

FUNDED BY THE UNITED STATES  
DEPARTMENT OF LABOR

# Independent Final Evaluation of the Combating Child Labor Through Education in Zambia, Phase 2

Jesus Cares Ministries

Cooperative Agreement Number: E-9-K-5-0044



2007

**M** INTERNATIONAL INC.  
MACRO

This page left intentionally blank.

**FUNDED BY THE UNITED STATES  
DEPARTMENT OF LABOR**

## **Independent Final Evaluation of the Combating Child Labor Through Education in Zambia, Phase 2**

Jesus Cares Ministries  
Cooperative Agreement Number: E-9-K-5-0044

**2007**

This page left intentionally blank.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

---

The evaluator would like to commend the entire project team and the backstopping officers at Macro International for their input into the evaluation process. The evaluation team was courteously and even enthusiastically received by all agencies. The interviewees were cooperative and eager to share their experiences, including successes and constraints encountered. The project staff was very helpful and accommodating despite their busy schedule. Thanks for time donated also goes to government officials, educators, representatives of community-based organizations, caregivers, and especially to children for sharing their thoughts and ideas.

### *Note on the Evaluation Process Report*

This independent evaluation was managed by an independent consultant following a consultative and participatory approach.<sup>1</sup> All major stakeholders were consulted and informed throughout the evaluation and its independence was not compromised during the process.

The field mission took place in October 2007. The opinions and recommendations included in this report are those of the author and do not necessarily reflect those of USDOL, Jesus Cares Ministries, or any other organization involved in the project.

*Funding for this evaluation was provided by the United States Department of Labor under Task Order number DOLQ059622437. Points of view or opinions in this evaluation report do not necessarily reflect the views or policies of the United States Department of Labor, nor does the mention of trade names, commercial products, or organizations imply endorsement by the United States Government.*

---

<sup>1</sup> Mei Zegers

This page left intentionally blank.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</b>	<b>iii</b>
<b>LIST OF ACRONYMS</b>	<b>vii</b>
<b>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</b>	<b>ix</b>
<b>I INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>II EVALUATION OBJECTIVES</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>III EVALUATION METHODOLOGY</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>IV PROJECT DESIGN AND RELEVANCE</b>	<b>7</b>
4.1 Adequacy of Problem Analysis	11
<b>V IMPLEMENTATION AND EFFECTIVENESS</b>	<b>13</b>
5.1 Activities and Outputs	14
5.2 Direct Action Program Results	21
<b>VI MANAGEMENT, COORDINATION, AND CAPACITY-BUILDING</b>	<b>41</b>
6.1 Project Management	41
6.2 Project Monitoring	44
<b>VII RESPONSES TO CHANGES IN SITUATION</b>	<b>47</b>
<b>VIII EFFICIENCY</b>	<b>49</b>
<b>IX EQUALITY, GENDER, AND ENVIRONMENTAL ISSUES</b>	<b>51</b>
<b>X SUSTAINABILITY, REPLICATION, AND CAPTURING OF LESSONS LEARNED</b>	<b>53</b>
<b>XI CONCLUSIONS</b>	<b>55</b>
<b>XII RECOMMENDATIONS, LESSONS LEARNED, AND GOOD PRACTICES</b>	<b>57</b>
12.1 Project Design and Project Inception Issues	57
12.2 Awareness-raising	57
12.3 Quality Education	58
12.4 District Cooperation	59
12.5 Community-based Organizations	60
12.6 Management and Monitoring	60
12.7 Sustainability of Project Results, Dissemination	61

## **ANNEXES**

Annex 1: List Of Interviewees

Annex 2: Evaluation Schedule and Site Visits

Annex 3: References-Documents Reviewed

Annex 4: Stakeholder Workshop Agenda and Participant List

Annex 5: USDOL Definitions

Annex 6: Terms of Reference

Annex 7: Principal Outputs and Indicators

## LIST OF ACRONYMS

---

CCLEZ	Combating Child Labor Through Education In Zambia
CHIN	Children in Need Network
CRS	Catholic Relief Services
EI	Education Initiative
GRZ	German Bilateral Aid Agency
IGA	Income-generating Activity
ICLP	International Child Labor Program
ILO	International Labour Organization
IPEC	International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour
JCM	Jesus Cares Ministries
KNH	<i>Kinder Not Hilfe</i>
MoE	Ministry of Education
MoLSS	Ministries of Labor and Social Security
MYSCD	Ministry of Youth, Sport, and Child Development
NCLP	National Child Labor Policy
NGO	Nongovernmental Organization
OCFT	Office of Child Labor, Forced Labor, and Human Trafficking
TEVETA	Technical Education, Vocational and Entrepreneurship Training in Zambia
UN	United Nations
UNICEF	United Nations Children’s Fund
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
USDOL	United States Department of Labor
WFCL	Worst Forms of Child Labor
WFP	World Food Programme

This page left intentionally blank.

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

---

The national nongovernmental organization (NGO), Jesus Cares Ministries (JCM), implemented the second phase of the “Combating Child Labor Through Education in Zambia (CCLEZ)” from 2005 to 2007. The first phase of the project was implemented from 2002–2005. The project is now in its closing stages and was evaluated by an independent evaluator in October 2007. The purpose of the evaluation was to assess the achievements of the project toward reaching its targets and objectives as outlined in the cooperative agreement and project document. The evaluation considered all activities that have been implemented over the life of the project. The evaluation addressed issues of project design, implementation, lessons learned, and reliability; and listed recommendations for future projects.

Key areas of the CCLEZ Phase II project focus included—

- Reducing the number of children engaged in or at risk of entering exploitive child labor.
- Providing educational opportunities (enrollment) and access for children engaged in, at risk of, and/or removed from exploitive child labor, particularly the worst forms.
- Encouraging retention in and completion of educational programs.
- Expanding the successful transition of children in nonformal education into formal schools or vocational programs.

The project also sought to address specific issues identified during the first phase of the project, including empowering caregivers, building capacity of the community child labor committees and the community at large in awareness-raising, implementing project design, enacting implementation and monitoring, encouraging child participation, building the capacity of JCM; and further developing the relationship with government and civil society.

To ensure a thorough evaluation, the evaluator combined a number of methods so that a well-rounded evaluation could be carried out. The evaluation included document review; individual interviews and focus group discussions with stakeholders and project beneficiaries from a wide range of groups; individual and small-group discussions with JCM senior staff in the central office as well as JCM staff responsible for the project in the implementation areas; and discussions with government officials and partners. The evaluator saw the evaluation process as a joint and participative effort to identify the key conclusions that could be drawn in each of the project areas.

The problem analysis carried out prior to project design was adequate. The impact of hunger on successful withdrawal and prevention was underestimated; however, JCM has been able to obtain some support from the World Food Program (WFP) and private sources to provide supplementary feeding in some locations. The ways to address the high demand for education resulting from the effective awareness-raising, while already clear from Phase I, could also have been more clearly analyzed.

The project design adequately supports the four Education Initiative (EI) goals, particularly goals 1–3. The project staff thought that the project purpose and outputs were mostly realistic. During the first phase of the project, JCM overenrolled children because of the large demand. The project tried to define more realistic outputs in CCLEZ Phase II and JCM worked hard to avoid overenrollment and to transition children out of the project into government schools.

The number of children to be withdrawn and prevented from child labor was particularly well defined and realistic in CCLEZ Phase II. The project was able to achieve good results overall in terms of withdrawal and prevention of child labor, particularly in its worst forms. The fact that a national NGO was financed directly is rather exceptional and has proved to be an efficient investment in obtaining results. The number of children who were targeted for withdrawal or prevention through the project was 3,600. The number of children withdrawn or prevented from child labor through the project at the time of the evaluation was 3,518, of which 1,764 were boys and 1,754 were girls; 1,638 children were withdrawn and 1,880 children were prevented.

The aim of the awareness-raising component of the project was quite realistic and mostly well achieved. The project exhibited a good fit with the overall government programs at national and local levels. JCM helped provide the government with a model for withdrawing and preventing children from child labor at the community level through a previous project (Phase I, 2002–2005).<sup>2</sup> Awareness-raising has been so successful that the demand for the education of children in child labor actually outstrips the resources to provide it. The JCM transitional and community schools, as well as the government schools absorbing JCM-transitioned students, lack the capacity to meet the demand.

JCM has come close to or exceeded most of its other targets, with the exception of the economic empowerment of caregivers and communities to continue program activities. The empowerment of community committees and caregivers needs further attention to ensure the internal and external sustainability of project results. The National Child Labor Policy (NCLP) was undergoing editing for legal wording at the time of the evaluation. JCM has an excellent reputation and has been able to sensitize policymaking national institutions on child labor and other child rights issues. JCM is the largest organization working directly in communities in the area of child labor. JCM sits on and plays an important role in the National Child Labor Steering Committee.

The project largely adhered to its workplan as per the results provided in the Technical Progress Reports. The project had to accelerate its implementation of the actions because currency fluctuations necessitated a project revision. JCM has developed a good system for withdrawing and preventing children from child labor.

JCM has developed partnerships with different government agencies, as well as international donors and national NGOs. Despite the good level of collaboration, there are still many challenges at the national level that impede ideal implementation of the project. The low government budget allocations for education result in understaffed government schools with limited infrastructure to absorb the numbers of children transitioning through the JCM schools.

---

<sup>2</sup> The project was also financed by USDOL.

JCM implemented a system of withdrawal and prevention of child labor through JCM-managed community schools, transitional schools, and direct entry into government schools. Children and parents generally felt the quality of the teaching in the JCM-supported schools was good. The teachers were generally well appreciated for the effort they put into teaching and their teaching skills. Several teachers requested training in the psychosocial counseling of children in the transitional and community schools. The main challenge faced in the JCM-supported schools was the high workload of teachers in terms of the number of students. Teachers noted that, despite the support they received from JCM, there was still a shortage of teaching and learning materials in general. The teachers pointed out that the situation was worse in the beginning of the project but has improved over time.

The main goal of the transitional schools is to prepare the children to enter government schools. JCM recognized the problem of integrating children from their community schools into the government schools as a result of lack of space. JCM staff was seriously concerned about the capacity of government schools to meet the demand for most children to be in school. The quality of education in formal schools was consequently compromised due to lack of space. One of the forms of support most appreciated by caregivers has been assistance with the purchase of uniforms and shoes for children transitioning into government schools.

The impact of the quality-focused interventions on teaching children withdrawn and prevented from child labor has been positive. Schools have been assisted with teacher guidelines, other educational materials, and infrastructure support. JCM schools—with most having just one classroom—needed more classrooms to accommodate the large number of students and their different educational levels. More desks were also needed. JCM did improve their schools, as well as some government schools, with sanitary amenities, access to water, etc. In most cases, these improvements were still considered insufficient for the needs of the schools. JCM found funds from a variety of donors, including local government, but no USDOL funds were used for this purpose.

The JCM approach included the promotion of community child labor committees to help raise awareness, identify children for withdrawal and prevention, track absent children, and provide practical sustainable support for JCM actions on child labor. Children themselves were active in peer education. Staff and teachers in the project sites also acted as social workers and were actively involved in all local project actions. JCM started developing community child labor committees during the first phase of the CCLEZ. Committees exist in all project sites but some appear more functional than others. Many committees stated that they received skills-training for economic empowerment, but that they needed more training on awareness-raising and psychosocial counseling. All committees that the evaluation team met indicated that they wished to continue their tasks after the end of U.S. Department of Labor (USDOL) financing even though financing may be a problem to fully support the actions.

A key CCLEZ project component was the development of improved economic empowerment of caregivers to keep their children out of child labor and in schools. A related aspect was the development of greater economic independence of JCM centers by developing Income-Generating Activities (IGAs) to support them. Skills-training have been variable in duration and effectiveness. The cost of effective skills and IGA development has been underestimated. The choice of skills is somewhat adapted to the localities but needs to be more closely matched to the

local labor market or other market needs. At the time of the evaluation, the process of matching skills to the market was still beyond the current capacities of the NGO. Usually specialized agencies and government bodies need to be associated for such an analysis.

JCM management strengths were particularly good in the area of human resource management. Working to coordinate and motivate staff has been largely successful in almost all project sites. The workload of JCM staff was very high, from headquarters to the project sites. Increased monitoring and mentoring of staff in the project sites is needed to ensure their level of initiative remains high. The monitoring tools have been standardized over the course of the past year throughout all of the activities of JCM. The tools were considered sufficiently clear and easy to use. JCM is introducing the monitoring tools to the other NGOs whose capacities they are strengthening through an International Labour Organization–International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labor (ILO-IPEC) project. The project has been very successful in leveraging nonproject resources as compared to many other NGOs.

## **SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS AND LESSONS LEARNED**

One of the key lessons learned was the importance of awareness-raising by going directly into the communities. Using a combination of local formal and informal leaders, teachers, and past beneficiaries has proven to be very effective.

Future project and other actions implemented by JCM would benefit from—

- Continuing to lobby for greater allocation of funds to government schools in low income areas.
- Exploring alternate forms of skills-training that correspond to local labor and economic market needs.
- Identifying more resources for infrastructure and school materials.
- Creating lists of possible sources of funds for local projects and developing an organized fundraising plan. Assist staff and communities with proposal development. Consider bonus from project resources for teachers/social workers who bring additional resources to support local actions.
- Ensuring that skills-training provided is in accordance with local labor and other market needs.
- Increasing emphasis on IGAs to be implemented for the sustainability of community schools.
- Increasing training for committee members so they can continue to support the child labor withdrawal and prevention process after financing ends.
- Strengthening the capacity of these and other stakeholders in accordance with specifically identified needs.

- Increasing continued mentoring and moral support of teachers, other staff, and community child labor committees.

“I come to school and learn so we can be better leaders in the society.”

*(Girl, 12 years old, Katete Community)*

This page left intentionally blank.

# I INTRODUCTION

---

The national nongovernmental organization (NGO), Jesus Cares Ministries (JCM), implemented the second phase of the “Combating Child Labor Through Education in Zambia (CCLEZ)” from 2005 to 2007. The first phase of the project was implemented from 2002–2005.

Zambia has officially recognized the need to decrease child labor, with emphasis on its worst forms, by signing International Labour Organization (ILO) Conventions 138 and 182. Zambia is finalizing the adoption of a National Policy on Child Labor and has integrated important statements on the elimination of child labor in other key strategy and policy documents. The CCLEZ project concentrates on education as a primary means to eliminate child labor as identified by the government and national, as well as international development, partners. The project is now in its closing stages and was evaluated by an independent evaluator. The purpose of the evaluation was to assess the achievements of the project toward reaching its targets and objectives as outlined in the cooperative agreement and project document.

Key areas of project focus include—

- Reducing the number of children engaged in or at risk of entering exploitive child labor.
- Providing educational opportunities (enrollment) and access for children engaged in, at risk of, and/or removed from exploitive child labor, particularly the worst forms.
- Encouraging retention in and completion of educational programs.
- Expanding the successful transition of children in nonformal education into formal schools or vocational programs.

The project also sought to address issues that were identified during the first phase, including—

- **Empowering caregivers** to enable them to sustain the children in school—a workable and specific strategy.
- **Building capacity of the community committees and the community at large** in awareness-raising, project design, implementation and monitoring, and capacity-building for project sustenance (i.e., income-generating activities [IGAs] at community level).
- **Encouraging child participation** at all stages of the project, ensuring peer education.
- **Applying lessons learned**, especially avoiding taking on excess numbers of beneficiaries and premature depletion of resources and overstretched teaching staff.
- **Building the capacity of JCM** in the area of project management, financial management, and income-generating activities for sustainability.
- **Developing further the relationship with government and civil society** for influence, advocacy, and impact.

- **Continuing and improving an effective tracking system** to ensure that beneficiary children complete basic education.

## II EVALUATION OBJECTIVES

---

The project was evaluated by an independent evaluator in October 2007. The evaluation analyzed all activities that have been implemented over the life of the project. The evaluation addressed issues of project design, implementation, lessons learned, and reliability; and listed recommendations for future projects.

As stated in the Terms of Reference: the goals of the evaluation process are to—

- Help individual organizations identify areas of good performance and areas where project implementation can be improved.
- Assist the Office of Child Labor, Forced Labor, and Human Trafficking (OCFT) to learn more about what is or is not working in terms of the overall conceptualization and design of Education Initiative (EI) projects within the broad OCFT technical cooperation program framework.
- Assess the degree to which objectives relevant to the country-specific situation they address have been achieved.
- Assess progress in terms of children's working and educational status (i.e., withdrawal and prevention from the worst forms of child labor, enrollment, retention, and completion of educational programs).

It is important to stress that the evaluation was intended to learn from the past and study how efforts to eliminate child labor can be further improved in the future. This process means learning lessons for other child labor projects in Zambia and the rest of the world. The evaluation concentrates on what should be avoided, what can be improved, and what can be added so that the elimination of the child labor—particularly in its worst forms—can be achieved more effectively.

This page left intentionally blank.

### III EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

---

To ensure a thorough evaluation, the evaluator combined a number of methods so that a well-rounded evaluation could be carried out:

- Document review of direct project-related documents and overall context in Zambia regarding education and child labor issues.
- Individual interviews and focus group discussions with stakeholders from a wide range of groups including national, district, and local education and labor policymakers and providers, local authorities, project partners and associates, community-based organizations, community parents, and children.
- Individual and small group discussions with JCM senior staff in the central office and JCM staff responsible for the project in the implementation areas.
- Individual discussions with the ILO-IPEC, the Chief Technical Adviser, and National Project Officer and Catholic Relief Services staff to learn more about the overall context and project networking.
- Observation of the stakeholders and their work in different settings, as well as their networking actions. The observation was combined with field visits and interviews.
- A 1-day stakeholder workshop where initial findings were presented, discussed, and enriched with additional input from the participants.
- Discussion of the results of the stakeholder workshop with staff and drawing final conclusions with them.

The evaluator first met with senior project staff in Lusaka to finalize the issues to address and obtain their further input into the evaluation process. The evaluator discussed the need for a representative sample of different kinds of actions across the three districts. The sample selected included all USDOL-financed locations with the exception of Solwezi due to time constraints. The evaluator continued to brief senior JCM staff during the field visits to update them on overall progress and general findings.

Senior JCM staff provided an overall briefing of other JCM actions. Meetings were held with representatives of partner NGOs, Children in Need Network (CHIN), and Tasintha.

The evaluator carried out field visits to meet with stakeholders and observe activities in education centers and communities. She also held meetings with various government officials who were involved or associated with project activities.

The evaluator met with senior project staff prior to the stakeholders' workshop to discuss principal findings and obtain comments on the evaluator's presentation. The stakeholders' workshop presentation concentrated on lessons learned and remaining gaps as identified by all the stakeholders. The exact program for the workshop was decided jointly with the senior project staff.

Following the workshop, the evaluator held a final meeting with senior project staff to discuss the overall conclusions of the workshop and the evaluation. Some remaining points were clarified. The project team provided every support that they could, despite their busy schedules.

The evaluator considered the evaluation process as a joint and participative effort to identify the key conclusions that could be drawn in each of the project areas. The evaluator made every effort to exchange ideas regarding impressions and findings throughout the evaluation process with staff. The evaluator and her research assistant were impressed with JCM staff's openness, willingness to be available to discuss, and relaxed attitude toward the evaluation process. Their positive attitude greatly facilitated the evaluation.

## IV PROJECT DESIGN AND RELEVANCE

---

1. *How has the project's design fit into overall government (national, provincial, and/or local) programs to combat child labor and provide education for all?*

“JCM is the largest national NGO working on child labor and is the most recognized in the country for this work.”

### *-ILO-IPEC staff in Zambia*

The project exhibited a good fit with the overall government programs at national and local levels. JCM actually helped provide the government with a model for withdrawing and preventing children from child labor at the community level through a previous project (Phase I, 2002–2005).<sup>3</sup> The project design of the current phase sought to increase and extend the impact of Phase I as well as consolidate its support for national programs on combating child labor.

Government efforts toward addressing child labor are currently concentrated on the development of national policies and strategies through the National Child Labor Policy (NCLP). The NCLP is still in draft format and is currently being debated and edited at senior levels. A separate National Plan of Action on Child Development also refers to the negative impact of child labor. The government used a participatory approach to develop these policies and strategies. JCM contributed information based on their practical experience on withdrawing and preventing children from child labor and providing education. Specifically, JCM is represented on the National Steering Committee on child labor and is on the board of the NGO network: Children In Need. The JCM Executive Director is a Human Rights Commissioner appointed by the president. In her capacity as Commissioner, she speaks on topics ranging from policy issues to print and electronic media in order to influence policy on issues concerning children. In 2007, eight Members of Parliament visited Jesus Cares Ministries centers in Eastern Province and Copperbelt with a view to enhancing and supporting the work of JCM.

The project design also closely supported other government strategies and policies including the Ministry of Education's Strategic Plan 2003-2007.<sup>4</sup> The project supported the Plan's Output 1 “Free basic education for all children;” Output 2.1 “Improved learning achievement in basic schools;” and Output 4.1. “Reduced HIV/AIDS transmission in the school community.” The project provided necessary support to the government through awareness-raising of communities on the importance of education, actively drew children into education, and contributed to improving the quality of education.<sup>5</sup> Education on HIV/AIDS through peer learning activities and classroom teaching contributed to the reduction of HIV/AIDS, including in schools.

The project was in line with the Zambian Government's fifth national development plan, which explicitly mentioned child labor as an issue related to poverty. The fifth national development plan included cross-cutting strategies that will contribute to the alleviation of child labor. The government Child Policy document also covered 10 areas on child rights, one of which is child

---

<sup>3</sup> The project was also financed by USDOL.

<sup>4</sup> Ministry of Education, Zambia (2002)–Strategic Plan 2003-2007.

<sup>5</sup> See Section 5 for details.

labor. Furthermore, the government had a labor policy document with a chapter on child labor. Labor inspectors have also been mandated to verify child labor in the formal sector, although the large informal economy had not yet been included in their work assignments.<sup>6</sup> JCM's actions complement the work of the Ministry of Labor through its identification system of children engaged in child labor in their project communities.

At the provincial level, little has yet been organized at this stage in the process of eliminating child labor. The design of the project provided a good basis for JCM and its stakeholders to provide input into the effective development of District policies, strategies, and actions. At the District level, as part of the Time Bound Program and Project, district child labor committees are being created. The district child labor committees are answerable directly to the President, bypassing provincial authorities.

2. *(a) Does the project design seem to be adequately supporting the four Education Initiative goals? If not, which ones are not being supported and why not? and (b) What major design issues should be brought to the attention of the implementing organization and DOL?*

The four EI goals:

1. Raise awareness of the importance of education for all children and mobilize a wide array of actors to improve and expand education infrastructures.
2. Strengthen formal and transitional education systems that encourage working children and those at risk of working to attend school.
3. Strengthen national institutions and policies on education and child labor.
4. Ensure the long-term sustainability of these efforts.

The project design adequately supported the four Education Initiative goals, particularly goals 1–3. Although the design, particularly after review with support from USDOL-financed consultants, supported long-term sustainability, some aspects for goal 4 could have been improved. Long-term sustainability in terms of continued school attendance of children assisted by the project (internal sustainability) and continued active withdrawal and prevention of future child labor cohorts (external sustainability) requires a review of the design.

The project design included the development of income-generating skills for caregivers and community committees to generate funds so that education could be ensured. The project staff pointed out that, in their opinion, the initial design of skills development actions was adequate. Issues related to currency exchange rate problems had a severe impact on the budget and led to a project revision with a negative impact on achieving the original skills and income-generating activities outputs. The targets were expected to be met over the course of three years, but this had to be reduced to two years. The staff believed that, with more time and money, they could achieve more in these areas. The evaluator notes, however, that the design also underestimated

---

<sup>6</sup> The information in this paragraph was obtained directly from JCM's director. The number of labor inspectors is too small to allow inspection coverage of the entire informal economy.

the complexity and cost of the successful development of income-generating activities overall (see Section 5.2.7. for further details).

The JCM staff noted that there should have been more time allotted in the timeline for involving the community during the planning stage. In several locations, the project built on existing community involvement. In other sites, new child labor committees and new caregivers were associated, and they needed more intensive participatory involvement from the beginning.

The project staff stated that because the design was strongly focused on education, the involvement of the Ministry of Health was more limited than it should have been. The issue of the impact of HIV on vulnerability for child labor and other psychological and physical aspects of commercial child sexual exploitation was underemphasized. HIV/AIDS prevalence is very high in Zambia. Many parents are ill and unable to engage in productive economic work or have already died. Children are forced into child labor to assist in feeding their family when it is struck by HIV/AIDS. Older children are the first to work and bear the psychological burden of nourishing their orphaned siblings emotionally and physically. Younger children often have to share the burden. JCM has tried to address this shortcoming of low attention for HIV/AIDS-related issues by including support from other donors in their actions. Catholic Relief Services and the ILO-IPEC project on HIV/AIDS Induced Child Labor have helped to address the gap by supporting the JCM activities.

3. *Were the project purpose and outputs realistic?*

***Reminder of Project Outputs:***

- Output 1:** Awareness raised on the dangers of child labor and the importance of education.
- Output 2:**
- a. Program JCM community schools strengthened.
  - b. Effectiveness of transition process improved.
- Output 3:** National Child Labor Policy implemented throughout Zambia.
- Output 4:**
- a. Caregivers, youth, and community committees empowered to continue program activities.
  - b. JCM staff, systems, and board and financial autonomy strengthened.

The project staff thought that the project purpose and outputs were mostly realistic. During the first phase of the project, JCM overenrolled children because of the large demand. The project tried to define more realistic outputs in CCLEZ Phase II and JCM worked hard to avoid overenrollment and to transition children out of the project into government schools. In the first year of the second phase, there was still some overenrollment because it was difficult for staff to reject interested applicants for lack of space. JCM addressed this issue by redoubling attention to it, although it continued to be a major challenge to the staff to face families and tell them that there was no space.

The evaluator agrees with the staff's assessment, although Outputs 3 and 4 may have been overly optimistic. JCM is a lead agency on the national policy scene working toward the elimination of

child labor. The complexity of factors influencing the adoption and implementation of the National Child Labor Policy are, however, beyond the direct control of JCM.

Output 4a requires extensive expertise in skills development, micro-enterprise management, and substantial micro-finance input to be successful. Micro-financing is not included in the USDOL-financed project.<sup>7</sup>

The indicators under each of the outputs could have been improved. Some of the indicators only measured the success of the outputs in a limited way or could have been worded differently. An example was Output 4a. In Zambia, the word “empowered” is usually interpreted to mean economic empowerment. The sustainability of the project actions was directly related to the result of Output 4a. As most interviewees indicated, without economic empowerment, sustainability over the long term is a major challenge. The first indicator under Output 4a referred to the “percentage of target communities that have an active committee on child labor.” While having active community committees is vital, it is not sufficient to attain the proposed output. An indicator measuring the extent to which committees were able to mobilize at least some funds for sustaining project activities would have been useful.

“We need so many things here in the school and the committee cannot meet the demand.”

*-Community Committee Member*

The second indicator under Output 4a was “percentage of households that report an increase in the number of meals taken per day.” In nutritional terms, such a measure is usually considered indirect and is to be used only when other measures cannot easily be taken.<sup>8</sup> A more objective measure could be to include a measure of children’s weight for height every six months. Weight for height is an indicator of acute malnutrition and is the first factor to change with improved nutrition. Including such a measure would also strengthen the links to district health services, which could be associated for monitoring weight. JCM has associated services for HIV/AIDS-affected families, but other health aspects could benefit from more emphasis. Section 5.1.1 discusses this aspect in greater detail.

The number of children to be withdrawn and prevented from child labor was particularly well defined and realistic in CCLEZ Phase II. The aim of the awareness-raising component of the project was quite realistic and mostly well achieved in the project locations.<sup>9</sup>

---

<sup>7</sup> It is USDOL policy not to provide financing for micro-finance actions. Agencies need to find other resources to provide micro-finance support for stakeholders.

<sup>8</sup> Davis, J. & Lynd, M. (2004).

<sup>9</sup> See Section 5.2.1 for further details.

## 4.1 ADEQUACY OF PROBLEM ANALYSIS

The problem analysis carried out prior to project design was mostly adequate. The impact of hunger on successful withdrawal and prevention was underestimated, however.

“In a country where children do not have food, it is very hard to fight child labor. This is how they can have a living. Because of hunger, they will do almost anything. If a child is provided food in school, his basic needs will be met and he will not go to beg on the street. This is the core issue.”

*-A Ministry of Education Official*

A project teacher from Ndola hesitantly provided some information about the extent of the problem because he found it shameful. The teacher reported that about one-third of his 105 students complained that they were hungry. In the same community, several elderly caregivers had 5–7 orphans under their care; one blind grandmother had two orphans, while some younger caregivers had 5–7 orphans in addition to biological children of their own to support. In other communities, the situation was not much different.

JCM has been able to obtain some support from the World Food Program and private sources to provide supplementary feeding in some locations. In one meeting with more than 40 caregivers where JCM had thus far been unable to find a source for supplementary feeding, one woman said, “If there could be a way of being assisted with food, these children could really concentrate in school. They need food. Please help with food” (Nansjika community). All the caregivers in the room clapped loudly on hearing this statement. The need for supplementary feeding in schools is an issue mentioned in all meetings with the evaluation team in both urban and rural areas. When JCM found some resources for supplementary feeding, it was much appreciated, with visible impact on attendance and retention. In Ndola city in the Copperbelt Province, a feeding program provided just once a week through a local church already had a strong impact on overall attendance and retention.

The ways to address the high demand for education as a result of the effective awareness-raising, while already clear from Phase I, could also have been more clearly analyzed. JCM staff and committee members all faced this arduous situation. The problem analysis could have gone into greater detail to define the extent of demand and subsequently reduce the geographic area in any one project site that the project could cover. Reducing the geographic coverage area would at least decrease some of the pressure by providing a concrete reason for admitting or not admitting a child to the JCM school.

“It is hard not to go beyond what is required. How do you say ‘no’ to a grandmother raising five orphans because you cannot accommodate them all? How do you tell her, ‘well I can take these two, but not the other three.’?”

*-The JCM Director*

This page left intentionally blank.

## V IMPLEMENTATION AND EFFECTIVENESS

---

*4. What major implementation issues should be brought to the attention of the implementing organization and USDOL?*

Section 5 covers the implementation issues that affected the achievement of project objectives. In summary, the project was able to achieve good results overall in terms of withdrawal and prevention of child labor, particularly in its worst forms. Awareness-raising was largely successful and a start has been made on ensuring JCM's institutional strengthening. The empowerment of community committees and caregivers needs further attention to ensure the internal and external sustainability of project results.

*5. How has the project's choice of target areas impacted project implementation? Has the project encountered any major problems or challenges due to the geographical locations or distance between sites?*

CCLEZ built on the previous project carried out by JCM in most of the same locations. An additional site was added in Solwezi, in the Northern Central area of the country, due to the high level of child labor in the area. The project document indicated that some actions would be undertaken in Chipata town, Eastern Province, but these have not yet materialized. The project did reach its targets in other project sites in the Chipata district.

The JCM headquarters did not have any major problems or challenges due to the geographical locations or distance between the sites. JCM had sufficient vehicles at headquarters for monitoring, although the high cost of fuel was a major impediment.

The Project Coordinator in Chipata town noted that she had transport problems that interfered with her supervision of project sites. No driver or vehicle was allotted to the Chipata office and she considered the amount available to cover the cost of public transport insufficient. JCM did make a vehicle available every few months for site visits and the Project Coordinator was able to visit project sites at that time. JCM responded to the Project Coordinator's complaint with the comment that she demonstrated insufficient personal initiative to visit project sites, a point also reiterated by the District Education Board staff in Chipata town. The Project Coordinator did accompany staff from Lusaka when they came for monitoring exercises in the area every few months. It is difficult to determine the extent to which the lack of transport or the management of the project coordinator in Chipata was a major factor.

Other issues related to transport issues within communities for the purpose of awareness-raising and tracking of absentee children in their homes are discussed in Section 5.2.1.

## **5.1 ACTIVITIES AND OUTPUTS**

6. *Has the project achieved its immediate objectives? Did the project adhere to its work plan? Were the expected outputs delivered in a timely manner, with the appropriate quantity and quality?*

The project largely adhered to its workplan as per the results provided in the Technical Progress Reports. The project had to accelerate its implementation of the actions because currency fluctuations necessitated a project revision. The implementing NGO was allowed to spend its budget in a shorter time period, but expected outputs overall remained the same. It is impressive to note that JCM has been able to withdraw and prevent the targeted number of children for this reason.

The number of children who were targeted for withdrawal or prevention through the project was 3,600. The number of children withdrawn or prevented from child labor through the project at the time of the evaluation was 3,518. Out of this, 1,764 were boys and 1,754 were girls.

Children withdrawn or prevented from working—as street children, 723; in stone crushing, 1,476; and in agriculture, 1319.

Approximately 2,061 students were mainstreamed into the formal system and 1,457 are still in community schools.

JCM has come close to or exceeded most of its other targets with the exception of the economic empowerment of caregivers and communities to continue program activities. The National Child Labor Policy was undergoing editing for legal wording at the time of the evaluation. Details of other outputs are discussed in the remainder of Section 5.

7. *Please assess the effectiveness of the different activities and their contribution to the immediate objectives of the project. Among the project's interventions (awareness-raising activities, enrolling children in JCM centers, working with government officials to improve legislation), which intervention has had the greatest impact on reducing child labor and increasing school enrollment? Which has had the least?*

The effectiveness of the different activities—including awareness-raising, enrolling children in JCM centers, and working with government officials to improve legislation—were effective. It is difficult to determine the extent to which any single activity had the greatest or least impact on reducing child labor and increasing school enrolment. All of these aspects created a certain impetus which, by creating synergy, resulted in favorable outcomes.

Awareness-raising at the community level resulted in school enrollment. The success of children in school, in turn, created greater awareness of other caregivers and children. Some children came to the JCM schools independently to enroll themselves upon hearing their peers were attending.

Supportive government officials and teachers—some of whom have been influenced by legislation still under discussion—added an additional push factor out of child labor and into schools. Direct support from local government has resulted in the allocation of small funds for infrastructure renovation and teacher training in several project sites.

## Policy Development and Governance

8. *What appears to be the project’s impact to date, if any, on (a) individual beneficiaries (children, parents, teachers, etc.), (b) partner organizations (local NGOs, community groups, schools, etc.), and (c) government and policy structures in terms of systemwide change on education and child labor issues? (This question is addressed throughout Section 5.)*

### **National Level**

9. *What have been the major challenges and opportunities, if any, of implementing coordination with the host country government, particularly Ministers of Education and Labor, as well as other government agencies active in addressing related children’s issues?*

“JCM has been a good partner for the government because they have very concrete work to show. You can really see their impact as an NGO. It is a tribute to their efforts to see their results when we go to see them, when they have special festivals and events.”

*-Child Labor Unit Representative, Ministry of Labor*

JCM has an excellent reputation and has been able to sensitize policymaking national institutions on child labor and other child rights issues. The opinions of the different government representatives in the Ministries of Labor and Social Security (MoLSS); Education (MoE); Youth, Sport, and Child Development (MYSCD); and the Commission of Human Rights were all unanimous in this regard. Other partners such as senior staff of ILO-IPEC and NGOs such as Tasintha and the Children in Need Network all supported this point of view.<sup>10</sup>

JCM is the largest organization working directly in communities in the area of child labor. The government acknowledged this fact and invited JCM’s representatives to sit in on a number of significant meetings including the development of national policy documents on child labor. JCM has contributed through formal and informal awareness-raising to the national policy and strategy documents on labor, child labor, the fifth national development plan, and education.<sup>11</sup> JCM also contributed to the Ministry of Foreign Affairs draft policy on child trafficking issues.

JCM sits on and plays an important role in the National Child Labor Steering Committee. The director of JCM is seen as very active on child labor and is well respected. The Director’s status as an activist on human rights has been officially recognized through her appointment as

---

<sup>10</sup> Tasintha works on withdrawing children from Commercial Child Sexual Exploitation, and CHIN is a network of NGOs working on children’s issues. JCM has chaired the CHIN board.

<sup>11</sup> Discussed in greater detail in Section IV.

Chairperson of the Human Rights Commission which monitors the human rights situation in the country. The appointment was generally perceived as an honor and a sign of JCM's good standards for excellence of delivery regarding child labor issues. The Human Rights Commission studies and draws attention to human rights issues in the country with a concentrated focus on a specific issue every year. The Director is frequently invited to speak on radio and television on child rights issues.

JCM has built its reputation by showing concrete results in communities. The agency has worked hard to demonstrate to the government that working with civil society groups is beneficial. JCM invited various government authorities, including members of parliament and line ministry staff members, to visit project sites in a practical and effective awareness-raising initiative.

“We really appreciate their work, I have visited and seen for myself what they do. It is really good. We shared this also with the Director of Education and lobbied with him for additional funding from the government itself.”

*-Ministry of Education Senior Staff Member*

The government has recognized the work of JCM by providing some grants for components of different actions implemented by the organization, which included grants for small scale infrastructure improvement, school education materials, supplementary feeding of a small group of street children, and recreational and sport materials. The government has also provided capacity-strengthening training for some of JCM's teachers on child labor awareness-raising, psychosocial counseling, and teaching skills.

JCM has developed partnerships with different government agencies, as well as international donors and national NGOs. JCM's key government partners are the MoLSS, MoE, MYSCD, and the National Steering Committee on Child Labor. The MoE and MYSCD had a budget line to address child labor. The official custodian for all child issues was the MYSCD, so JCM's effective collaboration with this ministry was of importance.

Despite the good level of collaboration there were still a number of challenges at the national level that impeded ideal implementation of the project. The low government budget allocations for education resulted in understaffed government schools with limited infrastructure to absorb the numbers of children transitioning through the JCM schools.<sup>12</sup> The Ministries also tended to work independently with little collaboration on addressing, for example, health and education in a harmonized manner.<sup>13</sup> Given the major issues of HIV/AIDs, orphans and their propensity to engage in child labor, and poor nutrition factors that influence school attendance, closer collaboration of partners is merited.

JCM has developed a good system for withdrawing and preventing children from child labor. The JCM Director is by far the key spokesperson at the national level creating a high dependence on her personal input. JCM could benefit from capacity-strengthening of other staff in promoting

---

<sup>12</sup> According to the Ministry of Education spokesperson, the budget is small compared to the needs at the community level.

<sup>13</sup> According to the Ministry of Education spokesperson and ILO-IPEC senior staff members.

the mainstreaming of the systems that they have developed. Such capacity strengthening could also contribute to improving project outputs such as Output 3—National Child Labor Policy implemented throughout Zambia.

Various pieces of legislation sometimes contradicted each other; even the definition of the term “child” was different. The JCM Director pointed out that such confusion over definitions interferes with implementation. Arguments can occur over which children have a right to project assistance because of these different definitions.

The timeframe required for finalizing and adopting policies on child labor was seen as a real challenge during project implementation. JCM staff noted that they have worked intensively on promoting the National Policy on Child Labor but are frustrated and reflect that “It has really taken forever.” The staff believed that the government needed to do more to move quickly so that things could really change on the ground.

### ***Provincial- and District-Level Coordination***

At the provincial level, the government has not yet established active coordination of child labor elimination efforts. JCM has, likewise, focused more intensively on the community and district-level coordination. At the district level, the degree of project coordination was variable depending on the degree of initiative of local staff and on government staff turnover.

The JCM Director pointed out that there was often a lack of understanding at the provincial level and district level about what JCM was trying to do. There was a constant need to advocate, partially also because of the high turnover rate among government officials. Officials’ lacked understanding about what the term “Worst Forms of Child Labor” constituted and/or did not understand why a child should not work.

JCM has associated local officials whenever the project has a special function, such as on World Day Against Child Labour. This approach has been found to be effective in raising their awareness. It has also contributed to the visibility of the project because officials often bring the media when they attend events.

Senior staff from Lusaka stopped by to visit district officials whenever they visited the activity at the local level. This practice was confirmed by officials in almost all locations visited by the evaluation team. In Chipata town, the District Education staff noted that they would have appreciated more interaction with JCM’s local project coordinator.

“We want NGOs to see the vision for the government and then they can identify the area where they are to focus on. We also know better who else is doing what, where. We can make sure that there is collaboration on the ground and not some kind of competition.”

***-The District Education Board Secretary***

Mentoring and monitoring the interactions of local JCM staff with District authorities is vital to ensure that such local staff pursues these essential components for sustainable success.

At the district and community levels, JCM has also tried to associate the locally elected councilors and other local authorities by trying to integrate them in the community committees. This association contributed to improved linkage with local government. The degree of interest and support to the committee depended, however, on the level of initiative taken by the individual councilor.

The enforcement of existing laws caused major difficulties at the district and community levels. Laws protecting children from child labor do exist, but JCM has found that they are almost impossible to enforce in some localities, such as in the case of pastoral work. Tradition requires that a male youth have approximately six cows to be able to marry. Boys can acquire cows through herding the cows of others, but it is a long process starting from a young age. Many youth may attain the age of 22 before they have acquired the necessary number of cows.<sup>14</sup>

Specific district-level programs could have provided opportunities for JCM to improve its impact by providing a supportive environment. The government instituted a decentralized district-managed community development fund which, in theory, can be accessed by communities to support local infrastructure development. The need to improve formal and transitional school infrastructure is critical and could have contributed substantially to the success of the project. Such locally initiated projects could have contributed to project Output 2—Effectiveness of transition process improved; and Output 4a—Empowering caregivers, youth, and community committees to continue program activities.

Stakeholders at the local level unanimously agreed that it is almost impossible to access such funds. In only one community—Chiparamba in the Eastern Province—has there been some success in accessing Community Development Funds. Stakeholders believed that the bureaucracy involved is too complicated, long, and politicized.

“We do not even think about applying for this because it is just too unrealistic to get through the red tape.”

*-Committee Member*

The national government has instituted a plan to establish district-level child labor committees with the support of ILO-IPEC. The central government had determined that more collaboration of all stakeholders is needed at the district level. The child labor issues and solutions were also deemed to differ from district to district, making such district child labor committees important for effective impact on eliminating child labor. JCM had contributed to the discussions on these issues at the national level during meetings with national policymakers. At the time of the evaluation, 5 out of 72 districts had started implementing child labor committees. These committees are directly answerable to the President’s office and can be potentially important for the sustainability of CCLEZ outcomes.

In the Chipata District, the evaluation team was able to meet with some members of the district child labor committee. They noted that there are still many challenges in making the committee operational. Confusion about the purpose of the committee exists and the interest of stakeholders is low even at this early stage of establishment. A MoLSS senior staff member bluntly noted that

---

<sup>14</sup> See Section 5.2.1 for a comment by a local youth on this issue.

in the first meeting, there was some interest because there was a general impression that abundant donor funds would arrive to support the committee.<sup>15</sup> Interest quickly decreased when it became apparent that members were expected to participate with little or no material reward. The MoLSS National Child Labor senior staff member explained that committees are expected to mobilize their own funds. He considered this mobilization to be quite difficult because members have to sensitize other committee members, find meeting venues, pay for meeting materials, etc. JCM is expected to be a member of this committee. It will be important to identify means to infuse the committee with motivation to ensure that it will become an effective partner for JCM and the beneficiaries it serves.

Over the long term, the community child labor committees are slated to report directly to the district committees instead of to JCM or other NGOs supporting local actions on child labor. The effective functioning of the district child labor committees will be essential for the community committees.

In one locality, George Compound, Lusaka, Ministry of Health staff assisted by doing checkups of children in the JCM school.

### ***Coordination With Other Agencies Working on Child Labor***

#### *10. What have been the major challenges and opportunities, if any, of implementing in coordination with the ILO-IPEC?*

Representatives of both JCM and ILO-IPEC were very positive about their collaboration. ILO-IPEC staff had a high opinion of the efforts of JCM on awareness-raising and successful withdrawal and prevention of child labor. As evidence of the trust of ILO-IPEC, JCM has received support from ILO-IPEC to implement a new project on HIV/AIDS-induced child labor. The ILO HIV/AIDS project is mostly based in Lusaka and is a pilot program for families affected by HIV/AIDS and at risk of child labor. ILO-IPEC has also associated JCM as the lead agency of a child labor project in the Luapula and Northern Provinces of Zambia. As lead agency, JCM is responsible for the capacity-strengthening of other NGOs that are implementing direct actions on child labor.

“We speak in one voice with them. We all cooperate and attend each other’s main meetings. The exchange is very good.”

***-The ILO-IPEC Chief Technical Adviser***

The JCM staff noted that the knowledge base of the NGOs in which they were expected to strengthen capacities was very low. JCM considered it a major challenge to bring them to a level where they could effectively implement the system developed under the USDOL-supported CCLEZ projects.

---

<sup>15</sup> He agreed that this could be overtly mentioned in the evaluation report.

*11. What have been the major issues and challenges of partnering with other organizations in support of the project?*

One of JCM's strengths was the extent to which it has been able to associate and create synergies of efforts with many different types of partners. These included government agencies, local authorities, donor agencies, international and national NGOs, as well as the community members.

JCM has tried to associate other agencies to support areas that USDOL was not financing, but which appeared crucial to success. Some of JCM's partners included United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF), ILO-IPEC, Kinder Not Hilfe (KNF), United States Agency for International Development (USAID), and CRS. JCM also networked at the national level with national NGOs such as the CHIN and with other NGOs at the local level. Local-level NGO partners do similar work as JCM to integrate children into government schools.

The CRS-supported project mostly used a holistic approach to work on HIV/AIDS with key families in some of the same communities where the CCLEZ project has been working. The project included actions on youth economic empowerment and peer skills in providing basic messages on HIV/AIDS.

Many of the children who were withdrawn through USDOL have become "home-based caregivers" for the CRS project to help communities with families with HIV/AIDS. This approach added to the impact of the USDOL project, especially in Lusaka. In the Eastern province and Lusaka, JCM implemented a Government-World Bank-financed initiative on "Com."

The German NGO, KNH, is financing a child labor project to withdraw 1,500 children in Zambia's Central Province. The project is actually replicating the system developed through the USDOL-financed project, including the monitoring and evaluation tools.

The World Food Programme (WFP) has partnered with JCM to provide one nutritional meal per day at some JCM Community Schools. Such support has proven very beneficial in reducing absenteeism and improving retention rates. The challenge is that WFP support is not permanent. The WFP support was already sorely missed by caregivers in the Chaawama, Lusaka Transitional School, where it was no longer available. UNICEF has provided support to meet some of the school requirements for materials such as textbooks and other learning materials. In some localities, small grants from GRZ (German Bilateral Aid agency) have also been provided.

The NGO Project Concern has been active in supporting JCM in terms of child rights promotion through the provision of training and sensitization through art. The methods were similar to ILO's child labor materials tools package, "SCREAM." Project Concern support was available in some of the same localities as CCLEZ, which provided additional expansion of the impact of the project.

JCM has been collaborating with CHIN on advocacy for child rights at the national level. JCM is on the board of CHIN and has been providing support to overcome some management and strategy development challenges. CHIN representatives noted that a remaining challenge was to increase the exchange of information on the development of minimum standards of care for

agencies that provide support for children. The Zambian NGO, Tasintha, which works on withdrawing and preventing children from commercial sexual exploitation, indicated that they learned much from JCM.

An important internal partner was the Board of JCM. The evaluation team met with members of the JCM Board, which consisted of a variety of individuals, including representatives of the private sector. The Ministry of Education was represented on the board. The board met regularly and provided input into decision making. The board also helped JCM to network, particularly with the private sector.

“The advantage that JCM has is that they have been able to organize themselves properly with a board from the beginning. The board has grown together with the organization. We fulfill more than just governors’ roles. The board helps to keep them on track and this has been very good.”

*-JCM Board Member*

JCM staff correctly identified a challenge regarding the weak linkages with stakeholders, partners, and other implementing agencies in tackling cross-cutting issues such as poverty reduction in order to empower households.<sup>16</sup> JCM tried to link the efforts of its collaborating agencies, but overall cross-cutting issues remained segmented among partners. This challenge existed throughout the country and has also been noted by other stakeholders.

## **5.2 DIRECT ACTION PROGRAM RESULTS**

“Looking back at JCM’s work in Nsanjika and Chiparamba, the children were really well helped. They were so seriously involved in illegal activities at the Malawian border, especially in Nsanjika. Now they are attending school.”

*-District Education Board official in Katete (formerly Chipata District)*

*12. Please assess the effectiveness of the “direct action” interventions—in other words, the educational interventions being provided to the four target groups of children.*

JCM has developed an effective system for creating awareness of the issues of child labor at the community level, motivating caregivers and children to attend school, and subsequently integrating them into formal schools.

“We started first by forming a community forum with representatives of the different stakeholders, including local government, teachers, and community representatives. We then started identifying the children and raising awareness. We involved the parents in this process. We tell the parents the dangers and effects of child labor. We make sure that parents give importance to schools. We identified the number of children not in school. There were over 320 children, but we could not support them all.

---

<sup>16</sup> Technical Progress Report of February 2007.

We supported them in batches. The children stay here for six months to one year.”

*-Chaawama Transitional School Teacher, Lusaka*

The evaluation team verified the means used to identify children in the different project sites to gain a greater understanding of the methods. Children and caregivers said that they were identified using different means, i.e., through community committees, local church outreach, peers of caregivers, and other children. Some children stated that they presented themselves upon having heard from other children or watching children they know walk to school.

The teacher in the JCM Chaawama Transitional School described the typical additional steps of the JCM strategy. During a child’s education in a transitional school, the teacher starts to determine how to transfer and integrate the child into formal government schools. The children in the JCM schools do not wear uniforms, but are provided with uniforms by the project for their first year in the government school. Caregivers considered the provision of the uniforms key to the successful strategy of JCM. The cost of uniforms and school shoes formed one of the main impediments to sending children to school, so this support was considered important. The JCM teachers carried out follow-up tracking to ensure that children were able to integrate into the formal schools and adapt. JCM also required that its teachers use tracking monitoring forms to be able to report the retention of the children in the transitional and government schools.

The necessity to continue to mentor and provide backstopping to stakeholders after initiating activities is an important challenge JCM faces. Monitoring alone is not sufficient to ensure continued high-level results. Field staff such as teachers as well as some community committee members noted that they need more intensive moral support accompanied by mentoring of their work in the field. This support is particularly important where there is a high reliance on volunteers and individuals receiving small salaries.

Many of the children in the project frequently came from very difficult backgrounds. Stakeholders stated that children had often been abused, were from very poor families, and needed psychological support through psychosocial counseling.<sup>17</sup> Teachers in some of the project sites reported that they had participated in a workshop to learn psychocounseling techniques, while others determinedly requested such training.

## **Awareness-raising**

“The vision for JCM came from the heart. It is compassion. It is more than a project, it is a calling. Because of that, there is a real commitment. There is such great joy when I can touch the life of the child and see what is happening in the community as a result of our project.”

*-JCM Director, a talented and eloquent advocate on child labor*

---

<sup>17</sup> Psychosocial counseling is the term used in Zambia for providing psychological support to children and adults by nonspecialized but trained staff.

One of JCM's greatest strengths has been in the area of awareness-raising. JCM and its partner stakeholders such as the community committees, caregivers, traditional leaders, and church authorities have been successful in motivating the school attendance of working children. Success has been such that the demand for the education of children in child labor outstripped the resources to provide it. The JCM transitional and community schools, as well as the government schools absorbing JCM-transitioned students, lacked the capacity to meet the demand.

At the national level, JCM has been able to continue to build on its effective contributions to awareness-raising. JCM was able to point to the successful withdrawal and prevention of child labor in a very practical way. The personal authority of the JCM Director and commitment of senior staff contributed to the recognition of child labor as an important issue to address.

At the district level, awareness-raising was variable depending on the location. Frequent turnover of government staff meant that JCM needed to intensify its efforts to create awareness and maintain strong communications on a regular basis. Regardless of the overall success, children pushed for even more awareness-raising.

“To get more children in the school, we all need to tell even more people in the community about the dangers of child labor. We need to go to more places where children are working and tell them about the importance of school.”

*-Children in Chaawama Transitional School*

Awareness-raising at the community level was the primary responsibility of JCM teachers and community child labor committees. It should be noted, however, that other mechanisms—word of mouth, church, and traditional leaders—have also been beneficial in spreading the word. JCM is perceived as going where the government cannot, that is, deeply into the communities to identify the children and assist them. One of the challenges has been the turnover in the community committees and, in some cases, of teachers.

“We were sensitized on how to approach the community about child labor. That was before these new people joined the committee.”

*-JCM Committee Member*

New committee members and recently hired teachers reported that they were not trained on awareness-raising methods by JCM. They stated that they just tried to use their own experience to convince people, which they found difficult. Mechanisms used to pass techniques from old to new committee members did not appear to be effected. Some committee members and teachers said that they needed organized training on how to approach and convince caregivers.

Committee members in Lusaka and Eastern Province complained that people in the communities were initially very reticent and distrustful of outsiders. In some areas, particularly in the Eastern part of the country near the border area with Malawi, trafficking is a major concern. Project staff also noted that people in this area were suspicious of people who want to influence them. According to child labor committee members, community dwellers were fearful that strangers wanted to either engage in child trafficking and were sometimes referred to as “Satanists.” The

community gradually came to understand that the project staff members were neither “Satanists,” nor did they wish to traffic children. The staff and committees were able to convince a few caregivers to send their children to the JCM school. Other caregivers began noticing the benefits accruing to the children attending the school, and realized that there was no danger to their children. People in the communities always, rightly, asked for identification. The committee members said they needed more materials such as T-shirts with messages and written advocacy materials that they could distribute to support their assertion that they work for the project. Based on her previous experience and the observation that it is common to wear such T-shirts and distribute advocacy materials in Zambia, the evaluator agrees with the project staff’s assertion that such materials would help lend them credibility.<sup>18</sup>

Another problem mentioned by some committee members was the concern raised by many caregivers that children who have attended school do not find employment and just roam in the streets. Committee members said they were only able to gradually build up the confidence of some caregivers. Once other community members saw that children were benefiting from education, more parents sent their children to the JCM centers.

All committees and some social workers and teachers noted that they needed more assistance with transport. JCM provided bicycles to teachers to be shared by committee members during the first phase of the project, but many of these were in poor or unusable condition or have been stolen. Individuals associated with awareness-raising and tracking of absent children often need to walk very long distances. Several interviewees noted that they spend the whole day tracking those absentees. Bicycles are not always the solution as in some places roads are very uneven, the countryside is hilly, and/or the health of the individual does not allow long bicycle rides. In such cases, the interviewees requested at least some small support in the form of a transportation allowance.

In high-density locations, new strategies need to be developed to extend the reach of the teachers and committee members. In one Lusaka site, for example, a committee member stated that more extensive strategies would be needed to reach the 112,000 people residing in their low income area. The committee member insisted that he felt the number of children reached was really too small.

JCM has trained children to reach out to their peers on the issue of child labor and other issues such as child abuse, children’s rights, and HIV. Three JCM-supported children went to Uganda to share their knowledge at an international conference with the support of the local chapter of an African NGO. Children participated well in sensitization and peer education overall, although in some locations, children said they could not mention any poems, songs, or other forms of messages on child labor.<sup>19</sup> The latter children were, however, personally articulate on the importance of eliminating child labor.

---

<sup>18</sup> In one community, the committee members also asked for umbrellas or raincoats and gumboots to use during the rainy season.

<sup>19</sup> E.g., as stated by one child in the community of Kagoro, “We are not doing any peer awareness-raising. We do not know any poems or songs about child labor. We just learned from our friends about how devastated they are not to get the opportunity to go to school while we do go. That is how we know about the dangers of child labor.”

JCM has provided training to teachers on the child labor awareness-raising syllabus that was developed by the MoE. Unfortunately, not all current teachers said they had benefited from the training. Teachers in the project have also been provided with ILO's SCREAM toolkit for peer awareness-raising. JCM staff stated that they do find the SCREAM toolkit very good, creative, and effective.

Aside from awareness-raising on the importance of education, several stakeholders noted the effectiveness of messages on child labor. One interesting aspect is related to the commonly held notion that boys in some areas prefer to work as herders so that they can earn cattle for later payment of bridal prices purposes. In fact, one boy stated that this is a misconception as far as he and his friends see it. He pointed out that the main reason was not "that we prefer herding to earn cattle for marriage but because we just need to work for money." He also insisted that some boys decide to work for a while to earn a cow and sell it so they can afford to go to school. One youth, currently in grade five, said he was a case in point for this situation.

Some committee members also indicated that certain issues, such as early child marriage, are now considered to be hidden forms of child labor by caregivers in some project locations. Other forms of child labor, such as stone crushing and commercial child sexual exploitation, were already commonly recognized as unsuitable but necessary for survival. The awareness-raising on stone crushing and commercial child sexual exploitation concentrated effectively on the fact that there were alternatives through education. A main issue raised during the evaluation was the necessity to identify means to support the children in the short term while they attended school, Section 5.2.7 discusses this aspect in more detail.

## **Nonformal Education**

"I like to come here so that we can live better lives in the future."

*-13-year-old girl attending a transitional school*

JCM implemented a system of withdrawal and prevention of child labor through JCM-managed community schools, transitional schools, and direct entry into government schools. In Zambia, there were community or NGO-managed "community schools," particularly at the primary level, that served to supplement the government schools. Government schools were unable to meet the demand, so communities and NGOs have moved to try to fill the gap.

JCM is operating a number of community schools, such as the one at Mtendere community in Lusaka city. JCM is also running transitional schools in Eastern Province and Copperbelt, although these have sometimes been informally converted to community schools in practical terms. The transitional schools were intended to provide a point for working children to learn to adapt to attending school and to make up for lost education for a period of six months to one year. In practice, because of lack of space in government schools, many children stayed longer in the transitional schools than was intended. Some children reported being in the transitional school for as long as three years. In some cases, children with special needs were also identified in the transitional schools, where they were retained for lack of suitable alternatives.

In Nsanjika community in Eastern Province, children were transitioned from child labor directly into government schools. This approach has actually been successful in Nsanjika due to the interest and support of the stakeholders, including teachers, community committee, and caregivers. Children and parents generally felt the quality of the teaching in the JCM-supported schools was good and the children learned a lot.

“The school is good, children are benefiting a lot. The children are spending time in school and their lives have been restored.”

*-Local Caregiver*

The teachers were generally well appreciated for the effort they put into teaching and their teaching skills. Children and caregivers also noted that the quality of the education was actually better in the JCM schools than in the government schools. The evaluation team interviewed government school teachers and children who had already transitioned into some government schools in several locations. The teachers noted that sometimes the children had difficulties adjusting, but the problems were more related to the psychological and social background of the children as opposed to their educational status. Children themselves felt that their educational level was actually higher than that of children in their government school class after transitioning. Project technical progress reports also indicated that children in the JCM centers tended to do comparatively well scholastically.

In only one location did caregivers complain of the quality of teaching, but this was attributed to the teacher’s inability to adequately teach the large number of children. Children in this school sit four to a bench meant for two students.<sup>20</sup>

The Zambian Government has instituted a regulation that all teachers in community schools be qualified and certified. The salaries of teachers in community schools, including those in the JCM-supported schools, are substantially lower than those offered by the government.<sup>21</sup> JCM is often only able to attract young, sometimes still unqualified, or retired teachers as a result. Despite their youth, however, it is quite impressive to note that the quality of teaching appears to be reasonable in the JCM schools.

A special government training program to enable all teachers in community schools to obtain teaching certificates is currently being implemented. Several of the teachers in the JCM centers were enrolled in this training program on a part-time basis.

Attendance in the JCM-supported schools was boosted by any type of supplementary feeding program.<sup>22</sup> In Lusaka, for example, teachers reported that children engaged in stone crushing attended the school only irregularly. After JCM was able to obtain supplementary feeding support from WFP, attendance was substantially improved.

---

<sup>20</sup> Kagoro Community, Eastern Province. The problem is also partially due to a lack of classrooms so that children can be divided into multiple sessions.

<sup>21</sup> Salaries are about 50 percent of government teachers’ salaries.

<sup>22</sup> Discussed in greater detail in Section 4.1.

Several teachers requested training in the psychosocial counseling of children in the transitional and community schools. Some teachers had received such training and stated that it was very useful to them when assisting the children with their problems. Many of the children came from abusive households, were orphans, or were engaged in the worst forms of child labor. The ability to assist these children to cope with their trauma was considered vital to teachers and other project staff.

One project coordinator in the JCM center at Mtendere, Lusaka, vividly described the need and effect of the psycho-social counseling, “We try to go where the child is playing and begin to chat, we try not to do it in a formal way. Before you know it, they will tell stories, they will tell you everything. Sometimes they will not tell you anything while playing, but the next day they come and want to tell you a secret. Their stories are very painful. They do not want anyone to know.” She continued to explain that repeated counseling and support has already helped numerous children to cope and integrate with other children in the center. In other project sites such as at Katete, Eastern Province, teachers also expressed their appreciation for the usefulness of the psychosocial counseling training that they had received. Teachers who had not received such training spontaneously requested it.

Children who have lived on the streets or worked in worst forms of child labor were initially perceived as problematic by other students. Some of these children were prone to fighting and used abusive or violent language. Intense counseling and guidance was needed, but teachers noted that eventually such children did manage to fit in, particularly during class hours. Teachers noted that a casual observer would not be able to tell the difference between the former street children and others, as long as they were in class. Sometimes the former street children would revert to their previous behavior outside of class, which indicated that the level of emotional stress such children have experienced is difficult to surmount completely.

The main challenge faced in the JCM-supported schools was the high workload of teachers in terms of the number of students. According to Zambian Government standards, teachers are supposed to teach 40 pupils per class for six hours per day.

One JCM teacher explained that he teaches three sessions of children per day. Each session has a class of approximately 50 children for a total of 150 students per day. Another teacher notes that he teaches 128 children per day. In government schools, however, the workload is quite similar.

One aspect, often overlooked, is that the children in transitional schools do not all have the same scholastic level. Many of the children are being re-integrated into schools after having dropped out previously, so their levels are variable. The challenge of addressing their different needs is quite great. In most locations, teachers have to engage in multigrade teaching as a result, which is a detriment also. Teachers and classes have to share a single classroom as a result of lack of space.

The number of class contact hours often has to be reduced to around three hours per day to accommodate the high number of students per teacher and to avoid the mixing of many grades. In Ndola in Copperbelt Province, for example, two teachers handled several groups in one classroom. One session included children in grades 1 and 2. Another session covered children in grades 3 and 4, while a final session of the day comprised children in grades 5 and 6. The

number of contact hours was limited to two real teaching hours for the lower grades and three hours for grades 5 and 6.<sup>23</sup>

One teacher at Ndola noted that it was essential to increase the time spent with the children to ensure that each pupil acquired the knowledge that they needed. He indicated that many children have no time to study at home because their parents still give them different types of work. Such children also needed some individual attention so that they would not lag behind the other students.

Teachers also complained that, despite the support they received from JCM, there was still a shortage of teaching and learning materials in general. Textbooks, teachers' manuals, children's exercise books, and learning aids were not sufficient to meet the needs. The teachers pointed out that the situation was worse at the beginning of the project, but has improved over time.

Another challenge was the fact that the JCM-supported schools were unable to absorb all of the children from the community who were actually presented to them. One elderly woman attended the meeting with the evaluation team only in the hope that she could push for entrance into the school for the three orphans she was looking after. It was very painful for the staff to look at such caregivers and deny entrance to such children, particularly in the case of orphans.

In Nsanjika, there was a community school that was funded by CARE International. The government school supported by JCM said that they did not really know what was happening in that school because they were not associated. JCM did not support a community school in Nsanjika, so children were supported directly within the government school. The teacher stated that they were aware that the CARE-supported school also had a community committee, but that there were no links with the JCM-supported community child labor committee. It is important for efforts to be undertaken so that at all levels—national, provincial, district, and community—communications are opened between all actors working toward the same goals.

Zambian law has regulated that corporal punishment in schools is illegal. Teachers are reprimanded and may lose their employment. Despite such laws, corporal punishment is widely used throughout the school system. JCM and USDOL have a very clear “no tolerance of corporal punishment policy.” In the largest JCM center, at Mtendere in Lusaka, there is no corporal punishment. A child at Mtendere spontaneously and without prompting on punishment stated: “We like our teachers; they do not beat us or even pinch us.” In some JCM-transitional schools, however, children reported being hit if they miss classes or arrive late.<sup>24</sup> Children did not report any abuse beyond being hit a few times and nothing that might constitute mindless violence was mentioned. Control over corporal punishment was easier in the large JCM centers such as at Mtendere because of greater accessibility for supervision. In other locations, control over corporal punishment was more difficult because JCM supervisors could not monitor the situation on a day-to-day basis. Stopping the use of corporal punishment is a great challenge and difficult

---

<sup>23</sup> The number of hours cited here does not include the time allocated for breaks.

<sup>24</sup> It should be noted that as a result of these reports from children of corporal punishment in some JCM schools, USDOL requested that immediate action be taken in the form of a formal investigation by JCM into the reports. An investigation was completed by JCM, which resulted in the dismissal of a staff member as a JCM transitional school at George compound. In addition, JCM immediately reported the allegations and their findings to relevant authorities.

for JCM to handle, despite their existing efforts to stop it. It is particularly difficult because of a general attitude among the population that corporal punishment is an accepted form of discipline.

Children have, however, also learned to fight for their rights in some instances. JCM has worked with children to become more aware of their rights and this is having some effect. The fact that some children reported corporal punishment to the evaluation team is already evidence of their awareness and confidence. Some children in Ndola Copperbelt province also related an experience they had after they transitioned from a JCM-sponsored school to a government school. The children had some problems with their new teacher in the government school. The teacher used to drink beer, even in class, and would beat the children when he was drunk. One of the students told his caregiver grandfather, who accompanied him to complain to the headmaster. The student was proud to relate that the intervention was a success because the teacher was suspended and replaced.

Some children and caregivers considered the JCM community school option preferable to the government schools. Reasons cited included even greater lack of space in government schools, long walking distance to government schools, and lack of long-term resources to pay for uniforms. Some special needs children and those with psychosocial counseling needs can be better cared for in the community schools. The high commitment of teachers, involvement of community committee members, and the interest of caregivers in the community schools were also viewed as being of better quality.

“The schools have received the children but we have nowhere to put them.”

*-Department of Education, Katete*

## **Formal Government Schools**

The main goal of the transitional schools is to prepare children to enter government schools. While this may seem straightforward, this is a major difficulty. As the official in the Department of Education Board indicated, one of the challenges for JCM is this transition into government schools.

A related aspect is the stigma perceived by adults and some children attached to children who attended community schools. Interestingly, children who have transitioned sometimes disagreed with this point of view. They believed that their scholastic level was actually higher than that of the other students in their grade, so they had few difficulties being accepted. Children provided the evaluation team with comments such as:

*“I felt very good and didn’t even notice any difference between us and them, we were actually more advanced than they were”; “The teaching is a bit different, they are behind us there”; and “I felt different there, the place is so big and there were so many classes, but I wasn’t frightened.”*

JCM also recognized the problem of integrating children from their community schools into the government schools as a result of lack of space. JCM staff members were seriously concerned about the capacity of government schools to meet the demand for most children to be in school.

The quality of education in formal schools was consequently compromised due to lack of space.<sup>25</sup> At the same time, the project design correctly required that children be transitioned into government schools as much as possible. Transitioning children in the government schools enabled JCM to avoid over enrollment in its own centers and receive new cohorts of former child laborers. JCM has been largely successful in pushing for transitioning, and is only limited by the ability of government schools to absorb the transitioned children.

The Zambian Government formally guarantees free primary education. In practice, however, there are still costs to be covered, including uniforms, books, pens, and financial support to the Parents Teacher Association for school infrastructure development. Uniforms are actually not obligatory in government schools anymore, but it is still standard practice to wear them. The government schools are understaffed and lack teaching materials and adequate water and sanitation.

“The formal education sector is very weak despite the millions pouring in. The education system was very badly allocated in the late seventies. They had one of the best education systems but all that crumbled totally and completely. The government budget for education is one of the lowest in Africa. The pass rate for government schools right now is less than 40% for all grade 7.”

*-ILO-IPEC staff member*

One of the forms of support most appreciated by caregivers has been assistance with the purchase of uniforms and shoes for children transitioning into the government schools. JCM was only able to provide such support through the project for the first year that a transitioned child attended the government school. Caregivers said that it was very difficult for them to ensure uniforms for their older children and transitioned children entering subsequent grades. Teachers and community committee members observe that it is one of the main challenges to ensuring that children do not return to child labor.

In some communities, caregivers also complained about the distribution of the promised uniforms and supplies. Uniforms were ordered by the JCM school in accordance with the numbers expected to transition, but these numbers sometimes increased after they were submitted to JCM headquarters. Caregivers said that uniforms and shoes came in the wrong sizes and that some children received only uniforms but no shoes, while some got nothing at all. In one location, caregivers complained that some formal school teachers and other community members allocated uniforms to children not with JCM. JCM regulations require that a staff member supervise the distribution, but it appears that in this particular location, this did not occur.

Lack of government funding in the education sector led to a temporary halt in hiring new teachers. The government has, fortunately, decided to hire an additional 6,000 teachers this year, although that is still insufficient, partially because of the death rate of teachers due to HIV/AIDS.

---

<sup>25</sup> Jesus Cares Ministries, Response to Comments and Clarifications by DOL on JCM Technical Report, May 2006.

“For us to withdraw the children from child labor, we need to give them time after school to play.”

*-Committee member*

## **After-School/Extracurricular Activities**

Teachers and community child labor committee members frequently stated that it was important to occupy children as much as possible after school to avoid them entering into child labor during their nonschool hours. After-school activities are particularly important because the number of actual school contact hours is limited, so time available for other activities is quite great. One committee member also indicated that, particularly in Lusaka, children may be involved in illicit activities involving drug abuse, vandalism, and other crimes simply because they loiter where they should not.

JCM provided some recreational materials with the support of the Ministry of Sports and other agencies but this was still limited compared to the actual need. Beyond providing items such as footballs, it would be useful to increasingly involve volunteers from among the local church youth or other groups to help organize sports teams. Locations for children to play and their free use are often limited and need to be explored more. Many parks have been abandoned or encroached upon, particularly in urban areas. Games that require less expensive materials can also be added to the collection of recreational activities. One boy suggested that more recreational facilities be built at the JCM school itself for security reasons.

## **Improvement of Quality in JCM-supported Community Schools**

*13. What has been the impact of the quality-focused interventions, if any, on withdrawal and prevention of children from child labor and their enrollment, retention, and completion of education programs?*

The impact of quality-focused interventions on teaching children withdrawn and prevented from child labor has been positive. Schools have been assisted with teacher guidelines, other educational materials, and infrastructure support. The quantity of such support needed is very high, particularly with respect to infrastructure and the need to decrease the student-teacher ratio. To fully meet the needs, JCM requires a much larger budget, although it has been able to have strong results with the limited resources at their disposal.

JCM employed an education specialist who worked with the NGO to develop materials for the teachers to use in preparing children for transitioning to formal schools. During the first phase, the specialist also worked with specialists from the U.S. and Zambia to develop these materials for Zambia. The materials were considered effective and useful. The MoE also provided some training for the JCM community school teachers, although not all teachers were included in training.

The education specialist noted that his time for mentoring the teachers during the current phase of the CCLEZ project was limited by his responsibilities as a professor at the University of Zambia. The specialist indicated, however, that his experience with JCM has greatly helped to improve his practical input into the teaching of new teachers at the university. The education specialist noted that the teachers in the government schools were unused to teaching former child

laborers. The educational specialist spent time in the communities and found that the child laborers were a totally different type of child than most teachers were used to teaching.<sup>26</sup> Many teachers were also apprehensive about getting these children in the class because they were often older than the other children. The MoE official interviewed by the evaluation team pointed out that psychosocial counseling should be integrated into the teachers' in-service training curriculum so that teachers are all trained.

The number of teachers that could be employed with the small CCLEZ project budget was inadequate. Although the level of the children transitioning into the government schools was considered relatively good compared to those already in the government schools, this was really relative. The education being offered in the government schools was mostly insufficient.<sup>27</sup>

It is important that JCM redouble efforts to identify new teachers with certificates. The low salaries that JCM can offer form an impediment, so alternatives also need to be studied. Retired teachers are a good source of experienced teachers, as was evident from the level of initiative and commitment of the JCM teacher in Chiparamba, Eastern Province.

### ***Effect of Infrastructure on Education Quality***

The quality of education was highly influenced by the infrastructure needs in the schools, a fact already discussed in Section 5.1.1. Children, teachers, caregivers, and community child labor committee members all agreed that JCM schools—with most having just one classroom—needed more classrooms to accommodate the large number of students and their different educational levels. More desks were also needed.

JCM did upgrade its own schools as well as some government schools with sanitary amenities such as toilets, water pumps, roofing, paint, and other infrastructure support. Some of the funding was provided through local government and/or private sources on the initiative of the project staff. No project funds were used. In most cases, these were still considered insufficient for the needs of the schools.

Lack of security in the urban areas of Lusaka and Ndola were perceived as a major problem by the stakeholders. The evaluation team noted windows broken by vandals in JCM community schools in these locations. Caregivers and children blamed drunken youth who wildly throw stones at the windows while passing by. Walls and fences are required to protect the schools, although the cost for such improvements is too high to be covered from JCM's budget.

Other requests from stakeholders were to add a library so children could practice reading and learn about more subjects.

In Chiparamba, JCM was actually renting a building from the District Council for the CCLEZ project. Given that JCM was providing a service to the community, it was sad to realize that the payment of rent was required. In Chipulukusu community, Ndola, Eastern Province, JCM and the community committee were able to negotiate for the allotment of land from the District to build a school. Lack of funding for the building has, so far, made this option prohibitive. JCM

---

<sup>26</sup> A module on child labor has been integrated into new teacher training courses.

<sup>27</sup> Failure rates are high, as has been noted in Section 5.2.3.

has been given an ultimatum by the local authorities for rapid construction on the site which, if not undertaken soon, would be withdrawn from availability.

Caregivers and community committee members in many communities insisted that they were ready to donate their labor and help to mold blocks to make school buildings with JCM. They were frustrated, however, by the fact that they still needed some financial support to pay for the cost of roofing. JCM has, so far, not yet been able to find funding to cover all of these costs.

One of the challenges faced by JCM was that because they have to rent buildings so it is difficult to invest in such spaces. JCM has undertaken major efforts to acquire land and buildings through private donations and purchase of buildings at reduced cost with some success.

## Community Partnerships

*14. (a) What have been some of the challenges and issues in working with local-level organizations? (b) In what stage of development are any community partnerships and what is the likelihood that these will endure in the long term? (c) How effective has the project been at stimulating interest and participation in the project at the level of children, parents, teachers, administrators, and other local actors? Please seek the viewpoints of parents, teachers, students, community members, and education officials.*

“As the chairman, I want to express our gratitude that you have found us and for the help that you have provided...”

*-Committee chairperson, Copperbelt<sup>28</sup>*

The JCM approach included the promotion of community child labor committees to help to raise awareness, identify children for withdrawal and prevention, track absent children, and provide practical sustainable support for JCM actions on child labor. Teachers noted that when they call a community meeting the parents are “very faithful and they do come.” Many caregivers were directly involved and their interest in project actions was in full evidence by the fact that large numbers came to meet the evaluation team. At least 75 people came for the caregivers meeting in one of the locations, with high figures in all the other sites.

Children themselves were active in peer education and were generally not shy to speak to outsiders, such as the evaluator. Children in some locations were even fighting to be selected to participate in the focus group discussions with the evaluation team. Staff and teachers in the project sites also acted as social workers and were actively involved in all local project actions. The level of their personal initiative varied somewhat, but this may be considered normal in any agency.

JCM also associated local government administrators as has been discussed in Section 5.1.1. The degree of their involvement largely depended on the level of initiative of the JCM staff in the project sites. Overall, however, local administrators were positive about JCM activities and were involved in supporting them in different ways. Administrators facilitated transition into

---

<sup>28</sup> The evaluator pointed out that she was not responsible for the support provided, but that she would pass the message onto the USDOL.

government schools and, in some localities, supported the disbursement of government funds for small-scale infrastructure projects from MoE budgets.

JCM started developing community child labor committees during the first phase of the CCLEZ. Committees existed at all project sites, but some appeared more functional than others.<sup>29</sup> Few of the members from the first phase were still in the committees. During the first phase, JCM adopted the strategy of including mostly local authorities and community leaders. It was noted, however, that their interest lagged at times, while caregivers of children enrolled in the project were highly motivated to participate in the committees. As a consequence, JCM promoted the participation of higher numbers of caregivers on the committees during the second phase. While JCM indicated that members were self-selected, in one community, caregivers complained that members were appointed by JCM representatives, although this appeared an exception.

“We had elections for the committee members. Even the pastor was elected. There were a lot of people who contested to be on the committee. People saw that it was really good to be involved.”

*-A community committee member in Ndola, Copperbelt Province*

JCM continues to strive to ensure representation of important local leaders from government, government line department, and churches. A number of committees also included government school teachers, retired teachers, or even youth leaders from the community. In some localities, women were highly visible on the committee, but in others, fewer women came to meet the evaluation team.

Although the inclusion of caregivers on the committee can be good, some stakeholders pointed out that this also has a negative side. After the children under their care transition to formal schools, many lose interest so “committees come and go and there is no continuity.” (Caregiver)

The level of activity of the community committees is somewhat uneven. In some places where JCM has a strong existing infrastructure, such as at Mtendere (Lusaka), the committee appeared to be less well informed. This situation may have arisen because JCM had a well-organized center at Mtendere and there was less need for community input in day-to-day functioning. In other localities, the committees appeared active and were well aware of the challenges and benefits accruing from the CCLEZ project. Committees were able to articulate the importance of combating child labor and their own roles in the effort to eliminate it. In some project sites, the committees met more often than quarterly, while in others they admitted it was hard to get all members together. Like in any club or association, most committees had a core group of active members who were more involved and committed.

JCM provided capacity-building for the committees in the first phase of the project, but in the second phase, capacity-building for actions on child labor was seen as somewhat limited. Many committees stated that they received skills-training for economic empowerment, but they needed more training on awareness-raising and psychosocial counseling. In most locations, there have already been at least two different committees. While the first committees have received some

---

<sup>29</sup> Given the short duration of the evaluation, it was impossible to access the *exact* level of activity of each of the committees. In most locations, there was some level of action.

training, many newer committee members state, that they have not received training or mentoring on awareness-raising. In committees with mixed membership—i.e., old and new members—the older members provided some guidance to the newer members.

On one committee, members said that they do not consider themselves sufficiently trained on how to work with the community and want training on this subject. Sometimes the community members did not accept them and they found it difficult to approach the community members and determine how to talk to them. Specific training requested by committee members was on leadership, conflict resolution, and community awareness-raising.

Community committees implemented needs assessments in the communities and brought important issues to the attention of JCM. Some of the problems they identified included violence against women, child abuse, and uncared-for HIV/AIDS patients. Committees have also brought some cases of child sexual abuse forward to the police.

Committees expressed the need to provide some financial and material support to the committee members for transport and awareness-raising materials. One committee member reported that there was so much dependence on the volunteer that they (the committee member) were often not given enough support. This point was repeated by all the other committees the evaluation team met.

JCM staff at field level found it difficult to explain to the committees why there were delays in getting a response from headquarters to their requests. One responded that the committee members were disappointed due to things not happening according to their proposed plans. Furthermore, understaffing at headquarters was a likely reason.

JCM staff also pointed out that there were sometimes conflicts between the committee members and the caregivers. The committees did not always fully represent the opinions of the caregivers. Committee members were usually the first to receive some skills-training. This was a logical step to motivate members, especially because many caregiver committee members were very much in need. The skills-training of committee members also served to fund the establishment of IGAs to support the JCM schools. The drawback was, however, that this could have led to some jealousy on the part of other caregivers who felt that committee members were advantaged. Staff members were requested to mediate when such situations arose.

Committee members also suggested that if a committee has been functioning for some time, it is necessary to work to renew their motivation. Interest and commitment tend to lag without frequent mentoring and moral support. All committees that the evaluation team met indicated that they wished to continue their tasks after the end of USDOL financing.

“Even if the funding from USDOL is stopped, we will continue as a committee. We just have to find the means to continue. If we let go, our children will suffer.”

*-Committee member*

Most said it would be difficult to fully support the schools because the financial resources generated were insufficient: “We need so many things in the school and the committee cannot meet the demand.”

At the local level, JCM has also been able to find some support and create partnerships. A local pastor funded a supplementary meal once a week in Ndola. The NGO “Jubilee” economically empowered eight caregivers of double orphans in the same project site. The caregivers were provided with small monthly grants to start and maintain economic activities. The evaluation team interviewed the grantees and found that they were well selected for high vulnerability and that they were benefiting substantially from this support.

JCM further made a start in developing public–private partnerships: Barkley’s bank agreed to finance the renovation of the community school at Chaawama in Lusaka city. Initiatives to develop additional public–private partnerships could be further developed in the future.

Caregivers also provided some direct support. In some locations, they volunteered to cook and serve the supplementary food and even do some informal monitoring. A caregiver in Copperbelt Province said that they went about once a month to the school for this purpose. They said they sat in a corner or quietly watched through the window. The caregivers also added that they sometimes just went to have a chat with the teacher to find out how things were going at the center. In the same project site, the government education inspector also regularly stopped by.

## **Skills Training**

“As long as the children are still missing something, they are likely to return to child labor. Most parents are below the bottom line. They are being helped, but the children need still more help. Their parents are just too poor.”

*-Community child labor committee member*

A key CCLEZ project component was the development of improved economic empowerment of caregivers to keep their children out of child labor and in schools. A related aspect was the development of greater economic independence of JCM centers by developing IGAs to support them. The main types of skills-training and IGA support provided through the CCLEZ project were tailoring, tie dyeing, simple catering, and support for farming. The CCLEZ design included skills-training for caregivers, older children, and community child labor committee members. JCM was only able to provide the skills-training in the first and second year of CCLEZ Phase II, but exchange rate difficulties resulted in inadequate funding to pursue the training on a sufficient scale this year. USDOL policy allows for the financing of such training but no funding for micro-credit or other forms of financing for the start-up of economic activities.

In Zambia, vocational training is an underdeveloped sector. The Ministry of Science, Technology and Vocational Training is in charge of vocational training instead of the MoE. This separation results in a disparate system on education, which could be more efficiently integrated to achieve maximum results. As caregivers noted, general education alone does not necessarily lead to employment. For this reason, vocational education is essential and should not be regarded as the last alternative “if you cannot make it in the general system.” A new government program,

the Technical Education, Vocational and Entrepreneurship Training in Zambia (TEVETA) is working to address improvements in the system.

JCM as an agency did not have a great deal of expertise on skills development at the time this component was launched. While JCM has learned many lessons during the implementation of this component, it was one of the weaker areas of implementation. The objective of economic empowerment was highly appropriate and rightly perceived as essential by the caregivers, community committee members, teachers and other JCM staff, however.

Skills-training has been highly variable in duration and effectiveness. The cost of effective skills and IGA development has been underestimated. In some locations, notable in Lusaka, the training stretched over a longer period while in Kagoro, Eastern Province, for example, a 1-day training was provided on both baking and tie dying. The cost of materials for training and implementation of IGAs has been underestimated. Many skills-training beneficiaries complained that they lack the materials to implement the IGAs for which they received training: “These skills were provided but the materials were not, so we did not really benefit.”

The choice of skills was somewhat adapted to the localities but not sufficiently matched to the local labor market or other market needs. Doing so effectively was, however, beyond the budget and current expertise of JCM.<sup>30</sup> JCM requested stakeholders to indicate the skills they would like to learn and tried to match this to their available training resources. Unfortunately, many stakeholders lacked the necessary information regarding the feasibility of income generated from the subject of the training of their choice. Additional information gathering is needed to identify locally suitable skills-training subjects. Obtaining information from local government experts is one useful option. The evaluation team met a government veterinary specialist in Eastern Province who was able to clearly describe some locally marketable activities such as raising poultry egg layers. Other marketable skills, depending on the location, suggested by stakeholders included mushroom growing, fisheries, piggery, computer technology and management of internet cafes, repair of vehicles and small machines, and small trade.

A typical comment from a stakeholder was, “The skills proposed by donors are so limited. This is just what they propose but it is not necessarily what is useful for the community.” Another stakeholder, “A few were helped very well, but others do not really improve with this help. They are not all able to improve and run activities.” The market for tailored products is variable, for example. In Lusaka, the availability of second-hand clothes is broad, decreasing the demand for locally tailored items, while the sewing of school uniforms is seasonal.

Finding a location to operate the IGA is another challenging issue raised by the interviewees. In a few cases, caregivers also indicated that they could not complete the skills-training course because of the distance to the training site and lack of transport costs.

Most of the skills development concentrated on the provision of skills for informal self-employment instead of paid employment in the informal or formal economy. However, in

---

<sup>30</sup> The CCLEZ project manager suggested linking the skills and entrepreneurship actions to the government TEVETA program. TEVETA is a government authority that is responsible for regulating technical, education, and entrepreneurship training for the formal and informal economy. TEVETA also regulates institutions of learning for quality control and helps ensure that services being provided are market-driven.

Lusaka in particular, preparing youth for paid employment was an alternative to consider. JCM has been able to identify and start some selected youth on more appropriate and marketable skills-training through the support they received through the ILO-IPEC grant. Fifty youths were educated in skills like driving, computer technology, and mechanics; and 19 (including 2 girls) have already found employment.

Although JCM has supported a few females in non-gender stereotyped activities, this has been somewhat limited. One committee member noted that attention to widening the options to allow for more gender-mixed training and in nontypical skills would be beneficial.

The stakeholders expressed the demand for more basic entrepreneurship / management training. The need for training on cash management and basic accounts was particularly important. Most of the caregivers, youth, and committee members lacked good understanding of managing working capital to avoid over-extending expenditures.

Some caregivers requested more assistance with receiving general education in night school at the JCM centers. Some literacy courses were provided in JCM centers either in the afternoons or during school holidays. These courses were not yet considered to be sufficient, particularly because of the timing during normal working hours.

USDOL did not provide micro-finance support for the IGAs, so JCM approached other agencies to receive some support for the start-up of activities with some success. CRS and the government “Community Response to AIDS” (CRAIDS) provided some small micro-financing resources. This financial support was appreciated, but often not yet considered sufficient for effective IGA operations.

The evaluation team requested that beneficiaries describe the situation regarding activities for which they received financing. The results were variable, but mostly not as successful as expected. In one example, a caregiver received a small loan to start a tie and dye business, but she said that the amount was insufficient to provide adequate income to cover education costs for her children. Another caregiver indicated that some people have too many children and thus cannot manage with such a small income. Yet another pointed out that three-fourths of the caregivers were widows so they needed a great deal of help. In the Eastern Province, support to buy fertilizer was appreciated, but did not result in the expected harvest due to heavy rains. In the Copperbelt Province, a caregiver noted that he had a good harvest this year and was able to earn sufficient income to buy school uniforms, shoes, and books.

The concept of assisting individuals using a group approach was also questioned by some skills-training participants. JCM recognized that the group approach was not well received in urban areas. In the Eastern Province, they tried to implement it with some more success, but even there some beneficiaries complained. The beneficiaries indicated that assistance should be more individualized to really be of benefit. The micro-finance identified by JCM to supplement USDOL skills-training input was viewed as being too diluted to have real impact on group schemes.

Caregivers in rural areas asked for more support with fertilizer input and farm implements. More micro-finance support was deemed necessary for an activity to really be sustainable. JCM staff

believed that they needed some type of revolving loan fund, but did not yet have the necessary resources.

Committee members operated some IGAs to help support the financing of the schools, but most of the activities were still nascent and did not generate sufficient income to meet all expenditures. Any form of income was useful to supplement the school costs, but teachers' salaries were an important factor and constituted an essential cost that had to be covered. Lack of management skills, time, and security influence the ability of committee members to make a sufficient success of the IGAs to support the schools completely. In Mtendere, Lusaka, there was a robbery in the business center and shop started by the project and had to be closed down until new sources were identified.

JCM also started other activities to generate income to be able to sustain the actions initiated under CCLEZ, as well as newer actions. One example was the operation of a farm on the outskirts of Lusaka, which is still under development. JCM was, further, operating a computer management support center at its main center in Mtendere, but the agency was a victim of theft and computers in the center were stolen. JCM is trying to restart this activity. In George Compound, JCM is starting a small grocery shop and tailoring shop to raise funds for the school. JCM is actively trying to identify and operate other similar IGAs and the actions are useful and realistic. It will take time for these interesting actions to become fully operational and generate sufficient income. JCM also recently held a dinner fundraiser, partially to obtain funds to operate these and new IGAs. These activities may not be able to raise sufficient funds to cover all of the JCM activities, but should be encouraged.

This page left intentionally blank.

## VI MANAGEMENT, COORDINATION, AND CAPACITY-BUILDING

---

“This is really a great program that USDOL has done with us. We really feel that we have learned a lot. Even other donors come to us to see what we have done and how we are managing things.”

*-JCM Finance Director*

### 6.1 PROJECT MANAGEMENT

#### *15. What are the management strengths of this project?*

JCM management strengths were particularly strong in the area of human resource management. Work in coordinating and motivating staff has been largely successful in almost all project sites. They have been able to effectively raise awareness at all levels, influence policy, and withdraw and prevent child labor in communities. The project has also developed good technical systems to implement the actions. These systems are being replicated by other agencies in the country with the assistance of the capacity-strengthening of JCM.

Financial management has greatly improved over the past few years, particularly under CCLEZ phase II. The financial director noted that the disbursement system of USDOL was more efficient than that of some of its other donor partners. Learning the complicated system for USDOL budget management has so strengthened JCM that they actually find working with other donors quite “easy.” The JCM Director is an internationally trained banker. The current financial director is a trained CPA with 15 years’ working experience. The current CCLEZ Project Manager formerly worked with ILO-IPEC, so she is well aware of implementation approaches and methods.

The growing list of donors entrusting work to JCM is proof of their ability to implement actions effectively.

JCM is in the process of growing at an exponential rate and has started reviewing its strategic planning and organization development issues. JCM has developed a procedures and management manual for the organization.

#### *16. What are management areas, including technical and financial, that could be improved?*

Despite the success of this locally initiated NGO, there were a number of areas that could be improved. The points raised in this section are mostly based on comments of staff and partner agencies.

Technical support from USDOL in the form of consultant input and a workshop provided a start for reflection on addressing the needs arising out of continual growth. Some strategies have been defined, but more work is needed to address the issues arising out of organizational growth. One of the identified areas for improvement was a review of organizational development, particularly for a good organizational structure for effective and efficient management. JCM senior staff

indicated that they need an organizational audit so that they can upgrade their management systems to meet their increasing programmatic needs.

## **Financial Management**

The financial director was the only well-qualified person in his department. The growth of the NGO requires a revision of the staffing of the department. Although he is training a young graduate to work with him, this is actually still not adequate for the needs of the agency. Donors often have different financial reporting requirements, which render the work very complex.

The financial reporting requirements of U.S. Government financing agencies are very complex for a relatively small local NGO to implement. Understanding these requirements led to some misunderstandings on allowed and disallowed costs and other issues during Phase I of the CCLEZ project.

There was only one financing gap, which occurred during the period when there was a shortfall because of the drop of the dollar and high disbursement of project funds. During the time period that there was a gap in paying salaries, teachers and other staff had to wait for payment until the issue was resolved. Sometimes there were some issues at the project site-level when bills for local costs arrived, but the grant had not yet arrived at the project site.

The financial director indicated that managing staff time sheets was very complex at times. Field staff had difficulty understanding how to log their time for the different projects that finance their salaries. In some cases, they would visit a community and take the opportunity to work on several different projects at once, leading to confusion on how to report their time.

The financial director also indicated that he found it difficult to train staff on financial management issues such as allowed and disallowed costs. Lacking a solid background as a trainer or an appropriate simplified handbook to use with other staff made his work difficult in this regard.

Low salaries also posed a problem with staff retention. Although staff were highly committed overall, they had personal and family responsibilities that could be difficult to meet. Teachers, for example, only earn about 50 percent of what they could earn in a government school.

## **Human Resources and Management of Technical Implementation**

The workload of JCM staff was very high, from headquarters to the project sites. As already indicated, teachers were overstretched and had too many children in class. Supervisory personnel in the project sites were limited and in one location, for example, a teacher also had to act to supervise a teacher in another JCM-supported school.<sup>31</sup> One of the donor partners also noted that the number of qualified staff working with JCM needed to be increased. Budgets have, so far, not allowed the hiring of sufficient staff.

Increased monitoring and mentoring of staff in the project sites is needed to ensure their level of initiative remains high. Low salaries mean that the need for moral support and mentoring is high to maintain interest and commitment. JCM can review its system for mentoring and

---

<sup>31</sup> The person in question is willing to do so.

backstopping personnel throughout the actions it is implementing. Headquarters staff was still very involved in project site implementation, but with the growth of the organization, this system needs to be reviewed. A multitiered system is required to ensure that headquarters staff does not have to intensively and unrealistically supervise staff in project sites directly. A highly vertical organizational hierarchy should, however, be avoided.

*17. The economic, especially currency rate, environment of Zambia seems to provide a unique challenge to projects. What strategies would the evaluator recommend to mitigate budget problems that were encountered in this project?*

The currency environment in Zambia, together with the substantial drop of the dollar, was and will probably continue to be a major factor for national NGOs. JCM staff described the difficulties in budgeting when the national currency, the kwacha, and the dollar are unstable. The problem is exacerbated by the variability of cost contingencies. The problem was difficult for the staff to handle on a concrete and personal emotional level. The evaluation team personally saw numbers of children and caregivers almost cry for help with education. Scaling back was very difficult to handle beyond any cold financial adjustment of budgets.

JCM staff proposed that the easiest way to handle the problem of currency fluctuations was to calculate the budget in kwacha, as some donors already do. The evaluator proposed another option, which was to have a flexible budget that is adjusted in accordance with budget fluctuations so that the actual value of the budget does not vary a great deal. The UN already applies this method to pay UN staff in many countries.

*18. What lessons could be learned in terms of budgeting for this type of project in the future?*

It would be useful to consider the following:

- In case of skills-development actions, increase budget allocation for training (or associate other donor agencies to provide funding and expertise for training and micro-finance from an early project stage).
- Ensure that budget allocations are realistic regarding the level of interest/demand in project actions that can result as a consequence of successful awareness-raising.
- Where national NGOs implement a project directly, include funding for organization development and management capacity-strengthening.

*19. USDOL, through its staff, spent substantial time helping JCM to fill out required forms and understand principles of managing USG grants. Does it appear that the project has improved its project management and grant management processes because of USDOL involvement?*

JCM was very satisfied with the support they received from USDOL, in general. They noted that USDOL generally responded in a timely manner to their requests. USDOL provided some training on strategy development and sustainability, as well as training for the financial director

on U.S. Government regulations and policies. JCM also interacted with ILO-IPEC at some stages to increase their understanding of the financial policies. The exposure thus provided was perceived as very useful to understanding and implementing the policies according to the regulations.

CRS engaged in a management and technical assessment of JCM prior to agreeing to finance one of their actions. CRS had also already been interacting with JCM in different networks. The CRS staff member interviewed by the evaluation team was impressed with the progress made by JCM over the past few years in terms of financial and overall project management. The evaluation team could only assess the current situation and had no grounds to compare to JCM's previous project management and grant management process. Nevertheless, the team had the impression that there have been definite improvements as a result of USDOL support in these areas.

## **6.2 PROJECT MONITORING**

*20. Has the project been able to accurately collect and track data on its direct beneficiaries and report on DOL common indicators (withdrawal, prevention, retention, and completion) thus far? Is the project able to accurately measure results in terms of DOL common indicators? If not, why not?*

JCM worked with the Education Specialist in CCLEZ Phase I to develop the monitoring and child registration form. The form listed all the details that were needed and included the monitoring of the children's work status. JCM staff and members of the community child labor committees carried out awareness activities with parents to ensure that children were not going back into child labor. Children were provided with recreational activities to keep them busy, although several stakeholders indicated that this could be increased. Children in the Mtendere transit home went on educational trips or camps on some weekends and during school vacations.

After children were integrated into transitional education, the project used a register for program monitoring. An additional tool was the tracking form for monitoring children who have been integrated into formal schools. Teachers in the government schools have been trained to track the transitioned children, while their effective tracking is occasionally monitored by JCM staff.

Other tools developed by JCM:

- Teacher performance monitoring tool (used once yearly). The form concentrates on teacher interaction with students.
- School standard inspection form listing the conditions of the infrastructure of the school (used for JCM and government schools).
- Tool for assessing the awareness of the caregivers on child labor when identifying the children.

Data have been collected from the first phase of CCLEZ in 2002 until now, enabling a good longitudinal overview.

The monitoring tools have been standardized over the course of the past year throughout all of the activities of JCM. JCM was using a different form for different projects supported by donors prior to standardization. The standardization was perceived by staff as contributing to easier monitoring and enabled a better comparison of progress across actions. The JCM board especially noted the usefulness of having such data to help them understand the impact of the actions. The tools were considered sufficiently clear and easy to use. JCM introduced the monitoring tools to the other NGOs, whose capacities they are strengthening through the ILO-IPEC project.

There was still an issue regarding the actual terms of “withdrawal and prevention.” The realities in the project sites made it very difficult to ensure that children were truly and completely withdrawn. JCM considers a child withdrawn if he/she only works a few hours a week in non-hazardous labor. In some places such as in Lusaka, children can be withdrawn completely, while in the Eastern Province, it is more difficult because children may work in farming on a part-time basis such as around harvest time.

Headquarters staff visited the project sites approximately once a quarter. This schedule was largely confirmed by caregivers and community committees. In some places, stakeholders requested more frequent monitoring and backstopping from headquarters staff to be able to consult with them and get their input. Teaching staff and, in some localities, committees, visit the homes of children who were shown as being absent through the monitoring system.

This page left intentionally blank.

## **VII      RESPONSES TO CHANGES IN SITUATION**

---

JCM has been able to address some of the changes in situation during project implementation. Although currency fluctuations were a major problem, JCM was able to overcome the gap by motivating the patience of staff and working through other donor programs.

Some of the community committees on child labor were transformed to integrate the ILO-IPEC HIV/AIDS induced child labor project. This integration was a positive step, since an overabundance of competing committees working in a similar direction tends to create a negative impact.

JCM also noted during implementation that it was important for caregivers to be more represented on the community child labor committee because they have an important stake in JCM actions. JCM then promoted and successfully integrated more caregivers in the committees.

This page left intentionally blank.

## VIII EFFICIENCY

---

*21. Assess efficiency of the program, i.e., compare the allocated resources with results obtained. In general, did the results obtained justify the costs incurred?*

The budget for project implementation was quite small compared to other projects on child labor financed by USDOL. The fact that a national NGO was financed directly is rather exceptional to date and has proved to be an efficient investment in results. JCM has achieved very good results as compared to the level of allocated resources. Some aspects, especially in the area of skills development, had less impressive results, although the investment in the project skills component was quite low. To obtain an improved cost-benefit ratio on the skills component, it would actually be advisable to invest more for better results.

*22. How successful has the project been in leveraging nonproject resources? Assess the ability of management to do so.*

The project has been very successful in leveraging nonproject resources as compared to many other NGOs. JCM had set very high standards/indicators for itself in the area of raising additional funds. JCM has reached out to a wide range of donors for additional resources, from the government to international donors, international NGOs, private citizens abroad and in Zambia, and the private sector. JCM has been creative in the identification of sources and has been able to gain some support from each. The need for resources is great, however.

*23. What other major design/implementation issues should be brought to the attention of the implementing organization and USDOL?*

JCM needs to pay additional attention to staff capacity-building, particularly in the area of management, but also technical implementation. Much of the budget rightly goes directly to assisting children, but JCM capacities to improve and extend its work also need to be strengthened. Project design also needs to focus on increasing capacity on staffing, operational systems, transport, and other logistics.

This page left intentionally blank.

## **IX      EQUALITY, GENDER, AND ENVIRONMENTAL ISSUES**

---

JCM has generally addressed gender issues well. The ratio of girls to boys in the CCLEZ project is good. Community committees have reasonable male-female ratios in most locations. Skills-training could focus somewhat more on including more mixed-gender groups. One male committee member said that there was enormous work to be done regarding gender issues in the community and that it needed to be addressed.

Promoting equality plays a role with respect to discrimination of people living with HIV/AIDS and orphans and vulnerable children. JCM has worked hard to address the issue of equality through its awareness-raising efforts. Environmental issues are not particularly addressed, but the project does not have any overt or substantial negative impact on the environment.

This page left intentionally blank.

## X SUSTAINABILITY, REPLICATION, AND CAPTURING OF LESSONS LEARNED

---

“We want to give a tribute to the great things this school has done in this community, but please continue your support. WE are not in any good situation of employment. We just work informally.”

*-Parent, Copperbelt Province*

JCM has done a commendable job of working toward sustainability. Agencies being trained by JCM are already replicating JCM approaches. The capturing of lessons learned can receive further attention, although the current evaluation and stakeholders’ workshop are expected to contribute to that process.

*24. Was the project’s initial strategy for sustainability adequate and appropriate?*

The initial strategy for internal sustainability—i.e., retaining children enrolled in the CCLEZ project—as well as the strategy for external sustainability was appropriate. It was mostly focused on strengthening community child labor committees and promoting income-generating activities. While the strategy was good, the implementation was challenging. The senior project staff found the technical support very useful, and it was provided by USDOL through a workshop on the Design of Phase II, with a strong focus on developing sustainability strategies.<sup>32</sup> JCM has developed good strategies linking different donor projects together to improve overall sustainability.

The fact that the initial strategy was mostly correct was reiterated over and over again by all stakeholders. The key to sustainability was considered to be the increase in the income of caregivers and of actions that could help finance the schools. As one project staff member indicated, however, “The project concentrated highly on children and only secondary on raising incomes. Actually there should be a great emphasis on the caregivers. There might be 200 children, but often several come from the same family.”

*25. (a) What steps have been taken so far to promote sustainability and continuation of education strategies for combating child labor beyond the life of the project?  
(b) What lessons could be learned to date about the project’s accomplishments and weaknesses in terms of sustainability of interventions?*

JCM developed a solid system of transitional and community schools and good working relations with local government schools and local authorities. JCM acquired some properties and/or obtained land from district authorities to build or maintain the schools. Community committees are working toward sustainability but need more resources and mentoring. Income-generating activities for caregivers and activities to raise funds for schools still need more resources and attention to be fully successful.

---

<sup>32</sup> U.S. Department of Labor, International Child Labor Program. (2005b).

Lessons learned on sustainability include the necessity to—

- Allot more funding for skills and entrepreneurship development.
- Match skills-training provided to local economic development plans, labor market needs, and marketability of products.
- Ensure that links are established to micro-financing institutions to help finance IGAs.
- Continue mentoring of project stakeholders, particularly of JCM field staff and community child labor committees.

*26. USDOL-funded projects are designed to serve as pilot models which, if successful, might be replicated in other areas. What is the feasibility of replicating the model developed by the project in other parts of Zambia?*

The model developed by the JCM in its CCLEZ project is already being replicated. Its effectiveness is commonly recognized by all interested partners and project beneficiaries. JCM is actively involved in helping replicate the model in new projects funded by other donors within its own agency as well as providing training to other NGOs to assist in replication. Some of the JCM approaches are being replicated, including projects with the support of ILO-IPEC, CRS, the government World Bank–funded CRAIDS, and the German NGO KNH.

One of the key lessons learned was the importance of awareness-raising by going directly into the communities. Using a combination of local formal and informal leaders, teachers and past beneficiaries have proven to be very effective.

Strongly attaching the project actions to the community by involving caregivers and community child labor committees directly helped to increase effectiveness.

Dissemination of the results of the project to caregivers could be increased. As one community committee member stated, “The people are often not aware of the good work of JCM. Once parents know what is possible, it helps to motivate them to participate and withdraw their children.” JCM Board members also indicated that advocacy could receive even more attention by greater dissemination of results.

## **XI CONCLUSIONS**

---

JCM has an excellent reputation and has been able to sensitize policymaking national institutions on child labor and other child rights issues. JCM is currently the largest organization working directly in communities in the area of child labor. JCM has come close to or exceeded most of its other targets, with the exception of the economic empowerment of caregivers and communities to continue program activities. The empowerment of community committees and caregivers needs further attention to ensure the internal and external sustainability of project results. The project largely adhered to its work plan as per the results provided in the Technical Progress Reports.

JCM has developed partnerships with different government agencies and international donors and national NGOs. Despite the good level of collaboration, a number of challenges at the national level remain. The low government budget allocations for education resulted in understaffed government schools with limited infrastructure to absorb the numbers of children transitioning through the JCM schools.

A key conclusion drawn from the evaluation process was the importance of involving the community members themselves as awareness-raising resources.

Children and parents generally felt that the quality of the teaching in the JCM supported schools was good. One of the forms of support most appreciated by caregivers has been assistance with the purchase of uniforms and shoes for children transitioning into the government schools. Supplementary food schemes introduced by JCM in some project sites with funding from non-USDOL sources appeared to be very important to reduce absenteeism and increase retention. The impact of the quality-focused interventions on teaching children withdrawn and prevented from child labor has been positive. Schools have been assisted with teacher guidelines, other educational materials, and infrastructure support. Teachers noted that, despite the support they received from JCM, there was still a shortage of teaching and learning materials in general.

Community child labor committees existed in all project sites, but some appeared more functional than others. All committees that the evaluation team met indicated that they wished to continue their tasks after the end of USDOL financing, even though financing could be a problem as far as fully supporting the actions.

A key CCLEZ project component was the development of improved economic empowerment of caregivers to keep their children out of child labor and in schools. A related aspect of the project was the development of greater economic independence of JCM centers through IGAs, which helped to support them. Skills-training has been variable in duration and effectiveness. The cost of effective skills and IGA development has been underestimated. The choice of skills is somewhat adapted to the localities, but needs to be more closely matched to the local labor market or other market needs.

This page left intentionally blank.

## **XII RECOMMENDATIONS, LESSONS LEARNED, AND GOOD PRACTICES**

---

### **12.1 PROJECT DESIGN AND PROJECT INCEPTION ISSUES**

- Invest more in skills and entrepreneurship/micro-enterprise management training to obtain an improved cost-benefit ratio on the skills component.
- Increase detail in the problem analysis prior to designing the project to define the expected extent of demand for education and, subsequently, reduce the geographic area the project can realistically cover.
- Include coordination with the Ministry of Health and HIV/AIDS groups as an action integrated in the design of the project. Attention for coordination with the Ministry of Health needs to focus on the impact of HIV/AIDS and other important health issues on the prevalence of child labor in the country.

### **12.2 AWARENESS-RAISING**

#### **National Level**

- Continue lobbying for greater allocation of funds to government schools in low income areas.
- Advocate and lobby for increased and appropriate vocational skills education for children in higher grades.
- Advocate for the integration of locally appropriate skills-training in general education from grade 6 or earlier.
- Support development of integrated local economic development policies and initiatives at all levels (national, provincial, district).
- Advocate that in-service teacher training included specialized instruction on methods for teaching withdrawn and prevented children from child labor. Also promote psychosocial counseling for all teachers.

#### **District and Community Level**

- Develop a model of JCM activity in major towns, even where JCM is more focused on rural communities. Such a model can serve to demonstrate the benefits and working methods of JCM to district officials on a daily basis. Transporting district officials to projects sites in more distant locations is less efficient.

- Provide materials such as T-shirts with messages and written advocacy materials that can be distributed to community child labor committee members. The committee members can wear the T-shirts to promote their credibility as awareness-raisers on child labor. The written advocacy materials can be distributed to community residents and will contribute to retention of the message.
- Provide more bicycles for transport of community committee members and teachers for awareness-raising in communities, and monitor their state of repair.
- Increase mentoring and moral support of community child labor committees over time.

## **12.3 QUALITY EDUCATION**

- Provide certificates of success to community child labor committees, schools, and districts with effective initiatives on child labor. Work with the stakeholders to determine the criteria for receiving a certificate.<sup>33</sup>
- Consider means to make transitional schools more long term; provide three to seven years of schooling when government schools are unable to absorb all of the students.
- Integrate the mentoring of teachers for education quality in the transitional schools on an enduring basis for continuous effectiveness of teaching skills. The mentoring can be provided through the supporting NGOs or, preferably, through the government education system.
- Redouble efforts to identify teachers with teaching certificates at the time of recruitment. Retired teachers are a good source of experienced teachers.
- Develop a more efficient system to distribute the correct numbers of complete sets of uniforms and shoes in the correct sizes. Ensure JCM supervision of uniform distribution in every project site.
- Increase efforts to find funding for infrastructure and material improvements in JCM schools, i.e., classrooms, toilets, water points, desks, and learning and teaching materials. Reward staff able to source local funding for such improvements by providing annual bonuses and prioritizing them in promotions, training, or other benefits.
- Explore additional means of discipline aside from corporal punishment, and increase sensitization of the teachers so that children can learn self-control in other ways. Means may include distributing and/or posting small colored papers, certificates, and end-of-term prizes for good behavior; offering counseling; and enacting temporary removal in cases of disruptive behavior (“time out”).

---

<sup>33</sup> Such certificates are separate from certificates provided at the end of training. They can be distributed at special events such as on World Day Against Child Labour.

- Continue and expand efforts to source supplementary food schemes in JCM and government schools.
- Ensure continued recreational and other activities after school to ensure children do not engage in long hours of CL after school.
- Organize and motivate supervisors of sports activities and matches. Involve secondary school students from other local schools and churches as volunteers.
- Increase recreation facilities and equipment, including small games.

### **Vocational Training for Students**

- Link JCM skills and vocational training actions to the TEVETA program.
- Support vocational training for older students from the same families as children enrolled in the program.
- Open organized skills-training centers in JCM project sites wherever feasible.
- Associate volunteers with technical skills or mentors willing to take individual apprentices for training in business and practical skills.

## **12.4 DISTRICT COOPERATION**

- Map local projects, government actions, and NGOs active in areas with high child labor levels.
- Promote the capacity-strengthening and allotment of resources to district and community child labor committees.
- Promote the linkage of community child labor committees to district child labor committees from an early stage to benefit from their practical experience in communities.
- Network with district line departments to identify economically appropriate skills-training and provide that training.
- Increase mentoring and monitoring of interactions of local JCM staff with district authorities, as it is vital to ensure that such local staff pursues these essential components for sustainable success.

## **12.5 COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS**

- Enhance mentoring efforts for community child labor committees. Volunteers, in particular, need continued moral support to ensure their continued commitment.
- Develop new strategies in high-density locations to extend the reach of the teachers and committee members. They are unable to personally reach the population.
- Renew training for committee members and teachers on how to approach and convince caregivers yearly so that new members and teachers are all assured of training.
- Develop a guide for committee members that can be used to train new members when there is turnover.
- Add more training for committee members on leadership, conflict resolution, and community awareness-raising.

## **12.6 MANAGEMENT AND MONITORING**

- Prioritize people who have proven records of high levels of personal initiative at the field level when hiring and promoting staff members.
- Emphasize performance-based evaluations for all staff, including resource identification and effective networking.
- Establish a special system for responding to requests from the field.
- Encourage JCM to carry out a more in-depth organizational audit and restructuring through organizational development techniques to upgrade management systems and meet increasing programmatic needs.
- Review monitoring and mentoring system of field staff. Due to the growth of the organization, the current system needs to be reviewed. A multitiered system is required to ensure that headquarters staff does not have to intensively supervise staff at project sites. A highly vertical organizational hierarchy should, however, be avoided.
- Ensure that all allowable and non-allowable costs are clearly defined and understood by the recipient agency when financing local NGOs directly.
- Prepare a simple manual for the financial officer to use with the rest of the staff to train them on key financial management systems issues.
- Provide motorbikes for middle-level staff members who need to supervise different project sites. When distances are not great and staff is physically able, more bicycles can be added.

## **12.7 SUSTAINABILITY OF PROJECT RESULTS, DISSEMINATION**

- Create lists of possible sources of funds for local projects and develop an organized fundraising plan.
- Link project actions to other local economic empowerment projects identified in the mapping exercise.
- Ensure that skills-training reaches as many caregivers as possible.
- Include entrepreneurship skills-training. Link to simple business training tools such as the ILO's GET Ahead: Gender and Entrepreneurship Together.<sup>34</sup>
- Introduce rotating schemes for farm inputs, including fertilizer. Consider introducing homestead farming on urban plots (fruit trees, etc.).
- Consider developing more skills to prepare youth for employment rather than developing self-employment skills. Use local labor market analysis methods to identify skills.
- Identify existing employment centers in urban areas and establish a networking system with them to hire former students.
- Ensure that links are established with micro-financing institutions to help finance IGAs. Assist local populations in accessing available micro-credit schemes.
- Work to identify a source to establish a rotating loan fund to provide starter capital for community-level IGAs.
- Promote development of small agriculture economic activities in city plots and on homesteads in rural areas.
- Develop further initiatives for additional public–private partnerships.
- Increase dissemination of project results at national, provincial, district, and community levels.

---

<sup>34</sup> This tool is more basic than the ILO's Start and Improve Your Business and is generally more suitable for micro-enterprise development. The JCM CCLEZ project manager has already received training with this toolkit in her previous job.