor for Kampong Cham province. According on the activities plan, national policy and other international standard that was ratified by the kingdom of Cambodia.
- To discuss and counsel to implementation of the hazardous works of child labor project, in CHUP rubber plantation. To encourage as the project owner and sustain of the project through the activities and plan of other relevant institutions.
- Recruit and counsel, and assent to the project, offer the program on child labor in terms of budget, contribution that were requested by the institutions, NGOs, community and other civil society to look for the support from NGOs, agencies and individual donors in terms of national program to eliminate the child labor and other forms of commercial exploitation to children.
- To discuss and counsel on the draft policy in national level and community base that involved with the child labor and relevant policy to social affair and labor, educations and child public health.
- To discuss, facilitate, review and evaluate to all relevant programs of child labor, in CHUP rubber plantation, Kampong Cham that were cooperation with others related to this works.
- Report once every 3 months, to the national sub-committee of child labor and other forms of commercial exploitation to children of the National Council for Children and Ministry of Social Affair, Vocational Training and Youth Rehabilitation, and report to the government of Cambodia.

Article 3: Provincial child labor committee and other forms of commercial exploitation to children, use the Provincial Department of Social Affair, Vocational Training and Youth Rehabilitation as the Steering general secretarial. Budget for meeting and administration of Provincial Child Labor Committee and other forms of commercial exploitation to children is a part of the Kampong Cham Provincial Department of Social Affair, Vocational Training and Youth Rehabilitation's budget. To contribute the program of elimination of hazardous work of child labor in CHUP rubber plantation.

Article 4: The representative of the United Nation and international and national NGOs and individuals that was interesting to participate as observer and join the meeting when has invitation from chairman of committee.

Article 5: Provincial child labor committee and other forms of commercial exploitation to children, has right to use seal/stamp of provincial hall.

Article 6: Every principle that is contrary to this process, are considered as to be repealed/abrogated.

Article 7: Kampong Cham provincial hall, offices and other relevant institutions, as in Article 1, should be achievement and effectiveness works. This process is completing performance from the signing date.

Receivers:

- Ministry of Interior
- Ministry of Social Affair, Vocational Training and Youth Rehabilitation
- National Council for Children
- National Sub-Committee of Child Labor and other forms of commercial exploitation to children
- District governors

(Known)

- 7 article "for implementation"
- Documents

KINGDOM OF CAMBODIA  
NATION RELIGION KING

Child Labor Committee and other forms  
Of Commercial Exploitation to Children  
In Kampong Cham Province

Organizational Descriptions

On September 5, 2002. Provincial child labor committee and other forms of commercial exploitation to children have organized the meeting to adopt the organizational description as below:

Article 1: Provincial child labor committee has to participate and join meeting according to the invitation of chairman of Provincial child labor committee.

Article 2: Steering secretary of Provincial child labor committee has to send the invitation and other documents to the members of Provincial child labor committee at least 3 days ahead of limited date. Except, the special case that can't inform.

Article 3: In case that the members of Provincial child labor committee can't come to join the meeting and send their representation they have to inform as writing or telephone to the steering secretary at less 24 hours a head of meeting.

Article 4: Provincial child labor committee have regular meeting one time of 13 months and abnormal meeting is depending on the real situation, and processing through the meeting schedule. The meeting could be works, only if have the presence of more than half of the total members of committee members.

Article 5: Secretary of Provincial child labor committee has to record all meeting note, and provide it to all the committee members.

Article 6: All the ideas of participant of Provincial child labor committee meeting, consider as the ideas of the self-department that was as the representatives.

Article 7: The adoptions of the Provincial child labor committee have to apply by raise and or secret vote according to the chairman of the meeting.

Article 8: The adoptions are depending on the decision of participants (50% + 1) of all Provincial child labor committee which was attending the meeting. In case, it has balance or same numbers of member are vote with two deference things, it has to revote again. If it is still equal it would be adoption by the chairman of the meeting.

Article 9: Before the meeting end, the members of Provincial child labor committee can request and enter their next meeting schedule to the committee for review and adoption.

Article 10: In case, it has the special needs, the chairman of Provincial child labor committee has right to exchange or adding more committee members.

Article 11: This organizational description would be practices and have efficiency from this meeting day of Provincial child labor committee.

Provincial governor and chairman of Provincial  
child labor committee and other forms of  
commercial exploitation to children