

FUNDED BY THE UNITED STATES
DEPARTMENT OF LABOR

Independent Midterm Evaluation of the Combating Child Labor Through Education in Morocco (ADROS) Project

Management Systems International
Cooperative Agreement Number: E-9-K-3-0052



2006

ORC MACROSM

This page left intentionally blank.

**FUNDED BY THE UNITED STATES
DEPARTMENT OF LABOR**

**Independent Midterm Evaluation
of the Combating Child Labor
Through Education in Morocco
(ADROS) Project**

Management Systems International
Cooperative Agreement Number: E-9-K-3-0052

2006

Funding for this evaluation was provided by the United States Department of Labor under Task Order number USDOLQ059622437. Points of view or opinions in this evaluation report do not necessarily reflect the views or policies of the United States Department of Labor, nor does the mention of trade names, commercial products, or organizations imply endorsement by the United States Government.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF ACRONYMS	v
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	vii
I INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Evaluation Objectives	1
1.2 Methodology of the Evaluation	2
II FINDINGS	5
2.1 Project Design	5
2.2 Implementation	11
2.3 Partnership and Coordination Issues	27
2.4 Management Issues	28
2.5 Sustainability and Impact	30
III CONCLUSIONS	33
3.1 Good Practices and Lessons Learned	33
3.2 Conclusions	34
3.3 Recommendations	35
ANNEXES	
Annex 1: Documents Reviewed	
Annex 2: Evaluation Itinerary, Interlocutors & Interview Topics	
Annex 3: Stakeholder Workshop Participants	
Annex 4: Stakeholder Workshop Minutes	
Annex 5: Terms of Reference	

This page left intentionally blank.

LIST OF ACRONYMS

COP	Chief of Party
EI	Education Initiative
GPRA	Government Performance Reporting Act
ILO	International Labour Organization
INDH	National Initiative for Human Development
IPEC	International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour
KAB	Knowledge, Attitudes, and Behavior
MDSS	Ministry of Social Development and Solidarity
MNEY	Ministry of National Education and Youth
MSI	Management Systems International
NGO	Nongovernmental Organization
NSC	National Steering Committee
ONDE	National Observatory for the Rights of Children
PANE	National Action Plan for the Protection of Children
SEENF	State Secretariat of Nonformal Education
SEFEPH	State Secretariat for the Family, Children and Handicapped Persons
UNFPA	United Nations Population Fund
UNICEF	United Nations Children Fund
USDOL	United States Department of Labor
WFCL	Worst Forms of Child Labor

This page left intentionally blank.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Introduction

This report concerns the independent midterm evaluation of the ADROS Project: Combating Child Labor Through Education in Morocco, conducted by Management Systems International (MSI). The project is financed by the United States Department of Labor (USDOL), under the Education Initiative (EI), Cooperative Agreement E-9-K-3-0052, for a total of US\$3,000,000. The start date of the project was August 6, 2003, and the ending date is August 2, 2007.

Evaluation Objectives

The evaluation's objectives are as follows:

- Assess the ongoing progress and performance of the project in relation to its stated objectives and delivery of outputs.
- Assess the achievements, outcomes, and/or impacts of the project to date.
- Assess progress in terms of children's working and educational status (i.e., withdrawal from the worst forms of child labor [WFCL]; enrollment, retention, and completion of educational programs).
- On the basis of findings, provide specific recommendations that can be implemented for the second half of the project.
- Identify lessons learned and good practices to inform future USDOL projects.

Methodology

The evaluation visit took place from May 22 to June 2, 2006. The methodology used was a combination of desk review; interviews with stakeholders and project staff; visits with 18 classes and nongovernmental organizations (NGOs) in the three target areas of the project (Rabat/Salé, Casablanca/Mohammédia, Marrakech/El Kelaâ); visits of the three shelters in Rabat, Casablanca, and Marrakech; and group interviews with the regional committees of Casablanca et Marrakech. The site visits included interviews with direct and indirect (mothers) beneficiaries, teachers, and NGO staff, and observations of the physical aspects of the classrooms.

Objectives of the ADROS project

Under the main objective ("practice of educating child laborers, and notably *petites bonnes* widely adopted"), the project's original target was to withdraw from work and enroll in school 5,440 *petites bonnes* and another 900 children involved in car repair, handicrafts, and other forms of child labor. In early 2005, the emphasis in enrollment was changed to prevention, because of difficulties experienced in withdrawing children from work (see below).

The following are a number of the notable outputs representing the four EI goals. The awareness raising output comprises a television soap series on child (domestic) labor and related focus group awareness raising. The strengthening education output encompasses three main activities: ensuring the quality of ADROS sponsored nonformal education classes, equipping existing shelters for *petites bonnes* in need, and providing tutoring services for potential primary school dropouts. The third output (strengthening policy) covers activities in collaboration with various stakeholders to adapt legislation, develop national policy on child protection, and to include child labor modules in the new formal school curricula. The fourth and final output (ensuring the sustainability of efforts) involves the capacity building of regional committees put in place by ADROS, and the improvement of the monitoring skills of the project's local NGO partners.

Main Findings

Project Design

The ADROS project is well designed and adapted to the needs of the target population. It addresses a form of child labor that had not been targeted on this scale before. The flaws of the design, however, are the lack of sustainability and phasing out strategies, and the somewhat too concise implementation strategy. Had the latter been more elaborated, the difficulties in withdrawing *petites bonnes* from work might have been foreseen. The project's indicators are relevant and measurable, but do not always cover the objective. Some objectives might have been more modest, while various indicators could have been more ambitious. The project's focus was initially on the withdrawal of *petites bonnes* only, but the process of withdrawing children was far more difficult than foreseen, so the project was modified to include prevention.

Cost effectiveness

The project has been cost effective, especially considering the fact that it suffered a 15 percent loss of funds because of the depreciation of the U.S. dollar. Despite these losses, the project has been able to target far more beneficiaries than foreseen, which is commendable.

Results

After the somewhat difficult start in the first year, because of the exclusive focus on the withdrawal of *petites bonnes*, the project's efforts resulted in enrollment, retention, and completion figures that largely surpassed the objectives. The enrollment of other working children (i.e., non-*petites bonnes*) proved much easier from the start, as their work is more visible and socially accepted. Total enrollment is currently 7,334, more than the target of 6,340.

Retention figures in the second year were about 85 percent. The project has sought to improve this rate in the third year, but the results are not yet known. The project staff is conscious of the fact that to obtain sustainable results, a transition to either formal education or vocational training before the project phases out is important. That is why the third year has been labeled the "transition year" and a lot of effort is being made to increase the transition rate, even though the targets have been met.

The joint communication strategy is a commendable initiative that sets an example for other social sectors, and for institutions involved in the struggle against child labor around the world.

However, the partners should be careful that their strength (the number of partners) does not become their weakness so that they lose momentum because they fail to act quickly. If necessary, a small sub-committee should be formed and charged with the execution of the strategy.

ADROS has had positive results concerning the quality of education, although the indicators could have been better defined. Project activities have included the selection of properly equipped classrooms, the arrangement of tables in a U-shape to promote the active participation of students, the promotion of learner-centered methodologies, and the selection and training of teachers. These classes are greatly appreciated by students and parents.

One shelter for *petites bonnes* has been running for a year, and two others have just started. The three NGOs approached by ADROS to execute this component have a long history and a good reputation in child protection. Not only do these NGOs deliver quality services, they also have the capacity to secure additional funds to ensure the continuity of the shelter after ADROS pulls out.

Tutoring services were provided to 1,445 children, comprising 60 hours of math, French, and Arabic taught after school in the last term to children with poor results and unstable home situations. Both the demand and the results of this activity were overwhelming: 83 percent of the children obtained passing grades and were able to access the next level.

The new Labor Code was ratified near the starting date of the ADROS project, including a number of child labor provisions. A draft text on domestic labor has been drawn up by the government, with input from the International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC), the United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF), and ADROS. On July 17–18, a seminar will be held, during which all stakeholders will decide upon the final text. The 10-year National Action Plan for the Protection of Children (PANE) has been developed by the State Secretariat for the Family, Children, and Handicapped Persons (SEFEPH). ADROS has assisted SEFEPH with the elaboration of the logical framework of PANE, and it has increased the Secretariat's strategic planning capacity.

The regional committees are functional, but not independently from ADROS. They operate more like informal networks than as committees. If the committees are to have an impact, they should be formalized and have their capacities built.

To date, 35 partner NGOs are using the monitoring tools developed by ADROS, and the objective have almost been obtained.

The project has had some unforeseen results. The capacities of the ADROS staff—notably the Chief of Party (COP)—in strategic planning are greatly appreciated by the government. As a result, the project's expertise is often requested by policymakers. If there is a connection somehow with the project's objectives, ADROS seeks to satisfy the demand. This has been a great opportunity for ADROS to build the government's capacities and incorporate child labor into national policies.

The project has achieved impressive results—

- Target numbers have been largely surpassed.
- The project is on track with all activities, except the communication strategy.
- The project is strongly appreciated by beneficiaries, NGO partners, and the government.
- The project is well managed and monitored by a qualified staff.

Partnership and Management

The project staff has excellent relations with the government and other core stakeholders, such as IPEC and UNICEF. They are valued for their professionalism and technical knowledge. Nevertheless, the project could have been more firmly rooted in the government institutions appointed to coordinate child labor issues. Relations with MSI headquarters and USDOL are equally good, and the project is managed professionally.

Sustainability

Sustainable results are not easily obtained in the field of child labor, especially through a project that mainly consists of direct action. Factors that threaten the long-term impact of the educational efforts include the following:

- The precarious environment of the beneficiaries (e.g., poverty, domestic instability).
- The deficient infrastructure can hinder enrollment (e.g., many roads to the schools are unsafe, and schools are often remotely located).
- The failing quality of public schools (a major cause of dropout).
- The limited hours of education offered by the project (i.e., even though some NGOs provide up to 400 hours of classes, most limit their offer to the minimum of 200 hours).
- The lack of relevance of the public school curricula (i.e., not adapted to the local habitat and work opportunities).

If these issues are not solved, there is considerable risk that children who are currently enrolled through the ADROS project will drop out (again). To reduce these risks, there should be continuity of the classes (nonformal education, tutoring courses, and vocational training) and of the monitoring of the working/educational status of the children. Parents should also be empowered to generate more income and pay for the education of their children.

Good Practices

1. The rigorous monitoring system.
2. The mechanisms that strengthen the retention of beneficiaries in school.

3. The partnership with *Entraide National*, enabling beneficiaries to take vocational classes in addition to the theoretical courses.
4. The partnership with the nonformal education inspection, which was very helpful in monitoring, technical advice to the teachers, and ad hoc problem solving.
5. The tutoring classes: a cost-effective, simple, and highly effective formula already adopted by the Direction of Nonformal Education.
6. The joint communication strategy.
7. The technical assistance provided by ADROS to build the government's strategic planning capacity.

Recommendations

For the last year of the project it is important that ADROS focuses on the following:

- Strengthening of government capacities (in education, the child labor unit in the Ministry of Labor, of SEFEPH, the Ministry of Social Development and Solidarity).
- Strengthening of partner NGOs' capacities in fund diversification and strategic planning to increase the chance of achieving durable results.
- Monitoring and support of the transition process.
- Inserting the project in the National Steering Committee on child labor.
- Building the capacities of and formalizing the regional committees.
- Producing the television soap series at a lower cost, to not lose the efforts made so far and to make an impact through awareness raising.
- Forming a small sub-committee charged with the execution of the communication strategy if necessary.

Now that the struggle against child labor is gaining momentum in Morocco, it would be good to extend the project by another two years, to continue making a measurable difference.

This page left intentionally blank.

I INTRODUCTION

1.1 EVALUATION OBJECTIVES

The scope of the evaluation includes a review and assessment of activities carried out under the USDOL Cooperative Agreement with MSI. The evaluation's aim is to address the project as a whole to assess the progress of project outputs and activities toward reaching targets and objectives as outlined in the Cooperative Agreement and project documents. It focuses on the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, and sustainability of all project activities to date.

The purpose of this evaluation is to serve as a learning tool for the project management team. Specifically, the evaluation should—

- Assess the ongoing progress and performance of the project in relation to its stated objectives and delivery of outputs.
- Assess the achievements, outcomes, and/or impacts of the project to date.
- Assess progress in terms of children's working and educational status (i.e., withdrawal from the worst forms of child labor; enrollment, retention, and completion of educational programs).
- Provide specific recommendations based on findings that can be implemented for the second half of the project.
- Identify lessons learned and good practices to inform future USDOL projects.

The midterm evaluation should provide all stakeholders with information on the possible need to revise work plans, strategies, objectives, partnership arrangements, and resources. It should identify the potential impact on policy and strategies and suggest a possible way forward for the future. The results of the evaluation will be used to assist USDOL and MSI to—

- Monitor performance of the program and its progress in meeting its outputs, targets, and objectives.
- Identify any areas of concern in project implementation and possible corrective measures.
- Be advised of strategies for the second half of the project and on ways in which the project could develop in the future, building on and amplifying achievements of current and past activities.

1.2 METHODOLOGY OF THE EVALUATION

The evaluation visit took place from May 22 to June 2, 2006. Upon consultation of the ADROS and International Child Labor Program (ICLP) staff, a selection of sites to be visited was made, ensuring a balanced representation of the three locations (Rabat/Salé, Casablanca/Mohammédia, Marrakech/El Kelaâ), sending and receiving areas, and successful and weak programs.

The evaluator used a variety of data collection methods—

- Desk review (see Annex 1 for the list of documents consulted)
- Individual interviews with stakeholders at the national level (Ministry of National Education and Youth [MNEY], State Secretariat of Nonformal Education [SEENF], SEFEPH, *Direction du Travail*, Ministry of Social Development and Solidarity [MDSS], UNICEF, IPEC, *l'Entraide Nationale*)
- Individual and/or group interviews with implementing partners
- Focus group and individual interviews with direct and indirect beneficiaries (children, parents)
- Observations of interactions, project sites and environment, health, and nutritional status of the children
- Group interviews with the regional committees of Casablanca et Marrakech
- Interviews with the ADROS staff
- Visits to classes and NGOs in—
 - Rabat/Témara/Salé (SOS Villages, Tamesna, Al Hayat, Al Ouaha)
 - Casablanca/Mohamédia (SOS Villages, Bayti, Riad Salam)
 - Marrakech/El Kelaâ (Hirafiyat, Grand Atlas, Atfalouna, Nour et Irfane, Zakoura, Amal Circuit de la Palmeraie, Sidi Moussa, Espace Associatif, Amal Féminine)
- Visits to shelters in—
 - Bayti (Casablanca)
 - Al Karam (Marrakech)
 - Amesip (Rabat)

(See Annex 2 for the complete program.)

Interviews consisted of open questions to allow respondents to express themselves freely. This method gives the evaluator a good impression of respondents' appreciations and concerns, and it might lead to unanticipated answers.

1.2.1 Quantitative/Qualitative Methods

Available quantitative data have been collected and incorporated into the report as relevant. Evaluation fieldwork consisted mainly of qualitative data collection (see above).

1.2.2 Methodology for Interviewing and Working with Beneficiaries

Open focus group and/or interviews were held with children and mothers, focusing on their appreciation of the program and concerns, and depending on their background on their (previous) work experience and employment conditions. Observations and interviews also yielded a general appraisal of such measures as health and nutrition status.

1.2.3 Confidentiality

To ensure that the implementing partners, stakeholders, communities, and beneficiaries felt free to speak at will, ADROS staff were not present during interviews. However, ADROS staff accompanied the evaluator to make introductions whenever necessary, to facilitate the evaluation process, make respondents feel comfortable, and to allow the evaluator to observe the interaction between ADROS staff and the interviewees.

This page left intentionally blank.

II FINDINGS

2.1 PROJECT DESIGN

2.1.1 The National Context

Morocco has a population of 29.2 million, approximately 56 percent of which is urban and 44 percent rural. The annual population growth is estimated at 1.6 percent.¹ It is classified as a middle-income country with a per capita income estimated at US\$1,250 in 1998. Agriculture holds a key role in the economy, with its share of GDP holding firm at 15 percent over the last 20 years, and employing some 40 percent of the labor force, compared with 25 and 35 percent for industry and services, respectively.²

Morocco is a kingdom headed by King Mohammed VI, the successor to King Hassan II, since 1999. Over the last few years, a major democratic and political transition has been underway in Morocco marked by increased political openness and transparency, greater respect for human rights, and more participation of civil society in debating and addressing major societal issues. However, the transition toward national consensus building and an open political climate is taking place as economic and social challenges facing Morocco are mounting.

Economic growth stagnated in the 1990s, falling from an average of 4.1 percent from 1986–91 to 1.9 percent from 1991–98, and transforming Morocco from one of the best (in the 1980s) to one of the worst economic performers in the Middle East and North Africa region. While the economy remains stable, fostered by good macroeconomic policy, its slow growth has resulted in rising unemployment, poverty, and vulnerability.³

In its “Education for All” 2000 Assessment, the United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) cited Morocco as the Arab country with the largest population of out-of-school children following Yemen: the total number of dropouts and never-enrolled children was estimated at 1.4 million.⁴ Besides deficiencies in school infrastructure and educational quality, the need to work, which is linked to poverty, is consistently reported as one of the main variables affecting school attendance. MNEY data as well as external studies document the fact that, historically, female enrolment in primary school, as well as at higher levels, has been substantially lower than male enrollment, and completion rates for both sexes have been much lower than those for enrollment. Out-of-school children, if not working already, may all be considered at risk of getting involved in child labor.

The Government of Morocco pledged to take immediate action to address the problem of child labor within its borders. It ratified the International Labour Organization (ILO) Convention No. 138, governing the establishment of a minimum age for work, in January 2000 (opting for a minimum age of 15) and ILO Convention No. 182, for the elimination of the Worst Forms of

¹ World Development Indicators Database, April 2003.

² World Bank, Morocco in Brief, May 2000.

³ Kingdom of Morocco Poverty Update, March 30, 2001.

⁴ UNESCO, Education for All, 2000 Assessment.

Child Labor, on January 26, 2001. It also ratified the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child in June 2002.

In line with these ratifications, the government undertook various projects for the adaptation and harmonization of Moroccan laws. During the summer of 2003, after years of negotiation, the Moroccan Parliament ratified a new Labor Code, with provisions concerning child labor largely following the fundamental principles contained in ILO Conventions 138 and 182. The following are the new child labor provisions that had come into effect by early 2004:

- The legal minimum age for work increased from 12 to 15 years.
- The fine for not respecting the minimum age requirement increased to approximately US\$3,000 (30,000dhs). In the case of repeat offences, the fine doubles and can include a prison sentence for up to 3 months.
- It is forbidden to engage a person under the age of 18 in hazardous work.
- It is forbidden to engage children in work that could compromise their morality.
- Children above the legal working age have the same rights as adults in terms of minimum wage and social security.

Article 4 of the new Labor Code stipulates that a special code would be drawn up to regulate (child) domestic work. ADROS is part of the working group that is currently drafting this code. The issue is complex, because it involves the private sphere: labor inspectors, even if they would be well equipped and sufficient in number, do not have the authority to enter a home to check on working conditions. The application of the code may therefore have to rely on social workers, more than on representatives of the legal system.

A list of hazardous work was established in 2005 by the Ministry of Labor in collaboration with the social partners. Moreover, an amendment to the Penal Code has been made that—

- Improves the protection of juvenile offenders
- Authorizes the Ministry of Justice to penalize—
 - The sexual exploitation of children
 - The trafficking of children
 - Those forcibly engaging children to work

Another Code has been developed (*Code de l'enfant*), which lists all laws and regulations in force with respect to children. It is designed to be a practical tool more than a legal instrument, as it refers to other, existing laws.

In May 2005 the King Mohamed VI launched the National Initiative for Human Development (INDH). He invited stakeholders throughout the country to provide their input to the plan, for

which considerable funding was reserved. Within three months the plan was completed and the initiative is currently functional. INDH provides opportunities for human development in general, and the fight against child labor in particular.

2.1.2 Child Domestic Labor

The ADROS project addresses a specific form of child labor, which had until the start of the project received relatively little attention in Morocco: child domestic labor. Although not defined by the Moroccan Government as a worst form of child labor (WFCL), it is an exploitative form of child labor, which concerns primarily girls. Invisible by its nature, the fight against this practice is complicated by the fact that it often involves the transfer of a child from one family to another, which regardless of whether it is formal and official or not, is considered to be an adoption. Adopted or foster girls are usually taken into other homes not for altruistic reasons, but as a source of domestic labor. Known as adoptive servitude, girls thus engaged are known in Morocco as “*les petites bonnes*” or little maids. Their numbers include not only adopted and foster children, but also young girls who are employed as domestic servants for the equivalent of US\$30–40 a month. Their remittance generally goes straight to their rural or suburban families, where they represent between 10 and 20 percent of the total family income.⁵ Because of a lack of reliable statistics, estimates of the incidence of child domestic labor vary enormously, the lowest at around 14,000⁶ and the highest around 100,000.⁷

There is an extremely high turnover among *petites bonnes* in Morocco. Girls frequently move back and forth between the categories of “working *petites bonnes*” and “at-risk *petites bonnes*.” This phenomenon is caused by a variety of factors, including high incidences of abuse. Another factor is the “finder’s fee” paid to the intermediaries who place girls as *petites bonnes*. These *samsars* are paid each time they place a girl, so they have an incentive to move girls from one household to another, generating additional fees for each new placement. Another factor contributing to high turnover is the desire of parents to gain the highest possible salaries for their daughters, causing them to move the girls for even a small promised increase in wage.

Girls may be sent to an employer/“foster family” at an age as young as 6 or 7 years. This is a custom notably in Marrakech and surrounding areas. If this arrangement works out for both parties, it may be remarkably stable. Employers of this type, who have spent many years with the “foster girl,” are the ones most likely to support the school enrollment of their *petites bonnes*.

In most cases though, girls will start working around the age of 10–12, shift employers frequently, and continue to live with their parents. The sending areas prove to be impoverished suburbs and slums, more than the rural areas, although some girls travel far. They work 12 to 13 hours a day and commonly suffer physical, moral, and sexual abuse. The sexual abuse occurs perhaps less often in the employer’s household than on the street, where they are likely to end up after having shifted between households too often. Even the *samsars* may take on the role of pimp for such girls. When they get pregnant, the cultural value placed on virginity makes it

⁵ Sommerfelt, Tone, Jon Pedersen and Mehdi Lahlou. *Domestic Child Labor in Morocco: A Report for Save the Children UK*. Faro Instituted for Applied Studies, 2001.

⁶ Coletti, Elisabetta Anna. “Little Maids of Morocco,” in *Los Angeles Times*, Spring, 2001

⁷ Lahlou, Mehdi. *Child Labor in Morocco: Socio Economic Background of the “Little Maids” Phenomenon*.” Ministry of Planning, Morocco, 2002.

difficult for them to return to their families—one more reason they might end up living on the street.

2.1.3 Structure of the Project

Under the USDOL EI (Cooperative Agreement Number E-9-K-3-0052) the ADROS (Arabic for “I study”) project seeks to reduce the employment of underage *petites bonnes* through various education initiatives.

Table 1: Structure of the ADROS Project

<p>Goal</p> <p>Reduce WFCL, particularly the employment of underage <i>petites bonnes</i> (Little Maids).</p> <p>Purpose</p> <p>To see the practice of educating working and at-risk child laborers, particularly <i>petites bonnes</i>, widely adopted.</p> <p>Outputs</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Awareness/Attitudes<ol style="list-style-type: none">a. Attitudes of the employers of child laborers regarding the benefits of education and the appropriate age of first employment improved.b. Attitudes of parents of working children regarding the benefits of education and the risks of child labor improved.2. Education/Shelter Access<ol style="list-style-type: none">a. Nonformal education options for working and at-risk child laborers in the target areas of Rabat/Salé, Marrakech, and Casablanca improved.b. Shelter demonstrations operational in target areas.c. Tutoring services for potential <i>petites bonnes</i> in target sending areas established.3. Policy Advances<ol style="list-style-type: none">a. Child labor regulatory environment improved.b. Public policies relative to the protection of children’s rights adopted.4. Capacity Building and Sustainability<ol style="list-style-type: none">a. Civil society organizations and government representatives take collective action concerning child labor in the targeted areas.b. Partner implementing agencies are capable of monitoring working children and at-risk children’s access to education.
--

Under the main objective (i.e., practice of educating child laborers, notably *petites bonnes*, widely adopted), the project’s original target was to withdraw from work and enroll in school 5,440 *petites bonnes* and another 900 children involved in car repair, handicrafts, and other forms of child labor. In early 2005, the emphasis in enrollment was changed to prevention, because of difficulties experienced in withdrawing children from work (see below).

The four outputs represent the four EI goals. The awareness output comprises a television soap series on child (domestic) labor and related focus group awareness raising. The second output encompasses three main activities: ensuring the quality of ADROS sponsored nonformal education classes, equipping existing shelters for *petites bonnes* in need, and providing tutoring services for potential primary school dropouts. The third output covers activities in collaboration with various stakeholders to adapt the legislation, develop national policy on child protection, and to include child labor modules in the new formal school curricula. The fourth and last output involves the capacity building of regional committees put in place by ADROS, and the improvement of the monitoring skills of the project's local NGO partners.

2.1.4 The Validity of the Design

By its nature, a project can only have a limited impact, especially if it comprises more direct action than policy change and capacity building. Sustainable results are extremely difficult to achieve through direct action in the field of child labor, notably when interventions are focused almost exclusively on education. This aspect has not been sufficiently taken into account in the project design. The capacity building and sustainability output is rather limited in scope. Under the Sustainability heading, the document mentions a phase out strategy focused on building the capacities of the local partners, but this is not represented in the log frame or the work plan. Phasing out ought to be an integral part of the project, for which the project should be held accountable: it should have indicators and progress ought to be monitored.

The types of interventions are relevant for the target group, the target group is well defined, the choice of stakeholders is appropriate, and although not evident from the project document, the project has an adequate monitoring component.

Indicators are relevant and measurable, although in some cases rather limited in scope. For example, Output 2a suggests that nonformal education options for working and at-risk children in the three target areas at large will be (durably) improved, but the indicators show that the interventions apply only to the ADROS-sponsored classes, which will merely last as long as the project itself. Likewise, the fourth output, Capacity Building and Sustainability, appears to promise more than the project can fulfill, if judged by the indicators. Additional indicators could have been related to the regional committees' capacity to function independently from ADROS, and to the local partners' capacity in strategic planning and fund raising.

The project document mentions a great deal of assumptions, which are relevant to the overall goal (WFCL reduced, notably child domestic labor), but not to the specific project objectives and outputs. It would have been more useful to define assumptions that might affect the achievement of the latter.

Changes in the project document

The project document is well written, but extremely limited when it comes to project approach and intervention strategies. It does not reveal how the project intends to work with the local NGOs, what interventions will be proposed to the beneficiaries, how they will be selected, and how they will be withdrawn from work. Had this been more covered in more detail, some of the problems involved in the actual withdrawal of *petites bonnes* might have been foreseen.

The difficulties experienced were twofold: because of information campaigns for the new Labor Code, employers were reluctant to admit that they employed underage maids, as they were now aware that it was illegal. On the other hand, parents were disinclined to let the girls go to school because their loss of income would not be compensated. Withdrawing *petites bonnes* demanded more awareness raising than enrolling at-risk children, and proved to be considerably less successful.

The project staff made the right decision to include at-risk children, both because of the pragmatic implications, and because it increased the chances of achieving sustainable results: considering the limitations of a four-year project, the degree of poverty of the families involved, and the absence of interventions aimed at livelihood improvement for the parents, the risk of withdrawn children returning to work is considerable. Continued enrollment can only be ensured if (at least⁸) livelihoods are lastingly improved, or beneficiaries are supported until they reach maturity and are ready to enter the (adult) labor market.

Although not explicitly mentioned in the project revision form, the original third output (providing “viable alternatives to sending/permitting children to work”) has been dropped because of the shift from withdrawal to prevention, and because the project staff did not want to give parents the impression that they were being rewarded for sending children to work. The sub-objective of encouraging employers to hire of-age domestic workers was abandoned, which was regrettable as the proposed interventions might have had long-lasting results.

The sending areas appeared to be more commonly located in urban slums than rural zones, except for some specific areas. The project, therefore, focused on the urban and sub-urban zones of Rabat/Salé/Témaré, Marrakech, and Casablanca/Mohammedia, and on the rural areas of El Haouz and El Kelaâ, close to Marrakech.

2.1.5 Composition of the Budget, Efficiency, and Dollar Depreciation

Of the project’s US\$3 million budget, slightly less than two-thirds forms the field budget, of which 42 percent is destined for the project activities and sub-contracting. This means that 72 percent of the total budget is directed at overhead and operational costs, which is considerable. However, it is difficult to evaluate the 30 percent being spent in the United States, as the evaluator only had access to the field budget breakdown.

The efficiency per beneficiary is high though: at least 200 hours of nonformal education is provided for only US\$100 per child and 60 hours of support courses cost US\$40 per child.

The project staff has put in place an intensive monitoring system, which is costly in terms of staff time, but in budgetary terms the cost is reasonable, because it does not involve the most expensive members of staff. The total project staff (without taking into account the cleaning lady and the driver) currently⁹ comprises 6.55 full-time employees, of which 2.5 is continuously occupied with monitoring. This effort worth while though, as it not only enables proper and

⁸ Because other conditions also need to be met, such as access to schools.

⁹ The project staff was smaller initially, but after two years one expatriate member left, whose vacancy could then be filled by four fulltime Moroccan staff members.

efficient project management, but it also helps to build the monitoring capacity of local NGO partners and inspectorate.

In the course of the project, the U.S. dollar has had considerable fluctuations in value. On average it suffered a 15 percent depreciation, which implies a loss of US\$300,000 for the project, as only the field budget is concerned. In the first 2 years, salaries varied along with the dollar, which created an unpleasant insecurity for the members of staff. From the third year, the COP managed to apply a fixed exchange rate of US\$1 to 10 Dirham, which represents the initial value of the dollar. The loss incurred will be compensated in the last year by a progressive decrease of staff time charged to the project. The fixed exchange rate was not applied to the sub-contracts, meaning that through the conversion into Dirham the NGOs suffered a loss of 15 percent on average. More than anything, this affected the teachers' incomes, which were derived directly from the ADROS contribution.

2.2 IMPLEMENTATION

2.2.1 Educating Working and At-Risk Child Laborers

Under the main objective, the target was to provide 5,440 *petites bonnes*/at-risk children, and 900 children involved in car repair, handicrafts, and other forms of labor with nonformal education or professional training.

NGO selection

To this end, partnerships were established with some 33 local NGOs in the three target areas of Rabat/Salé/Témara, Marrakech/Al Kêlaa, and Casablanca/Mohammedia. A request for proposals was published in the local newspapers, followed by interviews with the NGOs that had shown interest. The interviews were to ensure some level of expertise in literacy/nonformal education, and the intentions and legal status of the NGO, but selection criteria was relatively undemanding, to allow inclusion of the less experienced community-based NGOs.

The NGOs were asked to describe their project in a four-page format developed by ADROS, calling for information about the target population, the proposed activities, the beneficiary recruitment zone, the location of the classroom(s), available human and material resources, a timeline, a budget, the requested ADROS contribution, a match contribution, and a short monitoring plan. The projects were similar though, and no minimum match was required.

Proposed activities

Prescribed activities comprised the selection of under-age (<15 years) *petites bonnes* and other working children, the establishment of partnerships with the local representations of the ministries of education and nonformal education to obtain classrooms and teacher trainings, the teaching of nonformal education classes, and the sanitary monitoring of the beneficiaries. The NGOs were required to provide a minimum of 6 hours of classes per week and 200 per year. In view of the problematic background of the beneficiaries (e.g., poor school records, poverty, domestic instability), the courses were to include fun activities, such as drawing, theater, music, or sports, in addition to the modules on French, Arabic, mathematics, history, geography, and

civil education provided by the government. Attention was also to be given to the rights of children, health education, and the pedagogical approach. ADROS promotes the active participation of the children and the arrangement of tables in a U-shape or circle, if the size of the classroom allows it.

School monitoring

The NGOs are expected to closely monitor each beneficiary. An individual file is drawn up for every child, which contains personal details, information about the parents, the size of the family, prior school and working record, and the project school record. The teacher needs to keep daily records of school attendance, and follow up on repeated absence by means of home visits. Moreover, the NGO fills out a progress report every quarter, stating the implemented activities, challenges, and proposed solutions.

Additional monitoring is done by inspectors of the Direction of Nonformal Education. They also write quarterly reports in which they rate the preparation and organization of the classes, the pedagogical approach and the participation of children, and the monitoring of children by the teachers (home visits in case of prolonged absence, and social and teaching assistance for children faced with problems). Perhaps even more importantly, the inspectors make use of their experience in education to guide the ADROS teachers.

In 2006, USDOL introduced the distinction between withdrawn and prevented in the Government Performance Reporting Act (GPRA) table and became interested in monitoring the working status of children when not in school. This meant that the project staff needed to collect data about the current working situation of the beneficiaries, and that all 168 classes had to be visited.

Disbursement of funds

ADROS pays the US\$100 per child in five installments over a period of 15 months upon reception of the quarterly report, on the basis of actual enrollments. This system allows the staff to manage the project efficiently (no funds are disbursed for children who have dropped out), but most of all it incites NGOs to deploy maximum efforts to retain beneficiaries. The fact that the last installment is due in the next school year ensures that NGOs monitor the effective transition or re-enrollment of the children.

Teaching materials

In addition to the US\$100, ADROS pays for stationary for each child at least once and twice if she re-enrolls. In principle, manuals are provided free of charge by the Direction of Nonformal Education. In practice, new manuals were being developed during the first two years of the project, while the old ones were no longer available. At the start of the third year, the project was able to distribute the first level of the new manual among its partners,¹⁰ but the second and third level became available only toward the end of the school year. This meant that many teachers needed to improvise, and borrow from the formal primary school manuals, which are not adapted to the needs of the nonformal education population.

¹⁰ ADROS paid for the printing costs of 2,000 level 1 manuals to speed up the process of multiplication.

Practical classes

At the start of the project, ADROS signed a partnership convention with the State-based organization *Entraide National*, which has youth and cultural centers throughout Morocco that provide preparatory vocational training. Normally, children with a grade four level can enter the training and the certificate handed out upon completion of the program provides access to official vocational training schools. The convention signed with ADROS stipulated that all project beneficiaries enrolled in nonformal education would have access, and that ADROS children would be given priority over other children. On the local level too, many NGOs had developed fruitful partnerships with *Entraide*, allowing them to combine the nonformal education modules with a practical professional training. In project locations where *Entraide* was not represented, the NGOs sometimes organized practical classes themselves (notably in cooking, embroidery, and tailoring).

Beneficiary selection

The selection of beneficiaries was a labor intensive process, involving numerous door-to-door visits by teachers and social workers to trace working and at-risk children age 7 to 15. Some NGOs used school records to trace dropouts. Others were so well acquainted with the neighborhood that they were already aware of the whereabouts of working and out-of-school children. One visit was usually not enough, as parents and/or employers needed to be convinced of the utility of the program, the dangers of child labor, and the serious intentions of the project.

The project had defined certain areas as sending areas, meaning that children from within these zones are considered at risk of entering child labor, and notably child domestic work. The NGOs working within these areas only needed to check the age and the out-of-school status of the children.

Results

After the somewhat difficult start in the first year, because of the exclusive focus on the withdrawal of *petites bonnes*, the collective efforts resulted in enrollment, retention, and completion figures that surpassed the project's objective. The enrollment of working children other than *petites bonnes* proved much easier from the start, as their work is less invisible and taboo. The project staff needed to halt enrollment during the third year, because of the financial burden it threatened to place on the budget: 994 extra enrollments meant another US\$99,400 of unforeseen expenses.¹¹ Moreover, the project staff wanted to be able to complete the delivery of educational services to those already enrolled and monitor the transition process during the last year.

Retention figures in the second year were near 85 percent. The project has sought to improve this rate in the third year, but the results are not yet known. The project staff is conscious of the fact that to obtain sustainable results, a transition to either formal education or vocational training before the project phases out is important. That is why the third year has been labeled the "transition year" and a lot of effort is being made to increase the transition rate, even though the

¹¹ Part of this was paid through the reduction of the shelter budget (Output 2.b) with US\$70,000. This was possible because other donors were willing to complement the operational costs of the shelters.

targets have been met. During the evaluation period, NGOs were sending in the lists of beneficiaries ready to enroll in either formal education or vocational training in the next academic year. Although most lists were still to come, the children already numbered 589 for vocational training and 48 for formal education. While the first list exceeds the objective, formal education appears to lag behind a bit, but the target might still be met.

Table 2: Petites bonnes

Indicator		Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	LOP
Enrollment	Target	907	1,209	1,511	1,813	5,440
	Actual	572	2,669	3,282	-	6,523
Re-enrollment	Target	0	502	921	1,297	2,720
	Actual	0	2,424 ¹²	1,036	-	3,460
Transition FE	Target	0	44	250	250	544
	Actual	5	133	164	-	302
Transition VT	Target	0	50	100	176	326
	Actual	0	106	137	-	243
Completion	Target	0	0	227	303	530
	Actual	0	1,235	904	-	2,139

Source: March 2006 Technical Progress Report, non-GPRA table.

Table 3: Children Involved in Auto Repair, Handicrafts, and Other Forms of Labor

Indicator		Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	LOP
Enrollment NFE/VT	Target	150	250	250	250	900
	Actual	752	1,357	26	-	2,135
Reenrollment	Target	0	150	150	150	450
	Actual	0	705	471	-	1,176
Completion	Target	0	0	125	125	250
	Actual	0	545	796	-	1,341

Source: March 2006 Technical Progress Report, non-GPRA table.

The tables shown above include 924 beneficiaries that are not represented in the GPRA table, because they have not been sufficiently withdrawn from work, or because ADROS has not forwarded funds for them as they did not meet the selection criteria. Total beneficiaries according to GPRA criteria are 7,734 (both boys and girls), as opposed to 8,658 shown in these

¹² The re-enrollment figure of the second year seems strange, as the number of re-enrollees surpasses the number of newly enrolled in the first year. The explanation the project staff gave me is that at the start of the project the USDOL definition of re-enrollment included “transition to the next level.” With the nonformal education modules, two levels could be taught within one school year, meaning that the project would count them as re-enrolled after the start of the second term. In the second year, USDOL introduced the cohort tables and changed the definition of re-enrollment. It would be good to have the year 2 re-enrollment figure corrected, because it adds up different entities than the later figures, but the advantages may not outweigh the cost of comparing all beneficiary lists again.

two tables. This means that on average, each class has three to four students who are not being sponsored.

Challenges

Though the implementation of this part of the project appears to be successful so far, a number of challenges have been encountered.

Pedagogical and social skills

Most teachers have more than the required educational level, but they lack practical experience. Teaching multi-level classes (very often grades one to six are all in one classroom) requires considerable pedagogical skill, especially when no adapted methods are available. Many beneficiaries come from unstable homes, where poverty, divorce, and illness distract them from the learning process. Many have also had a negative experience with school, either because they could not cope, or else because the teacher did not care or abused them. Children who work before going to class may be hungry and tired, which makes getting the children's attention more of a challenge than it already is. Teaching Arabic, French, and math in only six hours a week under these circumstances is far from desirable. This is why the extra curricular activities are so important: besides teaching children how to express themselves, they make school attractive and help to let students focus on the serious matters.

It is clear though, that the teachers must be more than just teachers: they need a great deal of social skills. The harsh social circumstances affect girls and boys differently. Whereas girls tend to need help restoring their self confidence, boys need to learn how to contain their aggression. As a result, the dynamics in a girls' or a boys' class are extremely different, and a boys' class may be even more taxing.

Awareness raising

The teachers need to continuously engage in awareness raising. Circumstances at home may change, or temporary work opportunities may present themselves, which may cause the students to drop out or become irregular. After a few absences the teachers are required to trace down the children and convince their parents and/or employers to let them return to school. Most of the teachers I met made home visits more than once a week. Girls who are employed as *petites bonnes* may suddenly move to another part of town when they shift employers and the NGO may lose sight of them altogether.

Enrollment deadline

It was not clear to the NGOs why the project decided to stop new enrollments after November of the third year. The reason for this was not just financial, but notably that ADROS wanted the NGOs to commit to training and retaining a cohort, rather than having fluctuating numbers throughout the year.¹³ Understandably, the teachers who were dealing directly with the beneficiaries did not want to disappoint new students, or lose students who were moving to

¹³ In the first two years, the staff noticed that children who dropped out were being replaced by the NGOs. Allowing this would have been a disincentive to work hard for their retention.

another part of town and might have been enrolled in another project-supported class. The project staff encouraged NGOs to accept such children, but did not forward funds for them. In practice, most classes have a few students who are not being paid for, and some even accept the young siblings of beneficiaries, as this is the only way certain parents allow the (babysitting) girls to go to school.

Teacher salaries

The payment system was also not well understood. Some teachers complained that they were being underpaid, whereas others did not understand why the last wire was made in the new school year, as they felt that they had already delivered 200 hours of classes and feared that they would not get paid the full amount as some students might not return after the summer holidays. The sub-contract agreement that ADROS signs with the NGOs actually says that the project takes charge of only part of the costs, and that the NGOs agree to provide a minimum of 200 hours of nonformal education in total, and 6 hours per week. This means that NGOs should find additional funds to top up the teachers' salaries and to increase the number of hours taught to each class. In practice, most NGOs stick to the 6 hours per week agreement, unless they offer practical classes and occasional extra curricular activities/outings. Only two NGOs pay (some of) their teachers a fixed salary, while most educators' revenues depend on the number of students they manage to retain in class. ADROS advises the NGOs to advance at least 80 percent of the US\$100 to the teachers, but they each have their own policy in this regard. The following table shows the variation in fund distribution among a sample of NGO partners.

Table 4: Distribution of ADROS Contribution Among a Sample of NGOs

NGO	Total sum forwarded 2005/6	Teachers		Coordinators		Other	
		Dirham ¹⁴	%	Dirham	%	Dirham	%
Grand Atlas/Marrakech	41,1545	287,739	70	67,739	16	56,066	14
Riad Salam/Mohammedia	16,442	11,800	72	1,400	9	3,242	20
Al Hayat/Rabat	56,706	47,206	83	7,000	12	2,500	4
Espace Associatif/Kalâ	71,790	51,840	72	4,500	6	15,450	22
Fondation Zakoura/National	410,353	279,078	68	93,816	23	37,458	9

Source: ADROS Finance & Office Manager, Morocco.

Not all teachers were well informed about the ADROS policy or their own NGO's policy in terms of payment and some complained about the amount of their salary. ADROS seeks to inform all parties as well as they can, but apart from providing the above mentioned guidelines the staff does not interfere between NGO management and the teachers.

Too attractive?

The project needed to be careful not to attract primary school students. Some children or their parents felt they might learn more in the ADROS-sponsored classes, because the teachers were more dedicated to their task, and there were more extra-curricular activities. One way to avoid

¹⁴ Moroccan currency; at the time of the evaluation the Dirham stood at 8.6:1 USD.

attracting primary school students was to refrain from providing school bags along with the stationary. Some NGOs allowed public school children to participate in some of the activities to let them share the advantages of nonformal education without having to make the move.

Transition to formal education or vocational training

The transition to formal education or vocational training demands a lot of effort from the teachers. They need to make sure the new school accepts the children, that parents will continue to support the education of their children, and birth certificates often need to be drawn up with help from the NGO. In many cases, the distance to school is considered too long by parents for girls to safely walk to school, and in none of the sites do provisions for school transportation exist. Continued monitoring during the next school year is necessary to ascertain that children make the transition and are retained.

Consultant's Assessment

Within the limitations of the design, this project component has been very successful: enrollment figures surpassed the objective, retention rates are high, and it looks as though transition rates are increasing. Parents and students greatly appreciate the program, especially where theory was combined with practical classes. Poor parents may not be inclined to support the long formal school trajectory ("only leading to unemployment," as many say), but they generally favor short practical training that will allow their children to earn an income.

In this sense, the partnership with *Entraide* is beneficial: it increases everyone's enthusiasm for school, which has a positive impact on retention. However, although the girls themselves are happy to learn tailoring and embroidery skills, the relevance of these courses for income generation is not always evident. While these skills are useful in areas with a sewing industry, in small communities only a few girls will be able to make a living from these crafts. *Entreaide* is conscious of this fact and seeks to modernize and diversify its courses.

A good practice is the strict monitoring by project staff, teachers and inspection. The system—

- Provides accurate knowledge about the number and characteristics of the beneficiaries.
- Ensures the correct application of the selection criteria.
- Gives information about the working status of beneficiaries.
- Guarantees the sound management of project funds.

The selection of beneficiaries was not a problem. In a few cases, the age criterion was not respected, but the project staff solved this by allowing these children in class without paying for them. These students were not counted as beneficiaries in the GPRA and non-GPRA indicator tables. A few children abandoned public school to join the ADROS classes, but they were returned to school unless there was a very pressing reason to keep them.

In spite of the complaints of some teachers, the project has put in place a number of mechanisms that increase the retention of students. The quarterly payment based on the number of actually

enrolled beneficiaries, and the fifth installment paid in the next school year, push the NGOs to stretch their efforts to maintain and re-enroll their students, as this directly affects the teachers' income. This is further reinforced by the prohibition to replace dropouts with other students and the home visits by the teachers. Administratively, a student's file is never closed, even if she appears to have dropped out. If such a student returns to school, the project staff resumes accounting and remunerating the hours of education received by the student.

A potentially weak aspect of this component is the transition of students to formal education and vocational training. Even if they formally apply now, their actual enrollment after the summer holidays is far from warranted, as the ADROS target population typically lives in a very insecure environment reigned by poverty. The ultimate results will depend on the continued monitoring by ADROS during the next school year, and the continued support by the NGOs after the project phases out.

2.2.2 Awareness Raising Among Employers and Parents

This component seeks to improve the attitude of the employers of working children vis-à-vis the advantages of education and the appropriate age to enter the labor market, and the attitude of the parents regarding the benefits of schooling and the risks involved in child labor.

A joint communication strategy has been put in place with the most important stakeholders in the fight against child labor in Morocco. Initial partners included IPEC and UNICEF, and more recently the Ministry of Labor through its Labor Direction, the National Observatory for the Rights of Children (ONDE), the United Nations Population Fund (UNFPA), the state secretariat for children, and the *Ligue Marocaine pour la protection de l'enfance* (Moroccan League for the Protection of Children) have joined forces.

The partners have focused mainly on the following:

- Finding the most effective messages.
- Finding the most effective ways to transmit the messages.
- Finding a way to speak through “one voice” by coordinating campaigns.

A large television soap series project is under development, to which the three initial partners (IPEC, UNICEF, and MSI/ADROS) have each contributed US\$70,000. The plan is to broadcast awareness-raising messages through popular drama that appeals to a large audience. Focus group discussions have been organized to measure the effectiveness of various messages included in a preliminary script. The 30-episode soap series will concentrate on domestic as well as agricultural child labor and will be accompanied by other awareness-raising activities among the project's target population to reinforce the message.

ADROS has financed and executed a knowledge, attitudes, and behavior (KAB) survey to establish the attitudes and the level of knowledge with respect to child labor before the start of the campaign. A second survey will be executed after the awareness raising to measure its impact.

Challenges

The KAB survey revealed a level of knowledge that was so high already that ADROS would not be able to improve the level by another 20 percent, as stipulated in the logical framework. This also means that measuring the impact of the awareness-raising campaign will not be easy. This is merely a technical challenge though, as it is obviously good news that the knowledge about the hazards of child labor and the merits of education is widespread.

The soap series was planned to have been broadcasted by now, but the project has been seriously delayed during the last year. This is in part a result of the large number of partners who have joined the campaign, rendering the process of decisionmaking slow, but most of all to the fact that the broadcasting service that had promised to produce and air the series suddenly pulled out, which left the partners without a production and broadcasting company and with a considerable budget gap. No one seems to know exactly why the service withdrew, except that there has been a change in management and the new director appears to feel that the subject is not cheerful enough to attract viewers.

The ONDE, which is headed by Princess Lalla Merriem, has now promised to approach the State channel. ONDE's influence might very well be able to ensure the collaboration of the channel. This still leaves the partners with a budget gap though, so they are considering the option of reducing the number of episodes, or dropping the soap-series altogether.

Consultant's Assessment

The joint communication strategy is a commendable initiative that sets an example for other social sectors, and for institutions involved in the struggle against child labor around the world. However, the partners should be careful that their strength (the number of partners) does not become a weakness so that it loses all momentum because it fails to act quickly. If necessary, a small sub-committee should be formed and charged with the execution of the strategy.

The soap series is an interesting, innovative form of awareness raising, especially in combination with focused punctual activities. It would be regrettable if the series was abandoned.

The fact that the level of knowledge is already high means that the attention during the awareness-raising campaign should be focused more on attitude change than on the provision of information.

2.2.3 Quality of Education & Shelters

Under this component, the project seeks to achieve three objectives: the improvement of the quality of nonformal education in the project zones, the equipment of three shelters for *petites bonnes* in need, and the provision of tutoring classes for children at risk in the sending areas.

Quality Improvement

As stated before, this sub-objective concerns only the ADROS-sponsored classes. It comprises a number of activities, including the following:

- A financial contribution to the printing of the new nonformal education manuals (Level 1) that were developed by the Direction of Nonformal Education ADROS donated US\$13,211 for the printing of 2000 manuals to speed up the issuing process so they could be distributed at the start of the academic year (the third project year).
- The selection of teachers according to predefined quality criteria. The teachers were required to meet at least two out of three criteria: have achieved the “Baccalauréat” level (six years of secondary education), have some degree of experience in nonformal education, and have benefited from ADROS trainings.
- A total of 18 trainings were dispatched to the project teachers concerning—
 - Interview techniques and awareness raising with respect to enrollment
 - Interactive teaching
 - Teaching centered on the student
 - The use of the new nonformal education teaching manuals
 - The process of transitioning beneficiaries to formal education and vocational training.
- Monitoring visits by the nonformal education inspector to the ADROS sponsored classes.

Results

The Level 1 nonformal education manuals were distributed to a great deal of classes (but not all) toward the end of the first term. As the copies received from the Direction were not sufficient in number, some children had to share books. The second and third levels were distributed by the Direction in the course of the second term. Some schools received copies in January, but others obtained theirs only shortly before the evaluation visit and decided to keep them for the next year. The differences are probably a result of the policies of the provincial representations of the Ministry of Education, as they are charged with the local distribution.

The selected teachers all meet and even exceed the educational level requirement. In fact, most of them have a university degree. It proved to be more difficult though to find teachers with experience and a background in education. Many have a degree in history, languages, or social sciences, and were not really prepared for their task. The trainings offered by ADROS were therefore a necessary component of the program. All teachers I met claimed to have benefited from at least one training, but most had received more than one. In addition to the project-supported trainings, the Direction of Nonformal Education also provides courses for teachers, and in Marrakech the ADROS regional committee organized teacher trainings.

The indicators with respect to the quality of education also include the equipment of classrooms. The project considers a classroom adequately equipped when it has electricity (important for evening classes), a seat for every child, and a blackboard. If classrooms did not meet these criteria, the project staff encouraged the NGO to request the use of another classroom with the Ministry of Education or the community. As the table below shows, the percentage of classes that met all criteria has been well above the target throughout the project.

The nonformal education inspectors rate the following three aspects of learner-centered methodologies in their reports:

1. Preparation of lessons and the organization of the classroom (pre-class preparation, organization and decorations of the classroom, arrangement of tables in the shape of a U, attendance sheets filled out).
2. Management of the classroom (participation of students in class, presentation of diverse activities and tools, group work, adaptation of materials for use by the child).
3. Followup and support of students (pedagogical assistance given to struggling children; counseling children in difficult circumstances; extracurricular activities for the children; when a child stops attending, the teacher inquires into why the student has stopped attending).¹⁵

To judge the situation, the inspectors pay monitoring visits at least two to three times a year, during which they attend classes and speak with the teachers. They not only monitor the teachers' accomplishments, they also give them advice to enable them to improve on their performance. As the table shows, 85 percent of the classes meet this quality criterion.

Table 5: Indicators with Respect to the Quality of Education

Indicator		Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	LOP
% of classes held in adequately equipped classrooms	Target	75%	75%	75%	75%	75%
	Actual	96%	96%	90%	-	-
% of classes taught by qualified staff	Target	75%	75%	75%	75%	75%
	Actual	98%	89%	89%	-	-
% of classes that use learner-centered methodologies	Target	75%	75%	75%	75%	75%
	Actual	NA	83%	85%	-	-
% of classes that meet at least 2 of the 3 criteria above	Target	75%	75%	75%	75%	75%
	Actual	NA	82%	86%	-	-

Source: March 2006 Technical Progress Report, non-GPRA table

¹⁵ The inspectors rate on a scale from 1 to 5; 1–2 represent a negative, while 3–5 represent a positive answer. Two out of three of the criteria need to be met.

Consultant's Assessment

The project has exceeded its targets with respect to the quality of education indicators, which is commendable.

The classroom indicator is a useful one, in view of the fact that part of school dropout in Morocco is definitely related to the material conditions of the schools. To say, however, that with the presence of electricity, chairs, and a blackboard a classroom is “adequately equipped” presumes too much. Rather, this should be considered “minimum equipment.” Adequate equipment ought at least to include tables, a maximum number of students per m², and the sheltering qualities of the building (e.g., the presence of windows). In the context of Morocco, one would have expected sanitary provisions to be included as well, as the absence of bathrooms is another common cause for girl dropout.

Not surprisingly, therefore, the material conditions of the classes visited vary enormously. Where use can be made of public schools, the classrooms are generally spacious and relatively well furnished. Other classes can be narrow, and wanting in maintenance and equipment. In a number of cases, there were no proper tables, but chairs with a little table on the armrest. Not all classes allowed the teachers to arrange the chairs in a U-shape or circle, for sheer lack of space, or because the classroom was borrowed from a public school and would need to be re-arranged each time after class. The pictures on the next page show some variation in classroom quality and arrangement: above are two community schools, below two public schools.

Considering students' enthusiasm and the comments of mothers, the quality of teaching is generally good. Some parents actually value the nonformal education classes more than public school, because they say the teachers are always present, they take their job seriously, and the children learn more than in public school. The mostly illiterate parents do not necessarily know the exact difference between the two systems, but they judge the merits of the ADROS classes from the teacher's attitude, their children's response, and the skills they learn. While this is obviously very positive, it also implies that they are not supportive of schooling per se, but of these specific classes. This is a lesson learned for both the Ministry of Education, which could capitalize on the experience of the nonformal schools, and for the project, as it means they are not finished raising awareness.

Temporary Shelters

This sub-objective relates to the establishment of temporary shelters for *petites bonnes* in the three main cities targeted by ADROS. It concerns existing centers run by NGOs that have longstanding experience and an excellent reputation in child protection: AMESIP in Rabat, Bayti in Casablanca, and Al Karam in Marrakech. The purpose of the shelters is to provide a temporary home to runaway, abandoned, and/or abused girls age 7 to 18 years, with the aim of reintegrating them into their families and providing them with an education. ADROS finances part of the operational costs (US\$8,700 against current rates) over a period of 15 months in five installments. Payments are made upon delivery of bi-annual progress reports and a final report describing the sustainability strategy of the NGO with regard to the center.

The NGOs have engaged to provide physical and psychological care and legal assistance to the girls referred to them or found on the streets by their own staff. The priority of the NGOs is to reintegrate these girls into their own families. If this is not possible, they are taken to foster families or a permanent home as soon as they are ready. The children are enrolled in formal education, nonformal education, or vocational training. The NGOs continue to monitor the children until they reach maturity.

The Marrakech center has been functioning for a year now, and two other NGOs signed conventions in early May and the centers have just started to operate.¹⁶ In Marrakech, the Al Karam director estimates that the center has cared for some 100 girls so far. In the progress reports, the last of which dates from December 2005, the organization reports assistance to 74 girls, 21 of whom were internal beneficiaries and 53 were external. The external girls would come for daycare and return to their respective homes at night. Of the internal girls, eight had been reintegrated into their families, four had run away, and the remaining nine girls were still at the center when the report was issued.

All three NGOs mentioned that they work in close collaboration with similar structures throughout the country, to ensure the proper monitoring of children reintegrated in a different area, and with the ADROS supported NGOs for both referral purposes and to enroll children in nonformal education classes if appropriate. They also maintain good working relationships with medical services, psychologists, the police, and the judicial system.

Consultant's Assessment

As mentioned above, the three NGOs approached by ADROS to execute this component have a long history and a good reputation in child protection. Not only do these NGOs deliver quality services, they also have the capacity to secure additional funds to ensure the continuity of the shelter after ADROS pulls out.

Tutoring Classes

The last activity of this project component was to provide tutoring classes to children at risk of entering child labor. It concerned children whose results in primary school after the first term were so poor that they were likely to drop out, and whose home situation was not stable (e.g., parents divorced, deceased, or unemployed, extreme poverty). The project offered 60 hours of classes in the last term, based on the specific needs of the child, to catch up in French, Arabic, and mathematics. The tutor had to be a different teacher than the day school teacher. The cost of these courses was US\$40 per child. As the table below shows, the demand was so overwhelming that the project surpassed its End of Project Target in the first year the activity was offered. Funds did not allow for the financing of more courses, which is why the activity was discontinued.

¹⁶ The objective was to start one shelter each year from the second year on, which means that this activity has been delayed.

Table 6: Indicators Tutoring Classes

Indicator		Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	LOP
No. of NGOs offering tutoring classes	Target	0	2	2	2	6
	Actual	0	10	0	-	10
No. of beneficiaries	Target	0	405	405	405	1,215
	Actual	0	1,445	0	-	1,445

Source: March 2006 Technical Progress Report, non-GPRA table.

Consultant's Assessment

Like the demand, the success of this activity was also overwhelming: after only 60 hours of courses, 83 percent of the children had obtained passing grades. Not only were they retained in school, but they were able to access the next level. The tutoring involved the following simple but effective concepts:

Using a different tutor than the day school teacher made sure that the latter were not rewarded for doing a bad job.

In addition to providing extra instruction, tutoring classes have a psychological effect. The child feels that someone takes an interest in his or her results, and poor children feel they can access what is considered a normal investment in Morocco for parents who can afford it.

For some reason, the beneficiaries of the tutoring classes are not represented in the GPRA table. This is unfortunate, as the staff could have added another 1,445 beneficiaries to cohort 2.

An unexpected result for ADROS is that the formula has been adopted by the State Secretariat for Nonformal Education, which has provided another 100,000 tutoring classes in the current academic year. Hopefully the state will continue and further expand these services.

2.2.4 Policy Advances

Child Labor Regulatory Environment Improved

The indicators for this output are the progress in passing by-laws for enforcing existing labor code regulations that affect children, and the progress on including law on domestic labor in the government action plan PANE.

The new Labor Code, including a number of child labor provisions, was ratified around the starting date of the ADROS project. The PANE was published and a draft law on domestic labor has been drawn up by the government, with input from IPEC, UNICEF, and ADROS. On July 17–18, a seminar will be held, during which all stakeholders will decide upon the final text. One issue to be resolved is the application of the law, as labor inspectors do not have the right in Morocco to enter the private sphere. Two possible solutions are to change the law to enable female inspectors to do checks inside homes, or to confer social workers the power to bring offenders to justice.

The law on domestic labor is a result of the joint efforts of many, notably IPEC and the Labor Direction. ADROS will provide the technical assistance necessary to guide the stakeholders through the decisionmaking process during the July seminar.

Public Policies Relative to the Protection of Children's Rights Adopted

This output comprises two elements: the adoption of PANE and the inclusion of materials on child rights and child labor in the new public school curricula.

To start with the latter, ADROS contacted the Direction of Curricula and a number of authors at the regional level, as each region develops its own curricula. It so happened that there were already various modules on child labor and child rights included in the curriculum. The project staff then decided to focus instead on the training of teachers on the use of the modules in the classroom. This activity will take place in last year of the project.

SEFEPH developed the 10-year PANE, a process that started halfway through 2004, when the State Secretariat collected data on the current state of affairs regarding child protection. On the basis of those data, objectives were defined and 12 categories of vulnerable children identified, including the category of working and at-risk children. ADROS has assisted SEFEPH with the elaboration of the logical framework of PANE, and it has built the Secretariat's capacity in strategic planning.

2.2.5 Capacity Building and Sustainability

Collective Action Concerning Child Labor in the Targeted Areas

As a method of building local NGO capacity and to coordinate the project in the regions, ADROS created three regional committees, consisting of representatives of the sub-contracted NGOs. For two of these, the committees of Rabat and Marrakech, the project managed to secure funding from the World Bank (US\$10,000 for each). The funds enabled two NGOs to take on the role of coordinator, develop a plan of action, and implement some activities in the region. In Marrakech, the NGO Annakhil organized teacher trainings, and in Rabat an awareness raising activity was set up that included college students. Other activities were organized using these funds, including meetings between Casablanca and Marrakech NGOs, visits to ADROS classes and centers, and a study organized by the Rabat NGOs. As long as the funding lasted, the committees were active, but currently they only convene when ADROS calls a meeting. The Casablanca committee that had no funding has never really functioned independently, only gathering on demand by the project.

Consultant's Assessment

Judging by the indicator ("regional committees are functional"), this objective has been achieved. However, it is not an indicator that measures the complete objective: "Civil society organizations and government representatives take collective action concerning child labor in the targeted areas." The committees have never become entities taking collective action on their own initiative, nor is the government included. They function as informal networks rather than concrete structures. Appreciated for their flexibility and lack of protocol, such networks are useful for the NGOs that are well-connected. They enable easy referral and information to flow.

For the newer and less well-connected NGOs, a more formal structure would be useful to make sure that information also reaches them, and to allow them to learn from the experiences of the core NGOs.

The committees could, however, be more effective: they could take collective action to lobby the government, organize awareness-raising campaigns, and take part in policy making. They could set the agenda for the struggle against child labor on the regional level and lobby donor agencies. They could monitor government spending and exert pressure, or denounce corruption. They should not be limited to the ADROS partners though, but include all NGOs dealing with child labor. If the committees are to have an effect, they should be formalized and have their capacities built.

Partner Agencies Capable of Monitoring Children's Access to Education

The aim of this sub-objective is to strengthen the capacities of the NGOs that have signed a partnership agreement with ADROS so that they are capable of using the monitoring tools developed by the project. The relevant tools for the NGOs are the individual sheets with beneficiary information, the attendance sheets filled out on each school day, and the quarterly reports in which each NGO reports its activities.

The End of Project target is that 40 NGOs use the tools. To date, 35 are employing them.

Challenge

Of the three tools, the attendance sheets were the most difficult for the teachers to fill out, not because they were complex, but because they demanded some rigor. Once established, beneficiary names should not be changed and the sheets need to be submitted on time to ensure continued funding. To remedy these problems, the monitoring and evaluation (M&E) officer now provides sheets for every month with the names already printed. The teachers only need to record the hours of courses provided to each beneficiary.

Consultant's Assessment

This output has been very limited in scope. Within those limits, the results pursued have been obtained, except that the target of 40 will not be reached, as the project is not going to sub-contract new partners in the final year.

Unforeseen Results

The capacities of the ADROS staff—notably the COP—in strategic planning are greatly appreciated by the government. As a result, the project's expertise is often requested by policymakers. If there is a connection somehow with the project's objectives, ADROS seeks to satisfy the government's demand. This has been a great opportunity for ADROS to build the government's capacities and at the same time integrate the issue of child labor into national policies.

The project has contributed to the development of the following texts:

- The plan of action against child domestic labor for SEFEPH, as part of PANE (in partnership with UNICEF)
- The strategy to build the capacities of NGOs for MDSS
- The plan of action toward a system of accountability in education (currently being written with the Ministry of Education)
- Technical assistance to the Wilaya of Fez for the strategic planning of INDH

The project is likely to receive more requests for technical assistance regarding the execution and monitoring of these plans. Such activities allow ADROS to achieve a sustainable impact. The project staff takes care not to accept requests that would burden the project too much in terms of effort or budget.

2.3 PARTNERSHIP AND COORDINATION ISSUES

The project staff has excellent relations with the government and other core stakeholders, such as IPEC and UNICEF. They are valued for their professionalism and technical knowledge. The SEFEPH affirmed, for instance, that ADROS is sensitive to the needs and realities of the society, and is well informed about the possibilities and constraints of the Moroccan Government. The Direction of Nonformal Education asserted that ADROS has forced the government and the NGOs to become more professional.

Although the project is in line with the overall government policy to combat child labor and provide education for all, it is not sufficiently linked up with the institutions appointed by the government to coordinate these initiatives. Whereas the privileged partners for ADROS are SEFEPH and the Direction of Nonformal Education, the central institution for the coordination of child labor issues is the Labor Direction. The latter hosts the newly created Child Labor Unit, and the National Steering Committee (NSC) on child labor. Originally initiated by IPEC, the NSC is the national body—composed of many stakeholders—to coordinate all action aimed at the elimination of child labor. ADROS has attended NSC meetings, but has never submitted the project for approval or monitoring. Instead, the project has its own steering committee, hosted by the Direction of Nonformal Education. This committee meets once a year to discuss the project's progress with a number of stakeholders (IPEC, UNICEF, ONDE, *Entraide National*, SEFEPH, and the Direction of Nonformal Education). Beyond these meetings, the committee has no status or mandate. In the upcoming meeting of the NSC, the COP will present the project for the first time. The fact that it has not been presented before is an oversight by both ADROS and the NSC itself, as the latter should require that all new projects pass through it, to increase their sustainability and reinforce the coordination of actions. It would be beneficial if ADROS could strengthen its partnership with the government through the NSC during the final year to create more synergy with other stakeholders.

UNICEF and IPEC are partners mainly in relation to the communication strategy, but they also consult each other informally and on occasion undertake joint activities. The three institutions

linked up to prepare a workshop at the annual conference of the ONDE on child domestic labor, and they are currently preparing the seminar on the finalization of the law on domestic labor in July. The collaboration between UNICEF and IPEC is greater than between either of these and ADROS. This is probably a result of the fact that UNICEF and IPEC are permanent structures and both part of the UN.

There is no particular collaboration between ADROS and USAID, other than that they share membership of a committee on education, comprising all donors in the field. With the Foundation Mohamed V, there is also little contact, as this organization focuses more on emergency aid than sustainable development. UNFPA and the Moroccan League for the Protection of Children are partners in the communication strategy.

The major challenge with the sub-contracted NGOs was their lack of experience. While some of these NGOs are very skilled in nonformal education, project management, and monitoring, quite a few partners are relatively new community-based organizations. They are well rooted in the communities in which they work and generally demonstrate a great deal of enthusiasm, but are not used to manage projects professionally and apply strict monitoring. The project has been so well structured though, and the NGOs were monitored so closely by the project staff, that in practice this has caused no major problems. A few NGOs did not work correctly, as a result of which the partnership has not been extended after the end of the first contracts.

2.4 MANAGEMENT ISSUES

The project staff maintains a good working relationship with the MSI headquarters, and indirectly with USDOL. Technical assistance is provided when necessary, and USDOL comments are seen as constructive. Both institutions provide the project staff considerable freedom to operate, which ensures the project's flexibility and efficiency.

USDOL has provided the project technical assistance with the design of a monitoring system and with the development of the logical framework and PMP. While the first did not work out (see below), the second is seen as beneficial by the project staff. Notably, it has helped them better understand the requirements of an EI project.

EI technical report formats allow USDOL to carefully monitor the progress and constraints of the projects it funds, but the level of effort they require is substantial. In the case of ADROS, the estimated cost is a full month of staff time, (only to process the data and write the report) which amounts to US\$15,000 per report. Perhaps this is a factor USDOL ought to consider when designing report formats.

Internally, the project is managed professionally and all staff members are dedicated to their tasks. Weekly meetings are held to establish the progress made, difficulties encountered, to propose solutions, and set tasks for the week. The entire staff participates in these meetings, which facilitates decisionmaking and enables information to flow freely.

2.4.1 Monitoring at the Office Level

The forms filled out at the field level are all classified and filed at the project office. Each NGO and each beneficiary have their own file, comprising all relevant data. This results in a lot of paper work, but this seems unavoidable, as many teachers do not have access to computers. The master list of beneficiaries is kept in an Excel file, organized by cohort, comprising personal data (name, sex, birth year), the working status (withdrawn, prevented, or still working), the number of hours in class per month, and if applicable “completion,” “transition,” or “dropout” are ticked. Another Excel file shows the number of beneficiaries per NGO, class and teacher, organized by target area (Rabat, Marrakech, Casablanca, Kalâa).

The system allows the project to track the status of each beneficiary and to produce accurate data for the progress reports. Maintaining a database in Excel is a bit laborious though, and it does not allow the staff to track the history of the beneficiaries and class composition. A database in Access could have more easily generated reports and the history could have been maintained.

Initially, the consulting firm Juarez & Sons was supposed to deliver a software system for the monitoring of the project. After two workshops, a lot of trial and error, and communication back and forth, the software proved unsuitable for the monitoring of this project and was abandoned. Only in the third year was the project able to implement the above-described adequate monitoring system, which was developed by the M&E officer. The delay caused by the defective software system is still affecting the project, as two years worth of data had to be inserted, while simultaneously the third year needed to be monitored.

Adding to the work pressure was USDOL’s decision to monitor the working status of the direct beneficiaries, which meant that for the 2006 March report, all 168 classes had to be visited by the project staff. It was not an easy task to get to know the working status of *petites bonnes*, as girls are ashamed to admit they work as domestics, especially in front of their friends. The ADROS staff, therefore, needed to speak with them one by one, and double check the information with the teachers.

Usually, the staff visits the classes twice a year, more often if there is a specific need. All in all, the monitoring tasks are labor intensive. To reduce some of the stress the evaluator recommends that staff members be allowed to compensate the days worked on weekends when traveling to the field.

As the project’s indicators are all clearly defined and a good monitoring system is in place, measuring progress toward the achievement of objectives poses no problem. A subject of debate though, was the inclusion or exclusion of girls who continue to work as *petites bonnes* into the GPRA table: child domestic labor has not been defined as a WFCL in Morocco, but it is definitely an exploitative form of child labor. Technically, according to USDOL’s definition, children can be counted as direct beneficiaries as long as they are not in a WFCL, and as long as the number of working hours is reduced and/or conditions improved. The project staff has applied this definition, as they consider that withdrawing girls from labor is a process that takes time, even though the ultimate goal should be that no underage girl works as a domestic.

2.5 SUSTAINABILITY AND IMPACT

Sustainable results are not easily obtained in the field of child labor, especially through a project that mainly consists of direct action. Factors that threaten the long-term affect of the educational efforts are the following:

- The precarious environment of the beneficiaries (e.g., poverty, domestic instability)
- The deficient infrastructure (e.g., many girls do not enroll or enter the next level because of the distance to the school, some parents feel the roads are unsafe for travel by young girls)
- The failing quality of public school (a major cause for drop out)
- The limited volume of education offered by the project (Even though some NGOs provide up to 400 hours of classes, most limit their offer to the minimum of 200 hours; either way, the volume does not compare to the number of hours offered in day school.)
- The lack of relevance of the public school curricula (not adapted to the habitat and work opportunities)

If these issues remain unresolved, the risk that children who are currently enrolled through the ADROS project will drop out (again) is considerable. To reduce these risks, there should be continuity of the classes (nonformal education, tutoring courses, and vocational training) and of the monitoring of the working/educational status of the children. Parents should also be empowered to generate more income and pay for the education of their children.

This is possible only if the government takes responsibility, if the NGOs learn to diversify their funding and set their own agenda, and/or if the project is extended.

ADROS's contribution to strategic planning by the government and the mainstreaming of child labor issues into national policy is the activity to most likely have a sustainable affect. However, even this level of effort requires continuous effort. The political will for these efforts has been mobilized by years of collective action by various stakeholders, and the government is now ready to take action. Sustained capacity building and dialogue are necessary to yield the fruits of these efforts.

For the last year of the project, it is important that ADROS focuses on the following:

- The continued strengthening of government capacities (in education, the child labor unit in the Ministry of Labor, of SEFEPH, the Ministry of Social Development).
- The strengthening of the capacities of the partner NGOs.
- The monitoring and supporting (through such activities as assistance with the acquirement of birth certificates or continued awareness raising) of the transition process.

Now that the struggle against child labor is gaining momentum in Morocco, it would be good if the project could be extended by another two years to really make a difference. A recommendation for a second phase of ADROS would be to include a more comprehensive sustainability indicator to make sure progress toward the fourth EI objective would be measured systematically throughout the project.

This page left intentionally blank.

III CONCLUSIONS

3.1 GOOD PRACTICES AND LESSONS LEARNED

3.1.1 Good Practices

1. The rigorous monitoring system, because it—
 - Accurately tracks the beneficiaries on the basis of actual enrollment
 - Ensures that beneficiaries meet the selection criteria
 - Provides accurate information on the working/educational status of the beneficiaries
 - Allows a sound financial management, thus contributing to efficiency
 - Helps to build the capacities of the implementing partners
2. The mechanisms that strengthen the retention of beneficiaries in school—
 - The quarterly disbursement of funds made on the basis of actual enrollments
 - The prohibition to replace dropouts with new beneficiaries
 - The combination of theoretical with practical classes
 - The learner centered methodologies
 - Payment of the last installment only upon re-enrollment or transition of the child to public school or vocational training
 - The home visits by the teachers
 - The administrative management of beneficiary files at the office level: files remain open even after drop out, such that a child can always return to school and continue to benefit from project funds
3. The partnership with *Entraide National*, enabling beneficiaries to take vocational classes besides the theoretical courses. Children who did not have the required level gained access to the *Entraide* classes through the convention signed with ADROS.
4. The partnership with the nonformal education inspection, which was very helpful in monitoring, providing technical advice to the teachers, and ad hoc problem solving.
5. The tutoring classes: a cost-effective, simple, and highly effective formula, already adopted by the Direction of Nonformal Education.

6. The joint communication strategy, because it—
 - Is well targeted, on the basis of research
 - Enables the stakeholders to speak one language, with one voice.
7. The technical assistance provided by ADROS to build the government's capacity in strategic planning.

3.1.2 Lessons Learned

1. In the context of this project, prevention has worked better than withdrawal, resulting in two important lessons learned—
 - Because the process of withdrawal of domestic workers is painstaking and complex in the Moroccan context, the target numbers would probably not have been met, let alone exceeded, if the project had continued to focus exclusively on withdrawal.
 - Withdrawal entails responsibilities that are not easily met by a short-term project: once withdrawn, the project needs to continue supporting the child until the parents are sufficiently empowered to provide for her educational needs, or the local NGOs need to find ways to ensure continuity of the activities until the education has been completed.

This does not imply, however, that prevention is better than withdrawal per se. To eliminate all child domestic labor, prevention is not enough and should be complemented by withdrawal.

2. The regional committees need more support before they can function independently from ADROS.
3. The fact that parents value the ADROS classes over public school means that a great deal of awareness raising still needs to be done to fight school dropout. Parents also need to be convinced to send their children to school, and advocacy is necessary to adapt the public school system to the needs of the children. Results of the latter would obviously reinforce the former.

3.2 CONCLUSIONS

The ADROS project is well designed and adapted to the needs of the target population. It addresses a form of child labor that had not been targeted on this scale before. The flaws of the design, however, are the lack of sustainability and phase-out strategies, and the somewhat too concise implementation strategy. Has the latter been more elaborated, the difficulties in withdrawing *petites bonnes* from work might have been foreseen. Indicators are relevant and measurable, but do not always cover the objective. Some objectives might have been more modest, while various indicators could have been more ambitious, to really make an impact.

The project has been cost effective, especially considering the fact that it suffered a 15 percent loss of funds because of the depreciation of the U.S. dollar. Despite these losses, the project has been able to target far more beneficiaries than foreseen, which is commendable.

All in all, the project has achieved impressive results—

- Target numbers have been surpassed
- The project is on track with all activities, except the communication strategy
- The project is strongly appreciated by beneficiaries, NGO partners, and the government
- The project is well managed and monitored by a qualified staff

The results in terms of numbers of beneficiaries would probably have been less impressive had the project not included prevention from the second year.

The communication strategy got delayed because the broadcasting company pulled out at the last minute, leaving the partners without a production unit and channel, and with an important budget gap.

A sustainable impact is most likely to be attained through—

- The capacity building of various ministries in strategic planning and monitoring
- The capacity building of the partner NGOs in monitoring and project management
- The mainstreaming of child labor issues in national policy through the plans developed in collaboration with the government

However, in view of the precarious situation of child laborers and children at risk of entering child labor, and the lack of capacity in strategic planning and diversification of funds of the partner NGOs, the sustainability of the direct action results remains a big challenge.

Although the project is in line with overall government policy to combat child labor and provide education for all, it is not sufficiently linked up with the relevant institutions. Instead of creating its own steering committee, the project should have been supervised by the National Steering Committee on child labor.

3.3 RECOMMENDATIONS

For the final year of the project, it is important that ADROS focuses on the following:

- The continued strengthening of government capacities (in education, the child labor unit in the Ministry of Labor, of SEFEPH, the Ministry of Social Development and Solidarity)

- The strengthening of the capacities of the partner NGOs in fund diversification and strategic planning, to increase the chance of achieving durable results in direct action
- The monitoring and supporting (e.g., through such activities as assistance with the acquirement of birth certificates or continued awareness raising) of the transition process
- The insertion of the project in the National Steering Committee on child labor
- Building the capacities of and formalizing the regional committees
- Producing the television soap series at a lower cost, not to lose the efforts made so far and make an impact through awareness raising
- If necessary, a small sub-committee should be formed and charged with the execution of the communication strategy

Now that the struggle against child labor is gaining momentum in Morocco, it would be good if the project could be extended by another two years to really make a difference.

On the management level—

- Staff members should be compensated for the days they work on weekends to reduce the work pressure
- USDOL should simplify the technical progress reports to reduce the cost of producing them