



International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC)



International
Labour
Office

IPEC Evaluation

Project of Support to the Time-Bound
Programme (TBP) for the Prevention and
Eradication of the Worst Forms Child Labour

-Phase II-

P.260.08.223.055

DOM/06/50/USA

Expanded Final Evaluation

Main Report

DOMINICAN REPUBLIC

December 2009

This document has not been professionally edited.

NOTE ON THE EVALUATION PROCESS AND REPORT

This independent evaluation was managed by ILO-IPEC's Design, Evaluation and Documentation Section (DED) following a consultative and participatory approach. DED has ensured that all major stakeholders were consulted and informed throughout the evaluation and that the evaluation was carried out to highest degree of credibility and independence and in line with established evaluation standards.

The evaluation was carried out by a team of external consultants¹. The field mission took place in October-November 2009. The opinions and recommendations included in this report are those of the authors and as such serve as an important contribution to learning and planning without necessarily constituting the perspective of the ILO or any other organization involved in the project.

Funding for this project evaluation was provided by the United States Department of Labor. This report does not necessarily reflect the views or policies of the United States Department of Labor nor does mention of trade names, commercial products, or organizations imply endorsement by the United States Government.

¹ Jorge Piña Puig and Roberto González

INDEX

1.	INTRODUCTION.....	1
1.1	The Role of the Project of Support to the TBP, Phase II	1
1.2	Context of the Evaluation	1
1.3	Expanded Final Evaluation	2
2.	METHODOLOGY OF THE EXPANDED FINAL EVALUATION	3
2.1	Activities of the Expanded Final Evaluation	3
2.2	Assessment of project achievements	4
3.	PROJECT'S DESIGN AND IMPLEMENTATION	5
3.1	Design	5
3.2	The Context of the Implementation	9
3.3	Project's Implementation	10
4.	PROJECT'S RELEVANCE	13
5.	PROJECT'S EFFICIENCY	15
5.1	Efficiency Indicators	16
5.2	Assessment of Efficiency	17
6.	PROJECT'S EFFECTIVENESS.....	17
6.1	Immediate Objective 1.....	17
6.2	Immediate Objective 2.....	18
6.3	Immediate Objective 3.....	19
6.4	Immediate Objective 4.....	21
6.5	Overall Assessment of the Project Effectiveness	21
7.	IMPACT OF THE PROJECT	23
7.1	Impact on Human Capital.....	23
7.2	Impact on Social Capital	26
7.3	Impact on Institutions and Services.....	27
7.4	Qualification of the Impact	27
8.	SUSTAINABILITY	28
8.1	Social Sustainability.....	28
8.2	Technical Sustainability.....	28
8.3	Institutional Sustainability	29
8.4	Economic Sustainability	29
8.5	Assessment of Sustainability.....	30
9.	LESSONS LEARNED	30
9.1	Relevance, Effectiveness and Impact of the "Salas de Tareas" (SdT).....	30
9.2	Comprehensiveness of the Action Plans.....	31
9.3	Building the Institutionalization of the Fight against CL	31
10.	CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	32
10.1	General Evaluation of the Project	32
10.2	Recommendations	32
	ANNEXES.....	43

TABLES

Table 1.	CA – The Project’s Direct Beneficiaries	8
Table 2	Project direct cost	15
Table 3	Cost and Funding of the APs.....	16
Table 4	Achievements of the Indicators of the Project’s Immediate Objectives	22

PROJECT IDENTIFICATION

ILO – ILO Project CodeDOM/06/50/USA
ILO – Project NumberP.260.08.223.055
ILO – IRIS Code100610
CountryDominican Republic
Duration39 months
Starting Date30 September 2006
Ending Date31 December 2009
Region.....Central America
Language.....Spanish
Implementing Agency.....OIT-IPEC
Financial AgencyUS DOL
Donors ContributionUS\$ 2,700,000

ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

ADP	Dominican Teachers' Association
AECID	International Cooperation for Development Spanish Agency
APEC	Education and Culture Association (Asociación por la Educación y Cultura)
AP	Action Programme
ASANAHOES	Hotels and Restaurants National Association
CA	Children and Adolescents
CDL	Local Steering Committee for the Fight against Child Labour (Comision Directiva de lucha contra el trabajo infantil)
CIESC	Interinstitutional Comisión against children and adolescents abuse and sexual commercial exploitation (Comisión Interinstitucional contra el Abuso y la Explotación Sexual Comercial de NNA)
CL	Child Labour
CLU	Child Labour Unit
CO	Community organization
CONANI	National Council for Children and Adolescents (Concejo Nacional para la Niñez y la Adolescencia)
CONEP	National Council for Private Businesses (Concejo Nacional de Empresas Privadas)
COPARDOM	Dominican Republic Employers Confederation
CSEC	Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children
CSEC/NAP	National Action Plan for the Elimination of Abuse and Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children and Adolescents
DED	Design, Evaluation and Documentation (IPEC evaluation function)
DEPRIDAM	Dominican Republic First Lady Office
DINAF	Children, Adolescents and Family Division
DR	Dominican Republic
EFE	Expanded Final Evaluation
ENDESA	Demographic and Health Survey
ENHOGAR	National Household Survey
FUNDASEP	Foundation for the Development of Azua, San Juan and Elías Piña
FUNDEBMUNI	Foundation for Women and Childhood Development and Wealness
GPS	Cabinet for Social Policy
GO	Government Organization
IDEFA	Insitute for the Family
IOM	International Organization for Migration
ILO	International Labour Organization
INDOTEL	Dominican Telecommunication Institute
INFOTEP	Technical Education Institute
IPEC	International Programme for the Eradication of Child Work
INPOSDOM	Dominican Post Institute
NAM	Women Support Group (NGO Nucleo de apoyo a la mujer)
NCTU	National Council for Trade Unions (Concejo Nacion de ...)
NGO	Nongovernmental Organization
NSC	National Steering Committee for the Fight against Child Labour (Comite Directivo Nacion de Lucha contral el trabajo infantil)
NSCL	National Survey on Child Labour (Encuesta nacional de Trabajo infantil)
NSP	National Strategic Plan for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour in the Dominican Republic
ONE	National Statisitics Office
PMT	Fathers, Mothers and Tutors of Working Children and Adolescents on Risk
PUCMM	Pontificia Universidad Católica Madre y Maestra
SdT	Leveling Classes (Sala de Tareas)
SEE	Ministry of Education (Secretaría de Estado de Educación)
SECTUR	Ministry of Tourism (Secretaría de Estado de Turismo)
SEDEFIR	Ministry of Sports and Recreation (Secretaría de Estado de Deportes y Recreación)
SEM	Ministry of Women (Secretaría de Estado de la Mujer)
SESPAS	Ministry of Public Health and Social Support (Secretaría de Estado de Salud Pública y Asistencia Social)
SET	Ministry of Labour (Secretaría de Estado de Trabajo)

SINAMOTI	National Child Labour Monitoring System (Sistema Nacional de Monitoreo de Trabajo Infantil)
SIUBEN	System of Beneficiaries (Sistema Único de Beneficiario)
SPC	Syndicate of “Picadores de Caña”
SPIF	Strategic Program Impact Framework
TBP	Time Bound Programme
UAPA	Open University for Adults (Universidad Abierta Para Adultos)
UCL	Urban Child Labour
UNICEF	United Nations Children Fund
USDOL	United States Department of Labour
UTESUR	Southern Technological University
WFCL	Worst Forms of Child Labour
WV	World Vision

1. INTRODUCTION

1. The Expanded Final Evaluation (EFE) of the Project of Support to the TBP, phase II was arranged by the ILO-IPEC's Design, Evaluation and Documentation Unit (DED) at the Geneva headquarters. Between October and November 2009, a team of external evaluators² visited the Project's area, conducted interviews and held focus groups with key stakeholders in the implementation and fight against Child Labour and its worst forms. An Impact Study³ was conducted simultaneously through a beneficiaries' survey. At the completion of the evaluation field activities, there was a stakeholder's workshop in the Project.

1.1 The Role of the Project of Support to the TBP, Phase II

2. The Project is a follow-up of the efforts of the Dominican Government, the International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour from the International Labour Organization (ILO-IPEC), and the United States Department of Labor (USDOL), to eliminate Child Labour and its worst forms.
3. This effort has been going on for more than 12 years and it is expected that at the end of the Project, the Dominican Republic will be in a position to lead and finance these actions.
4. The Project objectives, strategies and principal actions come from the National Strategic Plan for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour (WFCL) in the Dominican Republic for the 2006-2016 period (NSP). The NSP's formulation was concluded in August 2006, and representatives from key sectors in the fight against public and private Child Labour (CL) participated in its creation.
5. The inclusion of the NSP's central elements implies that the Project is a facilitator for the plan's implementation by providing the technical and financial resources in support of public policies to guarantee the integral welfare of children and adolescents (CAs). The National Steering Committee for the Fight against Child Labour (NSC) is the institution responsible for coordinating the NSP's implementation and for monitoring its progress; and the Dominican Ministry of Labour is the institution in charge.

1.2 Context of the Evaluation

6. Support for the International Programme for the Elimination of Child Labour formally started in 1997 when the Dominican Republic (DR) and the ILO signed a Letter of Agreement. That year, the DR made the commitment to have the NSC operating, through the Decree No. 144-97. Other important signs that show the Dominican Republic adheres to international norms on child labour (CL) were the ratification of the ILO's Conventions 138⁴ (1999) and 182⁵ (2000).
7. The actual actions to prevent and eliminate CL started in 1998 and have been extended to this date with the following projects:
 - a. Project for the prevention and elimination of child labour in the Constanza province, funded by the Spanish Agency for International Cooperation and USDOL, started in 1998;
 - b. Sub-regional Programme against Child Labour in Commercial Agriculture in Central America and the Dominican Republic, funded by USDOL, started in 1998;

² Mr. Jorge Piña Puig, international expert and team leader; Mr. Roberto González, national expert

³ Research Center on Education and Human Development [Centro de Investigación en Educación y Desarrollo Humano (CIEDHUMANO)] at the Pontificia Universidad Católica Madre y Maestra.

⁴ Legal Minimum Working Age

⁵ Worst Forms of Child Labour (WFCL)

- c. First National Survey on Child Labour in the Dominican Republic, conducted in 2000 (NSCL-2000);
 - d. Project for the prevention of domestic child labour, funded by the Government of Canada, started in 2002.
8. In 2001, the Dominican Republic became the second country in the Americas to implement a Time-Bound Programme (TBP) intended for the elimination of the worst forms of child labour (WFCL). A TBP is a special operation, which essential elements are the adoption of the programme by the appropriate public institutions, and the programme's incorporation into the broadest framework of national policies. There were three supporting projects within the TBP's framework, all funded by USDOL: (1) Preparatory phase, implemented between 2001 and 2004; (b) First phase, implemented between 2003 and 2006; (c) Project for the prevention and elimination of the Commercial Sexual Exploitation (CSE) of children and adolescents, implemented between 2004 and 2006; and (d) Phase II implemented between 2007 and 2009, the object of the present evaluation. Hence, the actions to prevent and eliminate CL and its worst forms in the DR, with the support of ILO-IPEC and various donors, have been carried on for 12 years.

1.3 Expanded Final Evaluation

9. According to the policies and procedures of the ILO's technical cooperation and agreement with the donor, the ILO-IPEC's projects are subject to an evaluation at its completion. In the case of the Project, which was executed within a reasonable framework for the implementation of the provisions of the Convention 182, it is appropriate to apply the methodology of an expanded final evaluation, which combines detailed examinations of impact, along with the Project's final evaluation. The results of the impact studies, incorporated to the final evaluation within an EFE framework, allow for more thorough qualitative and quantitative research.
10. **Purpose of the Evaluation.** The EFE will serve as a learning tool for the Dominican government, for the team managing the project, for the ILO-IPEC, for the donor, and for other organizations that work to prevent and eliminate CL in the Dominican Republic and other countries. Its main purposes are: (i) Review the project's continuous progress and its performance as it pertains to its impact and achievements of the immediate objectives; (ii) To examine the project's likelihood to achieve its objectives; (iii) Research the nature and extent of the obstacles and factors that have affected its implementation, as well as analyze the factors that have contributed to the project's success; and (iv) Assess the legacy of the IPEC's project on the national efforts to combat child labour, and in particular the worst forms of child labour.
11. **The Evaluation Profile.** The profile of the Supporting Project to the TBP, phase II, was to be a facilitator in the planning, organization and execution of a national effort. For that reason, the EFE will focus on the project's task as it pertains to the implementation of its own activities, but it will also evaluate its contributions to national efforts to combat CL and its worst forms.
12. **The Evaluation Criteria.** According to the ILO, the objectives of an evaluation should be: (a) establish in a systematic way, and as objectively as possible, the relevance, the efficiency, the effectiveness, the impact of the projects and programmes in relation to their objectives; (b) the likelihood of sustainability of the actions and results; and (c) enable the ILO, the countries' public institutions, and third-party partners, to establish systematic processes to reflect on how to increase the efficiency of projects and programmes. The criteria defined by ILO⁶ to evaluate a project or programme are the following. In the TORs (annex 11) these are described as 'categories of suggested areas of consideration':

⁶ ILO Evaluation Framework, November 2002; ILO, Planning and Managing Evaluations, 2006

- a. Relevance. Indicates to what degree the project or programme served to fulfill the needs and aspirations of the target population and the other actors involved;
- b. Efficiency. Indicates to what degree the resources assigned to a project or programme served to achieve the expected results⁷;
- c. Effectiveness. Indicates to what extent were services rendered, and to what extent the results envisioned for the short or long term (effects) as defined in the immediate objectives of the Logical Framework (LF) of the project or programme were achieved;
- d. Impact. Indicates to what extent changes in the target population were achieved, some of which could be envisioned for the medium and long term;
- e. Sustainability. Indicates the results' durability after external resources and donations have ended.

2. METHODOLOGY OF THE EXPANDED FINAL EVALUATION

13. The Expanded Final Evaluation (EFE) of the Supporting Project to the TBP, phase II, included an evaluation of the immediate objectives (results and effects), as well as an Impact Study on the “*Salas de Tareas*”⁸ (leveling classes) implemented by the Action Programmes (AP) of the local interventions component. The methodology regarding the evaluation of the the achieved objectives is presented in Annex 5. The the Impact Study methodology on the “Salas de Tarea” is included in the study report.

2.1 Activities of the Expanded Final Evaluation

14. The EFE was able to carry on all proposed activites. This section summarizes the main results.
15. **Review of existing documentation.** The EFE team looked at the following documentation: (i) final evaluation report of the Supporting Project to the TBP, phase I; (ii) report of the design of the Supporting Project to the TBP, phase II; (iii) midterm evaluation report of the Programme of Support to the TBP, phase II; (iv) reports on the advances made by the Supporting Project to the TBP, phase II; and (v) documents on the ILO-IPEC's methodology. All the documents were provided by the DED.
16. **Additional Information on the Project's Coordination.** The Project's Coordinator provided additional information to the EFE, which consisting of: (i) copies of illustrative and audiovisual publications produced by the Project; (ii) copies of the reports on the advances made by the NGOs implementing the APs; and (iii) information on the financial execution of the Project and the APs. Also, work-related meetings were held with the Project Coordinator in order to define the outline for the interviews, as well as to hear their opinions about the implementation.
17. The EFE team is grateful to the Project Coordinator and to the ILO personnel in the Dominican Republic for their effective support for the accomplishment of the foreseen activities.

⁷ Results is used generically in this report as a term refered to the impacts, effects and results defined within the project's Logical Framework.

⁸ Methodology used in several Action Programmes executed in the Dominican Republic with the support of the ILO-IPEC (preparatory phase of the TBP in Constanza), and by the National Component of the Sub-regional CL Programme in Commercial Agriculture in Azua).

18. **Interviews with key informants at the national level.** The EFE team interviewed 19 people, representatives of 12 governmental and non-governmental organizations. Also, it attended the ceremony for the launch of the “Road Map”, which took place at the “Green Room” of the Government Palace. The list of interviewees and the summary of their opinions are presented in Annex 7.
19. **Focus Groups with stakeholders in the APs.** The EFE team visited the nine Action Programmes (AP) implemented by the Project. During these visits, there were 13 focus groups and one individual interview, in which 70 people participated. A list with their names is presented in Annex 8.
20. The purpose of the focus groups was to learn the relevance of the Project and the CDL; the aspects of the implementation; the likelihood of sustainability of the actions and results; and the recommendations for future projects. The participants were the following:
 - a. Seven focus groups and one individual interview with professional teams from the NGOs implementing the AP. The participants were 33 NGO’s specialists;
 - b. Five focus groups with members of the CDL. The participants were 33 people, who represent: governmental organizations (GO) from the provinces; community organizations (CO); non-governmental organizations (NGO); workers’ unions, and businesses from the area;
 - c. A focus group with four adolescents who participated in one AP’s vocational training activities.
21. **Results of the workshop with stakeholders.** On November 26, 2009, there was a workshop with stakeholders on the Project’s implementation and the prevention and elimination of CL and in particular its worst forms, in which 55 people participated, representing 31 GOs, NGOs, COs, trade unions and employers. The purpose of the workshop was to present the preliminary impressions of the EFE and to learn the participants’ conclusions and recommendations about the Project’s relevance, its effectiveness and its impact, the sustainability of the results as well as recommendations for future actions in the Dominican Republic.
22. **Impact Study on the “Salas de Tareas”.** The impact study was aimed at evaluating deeper the direct impact that the “Salas de Tareas” generated, on the children and adolescents beneficiaries and on their families. The purpose of the Impact Study was to obtain more detailed information on the impacts that this service had on the prevention and elimination of CL and on the educational progress of the CAs. This study also provides an outlook of the before and after situation of the target population who received this service.

2.2 Assessment of project achievements

23. The general achievements of the Project are assessed by the evaluation criteria. The degree of the achievement has been assessed by taking the indicators relating to each component and wherever possible comparing the current level of the indicator in relation to its baseline. Where this cannot be done, qualitative assessments have been made by the EFE team of each criterion using a simple qualitative scale, usually judged as (for example) ‘very effective’ if targets were exceeded, ‘effective’ if targets were reached or ‘partially effective’ if targets were not reached. Judgements on the basis of available quantitative and qualitative evidence were made about impact on the basis of ‘satisfactory’ (or not) and for sustainability on the basis of ‘likely’ to be sustainable (or not).
24. The indicators are listed in Table 4. This also shows baseline values and how far these indicators were enhanced during the implementation of the project, and the progression of the indicator in percentage terms.

3. PROJECT'S DESIGN AND IMPLEMENTATION

25. This chapter presents a summarized description of the design and implementation of the Supporting Project to the TBP, phase II.

3.1 Design

26. The Project's design was created in 2006. The design process was widely participatory, using the Strategic Programme Impact Framework (SPIF) methodology, and with the participation of representatives of GOs and NGOs involved in actions against CL and its worst forms. The results of the SPIF workshops and the experience from previous phases were the basic contributions to the design.
27. **General information on the design.** The timeframe for the implementation of the Supporting Project to the TBP, phase II was 36 months, from January 1, 2007 to December 31st, 2009. The ILO-IPEC was the implementing agency, the Dominican Government, workers' unions and national employers, NGOs involved in the prevention and elimination of CL and its worst forms, and the CO in the Project's area were executing partners.
28. The funding comprised a contribution of US\$2.5 million from USDOL, as well as others from the Government, NGOs and COs, all of which were established during the implementation.
29. **Objectives, Strategy and Actions.** The Development Objective was "CONTRIBUTE TO THE ELIMINATION OF THE WORST FORMS OF CHILD LABOUR IN THE DOMINICAN REPUBLIC".
30. The Immediate Objectives were organized in two strategic components.
31. The objectives of the "Create an Enabling Environment" component were three:
- a. Immediate Objective 1. "At the end of the project, society at large and especially key sectors will have been sensitized on the subject of child labour." This objective corresponds to Purpose No. 1 of the NSP;
 - b. Immediate Objective 2. "At the end of the project, the relevant institutions will produce, update regularly, analyze and disseminate relevant information for the development of policies and programmes to eliminate the WFCL." This objective corresponds to Purpose No. 3 of the NSP;
 - c. Immediate Objective 3. "At the end of the project, key institutions (including local governments and communities) will have developed the capacity to assure compliance with the law and the coordinated implementation of policies and programmes against the WFCL." This objective corresponds to Purpose No. 2 of the NSP.
32. The objective of the Local interventions component (Immediate Objective 4) was "AT THE END OF THE PROJECT, 4,900 CA WILL HAVE BEEN PREVENTED OR WITHDRAWN FROM THE WFCL." This objective corresponds to Purposes No. 4, 5 and 6 of the NSP.
33. **Strategies.** The general strategy to achieve those immediate objectives considers consistent actions, coordinated at the local and national levels. This implies that the actions at the national level were having direct effect in activities at the local level and that the latter were having also direct effect in activities at the national level. For that reason, the Action Programmes (AP) at the local level had to be interrelated, exchange their experiences and enhance the project's achievements as a whole.
34. Other strategic elements based on experiences from previous projects and to be applied to the Supporting Project to the TBP, phase II are:

- a. Even though a particular form of CL predominates in a specific zone due to its geographic, economic, social or cultural characteristics; experience has shown that there are different forms of CL, even for each child or adolescent in a specific zone
 - b. The mobilization of the communities is important for their effective involvement and sustainability;
 - c. The strong presence of private and public institutions is the fundamental base for effectiveness and sustainability;
 - d. In order to guarantee the continuity of the focalized interventions, there have to be consistent with the government social policy programmes.
35. Taking into account these experiences, the sectoral intervention model was replaced by a special criterion that presents strategies of intervention, tackling different forms of CL in a holistical and simultaneous manner.
36. **Actions.** According to the strategy, the actions at the national level will be directed at improving the context in order to achieve greater effectiveness and efficiency in the elimination of CL and its worst forms. The main actions at the national level would be: (a) Influence on the relevant GOs and NGOs; (b) generating periodic information on CL and its worst forms in order to know its evolution at the national level; and (c) institutional strengthening to complete and apply the legislation on CL, as well as to implement policies and programmes.
37. As for the actions at the local level, those were aimed at rescuing working CAs or children at risk, and at validating and adjusting the effective and efficient action models to be applied on policies and programmes. The central element of these actions was to validate and adjust the “*Salas de Tareas*” model, which was successfully applied in previous projects to promote and facilitate mainstreaming CAs into formal education. Other models of action under validation and adjustment were the methodology of vocational training for adolescents (between 15 and 17 years old), and an innovative model to promote income generation for the families of affected CAs or children at risk.
38. **Components.** According to the Project’s objectives and strategy, activities were organized in two strategic components: (a) Create an Enabling Environment; and (b) Local Interventions. The foreseen results of these components will be the following⁹:
39. “Create an Enabling Environment” Component. Its activities will be at the national level to achieve three immediate objectives: (a) O.I.1, Sensitizing and social mobilization; (b) O.I.2, Information and monitoring; and (c) O.I.3, Strengthening the institutional capacity to answer problems. These activities will be based on similar ones carried out during the Project’s first phase, although with clear direction to create the conditions for its sustainability. For that reason the following has been foreseen:
- a. Achieve a wide consensus of opinion in Dominican society’s perception on the CL and its worst forms. Progress was made during phase I, by bringing the issue to the media, which made possible for the problem of CL to gain visibility. For phase II, it was foreseen to intensify the key sectors’ knowledge of CL and its worst forms by disseminating the studies that have been made in the country, the content of the laws that protect CAs, and the actions foreseen by the NSP and the CSEC;
 - b. Improve government capacity to identify and monitor working CAs, especially those involved in the WFCL. With sustainability in mind, it has been foreseen to work on the following: (i)

⁹ The activities corresponding to each immediate objective are summarized in Chapter 6 (Project’s Effectiveness).

the inclusion of indicators about CL in regular national measurements that would allow maintaining the existing information database updated; and (ii) the strengthening of the CL Monitoring System (SINAMOTI);

- c. Increase the GO's technical capacity so that they can replicate and expand models to fight CL and its worst forms. Under this premise, the project should provide technical assistance to the government to design and implement programmes for the protection of CAs at a larger scale. The GOs considered in the design were the NSC, the Ministries of Labour, Education, Public Health, Agriculture, CONANI and the Judicial System;
- d. Moreover, the national legislation already includes compliance with the international commitments assumed and the necessary tools for the fight against the WFCL, although regulations of the Children's Code (Law 136-03) and the revision of the anti Human Trafficking law are still pending. Then the Project focussed on generating and promoting a stream of positive opinions in the legislative sector to ensure compliance with existing laws, and implementation of pending regulations.

40. "Interventions at the Local Level" Component. Its activities will be to withdraw and prevent CAs from CL and its worst forms (O.I.4). However, the Project will not try to have a significant impact on working CA, but will keep in mind the lessons learned and the good practices that have been identified in order to demonstrate that there are efficient strategies and tools to achieve the withdrawal and prevention of CAs from CL. Also, it foresees that the APs will prepare the foundation so that GOs and NGOs can progressively take charge of concrete actions to eliminate CL and its worst forms. An activity of great importance will be the involvement of the City Councils, which should allocate 5% of their budget to programmes directed at children¹⁰.

41. The results of the APs, as identified in the SPIF workshops, will be: (a) Increase school attendance and retention in basic education in the project's zones of intervention; (b) Access to vocational training programmes for adolescents between the ages of 14 and 17 years; and (c) Alternatives to income generation for the families of working CAs. All these activities will take place while trying to activate the institutional system of protection, which includes programmes and services of the GOs and NGOs in each zone, so that they may assist the communities during the implementation and after the Project ends.

42. **Direct Beneficiaries.** The Project's direct beneficiaries will be 4,900 CAs (5-17 years old) from the area of the Local interventions component. The Project's purpose is to withdraw 2,700 CAs and to prevent 2,200 CAs from exploitation and hazardous work through educational and non-educational services provided directly by the Project (see Table 1). These services are grouped in three categories:

- a. Category 1 – Non-formal or Basic Education. Registration of CAs in the "*Salas de Tarea*". The programme includes transitional, levelling, or literacy classes, mainstreaming CAs into formal school. This category also includes supplying the materials;
- b. Category 2 – Vocational or Skills Training. Mainstreaming adolescents (14 – 17 years old) into vocational training courses to develop job skills;
- c. Category 3 – Referrals to the formal education system or vocational courses. The Project's support includes facilitating their mainstreaming and other services, such as nutrition, uniforms, books, school materials, stipends and other incentives to permit the CA's enrolment.

¹⁰ Code for the Protection of Children (Law 136-03)

Table 1. CA – The Project’s Direct Beneficiaries

Children and Adolescents	Service Category									Total Services		
	Category 1			Category 2			Category 3					
	♂	♀	Total	♂	♀	Total	♂	♀	Total	♂	♀	Total
Withdrawn	650	250	900	105	45	150	1,205	445	1,650	1,960	740	2,700
Prevented	0	0	0	0	0	0	970	1230	2,200	970	1230	2,200
Total	650	250	900	105	45	150	2,175	1675	3,850	2,930	1970	4,900

43. The Project should also benefit 300 families of the CAs through services that support income generation, consistent with activities to promote parents’ groups, community organizations, information and counselling on CL, training on job skills and on the eligibility criteria to receive micro-credit as well as health micro-services.
44. **Indirect Beneficiaries.** The Project will indirectly benefit many more CAs through the implementation of: (a) A prevention strategy against the WFCL through promotion by intermediary institutions and other organizations (schools, local development committees, community organizations, parents associations, GO and NGO); and (b) Improvements in educational and health services by influencing State institutions at the national level. Additionally, the families and community organizations in the Project’s area will receive services through actions at the community level.
45. **Direct Recipients of the Project’s Support.** The elimination of CL requires close cooperation among all stakeholders in this mission. It includes the application of laws, investigations, gathering and dissemination information, training, sensitizing, formal education and vocational training. For that reason, the Project’s direct recipients of some services will be: (a) government employees from State institutions, particularly those that are part of the NSC; (b) the mayors and other municipal employees, as well as the authorities of the provinces; (c) legislators, judges, employees of the Public Ministry, police and other officials from the judicial system; (d) representatives of workers’ unions and employers’ organizations; (e) community leaders and teachers; (f) representatives of NGOs; and (g) members of the press and other media (newspapers, radio, TV).
46. **Project’s Area.** Create an Enabling Environment component has a national coverage with actions concentrated in Santo Domingo, where the government central offices and the head offices of the media and communication outlets are located. On the other hand, the area of the Local Interventions component will be: (a) Southeast region (the provinces of Azua, San Juan de la Maguana and Barahona); (b) Province of Santiago; and (c) Santo Domingo.
47. **Organization for the Execution.** The Project’s Steering Committee would be the National Steering Committee for the Fight against CL (NSC), which is the entity responsible for the implementation of NSP 2006-2016 (NSP)
48. The management of the Supporting Project to the TBP, phase II, was entrusted to the ILO-IPEC in the Dominican Republic, which will be in charge of coordinating the actions, monitoring, and administering the Project’s resources. The coordinating personnel included a project manager (for six months), two programme officials, two administrative assistants and one driver.
49. All GOs and NGOs involved in the implementation of the NSP will be partners associated with the Project. Among those entities, the following stand out:
- Institutions that are part of the NSC. This committee is presided by the SET, which operates as the leader organization;
 - The Inter-Institutional Commission against Abuse and Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children and Adolescents, whose responsibility is to provide follow-ups to the National Plan

against Abuse and Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children and Adolescents (NAP/CSEC);

- c. The Local Steering Committees (provincial and municipal) in the country's provinces and/or municipalities where there is local representation of the SET;
- d. The task of the NGOs implementing the Action Programmes will be supervised through the review of progress reports and monitoring visits;
- e. Other multilateral agencies, such as UNICEF and IOM.

3.2 The Context of the Implementation

50. The context changed notably during the implementation. Four elements influenced the implementation, and they also conditioned future actions for the prevention and elimination of CL and its worst forms. Such elements were: (a) the global economic crisis; (b) the establishment and increased scope of the *Solidarity* Programme; (c) the establishment and updating of the System of Beneficiary –SIUBEN–; and (d) the launch of the “Road Map”.
51. **The global economic crisis.** The principal effects of the crisis were: (a) creation of favourable conditions for the proliferation of CL and its worst forms; and (b) a decline in fundraising which is impeding increasing the budget for the fight against CL and its worst forms. Fundraising related to the value-added tax, started to decline in mid 2008 and the original level has not been recovered yet; the greatest decline corresponded to the first quarter of 2009, which was of 15%.
52. This situation has not only impeded adequate allocation of public resources to the prevention and elimination of CL and its worst forms, but it also defines a future scenario with the propensity for the increase of CL, and limited government resources to combat it.
53. In this respect, the Sub secretary of Labour responsible for CL said that:

THE GLOBAL CRISIS IS A THREAT TO THE FIGHT AGAINST CL, BECAUSE IT SUITS CL AND BECAUSE IT HAS REDUCED GOVERNMENT RESOURCES TO COMBAT IT.

54. **Solidarity Programme.** “*Solidaridad*” is a programme of the Office for Social Policy, through which poor families receive cash in exchange for compliance with a series of co-responsibilities, such as completion of their children's education¹¹. In regards to Solidarity, the Deputy Secretary of Labour, responsible for CL said that:

THE BIG ALLY IN THE FIGHT AGAINST CL IS THE SOLIDARITY PROGRAMME, WHICH SOLVES FAMILY INCOMES, REWARDS SCHOOL ATTENDANCE AND PUNISHES CHILD LABOUR.

55. It was created in September 2005, through Decree No. 536-2005, to address the fight against poverty which at the time affected 1,600,000 people. It started to operate in 2006. In October of 2009 it covered 731,000 households, with a target of 800,000 households by December 2009. The new funding, granted by the Inter-American Development Bank (US \$300 million), would reach a target of 1,000,000 households by 2010.

¹¹ The “Incentivo a la asistencia escolar” (Incentive for school attendance) is RD\$150 for each child, per month, which is added to the transferences “Comer es primero” (Eating first) (RD\$700 per moth/per family), and Bonogas (RD\$ 230 per month/per family). Added to those is “Dominicanos con nombre y apellido” (Dominicans with name and surname), which promotes and facilitates registering births and obtaining documentation (Article 2 – Decree No. 536-05)

56. Certainly “Solidarity” is contributing and will contribute to reducing the effect of CL and its worst forms, not only because it temporarily solves the families’ lack of income, but also because in 2009, became part of the NSC, which guarantees focussing on CL as well as an effective coordination between Solidarity and other GOs.
57. It could not be learned how many families of working CAs assisted by the AP are receiving benefits from the Solidarity Programme. The opinion polls seem to indicate that they are few.
58. **System of Beneficiaries (SIUBEN).** This is a system of information and registry of beneficiaries of the Cabinet for Public Policy. Its objective is to identify and evaluate the socioeconomic condition of the families to classify, prioritize, and select them and determine their potential admittance into social programs and monetary subsidiaries. In other words, it arranges the households based on criteria of socioeconomic needs, while at the same time it provides information to the households that require help.
59. The SIUBEN’s database is updated through surveys at the national level. It is foreseen that the survey will take place at the beginning of 2010. It will include a module on CL and its worst forms. The incorporation of the module in the SIUBEN survey is a result of the Project, since negotiations to achieve it were completed in a timely manner.
60. **“Road Map” (*Hoja de Ruta*).** It is a strategic framework consented and approved by the Dominican Republic to achieve the elimination of the WFCL by 2015, and CL by 2020, so that the Dominican Republic becomes a country free of CL and its worst forms.
61. The Dominican Republic complied with and adhered to the “Road Map”, which defines new and ambitious goals. Besides, an agreement was signed with the State of Bahia, Brazil to exchange information, research, technical experience and knowledge on the prevention and elimination of CL and its worst forms.
62. Therefore, national efforts will have to be stepped up in order to comply with the objectives established in the *Road Map*.

3.3 Project’s Implementation

63. The Project began on September 30 of 2006 and it will end on December 31, 2009, a total of 39 months.
64. The ILO-IPEC was the executor through its Dominican Office. The principal partners in the implementation were: (i) SET, through the Undersecretary responsible for CLU and regional offices in the interior part of the country; (ii) NSC and CDL in the AP’s area; (iii) the Attorney General’s Office (iv) SEE, through its educational centres located in the AP’s area; (v) Justice Department, through the School of the Judicature; (vi) CONANI; (vii) SEA, through Regional Offices; (viii) SESPAS, through hospitals located in the AP’s area; (ix) INFOTEP, through its service centres; (x) NCTU, through its affiliates; (xi) COPARDOM and some affiliated businesses; (xii) UNICEF, through its Dominican Office; (xiii) NGOs that implemented the APs, and those that were part of the CDL; and (xiv) the COs that were involved in detecting working children and adolescents and children at risk and participated in the awareness raising and social mobilization activities, several of which were part of the LSCs.
65. It is also important to mention those Project’s partners that, although, were not associated with the implementation, they nonetheless contributed to the accomplishments of the results. For instance: (i) the Cabinet for the Coordination of Social Policies through the Solidarity Programme; (ii) some City Councils in the AP’s area, who coordinated with the CDLs the allocation of resources; and (iii) the media.

66. The magnitude and diversity of the Project's partners and collaborators indicate that in the DR there is a sensitized society on the problem of CL and its worst forms, and also that the Project's Coordination carried on excellent work promoting and sensitizing.

3.3.1 Creating an Enabling Environment Component.

67. The activities of this component were executed by the Project's Coordination and the project's partners. The Project's Coordination participated by appointing the staff and short-term consultants. Meanwhile, the Project's partners were mostly institutions from the Central Government and they participated with their own resources.
68. All the foreseen activities in the design were taken to a good level, achieving the results described below.
69. Using NSP and NAP/CSEC to implement policies and programmes on CL and its worst forms Regarding these activities, the SET and the Project kept adequate coordination through the Undersecretary responsible for CL and the CLU, exercising effective leadership of the LSCs through its delegates inside the country, thus contributing with the implementation of the overall intervention strategy.
70. It is important to add that the SET turned out to be a relevant partner in the fight against CL and its worst forms because it is clear about its role and its priorities, which, as expressed to the EFE, are to strengthen Labour Inspection and the Child Labour Unit.
71. The Project's publication and distribution of audiovisual material on CL and its worst forms was a relevant activity to the purpose of the NSP and the NAP/CSEC. Ten of those stand out: (i) Dominican society's perception of CL; (ii) Good practices; (iii) Programme for the prevention and elimination of the WFCL in the DR; (iv) Educational Manual for the community on the eradication of SEC of CA; (v) Training Manual for administrators of the judicial system; (vi) Practical Manual for the application of procedures relating to CL; (vii) Winning videos from the APEC contest; (viii) Audiovisual material about CL and its worst forms; (ix) The video, "El CDN con los niños" (*NSC with the children*); and (x) "Road Map."
72. The "Road Map" is a document that defines a strategy to comply with the commitments assumed by the Dominican Republic and by other countries in the region, within the framework of "Decent Work Continental Agenda (Agenda Hemisférica del Trabajo Decente)". Its central contents (i) Summarize the fundamentals to make the Dominican Republic a country free of the worst forms of child labour by 2015, and CL in general by 2020; and (ii) Provide the basis for a strategic programming and the connection between public policies and complementary interventions with direct and indirect impacts on the prevention and elimination of child labour and its worst forms, as well as on the protection of working adolescents. It was created together with the Government, employers' and workers' organizations, and other civil society organizations.
73. In addition, informative materials on CL and its worst forms, such as posters and leaflets, were designed and published. As regards to the sensitizing and mobilization campaign, it was significant that CAs withdrawn or prevented from CL and its worst forms participated in activities to speak about their experiences and knowledge. These activities were the celebrations of the International Day against Child Labour and various articles published by the press.
74. Improvement in public's perception of CL and its worst forms. The Project pressured the media, and they responded by increasing the publication of news and articles on these subjects.
75. Generating and using information about CL and its worst forms. These activities were a success as a whole, even though those results will only be seen next year. In this sense, the Project's efforts were to: (a) Include a CL module in the National Household Survey (ENHOGAR); (b) Contribute with the

implementation of the DevInfo Latin American Countries (LAC) SEC system in the DR; (c) Include a module on CL in the SIUBEN survey; and (d) Establish the National Child Labour Monitoring System (SINAMOTI). These activities were carried on in the following way:

- a. The incorporation of the CL module into EHNOGAR was postponed until 2009 since the National Office of Statistics did not have sufficient resources for its implementation. That is why the Project had to negotiate the required co-financing, which ascended to US\$160,000 donated by ILO-IPEC and UNICEF. It is worth adding that among the priorities of the SET, there is managing the budget to continue funding the application of the CL module in ENHOGAR;
- b. The National Council for Children and Adolescents sent their own specialist to be trained on the monitoring system DevInfo LAC SEC, which was being implemented at the time of the EFE;
- c. The Cabinet for Social Policy became actively involved in this activity and it will include a CL module in the 2010 survey to update SIUBEN's database.
- d. The implementation of SINAMOTI could not be completed because the system did not operate, in spite of the efforts made by SET and the Project. The main reasons were an incomplete design of the system, difficulties in the coordination and operation in the pilot zones, and insufficient resources¹². It is important to mention that SET fulfilled its operative responsibility for this activity, because it established the three foreseen pilot areas and coordinated the training of the labour inspectors and the agents in the SEA area.

76. Activities within the ambit of the Judicial System. Regarding this area, the Project was involved in improving the Penal and Labour Codes, and the anti Smuggling/Trafficking Law in addition to sensitizing and training judges, prosecutors and public defenders on the subject of CL, its worst forms and the protection of working adolescents. A key partner of the Project in this last activity was the National School of the Judicature, which collaborated on the preparation of the methodology and training tools for the judges, prosecutors and public defenders, and on the creation of a "Training Manual" and a "Practical Manual." The results of this activity will surely be seen in the future, since presently there are few reported cases of abuse and SEC that receive sentencing and few records of labour inspection from SET that ended up fining the infractors. The EFE found the following reasons for these deficiencies on the application of the law: (a) CL and its worst forms are not a priority of the judicial system because other crimes are more pressing; (b) lack of personnel in the courts; and (c) lack of interest and training of judges to impose sentence in cases of CL and its worst forms.

3.3.2 Local Interventions Component

77. The Project undertook the implementation of nine Action Programs (AP); involving eight NGOs that worked in child protection actions. The AP's principal characteristics and the identification of NGOs that implemented each program are described in Annex 3.
78. The AP's activities were the basically ones foreseen by the Project, plus the ones that each NGO added. They were part of their own intervention strategy already and contributed to improve their results, the impact and sustainability. The activities included:
- a. Sensitizing and training. Each AP sensitized and trained leaders from the COs as well as school principals and teachers to be training agents in their work areas. The results were very

¹² Evaluation of SINAMOTI, Supporting Proyecto to the TBP, phase II, June 2009.

satisfactory since the training agents identified and referred 5,442 working CAs and children at risk who were incorporated as beneficiaries;

- b. Educational Activities. 143 *Salas de Tarea* were established, most of them offering double shifts, which were attended by 5,442 CAs (38 CA on average per SdT). The results were also very satisfactory. It was possible to withdraw and prevent CL, incorporate/reincorporate CAs into school and improve their school performance, in addition to reducing above school-age¹³ and school dropouts' occurrences.
 - c. Job Training. Adolescents between 14 and 17 years old were trained. They received skills/vocational training in different subjects, featuring entrepreneurship, computer and handcraft training. At the time of the EFE, the insertion into the labour force of these adolescents was low, because of the short duration of the programme, and also because activities of support and follow-up to the insertion into the work force were not foreseen. The most effective NGO in this activity was "Muchachos and Muchachas con Don Bosco, whose programs included support for their insertion into the work force.
 - d. Income Generation. Income generation for the families of the CAs consisted in vocational and job training. The most frequent training areas were administration of colmados¹⁴, beauty parlour, and handcraft.
 - e. The APs implemented by FUNDASEP, Acción Callejera and World Vision, also included micro-credit activities to fund micro-businesses for those families; the resources for the micro-credit were provided by the NGOs and/or financial institutions affiliated with the NGOs.
79. The activities incorporated to the APs through the NGOs were diverse, such as acquisition of identity papers, recreational and sports activities, psychological and medical assistance to CAs victims of abuse and SEC, micro-credit, sensitizing City Councils, and preschooling.
80. Regarding to micro-credit, there were programs implemented by FUNDASEP¹⁵, Acción Callejera and World Vision -Barahona. The first was in association with ADEMI Bank, and it included the creation of a fund for micro-credits co-financed by both institutions, while training of the beneficiaries was provided by FUNDASEP. It is remarkable that the beneficiaries were micro-businessmen who already had a business running. "Acción Callejera" carried out a similar programme, in association with ADOPEM Bank. It provided training and micro-credits. World Vision Mundial-Barahona supported a textile micro-business in Batey 5, making school uniforms. Its client is World Vision itself, wearing the clothes in the SdT and in the Barahona market.

4. PROJECT'S RELEVANCE

81. The evaluation of the projects relevance considered three main reasons:
- a. It was designed and executed to facilitate the implementation of the National Strategic Plan to Eliminate WFCL, 2006-2016 (NSP), and the National Plan against Abuse and CSEC;
 - b. Its development objective was to solve the situation of negligence and inequality that affects a high percentage of CAs between the ages of 5 and 17 years;

¹³ Above school-age; age above the media that would correspond to a grade. This terminology is used by the educational sector in the Dominican Republic.

¹⁴ Grocery stores.

¹⁵ Foundation for the Development of Azua, San Juan la Maguana, and Elías Piña.

- c. It anticipated contributing to strengthening public and private institutions for the elimination of CL and its worst forms.
82. The Project's relevance is confirmed by many signs of the government political willingness to eliminate CL and its worst forms. But structural and temporal reasons limited its efficiency to reach the expected results.
- a. In 2001, there were 436,000 working children and adolescents in the Dominican Republic, equivalent to 18% of the 2.4 million CAs between 5-17 years old (NSCL-2000);
 - b. Approximately 9% of the CA between the ages of 5 and 17 years old spent many hours performing domestic chores in their own home in which an important gender gap was found (NSCL-2000)
 - c. The scope of basic education is high. However, close to 15% of boys and girls between the ages of 6 and 13 years old do not attend school and the dropout rate is very high (5.6% in elementary education and 9.4% in middle school);
 - d. Close to 50% of working CAs are unable to finish elementary education and the rest lags behind two to three grades. In addition, less than 20% of working CAs finish secondary education;
 - e. Studies by CEPAL indicate that during their adult lives, working CAs have salaries 20% lower than those who attended school for seven years;
 - f. About 15% of CAs do not have identity papers;
 - g. Poverty affects 62% of the population, and it concentrates in rural areas and in slum neighbourhoods in the cities. In addition, extreme poverty affects 33% of the population;
 - h. There is a strong social perception in Dominican society that considers that work is a good way to build character in CAs and is a way to avoid "idleness". It is based on the notion that children should learn a trade early on in its life. This perception is stronger in low-income and, low-education households¹⁶;
 - i. The WFCLs that have been identified through studies conducted in the DR with ILO-IPEC support, include hazardous work by nature and its conditions, commercial sexual exploitation, illicit activities, smuggling and trafficking of children and adolescents, and other forms of slavery;
 - j. National legislation to combat CL is complete, except for the lack of regulation of the Children's Code and revision of the anti Smuggling and Trafficking Law. However, the judicial system and law enforcement have not been trained to apply the present legislation;
 - k. A large number of the population does not report WFCL or CSEC for different reasons.
83. The Project's relevance is based on the appropriateness of its objectives and strategy:
- a. An analysis of its objectives assures that the project's purpose is to solve the problem of neglect of working CAs and children at risk of CL and its worst forms in a comprehensive way. It includes: (i) a national dimension as it pertains to social mobilization, information about CL, and institutional strengthening; and (ii) a local dimension through the mainstreaming or insertion of the CAs into the formal school system and vocational training,

¹⁶ Dominican society's perception of child labour, ILO-IPEC December 2006

the mobilization of the CO, the strengthening of NGOs, and the generation of income for the families of working CA and children at risk;

- b. The Project's general strategy includes coherent actions coordinated at the national and local levels, so that the actions at the national level are reflected at the local level, and that the local action programmes have an input on the national process. Among the good practices promoted by the Project it is worth mentioning, the "Salas de Tarea", which showed results of success in the insertion or mainstreaming into the formal education system of working CA and children at risk.

84. Therefore overall the Project is assessed as **very relevant** because its objectives are appropriate and significant for the worker CAs needs.

5. PROJECT'S EFFICIENCY

85. The assessment by the EFE is based on the analysis of the Project's direct costs, the cost of the Action Programs, and the efficiency indicators.

86. The total cost of the Project was US\$2.76 million, being direct costs of US\$2.11 million (see Table 2 for distribution of components) and the ILO-IPEC's supervision and support costs (central and regional offices), estimated at US\$0.48 millions.

Table 2 Project direct cost

COMPONENTE	Costo Directo Anual (US\$)			Costo Directo Total	
	2007	2008	2009		
Generación de un Ambiente Propicio	207 137	50 289	39 329	296 755	14%
Intervenciones a Nivel Local	172 185	274 968	382 884	830 037	39%
Unidad de Coordinación del Proyecto	384 000	300 450	300 450	984 900	47%
Costo Directo del Proyecto	763 322	625 707	722 663	2 111 692	100%
	36%	30%	34%	100%	

Source: ILO-IPEC Offices in the Dominican Republic valid until October 30, 2009

87. In real terms, the cost of the interventions at the Local level component was higher, US\$2.28 million (see Table 3). For that reason, the NGOs that implemented the AP contributed US\$1.45 million for it (64% of the total cost).

88. The NGO's co-funding was allocated to the implementation of activities not foreseen by the Project, but that are still part of its own strategies and methodologies. These activities included preschool, psychological assistance to the CAs as victims of CSEC, legal assistance to the CO, micro-credit for income-generating activities for the families of CA beneficiaries, among others. Also other items funded by the NGOs were the social security costs of the NGOs staff and some operational costs.

Table 3 Cost and Funding of the APs

Intervenciones a Nivel Local	Financiamiento (US\$)		Total
	Proyecto	ONG	
<u>Costo Directo de los PA</u>			
FUNDEBMUNI-San Cristóbal	59 693	28 892	88 585
Muchachos(as) con Don Bosco	57 469	700 781	758 250
Niños del Camino	66 279	30 073	96 352
Nucleo de Apoyo a la Mujer	74 431	7 145	81 576
Niños con una Esperanza	23 785	19 487	43 272
Acción Callejera	88 994	-	88 994
FUNDASEP	142 236	40 119	182 355
Visión Mundial Azua	109 588	12 513	122 101
. UTESUR Azua	14 975	-	14 975
Visión Mundial Barahona	127 470	612 279	739 749
<u>Subtotal Costo Directo de los PA</u>	<u>764 920</u>	<u>1 451 288</u>	<u>2 216 208</u>
<u>Costos de Apoyo del Proyecto</u>	<u>65 117</u>	<u>-</u>	<u>65 117</u>
Total	US\$ 830 037	1 451 288	2 281 325
	% 36%	64%	100%

Source: The ILO-IPEC Office in the Dominican Republic, with data from the NGOs

5.1 Efficiency Indicators

89. The EFE used efficiency indicators that are only indicative to establish comparisons with other similar projects, and for designing future projects, as they only refer to tangible results on direct beneficiaries. This means that the Project's intangible results were not considered, such as raising awareness and social mobilization on the subject of CL and its worst forms, the number of CAs that will benefit from the improvement of the services generated by the Project, nor the strengthening of organizations (public or private) recipient of the Project's services.
90. **Cost per beneficiary of the Project.** The cost was US\$ 339 per CA¹⁷ that received some type of service from the Project. This rate is reasonably low, especially if it is taken into account that the Project also contributed to the improvement of the local and national environment for the fight against CL and its worst forms, in addition to the variety of services it offered.
91. **Cost per beneficiary of the AP.** The cost was US\$419 per CA¹⁸ that received integral services, among which the following stand out: educational services, raising awareness among children, their families, and the community about childhood rights; and community leaders training.
92. **Components Financial disbursements** They were 74% for local interventions, and 26% for the creation of an enabling environment. This is well-balanced, considering the co-funding from the private sector to implement the APs, and the necessity to strengthen public institutions to fight CL and its worst forms.
93. The share of the Project's Coordination disbursement rate is higher (47%) for a project that was executed within the planned timeframe. Such rate is explained by the Project's relatively low direct cost, the need for intensive institutional advocacy ran by the coordination and technical staff, and to the heavy load of monitoring and administration of nine APs.

¹⁷ 6,226 CAs received services from Proyecto.

¹⁸ 5,442 CAs received services from the APs.

5.2 Assessment of Efficiency

94. Based on the indicators, the EFE judged the efficiency of the Project of Support to the TBP, phase II as **efficient**, because i) it carried out a good utilization of the resources and ii) the individual cost for taking care of the beneficiaries is comparable to other similar projects, but iii) the cost for the Project's Coordination is proportionally high relative to the strategic components.

6. PROJECT'S EFFECTIVENESS

95. The evaluation of the effectiveness was assessed by reviewing the level of achievement of the 18 output indicators that correspond to the project four immediate objectives.
96. The data sources were the Project reports and the Mid-term Evaluation Report. These sources were cross-checked by the EFE team in most of the cases.
97. The disaggregated analysis by immediate objective and by indicator is presented below. The degree to which indicators in terms of how much targets are shown in both absolute and relative terms in Table 4 (i.e. targets and achievements).

6.1 Immediate Objective 1

98. The objective was that "at the end of the project, society at large, and key sectors in particular, will have been sensitized on the issue of child labour."
99. The indicators of this objective were four in number: (i) Measurement of the level of perception of CL in the key sectors, (ii) Perception of CL in the population, (iii) number of institutions that are implementing activities against CL; and (iv) Coverage of CL in media communication. The indicators achievements are described below.
100. *Measurement of the level of perception of CL among key sectors:* The Project conducted two knowledge, attitude and perception (KAP) surveys about the WFCL; one in the communities of nine *bateyes* in the provinces of Barahona, Batoruco and Independencia; and another one at the public institutions that provide services in the province of Azua. It was fully achieved.
101. *Perception of CL in the population. The target was to have 2 studies of CL perception in key sectors.* The project contributed with the publication and the launch of the study "Perception of CL in Dominican society"¹⁹. Therefore the target was only half reached.
102. *Number of institutions that implement activities against CL.* The target was that 14 institutions implement activities against CL. As the project achievement was that 23 institutions, (8 GOs and 15 NGOs), conducted relevant activities against CL, the target was reached by one and a half times.
- a. Governmental Organizations:
- (i) *Ministry of Education.* Teachers from five regional offices in Santiago and San Cristobal participated in sensitizing events with the SCREAM methodology and assumed their commitment to support the APs by identifying working CAs and collaborating with the "Salas de Tarea" in the follow-ups to school attendance;
 - (ii) *The Child Labour Unit of the Ministry of Labour.* They maintained close and continuous relation with the Inspectors Department to detect CAs affected and children at risk of CL and its worst forms;

¹⁹ OIT-IPEC-CIEDHUMANO, September, 2006.

- (iii) *National Council for Children and Adolescents (CONANI)*. (i) Its president and other representatives took part in the activities for the launch of the action programmes being implemented; (ii) Directors from CONANI included the subject of CL in their speeches; (iii) CONANI's quarterly magazine includes articles on CL; and (iv) Launch of one postal stamp against SEC, jointly with the Dominican Postal Institute (INPOSDOM);
- (iv) *Public Ministry*. The Santiago and San Cristóbal delegations increased their concrete actions against the WFCL. It is worthwhile to point out that such actions included investigation of worst forms of child labour cases; inclusion of its staff to AP activities, participation in AP meetings to inform about the procedures to report cases detected; and integration into the local steering committees (CDL);
- (v) *Attorney General's Office*. The Smuggling/Traffic and CSEC Department continues to strengthen its actions against the WFCL;
- (vi) *Office of the First Lady*. Promoted a radio and TV sensitizing campaign, aimed at parents to keep CAs in school and out of hazardous work;
- (vii) *Cabinet for Public Policy*. The anti-poverty *Solidarity* programme was integrated into the NSC. It was established the "School attendance Incentive". It was included a CL module in the SIUBEN survey. An article on CL was also included in the institutional newsletter;
- (viii) *Banco Agrícola*. A clause in the loan agreements prohibits agricultural borrowers to use CL.

b. Non governmental Organizations:

- (ix) *12 organizations in Santiago*. As members of a coalition against CL, conducted a sensitizing activity that consisted of distribution of stickers for vehicles with the message: "A CONSCIOUS TOLL – EDUCATION: THE RIGHT ANSWER TO CHILD LABOUR";
- (x) *FUNDEBMUNI*. Celebrated June 12th, 2009 with several activities that involved CAs withdrawn or prevented from WFCL, in coordination with the Network for the Defence of the Rights of Children and Adolescents (REDNNA);
- (xi) *Universities APEC and UAPA*. Signed an agreement to join key actors confronting WFCL.

103. *Media Coverage of CL*. The target was coverage of CL issues in the media, without establishing a number of publications as a target. The Project contributed to the publication of 103 articles on CL by the press in 2008-2009 (see Annex 4). The frequency was notably higher in 2009 (64 articles), most likely because of the International Day against Child Labour celebrations. Therefore, the EFE considered that this component of the Immediate Objective 1 was achieved.

104. Assessment of Immediate Objective 1. With the review of the four indicators comprising Immediate Objective 1, the EFE judged that the Project was **effective** in achieving this objective.

6.2 Immediate Objective 2

105. The objective was "At the end of the project, the pertinent institutions produce, update regularly, analyze and disseminate information relevant to the development of policies and programs to eliminate the WFCL."

106. The indicators of this objective were three in number: (i) Coverage of the monitoring subsystems, (ii) Number of surveys that include CL in their analysis; (iii) Number of boys, girls and adolescents, referred to protection institutions that received expected services. The progress of the indicators is described below.
107. *Scope of the monitoring subsystems.* The target was that SINAMOTI operates in three regions. This indicator does not report any progress, since SINAMOTI did not start to operate. In spite of that, the SET and the Project carried on all the foreseen activities in three pilot areas. However, there were deficiencies in the design; difficulties in the inter-institutional coordination; and insufficient allocation of resources, which is why it did not become operational. Therefore in terms of the target indicators of this component, there was no achievement.
108. *Number of surveys that include CL in their analysis.* The target was that one survey included the analysis of CL. The Project's actions contributed to the carrying out of two surveys that included CL modules. Achievement was therefore double the target.
- a. The National Office of Statistics (ONE) included a CL module in their National Household Survey (ENHOGAR-2009). Such module consists of 45 questions to research the educational, labour, and economic status; the work risks, and housing conditions of the households surveyed. Fieldwork by ENHOGAR-2009 was being conducted during the EFE team and the results will be known in 2010.
 - b. *This achievement* by the Project is remarkable because it will be the first measurement of CL at the national level after the NSCL 2000, and it will make possible to know the progresses made in the last nine years;
 - c. The updating SIUBEN survey, which will be conducted at the beginning of 2010, will include a CL module, as per agreement between the *Solidarity* Programme and the Project;
 - d. The Project also contributed to the implementation of the DevInfo LAC SEC²⁰ system in CONANI by training specialists from that institution. This system is still on implementation.
109. *Number of CAs referred to protection institutions that received expected services.* The target was that 400 boys, girls and adolescents would be referred to protection institutions. The Project offered several services to 784 CAs, referring them to protection institutions. Such services were in the form of assistance to obtain birth certificates, health assistance, legal aid, psycho-pedagogical evaluation and nutrition. Although the majority of the beneficiaries were not registered in the monitoring system, identifying them was the result of AP activities (CO and NGO). The achievement was 196%
110. Reviewing all indicators in terms of achievement of targets for Immediate Objective 2, the EFE regards that project was **very effective**.

6.3 Immediate Objective 3

111. The objective was: "At the end of the project, key institutions (including local governments and communities) will have developed the capacity to assure compliance with the law as well as to implement coordinated policies and programs against the WFCL".
112. The indicators of this objective were seven: (i) Inclusion of CL issues in the training of key institutions; (ii) Approved legislative proposals; (iii) Number of judgements and denounces of the children exploitators (iv) Number of initiatives by the ILO constituents; (v) Number of institutions that use NAP as their framework for their policies (vi) Number of institutions that use the CSEC as a

²⁰ Monitoring system of the international commitments regarding commercial sexual exploitation of children and adolescents, developed by UNICEF, ILO-IPEC, IOM, Save the Children, and ECPAT International.

framework for their policies; and (vii) the number of community initiatives to fight against CL in the project areas. The achievement is described as follows:

113. *Inclusion of themes of CL in the training/education of key institutions.* Eight key institutions were the target. Reports on the Project's progress indicate that 25 institutions implemented activities against CL. Those institutions were: (i) SET; (ii) NSC; (iii) Attorney General's Office; (iv) SEE; (v) National School of the Judicature; (vi) CONANI; (vii) National School of the Public Ministry; (viii) SESPAS; (ix) INFOTEP; (x) Inter-institutional Commission against Abuse and SEC; (xi) *Solidaridad* Programme; (xii) Dominican Institute of Telecommunications; (xiii) The National Office of Statistics; (xiv) National Police; (xv) DINAF; and (xix) 8 NGO implementing the APs. The achievement of targets was over three times the rate proposed
114. *Approved Legislative Proposals.* Two approved legislative proposals were identified as the target. However, Congress of the Dominican Republic has not approved the modifications to the Penal Code, the Labour Code, and the anti Smuggling/Trafficking Law, all created with the Project's support. In spite of that, there is some legislative progresses, such as: (i) modification of articles 56 and 63 of the Dominican Republic Constitution, which deal with the protection of children and adolescents, and the right to an integral education; and (ii) approval of the Regulation to Law 53-07 against Technology Crime, which sanctions childhood pornography on the internet. But the targets were not reached.
115. *Number of accusations and prosecutions of exploiters of CA:* There were six formal accusations of SEC and procuring, in Santiago, initiated by the parents, other relatives, and the victims themselves. These accusations are the result of the raising awareness work conducted by the action programs with the participation of representatives of the public ministry. The target was 50 accusations. Using AP's funds, the NGO "Núcleo de Apoyo a la Mujer" hired a lawyer to provide legal counselling to the victims and their families. The achievement rate therefore was very low.
116. *Number of initiatives from ILO constituents.* Three initiatives from ILO constituents were the project target, and four initiatives pertaining to the government, workers and employers were reported. These four initiatives were:
 - a. SEE assigned an undersecretary to deal with issues of CL, and who would represent it in the NSC;
 - b. NCTU presented a project proposal on the inter-institutional coordination against CL and its worst forms, to disseminate the contents of NSP and NAP/CSEC, and to advise workers federations, defining responsibilities and carry on actions against CL and its worst forms. Agreement with the Project has not been finalized yet;
 - c. COPARDOM broadcasted information on CL in its weekly TV program and in its annual conference about work-related risks. Both activities carried on sensitization to foster employers' commitment, the legal framework, and sector's strategies;
 - d. ASONAHORES adopted the international code of ethics which prohibits the use of child labour in any activity at affiliated hotels;
117. *Number of institutions that use NAP as a framework for their policies.* Nine institutions were targeted to apply the NAP as a framework for their policies. The Progress Reports on the Project's progress list seven institutions that use NSP as a framework for their policies as well as to develop their annual operative plans. Those institutions are: (i) SET; (ii) CONANI; (iii) Attorney General's Office; (iv) National School of the Judicature; (v) School of the Public Ministry; (vi) NCTU; and (vii) SEE. Therefore this target was not fully met.

118. *Number of institutions that use NAP/CSEC as a framework for their policies.* The target was 9 institutions that will use the NAP/CSEC as a framework for their policies. The Project Progress Reports lists 14 institutions that use NAP/CSEC as a framework for their policies as well as to develop their annual operative plans. These institutions are: (i) CONANI; (ii) Attorney General's Office; (iii) School of the Judiciary; (iv) School of Public Ministry; (v) Inter-institutional Commission against Abuse and SEC; (vi) Dominican Institute of Telecommunications; (vii) DINAF; (viii) SECTUR; (ix) DINAF; (x) UNICEF; and (xi) four CDL that developed strategic plans to fight CL and its worst forms. The achievement rate is considerably higher than the planned targets.
119. *Number of community initiatives for the fight against CL in the Project's area.* There were 9 community initiatives reported, which corresponded to the CO located in the area of the nine APs that carried out sensitizing, mobilization and training activities. Therefore the target was exactly met.
120. Therefore reviewing all of the seven indicators of Immediate Objective 3, the EFE judges that the achievement was in excess of targets and therefore satisfactory.

6.4 Immediate Objective 4

121. The Objective was: "At the end of the project, 4,900 CAs will have been prevented or withdrawn from the worst forms of child labour."
122. The Progress of each indicator was as follows:
123. *Number of CAs prevented from CL and its worst forms. The target was 2000 children prevented from CL.* The AP's reports show the incorporation of 2,315 children and adolescents at risk.
124. *Number of CAs withdrawn from CL and its worst forms. The target was 2900 children withdrawn from CL.* The AP's reports show the incorporation of 3,127 CAs withdrawn from work.
125. *Enrolment Rates for targeted CAs.* Target was 92% of enrolment rates. The Impact Study reports that at the time the survey was conducted, 98.6% of the surveyed CAs were attending school.
126. *Dropout Rates for targeted CAs.* The target was 5%. The Impact Study does not report dropouts from school by CAs beneficiary of the Project, and therefore why this indicator progress has been very effective.
127. *Promotion Rate for targeted CAs.* The target was 90%. The Impact Study shows that 90.1 % of the CAs interviewed were promoted to the next grade. That is a relevant result since 40.7% of the targeted children and adolescents had been held back at some grade before attending the SdT.
128. This result is supported by the fact that the SdT improved school performance of the interviewed CAs. 93% of the CA reported improvement in their grades in all or almost all the school courses.
129. The above observations show that the target was generally met in all five indicators and so therefore achievement rate of the immediate objective 4 was satisfactory.

6.5 Overall Assessment of the Project Effectiveness

130. As the targets in all Immediate Objectives were met or bettered, the EFE regards the project as **effective**.

Table 4 Achievements of the Indicators of the Project's Immediate Objectives

Immediate Objectives / Indicators	GOAL		PRODUCT		ADVANCE
	value	unit	value	unit	Indicator
Immediate Objective 1					
Society in general and key sectors, in particular, will have been sensitized on CL					
Indicator 1.1. Measurement of the level of perception of CL among Key Sectors	2	surveys	2	surveys	100%
Indicator 1.2. Perception of CL in the Public Opinion	2	studies	1	study	50%
Indicator 1.3. N° of institutions that implement activities against CL	14	institutions	23	institutions	164%
Indicator 1.4. Media's coverage of CL	increase	scope	increase	scope	100%
Immediate Objective 2					
Institutions produce, update, analyze, and disseminate information relating to the WFCL					
Indicator 2.1. Scope of the monitoring sub-systems	3	regions	0	region	0%
Indicator 2.1. No. of surveys that include CL in their analyses	1	survey	2	survey	200%
Indicator 2.3. No. of cases referred to protection institutions that received services	400	NNA	784	NNA	196%
Immediate Objective 3					
Key institutions develop capacity to ensure application of the law against WFCL and implement policies/programmes					
Indicator 3.1. Inclusion of themes of CL in the training/education of key institutions	8	institutions	25	institutions	313%
Indicator 3.2. Approved legislative proposals	2	laws	0	law	0%
Indicator 3.3. N° of reports and prosecutions of exploiters of CA	50	denuncias	6	denuncias	12%
Indicator 3.4. N° of initiatives on the part of the ILO's constituents	3	initiatives	3	initiatives	100%
Indicator 3.5. N° institutions that use the National Plan against the WFCL as framework for their policies	9	institutions	7	institutions	78%
Indicator 3.6. N° institutions that use the National Plan against CSE as framework for their policies	7	institutions	14	institutions	200%
Indicator 3.7. N° community initiatives for the fight against CL in the Project's area	9	initiatives	9	initiatives	100%
Immediate Objective 4					
At the end of the project, 4,900 Cas will have been prevented or withdrawn from the WFCL					
Indicator 4.1. N° of Cas prevented from the WFCL	2200	CA	2315	CA	105%
Indicator 4.2. N° of CA withdrawn from the WFCL	2900	CA	3127	CA	108%
Indicator 4.3. Rate of schooling of the targeted CA	92	%	98.6	%	107%
Indicator 4.4. Desertion rate of targeted CA	5	%	0	%	100%
Indicator 4.5. Promotion rate of targeted CA	90	%	90.1	%	100%

7. IMPACT OF THE PROJECT

131. To assess the degree of achievement of impact, the EFE considered the following areas:

- a. Human Capital. Human capital refers to health, nutrition, education and knowledge/capacity of individuals. The following points were considered by the EFE team: (i) elimination and prevention of CL and its worst forms; (ii) return to work; (iii) improvement in school performance; (iv) responsibility of the PMTs for their children's education; and (v) awareness and capacity of community leaders, AP's specialists, public officials, judges and prosecutors to deal with issues of CL and its worst forms;
- b. Social capital and empowering. Social capital refers to the formal and informal groups, networks and connections, trustable relationships and support, collective representations, mechanisms of participation in decision making process and leadership. The EFE considered the progress in the creation and consolidation of the COs and NGOs, in the organization of interconnected networks, in the organization's and their networks demands to be heard; and into have a saying in the generation of policies, and for the CAs and their families to have access to social services.
- c. Institutions and services. The strengthening of GOs and NGOs, and generation of laws and regulations and the making process of public policies that regulate the protection and integral welfare of working CAs and children at risk.

132. The EFE team's sources of information were the Impact study of "Salas de Tarea" for quantitative and qualitative data; the EFE team's interviews and focus groups with qualitative opinions of stakeholders, as well as the conclusions and recommendations from the workshop with stakeholders (i.e. opinions).

7.1 Impact on Human Capital

133. The evaluation of the impact in Human Capital considered the following areas of impact: (i) Impact on the working and at risk CAs, (ii) Impact on the fathers, mother and tutors, and (iii) Impact on the community leaders, NGO staff and government officers.

134. **Impact on working CAs and children at risk.** Child labour is the main cause for low school performance, as confirmed by 89.3% of the teachers surveyed. At the same time, poor school performance causes frustration on CAs and PMT, and they find in working the satisfaction they cannot find at school.

135. The survey of working CAs and children at risk, PMT, school teachers in the AP area show that the "Salas de Tareas" achieved the following impacts:

- a. *Removal from CL*. At the moment the CAs register for the *Salas de Tareas*, 46% of the CAs selected were working. Presently, the percentage of beneficiaries that is no longer working or searching for a job has decreased to 16.2%; a reduction of 30 percentage points. This impressive reduction in the activity rate of the Project's beneficiaries is indicative of the contribution made by the APs to remove CAs from working activities that harm their physical, mental and educational development;
- b. The opinion polls in the focus groups confirm the importance of the "Salas de Tareas" to prevent and eliminate CL and its worst forms,

KIDS DO NOT HAVE A LOT OF TIME TO BE IN THE STREET
--

YES, THEY HAVE CONTRIBUTED A LOT; THEY ARE IN SCHOOL AND SPEND LESS TIME IN THE STREETS. THE IMPROVEMENT IN THEIR GRADES AND IN THEIR BEHAVIOUR IS NOTICEABLE.

THEY ARE LEARNING A LOT AND NOW THEY ARE MORE CONCERNED ABOUT GOING TO SCHOOL BECAUSE THEY KNOW THEY HAVE COMPLETED THEIR HOMEWORK.

- c. CL Prevention. The AP's area is characterized by a high incidence of CL, and working children and adolescents that leave the school. For that reason, the SdT's were a good tool to prevent CL, according to 97.8% of the teachers surveyed. The SdT was the reason to prevent missing school, according to 93.9% of CAs surveyed. Likewise, 98.9% of the PMTs surveyed confirmed that SdT is good to prevent children from working;
- d. School Dropouts. In the schools in the AP's area, dropout rate ranges between 2% and 6%, but 97.9% of the teachers surveyed affirmed that it went down due to the SdT;
- e. Reintegration into school. Another aspect included in the impact study was whether the SdT's contribute to stimulate children to return to school after having being excluded from the school system. Given the Project's limited scope²¹, it cannot be asserted based on statistics that the strategy in fact is the determining factor that connects CAs to school. However, the fact that the rate of attendance by the beneficiaries has increased by 2.5%, bringing it to 98.6%, can be considered as an indication that SdT encourages the reintegration of those excluded from school;
- f. School performance. Work harms children's school performance according to 90.5% of the teachers interviewed, and the SdT contributed significantly to the improvement of such performance. In this respect, 92.9% of the CA surveyed expressed that their grades improved and that they passed all or almost all of their courses. That was confirmed by 92.3% of the teachers, who asserted that children's production had improved. Similarly, 97.0% of the PMT affirmed that their children's school performance improved. During the EFE, SdT's many revised children's grade reports showed this improvement. There were also many valuable opinions registered, such as the following one from San Cristóbal

WITH THE SALAS DE TAREA, THERE WAS A JUMP IN QUALITY BECAUSE OF THE DECREASE IN REPEATING THE ACADEMIC YEAR AND THE REDUCTION OF ABOVE SCHOOL-AGE OCCURRENCE.

- g. Grade advancement. A significant proportion of the CAs surveyed (40.7%) had repeated a grade at some point before being registered in the SdT. Thanks to the support in the SdT, grade advancement improved, as 99.3% of the PMT surveyed affirmed. Likewise, 92.6% of the teachers surveyed confirmed that it had in fact improved.

136. Other unforeseen impacts on the CA beneficiaries of the APs that reached a high number of beneficiaries were acquisition of identity papers, development of handicraft abilities, cultural and sport development, psychological support/health care for cases of SEC, and preschool. These activities were added to the APs because of an initiative of the NGOs implementing the APs. The impact of these activities was described by those interviewed. Some of the comments follow:

PSYCHOLOGICAL EVALUATIONS OF THE CA VICTIMS OF SEC AND THE ATTENTION FROM PSYCHOPEDAGOGISTS ARE EXTREMELY IMPORTANT BECAUSE THE VICTIMS DO NOT WANT TO BE INTEGRATED INTO GROUPS AS A DENIAL AND DEFENSE MECHANISM

²¹ They have tended 4,000 children and adolescents in the last two years.

TO REGISTER KIDS IN PRESCHOOL, POPULATION DEMAND LARGELY SURPASSES THE NGO'S OFFER CAPABILITY

ALSO, IT WAS POSSIBLE TO OBTAIN IDENTITY DOCUMENTS FOR 23 CAS AND CURRENTLY PROCEDURES ARE BEING FOLLOWED FOR OTHER 7 PMTs

WE ORGANIZE "SUMMER CAMPS" THAT INCLUDE RECREATIONAL ACTIVITIES, SUCH AS TRIPS, VISITS TO THE ZOO, POOL, ACCESS TO EVENTS ORGANIZED BY DEPRIDAM, AND THE CHRISTMAS PARTY

137. **Impact on parents and guardians (PMT).** The role of the PMTs is central to follow-up on working CAs and children at risk. For that reason, the APs conducted multiple sensitizing and awareness-raising activities with the PMTs. The adoption of the concept of responsibility is undoubtedly an impact of great importance for the prevention and elimination of CL.
138. The Impact Study showed that the care of working CAs and children at risk is the responsibility of the mother, since 85% of those surveyed were women. That indicates not only that it is the mother who assumes the role to follow-up on their education, but also that the majority of the children's households has as the head of household either a single or an abandoned mother.
139. The survey of the PMT shows that the APs achieved the following impacts:
- Follow-ups to school performance.* 95.4% of those surveyed expressed that they check the grades, or that they attend school meetings or school-related community meetings; a quarter of those PMT stated they do both activities;
 - Age to enter TO the work force.* 74.5% of those interviewed opined that it should be between 18 and 20 years old;
 - Child labour as life training.* A great proportion of Dominican society considers that CL is good training. However, 83.3% of the PMT interviewed did not agree with that assertion. Besides, 95.8% of those surveyed opined that it is better if CAs do not work and complete their basic education because it is the best thing for their future;
 - Suitable Activities for CA's good development.* The great majority of the PMTs agreed with activities promoted by the APs because they improve the CA's development. In this respect, 33% of those surveyed opined that doing school homework, sports, or cultural activities should be encouraged; 49% opined that those three activities should be encouraged together.
140. The EFE focus groups also tossed in facts of the positive impact on the self-esteem of the mother's head of household as a result of promotion, vocational and skills training activities. One of the participants stated that:

VOCATIONAL TRAINING SERVED TO DISCOVER AND DEVELOP ABILITIES AND POTENTIAL. THERE WERE COURSES ON COMPUTER, PAINTING, AND "MACRAMÉ" HANDCRAFT. THERE ARE 12 MOTHERS WHO MAKE "MACRAMÉ" AND WE ARE PLANNING ON OPENING A HANDCRAFT SHOP.

141. **Impact on community leaders NGO's specialists, public officials, and prosecutors.** The interviews, focus groups with AP's specialist who are part of the LSCs, and the workshop for stakeholders, in which 140 people participated, confirmed the stakeholders' awareness and knowledge about CL's.

142. The views of these stakeholders are presented in Annex 7, 8, and 9. Transcripts of some opinions are presented below.

THERE IS A CONNECTION AMONG PMT, TEACHERS, SCHOOL PRINCIPALS, AND SCHOOL DISTRICTS. ALSO, THERE IS A TEAMWORK EFFORT AMONG SESPAS, FUNDEBMUNI AND SEE

THE APS PROVIDED THE OPPORTUNITY TO STRENGTHEN REDNNA, AND SOLID FOUNDATIONS TO CONTINUE WERE BUILT. IF THE APS HAD NOT EXISTED, THERE WOULD HAVE BEEN MORE WEAKNESSES TO MANAGE THE PROBLEM AND NO PROGRESS WOULD HAVE BEEN MADE.

THE TIMEFRAME OF THE APS SHOULD NOT BE LESS THAN 3 YEARS, IN ORDER TO COMPLETE THE PROCESSES AND ACHIEVE GREATER AND BETTER IMPACT.

GETTING ONE FAMILY TO CHANGE ITS PERCEPTION OF CL AND IMPROVE ITS INCOME IS NOT A 2-YEAR TASK.

THERE ARE MANY LOCAL METHODOLOGIES AND DETAILS OF THE SDT. ALL EXPERIENCES SHOULD BE SYSTEMATIZED AND A "TOOL BOX" SHOULD BE CREATED TO BE USED IN THE FUTURE.

OUR MAIN DIFFICULTY WAS THAT PREVENTION AND ELIMINATION OF CL IS A NEW SUBJECT FOR FUNDASEP AND FOR THE DIOCESES, THUS WE HAD TO LEARN ALONG THE WAY. THE ILO-IPEC'S TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE FACILITATED OUR LEARNING PROCESS.

143. The impact on human capital was assessed by the EFE team as **very satisfactory**, since they have achieved all the expected outputs, and some other positive impact that was not expected.

7.2 Impact on Social Capital

144. The impact consisted essentially on improving organizational, technical, and economic capacities of the COs and NGOs to combat CL and its worst forms. This impact is demonstrated through the accounts and opinions of those the EFE interviewed. Some of those testimonies are transcribed below.

THE STRENGTHENING OF THE DEFENSE NETWORK OF CAS AND SENSITIZING THE CITY COUNCIL SERVED TO OBTAIN 5% FINANCING.

ONE AP RESULT WAS THE NETWORK FOR INTEGRAL DEVELOPMENT IN CIENFUEGOS, A SPACE FOR SOCIAL ARTICULATION, WHICH IS STILL FUNCTIONING

THE COMMUNITIES DID NOT IDENTIFY THE CSEC AS A SOCIAL AND CHILDHOOD PROBLEM; THAT IS WHY, SINCE THE AWARENESS-RAISING ACTIVITIES, IDENTIFICATION AND FOLLOW-UPS TO THE CA VICTIMS BEGAN, AS WELL AS REPORTS AGAINST PROCURERS

A VERY RELEVANT ASPECT OF THE PROJECT IS THAT THANKS TO THE APS, THE PROBLEM OF CL HAS BEEN MADE VISIBLE, WHICH WAS CONCEALED BEFORE

THE APS MAKE US STRONGER AT THE TECHNICAL, FINANCIAL AND ADMINISTRATIVE PROCESSES. ALSO, THE WORKSHOP ON THE LAUNCH OF THE AP HELPED THE NGO BECOME VISIBLE.

THE SUGAR CONSORTIUM HAS DECIDED TO CONTINUE WITH THE SPECIAL EDUCATION UNIT AND PRESCHOOLS; IT WILL ASSUME THE SALARY OF THE FACILITATORS OF THE "SALAS DE TAREA" IN ALL 18 "BATEYES," FROM WHICH 38 CAS HAVE GRADUATED ALREADY.

145. The impact on social capital was assessed by the EFE team as **very satisfactory** because all the expected outputs were achieved, in addition to some other unexpected positive impacts.

7.3 Impact on Institutions and Services

146. The impact evaluation of the institutions and services took into account the development of institutional capacity to apply the law and to implement policies and programmes.
147. **Institutional capacities to apply the law.** The outcomes and effects regarding this area were achieved because judges, prosecutors and public defenders received training; training materials were produced; articles 56 and 63 of the Dominican Republic Constitution were modified, guaranteeing the rights of children and adolescents; Law 53-07 on high technology crime was regulated, and projects to modify the Penal Code, Labour Code and the anti-Trafficking/Smuggling Law are presently in Congress.
148. However, the judicial system continues to show insufficient effectiveness in processing reports and prosecuting offenders of CSEC. This shows that the impact has been minimal, even though the Project conducted all the foreseen activities.
149. **Institutional Capacities to implement policies and programmes.** The development of institutional capacities to implement policies and programmes for the fight against CL and its worst forms is clear.
150. The major results in this area are the establishment and development of the CDL in four provinces, the development of capacities of the NGOs executing the AP; the use of the NSP and the NAP/CSEC for the planning and carrying out of the ENHOGAR-2009, that provide updated information on policies and programmes; CONANI's progress to implement the DevInfo LAC CSEC system, the expansion of the scope of the *Solidarity* Programme, and its inclusion to the NSC.
151. However, these institutional capacities are not translating into action for the fight against CL and its worst forms as expected because insufficient allocation of public and private resources
152. The assessment of the impact in the institutions and services shows that this was limited and **unsatisfactory** because although some impact in the eradication and prevention of CL and its worst forms has happened, it was under the expected level and in fewer areas.

7.4 Qualification of the Impact

153. The impact of the Project was variable with the areas of human and social capital doing well but with very limited impact on institutions and services where showing impact may require a longer time horizon. Therefore the Project impact is only **partially satisfactory** because although it produced impact in the eradication and prevention of the worst forms of CL, it was not in the expected manner.

8. SUSTAINABILITY

154. Sustainability refers to the lasting of the results of the Project, after the resources and external funds have been exhausted. This forward looking assessment (rather than a retrospective one) is based on a detailed analysis of the four factors of sustainability considered: social, technical, institutional and economic.

8.1 Social Sustainability

155. Social sustainability refers to the support and acceptance by the society, to the commitment of the communities, and the social cohesion regarding objectives and results.
156. The EFE team assesses social sustainability as **likely** there have been capacities developed among the key social actors: the COs, PMTs of working CAs and children at risk, the workers' unions and employers' organizations.
157. The COs were trained on CL and CSEC, establishing social networks (i.e. San Cristóbal, San Juan la Maguana, y Santiago), and several of them were incorporated to the CDL. These organizational and managerial progresses allowed the COs to sensitize and raise awareness of working CAs and children and PMTs at risk, and to provide follow-up to the children who were identified and referred.
158. The PMTs were sensitized on the importance of education, keeping their children out of work until they have reached adult age, and to providing follow-ups to their children's educational progress and school attendance. This has been in the impact study.
159. The NCTU and workers' unions with representatives inside the country, such as the Teachers Association, the Sugarcane Cutters Union, the CNTD, got involved in the fight against CL and its worst forms. They also collaborate in keeping work places under surveillance through social mobilization (i.e. rallies and other events), and by participating in the CDL.
160. Similarly, COPARDOM, ASONAHORES, agriculture organizations in Azua, and several companies inside the country, such as the sugar refineries in Barahona and San Cristóbal, as well as others from the AP area, got involved in the fight by prohibiting CL, having their foremen and drivers watching, and by co-funding AP and the NGO's activities.
161. All of this indicates that the future support to improve social sustainability should be directed at: (a) strengthening social networks to reach beyond the area in which they currently operate; (b) promoting the legalization of the COs that do not have access to the CDL; and (c) extend awareness-raising activities to new workers' unions and employers' organizations, to get them involved in the fight against CL and its worst forms.

8.2 Technical Sustainability

162. Technical sustainability refers to the availability of appropriate technical solutions, qualified human resources, technical training for new and updated staff and technical assistance.
163. The EFE ranks the technical sustainability as **likely** since the most important positive factors are present. Such factors are an important understanding of the fight against CL and its worst forms in the GOs and NGOs, and amongst them that there are now technical capacities at the institutional and individual level.
164. The relevant technical achievements made by the GOs are the systematic use of NSP and NAP/CSEC in the implementation of policies and programmes; strengthening judicial systems by sensitizing/training judges, prosecutors, and public defenders, conducting the ENHOGAR-2009

survey, updating SIUBEN by adding a CL module; and implementing DevInfo LAC ESC at CONANI.

165. The relevant technical achievements made by the NGOs were their learning while implementing the APs, especially about the importance of combining complementary activities. Other learnings refer to the timeframe of the APs, and the technical characteristics of each activity.
166. It is pertinent to add that these experiences should be systematized and added in a “tool box” so that they can be shared to expand the number of NGOs involved in the fight against CL and its worst forms.

8.3 Institutional Sustainability

167. Institutional Sustainability refers to the support and institutional coordination to the existence and application of public policies, the commitment of the government and the private sector to collaborate amongst them.
168. The Project’s results were considered to be **potentially sustainable** from an institutional standpoint, because the strategies and some of the Project’s activities were adopted and became regular practices for the stakeholders at the local and national levels. However, they will need more support to guarantee the sustainability.
169. Among such activities, the following stand out: (a) adoption of NSP and NAP/CSEC by the GOs to formulate public policies and implement programmes; (b) incorporation to the national strategy of the Road map/Hoja de Ruta; (c) formulation of plans to combat CL by the LSCs, which are the foundation to organize and coordinate the actions and maximize the impact and efficiency; (d) strengthening of NGO’s implementation of the APs and their decision to continue with those activities even without the Project’s support; and (e) the creation of institutional networks at the local level, integrated by the NGOs and OCs.
170. A pending institutional issue is the articulation of NGOs focused on children and adolescents into a network of national outreach to effectively influence governments to increase state funding for the fight against CL and its worst forms. The network’s institutional platform could be “The Coalition of NGOs for Children”
171. For that reason, and considering that the private sector is a relevant actor in the fight against CL and its worst forms, future actions from the Dominican Government and ILO-IPEC should consider strengthening local networks and increase national outreach so that they can expand their territorial scope and increase the cooperation from the public and private sectors.

8.4 Economic Sustainability

172. Economic sustainability refers to the financial allocation of resources and its sustainability, even through periods of economic crisis.
173. The EFE team considers that the Project’s results are **potentially sustainable** from an economic standpoint because a share of the cost to prevent and eliminate CL is included in the budgets of GOs and NGOs. However, it will need more support to guarantee its sustainability.
174. This share seems insufficient to reach the goals of the national plans and the Road map/Hoja de Ruta within the projected timeframe. Therefore, new efforts to achieve greater allocation of public resources will have to be made, in addition to increase awareness in the co-fund NGO’s actions.

175. Not all of those involved from the private sector are confident that there will be a greater allocation of public funds. The EFE collected several comments from those interviewed, and some, like the following one, were extremely pessimistic:

THE FIGHT AGAINST CL AND THE WFCL IS SUSTAINABLE THANKS TO PRIVATE FUNDING AND NOT TO THE GOVERNMENT, BECAUSE WORKING CA DO NOT VOTE

176. However, the private sector is not organized, nor has it defined a strategy to have access to public resources like those available at SEE and CONANI to co-fund NGO's projects.
177. Another important element of economic sustainability is the income-generating component for families of working CAs and children at risk. The strategy and activities of several NGOs implementing the AP (FUNDASEP, Visión Mundial and Acción Callejera) stand out; particularly micro-business and business finance training, in collaboration with micro-credit specialised financial institutions.
178. It is pertinent to comment that generating income is ever more viable and effective thanks to the support from *Solidaridad* Programme to poor families with school-age children.

8.5 Assessment of Sustainability

179. The EFE team judges the results of the Project as **potentially sustainable**, because there are some positive factors, but still needs more support to guarantee the sustainability of its results.

9. LESSONS LEARNED

180. The Project of Support to the TBP, phase II, generated several lessons that can be replicated by other programs in the Dominican Republic as well as in other Latin American and Caribbean countries. This report presents the most significant ones that could be amply replicated.

9.1 Relevance, Effectiveness and Impact of the “Salas de Tareas” (SdT)

181. The “*Salas de Tareas*” proved to be relevant, effective and efficient. They had a satisfactory impact on the prevention and elimination of CL and its worst forms, as the EFE Impact Study shows.
182. Their implementation has been carried out in the Dominican Republic since the first interventions of the ILO-IPEC. Very satisfactory results were obtained.
183. The methodology has been developed by several NGOs, which explains why they are known by different names. Each name entails a strategy and particular methods of implementation with different educational basis.
184. Beyond the methodological differences, the common elements to all the methodologies are the daily attendance to the half journey to do school homework, support of a hired facilitator, provision of school material, sport and recreational activities, daily tea, coordination with the school teachers and the after school class to give follow up to the educational progress. All these elements were systematized by the project in the good practice publications to prevent and eradicate CL.
185. All the methodologies are documented and available. They all have shown positive results expressed in the increase of the school attendance rate and in reducing the number of held-back and above-school age students.
186. These results are well-known in the Dominican private sector and in the international cooperation. Both are providing funds for their implementation.

9.2 Comprehensiveness of the Action Plans

187. The impact and sustainability of the results of the Project of Support to the TBP, Phase II are attributed to the fact that the APs included different activities, closely inter-related, which cannot be separated without affecting the results.
188. Not all of these activities were included in the agreements between the Project and the NGOs. Several of them were already developed by NGO local areas.
189. For that reason, the activities of each NGO were added to activities defined by the Project that included educational services, awareness-raising, income generation, and job training for adolescents. The following activities stand out: vocational training, micro-business management, micro-credit, recreational activities, preschool, psychological support, and health care;, among others.
190. A central aspect of the action programmes is their duration because the expected changes required time to be developed. In this respect, the NGO's specialists expressed that the APs should last at least 3 years in order to achieve a satisfactory impact and good probabilities of sustainability.
191. One AP activity with very little relevance was the job training for adolescents and this was perhaps due to the beneficiaries' difficulty to access the programs at INFOTEP. In this context, it is worth noting the strategy of the NGO "Muchachos y Muchahas con Don Bosco", which in addition to training, includes job counselling and legal assistance. This NGO is also a Centre of Services for INFOTEP.

9.3 Building the Institutionalization of the Fight against CL

192. Within the Project, the institutionalization of the fight against CL and its worst forms is being developed in the local level, and it is extending toward the national level. This institutional development process has not happened in reverse.
193. Logically, this process was not spontaneous since there was a plan, a strategy, and tools. The strategy considered the organization and strengthening of the LSCs as well as the interaction between local and national actions. The tools were the APs, whose activities involved public and private entities brought together in the LSCs.
194. Building the institutionalization had initial communication mechanisms between the local and the national levels, promoted by the SET and the Project Coordination. These mechanisms do not happen in other government institutions or in the private sector. Therefore future actions should support this.
195. It is pertinent to add that the LSCs were key institutions for the Project's implementation, because it incorporated the majority of stakeholders, and maintained a close and effective coordination and collaboration with the APs. They are headed by the SET's delegate and are composed of representatives from the CO and local NGOs, CONANI, the Attorney's General Office, the SEE and SESPAS regional offices. The LSCs from Santiago, San Juan de la Maguana and Barahona incorporated other key actors, such as public officials from City Council and from SEDEFIR, police officers, and representatives of agriculture associations, leading businesses in the area, workers unions, and universities.
196. Other activities of the LSCs that stand out are: (a) to create local plans for the fight against CL and its worst provincial forms, which has not been possible to translate into an annual work programme because there was no budget for its execution; (b) to influence the City Council authorities, who in some cases were able to obtain resources for the AP; (c) to increase work inspections; and (d) to

raise awareness of the leading corporations and employers' organizations from the area, which were able to prevent CAs from working, and contributed financial resources to the APs.

197. This means that national plans for the fight against CL and its worst forms should be enhanced, including a territorial prioritization to establish new LSCs, and a progress pace in relation to the undertaken goals.

10. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

10.1 General Evaluation of the Project

198. The assessment of the general performance of the Project is based on the five evaluation criteria:

- a. Relevance. Very Relevant;
- b. Efficiency. Efficient;
- c. Effectiveness. Effective;
- d. Impact. Satisfactory in some areas, unsatisfactory in others;
- e. Sustainability. Potentially Sustainable.

199. Taking into account all of the above, and the variations between the fulfilment of targets as shown by the many indicators, the EFE team ranked the Project overall performance as **satisfactory**.

10.2 Recommendations

200. Recommendations refer to the following topics: (a) “*Salas de Tarea*”; (b) Balance between actions at the national and local levels; (c) Roles of stakeholders; (d) Progress pace against CL and its worst forms; and (e) Institutional strengthening.

10.2.1 The “Salas de Tareas”

201. The “*Salas de tareas*” are a fundamental component in the prevention and elimination of CL and its worst forms, because they improve the children’s school performance with activities that motivate them and keep them busy, preventing them from going to work.
202. A remarkable aspect of the SdT is that they are able to overcome the deficiencies of the Dominican school system, which is of poor quality in absolute terms, as well as in relation to other countries from the region. Also, the authorities from SEE reported to the EFE that the low quality of education will not be solved in the short term given the complexity and the dimension of the education system.
203. That is why the EFE team recommends that the “Salas de Tareas” be part of all interventions to prevent and eliminate CL and its worst forms. This recommendation is not only directed to the international cooperation and to donors, but also to the Government of the Dominican Republic.

10.2.2 Balance between Actions at the Local and National Levels.

204. The Project’s results show that there were more results at the local level than at the national level. Therefore, the allocation of the Project’s resources was well balanced since local interventions had 74% of the total resources, and the creation of an enabling environment the remaining 26%.

205. A review of the results shows that at the local level: (i) the CDL, NGO, and CO were either established or strengthened; (ii) More working CA and children at risk than the ones foreseen were taken care; (iii) it was possible to channel the resources from the City Council to carry out the APs; (iv) CDL delegates are pressuring national institutions by making structured and consistent demands, such as local plans for facilities; (v) the social mobilization was most effective when it was organized locally, even when it was coordinated at the national level; and (vi) as a whole, the performance of those involved has been very satisfactory.
206. The results at the national level were also relevant, but their impact will be perceived in a longer term; such as the sensitizing and training of the judicial system, which will have an impact when the justice system grants priority to the fight against CL and its worst forms. On the other hand, the use of NSP and NAP/CSEC by the GOs will have an impact when there will be funding to transform the policies in actions. An exception to this is the inclusion of a CL module in the ENHOGAR 2009 survey, which will generate information extremely relevant for the planning of future actions.
207. It is recommended that the balance in the allocation of resources for future interventions should be firmly biased toward the local interventions. That does not mean that the actions at the national level should be minimized, but instead, scale should consider the impact for the short and long term.

10.2.3 Complementarity of the government and the private sector

208. The achievements of the Project rely on the collaboration and complementarity of the Government and different actors from the private sector, which include NGOs, COs, employers association and workers unions.
209. The implementation and funding of the results of local interventions, specifically those of the APs, show that in the fight against CL and its worst forms, a significant share corresponds to the private sector, and that it is capable of assuming it, since it has the necessary technical and managerial capacities.
210. That has to be appropriately valued by the government who should also foster the private sector's full participation. In this respect, it is recommended that the Government of the Dominican Republic should increase its funding to the NGOs involved in the fight against CL and its worst forms. It should facilitate access to those funds and select, based on objective criteria, the NGOs that will become its principal allies. For that, public policies along with their instruments, should be revised and adjusted, in order to give the private sector the deserved relevance.
211. The NGOs implementing the APs showed relevant strengths since they have qualified professionals with the experience to carry out the APs as well as to improve the methodologies. In addition, they have resources from the private sector and enjoy international cooperation. These strengths make them central actors in the fight against CL and its worst forms.
212. One weakness of the NGO sector is that it is not a well-organized sector and a large proportion of these entities do not belong to networks or associations. There are several local networks such as REDNNA in San Cristóbal, which groups 16 organisations, and the Coalition of NGOs of Santiago, which groups 12 of them. In the national level, the Coalition of NGOs for Children groups 31 organizations and includes international entities that have at their disposal significant resources (World Vision, Plan International and Save the Children) as well as national NGOs with limited resources. The weaknesses of the Coalition are that it has no legal representation or professional management; and it lacks a database of all the NGOs dedicated to children and adolescents. Until now, the Coalition has focused on the coordination of its partners, but it is developing a plan for growth and strengthening of the capacity of the associated entities.
213. The COs from the AP areas also had a central role identifying and referring working CAs and children at risk as well as sensitizing and raising awareness among the families. Besides, they co-

financed the APs by finding spaces for the SdT as well as with other contributions necessary for their operation. It is no novelty that the COs are the social foundation of the fight against CL and its worst forms, and with that in mind, their incorporation into the LSCs should be promoted and facilitated. This is not always possible since neighbourhood associations, in spite of their relevant role, are not legally authorized to be part of the LSCs. Therefore, it is recommended that the ILO/IPEC and the NGOs involved in the prevention and eradication of CL promote the legitimization of the COs and their incorporation into the LSCs.

214. National federations of employers collaborated with the dissemination of themes related to CL, but they did not have a proactive attitude, with the exception of the ASANAHORES. The EFE team, instead, learned of local businesses with the proactive participation in the APs in Santiago, San Cristóbal, and Barahona, as described above. That would indicate that the sensitizing work carried out by the APs had good results when it focused on that segment of the private sector. It is then recommended that ILO/IPEC, and the NGOs involved in the prevention and eradication of CL, to develop awareness raising activities in the private sector settled in the Action Programmes areas.
215. Finally, trade unions only do follow-ups to the Project through their participation in the NSC. It was not possible to implement a project proposed by NCTU. In contrast, several workers unions from inside the country were actively involved and participated in the CDL and in the AP's activities. Hence the EFE team recommends that greater participation in the CDL of the unions located in the interior should be promoted. The EFE team further recommends that the national trade unions promote more active participation in the LSCs of the unions based in the provinces.
216. Government institutions fulfilled the role within the realms of their possibilities, since they did not always organize themselves effectively nor did they have sufficient budget. In spite of that, the representatives of those institutions interviewed by the EFE confirmed that there is institutional commitment as well as commitment from the public officials. The EFE team recommends that the Government of the Dominican Republic and ILO/IPEC promote a bigger involvement of the national offices of the SEE and the SESPAS in future interventions.
217. A weakness of the public sector is that there was no effective coordination between the central offices and those in the interior of the country, with the exception of SET. In the case of the SEE, schools located in the AP areas connected very effectively with the Project, collaborating with the detection of working CAs, coordinating educational aspects with facilitators from SdT, and turn over spaces for the operation of some SdTs. In contrast, there was no active collaboration from the central offices; the irregular participation in the LSCs by the educational authorities from the interior is to be blamed for that. Something similar occurred with SESPAS, where there was no coordination with the Project at the central level. However, several public hospitals in the AP area granted priority to CA victims of SEC referred by the NGOs executing the AP.
218. A pending issue for the government is to improve its performance on its application of labour laws and legislation for the protection of children and adolescents, as well as to guarantee effective application of justice.
219. It cannot be omitted that ILO-IPEC and other multilateral and bilateral agencies for international cooperation, fulfilled a central role in connecting the efforts of the State and the private sectors, and in addition to their financial support, contributed to their technical and methodological abilities.
220. All of this indicates that future actions for the fight against CL and its worst forms should consider a strategy to intensify the collaboration and complementarity between the government and the private sector. This strategy would be based on:
 - a. Increasing government funds to the NGOs involved in the protection of children and adolescents;

- b. Decentralizing government actions aimed at strengthening the role of the LSCs, which would be the principal setting for the public and private sectors to meet, coordinate, and negotiate. At the moment, the NSC is that setting. However, it is difficult to perceive the “real world” at that level with the precision and strength with which the CDL can perceive it given that they confront the drama and the injustices that working CA and their families suffer on a daily basis. That is why strengthening LSCs and creating efficient channels of communication with the NSC are the elements that would make this strategy viable.

10.2.4 Pace of the Progress against CL and its Worst Forms.

- 221. The Project evaluation produced encouraging signs about the economic sustainability of the fight against CL and its worst forms. This is due to the *Solidarity* Programme and the funding to the involved NGOs (the government, international cooperation and corporations).
- 222. However, even though there are no updated statistics, it seems that if the pace of the progress on prevention and elimination will not be sufficient to fulfil the goals of the “*Road Map*.”
- 223. For that reason, and based on the ENHOGAR 2009 survey results, it will be required to define public policies to accelerate the fight against CL and its worst forms. Such policies will have to aim at: (a) prioritizing the families with working CA beneficiaries of the *Solidarity* Programme; and (b) increasing government’s funding of NGOs that implement action programmes in prioritized areas.
- 224. However, in spite of the valuable contribution that those resources represent, it is unreasonable to assume that the lack of income of the families of working CAs, principal cause for CL and its worst forms will be solved with programme like this. Therefore, it is recommended that promoting the income generation through training and micro-credit must continue, following models similar to those applied by the Project.

10.2.5 Institutional Strengthening

- 225. The Project supported strengthening the GOs, NGOs and COs involved in its implementation, which brought about better performance and satisfactory results. However, it did not promote strengthening NGO networks or the legalization of COs with outstanding performance in the APs.
- 226. In light of the effectiveness that the private sector has demonstrated in the fight against CL and its worst forms, it is recommended that future interventions should consider strengthening NGO networks and the legalization of the CO.
- 227. In both cases, it will be required to develop institutional diagnostics and strategic plans, and based on them, it will be possible to determine which actions should be carried out.

Annexes to the Principal Report

Index

- 1. LOGICAL FRAMEWORK OF THE PROJECT OF SUPPORT TO THE TBP, PHASE II**
- 2. INSTITUTIONS INVOLVED IN THE PROJECT'S IMPLEMENTATION**
- 3. CHARACTERISTICS OF THE ACTION PROGRAMMES**
- 4. PUBLICATIONS ON CL AND ITS WORST FORMS IN NEWSPAPERS AND MAGAZINES**
- 5. METHODOLOGY OF THE EXPANDED FINAL EVALUATION**

- 6. INTERVIEWS WITH THE EXPANDED FINAL EVALUATION TEAM**
- 7. FOCUS GROUPS ON THE PROJECT'S LOCAL INTERVENTIONS**
- 8. WORKSHOP FOR STAKEHOLDERS – RESULTS OF THE WORKING GROUPS**
- 9. LEGISLATIVE MODIFICATIONS SUPPORTED BY THE PROJECT**
- 10. PRINCIPAL FINDINGS OF THE IMPACT STUDY**

11. TERMS OF REFERENCE OF THE EXPANDED FINAL EVALUATION

Annex 1: Logical Framework of the Project of Support to the TBP, Phase II

IMMEDIATE OBJECTIVES, RESULTS AND ACTIVITIES

IMMEDIATE OBJECTIVES	RESULTS	ACTIVITIES
O.1. At the end of the project, society at large and especially key sectors will have been sensitized about child labour	R.1.1. Strategies of information, education and communication (IEC) directed at key sectors (professional Unions, NGOs that work with children and for the defence of HR and CO) were designed and campaigns were implemented	<p>A.1.1.1. Disseminate the content of the National Plan of Action and the Plan of Action to eliminate CSE among national institutions and international donors.</p> <p>A.1.1.2. Disseminate available information about WFCL, good practices and lessons learned including the perspective on gender.</p> <p>A.1.1.3. Design educational, of support and sensitizing materials (posters, TRIPTICOS, etc.) about the WFCL, including lessons learned and good practices systematized in collaboration with GO and other institutions.</p> <p>A.1.1.4. Conducting Forums, meetings and seminars with key actors to spread the consequences of CL and the strategies for the elimination of its WF including a gender perspective.</p>
	R.1.2. Key actors were sensitized, strengthened and mobilized against the WFCL	<p>A.1.2.1. Provide actors that ought to be involved (professional trade unions, NGO working with children and defending HR and OCB in particular) with the tools of knowledge and the necessary techniques to combat the WFCL.</p> <p>A.1.2.2. Launch specific campaigns to sensitize those sectors aforementioned.</p> <p>A.1.2.3. Obtain the support of leaders at the local and national levels, personalities and famous people committed to the elimination of WFCL and their participation in FOROS, CHARLAS, campaigns, etc. A.1.2.4. Promote the participation of boys, girls and adolescents withdrawn or prevented from CL in actions to spread their experiences and knowledge.</p> <p>A.1.2.5. Promote the participation of NGOs implementing the APs phase I in spaces where they bring their experiences.</p>
	R.1.3. Members of the community with the capacity to defend the rights of CA from a gender and HR perspective	<p>A.1.3.1. Involve relevant actors in all areas of the discussion on how to make effective the policies and actions that emerge from the adjustments in terms of legislation and penalization of crimes, particularly about CSE and TT.</p> <p>A.1.3.2. Strengthen the CAL to collaborate on the protection and restitution of the rights of CA and to participate in social examination processes.</p> <p>A.1.3.3. Capacitate community leaders about WFCL and community mobilization.</p>
O.2. At the end of the project, pertinent institutions produce, update regularly, analyze and disseminate information relevant to the development of policies and programmes to eliminate the WFCL	R.2.1 Indicators of child labour included and analyzed in selected national surveys	<p>A.2.1.1. Negotiate with ONE for the inclusion of child labour indicators in ENHOGAR.</p> <p>A.2.1.2. Provide technical assistance to professionals of different institutions on the definition of indicators as well as which questions to include.</p> <p>A.2.1.3. Promote research on the subjects of CL, SEC and TT among university students of similar careers and their professors in order to encourage writing thesis and documents that may expand the information available.</p>
	R.2.2. Child Labour Monitoring System (SINAMOTI) transferred to relevant and operating national institutions.	<p>A.2.2.1. Strengthen SINAMOTI in coordination with the Child Labour Unit (CLU), the Inspection Division, the Departments of Statistics and of IT of the SET</p> <p>A.2.2.2. Sensitize and raise awareness on the necessity to collect information, its uses and benefits.</p> <p>A.2.2.3. Validate the existing information systems, including information flows.</p> <p>A.2.2.4. Provide assistance and technical support for the installation and administration of the system.</p> <p>A.2.2.5. Design the instruments of collection, validate them and train on their use.</p> <p>A.2.2.6. Develop training workshops for the personnel in charge of uploading the information and analyze it.</p> <p>A.2.2.7. Design a manual on the administration and use of the SINAMOTI, in collaboration with the technical personnel.</p> <p>A.2.2.8. Train the personnel that participate in the collection and analysis of information: agricultural technicians, inspectors, health workers, etc.</p>

IMMEDIATE OBJECTIVES	RESULTS	ACTIVITIES
		<p>A.2.2.9. Support the Ministry of Education in the periodic collection of information in the classroom of working boys and girls.</p> <p>A.2.2.10. Collaborate with the establishment of a referral system of working BGAs to the services they need.</p> <p>A.2.2.11. Support the implementation of SIPI, developed by the IINI.</p>
	R.2.3. Information System on the trafficking and commercial sexual exploitation of CAs created and operating	<p>A.2.3.1. Support the design (by CONANI) of a monitoring system for the SEC and smuggling and trafficking in collaboration with universities, NGOs and other institutions.</p> <p>A.2.3.2. Provide technical assistance to CONANI in the implementation of the system designed.</p> <p>A.2.3.3. Train the technical personnel of the participating institutions (CONANI, Publid Ministry, SEREX, DG Migration, police, health workers, prosecutors) in the collection and analysis of data.</p>
O.3. At the end of the project, key institutions (including local governments and communities) will have developed the capacity to assure their compliance with the law and with the coordinated implementation of policies and programs against WFCL	R.3.1. National legislation harmonized and regulated according to international norms	<p>A.3.1.1. Harmonize the penal legislation with the Law 136-03 (Code of Minors) and support its reglamentation promoting the discussion of the articles concerning CL and its WF and promote its implementation.</p> <p>A.3.1.2. Support the proposed modification and regulation of the Law 137-03 (anti-Trafficking and Smuggling) and promote its application.</p> <p>A.3.1.3. Encourage key actors (governmental institutions through the NSC, members of the National Congress, etc.) so that they promote the approval to the modifications of the national norms concerning CL (Code of Minors, Penal Code, Labour Code, Law 137-03).</p> <p>A.3.1.4. Prepare and publish reference tools for professionals of the Judicial System, including guidelines of institutional responsibilities and a compilation of the rules and jurisprudence concerning CL.</p>
	R.3.2. Institutions from the judicial system are strengthened in their capacity to implement existing legislation	<p>A.3.2.1 Carry out training actions for actors of the System to pursue, investigate and sanction the exploiters.</p> <p>A.3.2.2. Carry out training actions for actors from the judicial system responsible for applying the laws regarding CL (police, prosecutors, investigators, defenders, and judges).</p> <p>A.3.2.3. Promote the inclusion of the subject of CL and its worst forms in the School of the Judiciary identifying judges sensible to the subject that could lead their fellow judges.</p> <p>A.3.2.4. Support institutions in their processes of reports and legal proceedings of exploiters introduce in their</p> <p>A.3.2.5. Facilitate that each one of the institutions involved in the elimination of the WFCL introduce in their training plans the subject of CL in accord with the commitments assumed by the PNA and the PNESC.</p> <p>A.3.2.6. Support the diffusion of the content and magnitude of National Plan of Action and the National Plan against the Commercial Sexual Exploitation of CA among the national institutions and the international donors in order to clarify their role and commitments.</p> <p>A.3.2.7. Encourage the coordination of actions with SEREX of issues dealing with smuggling and trafficking of CA.</p> <p>A.3.2.8. Reinforce training actions and technical assistance for the institutional strengthening of the UTI and the Labour Inspection Department.</p>
	R.3.3. CL and its worst forms are integrated into the agenda of the ILO's constituents	<p>A.3.3.1. Organize day-discussions with trade unions and employers on their responsibilities in the implementation of the PNA and PNESC.</p> <p>A.3.3.2. Discuss strengthening strategies with workers unions and employers organizations that contribute to their involvement in the elimination of WFCL within the framework of the IPEC's actions.</p> <p>A.3.3.3. Promote within the employers sector an effective corporate social commitment for concrete actions of each AP, and in other activities.</p>
	R.3.4. Existing spaces for inter-	A.3.4.1. Collaborate with SET so that the actors of NSC assume their respective responsibilities for follow-ups of the

IMMEDIATE OBJECTIVES	RESULTS	ACTIVITIES
	institutional coordination at the central and local levels strengthened and developing actions	<p>implementation of both plans, including their own implementation and the evaluation of their progress.</p> <p>A.3.4.2. Support strengthening the actors participating in the CIESC to make the implementation of the PNESC effective.</p> <p>A.3.4.3. Support the training of the technical personnel of the CLU of the SET for their work in the NSC.</p>
O.4. At the end of the project, 4,900 CAs will have been prevented or withdrawn from the worst forms of child labour.	R.4.1. School attendance and retention increased at the basic education level, prioritizing project's areas of intervention.	<p>A.4.1.1. Offer educational services ("Salas de Tareas") for the children and adolescents withdrawn, establishing a system of follow-ups, placing special attention to the BGAs that have never attended school.</p> <p>A.4.2.2. Provide pedagogical and educational materials to the "salas de tareas" and to the schools.</p> <p>A.4.1.3. Train teachers, school principals and school district officials on educational management, teaching methods and how to interact with difficult students among other subjects.</p> <p>A.4.1.4. Promote activities after-school activities, including sports and arts programs.</p> <p>A.4.1.5. Negotiate with SEE the implementation of existing and future programs in the target communities' schools, including donations of school uniforms, books, provision of school meals and preventive health programs.</p>
	R.4.2. Adolescents between the ages of 14 y 17 have access to programs to technical-professional training	<p>A.4.2.1. Negotiate with INFOTEP and SET (Youth Employment Program) the incorporation into their regular courses for adolescent beneficiaries of the APs.</p> <p>A.4.2.2. Diffuse among the GOs and local NGOs the possibilities that they offer training programs from INFOTEP and the SET, in order to link vocational programs to them.</p> <p>A.4.2.3. Develop skills for adolescents and adults that do not meet INFOTEP's education prerequisites.</p> <p>A.4.2.4. Offer scholarships to vocational training programs to adolescents and their parents.</p> <p>A.4.2.5. Promote the exchange of experiences and the identification and dissemination of good practices</p>
	R.4.3. Alternatives to the generation of income for the families of working children and adolescents are available.	<p>A.4.3.1. Promote micro-businesses cooperatives and associations and encourage corporate credit schemes.</p> <p>A.4.3.2. Link cooperatives or associations as well as credit schemes to local development programs, if they exist.</p> <p>A.4.3.3. Identify existing financial institutions that can administer credit schemes at the local level.</p> <p>A.4.3.4. Train the target group on having access, using and administering the credit.</p> <p>A.4.3.5. Negotiate with SEE the development of literary programs for parents of working girls and boys.</p> <p>A.4.3.6. Support INFOTEP in creating relevant courses for employment opportunities available and the skills demanded in the target communities.</p> <p>A.4.3.7. Support the generation of income through the setting-up of repair shops, stores, beauty parlours, handicrafts, etc. (urban areas).</p> <p>A.4.3.8. Promote the exchange of experiences as well as the identification and dissemination of good practices.</p>

IMMEDIATE OBJECTIVES AND INDICATORS

IMMEDIATE OBJECTIVES	INDICATORS	MEANS OF VERIFICATION
O.1. At the end of the project, society as a whole, and especially in key sectors, will have been sensitized about child labour.	Perception of CL among key sectors of society	Through the qualitative methodology (focus groups and mini surveys) changes in the perception of child labour and in the attitudes of key sectors (journalists, legislators, judges, employers, workers, etc.) Measurement pre and post facto.
	Perception of CL in the public opinion.	Idem. But with population groups of different age ranges, gender and socioeconomic conditions.
	Media coverage of issues dealing with child labour	Quantitative and qualitative analysis of the media, news of CL, including evaluation of the journalists, interviewees or commentators' sensitivity to child labour issues and their knowledge of the subject and existing norms.
O.2. At end of the project, pertinent institutions produce, periodically update, analyze and disseminate relevant information for the development of policies and programmes to eliminate the WFCL	Coverage of the monitoring sub-systems created	The indicator will determine the proportion of girls and boys in the WFCL, monitored regularly in relation to the total girls and boys in the WFCL (according to the information available). This is a measurement of the system's efficiency. Reports from the SINAMOTI's sub-systems.
	Number of CA who were referred to the institutions in charge of their protection and received services	This is the indicator of the efficiency of the system of reference and counter-reference as a tool for the protection of CA. Reports of institutions of protection and relevant authorities. Analysis of information included in SINAMOTI.
O.3. At the end of the project, key institutions (including local governments and communities) will have developed the capacity to assure the compliance with the law and the coordinated implementation of policies and programmes against the WFCL	Inclusion of the thematic of CL into training courses and regular education in training and key institutions.	Qualitative indicator. Analysis of curricula, courses, workshops of GO, universities and other educational institutions.
	Number of reports and legal proceedings of CL exploiters.	This quantitative indicator shows an increase in the actions against CSEC. Reports of relevant institutions and monitoring of the proceedings.
	Number and type of institutions that use the National Plan as the framework for their work policies against CL.	The indicator will be categorized according to the type of institution. Reports and work plans from relevant institutions and organizations.
	Effectiveness of the National Plan for the Elimination of the WFCL and action Plan for the elimination of Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Girls and Boys.	Reports on the evaluation and/or the records on activities' progress and the achievement of the objectives of both plans.
O.4. At the end of the project, 4,900 CAs will have been withdrawn or prevented from the worst forms of child labour	Number of working CA in the WF in selected areas.	Through a baseline survey, which will be then repeated at the end of the project. Measuring the occurrence of the WFCL in the areas of intervention. WFCL will be categorized according to area, gender, and age, Both the withdrawn and the prevented CAs will be measured. The information will be included in SINAMOTI.
	Number of WBGA withdrawn from work or rescued from SEC..	Idem. It is an indicator of efficiency regarding withdrawal.
	Enrolment rates for CA target.	According to the child population in selected areas, categorized by WFCL, area, gender and age. School reports, information of SEE, SINAMOTI and the project's monitoring system
	Dropout rates for targeted children.	Idem.
	Promotion rates for targeted children.	Idem.

OBJECTIVES AND ASSUMPTIONS

DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVE		Contribute to the elimination of the worst forms of child labour in the Dominican Republic		
IMMEDIATE OBJECTIVES	ASSUMPTIONS	LIKELIHOOD OF HAPPENING	MONITORING ELEMENTS	PROJECT'S STRATEGY FOR THE ASSUMPTIONS
At the level of all the project's objectives.	Natural disasters that could modify national priorities do not occur.	Every year during hurricane season (June-October) there is the probability that a hurricane affects the country considerably.	Budget Allocations assigned to activities related to programs for CA and in particular WCA.	The project will be able, if necessary, to associate its work to pertinent sectors and principal interested parties to assure that the subject of CL continues being a priority and be tied to foreseen actions to come out of the disaster.
	Maintain economic stability, particularly regarding the peso/dollar relation and the prices of oil.	It is high if there is continuity of macro-economic policies.	Public manifestations and participation in public events of government officials and political leaders.	The project will have to reshape strategies, programmed actions and budget in light of the new scenario presented.
	Change of government does not produce major personnel changes personnel, (beyond the decisores politicos) or in the governmental priorities.	It is highly probable that successive governments do not change the expressed support given the degree of sensitization that has been accomplished. There could be changes of personnel.		Reaching out to political parties during campaign season and training of the constituted authorities and the designated technical team at the start of their new term in office.
O.1. At the end of the project, society at large and especially key sectors will have been sensitized on child labour.	Maintain the achieved social mobilization to be able to intensify the actions.	It is very high given the conditions under which this phase of the project would begin to be implemented.	Society's participation in activities for the 12 th of June and other programmed activities.	Evaluate the causes for demobilization and carry out sensitizing actions according to the situation presented.
O 2. At the end of the project, pertinent institutions produce, periodically update, analyze and disseminate relevant information for the development of policies and programs to eliminate the WFCL.	The different institutions involved maintain their commitment regarding the collection of necessary information.	They are high given the agreements that have been reached during the 1 st phase of the TBP and the level of commitment assumed by the institutions involved.	Permanent follow-up by IPEC's specialists. Support to institutions involved in equipping and getting the system operating.	Reach out to the actors involved to undue the problems that might have emerged.
	Be able to articulate the information coming from different sources.			Meetings with stakeholders will be promoted and concrete proposals for articulation will be made.
	CONANI and the SET allocate resources for the			Negotiations so that RRHH and financial are designated for the functioning of the system.

DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVE		Contribute to the elimination of the worst forms of child labour in the Dominican Republic		
IMMEDIATE OBJECTIVES	ASSUMPTIONS	LIKELIHOOD OF HAPPENING	MONITORING ELEMENTS	PROJECT'S STRATEGY FOR THE ASSUMPTIONS
	functioning of the system.			
O 3. At the end of the project, key institutions (including local governments and communities) will have developed the capacity to assure their compliance with law and the coordinated implementation of policies and programs against the WFCL.	Implement existing laws.	Regarding the ESCI, there have been several actions in pursuit of infractors, incarceration, and even prosecution. There are sustained advances regarding work inspections as regards compliance with the law in the agricultural zone especially.	Proceed with follow-ups to the cases detected. Continue with training programmes for inspectors from SET and Tourist Police officials, Public Ministry and judges.	Continue training actions in order to generate an ever bigger consciousness among those in charge of enforcing the law.
O 4. At the end of the project, 4,900 CAs will have been prevented or withdrawn from the worst forms of child labour.	Maintain the social mobilization that has been achieved at the local level to continue intensifying the actions.	It is high since the AP will be implemented in already sensitized areas.	Permanent follow-ups to the AP. Meetings of IPEC specialists with those responsible for the implementing NGOs and relevant local institutions.	Evaluate the causes of demobilization and carry out sensitizing actions.
	Guarantee health and educational services developed by the APs for WCAs.	It is high since access to health and education are part of the foreseen strategies in the NAP.		Discussions with actors involved and members of the NSC to guarantee access.
	Sustain the active participation of INFOTEP and the SET's Employment Orientation for the improvement of the technical-professional, vocational training for adolescents and their families.	There are commitments assumed in the NAP and the AP that are being implemented in phase I of the TBP.		

Annex 2: Institutions Involved in the Project's Implementation

a GOVERNMENT ORGANIZATIONS

SET. The Ministry of Labour is the government counterpart responsible for providing answers and monitoring the CL situation in the country. The creation of the Child Labour Unit (UTI) and its active participation on the formulation of the National Plan and the revision of the Labour Code, as well as the effectiveness of labour inspections in the agricultural sector show the commitment assumed as the leading institution on the subject. Similarly, the SET leads the NSC and it is involved in the sensitizing and social mobilization campaign, and it encouraged the creation of Local Committees against CL.

Within the framework of phase II, the SET and the CLU in particular, will be supported so that they assume the leadership in the implementation and follow-ups to the National Plan, so that it extends actions to inspect areas of informal urban work and CSEC, and supports the proposed the Labour Code modification. For all of this, the institutionalization of the CLU will be strategic, with the intention of forming a technical group to be maintained through successive administrations. At the local level, its role as the administrator of the Local Committees will have to be reviewed, and increase the participation of other actors. For the execution of the AP, it will be fundamental to establish solid ties with local representatives.

SEE. The *Ministry of Education* will be a key partner in the implementation of the education component since an important part of the strategy consists in expanding and consolidating social programmes in targeted communities. In addition to the permanent collaboration that already exists in actions to train teachers through the Psychology and Counselling Department, the provision of educational material and school meals, as well as the precise support to alternatives to non-formal education ("*Salas de Tareas*"/Spaces for Growth). During phase II, there will be an attempt to systematize teachers' training on issues regarding WFCL, and there will be an effort to regulate and direct the distribution of educational materials and school meals. It is also a fundamental actor in monitoring CL in schools in terms of detection and follow-ups to children and adolescents in situation of exploitation or at high risk.

SEA. The Ministry of Agriculture will continue monitoring CAs working in the agricultural sector as well as sensitizing agricultural workers and agribusinesses on hazardous child labour in the agriculture sector through its Agricultural Extension Department. During this phase, efforts will be made to systematize and expand monitoring actions, achieve sector's mobilization and the support of productive initiatives, particularly on technical assistance, vegetative material, and soil preparation.

SESPAS9. The Ministry of Public Health and Social Assistance has been collaborating on local actions of several APs. It conducts follow-ups to working children through the "Ficha Familiar" used by the promoters of the Unidades de Atencion Primaria (UNAP) (*Primary Attention Units*) in the coffee project in San José de Ocoa. It collaborated on the evaluations of their health condition (weight, size and haemoglobin determination) as well as on the provision of micronutrients to CA in schools located in the coffee and rice growing areas of influence, and it offered support in the psychological evaluations of CA beneficiaries of the AP against SEC in Boca Chica. During phase II, efforts will be made to involve different structures of the health system with SINAMOTI, and in the production of information, especially on the harm of child labour, particularly its worst forms (CSEC). Likewise, there will be an effort to ensure its involvement in the detection, follow-up and assistance to the CA victims of abuse, as well as in the implementation of integral health programmes in school with emphasis on prevention (adolescent pregnancy, addictions, etc.).

INFOTEP. The *Institute of Technical and Professional Training (INFOTEP)* signed an Agreement with the Attorney General's Office to train vulnerable groups in the AP areas supported by the ILO-IPEC, which would extend the scope of their training programmes to several regions. Phase II would

allow designing and offering specific courses for the professional training of the target population with a particular focus on strategies to find jobs. Also, adjustment of course prerequisites will be sought so that the population of working CAs can gain access to them.

CENTRAL BANK and other institutions in charge of national surveys. The discussions with the Central Bank have resulted in lowering the age of children from 10 to 5 years old in the Labour Force Survey. This will make possible to maintain part of the basic information on the magnitude and effect of CL in the country updated. In the future, it will be sought to incorporate a special module in the National Household Survey of the National Office of Statistics (ONE) as well as an agreement for its periodic supervision.

CONANI. The *National Council for Children and Adolescents (CONANI)* is the nation's "*organismo rector*" (leading institution) on the subject. It covers the national territory; it has provided training to the personnel of the "*hogares de paso*" (temporary shelters) and it collaborated on the development of local Plans and Committees on Childhood. The challenges looking ahead include advancing the implementation of the monitoring system (SINAMOTI); improving the handling of cases processed by the personnel in the temporary shelters, and support CONANI in the incorporation of CL, particularly its worst forms, into the Local Agendas on Childhood.

ATTORNEY GENERAL'S OFFICE. The advances achieved with the work from these institutions have been numerous and substantial. The Public Ministry has been an ally to secure the compliance with the law regarding the commercial sexual exploitation of children. Also, it has been possible to work on training prosecutors, and the subject of CL has been successfully inserted into the modules on the ongoing training of the Public Ministry and into the sensitizing programmes at the community level. During this stage, the training of the judicial police specialized in CAs will be consolidated, and there will be attempts to improve the training of the Public Ministry on investigation techniques and the quality of its response regarding protection.

NATIONAL POLICE - TOURIST POLICE. During phase I, the POLITUR personnel was trained on the subject of CSEC and an agreement between that institution and CONANI was reached, which made possible that children and adolescents, victims of abuse were referred to CONANI's temporary shelters if they so required. During phase II, it is projected there would be monitoring the impact of such training and depending on that, then continue with it.

BANCO AGRÍCOLA. This state financial institution included a clause in their contracts that makes credit acquisition conditional on not having children working. Also, it granted loans to the beneficiaries of the AP in Azua. These actions position this Bank as an important partner to continue the work in search of sustainability of the actions in the agriculture sector. Regarding this, follow-ups will be given to the compliance with the clause's condition; also, credit policies for groups in vulnerable condition will be sought.

Trade Unions and Business Organizations

CNUS. The National Council of Trade Unions (NCTU) has adopted important positions in favour of the elimination of WFCL. Teams of facilitators and trainers have been formed as well as an organizational structure around the subject of CL for the 4 central trade unions at the central and local levels: *Comité Intersindical para la Erradicación del Trabajo Infantil (Committee of Trade Unions for the Elimination of Child Labour)*. Efforts will be made so that the NCTU brings the subject of CL to other spaces of coordination and decision making such as the Government Council, social security, job policies, labour negotiations and collective pacts, etc.; collaborates on the reports and follow-ups to child labour cases; and supports the alert system. The involvement of the **Teachers Association (DTA)** was achieved, and an agreement to mobilize the teachers on the subject will be sought; also, support will be given to the teachers so that they monitor CL in the classroom. In addition, the NCTU will continue with training and mobilizing its members through its Committee of Trade Unions.

CONEP. Participation and commitment of the National Council for Private Business (CONEP) has been more difficult to achieve. Still, the Board of Directors of **COPARDOM** has shown interest on the subject of CL. Its representatives were trained and they participated in the formulation of the NSP as well as in the process of national discussions for the revision of the Labour Code.

Furthermore, **AFCONAGRO** advanced the inclusion of a clause prohibiting the hiring of child labour in the tomato growing business in Azua, and that meant advancement in the agricultural sector's commitment to eliminating the WFCL. Work will be done with these two organizations in hopes of spreading the word to develop corporate social responsibility in Dominican society.

Sociedad civil

From the beginning of the IPEC's activities in the country, several NGOs, national and international, have been involved in the fight against the WFCL. Many of them are part of the coalition of NGOs for children and some have carried out APs as part of the direct action foreseen in the TBP. However, the commitment has not transcended the agreements made in each AP. Furthermore, connections with universities, churches, professional unions, and grassroots community organizations have been limited. During this period, there will be sustained actions regarding those social actors.

Coordination with Other Donors and International Organizations

Out of the international organizations working in the DR, the project has coordinated activities with UNICEF and IOM. In the case of UNICEF, there have been regular meetings through the Inter-institutional Commission against the abuse and SEC of children and adolescents and of CONANI's Technical Committee. In addition, there have been different joint activities (campaign against SEC). As for the IOM, it participated in designing the Addendum to the Smuggling and Trafficking of CA and common activities were planned within that framework, which includes training actions, and a dissemination campaign. In this phase II of the programme, it will be proposed to strengthen the dialogue and communication, redefine the characteristics of mutual assistance and regulate some joint actions.

As regards other contributing agencies, both the European Union and the Canadian Government have shown interest in the subject. Canada, for its part, has funded several initiatives against the WFCL in the region including the TBP of Costa Rica and the sub-regional programme against CL. In connection to the previous point, there have been good results in the evaluation of that component in the DR and the Embassy has expressed its country's interest in working against SEC. During phase II, work will be done to establish relations with these donors, the authorities, as well as the NGOs that work in the country in order to continue funding initiatives around the subject of CL.

Annex 3: Characteristics of the Action Programmes

This Annex to the Report of the Expanded Final Evaluation of the Project of Support to the TBP, phase II, describes the main characteristics of the eight Action Programmes implemented.

<u>Name of the Action Programme</u>	Contribution to the elimination of Hazardous Child Labour at the Rafey Landfill in the Municipality of Santiago
<u>Implementing Agency</u>	Ministerio Evangélico Tiempo Decisivo- Programa Niños con una Esperanza
<u>Implementing Date</u>	-----
<u>Implementing Site</u>	The neighbourhood of Santa Lucia (La Mosca), Cienfuegos, Santiago
<u>Children's Work</u>	Searching for residues through garbage at the Rafey Landfill in Santa Lucía
<u>Name of the Action Programme</u>	Programme for the Prevention and Elimination of the worst forms of child labour through education
<u>Implementing Agency</u>	Muchachas y muchachos con Don Bosco
<u>Implementing Date</u>	Start. 16 October 2007 - End. 16 April 2009
<u>Implementing Site</u>	The communities of Cristo Rey, Villa Juana y María Auxiliadora, Santo Domingo, and National District.
<u>Children's Work</u>	Boys and girls in street situation.
<u>Name of the Action Programme</u>	Contributing Programme to the Elimination of Hazardous Child Labour in the Municipality of Santiago
<u>Implementing Agency</u>	Acción Callejera - Fundación Educativa, Inc.
<u>Implementing Dates</u>	-----
<u>Implementing Site</u>	Barrio Cienfuegos, Santiago
<u>Children's Work</u>	Informal Urban work (mechanics, collecting metal, picking up garbage, shoe shining, making deliveries for local grocery stores (colmado) and pharmacies, as vendors and domestic workers)
<u>Name of the Action Programme</u>	Elimination of child labour in the streets and slum areas in San Cristóbal
<u>Implementing Agency</u>	Fundación para el Desarrollo de la Mujer y el Niño (FUNDEMUNI)
<u>Implementing Date</u>	Start. 30 August 2007 - End. 29 September 2009
<u>Implementing Site</u>	The communities of Barrios La Marina, 5 de abril 2, Jeringa, Madre Vieja, Canastica 2
<u>Children's Work</u>	Commercial sexual exploitation and urban child labour (mechanics, collecting metals, picking up garbage, shoe shining, making deliveries for grocery stores and pharmacies, as vendors and domestic workers)
<u>Name of the Action Programme</u>	Prevention and Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour in the Province of Azua
<u>Implementing Agency</u>	World Vision. The "Salas de Tarea" component was implemented by the Universidad Tecnológica del Sur (UTESUR)
<u>Implementing Date</u>	Start. 18 September 2007 - End. 18 May 2009
<u>Implementing Site</u>	Sabana Yegua, Pueblo Viejo y barrio La Bombita, del Municipio de Azua

<u>Children's Work</u>	Predominantly in agriculture at a relative's or third-party's plots, urban work (street vendors, shoe shining, running errands), domestic work, in some cases, of the worst form identified.
<u>Name of the Action Programme</u>	Action Programme to contribute to the prevention and withdrawal of CAs from the WFCL in Santo Domingo
<u>Implementing Agency</u>	Niños del Camino
<u>Implementing Dates</u>	Start. 9 November 2007 – End. 8 August 2009
<u>Implementing Site</u>	Barrios Capotillo, del Distrito Nacional, Café de Herrera, de Santo Domingo Oeste, y Mata San Juan de Villa Mella, en Santo Domingo Norte.
<u>Children's Work</u>	Children and Adolescents living in street situation or at risk. Perform urban child labour and many times of the WFCL such as shoe shining, washing car windows, panhandling, sex for money, hawking, collecting money in buses, helping out at food places, selling or transporting drugs, and a combination of several.
<u>Name of the Action Programme</u>	Elimination of the WFCL in bateyes in the provinces of Barahona, Bahoruco e Independencia
<u>Implementing Agency</u>	Visión Mundial
<u>Implementing Date</u>	Start. 5 February, 2008 – End. 30 September 2009
<u>Implementing Site</u>	Bateyes de los Municipios Barahona, Fundación, Tamayo, Jaquimelles, Neyba, NAP/CSECadería y Uvilla
<u>Children's Work</u>	Family work without pay, performing different domestic chores, agricultural work such as sowing and fertilizing; hawking, agricultural labour (cutting grass), shoe shining, herding, pasturing and milking animals; fishing, running errands, construction work.
<u>Name of the Action Programme</u>	Programme of Prevention and Elimination of Hazardous Child Labour in the Province of Provincia San Juan
<u>Implementing Agency</u>	Fundación para el Desarrollo Azua, San Juan y Elías Piña (FUNDASEP)
<u>Implementing Date</u>	Start. 7 March 2007 - End. 30 September 2009
<u>Implementing Site</u>	Barrios Cristo Rey y Villa Esperanza en San Juan de la Maguana, Municipios El Cercado y Las Matas de Farfán.
<u>Children's Work</u>	Day labourer (sowing corn, sweet potato, examining the soil), working with the family (without pay) in different agricultural activities, urban work (washing cars, watching motorcycles and cars, selling ice cream, selling candies).

Annex 4: Publications on CL and its Worst Forms in Newspapers and Magazines

	TITLE	DATE
1.	Lo que se llevo “Noel” (<i>What “Noel” Took Away</i>).....	06/03/08
2.	Preocupa la sobreedad de estudiantes en las escuelas (<i>The Issue of Over School-Age is Worrisome</i>).....	07/03/08
3.	Estudiantes podrán cursar dos grados (<i>Students will be able to study two school grades</i>).....	25/03/08
4.	Cancelan a dos por embarazar alumnas (<i>Two are dismissed for impregnating students</i>). ..	27/03/08
5.	Creen que las metas del milenio no se cumplirán (<i>It is believed the goals for the Millenium will not be met</i>).....	27/03/08
6.	CCN ha donado \$18.2 millones (<i>CCN donates \$18.2 millions</i>)	28/03/08
7.	El patético drama del trabajo infantil (<i>The pathetic drama of child labour</i>).....	29/03/08
8.	Prevención del abuso infantil (<i>Preventing child abuse</i>).....	01/04/08
9.	Seducción: abuso sexual contra menores más denunciado (<i>Seduction: the most reported form of sexual abuse</i>)	15/04/08
10.	Once maestros son destituidos por acoso sexual y otros delitos (<i>Eleven teachers fired for sexual harassment and other offenses</i>).....	15/04/08
11.	El drama del abuso infantil (<i>The drama of child abuse</i>).....	21/04/08
12.	Marchan en santiago contra el abuso infantil (<i>Rally in Santiago against child abuse</i>)... ..	23/04/08
13.	SET busca sacar 5,200 menores del trabajo infantil (<i>SET aims at withdrawing 5,200 minors from child labour</i>)	29/04/08
14.	Considera país se esfuerza en eliminar la discriminación (<i>The country makes efforts to eliminate discrimination</i>).....	29/04/08
15.	Preocupa el tráfico de niños de Haití a República Dominicana (<i>The smuggling of Haitian children into the Dominican Republic is alarming</i>).....	21/05/08
16.	ENDESA registra aumento en la brecha de analfabetismo (<i>ENDESA indicates an increase in the illiteracy gap</i>).....	31/05/08
17.	El doce de junio se celebra el DIA mundial contra el trabajo infantil (<i>12 June World Day Against Child Labour</i>)	09/06/08
18.	Los niños que trabajan faltan a la escuela hasta cinco veces al mes (<i>Working children miss school at least five times a month</i>)	10/06/08
19.	Miles de niños siguen dejando las aulas para ser explotados (<i>Thousands of children continue to leave the classroom to be exploited</i>)	11/06/08
20.	Valoran educación como ayuda erradicar el trabajo infantil (<i>Education is Valued as Support to Eradicate Child Labour</i>).....	11/06/08
21.	Estudio dice 51% de niños falta a escuela (<i>Study shows 51% of children miss school</i>)	11/07/08
22.	Instituciones aseguran aumenta trafico de niños haitianos al país (<i>Institutions confirm a rise in the trafficking of Haitian children into the country</i>).....	12/06/08
23.	Republica Dominicana pasa la prueba ante la OIT (<i>The Dominican Republic passes test with the ILO</i>).....	12/06/08
24.	Una ayuda que limita (<i>Help that sets limitations</i>).....	12/06/08

25. Todavía en R. D. hay niños que trabajan en las calles (*There are still children working in the streets in the Dominican Republic*) 24/06/08
26. UNICEF” no basta con sacar a los niños de la calle (*UNICEF: It is not enough to get the children off the streets*) 01/07/08
27. Informe PNUD califica como muy mala educación país (*UNDP report grades country’s education as very bad*) 05/07/08
28. Desarticulan red que prostituía adolescentes (*Prostitution ring that used adolescents is dismantled*) 14/07/08
29. Denuncian que vendedores de droga “trabajan” con menores (*It is reported that drug dealers “work” with minors*) 17/07/08
30. Estudio revela CAEI no tolera trabajo infantil (*Study reveals CAEI does not tolerate child labour*) 17/07/08
31. UNICEF revela explotación sexual a menores en r. d. (*UNICEF reveals sexual exploitation of children in the D. R.*) 21/07/08
32. Presentan el plan nacional sobre drogas (*National Plan Against Drugs is Introduced*) 24/07/08
33. Niños de 8 años forman parte de pandillas (*Eight-year Olds are Part of a gang*) julio/08
34. Niños “buzos” viven entre la basura y olores nauseabundos (*“Diver” children live in the midst of garbage and nauseating odors*) 04/08/08
35. Violada (*Raped*) 09/08/08
36. Condenan pastor a 15 años violó joven embarazada (*Pastor is convicted to 15 years for raping pregnant adolescent*) 09/08/08
37. Profesor va a cárcel por abuso sexual (*Teacher goes to jail for sexual abuse*) 09/08/08
38. ONU aconseja no discriminar a niños al otorgar actas nacimiento (*UN advises not to discriminate against children when granting birth certificates*) 11/08/08
39. Y arrastra a menor (*And he/she drags the child/adolescent*) 28/08/08
40. El Banco Agrícola niega presione a los bananeros (*Banco Agrícola denies pressuring banana growers*) 3/03/09
41. Unos 140 mil niños aun atrabajan (*About 140 thousand children still work*) 3/03/09
42. Adolescentes y niñas del barrio Cienfuegos en la mira de proxenetas (*Adolescents And Girls From Cienfuegos Under The Watchful Eye of Procutors*) 5/03/09
43. Montás advierte crisis traerá desempleo (*Montás warns crisis will bring unemployment*) 12/03/09
44. Educación capacitará a 14 mil maestros (*Ministry of Education will train 14 thousands teachers*) 17/03/09
45. Fiscalía realiza operativo contra juegos de azar (*Public Prosecutor’s Office Conducts an Operation Against Illegal Games and Gambling*) 20/03/09
46. Jóvenes y menores son vendidos presos (*Youth and minors are sold incarcerated*) 25/03/09
47. Inician reunión sector educativo (*Meeting of the educational sector gets under way*) 27/03/09
48. La Corte Interamericana sesiona en el país (*The Inter-American Court Holds Session in The Country*) 30/03/09
49. En Azua prostituyen a menores en barcos (*Minors are Prostituted in Ships in Azua*) 2/04/09
50. Una red que prostituye menores con marineros opera en costas de Azua (*A Network Prostituting Minors With Marines Operates in the Coasts of Azua*) 2/04/09

51. Las cifras oficiales califican de vagos a los desempleados (<i>Official Numbers Classify as Unemployed as “Lazy”</i>)	5/04/09
52. Plantean uso de RD\$9,000 MM FONOMAT en seguro desempleo (<i>RD\$9,000,000 from FONOMAT to Be Used For Unemployment Insurance</i>)	7/04/09
53. La SET ratifica convenio sobre seguridad laboral (<i>The SET Ratifies Convention on Job Security</i>)	8/04/09
54. Programa gradúa más de 27 mil jóvenes de los barrios (<i>Programme Graduates More Than 27,000 Youths From The “Barrios”</i>)	8/04/09
55. Comercio sexual y seguridad en nuestras costas (<i>Commercial Sex and Safety of Our Coasts</i>)	9/04/09
56. La Justicia se muestra débil ante la explotación sexual de los menores (<i>Justice System Is Weak With Sexual Exploitation of Children</i>)	12/04/09
57. Educación en República Dominicana en último lugar (<i>Dominican Education in Last Place</i>)	16/04/09
58. Hospital destaca reducción de mortalidad neonatal (<i>Hospital Points Out Reduction in Neonatal Deaths</i>)	27/04/09
59. Subero pide dureza en caso abuso de menores (<i>Subero ask for toughness in cases of child abuse</i>)	30/04/09
60. 35 mil estudiantes aun sin acta de nacimiento (<i>35 Thousand Students Still Without Birth Certificates</i>)	30/04/09
61. El derecho a la educación será para legales e ilegales (<i>The Right to Education will be for legal and undocumented</i>)	1/05/09
62. SET declara mayo mes del trabajo (<i>SET declares May labour month</i>)	7/05/09
63. OIT: Desempleo crecerá este año en RD y Centroamérica.....	7/05/09
64. Vecinos satisfechos por cierre de hogar (<i>Neighbors Pleased With the Closing of “Home”</i>).....	7/05/09
65. Estudiantes fantasmas (“ <i>Ghosts</i> ” Students)	8/05/09
66. Rescatan 38 niños violados y abusados de un albergue	14/05/09
67. Pastor evangélico acusado de violar a varios menores de edad	14/05/09
68. Denuncian prostitución infantil en zona colonial (<i>Child Prostitution in the Colonial Zone</i>)	15/05/09
69. RD y Colombia firman convenio (<i>DR and Colombia Sign Agreement</i>)	16/05/09
70. Cada mes reportan 78 casos de abuso sexual a menores (<i>78 Cases of Child Sexual Abuse are Reported Every Month</i>)	16/05/09
71. Salud Pública incrementa vigilancia en la Región Este (<i>Public Health Increases Vigilance in the Eastern Region</i>)	18/05/09
72. Visión Mundial premiara de nuevo los mejores trabajos periodísticos (<i>World Vision Will Award The Best Works in Journalism Again</i>).....	22/05/09
73. Acusan a mujeres de explotación sexual (<i>Women accused of sexual exploitation</i>)	3/06/09
74. El 85% menores paren maternidad La Altagracia viven con su pareja.....	3/06/09
75. Comité de Lucha Contra el Trabajo Infantil presenta campaña.....	9/06/09
76. OIT estima que más de 400 mil niños trabajan en el país (<i>The ILO estimates that more than 400,000 children in the country work</i>)	9/06/09

77. Muchachos de Don Bosco. Erradicación del trabajo infantil (<i>“Muchachos” from Don Bosco: Eradication of Child Labour</i>).....	10/06/09
78. Alburquerque dice gobierno invertirá \$10,000 MM en programa solidaridad (<i>Vice-president Alburquerque Says Government Will Invest RD\$10 Million in Solidarity Programme</i>)	10/06/09
79. La Asociación Dominicana de Profesores está contra la explotación (<i>The Dominican Teachers’ Association is Against Exploitation</i>)	10/06/09
80. Tratan de acabar con el trabajo infantil en 10 años (<i>Trying to Abolish Child Labour in Ten Years</i>)	10/06/09
81. Profesores y alumnos marchan contra el trabajo infantil (<i>Professors and Students Walk Against Child Labour</i>).....	10/06/09
82. Estudiantes y maestros alzan su voz contra el trabajo infantil (<i>Students and Teachers Raise Their Voices Against Child Labour</i>)	10/06/09
83. Experto insta atacar el trabajo infantil (<i>Expert Urges to Combat Child Labour</i>)	10/06/09
84. La OIT y SET realizan encuentro (<i>ILO and SET Hold Conference</i>)	10/06/09
85. Crisis económica mundial golpea a los mercados laborales de AL y el Caribe (<i>Global economic crisis hits the job market in LA and the Caribbean</i>)	11/06/09
86. La OIT prevé que crisis económica aumentaría el trabajo infantil (<i>The ILO Predicts that the Economic Crisis Will Increase Child Labour</i>).....	11/06/09
87. Niños y maestros marchan contra el trabajo infantil (<i>Children and Teachers Walk Against Child Labour</i>)	11/06/09
88. Informe OIT y PNUD insiste en desigualdades del área laboral (<i>The ILO and UNDP Report Insists on The Inequalities in The Work Force</i>)	11/06/09
89. En RD hay 436 mil niños sometidos a abusos (<i>There are 436 Thousand Children Subject to Abuses in the DR</i>).....	12/06/09
90. OIT alerta por niñas en trabajo infantil (<i>ILO Alert for Girls in Child Labour</i>)	11/06/09
91. Statement by President Barack Obama on World Day Child Labor	12/06/09
92. Acción Callejera demands the elimination of child exploitation (<i>NGO “Acción Callejera” Demands the Elimination of Child Exploitation</i>).....	12/06/09
93. La niñez dominicana esta perdida en labores para adultos (<i>Dominican Childhood is Lost in Adult Labour</i>).....	12/06/09
94. Vicepresidente participara en reunión OIT prevención de desastres (<i>Vice-present Will Attend ILO Conference on Disaster Prevention</i>)	15/06/09
95. Vicepresidente discutirá en Suiza sobre empleos en RD (<i>Vice-president will discuss in Switzerland Jobs in the Dominican Republic</i>)	15/06/09
96. INDOTEL y CNSIC lanzan campaña Internet sano y ético en Región Norte (<i>INDOTEL and CNSIC Launch Campaign “Internet: Sound and Ethical” in the Northern Region</i>) ..	19/06/09
97. Rosario Guerra encabezara lanzamiento de la estrategia sobre Internet sano (<i>Rosario Guerra Heads The Launch of a Strategy for Healthy Internet</i>).....	19/06/09
98. UNICEF denuncia el aumento de explotación sexual infantil (<i>UNICEF Denounces the Increase in Sexual Exploitation of Children</i>)	19/06/09
99. UNICEF propone ayudar a la nación (<i>UNICEF proposes to help the nation</i>).....	20/06/09
100. Secretario de Trabajo se reúne con su homóloga Estadounidense (<i>Labour Secretary meets with his U.S. counterpart</i>)	13/07/09

101. Rescatan menores presentaban su cuerpo en lugares de diversión de Palenque (*Minors Showing Their Bodies in Entertaining Places in Palenque Rescued*)..... 14/07/09
102. El 70% explotación infantil RD la cometen dominicanos (*70% of Child Exploitation is committed by Dominicans*) 21/07/09
103. Republica Dominicana: Desentendimiento ante explotación sexual de menores (*Dominican Republic: Disregard for the Sexual Exploitation of Minors*) 3/08/09

Annex 5: Methodology of the Expanded Final Evaluation

The Expanded Final Evaluation (EFE) will be conducted combining several tools in order to establish the parameters defined by ILO-IPEC, which include relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, and impact, in addition to the likelihood of sustainability of the actions and results.

Such tools include: (a) Reviewing existing documents; (b) Interviewing representatives of government and nongovernmental organizations key in the implementation of the Project of Support to the TBP, phase II, and in the elimination of the WFCL; (c) Studying the Impact of the “*Salas de Tareas*” of the Action Programs (AP); and (d) A workshop with stakeholders in the Project and the elimination of the WFCL.

a REVIEWING EXISTING DOCUMENTS

The documents to be reviewed will include all those submitted by the IPEC’s Design, Evaluation and Documentation Section and by the ILO-IPEC Dominican Republic Office, as well as others submitted by those interviewed by the EFE.

It was also foreseen asking the Project’s coordination for complementary information.

Interviews of Public Institutions and Nongovernmental Organizations

The consultant team in charge of the EFE²² will conduct interviews with representatives of government organizations (GO) as well as nongovernmental (NGO) involved in the implementation of the Project of Support of the TBP, phase II, and in the prevention and elimination of the WFCL. All these entities will be selected in coordination with the Office of the ILO-IPEC in the Dominican Republic.

GO’s Interviews. Twelve (12) key government organizations were selected; they are: (i) Ministry of Labour (SET); (ii) Undersecretary’s Office of Labour, in charge of Child Labour; (iii) National Council for Children and Adolescents (CONANI); (iv) Office of the First Lady (DEPRIDAM); (v) Undersecretary’s Office of Education (SEE); (vi) Attorney General’s Office; (vii) Ministry of Agriculture (SEA); (viii) *Solidarity* Programme of the Cabinet of Social Policies; (ix) Institute of Technical and Professional Training (INFOTEP); (x) School of the Judicature; (xi) School of the National Ministry; and (xii) National Office of Statistics (ONE).

It has been foreseen that these will be individual interviews. Although guidelines to conduct them were not prepared, the interviews will focus on the role of each GO in the Project and in the fight against the WFCL, their impressions on the Project’s relevance, its effectiveness and impact, as well as their perception on future actions.

Focus Groups with the Local Steering Committees (CDL). There will be four (4) focus groups with representatives of the CDL from the provinces where the APs were implemented.

Interviews with ILO Constituents. The two (2) organizations selected from the ILO constituents were, the Dominican Employers’ Confederation (COPARDOM), and the National Council of Trade Unions (NCTU).

Focus Groups with the NGOs of the APs. The key non-governmental organizations selected were the eight that implemented the nine Action Programs: (i) *Niños del Camino*; (ii) *Acción Callejera*; (iii) *Niños con una Esperanza*; (iv) *Núcleo de Apoyo a la Mujer*; (v) *Muchachos y Muchachas con Don Bosco*; (vi) *Fundación para el Desarrollo y Bienestar de la Mujer y la Niñez*, FUNDEBMUNI;

²² Jorge Piña Puig and Roberto González

(vii) World Vision; and (viii) Fundación para el Desarrollo de Azua, San Juan y Elías Piña (FUNDASEP).

Two types of focus groups will be conducted with these people: (i) Nine (9) focus groups with the technical teams from the NGOs that participated in the implementation of the AP; and (ii) One (1) focus group with NGO directors.

Also, representatives of the NGO EDUCA, which systematized the “Spaces for Growth” methodology, will be interviewed, as well as the Institute for the Family (IDEFA), which is part of the Commission for the Elimination of WFCL.

Focus Groups with adolescent beneficiaries of skills training. It has been foreseen to conduct two (2) focus groups with adolescent beneficiaries of the AP’s vocational and skills training activities, in order to establish the relevance of those actions and the efficiency of the mechanisms of implementation.

It was also foreseen to hold an interview with one representative of the United Nations Children’s Fund in the Dominican Republic (UNICEF), because of its involvement in child-related issues, its coordination with the ILO-IPEC Dominican Office, and its committed co-funding for the effectuation of the CL module in the National Survey, ENHOGARES, 2010.

Study on the Impact of the “Salas de Tareas”

The impact study of the Salas de Tareas will include two activities: (a) a survey of direct beneficiaries children and adolescents and their parents or guardians; and (b) a group of 18 focus groups directed at three segments of beneficiaries and those involved in the AP.

Survey. There will be 300 surveys with children and adolescents prevented and withdrawn from the WFCL through the salas de tareas and with their families. The survey ballot consists of 25 questions with multiple-choice answers for the CAs and their families. Additionally, there will be 8 questions for the representatives of schools with salas de tareas.

Focus Groups. The segments of beneficiaries and those involved in the AP as well as the number of focus groups with each segment will be the following:

- (xii) Six (6) focus groups with the facilitators of the “Salas de tareas.”
- (xiii) Ten (10) focus groups on the coordination of civil society and public institutions at the local level.
- (xiv) Two (2) focus groups with family beneficiaries of the AP’s income generating activities.

Workshop with Stakeholders

The Workshop with Stakeholders took place on November 26th, 2009 and it was the last activity at the field level of the EFE. The participants in the workshop were representatives of main stakeholders involved in the implementation of the Project of Support to TBP, phase II, and in the prevention/elimination of the WFCL in the Dominican Republic. As the turnout was 55 people, the workshop was effective with respect to the use of time and the achievement of the results described in this section.

The workshop program included the following activities:

- (b) Welcoming the participants and introduction of the workshop’s methodology;
- (c) Introduction of the Preliminary Impressions of the EFE by Mr. Jorge Piña Puig (power point);

- (d) The work for the groups covered four evaluation criteria: (i) Project's relevance; (ii) Project's effectiveness and impact; (iii) Sustainability of the actions and results; and (iv) Stakeholders' performance, reviewing and defining roles for the future. Each criteria was tackled by a working group;
- (e) Submission of the results from the working groups to the plenary workshop;
- (f) Closing remarks.

The working groups were heterogeneous in their composition because they grouped together representatives from different organizations, governmental and nongovernmental. The work of the groups included an analysis and elaboration to obtain: (a) conclusions on the performance of the Project of Support to the TBP, phase II, and (b) recommendations for future actions.

EFE²³ consultants organized the analysis so as to obtain the expected results in the foreseen timeframe and moderated the working groups. Each group designated a representative, who in turn presented the results at the planning workshop. The results were presented using power point, and the respective presentations were given to the EFE consultants.

²³ Jorge Piña Puig, Roberto González, Rahamés Mejía, and Oscar Amargós.

Annex 8. Workshop for Stakeholders – Results of the Working Groups

WORKING GROUP 1 – PROJECT’S RELEVANCE

DO YOU CONSIDER THAT THE PROJECT OF SUPPORT TO THE TBP, PHASE II, WAS RELEVANT TO THE ELIMINATION OF CL AND ITS WORST FORMS? EXPLAIN IN DETAILS WHY?

The AP is considered to be relevant for several reasons:

- a. A significant decrease in the number of children and adolescents immersed in the problem of CL is perceived.
- b. The media has taken on the subject of CL
- c. NGOs and the media did a very good job in the way in which they handled information for the communities and how they have tried to change communities’ perception of CL
- d. The subject has been laid out in the public arena as very relevant and it has been possible to sensitize society on it.
- e. The connection between GO and NGOs has grown a lot during the AP’s development.
- f. In accordance with the objectives achieved by the AP and their justifications, its relevance to eliminate child labour is visible.
- g. The way in which the public, judges and others look at the subject of CL has changed; it has been possible to sensitize this very important sector of society
- h. From the perspective of the implementation of public and social policies
- i. The fact that the way parents and community leaders look at CL has started to change
- j. CL is now a subject of discussion
- k. A change in the media’s approach to the subject can be seen, which makes it easier for the community to engage in the issue and perceives the problem in their own communities

Do you believe that the Project focusSed on solving the problems of the beneficiaries and on satisfying their aspirations, taking into consideration working CAs, their families, CO, Government and NGOs? Explain in details why.

If we consider carefully all the programme’s components and their levels of implementation, as well as the efforts made by the *SOLIDARITY* Programme it is remarkable the number of services of which AP members are beneficiaries.

The principal components directed at the beneficiaries were: the “*Salas de Tareas*”, Legal Documentation and School Insertion.

As for the families, we could mention training programs, access to credit and support in the form of school materials for their children beneficiaries.

What do you recommend for future interventions so that they are more relevant?

- l. Carrying out statistics of working children and adolescents
- m. Tackling the problem in a more coherent way
- n. Provide more follow-ups to the CAs that have already gone through the AP
- o. Articulation of educational and recreational programs for the CAs
- p. Expansion, sustainability of government programs
- q. Continue the sensitizing programs for the communities
- r. Increase educational and sensitizing programs for the parents
- s. Inclusion of the subject of CL in the course curriculum for higher education
- t. Continue the sensitizing and awareness-raising strategies and include different actors
- u. The achievements are evident, but it is important to review the number of working CAs before and after the AP
- v. Work with the families of the beneficiaries should be done directly

WORKING GROUP 2 –EFFECTIVENESS AND IMPACT OF THE PROJECT

Do you think that the Project of Support to the TBP, phase II achieved the majority of the foreseen results in the four immediate objectives²⁷? Explain in detail which results seemed to you to be the most relevant to combat CL and its worst forms ?

Yes, because there is evidence that the institutions (Government, Private, NGO, CO, etc.) are more sensitized and strengthened in the fight against CL and its worst forms

The more relevant results were:

- w. Society and key actors have been sensitized
- x. Key institutions developed capacities on child labor to apply them on policies and programmes.
- y. Institutions that produce, update, analyse and disseminate information about CL
- z. More than 4,900 CA will have been prevented or withdrawn from CL and its worst forms

Do you think that the Project of Support to the TBP, phase II had any impact on the elimination of CL and its worst forms? Explain in detail in which areas of impact (human capital, social capital, institutions and services) were the best results achieved and why ?

²⁷ Immediate Objective 1. Society and key actors have been sensitized on CL
Immediate Objective 2. Institutions produce, update, analyze and disseminate information on CL
Immediate Objective 3. Key institutions develop capacities about CL to be applied to policies and programmes
Immediate Objective 4. 4,900 CAs will have been prevented or withdrawn from CL and its worst forms

Yes. We consider that it was in the area of HUMAN CAPITAL where the greatest result was achieved.

Why? The existing culture in the Dominican family of making CAs responsible for working at an early age, which was part of the family upbringing, has decreased.

What do you recommend for future programmes and projects so that they are more effective and achieve greater impact?

- Form a national network to provide follow-ups to local and regional networks.
- Create public policies that enable institutional and corporate commitment from the large, medium, small, and micro-businesses
- Enforce compliance with existing laws.
- Make the agreements with the articulated institutions effective
- Make sure that the institutions involved comply with their role
- Promote actions of financial support for the families affected by the problem of CL
- Sensitize media owners on the elimination of CL
- Use quantifiable variables to effectively measure the project's accomplishments

WORKING GROUP 3 – SUSTAINABILITY OF ACTIONS AND RESULTS

Do you believe that the actions and results of the Project of Support to the TBP, phase II are sustainable? Explain in details what areas of sustainability²⁸ achieved the greatest sustainability and why?

We all agree in that the actions are sustainable to the extent that each institution and entity undertakes their social role, and especially services that require resources (human, financial, etc.).

Social Sustainability

- Articulating local community networks so that they can create joint plans to tackle CL
- Sensitizing external organizations on the subject and their interest in providing services (more actors joining in)
- Empowering beneficiaries so that they recognize and demand their rights
- Increasing the CA's motivation to attend school and continue with their integral growth
- Parents' participation and follow-ups to their children's growing processes

Technical Sustainability

- Empowering key actors on the subject
- Strengthening technical capacities
- Strengthening capacities of human resources

Institutional Sustainability

- Strengthening technical capacity

²⁸ Social, Technical, Institutional, Economic, and others

- Strengthening service capacities
- Specialized materials
- Strengthening multi-sector capacities
- Strengthening the inter-institutional articulation (referral system, bilateral coordination)

Economic Sustainability

- The institutions' capacity to negotiate funding

WHAT DO YOU RECOMMEND TO IMPROVE THE SUSTAINABILITY OF THE ACTIONS AND THE RESULTS IN THE FUTURE, MAKING REFERENCE TO EACH AREA CONSIDERED?

- Trade unions should have a more direct and active participation in the APs and CDL
- The teachers' association should be a mechanism to articulate the subject of CL in school
- Institutions should have the subject in their work agendas permanently, including the budget (GO, NGO, Trade Unions and Business Men), being the direct responsibility of government organizations.
- Continue training the judicial sector for their comprehension on the subject and the correct characterization of the subject.
- Encourage the active participation of the employer sector in the PAs and CDL
- Provide clear instruments to key actors on how to carry out work agendas
- The NGO sector should be seen as a provider of services, an ALLY of State organizations
- Establish an agenda to encourage, stimulate and visualize the corporate social responsibility regarding CL and SEC

WORKING GROUP 4 – PERFORMANCE OF THOSE INVOLVED AND REVISION OF THEIR ROLES

Do you believe that stakeholders in the Project of Support to the TBP, Phase II, performed their roles correctly? Explain in detail regarding the following: (i) National Executive Power; (ii) City Councils; (iii) Judicial System; (iv) Employers' Organizations; (v) Trade Unions; (vi) Community Organizations; (vii) NGOs for children; and (viii) Mass Media.

NGOs, COs and some GOs have fulfilled their role and given their full support. One role model initiative is the *Solidarity* Programme and SIUBEN. In the private sector the sugar corporation of the Ingenio Barahona acted properly. The other actors have varied. The media has contributed.

The working group made the following comments:

Executive Power: (Santiago) Contributed with *Solidarity* cards, school breakfast, school rations. (San Cristóbal) Signing of a work agreement between SEE and SESPAS to assure children's insertion into school and a dengue prevention campaign. A work articulation agreement with SM. There is still no continuity with the *Solidarity* card because of the instability of the supervision personnel; attention should be given to counselors and psychologist that provide help to children in school. It is now when the Executive power is awakening and it should be encouraged to increase its impact.

Involvement by levels, there are institutions that have not real presence, there is no information on time allocated to execution Disconnect within State institutions, the centralization of state officials at a higher level, who in turn limit the actions of actors at lower levels. There are instruments, but the government is not articulated and slips in its actions. The WFCL are not a priority on its agenda during AP's implementation.

City Councils: At least in Santo Domingo recreation has been prioritized and at a minimum there are spaces that did not exist before (not enough, but there are some). In Santiago they have responded by providing places in better conditions to serve as recreational spaces. In San Cristóbal, the city council has not collaborated even 1%. A struggle with the City Council for a minimum of support to the COs, and it has been difficult obtaining the spaces. Participation in this process has been limited, as they do not have a well-defined role in their participation in this program. Resistance to give support as agreed by with the law. The subject of childhood is not a priority for the city councils.

Judicial System: Their performance has not been good because in spite of the norms, there are still CL violations. It looks very weak because of the lack of application of the law. They do their job, but due to negligence on the part of the NP there was no conclusion in the processes. There have been some advances regarding their dedication, but not to the extent that the law and society demand. In order to accomplish that sentencing was applied on flagrant acts, it had to be under society's pressure and the use of the media. Paying bails or using political influence weakens actions to bring infractors to justice. Nothing is accomplished by closing or shutting down prostitution centers if the judge's ruling is weak, there is bail or deliberation of the evidence, and thus the act remains unpunished. The JS is disjointed, it is being bought with money, it has not responded to actions of real offenses. The cases reported were not condemned by the DA.

Do you believe that the Project involved all the organizations or are there still organizations that should be involved in the fight against CL and its worst forms?

Yes it did. It involved all the organizations.

The roles currently assumed by stakeholders. Are they the correct ones or should they be reviewed? What are your recommendations regarding future roles?

The roles should be reviewed, as it was indicated in the first topic.

Annex 9: Legislative Modifications Supported by the Project

The Immediate Objective 3 of the Project of Support to the TBP, phase II establishes that at the end of it, the key institutions will have developed capacities to assure compliance with the law, and coordinate the implementation of policies and programmes against CL and its worst forms.

In order to accomplish this objective, the Project gave support and follow-up to the initiatives on legislative modifications developed during the First phase; as well as to the process of the National Constitutional reform, and to new legal initiatives regarding CL and its worst forms. The activities carried out were the following:

- a. Follow-up to three (3) legislative modification proposals developed in the First phase of the Project dealing with: (i) the Penal Code, in which there are being proposed 10 articles on types of penalties relating to SEC, to be included in the project of reform of the Penal Code, which is currently being debated in Congress; (ii) the Labour Code, for which there is a consensual proposal for modification at the SET, and it is pending submission to Congress; and (iii) the anti Trafficking and Smuggling Law, whose proposal of modification includes emphasis on the trafficking of minors, in accordance with the Palermo Protocol. SEREX, SEM, CIPROM and IOM are collaborating in this process;
- b. The constitutional reform establishes that all forms of slavery or servitude for debts and the trafficking and smuggling of persons are herein forbidden. In its Article 56, it establishes that the family, society and the State, will make the best interests of the child and adolescent a priority; will have the obligation to tend to them, protect them so as to guarantee their balanced and integral development as well as the full exercise of their fundamental rights. Likewise, it declares the elimination of child labour and all types of maltreatment or violence against underage persons as the highest national interest. It also contemplates that CAs will be protected by State against every form of abandonment, kidnapping, vulnerable state, abuse or physical, psychological, moral, or sexual violence, commercial, work, economic exploitation and hazardous work, in addition to promoting the active and progressive participation of children and adolescents in family, community and social life.

Article 63, likewise, declares that every person has a right to an integral education, under equal conditions and opportunities, without further limitations other than those stemming from their aptitudes, vocation and aspirations; guaranteeing free public education, making it mandatory at the initial, basic and middle levels, including children of undocumented immigrants, just as it is stipulated in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights.

- c. Establishment of the Regulation of the Law against Technology Crimes (L-53-07), which penalizes childhood pornography and includes institutions that participate in the CSEC. INDOTEL proposed an agreement between the Government and the private sector to install filters and software to control, facilitate and promote the use of the Internet by young people in a more trustful way, and thus prevent that unscrupulous people use information technology for criminal purposes.
- d. The tripartite signing in the country of the “Trabajo Decente 2000-2011” agreement (*Decent Work*), which includes a specific objective aimed at eliminating CL with the Project’s support during the negotiation process with the SET’s Child Labour Unit.

Annex 10: Principal Findings of the Impact Study

The Impact Study of the “*Salas de Tareas*” conducted 716 surveys about the SdT of the APs of the Project of Support to the TBP, phase II. Those surveys were for working children and adolescents and children at risk, for their parents or guardians, and schoolteachers.

The survey included questions of characterization and questions or affirmations on the effect/impact to which they had to respond whether they were in agreement or not.

This Annex to the EFE Report presents the principal findings of the study (percentages of the answers of those surveyed). These results served to evaluate the Project’s Impact.

CHILDREN’S ANSWERS

360 children and adolescents were interviewed (46.4% male and 53.6% female), of which 69.8% were between the ages of 10 and 13 years. All attended one SdT, but 16.7% are no longer attending. In the present, 98.6% of those surveyed attend school.

- a. TIME ATTENDING THE “SALA DE TAREAS”: One year (66.1%), 2 years (17.9%), or three years (16.0%). Frequency: 357.
- b. WHEN YOU STARTED ATTENDING THE “SALA DE TAREAS”, WERE YOU ATTENDING SCHOOL? 97.2% was attending school, and 2.0% never had attended school. Frequency: 356.
- c. BEFORE ATTENDING THE “SALA DE TAREAS,” HOW WERE YOUR GRADES IN SCHOOL? (i) Very good, 6.6%; (ii) Good, 63.2%; (iii) Fairly good, 21.7%; (iv) Always received bad grades, 8.5%. Frequency: 351.
- d. Before attending the “sala de tareas,” had you repeated any grade in school? 40.7% had repeated a grade, and 59.3% had not repeated any. Frequency: 351.
- e. BEFORE ATTENDING THE “SALA DE TAREAS,” DID YOU USE TO MISS SCHOOL FREQUENTLY? (i) No. Did not miss, 79.1%; (ii) Did not miss many times, only missed when there was no school, 12.0%; (iii) Yes, used to miss a lot during the school year, 8.9% (31 cases). Frequency: 349.
- f. WHY WOULD YOU MISS SCHOOL? (i) Because I was sick, 20.0%; (ii) Because I had to work, 13.3% (4 casos); (iii) Because I did not like going to school, 23.3%; (iv) Other reason, 43.3%. Frequency: 30
- g. After you started attending the “sala de tareas,” how many times, more or less, did you miss school per week? 93.9% of those interviewed only missed when they were sick or there was no school. Frequency: 346.
- h. AFTER YOU STARTED ATTENDING THE “SALA DE TAREAS”, WHAT HAS HAPPENED WITH YOUR GRADES IN SCHOOL? (i) They improved a lot, and I passed all my subjects, 65.1%; (ii) The improved some, and I passed almost all my subjects, 27.8%; (iii) They continued to be the same, 7.0%. Frequency: 327.
- i. AFTER YOU STARTED ATTENDING THE “SALA DE TAREAS,” HAVE YOU REPEATED ANY GRADE IN SCHOOL? 90.1% of those interviewed did not repeat a grade, and 9.9% did repeat a grade. Frequency: 354
- j. In the last seven days, did you have a job, “chiripa,” (temporary/for the moment work), or a business in which you worked for wages or profit or for a relative without pay? 20.2% of those interviewed did in fact have some type of work

k. What type of work did you do?

- (a) Picking or sowing some agricultural product, 11.1%;
- (b) Selling food, drinks, peanuts, sweets, flowers, or other products, 11.1%;
- (c) Washing cars, motorcycles, squeegeeing, 11.1%;
- (d) Domestic work, 55.6%;
- (e) Other activity, 11.1%.

aa. Have you sought work in the last seven days, or were you trying to establish your own business? 96.3% of those interviewed responded that they did not seek work. The reasons for which they did not seek work were:

- (f) Is in school, 58.9%;
- (g) Has been seeking, but cannot find, 1.9%;
- (h) I do household/domestic chores, 1.1%;
- (i) Does not need to work, 2.6%;
- (j) Does not want to work, 10.9%;
- (k) Other, 24.5%.

bb. During the last year, did you do any work, “chiripa” or business, either for wages or for a relative without pay, for at least two days?

cc. 78.1% of those interviewed answered, “No;” and 21.9% answered, “Yes.”

(l) That work or “chiripa”, you did it in what capacity?

- (i) Employer or employee, 18.1%;
- (ii) Working on their own, 11.2%;
- (iii) Family helper without pay, 50.0%;
- (iv) Apprentice with pay, 14.7%;
- (v) Apprentice without pay, 0.9%;
- (vi) Employer or person in charge, 1.7%;
- (vii) Other, 3.4%.

(m) That work is/was?

- (i) Permanent, 44.7%;
- (ii) Temporary, 29.8%;
- (iii) Occasional, 25.4%.

RESPONSES OF THE PARENTS OR GUARDIANS

262 Parents or guardians of the children interviewed were surveyed (85% women and 15% men).

dd. Follow-ups to their children’s performance in school. Total: 256

- (n) I always ask to see their report card, 35.2%;
 - (o) I always visit the school or participate in school meetings with teachers, parents and friends of school, 38.7%;
 - (p) I always ask to see their report card and always visit school or participate in the meetings, 21.5%.
- ee. After their child was integrated into the “*Sala de Tarea*”, did his or her performance in school improve? 97.0% of those interviewed affirmed “Yes,” that they did improve. Frequency: 261.
- ff. HAS THE “*SALA DE TAREAS*” CONTRIBUTED TO INCREASE MY CHILD’S DESIRE TO ATTEND SCHOOL? 98.5% of those interviewed affirmed “Yes,” they like going to school more now. Frequency: 261.
- gg. HAS THE “*SALA DE TAREAS*” CONTRIBUTED TO YOUR CHILD’S PROMOTION IN SCHOOL? 99.3% of those interviewed affirmed that it did contribute. Frequency: 261.
- hh. Is the “*sala de tareas*” a good strategy to prevent children from getting involved in work-related activities or child labour? 98.9% of those interviewed affirmed that it is a good strategy. Frequency: 261.
- ii. Have you heard talking about child labour, either on television, radio or at community meetings (Support Committee, neighbors organization, church, etc.)? 92.7% of those interviewed affirmed they had heard. Frequency: 261.
- jj. AT WHAT AGE DO YOU THINK CHILDREN SHOULD START WORKING? 74.5% of those interviewed opined that they should start between 18 and 20 years of age. Frequency: 223.
- kk. Work is the only thing that guarantees overcoming poverty; for that reason, the best thing for a child is to learn to work from an early age. 83.3% of those interviewed did not agree with this assertion, while 10.3% did agree. Frequency: 262.
- ll. The most important thing for a child is not to work, and complete basic or primary education because that would be the best thing for their future. 95.8% agreed with this assertion. Frequency: 261.
- mm. The best thing for children is to learn a trade from early age, so that they can find a good job as adults. 50.2% of those interviewed did not agree with this assertion, while 49.8% did agree. Frequency: 261.
- nn. The best thing would be that during the time of their school education, they could also learn a trade. 45.1% did not agree, while 54.9% did agree. Frequency: 262.
- oo. Which activities do you consider are the most appropriate or helpful for their development? Total: 261.
- (q) Teach them to work, 6.1%;
 - (r) Motivate or support them so that they do their school homework, 28.0%;
 - (s) Motivate or support them so that they practice a sport (baseball, basketball, etc.), 1.9%;
 - (t) Motivate or support them so that they participate in cultural, church or community groups, 3.1%;

- (u) Others, 0.4%;
- (v) All, 11.5%;
- (w) Activities b, c and d, together, 49.0%.

pp. COMPARISON OF THE PRESENCE OF CL IN THE COMMUNITY—BEFORE AND AFTER THE AP. 82.4% of those interviewed opined that there is less CL now; while 16.1% opined that there is more CL now. Frequency: 261.

SCHOOLTEACHERS' ANSWERS

94 schoolteachers (76.1 female and 23.9% male) from the schools in the AP area in five provinces were surveyed. The survey included characterization questions, and questions or affirmations about the effect/impact, which they had to answer whether they agreed or not.

qq. Most frequent annual average of education indicators

- (x) Students' attendance: 80 to 95%;
- (y) Grade promotion: 85 to 95%;
- (z) *Desertion*: 2 to 6%;
- (aa) Above school-age students: 7 to 22%;

rr. School absences

(bb) Average rate:

- | | |
|--|--------|
| (i) Very high (more than 8%): | 15.9%; |
| (ii) High (between 5 y 8%): | 9.1%; |
| (iii) low (between 3 y 5%): | 35.2%; |
| (iv) Almost not registered (Less than 2%): | 39.8%; |

(cc) *Reasons for absences*: (i) Due to sickness (27.0%), (ii) Because many have to work or remain at home watching younger siblings (61.9%).

ss. DO YOU KNOW ABOUT THE “SALAS DE TAREAS” INITIATIVE? (i) 87.1% answered, “Yes. I am very well aware, several of our students participate in those spaces”; (ii) 10.8% answered, “Yes, I know of them, but I don’t have too much information about its objectives”

tt. Impact of the “Sala de Tareas”

- (dd) *Absences from classes*: 87.1% of those interviewed opined that they reduced them;
- (ee) *Desertion*: 97.9% of those interviewed opined that they reduced it;
- (ff) *School performance*: 92.3% of those interviewed opined that they improved it;
- (gg) *Grade promotion*: 92.6% of those interviewed opined that students from the SdT achieved it.

- uu. DO YOU THINK THAT THERE ARE A LOT OF CHILDREN WORKING IN THIS COMMUNITY OR IN NEARBY COMMUNITIES?: (i) In total disagreement, 23.4; (ii) In disagreement, 8.5; (iii) Somehow in agreement, 20.2; (iv) In agreement, 17.0; (v) In total agreement, 30.9.
- vv. do you think that the “*sala de tareas*” is a good strategy to prevent children from getting involved in work related activities that harm their school performance? 97.8% of those interviewed agreed with this affirmation.
- ww. DO YOU THINK THAT IN GENERAL CHILDREN WHO WORK, LEAVE SCHOOL? (i) In total disagreement, 7.4; (ii) Disagreement, 2.1; (iii) Somehow in agreement, 12.8; (iv) In agreement, 22.3; (v) In total agreement, 55.3.
- xx. Does child labour impede or limit the children’s good performance in school? 89.3% of those interviewed agreed with this affirmation.
- yy. Do children who work frequently have “bad grades” or have to repeat the school year? 90.5% of those interviewed agreed with this affirmation.



Annex 11

International Labour Organization

International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour ILO/IPEC

Terms of Reference

Expanded Final Evaluation of the ILO/IPEC

Supporting the Time Bound Programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour in the Dominican Republic, Phase II (2006-2009)

**Final Terms of
Reference – as
the basis for
the contract**

October 2009

ILO Project Code	DOM/06/50/USA
ILO Project Number	P.260.08.223.055
ILO Iris Code	100610
Countries	Dominican Republic
Duration	39 months
Start Date	30 September 2006
End Date	31 December 2009
Localities	Central America
Language	Spanish
Implementing Agency	ILO-IPEC
Funding Agency	US DOL
Donor's Contribution	US \$2,700,000

Introduction

1. The purpose of the International Programme for the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) is the progressive elimination of child labour, giving priority to the urgent elimination of its worst forms. The political willingness and the governments' commitment against child labour – in collaboration with workers' and employers' organizations, nongovernmental organizations and other social actors – constitute the basis for the IPEC's action. The support that IPEC give nations is based on a multi-sectoral strategy that is developed in phases. This strategy comprises strengthening the national capacities to combat child labour, the legislative harmonization, improving the knowledge basis, sensitizing on the negative consequences of child labour, promoting social mobilization against this phenomenon and the demonstrative implementation of the action programmes (AP) aimed at preventing child labour, withdrawing working children and adolescents from harmful jobs and provide them and their families with adequate alternatives.
2. From the ILO's perspective, the elimination of child labour is part of its mandate under the Norms and Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work. The fulfillment of these standards should guarantee decent work for all adults. In this sense, the ILO provides technical assistance to its constituents: governments, workers and employers. This tripartite structure is a characteristic element of the ILO's cooperation and it is within this framework that the activities developed by the project should be analyzed.
3. The ILO's Decent Work Country Programs (DWCP) are being introduced in different countries to provide a mechanism through which concerted priorities could be negotiated between the ILO, national partners and other components within the larger context of the UN's international development. For additional information, please go to: <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/decent.htm>
4. The DWCP define their priorities, operational strategies, as well as the resources and plan for their execution, in such a way that they complement and support the plans of their counterpart programs for national priorities regarding decent work. Such DWCP are ample models to which the ILO's individual projects are linked and contribute. The DWCP are beginning to be introduced gradually in the planning of various countries. In the Dominican Republic the Decent Work Country Program 2008-2011 is already in the course of being implemented. For additional information, please go to: <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/bureau/program/dwcp/download/dominicana.pdf>.
5. A Time-bound Programme essentially is a framework of national strategic planning that comprises closely tight policies and initiatives, coordinated at different levels to eliminate the worst forms of child labour (WFCL), in a given country, within a definite period of time. It is a national initiative that emphasizes the necessity to confront the fundamental causes of child labour, interconnecting actions against child labour with the effort for national development with particular accent on economic and social policies to combat poverty and promote universal basic education. The ILO, with the support of many organizations of development and with the financial and technical contribution of the United States Department of Labour (USDL), has elaborated this concept based on previous national and international experiences. It has also created innovative formalities of technical cooperation to support the implementation of extensive measures against the WFCL in the countries that have ratified the Covenant 182.²⁹
6. The most critical element of a TBP is that it is implemented and managed by the country itself. Countries that commit themselves to develop a plan to eliminate or decrease in a significant way the worst forms of child labour in a definite time period. This implies a commitment to mobilize and allocate national human and financial resources to combat the problem. The process of TBP in the

²⁹ For more information about the concept of TBP see the "Time Bound Programme Manual for Action Planning (MAP)", at <http://www.ilo.org/ipec/Action/Time-BoundProgrammes/lang--en/index.htm>.

Dominican Republic is one of approximately 20 programmes of this nature that IPEC supports globally.³⁰

Antecedents of the Project of Support to the TBP in the Dominican Republic, Phase I

7. On January, 1997, the Letter of Understanding between the Government of the Dominican Republic and the ILO was signed, which served as the departing point for the IPEC's actions in the country. Two years later, in 1999, the government ratified the Covenant No. 138 about minimum age and in November 2000, the Covenant No. 182 about the Worst Forms of Child Labour. The ratification of the covenants encouraged the Dominican Republic to recognize the elimination of the worst forms of child labour as one of its priorities
8. The government confirmed its strong commitment becoming the second nation in the Americas to implement a Time Bound Programme (TBP) to eliminate child labour. In preparation for this new program, the ministry of labour undertook a series of preparatory activities to expand knowledge base and to raise baselines.
9. As a result of the preparatory work, the ILO/IPEC's project named "Combating the worst forms of child labour in the Dominican Republic" – Support to the Time Bound Programme to eliminate the worst forms of child labour in the Dominican Republic" was developed. This project supported the creation of a national action plan in the Dominican Republic.
10. The project focused resources in policies and dominant national programmes and in trying to create the necessary conditions to eliminate the WFCL in the Dominican Republic. At the national level the project's components were focalized on information and follow-up, development and policy legislation, raising awareness and social sensibilization.
11. In addition, the project developed Action Programmes (AP) in geographic zones of national priority, which aimed specifically at the worst forms of child labour. These APs developed intervention models that could be reapplied at the national level. The project's components at the local level were the generation of information, the development of follow-up systems, social protection measures, sensitizings, and income generation alternatives.
12. An expanded final evaluation of Phase I found that the project executed most of the planned activities and that the preparative project of the TBP and the project of support to the TBP had a satisfactory performance. One objective that was not achieved was the implementation of a national child labour monitoring system (SINAMOTI). Likewise, the final evaluation found that in general, the results of the trafficking amendment were the least successful. This is related, in part to political and political factors of the relation between the Dominican Republic and Haiti.
13. The expanded final evaluation comprised an impact study of the target group, with the objective of obtaining more detailed information about the benefits of the action programs' services to the targeted group and thus offer a picture of the before and after of the targeted population subsequent to the intervention of the IPEC's project. The findings of the impact study showed evidence that the project's interventions had a positive impact on the children and adolescents and their families. Particularly, the more valued services were the provision of school uniforms and school supplies, as

³⁰ The term "national TBP" usually refers to some national programme or action plan that constitutes a strategic framework or plan for the implementation of Covenant 182 about the worst forms of child labour. TBP is a generic term for these frameworks, and for a general concept or procedure that will be used in a different way in different national contexts. In many cases, the terminology TBP is not used in spite the fact that the process and framework contain many of the concept's general characteristics. ILO/IPEC have formulated the TBP concept based on the work of the ILO and its constituents. ILO/IPEC offer support to the process of the TBP in several countries through "Projects of Support", which is one among many components, such as projects, interventions and institucional development support to the process of the TBP.

well as the “salas de tareas.” These actions contributed to guaranteeing that children and adolescents remain in formal school system, and to decreasing the indexes of repetition.

Antecedents of the Project of Support to the TBP in the Dominican Republic, Phase II

14. In light of these considerations, the necessity to extend into a second phase the project of support to the TBP in the Dominican Republic. The purpose was to provide technical support to the national institutions that would implement the programmes prevention and withdrawal of children from the WFCL, as established by the National Action Plan, soon to be published and distributed, in addition, make possible the development of a regional strategy at the local level.
15. As in the first phase, the project's actions have been divided into two strategic components. The first component is to generate enabling surroundings at the national level, while the second is interventions of direct action at the local level.
16. The first component is being developed at the national level and it focuses on three specific aspects:
 - a) sensibilization and social mobilization, b) information and monitoring; and c) strengthening of institutional capacity to provide answers to the problem. These three aspects correspond to the three first immediate objectives of the logical framework.
 - OI.1. At the end of the project, society in general and specially the key sectors will have been sensitized on child labour
 - OI.2. At the end of the project, relevant institutions produce, update, analyze and disseminate relevant information for the development of policies and programmes to eliminate the WFCL
 - OI.3. At the end of the project, key institutions (including local governments and communities) will have developed the capacity to assure compliance with the law and the coordinated implementation of policies and programmes against the WFCL
17. The second strategic component is local interventions. Its immediate objective (IO.4) was defined as: At the end of the project, 5,100 children and adolescents will have been prevented or withdrawn from the worst forms of child labor.
18. Based on the lessons learned and systematized during the first phase, the model of intervention that sought to prevent and eliminate only one manifestation of child labour in a specific geographical area by a criteria of a regional nature, and that presents integrated and simultaneous intervention strategies on the different WFCL in selected geographical areas, was replaced.
19. Phase II paid special attention to aspects linked to sustainability. To that effect, it has been sought to negotiate support and commitments that guarantee that the relevant social actors, at both the national and local levels, adopt the subject matter; and a strategy to guarantee institutional and financial continuity of the actions has been implemented. For all of that, the provisions presented in the two National Action Plans are fundamental tools.

Midterm Evaluation

20. In conformity with the policies and processes of the ILO/IPEC, an independent midterm evaluation was conducted at the end of 2008, and it is provided in the project's document,
21. Relative to the project's first component about the creation of an enabling environment, the evaluation found that the principal limitation was the institutional weakness of the key actors. The principal good practices identified by the evaluation were the expeditious and engaging manner in which the subject of child labour was being integrated into the Programmes of the Cabinet of Coordination of Social Policies; the articulation between the National School of Public Ministry and

the School of the Judiciary to revise the curricula of both schools, and the model of negotiations of the ILO/IPEC office in the Dominican Republic which enjoyed a high degree of recognition among the different actors involved.

22. The principal recommendations of the midterm evaluation for the strategic component 1 were: develop a plan for the transference of processes; extend the time of the project by a year in order to make advances in the transference of the processes and to consolidate capacity development; strengthen communication channels between the ILO/IPEC office in the Dominican Republic and high management of the key institutions; maintain the project's strategy and regional approach in the selection of beneficiaries of the Action Programmes; develop tools to measure the perception about child labour; redirect the indicators of the handling of information and of institutional capacities and ponder the rationality behind the designation of roles and the viability of the coordinating structures of the key government institutions.
23. As per the project's second component—local interventions, the midterm evaluation found that the foreseen direct beneficiaries target, defined at the beginning of the project already had been surpassed by about 7%. In zones with action programs, the reinsertion of CAs into school had been achieved, raising school attendance rates; improving children's school performance; job training for adolescents 14 and 16 years old; creating support networks for the programmes to fight child labour; offering vocational training options for parents and guardians; integrating teachers in the identification of children in child labour and channeling health, nutrition, steps to obtain birth certificate, and legal assistance services.
24. Some of the most important challenges for the sustainability of the withdrawal and prevention of child labour that the midterm evaluation identified was that the present implementing agencies continue working on the elimination of child labour in their plans and projects. Likewise, the evaluation found lacking the strengthening of the local spaces of coordination which had been created within the framework of the action programmes with the objective that they include continuation of the "salas de tarea" as part of their responsibilities. In the local interventions those linked to participative strategies were designated as potentially good practices.
25. For the local interventions component, there were two principal recommendations identified: 1) Encourage meetings among the implementing agencies to exchange experiences. Those meetings would facilitate defining general guidance to approach themes such as the sustainability of the withdrawal and prevention of child labour, the scope of the income generating activities aimed at parents and guardians as well as how to promote simple and creative systematizations of specific aspects of the local strategy that have been outstanding in most of the APs. 2) Encourage the commitment of the Ministry of Education (SEE) to attend to the special needs of CA victims of labour and sexual exploitation or vulnerable to those and that the SEE try extending hours in zones with high presence of child labour.

Present State

26. According to the last technical report of progress, the project is on its way to reach its objectives. The goals for the withdrawal and prevention of direct beneficiaries have been achieved already.
27. The project is presently working with the Government of the Dominican Republic to include the problem of child labour in all of the processes of programming, sensibilization and social mobilization of the conditional cash transfer programme, known as *Solidaridad*. Additionally, ILO/IPEC has supported work to incorporate considerations for child labour in the nation's Labour Code and the Penal Code.
28. For the present semester, the project has planned conducting a survey on child labour in the Dominican Republic as part of the national household survey (ENHOGAR). An evaluation of the Child Monitoring System has also been planned.

Context of the Expanded Final Evaluation

29. According to the policies and procedures of the ILO's technical cooperation and the agreement with the donor, the ILO-IPEC's projects are subject to an evaluation at the end of their duration. Given that this project is one of support to the TBP, which has been developed as the comprehensive framework for the implementation of the provisions of the Covenant 182, this evaluation, as well as the ones for similar projects in other countries is done as an Expanded Final Evaluation (EFE). An EFE combines detailed impact studies together with the Project's final evaluation. The results of the impact sub-studies, incorporated to the final evaluation within the framework of an EFE, make possible a more profound qualitative and quantitative investigation of the programme's impact in particular areas previously defined.

Standard framework for the evaluations of the Project of Support to the TBP

30. The design of the expanded final evaluation (EFE) was influenced by the initial work to develop a standard evaluation framework for projects of support to Time Bound Programmes. While a great number of key questions have been identified and elements of the standard framework have been utilized here, it is expected that future EFE help to continue developing a standard evaluation framework for the use of programs of support to future Time Bound Programmes.
31. Besides serving as the project's evaluation, using this standard framework would facilitate a wider approach that will help develop national structures of the PDD, including the identification of future actions. Using a consistent approach in all the projects of support of the ILO/IPEC will assure that the number of questions and key aspects be considered. Also, it will offer a comparative perspective to extract lessons learned. Thus, it is part of the revision process at the ILO/IPEC of the concept itself of a PDD and it can potentially offer the opportunity to involve other parties and partners interested in the evaluation process. There is also the possibility that the approach is done as joint evaluation of the integral structure of the TBP, including the different components of the project of support, or the ILO/IPEC's different types of projects of support.
32. It would be ideal if the standard evaluation framework became the base for larger joint evaluations of several projects of support or for components within the process of national TBPs implemented by several partners.

Assessment of the Impact on IPEC

33. The impact assessment is a fundamental pillar in the IPEC's system of evaluation. Impact assessment methodologies, studying long-lasting changes and of even longer term are being developed as part of the methodology for development of the Time Bound Programme, where the first considerations and discussions about the impact assessment happened.
34. An Impact Assessment Framework is being created to guide the work about impact assessment of projects to combat child work from both the ILO/IPEC as well as from other partners. An initial approach has focused on measuring the impact on the children and their families that directly benefited from the ILO/IPEC's interventions through the development of methodologies for tracer studies³¹ and trackings.³²
35. In the context of broader programs like the time bound programs, it is proposed to include impact studies on target groups such that there can be follow-ups of baseline studies. This is done in order

³¹ Retrospective followup studies (Tracer Studies) observe retrospectively the development of a group of children who previously received services or were exposed to a specific intervention. It is an approximation to a specific moment of time and generates before and after data.

³² The followup of the impact (tracking) is a systematic method to follow for a period of time, and through repeated polls with a sample of a specific group of people who participated in a program.

to obtain an initial assessment of the changes or impact on the target areas as a result of the project's activities, particularly activities that aim directly to children and their families. The intention is that, in the context of the final evaluation, the results of such "repeated baselines" or takings provide valuable contributions to the analysis of the medium and long terms changes.

Impact Evaluation combined with the Final Evaluation (Expanded Final Evaluation)

36. The expanded final evaluation will combine the efforts of an impact study with the project's final evaluation. The findings of the impact study will feed the findings of the project's final evaluation.
37. The evaluations of the ILO/IPEC's projects are carried out to promote institutional learning. Following IPEC's procedures, before the evaluation planning there was a process of participative inquiry on the nature and specific purpose of the evaluation. There were comments from the principal interested parties: Project's Management, IPEC HQ, interested parties at the national level and the donor. The present Terms of Reference are based on the input received during this consultative process.

Scope and Purpose of the Evaluation

Scope

1. The expanded final evaluation will cover IPEC's project of support to the time bound programme in the Dominican Republic. This final evaluation will focus on the aforementioned project, its achievements and contribution to the national efforts to eliminate the worst forms of child labour (WFCL). The evaluation will focus on the activities, including program actions that have been implemented since the beginning of the project and until the moment of the field visits. If it were relevant for the project's evaluation, any other preparatory work for the project of support will also be considered.
2. The evaluation will have to take into account the project in its totality, including issues related to the project's design, its implementation, lessons learned, its replicability and the recommendations for future projects as well as the specification of the recommendations to be used by the project of support to the TBP in the Dominican Republic.
3. IPEC's contributions to the national process of the time bound programme normally includes promoting an enabling environment and assuming the role of technical advisor or facilitator of the process of development and implementation of this national time bound programme. To be able to analyze the degree of IPEC's contribution, the evaluation will have to take into account relevant factors and developments of the national process. The focus of the evaluation, however, will be on the IPEC's project of support to the Dominican Republic in its time bound programme.
4. It is expected that the evaluation will emphasize key aspects of the programme, such as the implementation strategy and the objectives' achievements. The effect and impact of the work carried through during the implementation phase will be analyzed using data on the performance indicators along with the information generated in the impact study to provide a detailed evaluation of the achieved impact and the potential impact at all levels (political, middle and direct interventions). Also, the effectiveness, relevance and other sustainability elements of the activities carried on by the project will be evaluated.

Purpose

5. At first the evaluation will serve as a learning tool for the project's management team, IPEC, the national interested parties, the donor, and organizations that work on child labour in the Dominican Republic and other countries. The principal purpose of the final evaluation is to i) Revise the continuous progress and performance of the project (the degree in which the immediate objectives and results have been achieved), ii) Examine the project's possibilities in achieving those objectives, iii) Investigate the nature and magnitude of the obstacles and factors that have affected its implementation and an analysis of the factors that have contributed to the project's success, and iv) Assess the legacy of the IPEC's project in their national efforts to combat child labour.
6. Although the principal focus of the evaluation is the ILO/IPEC's support to Phase II, since this is the final evaluation of such support, it would be important to link it to Phase I, offering an assessment of the ILO/IPEC's legacy and general contribution to be able to discuss, in a comprehensive way, what is the timeframe necessary to provide an effective support.
7. The purpose of the evaluation is to learn from lessons generated throughout the project. It will show how they can be applied in the programming of IPEC's future activities as well as in the actions against child labour in the course of the Time Bound Programme. Finally, the evaluation will have to have as its goal the identification and documentation of potential good practices, models of intervention and of the histories of the lives of children beneficiaries of the project. This will serve

as an important base of information for the principal interested parties and for those decision makers in subsequent future activities in the country.

8. The evaluation will also include a revision of the role of the IPEC's project in the promotion and development of the National Action Plan against child labour as framework for the TBP in the Dominican Republic. The purpose is to identify changes, if they are needed, in their strategy, structure and mechanisms. The analysis will focus on how the concept of TBP has been addressed and promoted; its relevance, and how it has contributed to mobilize the action against child labour; who has been involved in the process of designing a process for a TBP and the influence that IPEC has had in this respect. However, the approach will have to concentrate on the IPEC's role within the National Action Plan as framework of the Time Bound Programme.
9. Given that the approach of the TBP has been applied since 2001, the innovative nature and the "learning while implementing" element should be taken into consideration. The intention of the concept of TBP is evolve the lessons learned and adapt them to the changing circumstances. The identification of specific measures and of lessons learned for a broader application within the concept of TBP, in its totality, could be one supplementary characteristic of this evaluation.
10. The evaluation results will be used as part of the strategic planning and as part of a possible orientation in future phases of various projects. The results will also be used by IPEC to design future programmes and grant resources.
11. The evaluation will offer recommendations to the Government of the Dominican Republic on the implementation, development and finalization of a National TBP (contents in the program of support to a TBP, a possible mode of use, etc.) and recommendations to the project regarding the exit strategy and how to support the consolidation of a National TBP.

Suggested aspects for consideration
--

12. The evaluation should address issues such as relevance, efficiency, effectiveness and sustainability as they are defined in the ILO's guidelines: *Planning and Managing Project Evaluations* 2006. For more information, please see the ILO's document, *Preparation of Independent Evaluations of ILO Programmes and Projects* 1997. For gender-related issues see: *Considering Gender in Monitoring and Evaluation of ILO Programmes and Projects*, 2007.
13. The evaluation should be carried out within the ILO's framework and evaluation strategy, the ILO/IPEC's guides and notes, the standards and norms for evaluations of the UN evaluation system, and the quality standards for the evaluation of the OECD/DAC
14. According to the results-based framework used by the ILO/IPEC to identify results at the global, strategic, and project levels, the evaluation's approach will be to identify and analyze the results related to issues of the evaluation by addressing key questions and the scope of the project's immediate objectives using data from the indicators of the logical framework.
15. The following aspects suggested for consideration have been identified during the process of preparation of the terms of reference. Other subjects could be added by the evaluation team as long as the essential purposes of the exercise are respected and in consultation with the IPEC's Design, Evaluation and Documentation Section in Geneva (DED). It is not expected that the evaluation answers all the questions detailed below; however, the evaluation must respond to the general areas of focus. The evaluation tool kit, which will have to be prepared by the evaluation team and shared with DED for its revision before commencing fieldwork, will indicate if there are other specific aspects to be tackled. The principal categories are:
 - Design and planning
 - Achievements (implementation and effectiveness)

- Project's relevance
- Sustainability
- Special aspects to be considered

16. The suggested aspects to be considered within the aforementioned categories are in Annex I.
17. The current list of questions and primordial aspects considered as part of the standard evaluation framework for the projects of support to the TBP foresees the principal aspects and questions that will have to be examined by the evaluation. The primordial focus should be the contribution of the ILO/IPEC's project of support to the national TBP.
18. In evaluations of programs of support to TBP, the questions about the levels of analysis should be answered primordially at the project and country levels. In the localities in which the IPEC's projects are operating, the changes in policy should be analyzed to understand the nature of the political support to the projects or programs and specific actions executed by city councils or community leaders to support, integrate or replicate actions defended by the project or program. In the case of sectoral studies, the evaluator will have to document explicitly the changes in policy or practices that have occurred within the targeted sectors.
19. These results have the intention of contributing to a better understanding of the ILO/IPEC's contributions globally. In projects of support to time bound programmes, and to other national large projects, the effects can include institutional strengthening, development of sustainable organizations and affiliation networks.

Aspects for consideration in the impact study (Study on the impact of the “salas de tarea”)

20. The purpose of the impact study as part of the expanded final evaluation is to have the opportunity to learn in a more detailed and specific way about a central component of the education strategy (“Salas de Tarea”) within the action programs and to incorporate the results of the study to the broader evaluation process.
21. After an advisory and discussion process between the project and the DED, and considering the contributions of the interested parties, it was decided to focus the study on the impact the “Salas de Tarea” have had on the CA's school performance and on their decisions on whether they should work or study.
22. The concept of the “Salas de Tarea” is to maintain the children and adolescents busy during hours outside school hours offering additional help with homework. The intention has been to reduce school desertion and over school-age occurrence. The “Salas de Tarea” include a physical space and a qualified person to help children with their school work. The final evaluation of phase I found that the “Salas de Tarea” strategy was one of the most recognized and appreciated services by children, parents and guardians.
23. To this effect, an impact study can define with greater clarity the contributions or broader scope of this strategy with the final objective of reducing child labour in the Dominican Republic. The purpose of the direct action programs is to be models for learning which services or combination of services work better. Therefore, this is an opportunity to learn about the “salas de tarea” as a potentially replicable model.
24. The results of the impact study will strengthen the final evaluation. The experience, likewise, will contribute to the broader work that is being done at the heart of the ILO/IPEC to develop methodologies and tools of impact assessment.

Expected Results

25. It is foreseen that the results of the evaluation team will be the following:

Expanded Final Evaluation

26. From the evaluation team leader

- Documents revision
- Sessions of technical and methodological support with the local partners that will implement the impact study.
- Conjoint revision of the design of the impact study and continuous support to the execution of the study.
- An evaluation tool kit prepared in conjunction with the evaluation team
- Field visit to the Dominican Republic
- Facilitate, along with the other member of the evaluation team, the workshop for interested parties. This will include the writing of a detailed program and an anticipatory note.
- Final work session with the project management.
- Draft report in Spanish.
- Second final version of the report, including answers to the comments consolidated.
- Notes about the experiences of the evaluation process and suggestions for the development of a standard evaluation framework and of the design of the impact study.

27. From the second member of the evaluation team:

- Documents Revision
- Support to the leader of the international team throughout the evaluation phase
- Co-facilitating the workshop for the interested parties
- Contribute to and support the preparation of the draft of the report and final evaluation report

IMPACT STUDY

28. The results that will have to be delivered by the local organization in charge of the impact study are:

- The methodology and the plan to collect data including questionnaires and discussion guides for the focus groups.
- Meetings and discussions with the evaluation team regarding the design and the implementation of the impact study.
- A summary of the analytical report gathering the study's principal findings to be incorporated into the final evaluation.
- Presentation of the preliminary findings of the impact study at the workshop for the interested parties.
- An analytical report of the information collected during fieldwork (the approach will have to be the presentation of the findings instead of a exhaustive analysis).
- An electronic version of raw data for its subsequent analysis.

Final Report

29. The final evaluation report will have to include:

- An executive summary of the principal results, conclusions and recommendations
- Results clearly identified including findings of the study of impact of the "salas de tarea"
- Conclusions and the recommendations clearly identified

- Lessons learned
 - Potential good practices and the effective models of the intervention
 - Appropriate Annexes including these ToRs
 - Uniform matrix of the evaluation tool
30. It is recommended to structure the final report within the guidelines of the principal questions establishing the following subtitles:
- TBP and Project of support in its preparatory process
 - Process of development and design of the
 - National TBP
 - Project of support
 - Action Programmes
 - Implementation Process
 - Achievements and Performance
 - Support to the TBP national process
 - Facilitating Environment or Context
 - Targeted Interventions
 - Networks and Connections
 - Evidence of sustainability and mobilization of resources
31. The report should not exceed a maximum of 40 pages, excluding the annexes that will provide antecedents and details of the components of the project evaluated. The report will be sent as a complete document without exceeding 3 mega bytes. Should pictures be included, those will have to be in low resolution so as not to exceed the aforesaid limit. All drafts and final results, including supporting documents, the analytical reports and the information will be sent in electronic version compatible to Word for Windows.
32. Property rights of the evaluation belong to the OIT/IPEC and consultants. The ILO holds exclusive copyright. The use of the information of the publication and of other presentations can be used only through a written agreement with the ILO/IPEC. The principal interested parties can make appropriate use of the report as long as it is in line with the original purpose and proper recognition.
33. The final report will be circulated for its revision among the interested parties (project management, ILO/IPEC regional office, all the participants of the workshop, the donor and others identified by the ILO/IPEC-DED). The comments of the interested parties will be consolidated by the ILO/IPEC's Design, Evaluation, and Documentation Section (DED) and they will be given to the team leader. In the preparation of the final report, the team leader will consider the comments and will incorporate them if s/he deems it necessary. Should that be the case, the team leader will give a brief explanation of the motives for which some of the comments of the interested parties were not included in the final version.

Evaluation Methodology

34. The following paragraphs present the methodology suggested for the evaluation. The evaluation team can adjust this methodology if they deem it necessary, maintaining coherence with the objectives of the exercise and in constant communication with IPEC DED.

1. Expanded Final Evaluation

1.1. Documents Revision

35. The evaluation will be carried out beginning with a documents revision including the project documents, the progress reports, results of the project and of the action programmes, results of the

internal process of planning and relevant materials from secondary sources. During the phase of documents revision, the leader of the evaluation will have an informative session with ILO/IPEC-DED, a telephone conference with representatives of USDOL and one with the person responsible for the project at the head office of the ILO/IPEC.

36. It is expected that, at the end of the final documents revision, the consultant prepares a brief methodological document indicating the “evaluation plan”, which will have to be discussed and approved by DED before the beginning of the field visits.

1.2. Fieldwork by the the evaluation team

37. The leader of the evaluation, in collaboration with members of the evaluation team, will conduct an evaluation mission in the country that will consist of the following:
 - Work sessions with the ILO/IPEC personnel
 - Work sessions with the organization in charge of the impact study
 - Interviews with the principal interested parties and informants
 - Field visits to selected areas of the project
 - Evaluation workshop with the interested parties
38. The evaluation will also include fieldwork in the selected localities, where interviews with national government officials, trade unions, employers and other related organizations would be conducted, as well as in localities where programmes of direct action are being implemented. It will also include visits to the action programmes.
39. During the interviews, focus groups and other exercises to collect information, the evaluation team will have to ask for the opinion of a large range of interested parties, including children, parents of beneficiaries, teachers, government representatives, professionals linked to sectors of high priority, representatives of trade unions and employers’ organizations, implementing agencies and other interested parties, including the donor.
40. The evaluation process will include a one-day workshop for the interested parties to present the preliminary findings and conclusions of the evaluation and their recommendations, with the objective of obtaining additional comments and information (feedback). This meeting will take place close to the end of the field visit. The result of this workshop will have to be taken into consideration for the preparation of the draft of the evaluation report.
41. The workshop will have the participation of the IPEC’s personnel and principal partners, including the donor should it be fitting. The team leader, in collaboration with the national consultant, will be responsible for organizing the workshop methodology. The project team will be in charge of identifying the number of participants of the workshop and its logistics. The principal partners of the project will have to be invited to the workshop. The project, in conjunction with the leader of the evaluation team, will propose a list of participants.
42. The team leader and the national consultant will work together particularly during the field mission, this will include dividing the interviews with the principal national interested parties.
43. The evaluation team leader will interview donor’s representatives, ILO/IPEC in Geneva, and the ILO/IPEC’s personnel in the region in the course of the evaluation process, preferably during the the writing, revision phase.
44. The evaluation team will have to prepare an evaluation tool kit. It is expected that the team include, as part of the specific evaluation tool kit, the standard evaluation tool developed by ILO/IPEC to document and analyse the achievements of the projects and the contributions of the action programmes to the projects.

45. The evaluation methodology will have to consider the multiple layers involved in the process: the framework and structure of the national efforts to eliminate the WFCL in the Dominican Republic and the IPEC's support to this process through this project. The collection of data and the analytical tools will have to consider this practical and methodological distinction.

Composition of the evaluation team

46. A team leader and a national consultant will carry out the evaluation. Neither could have been previously involved with the project. The leader of the evaluation team will be responsible for writing and finalizing the evaluation report. The national consultant for the evaluation team will assist the team leader in the preparation of the field visits, during the field visits, and in the writing of the draft report. The leader of the evaluation team will be responsible for the evaluation process and for its results, including the quality of the report and for meeting the agreed deadlines.
47. The qualifications and general background information about the team leader and the national consultant for the evaluation team will include:

Evaluator (team leader)	
Responsibilities	Profile
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Work sessions with the associated local agency and support to the impact study • Provide commentaries and feedback to the evaluation of the impact study, including comments on the design of the tool and the questionnaires. • Informative session with ILO/IPEC-DED • Telephone interviews with the donor and with ILO/IPEC in Geneva. • Review documents • Prepare an evaluation plan • Mission in the country to collect information • Facilitate the workshop of the interested parties in collaboration with the national consultant to the evaluation team. • Prepare a draft report of the evaluation in Spanish. • Finalize the evaluation report taking into consideration the comments of the interested parties. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Relevant education on social themes and economic development. • Plenty of experience in the design, management and evaluation of development projects, particularly work in public policy, institutional strengthening and local development projects. • Experience as a team leader with the UN System Evaluation or other international projects. • Relevant experience in the region, preferably with previous experience in the Dominican Republic. • Familiarity and knowledge of thematic areas such child labour, social mobilization, human rights, gender or the like. • Experience with public policy in the areas of education and legal issues preferred. • Experience with the UN system or similar international experience preferably in developing national and international frameworks, particularly with Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs) and United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF). • Experience facilitating workshops to share findings of the evaluation. • Fluent in Spanish and strong knowledge of English
Evaluator (National Consultant)	
Responsibilities	Profile
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Prepare the revision of the documents in coordination with the team leader. • Conduct field visits with the team leader • Support the leader in the creation of the workshop for the interested parties. • Contribute to the writing of the first draft of the evaluation report. • Contribute to the writing of and incorporation of the comments into the final report. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ample knowledge of development themes in the Dominican Republic, preferably regarding child labour. • Experience with evaluation conducted at the level of multi-bilateral development. • Experience in facilitating evaluation workshops and in the preparation of antecedents for reports.

48. The leader of the evaluation team will be responsible for discussing the design of the impact study with the associated local agency. The team leader will provide support and feedback to the design and the execution of the impact study.
49. The leader of the evaluation team will be responsible for reviewing documents, conduct field visits in the project's localities and facilitate the workshop for the interested parties.
50. The team leader will be in charge of writing the draft report. After the comments to the draft report, the leader will be responsible for finalizing the report, and include, if it is appropriate, the comments of the interested parties.
51. The evaluation will be carried out with the technical support of the IPEC-DED section and with the logistic support of the project's office in Santo Domingo, the Dominican Republic, as well as with the administrative support of the ILO office in San José, Costa Rica. DED will be responsible for consolidating the comments and hand them to the consultant.
52. It is expected that the consultant will work in accordance with the highest standards and code of conduct and follow the United Nations evaluation norms and standards.

2. Impact study of the “salas de tarea”

53. A local associated agency (research institute) will design and implement an impact study. The study will focus on examining the impact of the “salas de tarea,” as one of the principal strategies/services offered by the action programmes to improve school performance of the children and adolescent beneficiaries, to prevent them from leaving school and support the withdrawal from or prevention of child labour.
54. The results of the impact study will be integrated into the final evaluation report. The study about the specific impact of the “Salas de Tarea” will be complemented with the rest of the information collected in the field by the evaluation team through interviews with parents, guardians, teachers and local government officials, which will offer a more complete picture about the impact of the action programmes on the CAs.
55. The local agency, with the support of the evaluation team, will design the impact study methodology. It is recommended that it include individual questionnaires as well as discussions with focus groups and analysis of information and data about external and contextual factors.
56. The study will be designed using as supporting material the manual and ILO/IPEC's experience in studies of impact in general and in particular, the tracer studies.
57. The local agency will present the study's preliminary findings at the workshop for interested parties as well as a written summarized report that enable to integrate these key findings into the evaluation report.
58. The terms of reference for the impact study will be in a separate document, but the impact study will have to be considered as part of the Expanded Final Evaluation.

Calendar

59. The preliminary calendar is the following:

Phases	Responsible	Activities	Duration and Date
Phase I: Review of documentation	Evaluation team with the DED's support	Informative session with IPEC DED Review of documentation Design of the evaluation plan Field visit to offer support in the design of the impact study (see attached calendar)	19 Oct – 6 Nov, 2009 (26-30 Oct: field visit by the team leader)
			Team leader: 10 working days Team members: 5 working days
Phase II: Collecting data	Evaluation team with logistic support from the project	Field work, interviews, and data collection Meetings with the institution responsible for the impact study Workshop for interested parties	9-27 Nov, 2009
			Team leader: 17 working days Team members: 15 working days
Phase III: Writing the draft report	The evaluation leader with the support of the team members	Analysis of the information collected and preparation of the first draft report	30 Nov – 4 Dec, 2009 Hand in the draft: 4 dic, 2009
			Team leader: 5 working days Team members: 3 work days
Phase IV: Comments of the interested parties	DED	Send the report to the interested parties; reception of the comments of the interested parties; review of the comments and preparation of a document of consolidated comments	2 weeks in December
Phase V: Finalize the report	Leader of the evaluation team with the support of the team members	Reviews based on the comments of the interested parties.	Around mid-December, 2009
			Líder del equipo: 5 días hábiles Miembro del equipo: 2 días hábiles
			TOTAL: Team leader: 37 working days National consultant: 25 working days

Impact study		
Person Responsible	Tasks	Duration and Due Dates
Local Associated Agency (Research Institute)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Review of the baseline background and bibliography, information of the media, reports on the project's development, project's technical reports and other documents related to the project. 	19 – 23 Oct, 2009 5 working days
Local Associated Agency (Research Institute) and leader of the evaluation team.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Preparatory Consultations Design of the plan of study and instrument 	26 – 30 Oct, 2009 5 working days

Associated local Agency (Research Institute)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Based on the plan of study, implementation of the project in a sample and in previously selected districts, and conducting focus groups for discussions ○ Field work ○ Processing and analysis of data 	2 Nov – 13 Nov, 2009 10 working days
Associated local Agency (Research Institute) with the contribution of the team leader	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Preparation of preliminary findings for the inclusion of the draft report of the evaluation ○ Presentation of the preliminary findings at the workshop for the interested parties ○ Finalizing the report based on the comments by the leader of the evaluation team and on the feedback from the workshop 	16 – 26 Nov, 2009 9 working days
Associated local Agency (Research Institute)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Provide support to the team leader in finalizing the report 	2 days in December
TOTAL Number of days		31 days

Information Base and Consultations/Meetings

It is found in Geneva and it will be provided by the DED	Project Document Midterm Evaluation Report Progress reports Guides of the ILO and DED
It is found at the project's office and will be made available by its administration	Progress reports of the action programmes Evaluation reports and similar reports of the action programmes Financial and technical reports of the partner agencies Other studies and investigations that have been carried out Baselines reports and information Records of the action programmes' activities Synthesis of the national workshops and their procedures Planning documents at the national level SPIF Documents Master List and records of the beneficiaries
To be provided if necessary	Relevant documents to the development of the situation in the Dominican Republic in the context of child labour Policy documents of relevance to the project's development Documents such as strategies, monitoring, monitoring plans, reports and budgets

Consultations with:

- The project's management and its team
- ILO/IPEC Geneva and officials in charge in the region
- Government Representatives
- Employers and workers groups with their respective associations
- Implementing Agencies
- Children
- Children's parents
- Members of the community
- Teachers, legal authorities, etc., such as those identified by the evaluation team
- National Committee
- The personnel of the DevTech Systems, EDUCA e INTEC projects
- Telephone discussions with USDOL

2. Process to hand in the final report

- For the independent evaluations, the following procedure applies:
- The evaluator will send a draft of the report to **IPEC DED in Geneva**.
- IPEC DED will send a copy to the principal interested parties for their comments on precise issues for clarifications.
- IPEC DED will consolidate the comments and will send them to the evaluator on the agreed date by the DED and the evaluator or at the moment when all comments from all interested parties have been received
- The final report will be sent to IPEC DED who will officially send it to all interested parties, including the donor.

Resources and Management

Resources

60. The following are the necessary resources for this evaluation:

For the team leader:

- Honorary for an international consultant for 37 working days
- DSA (daily subsistence allowance) in the different localities in the Dominican Republic for a maximum of 25 nights.
- Expenses for two round-trips for the consultant from his place of residency to the Dominican Republic according to the ILO's rules.

For members of the team:

- Honoraries for a national consultant for 25 days
- DSA in the project's localities for a maximum of 5 nights.

Other costs:

- Expenses for the impact study
- Expenses for local trips inside the country
- Expenses for the workshop for stakeholders in the Dominican Republic.
- Additional related expenses

61. A separate detailed budget is available.

Management

62. The evaluation team will report to IPEC-DED in Geneva and will discuss any technical or methodological issues with DED as they may come up. The officials of the IPEC's project in the Santo Domingo office in the Dominican Republic as well as the ILO office in San José in Costa Rica will provide administrative and logistic support during the evaluation mission.

ANNEX 12: List of suggested aspects for consideration

Design and Planning

- Evaluate if the project was designed in a logical and coherent way keeping in mind the institutional arrangements, the roles, the capacity and the commitment of the interested parties.
- Were the lessons from the first phase, and from the sub-regional projects taken into account? (For instance, the sub-regional project, “Prevention and Elimination of the Sexual Exploitation of Underage Persons in Central America, Panama, and the Dominican Republic”; the sub-regional projects of progressive elimination of child labour in the coffee sector and commercial agricultural in Central America and the Dominican Republic; the project for the prevention and elimination of the worst forms of domestic child labour in Central America and the Dominican Republic (Phase I and II); and the regional project, “Elimination of Child Labour in Latin America” funded by the AECID).
- Examine the project’s internal logic (links between objectives achieved through the implementation of activities) and the project’s external logic (the scale with which the project squares with the activities carried out, which will have an impact in child labour)
- To what extent were external factors and the assumptions identified at the time of the design? Were there changes in these external factors and assumptions? If so, what has been the impact in the project’s implementation and in the achievement of the objectives?
- Assess if the problems and needs were adequately analyzed and determine whether the needs, obstacles, resources and access to the project’s services by the different beneficiaries were clearly identified taking into account the issue of gender.
- Was the time frame for the project’s implementation realistic? Was the sequence of the project’s activities adequate?
- What was the relevance of the project’s indicators and their assessment measurements? Please assess the usefulness of the indicators for monitoring and measuring the impact.
- Were the project’s objectives clear, realistic and likely to be achieved within the set time frame and with the assigned resources (including human resources)? Were the immediate objectives realistic?
- What lessons have you learned in the process of creating baselines for the identification of targeted children?
- To what extent did the project design take into consideration existing local efforts in the fight against child labour and how has it strengthened their capacities to combat this issue?

Achievements (Implementation y Effectiveness)

- Has the project achieved its immediate objectives? Has the project delivered its expected results on time and with the appropriate quality and quantity?
- How effective has the project’s strategy for retention, prevention and withdrawal of children and adolescents that work in hazardous conditions been?
- Which have been the mechanisms employed to monitor the project? Please evaluate the use of the Project Monitoring Plans (PMPs) and the monitoring processes or systems, including children that attend school and their working condition. Have the strategies been effective and sustainable?
- How have the recommendations from the midterm evaluation been integrated into the project and what has been its scope?
- How has the project coordinated and collaborated with other interventions that focus on children and adolescents, which are supported by other organizations in the country, including the project funded by USDOL and implemented by DevTech Systems? To what extent have the synergy being exploited and generated scale economies?
- Which elements have contributed the most to the success of the actions developed at the local level?

- What impact has the education component had on the processes of prevention and elimination of child labour?
- How has offering other services to the beneficiaries contributed in the tackling processes? For instance, provide them with birth certificates; offer legal assistance; connections with special programmes such as the Office of the First Lady and *Solidarity*, among others.
- What has been the inclusion of the parents and guardians in the process? What other actions would be important to carry out with the parents in the fight against child labour?
- How has the incorporation of the social and community actors to reduce the tolerance against child labour at the local level been?
- Have the implementing agencies been the most adequate for the action programmes? Were they the most relevant and appropriate ones to carry on the activities? How was the selection of the associated implementing agencies conducted?
- What is the quality and how effective have the action programmes and the research projects been? And how did they contribute to the success of the project's immediate objectives?
- Do action programmes designed under the project complement others; do they show clear links with the project's strategy and the intervention components?
- Evaluate the project's role in supporting the formulation and implementation of the National Action Plan including the mobilization of resources, policies, programs, relations with the partners and activities as part of the project of support to the TBP.
- How has the capacity of the implementing agencies, government institutions, and other relevant local partners been strengthened in the development of an effective action against child labour since the project's activities? Has the capacity of the agencies and community organizations in the Dominican Republic been strengthened to plan, initiate, implement and evaluate actions that prevent and eliminate child labour?
- Examine the preparatory processes and how those have impacted on the project's result.
- Examine how the project has contributed to the establishment of networks among organizations and government agencies that work against child labour at the national, provincial or local levels.
- Identify the unexpected aspects and the project's multiplying features. How have external factors or factors outside the project's management affected the project's implementation? What has been the project's response to unexpected aspects?
- Evaluate how gender considerations were included into the project's activities.
- How effective is the project regarding sensitizing and promoting social mobilization to combat child labour?
- Assess the success of the project in its support to the creation of public policies in areas such as education, job creation, reduction of poverty and the collection of data that integrate the subject of the fight against child labour.
- Evaluate the process of documentation, dissemination and replication of the pilot projects.
- What has been the role of the National Committee in regards to the project?

Project's Relevance

- Examine the validity of the project's approach in its strategies and the potential to be replicated.
- Evaluate if the problems and needs that have triggered the project still exist or whether those have changed.
- Based on the baseline findings, evaluate the validity of the sectors and targeted groups, as well as the localities selected to develop the project.
- How is the project's strategy being applied to the National Action Plan and to other national educational and poverty elimination efforts?
- Does the package of services (IGAs, educational, recreational and mobilization in the community) offered by the project respond to the actual needs of the beneficiaries? Do children, families and communities receive the support they need to protect children and adolescents from the worst forms of child labour?

Sustainability

- Evaluate the possibility that local/national institutions (including the government) might continue carrying out activities relevant to child labour as a result of the project of support.
- Evaluate the project's contributions to strengthening the capacity and knowledge of the interested national parties to grant the partners the leadership of actions against child labour. Please identify the areas where work is still needed.
- Evaluate the degree of the government's participation in the project and how it has strengthened its capacity to continue with future programmes.
- How can the role of key institutional actors be maximized to continue the fight, for instance, the Ministry of Labour, the Ministry of Education and the National Council for Children and Adolescents?
- Has the project promoted the local adoption of the program and its sustainability in the long term?
- Please evaluate the project's exit strategy. Was an exit strategy incorporated since the project's design? What actions has the project taken to articulate this exit strategy?
- Examine if the socio-cultural and gender aspects endanger the programme's sustainability, and if actions have been taken to sensitize local institutions and targeted groups about these issues.

Special Aspects to be dealt with:

- Did the interested parties use the SPIF or any other strategic framework to develop a national plan process?
- How has the project of support been integrated into or coordinated with the National Program for Decent Work? Include recommendations for future integration and joint activities.