



Promising Futures: Reducing Child Labor in Jordan through Education and Sustainable Livelihoods

Mid-Term Evaluation Report

December 3, 2012

Report developed and submitted by:

Nahla Hassan

**Independent Development and
Communications Consultant**



Funded by the
United States Department of Labor

Promising Futures: Reducing Child Labor in Jordan through Education and Sustainable Livelihoods

Mid-Term Evaluation Report

December 3, 2012

Report developed and submitted by:

Nahla Hassan

**Independent Development and
Communications Consultant**



Funded by the
United States Department of Labor

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This report describes in detail the evaluation, conducted during October 2012, of Promising Futures: Reducing Child Labor in Jordan through Education and Sustainable Livelihoods. The report was prepared by ICF Macro, according to agreements specified in its contract with the U.S. Department of Labor's (USDOL) Office of Child Labor, Forced Labor, and Human Trafficking (OCFT). The evaluation of the Promising Futures Project in Jordan was conducted and documented by Nahla Hassan, an independent evaluator in collaboration with USDOL/OCFT staff, the Promising Futures project team, and stakeholders in Jordan. ICF Macro would like to express sincere thanks to all parties involved in this evaluation: the independent evaluator, Save the Children International (STC), the Jordanian Hashemite Fund for Human Development (JOHUD), and the USDOL.



Funding for this evaluation was provided by the United States Department of Labor under Task Order number DOLB089K28215. Points of view or opinions in this evaluation report do not necessarily reflect the views or policies of the United States Department of Labor, nor does the mention of trade names, commercial products, or organizations imply endorsement by the United States Government.

THANKS

I would like to express my appreciation to all individuals in Jordan for their support, flexibility, and cooperation during the field visit interviews. These individuals include beneficiaries, teachers, stakeholders, and staff members of government agencies. In addition, I would like to thank the Save the Children International project management team and the Jordanian Hashemite Fund for Human Development (JOHUD). I am also grateful to all field office staff of Save the Children International for their flexibility; planning and preparation; logistical support; organization of field visits; all of whom contributed to the final evaluation. I would also like to thank the staff of the Social Support Center for sharing their opinions and suggestions. I am thankful to all stakeholders whose insights and perceptions which helped me a great deal in finalising the report of this evaluation.

Finally, I would like to give special thanks to all beneficiaries, particularly the children and their parents for their willingness to share their experiences and tell their stories.

Nahla Hassan

Table of Contents

List of Acronyms.....	5
Executive Summary	7
I. Project Description	10
II. Evaluation Objectives and Methodologies.....	11
2.1 Scope of Evaluation.....	11
2.2 Interim Evaluation Purpose	11
2.3 Intended Users.....	12
2.4 Evaluation Approach.....	12
2.5 Interim Evaluation Team.....	13
2.6 Data Collection Methodology	13
2.7 Ethical Considerations and Confidentiality.....	14
2.8 Limitations.....	15
III. Relevance	16
3.1 Project Assumptions.....	16
3.2 Support Education Initiative Goals	16
3.3 Main Strategies in Withdrawing and Preventing Children from the Worst Forms of Child Labor.....	20
3.4 Main Barriers to Addressing Child Labor.....	22
3.5 Appropriateness of the Design to the Cultural, Political, and Economic Context in Jordan	23
3.6 Fitting with Other Initiatives in the Country (Government and Non-government).....	24
3.7 Program Region and Sector Selection.....	24
3.8 Other Design Issues.....	25
3.9 Lessons Learned and Promising Practices.....	26
IV. Effectiveness	26
4.1 Achievement toward Objectives.....	26
4.2 Effectiveness of Direct Action	28
4.3 Role of Intervention Models in Increasing Educational Opportunities and Building Local Capacity and Community Ownership	29
4.4 Identification of Beneficiaries and WFCL	29
4.5 Effectiveness of Monitoring Systems.....	30
4.6 Management Issues	31
4.7 Effectiveness of Livelihood Services	32
4.8 Project Readiness for Scale-up and Replication.....	33
4.9 Collaboration with ILO-IPEC	34

4.10 Implementation Challenges	34
4.11 Lessons Learned and Promising Practices.....	36
V. Efficiency	36
5.1 Cost Efficiency	36
5.2 Financial and Human Resource Management	37
5.3 Monitoring System and Beneficiary Monitoring System.....	39
5.4 Lessons Learned and Promising Practices.....	39
VI. Impact.....	40
6.1 Change in the lives of Direct Beneficiaries	40
6.2 Expected Impact on Partners and Other Institutions	41
6.3 Impact on Government and Policy Structures	42
6.4 Education Quality	43
6.5 Emerging Trends and Issues That the Project Will Take Further	43
6.6 Lessons Learned and Promising Practices.....	44
VII. Sustainability	45
7.1 Sustainability Plan and Exit Strategy	45
7.2 Leveraging Non-project Resources	45
7.3 Challenges and Successes in Initiating and Maintaining Partnerships with Other USDOL Projects.....	46
7.4 Local/National Involvement and Impact on Government Capacity	46
7.5 Additional Steps for Sustainability.....	47
7.6 Lessons Learned and Promising Practices.....	47
VIII. Recommendations	47
8.1 Key recommendations.....	48
8.2 Other Recommendations for the Project	48
IX. Conclusions	49
X. ANNEXES	49
ANNEX 1: PROJECT COMPONENTS AND ACTIVITIES	50
ANNEX 2: PROPOSED ITINERARY, MID-TERM EVALUATION OF PROMISING FUTURES	51
ANNEX 3: STAKEHOLDERS MEETING AGENDA AND LIST OF PARTICIPANTS....	53
ANNEX 4: OVERVIEW OF HOMEBOUND GIRLS PROJECT	54

List of Acronyms

CDC	Community Development Center
CECLE	Combating Exploitive Child Labor through Education Project
CHF	Cooperative Housing Foundation (currently, Global Communities for Good)
CLMC	Child Labor Monitoring Committees
CLMS	Child Labor Monitoring System
CMEP	Comprehensive Monitoring and Evaluation Plan
CPC	Child Protection Committee
DBMS	Direct Beneficiary Monitoring System
DOS	Department of Statistics
ECL	Exploitive Child Labor
EI	Education Initiative
GCL	Governorate Child Labor Committees
GoJ	Government of Jordan
HH	Household
ILO-IPEC	International Labour Organization's International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labor
JOHUD	Jordanian Hashemite Fund for Human Development
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MOE	Ministry of Education
MOL	Ministry of Labor
MOU	Memorandum of Understanding
NAF	National Aid Fund
NFCC	National Framework to Combat Child Labor
NFE	Non-formal Education
NGO	Non-government Organization
OCFT	Office of Child Labor, Forced Labor, and Human Trafficking
PF	Promising Futures
SSC	Social Support Center

STC	Save the Children
TCCCL	Technical Committee to Combat Child Labor
TOR	Terms of Reference
TOT	Training of Trainers
TPR	Technical Progress Report
USDOL	United States Department of Labor
VTC	Vocational and Technical Center
WFCL	Worst Forms of Child Labor
YBI	Youth Build International

Executive Summary

On December 28, 2010, Save the Children (STC) International received a 4-year Cooperative Agreement worth \$4 million from the United States Department of Labor (USDOL) to implement an Education Initiative (EI) project, aimed at withdrawing and preventing children from exploitative child labor in Jordan by expanding access to and improving the quality of basic education and by providing sustainable livelihood services to families of working children. STC was awarded the project through a competitive bid process.

The project called *Promising Futures: Reducing Child Labor in Jordan through Education and Sustainable Livelihoods* aims to withdraw 3,500 children from the worst forms of child labor (WFCL) and prevent 3,500 children from WFCL. The project further aims to provide 3,500 families with livelihoods services. Save the Children works together with its partner the Jordanian Hashemite Fund for Human Development (JOHUD) to address child labor in construction, small workshops, manufacturing, transport and storage, and domestic servitude (homebound girls).

Relevance

The design and activities of the Promising Futures project clearly support the five EI goals. Project activities are interlinked and show systematic support for one or more EI goals. The Promising Futures project uses three interlinked strategies to withdraw and prevent children from WFCL, namely: providing education services and innovative livelihood solutions while improving the learning environment of children; building the capacity of local institutions and partners to continue to withdraw and prevent children from WFCL; and, replicating the Social Support Center (SSC) model in three districts in Jordan. The project design is well suited to the cultural, political, and economic context in Jordan. The project recognizes that poverty and economic need are the main obstacles to addressing child labor in Jordan. The project provides sustainable livelihood options and economic empowerment solutions to help address this challenge. The project's planned activities in Zarqa and Mafraq in particular could be said to support government efforts to deal with the Syrian refugee crisis. The project fits well with other initiatives in Jordan aiming to combat exploitive child labor in general and is pioneering the work on homebound girls. Promising Futures builds on the Government of Jordan (GoJ)'s commitment to end WFCL in Jordan. At present, the project has a clear geographic focus and not a child labor sector focus. There is a need to increase attention to the WFCL identified in the project document, namely children working in construction, as well as in the transport and storage industries.

Effectiveness

Generally speaking, the project seems to be perfectly on target, if not overachieving, some of its indicators and slightly behind on others. Certainly, the project has encountered many delays that have affected its ability to stay on target. But, overall, this evaluation has found that the project interventions have been effective in withdrawing children from WFCL. The provision of transportation, for instance, is a commendable effort by the project as it helps reduce the cost of education that parents have to endure. It also helps the project monitor attendance at times. Also, the project is commended for providing Jordanian and non-Jordanian children with educational services. The project intervention models clearly increase the educational opportunities available to children. Although the project does not necessarily pay specific attention to refugee children, upcoming project activities in Mafraq, in particular,

will increase access to education by Syrian refugee children residing in this governorate. Other areas await progress, too. A case in point is the development of the database. Database drop down menus have all been drafted and developed, but the project does not have a functioning database. The physical database does not exist yet: The project has experienced delays in the development of the database infrastructure. According to the program director, the database will be available by the end of October 2012. Nonetheless, the project can be said to be ready for beginning its work in Mafraq. But there will be a need for strong coordination and oversight by the Community Development Center (CDC) to ensure the smooth operation inside the Vocational and Technical Center (VTC).

Efficiency

The project is cost-efficient. Nonetheless, there are various management and partnership issues that STC has to address in order to meet its stated objectives. The inability of the project to gain the complete support and involvement of the SSC in Marka and the delays in project implementation activities will have a serious impact on the project ability to meet its stated objectives and target numbers. The project should consider either (a) decreasing the number of its target beneficiaries, especially in relation to beneficiaries of livelihood services, and the number of schools where the project is planning to work or (b) hiring more staff to support the project activities. There is also a clear need to discuss and resolve management challenges with JOHUD to ensure that they are able to continue to meet their obligations toward the project and provide a smooth implementation of the project in the coming 20 months.

Impact

At mid-term, project activities have already led to positive changes in the lives of girls and boys alike and, at the end, project results are expected to make positive impacts on child labor. Generally speaking, children interviewed showed high levels of confidence and shared their dreams to continue their education and work in different fields. There is an evident change in perception regarding child labor and the value of education. Many of the interviewed children aged 12-16 explained that they used to think that it was better to work before starting their classes in the SSC. Children also spoke very positively of their teachers and counselors. The project is also expected to have a positive impact on improving the learning environment available to the children in the locations where the project operates. Intended activities in the schools, including upgrading infrastructure and establishing community-based committees for child labor will support the project's overall efforts to combat child labor by ensuring the presence of a monitoring body inside the school that continues to monitor the work status of children and systematically works on preventing more children from dropping out of school due to poor educational performance or otherwise.

For women, the project's livelihood services, particularly the financial literacy training and the establishment of saving and lending groups, were helpful and empowering. Besides the obvious expected outcome of improving their household incomes, coaching women to become self-sufficient entrepreneurs will have lasting positive impacts on the lives of these women and subsequently on their entire families.

The project's research results will have a positive impact on the work of partners and other institutions working on child labor issues in Jordan. The increase in the body of literature

about the situation of child laborers and the mapping of service providers in Marka, Zarqa, Mafraq and Maan will enable other institutions to build effective strategies based on empirical evidence. It will also allow future interventions to identify gaps in services.

The project's coordination efforts with other USDOL projects in Jordan, particularly with the International Labour Organization's International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labor (ILO-IPEC), have supported the activation of the Technical Committee to Combat Child Labor (TCCCL). The project has further complemented the work of the TCCCL by ensuring that national plans to combat child labor take into account the voices and roles of community groups, such as the project-established Child Protection committees (CPCs). This evaluation has found that, at mid-term, the project has already positively contributed to the quality of education in the SSC.

Sustainability

The project design is geared toward sustainability of project interventions and work modalities. The project works through a government approved and endorsed model by the SSC, which uses approved government curricula from the non-formal education program. The project has been successful in leveraging non-project resources to support and complement the work of the project in Jordan. Promising Futures has been successful in establishing local and national partnership with a variety of stakeholders at government and non-governmental organization (NGO) levels. The project strategically partnered with JOHUD for the implementation of its activities. This has allowed the project to work through an existing model that is endorsed by the Jordanian government and will support the sustainability of the project. The establishment of the Child Protection committees has also ensured that local capacity to combat child labor is established and supported. The role envisaged for the CPCs, along with the upcoming establishment of the Governorate Child Labor committees (GCLs), will help increase national involvement in combating exploitive child labor (ECL) and WFCL.

Key Recommendations

Resolve the partnership issues with JOHUD. Systematic efforts are needed to ensure that project implementation is not being affected by problems in communication and/or coordination with the SSC. STC should insist that JOHUD live up to its obligation toward the project.

As soon as possible, start using a beneficiary monitoring database that would facilitate follow-up on project activities and rate of implementation.

Align project indicators with USDOL indicators and ensure clarity and understanding of the various reporting requirements by all project partners.

Other Recommendations

Re-examine the criteria for providing livelihood opportunities to be able to provide services to families of children enrolled in SSC services as well as schools.

Provide additional training to teachers to allow them to continue to use child-friendly methodologies and enable them to focus on behavior and attitude of working children.

Strengthen the role of the CPCs by institutionalizing their referral and tracking systems and linking them to the GCLs and the national referral system.

I. Project Description

In December 2010, the USDOL awarded a four-year Cooperative Agreement to Save the Children to combat exploitative child labor in Jordan. The project will provide 7,000 children with direct educational services to reduce their vulnerability to child labor. In addition, the project will provide 3,500 families with livelihood services. Save the Children works together with its partner the Jordanian Hashemite Fund for Human Development to address child labor in construction, small workshops, manufacturing, transport and storage, and domestic servitude (homebound girls). Below is an overview of the project’s goal and objectives.

Figure 1.1: Project Goal and Objectives for Reducing Exploitive Child Labor in Jordan

Overall Goal	Reduce the number of children engaged in exploitive child labor (ECL), including the worst forms of child labor (WFCL) in Jordan
Immediate Objective	Withdraw or prevent targeted children from entering exploitive labor and provide formal and/or non-formal education and/or vocational training
Output 1	Reduce exploitive child labor and provide services to promote education and sustainable livelihoods
Output 2	Strengthen policies and capacity on child labor, education, and sustainable livelihoods
Output 3	Raise awareness on exploitive child labor, its root causes, and the importance of education
Output 4	Conduct needs assessment based on prevalence of ECL & WFCL, educational performance, and economic profile of targeted households, as well as schools and other learning environments
Output 5	Promote long-term sustainability of efforts to combat exploitive child labor and improve livelihoods

The Promising Futures project utilizes an integrated approach that combines educational services with livelihood services. Formal, vocational, and non-formal educational services are designed to provide at-risk youth with viable educational alternatives to child labor. Livelihood services link households with financial services; provide training and technical assistance in financial literacy; and increase household access to producer and marketing groups. Additional project components focus on the establishment and coordination of government entities, awareness-raising, research, and sustainability. Homebound girls represent a particular focus for the project. For cultural more than economic reasons, these girls are often removed from school to perform domestic work in their own homes on a full-time basis. Please see Annex 1 for a list of project components and key activities.

II. Evaluation Objectives and Methodologies

This section provides an overview of the evaluation objectives and the methodologies used, including data collection and analysis.

2.1 Scope of Evaluation

The scope of the evaluation includes a review and assessment of all activities carried out under the USDOL Cooperative Agreement with Save the Children. All activities that have been implemented from project launch through time of evaluation fieldwork were considered. The evaluation assessed the project's achievements of reaching its targets and objectives, as outlined in the Cooperative Agreement and project document. The evaluation examined issues of project design, implementation, management, lessons learned, and replicability, and provides recommendations for current and future projects.

2.2 Interim Evaluation Purpose

The purpose of the interim evaluation is the following:

1. Assess the relevance of the project in the cultural, economic, and political context in the country, as well as the extent to which it is suited to the priorities and policies of the host country government.
2. Determine whether the project is on track toward meeting its objectives and identify the challenges encountered in doing so:
 - a. How far off track is the project on the implementation of livelihood and vocational training services from their original timeline (due to difficulties with Youth Build International)?
 - b. Are the interventions that Youth Build has put forth or implemented viable livelihood or vocational training solutions? Will they help people find good, safe jobs?
 - c. How has the delay affected project beneficiaries?
 - d. What, if anything, can the project do to get back on track and target their original number of beneficiaries?
3. Provide recommendations toward how the project can successfully overcome challenges to meet its objectives and targets by the time of project end.
4. Assess the effectiveness of the project's strategies and the project's strengths and weaknesses in project implementation and identify areas in need of improvement.
5. Assess whether project activities can be deemed sustainable at the local and national level, and among implementing organizations, and identify steps that can be taken to enhance the sustainability of project components and objectives.
6. Determine if the intended number of beneficiaries, forms of child labor, and general vulnerability level of beneficiaries changed as a result of the Syrian situation.
7. Determine the issues of greatest concern, which the project is unable to handle.

8. Determine if (and how) the project should adjust to this new implementing environment.
9. Determine the lessons learned that the STC project incorporated into their design and to what extent they have been successful.
10. Determine how well the projects have learned from past mistakes and whether this project will be more successful in building local capacity, fully removing children from work situations, in reducing dropout rates in the program, and in monitoring the beneficiaries throughout the life of the project.

2.3 Intended Users

This interim evaluation aims to provide USDOL, Save the Children, and other project stakeholders an assessment of the project's experience in implementation and its impact on project beneficiaries. USDOL, the Office of Child Labor, Forced Labor, and Human Trafficking (OCFT) and Save the Children management will use the evaluation results as a learning tool regarding the relevance of the approach and strategy used by the project. The evaluation results should also be used by Save the Children, the Government of Jordan and other current or potential partners to enhance effectiveness in the project's implementation.

2.4 Evaluation Approach

The evaluation approach relied primarily on qualitative methods. To the extent possible, quantitative data was drawn from project reports and incorporated in the analysis. The evaluation was conducted by an independent external evaluator. All efforts were made to ensure that a participatory process was followed during the course of the evaluation. Project staff and implementing partners were generally only present in meetings with stakeholders, communities, and beneficiaries and then only to provide introductions. The following additional principles were applied during the evaluation process:

1. Methods of data collection and stakeholder perspectives were triangulated for as many of the evaluation questions as possible.
2. Efforts were made to include parents' and children's voices and beneficiary participation, generally using child-sensitive approaches to interview children following the ILO-IPEC guidelines on research with children on the worst forms of child labor (<http://www.ilo.org/ipeinfo/product/viewProduct.do?productId=3026>) and UNICEF Principles for Ethical Reporting on Children (http://www.unicef.org/media/media_tools_guidelines.html).
3. Gender and cultural sensitivity were integrated into the evaluation approach.
4. Consultations incorporated a degree of flexibility to maintain a sense of ownership for the stakeholders and beneficiaries and to allow additional questions to be posed that were not included in the terms of reference (TOR), while ensuring that key information requirements were met.
5. As far as possible, a consistent approach was followed in each project site, with adjustments made for the different actors involved and activities conducted and the progress of implementation in each locality.

2.5 Interim Evaluation Team

The evaluator was responsible for developing the methodology in consultation with ICF and the project staff; directly conducting interviews and facilitating other data collection processes; analyzing the evaluation material gathered; presenting feedback on the initial findings of the evaluation at the national stakeholder meeting; and, preparing the evaluation report. One member of the project staff, who was not involved in the evaluation process, could travel with the evaluator to make introductions.

2.6 Data Collection Methodology

Data collection was conducted in three phases: desk review prior to field visit; interviews and focus groups with stakeholders during field visit; and, document collection, further review and data synthesis after the field visit.

1. Document Review

- Pre-field visit preparation included extensive review of relevant documents.
- During fieldwork, documentation was verified and additional documents were collected. A complete list of the reviewed documents is available in Annex 2 of this report.

2. Tools Development

Prior to the commencement of the field work, the evaluator developed a question matrix, which outlined the source of data from where the evaluator planned to collect information for each TOR question. This helped the evaluator make decisions as to how to allocate time in the field. It also helped the evaluator to ensure that they were exploring all possible avenues for data triangulation and to clearly note where their evaluation findings were coming from. Following initial discussion of the question matrix, detailed question guides, by data source, were developed by the evaluator. The question guides encompassed all the TOR questions as well as others that the evaluator deemed necessary. The guides were overlapping and this was intended to create a pattern of perceptions about different issues.

3. Initial Contacts with USDOL and Project Management

Following the development of the question matrix, the evaluator conducted teleconference interviews with USDOL and Save the Children project management. The purpose of these interviews/discussions was to gather as much information about the project prior to the field visit, develop a clearer understanding of the main successes and challenges of the project, gain in-depth perspective on the progress of the project at mid-term, and acquire initial insights about the project's successes and challenges. This step also informed the tools development for the fieldwork and helped refine the field visit schedule.

4. Sample

In interviews, focus groups, etc., the evaluator solicited the opinions of a wide variety of stakeholders, including children, community members in areas where project activities have either already started or are planned, parents of beneficiaries, teachers, government representatives, legal authorities, the action program implementers, and STC staff.

The evaluation included interviews with the following:

- OCFT staff responsible for this project (Wendy Blanpied, Project Manager, and Margaret Hower, Evaluation Coordinator) prior to the commencement of the field work so that USDOL, as a key stakeholder, could provide input to the evaluation framework;
- Appropriate US Embassy staff (Elizabeth Litchfield) prior to commencement of field work;
- Staff from Save the Children headquarters; the Country Director, project managers, and field staff of grantee and partner organizations, including the ILO-IPEC project; and all project partners and sub-grantees;
- Appropriate delegates from the Ministry of Labor (MOL) and the Ministry of Education (MOE);
- Other international NGOs and multilateral agencies working in the area;
- Community leaders, members, and volunteers;
- School teachers, assistants, school directors, and other education personnel;
- Project beneficiaries (children withdrawn and prevented from ECL and their parents); and
- Implementers at all levels, including child labor monitors involved in assessing whether children are effectively prevented or withdrawn from child labor situations.

5. Field Visits

The evaluator visited a selection of project sites (those where project activities have started and those where project activities are planned). The final selection of field sites visited was made by the evaluator in consultation with STC. During the visits, the evaluator observed some of the activities and outputs developed by the project. Focus groups with children and parents were held and interviews were conducted with representatives from local governments, NGOs, community leaders, and teachers. A complete list of all those interviewed is available in Annex 2 of this report.

6. Stakeholder Meeting

Following the field visits, the evaluator conducted a stakeholders' meeting. The meeting brought together a wide range of stakeholders, including the implementing partners and other interested parties (the list of invited participants was drafted prior to the evaluator's visit and confirmed in consultation with project staff during fieldwork). The evaluator determined the meeting agenda in consultation with project staff. Some specific questions for stakeholders were prepared to guide the discussion and, possibly, to provide a brief written feedback. The meeting was used to present the major preliminary findings and emerging issues, solicit recommendations, and obtain clarification or additional information from stakeholders, including those not interviewed earlier. The meeting agenda and list of participants can be found in Annex 3 of this report.

2.7 Ethical Considerations and Confidentiality

The evaluation mission observed the utmost confidentiality related to sensitive information and feedback elicited during the individual and group interviews. Implementing partner staff were generally not present during interviews to mitigate bias during the data collection process and ensure a maximum freedom of expression of the implementing partners,

stakeholders, communities, and beneficiaries. However, implementing partner staff accompanied the evaluator to make introductions, whenever necessary; to facilitate the evaluation process; to make respondents feel comfortable; and, to allow the evaluator to observe the interaction between the implementing partner staff and the interviewees.

2.8 Limitations

Fieldwork for the evaluation lasted two and a half weeks, on average, and some project activities had not yet started in some of the sites. As a result, the evaluator took into consideration only the sites where the project activities have already started and where project activities were planned. This was not a formal impact assessment. Findings for the evaluation were based on information collected from background documents and in interviews with stakeholders, project staff, and beneficiaries. The accuracy of the evaluation findings were determined by the integrity of information provided to the evaluator from these sources. Furthermore, the ability of the evaluator to determine efficiency is limited by the amount of financial data available.

III. Relevance

This section considers the relevance of the project to the cultural, economic, and political context in Jordan, as well as to the extent it is suited to the priorities and policies of the host country government and USDOL.

3.1 Project Assumptions

The Promising Futures project has developed a comprehensive matrix where project assumptions, risks, and planned mitigation efforts have been carefully designed. By and large, project assumptions have been relatively accurate.

The project assumption concerning the possible difficulty in identifying homebound girls has proved true. The project has faced difficulty in identifying girls due to cultural and traditional norms in the community. However, the project has developed a solid mitigation plan to overcome this obstacle, which includes working through the CPCs to support the identification and recruitment of homebound girls for project activities.

Assumptions regarding education could be said to be accurate. The project assumed that it could improve the learning environment, which is dependent on a complex web of stakeholders. The project has successfully partnered with MOE and MOL to support improvements in the learning environment. The project has also concluded Memorandums of Understanding (MOUs) with the MOL to improve schools' infrastructure by supporting the development of internship programs for SSC students enrolled in the VTC.

The project assumptions regarding the participation of international organizations have also been accurate. The project has successfully established a solid working relationship with the USDOL-funded ILO-IPEC project. The project has also actively participated in the work of the TCCCL.

It is difficult to assess whether the project assumptions regarding the sustainability of withdrawal of children from ECL and WFCL are accurate. The project assumed that the income of the child withdrawn would be replaced by the families' new livelihood opportunities offered by the project. It is difficult to assess the accuracy of this assumption for two reasons. First, the livelihood activities provided by the project have just recently started and require time to assess their effectiveness and impact on the sustainability of withdrawal. Second, and most important, is that the livelihood component is not monitored in a way that would enable the project to accurately verify this assumption. (Further discussions of monitoring concerns are available elsewhere in this report.) The project further assumed that the service providers would be able to provide adequate support. However, according to the STC program director, many of the service providers in Jordan are facing financial difficulties, such as the National Aid Fund (NAF), which is limiting providers' ability to provide adequate support to those that need it.

3.2 Support Education Initiative Goals

The design and activities of the Promising Futures project clearly support the five EI goals. Project activities are interlinked and show systematic support for one or more EI goal. Below is a discussion of the extent to which each EI goal was supported by project activities.

EI 1: Reducing exploitative child labor, especially the worst forms, by providing direct educational services and by addressing root causes of child labor, including offering innovative strategies to promote sustainable livelihoods of target households

The project design fully supports this main goal of reducing the number of children engaged in or at risk of ECL. In order to meet its stated goal, the project works through the Jordanian government supported and approved model of the Social Support Center to identify children engaged in WFCL including homebound girls.

The majority of SSC's activities support the project's main goal. Teams of trained volunteers supervised by SSC staff conduct awareness raising, surveys, and recruitment campaigns at the community level to encourage parents of working children to register them in the SSC's programs.

The SSC provides a variety of educational opportunities to working children. These include re-enrollment into the formal education system if the legal age requirements are met. If the child is unable to re-join the formal education system, he/she can join the non-formal education system at the SSC. The non-formal education system, designed by the Jordanian Ministry of Education, provides students with a tenth grade certificate upon completion which allows them either to join VTCs or to continue high school through home-schooling education schemes.

The project further addresses the root causes of child labor in Jordan. The services provided by the SSC include counseling to children and their families and referral to service providers who could support children and their families either financially or through counseling and resolution of social issues that could be at the root cause of the child's work in the first place.

In addition to the counseling and referral mechanisms of the SSC, the project provides families of working children with innovative, sustainable livelihood opportunities that could potentially replace the income lost from withdrawing the child from the labor market. These livelihood services include family economic empowerment through the provision of financial literacy training to targeted households as well as support and guidance in forming saving and lending groups. Moreover, project activities support the provision of career counseling to parents and children, vocational training of parents of working children, and constant networking with service providers to widen the social support network available to parents.

EI 2: Strengthening policies on child labor, education, and sustainable livelihoods and the capacity of national institutions to combat child labor, address its root causes, and promote formal, non-formal and vocational education

The Promising Futures project works on strengthening policies on combating child labor through active collaboration with the ILO-IPEC project. The Promising Futures staff actively participates in the work of the Technical Committee on Child Labor, regularly attending meetings and contributing to plans to activate the National Framework to Combat Child Labor in Jordan.

In addition, the project has already established Child Protection committees. The role of the CPCs is to continuously monitor and refer child laborers to the SSC, where they can receive rehabilitation and education services. The project aims to create linkages between the CPCs

and the Governorate Child Labor committees (yet to be established). These linkages will strengthen the identification and monitoring of child labor.

The project has further supported the collaboration amongst many departments within MOE and between the MOE and MOL. The project has supported the establishment of a steering committee for the project within MOE, under the leadership of the department of non-formal education. The steering committee of the MOE encompasses representatives from formal education, counseling, and non-formal education departments. The project has also supported the establishment of a partnership between the vocational training centers affiliated with the MOL and MOE. This partnership will allow students in the MOL-supported VTCs to access apprenticeship and internship opportunities to rehabilitate schools' infrastructure, thus improving the learning environment in schools, on the one hand and supporting the improvement of the image of the VTCs in the communities, on the other. The project has also facilitated dialogue between the SSC and VTC to simplify the procedures and requirements for the enrollment of SSC graduates into VTC programs. Finally, the scale up of the project in the Mafraq district will allow students to receive non-formal education services inside the premises of the VTC in Mafraq.

Capacity building of national institutions is one of the cornerstones of the project design. The project works through an existing structure for the SSC using government approved curricula, namely: Strengthening the Culture of School Drop-outs (non-formal education program). Project activities include training for volunteers, MOE teachers, MOL staff, and VTC employees, as well as career counseling for children and financial literacy for parents. The project further supports the establishment and capacity building of community groups like the CPCs, school-based Child Labor Monitoring committees, and the Governorate Child Labor committees. Capacity building activities of existing national institutions and newly established groups is conducted based on needs assessments. These activities help strengthen the efforts to combat child labor in Jordan and support the sustainability efforts of the project.

All project activities promote the enrollment of children in formal, non-formal, and vocational training programs. The project will also aim to provide basic literacy programs to parents of working children to enable them to support their children's education.

EI 3: Raising awareness of exploitative child labor and its root causes promoting the importance of education for all children, and mobilizing a wide array of actors to improve and expand education infrastructures

The project's third objective: Increased awareness of the dangers of ECL and the benefits of education among community members clearly support this goal. The project has mobilized a wide array of actors to continuously raise awareness about ECL and its root causes and to promote the value and importance of education. Project volunteers engage children, parents, and employers to raise awareness about the importance of education and WFCL. The project also conducts seminars and community meetings where experts are invited to speak about WFCL and to promote the value of education, encouraging parents of working children to either send them back to school or to make use of the services available at the SSC.

The composition of the CPCs also ensures that parents and community members are involved in education issues as well as child protection issues, in general. In Marka, Promising Futures collaborated with Save the Children Sweden to establish one CPC with two sub-committees;

one focusing on violence and child protection issues and the second focusing only on child labor issues. This ensured collaboration and avoided duplication of efforts. This collaboration also ensured that the sub-committee on child labor supported by the project received more training on child protection as well as on child labor issues. In addition, this supported the project's efforts in mainstreaming child labor issues within child protection and in spreading awareness about WFCL to a wider audience. The CPC sub-committee on child labor in Marqa continues to identify children engaged in WFCL and refer them to the SSC. There is a need to strengthen the referral mechanisms to ensure that children identified by the CPCs are followed-up by the SSC teams. This will expand the role of the CPC and assure a higher impact and a wider reach for project activities.

Project activities target all children residing in Jordan, irrespective of nationality. This allows non-Jordanian children, including those considered by the GoJ as 'persons of concern'¹ to access the services provided through the project. The approach successfully supports the universal goal of education for all children. Likewise, it supports the overall rights of children.

The project design has a particular focus on homebound girls. At mid-term, the project already started to conduct research on the situation and root causes of the problem for homebound girls to enable staff to develop appropriate strategies to support girls' access to education. The project has plans to increase awareness-raising activities and take it to the national level. Further, the project has managed to enroll a number of previously homebound girls in its education programs.

EI 4: Supporting research, evaluation, and the collection of reliable data on child labor and its root causes and developing effective strategies, including educational and vocational alternatives, microfinance and other income-generating activities to improve household income

Project activities and strategies depend on research conducted by the project. At mid-term, the project has already concluded a comprehensive needs assessment (baseline) in Marka. The findings of the needs assessment were presented at a meeting of the Technical Child Labor Committee. The needs assessment helped the project modify its strategies and target groups. The project has also conducted mapping of service providers and key informant interviews in Zarqa and Mafraq. The project is currently engaged in detailed research about the situation of homebound girls in Marka, Zarqa, Mafraq and Maan. It is anticipated that this research will elucidate the situation of this category of girls and allow the project to continue to develop effective strategies to shed light on the phenomena and continue to raise awareness about the linkages between homebound girls and WFCL. It will also support the project's efforts to design culturally acceptable strategies that will allow these girls access to education.

The project needs assessment and research activities focus on mapping service providers in the target areas and creating linkages between the service providers and parents/community groups to improve household incomes in a sustainable manner.

¹ GoJ does not recognize Iraqis and Syrians residing outside of camps in Jordan as 'refugees.' The term used by GoJ is 'persons of concern.'

EI 5: Ensuring the long-term sustainability of these efforts

The project design has sustainability at its core. This project has strategically decided to combat child labor by working through an existing government approved and endorsed model (SSC) and build the SSC's capacity, fine-tune its procedures and systems, and replicate the model to other locations where child labor is known to be widespread. Further, the project has supported the expansion and infrastructure work of the SSC, thus, enabling the center to accommodate more children both during and after the life of the project. Ensuring the long term sustainability by working through government established systems is not without its challenges. The project had to gradually build partnerships and introduce work modalities that would ensure the success of project activities as well as the sustainability of these efforts. However, this strategy requires time and commitment, which have affected the rate of implementing project activities.

The project builds partnerships and agreements between various stakeholders to collectively address issues pertaining to child labor and access to education. The establishment of the CPCs and the upcoming plans to establish Governorate Child Labor committees will support sustainability efforts of the project, too. The project could consider supporting the signing of MOUs between the relevant service providers, especially the MOE and MOL, to increase common understanding of child labor issues as well as to foster common ownership of the problem, its solutions, and the sustainability of project interventions.

Working in partnership with other organizations and government bodies, as well as building on existing structures and systems, are all sound development strategies that could yield higher levels of sustainability. However, as noted, this process requires time to foster lasting relationships and ensure that new methodologies and approaches are accepted and adopted by the concerned parties.

3.3 Main Strategies in Withdrawing and Preventing Children from the Worst Forms of Child Labor

The Promising Futures project uses three interlinked strategies to withdraw and prevent children from WFCL, namely: providing education services, which includes innovative livelihood solutions and improves the learning environment of children; building the capacity of local institutions and partners to continue to withdraw and prevent children from WFCL; and, replicating the SSC model in three districts in Jordan. The project undertakes these strategies in the context of the country's economic and political climate. Below is a discussion of each strategy.

The project uses the SSC model as a base for many of its project strategies and activities. The SSC has volunteers recruit children engaged in WFCL into its non-formal education services. Along with education services, the SSC provides counseling and innovative livelihood solutions (discussed below) to families of children engaged in WFCL to improve the living conditions of these families. The project builds on this model by continuing the educational services to children as well as offering career counseling. The project further strengthens the procedures and practices of the SSC by providing training and capacity building to SSC staff, including volunteers, teachers, and counselors.

The project uses the provision of livelihood services and economic empowerment as a main strategy to withdraw children from WFCL. During the course of this mid-term evaluation,

discussions with project staff revealed that the project will provide 3,500 livelihood opportunities to families of children enrolled in SSC activities in Marka, Zarqa, Mafraq, and Maan. However, the project had no plans to include some livelihood opportunities for families of children who may be identified in schools (either for withdrawal or prevention). The project has clear criteria for identifying families and children at risk. In order to increase the relevance of the project livelihood strategies, it would be useful to clearly link the livelihood opportunities with withdrawal as well as prevention of children enrolled in SSC models and in schools. This requires close monitoring through the project database to enable the project to constantly review this important strategy and to measure its impact on withdrawing and preventing children from WFCL.

In addition to the provision of direct educational and livelihood services, the project works on improving the learning environment of children both in the SSC and in schools. The project is upgrading infrastructure at the SSC premises in Marka as well as the schools in the four selected locations where the project operates. Infrastructure upgrading is accompanied by teacher training and capacity building in the SSC, and the introduction of child-to-child methodologies in schools.

Many of the children interviewed during the course of this evaluation explained that they dropped out of school due to harsh treatment by the teachers, absence of play areas, and a generally violent environment in the school. The project strategy to improve the learning environment of children through infrastructure work and teacher training is directly relevant to the needs of children and can positively contribute to preventing more children from dropping out of school. Increasing the number of available classrooms for children already engaged in WFCL is also a suitable strategy that could enable the project to withdraw more children from WFCL by providing them with direct educational services. The project can further increase its relevance by providing more training to teachers, especially in teaching methods and dealing with children with learning difficulties or children engaged in WFCL. Similarly, it would be useful to increase teachers' awareness of their role in reducing the number of children dropping out of school and subsequently becoming engaged in WFCL.

The second main strategy employed by the project is building the capacity of partners and institutions to continue their work in withdrawing and preventing children from WFCL. The project identified and assessed needs and tailored training programs to support the work of identified partners and institutions. The establishment of CPCs and the training of committee members are of direct relevance. CPCs support the work of the volunteers and the SSC. CPC members have insiders' knowledge of their community and, through training and coaching by project staff, could potentially become catalysts for change and advocacy against child labor in their communities. The project further builds the capacity of VTC trainers on providing parents of children engaged in WFCL with financial literacy and career counseling. This innovative approach will increase the knowledge base of individuals and key stakeholders involved in the fight against child labor in Jordan. It will also help raise awareness about child labor issues and diversify the number and specialty of stakeholders involved in the response.

The third strategy used by the project to withdraw and prevent children from WFCL is to replicate the SSC model in other locations, namely Mafraq and Maan. At mid-term, the project already rehabilitated four SSC classrooms in Marka to accommodate children from Zarqaa. The project implementation strategy was developed so that lessons learned from one area were incorporated into the work of new areas. Promising Futures focused on improving

the learning environment for children from Zarqa based on lessons learned from Marqa. The project focused on creating an attractive learning environment for children through classroom design and furniture. The project also attempted to ensure the implementation of the MOE active learning methodologies. The project implementation plan is to open the replicated centers in phases to make certain that models, procedures, and approaches have all been tested and can be effective in the selected locations.

The project remains relevant in light of the emerging trends in Jordan, most notably responding to the Syrian crisis. Although the project does not aim to directly respond to the crisis yet, it is well-informed of developments, particularly in Mafraq where the project plans to replicate the SSC model. The project is appraised of emerging trends in child labor of Syrian children residing outside the Zaatari camp in Mafraq, and is planning to provide services to these children within the main strategies of the project. This issue was discussed with the program director who explained that many of the children residing outside the camp in Mafraq had arrived in Jordan prior to the eruption of the war in Syria. As such, they may not have been exposed to the same level of trauma as the Syrians who fled the fights. However, the program director indicated that the project was more likely to open special classes for the Syrians, providing them with extra-counseling based on needs, and not attempt to include them in classes for Jordanian children. Furthermore, the issue of the different curricula taught in Syria and Jordan was also discussed. The program director explained that the non-formal education (NFE) program was designed to help children who had not been attending school for more than two years and the curricula used was different from the ones taught in regular schools. The NFE program essentially focuses on literacy and numeracy.

3.4 Main Barriers to Addressing Child Labor

Poverty and economic need are identified as key obstacles to addressing child labor in Jordan. Promising Futures provides livelihood opportunities to families to replace the income of children withdrawn from WFCL and to prevent at-risk children from engaging in WFCL. This innovative and sustainable strategy needs to be carefully monitored and constantly evaluated to gauge the degree to which the provision of livelihood services can truly support the reduction in the numbers of children engaged in WFCL. It will be important to understand whether the project livelihood interventions are sufficient to withdraw and prevent children from WFCL, or if further interventions are needed and which type(s) of livelihood intervention(s) would be more effective.

Other barriers identified by the project are directly related to homebound girls. On the one hand, there is societal denial that the phenomenon of the homebound girl is a form of child labor. Communities and the government of Jordan alike attribute the phenomena of homebound girls to societal and tribal customs and traditions and fail to see the link to child labor issues. Access to homebound girls is one of the challenges that the project needs to address to be able to develop the appropriate strategies that can withdraw the girls and provide them with adequate educational opportunities. Economic factors could have a role in the phenomena but it is not certain. The project is currently conducting in-depth research about the situation of homebound girls. This will allow it to develop the appropriate strategies to overcome this challenge. In addition, the project has started to raise awareness about the problems of homebound girls within the communities and has rallied support from local and natural leaders to support the project's efforts in this regard.

Most of the children interviewed during the course of this mid-term evaluation have explained that they dropped out of school and then started to work. It is evident that there is a need to try and address the root causes that make children drop out of school. It is recognized that many leave school due to the financial situation of the family. Although education is technically provided free of charge in Jordan, many families find that there is a high cost associated with education (books, clothes, shoes, transportation, meals) which they are not always capable of affording. School-based violence and teachers' treatment were often cited by children as main causes for dropping out of school. Continued improvement in the learning environment and teachers' training could help reduce the number of children who drop out of school. Education quality in general and teacher's skills in particular are challenges that need to be addressed to help efforts aimed at reducing the number of children engaged in WFCL. Lastly, during the interviews conducted during this evaluation, it was noted that the value attributed to education is declining. Many of the parents interviewed explained that they know that they will not be able to further their children's education in university due to the costs involved and, as such, feel at times that the cost of education compared to the return is not optimal, as children will not be able to find employment opportunities. The children and parents interviewed during the course of this evaluation have explained that although they recognize that children should not work, they believe that working at young ages helps children develop skills and vocations that can help them build their future, since it is difficult to find employment in Jordan.

3.5 Appropriateness of the Design to the Cultural, Political, and Economic Context in Jordan

The project design is well-suited to the cultural, political, and economic context in Jordan. The project recognizes that poverty and economic need are the main obstacles to addressing child labor in Jordan. The project provides sustainable livelihood options and economic empowerment solutions to help address these challenges. The project does not provide direct financial support to families of children engaged in WFCL to replace the income of the child withdrawn from child labor. This approach is sound and commendable. Instead, the project provides communities and individuals with access to available social and economic support networks provided by the government. This is done through mapping service providers and creating the necessary links between the communities and these services. This is an appropriate approach that ensures sustainability of project efforts.

The project design takes into consideration the conservative nature of Jordanian society. Classes for girls and boys are provided separately and at different times to ensure that cultural issues are considered. Further, the project provides transportation to children enrolled in SSC programs. This important component ensures higher retention rates in project activities. Many of the parents interviewed during the course of the evaluation explained that the provision of transportation services is most important, particularly to girls. The project ensures that transportation services are supervised and that separate transportation is available to girls and boys enrolled in project activities.

The project has taken many steps to ensure that it is well-aligned with the political situation in Jordan. The events of the Arab Spring and the evolving Syrian refugee crisis have had implications for the project and caused some delays. Jordan has gone through four Cabinet changes since the inception of the project, making it difficult for the project team to finalize MOUs with the relevant line ministries. This has caused delays for project implementation,

particularly in relation to planned project activities in schools. Nonetheless, the project attempts to be well-aligned with the political situation in Jordan. There are plans being drawn to maintain services to children most affected by WFCL. The project's planned activities in Zarqa and Mafraq in particular could be said to support government efforts to deal with the Syrian refugee crisis.

3.6 Fitting with Other Initiatives in the Country (Government and Non-government)

The project fits in well with other initiatives in Jordan aimed at combating exploitive child labor and is pioneering the work on homebound girls. Promising Futures builds on the GoJ commitment to end WFCL in Jordan. In 2008, the Jordanian government established the Social Support Center (SSC) for working children. The core objectives of the SSC are in line with the National Agenda framework, which aims to withdraw child laborers from the market through rehabilitative services. The SSC operates through an MOU signed between JOHUD and the MOL, which established the SSC in East Amman to be the first of its kind in Jordan to offer comprehensive services to children who have dropped out of school and are employed, many as child laborers. The SSC works to address the fundamental causes of why children are drawn into labor situations and spreads awareness of the negative effects of labor on children, their families, and society.

Most project activities are geared toward strengthening the SSC model through improving its procedures for recruitment, counseling, and teaching, as well as providing sustainable livelihood options to families, including job placement when possible. More importantly, the project will replicate the strengthened SSC model in other locations in Jordan. MOL recognized the need to repeat the model in the designated program regions.

The project policy and advocacy work and the establishment of CPCs fit well with ILO-IPEC efforts to activate the NFCC in Jordan and develop a tracking system to support governments' efforts to combat WFCL. The project activities have also fit well with other NGOs' work on issues of child protection and child rights. The Promising Futures project has teamed up with Save the Children - Jordan to establish and train Child Protection committees and community-based Child Protection committees dedicated to child labor issues.

3.7 Program Region and Sector Selection

The project has successfully identified the regions where WFCL is found. The project currently operates in East Amman and Zarqaa, where small workshops and auto repair shops employing children are widespread. The project plans to scale up its interventions in Mafraq and Maan governorates. The selected program regions are accurately identified based on information from previous studies regarding 'poverty pockets' in Jordan. Discussions with government officials at MOE and MOL during the course of this evaluation revealed that Mafraq and Maan have the highest illiteracy rates in Jordan and the least attention in development from the government. Discussions with MOL show that although they prioritize Irbid as a location for a scale up of the SSC model, there is nothing to suggest that the locations identified by the project are not needed by the government of Jordan. The Secretary-General of the MOL explained to the evaluator that there is a need for social support centers for working children in all districts and governorates in Jordan. According to the Promising Futures program director and the STC assistant country director, the Prime Minister of Jordan has acknowledged the importance of replicating the SSC model in Mafraq.

At present, the project has a clear geographic focus and not a child labor sector focus. Nonetheless, project volunteers specifically target children engaged in auto repair shops through visits to these locations in East Amman and Zarqaa. The project has managed to engage government and communities alike in discussions about the relationship between homebound girls and child labor. Although, there is no formal (i.e., governmental) recognition about the link yet, the ongoing discussions will gradually alter perceptions about homebound girls. The project is also making efforts to include identified homebound girls in project activities

Although the geographical focus of the project is commendable, there is a need to increase attention to the WFCL as identified in the project document, namely children working in construction, the transport and storage industries. Alternatively, Promising Futures could focus its activities on the sectors identified through needs assessments conducted in the locations where the project operates and amend the project document in consultation with USDOL accordingly.

3.8 Other Design Issues

The Promising Futures project design is well-suited to the situation and context in Jordan. It exhibits clear understanding of the realities of child laborers and the challenges in addressing ECL and WFCL in Jordan. The project could increase the relevance of its interventions and strategies by refocusing some of its capacity building activities on addressing some of the root causes of child labor.

In particular, the project design currently does not place a focus on teachers' training beyond training of trainers (TOT) on career counseling. There is a need to focus on teachers' training especially concerning teaching methods and dealing with children exposed to WFCL and/or at risk. The project could also consider focusing on the introduction of active learning techniques and methodologies using materials available in the community. This will have long-ranging impact on teachers and children in formal and non-formal education as it would increase education quality. An important component in the project's attempts to improve the learning environment for children is to ensure that the furnishing of newly established classrooms, and whenever possible, old classrooms are conducive to active learning and child-centered learning approaches.

At mid-term, plans to work inside the schools had just about started. The project has not yet developed plans to monitor the work status of children involved in project activities and considered 'prevented.' The program director explained that the project is awaiting the formation of the school-based Child Labor Monitoring Committees (CLMCs) to collectively develop the appropriate mechanism to monitor the work status of children considered 'prevented.' It was further noted that the main duties of the CLMC in the project design did not include monitoring the work status of children considered 'prevented.' Rather, it was envisaged that the CLMC would support the implementation of the Learning Environment Enhancement Tool, as well as monitor school attendance and performance of children. According to the Promising Futures program director, discussions with MOE and CLMC are planned to determine, in a participatory manner, the most appropriate way to monitor the work status of children considered 'prevented.' (For further details about the role of the CLMCs, please see Annex 5.)

3.9 Lessons Learned and Promising Practices

This evaluation has found that the Promising Futures project is relevant to the issues and challenges of combating ECL and WFCL in Jordan. The project has focused on working through existing structures and building the capacity of local partners and institutions to ensure long-term sustainability of project activities. The project's key lessons learned and promising practices concerning relevance could be summarized as follows:

- Working through existing government-endorsed structures is a positive approach to development, ensuring sustainability of project efforts. However, working through existing structures requires time and effort to fine-tune strategies and procedures and ensure buy-in of project staff.
- Developing strategies based on needs assessments of communities increases the relevance of project activities and supports the creation of community ownership.
- Fostering partnerships between government ministries requires time and effort. However, the outcome of building partnerships between the various ministries ensures that project activities are relevant and potentially sustainable.
- Focusing on the root causes of WFCL requires paying close attention to teachers' training and introducing active learning methodologies.
- Focusing on geographic locations for project implementation should not limit attention given to specific sectors of child labor.
- Pioneering work, such as the project's work on homebound girls, requires time and resources to enable the project to raise awareness about it, gain community support for the ideas and notions presented, and develop culturally sensitive strategies that will ensure the withdrawal of these girls from WFCL.

IV. Effectiveness

This section assesses whether the project has reached its objectives, and the effectiveness of project activities in contributing toward those objectives.

4.1 Achievement toward Objectives

Generally speaking, the project seems to be slightly behind on some of its indicators and perfectly on target, if not overachieving, on others. Assessing whether the project is on track in terms of meeting its targets/objectives in the absence of a functioning database was one of the challenges of this evaluation. The project has encountered many delays that have affected its ability to stay on target. Discussions of these challenges are in Section 4.10 of this report.

It is important to note that the project uses different indicators and definitions to report similar issues. This is particularly the case for how the project reports the number of children withdrawn and prevented from WFCL. Project indicators provide different numbers and, accordingly, different levels of achievement than the USDOL's list of common indicators, which uses the terms 'children engaged in WFCL' and 'children at risk of WFCL.' There seems to be confusion about whether these two categories are the same as children withdrawn and prevented. The table below is based on project numbers recorded up until March 2012. It provides an overview of project achievements regarding Output 1. There were no other available numbers that the evaluator could use to determine achievements toward objectives.

Figure 4.1: Project Achievement toward Output 1

Output 1. Reducing Exploitative Child Labor and Providing Services to Promote Education and Sustainable Livelihoods			
Category	December 2012 targets	Achievement as of March 2012	Rate of implementation
Children Fully Withdrawn from WFCL	285	84	29%
Children Prevented from WFCL	285	120	42%
Children Engaged in CL, Receiving Education	513	572	111%
Children At Risk, Receiving Education	513	171	33%
Families involved in livelihood activities	1,138	452	39%

Output 2. Strengthening Policies and Capacity on Child Labor, Education, and Sustainable Livelihoods

The project, in collaboration with ILO-IPEC, has established the TCCCL and developed its scope of work and mode of operation. The project has successfully established two CPCs. One of the CPCs has received training and coaching for its members. The CPC is operational and is already involved in identifying children in WFCL and referring them to the SSC for follow-up and support. The second CPC has already been formed and at the time of this evaluation its members were receiving training. The GCLs have not yet been formed. The MOE and the Promising Futures program director have further explained that assessments of learning environments have been completed for 16 schools in Marka. Moreover, service provider mapping in Marka, Zarqa and Mafraq have been completed and production of information lists for Marka service providers have been compiled. The project has also successfully linked households to service providers. Other activities under this output have not yet started.

Output 3. Raising Awareness on Exploitative Child Labor, its Root Causes, and the Importance of Education

According to the Promising Futures program director, by October 2012, fourteen awareness raising activities were held in the communities (out of an expected 10 for 2012). Also by October 2012, a total of 19 media spots (out of 15 planned for 2012) were issued regarding ECL and WFCL as follows: 13 newspaper articles, 2 TV interviews, 1 radio interview and 3 ‘other’ media spots.

Output 4. Needs Assessment and Other Research

At the time of the mid-term evaluation in October 2012, the project had completed a comprehensive needs assessment and mapping of service providers in Marka. The project had also presented the findings from the Marka needs assessment to the TCCCL. Field work for mapping service providers and key informant interviews were conducted in Zarqaa. Fifty per cent of data collection of service providers was conducted in Mafraq. And, at the time of the mid-term evaluation, the research on homebound girls had already started.

Output 5. Promoting Long-Term Sustainability of Efforts to Combat Exploitative Child Labor and Improve Livelihoods

There were no intended activities under this output at mid-term.

4.2 Effectiveness of Direct Action

The project's main direct interventions focus on providing education opportunities and sustainable livelihood opportunities to families of children engaged in child labor. This evaluation has found that the project interventions have been effective in withdrawing children from WFCL. Many of the children interviewed during the course of this evaluation explained that they were no longer engaged in ECL and that they were only attending the educational services provided by the SSC.

Awareness raising activities provided to parents about the value of education and the linkages made by the project between non-formal education and the VTC help in the efforts to remove children from WFCL. Furthermore, the establishment of two CPCs will support efforts at raising awareness and will facilitate access to homebound girls.

The project model of providing separate classes and separate class times for girls as well as offering transportation services support project efforts in withdrawing children from WFCL. In fact, parents of children, particularly girls, believed that the provision of transportation services helped their children attend the classes offered regularly in the SSC. The provision of transportation is a commendable effort by the project as it helps reduce the indirect cost of education that parents have to bear. It also helps the project monitor attendance. Transportation services are available to children attending SSC classes and VTC services in Marka.² However, bus times are better suited to children attending the SSC and not to those attending the VTC, due to different time schedules. VTC teachers interviewed during the course of the evaluation explained that students from SSC attending VTC services do not benefit from the full range of training and school days in the VTC because they either arrive too late or they leave too early because of the bus schedule offered by the SSC. Higher levels of attendance and retention in the VTC can be improved by ensuring that bus services for children attending the VTC are appropriate to the VTC's working hours. However, it was noted that the provision of this type of service, bus services to VTC students, was not likely to be sustainable after the life of the project. An alternate method could be examined to ensure that children graduating from the SSC and enrolled in the VTC could continue to benefit from this educational training program.

The linkages created between the project and the VTC are effective. Many of the children interviewed explained that they continued to attend classes regularly to be able to access the

² Both the SSC and the VTC for girls in Marka are closely situated.

VTC and acquire a skilled labor certificate. They believed that this would help them access better jobs and subsequently improve their economic situations.

The effectiveness of the project's livelihood activities is positively perceived by stakeholders. Whether the livelihood components will enable the project to fully withdraw children from WFCL and prevent children at risk from engaging in ECL and WFCL remains to be seen. The Promising Futures program director explained that the monitoring of livelihood services is part of the Direct Beneficiary Monitoring System (DBMS). However, close monitoring is still required to understand how the provision of livelihood services contributes to withdrawing and preventing ECL and WFCL.

The project can increase its effectiveness by conducting teachers' training on teaching methods and dealing with children to improve the learning environment available to children in formal and non-formal education and VTCs.

4.3 Role of Intervention Models in Increasing Educational Opportunities and Building Local Capacity and Community Ownership

The project intervention models clearly increase the educational opportunities available to children. The project is commended for providing Jordanian and non-Jordanian children with educational services. Although the project does not necessarily pay specific attention to refugee children, upcoming project activities in Mafraq, in particular, will increase access to education by Syrian refugee children residing in this governorate.

The project increases educational opportunities available to children by re-enrolling children into the formal education system. The infrastructure and rehabilitation work of the project in the SSC provides additional classrooms for the SSC where non-formal education classes can be held. The planned replication in Mafraq and Maan will further increase the number of available classrooms for children in these areas. Promising Futures increases the educational opportunities available to children by building on the existing model of non-formal education and by creating linkages with the VTCs, both of which increase and enhance the educational prospects accessible to children.

Community-level awareness raising and community involvement through CPCs secures community ownership of the problem of child labor and hence its role in identifying solutions. Many of the parents interviewed explained that remote communities had no awareness of the dangers of child labor. Members of the CPC have said that they feel it is their obligation to continue to support the work of the project and to identify the children at risk of and engaged in WFCL.

The project's establishment of CPCs is an effective model that assures community ownership and sustainability of the project's interventions. Discussions with members of the CPCs show that they are highly dedicated individuals keen on rendering support to their communities. The project can increase the effectiveness of the CPCs by securing the structure with some form of legal status within the National Framework to Combat Child Labor in Jordan. The CPCs need additional resources to be able to effectively follow up on the cases referred to the SSC.

4.4 Identification of Beneficiaries and WFCL

Promising Futures has a clear geographic focus in Marka, Zarqa, Mafraq and Maan, where WFCL is widespread. The project is successful in identifying children engaged in and at risk of child labor. The project is generally adept in identifying families of children engaged in labor. The project competently identifies children engaged in WFCL and project volunteers specifically target children working in auto repair shops. Further attention is required for children in WFCL identified in the project document, namely children working in construction and the transport and storage industries.

Identification and recruitment of beneficiaries in project activities is not without its challenges. Project volunteers, tasked with identification and recruitment of children engaged in WFCL, have explained that some areas where the project operates are not considered 'safe.' At the moment, this includes the Zarqaa district. The volunteers have been working in Marka for a long time and are not familiar with the Zarqaa district, making it harder for them to access children and their parents. They explained that they have tried to work through the labor inspectors; however, job owners were scared and children would run away before the volunteers could talk to them.

Most pressing is the fact that project volunteers are not exclusively dedicated to recruiting children. Volunteers are also tasked with several administrative assignments and are only capable of spending, in most cases, two hours a day on recruitment. The SSC management explained that volunteers are taken to the field for recruitment using the same buses that children use for transportation, limiting the time they can spend on recruitment. There is a clear need to free up the time of the volunteers and provide them with adequate training to enable them to better identify children at risk. Volunteers have also explained during the course of this evaluation that it is difficult for them to access homebound girls. They explained that neighbors and community members refuse to help them reach girls and their parents due to cultural norms. The project is well aware of this difficulty and the Homebound Girl project will support efforts at identifying homebound girls.

Although project activities have not officially started in Mafraq yet, volunteers in the VTC Mafraq have already started to compile lists of children who have dropped out of school. The VTC manager in Mafraq explained that the work of the volunteers can be supported by finalizing all relevant agreements between the various stakeholders in Mafraq, ensuring that VTC staff have the required administrative permissions to be engaged with Promising Futures activities.

4.5 Effectiveness of Monitoring Systems

The project completed the design of the DBMS in February 2012. This system includes tables, fields, database drop-down menus, data entry forms for: assessment, child assessment, households, child services, identification, education status, household follow-ups, and child work status follow-up. Review of these forms shows that there are no linkages between the household form, the household follow-up form, and the work status follow-up form. There is a need to perhaps add a question that links these forms together to ensure that the impact of livelihood services on withdrawal and prevention of children from ECL and WFCL is monitored and regularly assessed and not assumed.

The project does not have a functioning database yet because the agency chosen for the task was not able to deliver. The project is currently switching to another company and hopes that the database will be operational by the end of 2012. The selected agency is the same that

designed the MOL labor inspection database and is also working with the ILO on the national CLMS. The database structure was reviewed and seems sufficient to monitor the beneficiaries. Moreover, the database will allow the project to determine the drop-out rate from project activities. However, database testing will reveal whether the fields are realistic and whether they include any redundancies. As previously mentioned, it will be important to ensure that livelihood activities are clearly monitored to assess whether they effectively contribute to children being prevented/withdrawn from WFCL.

Notably, the needs assessment and follow-up forms were developed by the project. However, the delays in developing the physical database meant that these forms had not been used by SSC staff tasked with following up on the children. The SSC staff that will be tasked with filling in the needs assessment forms explained that the form may be too long and may require several sessions with the children, which may necessitate additional time and resources. There is an evident need to test the forms and refine them accordingly. The project has contributed to refining and strengthening the systems and procedures used in the SSC, especially concerning the case file management of project beneficiaries. However, not all newly introduced and simplified procedures have been adopted by the SSC. There is a need to continue to work with SSC management to convince them of the usefulness of the new methods and ensure that efforts and resources allocated to training staff on these new approaches are benefiting case management.

At the time of this evaluation, project activities inside the schools had just started. At the moment, there are no clear plans on how to monitor children in schools. According to the Promising Futures program director, it is not that the project does not have a clear plan; rather, the project would like to develop the plan in a participatory manner by ensuring that MOE and CLMC are involved in the discussion and the design of a system that will allow them to monitor the work status of children. Additional fields will have to be added to the database once a plan is designed.

Once the database is available, the project's monitoring and evaluation (M&E) officer could perhaps consider holding regularly scheduled qualitative data gathering exercises with the children. Focusing on the root causes of child labor and on the effectiveness of the project interventions will positively affect project implementation and enrich the available data on child labor.

Currently, the project prioritizes livelihood beneficiaries as families of children enrolled in SSC. The project has the ability to support 3,500 families and the overall target number of children is 7,000. It is not clear how the parents of identified children in the schools will benefit from the livelihood component of the project. According to the Promising Futures program director, parents who benefit from the livelihood component will be channeled through and monitored by the SSC. There may be a need to review the available forms to ensure that the impact of this activity on preventing children from ECL and WFCL is monitored closely.

4.6 Management Issues

The project is generally under-staffed and staff members are required to play a variety of roles which affects their ability to focus on specific tasks and causes delays in project implementation. The project team is highly dedicated and committed to improving the quality of education and providing support to working children and their families.

Regularly scheduled team meetings are held; however, these meetings do not include all project staff. Most team meetings involve STC staff. SSC staff are invited based on need. Senior management team meetings between STC and JOHUD are also held based on need. There is a clear need to increase coordination and management team meetings to increase the effectiveness of project implementation and foster a sense of being one team with similar objectives. It's necessary to have increased formal coordination between STC and JOHUD as well as clarification of roles and responsibilities of each project partner. An increase in oversight of management and financial reporting of SSC will increase the effectiveness and efficiency of project activities.

The project's work with an existing structure that has wide experience in working with child laborers and their families is a double-edged sword. It facilitates access to children and their families and allows the project to use existing structures and channels of communication already established within the community. However, convincing the management of the SSC to change approaches and systems and having them revise their procedures and systems are time consuming efforts that impact the rate of implementation of the project.

On another note, providing technical training to teachers, volunteers, and financial teams can highly increase the effectiveness and efficiency of the project. There is also a need to clarify the role of each team member as well as to free up the time of volunteers to focus on identification of children engaged in WFCL. The revision of the management structures and modalities can help foster a team spirit within the project, increase local ownership of project activities, and support the project's endeavors in meeting its stated objectives.

4.7 Effectiveness of Livelihood Services

Promising Futures provides a diverse range of services to promote income generation of families of children engaged in WFCL. The project provides a wide range of financial services through networking, training, and coaching, which is effective and sustainable. However, assessing the effectiveness of the livelihood component and its role in preventing/withdrawing children from WFCL is not easy at this stage of the project since these activities have only just started.

The project provides economic empowerment to families through financial literacy training and support in establishing saving and lending groups. The project further provides career counseling to children and their parents. The project offers VTC teachers and trainers with TOT on financial literacy, which they subsequently provide to project beneficiaries. Most trainers and VTC teachers interviewed during the course of the evaluation expressed satisfaction with the financial literacy training. However, they explained that the material taught was very complex and difficult to understand. VTC teachers in particular have concern that the material may not be suitable for the target group. Interestingly, there are two versions of the financial literacy material; one is geared toward the trainers and the other is a simplified version for the trainees/beneficiaries. According to trained women in Abu-Sayah village interviewed during the course of this evaluation, the financial literacy training was appropriate for their level and easy. They remarked that the trainers worked hard to simplify complex issues and ensure that they understood them well. Additionally, they concluded that the training was not sufficient in itself and that they required vocational training on specific crafts, like candle making or others to be able to apply what they had learned. Moreover, they still needed support in product development and marketing to be able to generate income.

The project does not provide direct financial support to parents of children to replace income loss resulting from withdrawing children from CL. The project networks with other service providers in the community such as NGOs providing services, counseling, capacity building, and micro-finance loans to ensure that families have access to sustainable income. The project also networks with governmental service providers such as the Ministry of Social Solidarity and the National Aid Fund to support project beneficiaries' access to their rights.

Determining the effectiveness of this model requires close monitoring of linkages between the provision of these services and the withdrawal/prevention of children, which at the moment is not available. The project needs to consider how the livelihood opportunities support child retention in educational services and child educational performance.

According to the project livelihood specialist, at the moment some families of children enrolled in SSC services benefit from the livelihood opportunities offered by the project. Families of children identified in the schools will also be referred to the SSC for case assessment to determine the appropriate intervention. School students will also be able to benefit from counseling services provided by the MOE and could also be referred to other services not provided by the SSC. Although the project has some criteria for prioritizing families to receive livelihood services, it is important to ensure that all involved partners (SSC and schools) are well aware of these criteria. STC needs to closely monitor strict adherence and systematic use of the criteria developed by the project.

4.8 Project Readiness for Scale-up and Replication

The project implementation plan is designed in stages to allow for assimilation of lessons learned into project activities. At the time of the mid-term evaluation, the project had already completed a comprehensive needs assessment and the mapping of service providers in Marka and project activities that are ongoing. The project had also completed the mapping of service providers and key informant interviews in Zarqaa. Classes in SSC to accommodate Zarqaa students were ready in terms of infrastructure. There was a need for furnishings, hiring teachers, and recruiting children (some were already attending classes in the SSC in Marka). There seems to be difficulty in hiring teachers for the new classrooms, although the Promising Futures program director explained that the budget for it was available. According to the SSC manager, the timing of the classes offered in the SSC was the same as the operating hours of regular schools, making it difficult for the SSC to hire MOE teachers. Furthermore, the salary scale of the MOE and the project are different than the salary scale of the SSC. The MOE provides NFE teachers with a monthly stipend of JOD 90. The project provides the teachers with JOD 100. There seemed to be some resistance on the part of the SSC management to amend their salary scales to abide by the project budget. The SSC manager reasoned that prior to the commencement of the Promising Futures project implementation, they were paying their teachers JOD 190 and it would have been difficult to hire new teachers under a reduced salary scheme. At the time of the evaluation, there continued to be discussions between STC and SSC on how best to resolve this issue and to start hiring new teachers.

According to the project's M&E specialist, the mapping of service providers had already been completed in Mafraq and 50% of the data had been entered. The project still needed to complete key informant interviews in Mafraq. Strong, clear relations were established with the VTC and CDC in Mafraq. The project made plans to locate the non-formal education classes in the VTC, whereas follow up and monitoring would be in the CDC. Interviews with stakeholders in Mafraq during the course of this evaluation revealed that there was a need for

developing a clear plan and roles and responsibilities of the various actors who would be involved in the replication. CDC and VTC management explained that convincing the parents, particularly parents of girls, would not be an easy endeavor. CDC management in Mafraq determined that there would be a need to have a project coordinator who could oversee the work of the project and ensure that the work modalities and systems are in-line with project requirements. CDC management further concluded that the teams that would be involved in the project needed to be well trained, particularly in areas of communication, time management, documentation, recruitment methods, and in working with local communities

The project is ready for beginning its work in Mafraq. There will be a need for strong coordination and oversight by the CDC to ensure the smooth operation inside the VTC. It will be highly important to ensure that a beneficiary database is operational before the start of the work in Mafraq and that the roles and responsibilities of the various actors are clearly drafted.

According to the project implementation plan, scale up in Maan is scheduled to start in 2013. According to the project's M&E specialist, the project team has not yet decided whether a comprehensive needs assessment, including an HH survey, would be conducted in Maan or not.

4.9 Collaboration with ILO-IPEC

The Promising Futures project collaborates effectively with ILO-IPEC. Management teams on both projects meet regularly to compare work plans and ensure the absence of redundancy. The ILO-IPEC project does not have direct beneficiaries and works on strengthening government policies and structures, whereas STC works downstream with beneficiaries and allows ILO-IPEC to use lessons learned from the field to refine government policies and procedures for the national tracking system.

The two projects effectively collaborate on research as well as coordinate the work of the Technical Committee on Child Labor. The collaboration between the Promising Futures project and ILO-IPEC support the work of Promising Futures, especially the institutionalization of the work of the CPCs, which give greater voice and roles for community-based structures in the national tracking system. According to the ILO-IPEC program director, the collaboration between ILO-IPEC and STC has been very strong from the start of the project. Some delays in establishing the governorate-level Child Labor committees, which ILO-IPEC needed to do, have affected STC's ability to continue to advance its work with the CPCs at the local level. CPCs need to be linked to GCLs to increase their role and effectiveness.

The two projects believe that more collaboration and joint efforts could go toward piloting the referral and tracking system at the local level through the work of STC with local communities. This will have an impact on refining the tools and procedures for the national tracking and referral system and may result in a re-writing of the national framework and relevant policies, ensuring effectiveness and efficiency of the implementation processes.

4.10 Implementation Challenges

The project has encountered a number of challenges since inception that have affected its implementation rate. Many of these challenges could not have been foreseen prior to commencement of work. The project spent a long time in conducting the needs assessment in Marka, which resulted in delays in project start-up and implementation. The project team

explained that the key challenges they faced with the needs assessment in Marka was the lack of accurate household data. The absence of an electronic database of the NAF required the team to search through paper files for the target households. Furthermore, the maps provided to the project by the Department of Statistics (DOS) were not always accurate. Data entry also proved challenging and delayed data analysis. Nonetheless, according to the STC project team, these delays should not have taken away from the Marka Needs Assessment report, which had confirmed the accuracy of the project design and provided concrete recommendations to partners.

The political situation in the region and subsequently in Jordan caused delays in project implementation, as well. Four cabinet changes have occurred in Jordan since the beginning of 2011 until present. The teachers' syndicate elections and the difficulty in mediating agreements between MOE and MOL for SSC-VTC collaborations were amongst the challenges faced by the project. This has affected the project's ability to draft and conclude the required MOUs that would enable the project to start implementation. The delay in signing the MOUs particularly affected the project's ability to start its planned activities in the schools.

The project further faced challenges in establishing and maintaining partnership with key project partners, namely Youth Build International (YBI) and JOHUD. According to STC project team, a lot of time and resources were invested in supporting the intended work of YBI. However, due to the fact that YBI provides services similar to STC and the lack of clarity on behalf of YBI on how to proceed with implementation, a decision was made to stop working with YBI. This difficulty in establishing and maintaining the relationship with YBI resulted in delays in project activities with the VTCs.

Most relevant, the project continues to face difficulties in maintaining a solid partnership with JOHUD. The initial plan was for JOHUD to oversee the work of the SSC and ensure adherence to project procedures, systems, and work modalities. However, this role was not assumed by JOHUD, and STC had to micro-manage project activities taking place in SSC, placing enormous pressure on their time and resources. Refining the systems of the SSC without the appropriate oversight and guidance of JOHUD is a difficult and time-consuming process, which affects project implementation.

Lastly, the presence of several monitoring indicators was a challenge which caused delays for the design and implementation of the project's beneficiary monitoring system. The design of the database needed to take into consideration the project indicators, the CMEP indicators, and USDOL common indicators. The program director explained that in discussions with USDOL, but, nevertheless, it took a long time to reach an agreement on the indicators, which had an impact on the project's ability to finalize its monitoring and evaluation plans and proceed with developing the physical infrastructure of the database itself. As well, the project was unable to easily and smoothly use the CECLE3 database. Access to the CECLE database was problematic. Although the project was promised access to information about children who could be supported by livelihood opportunities offered by Promising Futures, to date

³ Combating Exploitive Child Labor through Education (CECLE) in Jordan was a USDOL-funded project. This was a four-year project that concluded in July 2012. CECLE aimed to prevent 4,000 children from exploitive child labor and withdraw another 4,000 through the provision of quality education interventions at many levels. The project also sought to increase the body of knowledge regarding child labor and support and strengthen policy structures to increase the protection of children.

access to this information has not been granted to the project. According to the Promising Futures program director, it took time to find a way to access the data, but temporary access to the CECLE database has been promised and currently only requires some organization by the two projects.

4.11 Lessons Learned and Promising Practices

The Promising Futures project presents many lessons learned in terms of effectiveness, as follows:

- Providing livelihood services to families of children engaged in ECL and WFCL can support efforts to eliminate WFCL.
- Designing project interventions based on empirical evidence lays the foundation for the implementation of relevant and effective strategies to combat child labor.
- Using research to develop specialized and culturally appropriate interventions targeting homebound girls is an effective way to access these girls and address the phenomena.
- Creating community structures and fostering community ownership of the problem will increase awareness about the dangers and perils of child labor.
- Planning to implement project activities and scale up in phases is a positive approach, allowing the project to better inform its strategies and activities.
- Working through established government structures ensures sustainability but requires a great investment in time and resources.
- Using a comprehensive beneficiary monitoring system including the necessary tools (such as a functioning database) at the beginning of the project facilitates project monitoring and oversight.
- Developing a common understanding and clear division of roles amongst project partners could facilitate the implementation process and speed up the start-up phase.
- Building clarity amongst project partners is required to ensure smooth implementation of project activities.

V. Efficiency

This section provides analysis as to whether the strategies employed by the project are efficient in terms of the resources used (inputs), compared with its qualitative and quantitative impact (outputs).

5.1 Cost Efficiency

The project achievements observed during the course of this evaluation and the number of activities carried out despite the delays in the start up and the challenges in implementation as well as a review of project budgets suggests that the project is cost efficient. The programmatic and activities costs and expenditures supersede the administrative and operational costs of the project.

The burn rate of the project at the end of September 2012 was 35 per cent, suggesting that the project was behind on implementing some of its activities at mid-term. In light of the discussions in Section IV of this report, the project has suffered from a series of implementation challenges. However, the planned scale up to Mafrag and Maan will, without a doubt, increase the rate of implementation and, subsequently, spending.

5.2 Financial and Human Resource Management

The project's financial reports have shown good progress on the resource match to date. The project has managed to raise 34.9 per cent of its required resources. The details of the resource match are as follows:

Source	Match Budget	Raised to date
JOHUD/ Staff	\$154,202	\$61,165
JOHUD/Equipment	\$31,705	
JOHUD/Office expenses and other direct costs	\$107,813	\$40,180
Save the Children/Vehicles	\$29,400	\$8,400
Save the Children/Laptops	\$700	
Youth Build International /ICR	39,391	\$17,312
Total	\$363,211	\$127,057

Source: Program Director, through STC Financial Officer

Project management and staff at STC and JOHUD are highly committed and dedicated. As previously discussed in Section 4.6 of this report, the project is under-staffed. There are various management and partnership issues that STC has to address in order to meet its stated objectives. The inability of the project to gain the complete support and involvement of the SSC in Marka and the delays in project implementation activities will have a serious impact on the project's ability to meet its stated objectives and target numbers.

According to the program director, the education and livelihood specialists are stretched to the limit. The education specialist is still required to conduct two full-day workshops for the development of the learning environment enhancement plan and start follow-up visits for three of the four activities scheduled, per the 51 schools in which the project is planning to operate. This amounts to nearly 500 working days (unforeseeable delays are also possible). The education specialist is further required to establish and train 4 GCLs that will meet 4 times a year, which means 20 training days (with additional time for preparation), and 20 meeting days. These activities alone will take 2.23 man years, while the project has only 1 year and 8 months left. And, this does not take into account all the coordination meetings, advocacy work, etc. that the education specialist needs to do. The activity log shows how many meetings the project entails. The livelihood specialist is required to be involved in the training of 400 persons on financial literacy, which means following up on about 125 saving and lending groups. The livelihood specialist is also required to train members of three to four CPCs, which requires nine training days for each. The CPCs meet every 3 months, so there will be about 40 meetings in total. Then too, the specialist is required to work with approximately 100 service providers, which will involve some collective training, but also follow-up visits. In sum, this will require 2.1 man years, not counting all the other activities that need to be carried out. The project is striving to build the capacity of the government and JOHUD to take over some of the responsibility, but this will be a lengthy process.

In light of the above calculation, it is evident that the project should either decrease the number of its target beneficiaries, especially in relation to beneficiaries of livelihood services, and the number of schools where the project is planning to work or hire more staff to support the project activities. There is also a clear need to discuss these challenges with JOHUD to confirm that they are able to continue to meet their obligations toward the project and provide smooth implementation of the project in the coming 20 months.

Staffing issues were discussed with the program director who agrees that the project is objectively ambitious compared to the number of key staff. The Promising Futures program director further explained that USDOL was strict on the number of key staff as well as on the number of components that the project needed to address. It is important to note that this perception is not totally accurate. USDOL has a requirement for a minimum number of staff but not a maximum number. The project is allowed to have the number of staff it believes are needed as long as it is within the overall budget for the project.

During the design of the project, STC did not feel that it was possible to reduce the number of activities. Furthermore, the project assumed that a lot of the work could be done by the partners. However, this proved to be an inaccurate assumption. Promising Futures' experience so far shows that a lot of capacity building is still needed to enable the partners to take over some of the implementation responsibilities. For example, the MOE could have taken over some of the work with the schools; however, at this time, it is not foreseen that it can assume the role of developing the learning environment enhancement plans.

According to the program director, other reasons for the increasing staff workload is that in "traditional" child labor projects, implementing partners would mainly offer direct services, not be engaged in complex processes, such as replicating a model to new areas, mainstreaming approaches to national stakeholders, or building the capacities of services providers. STC believes that Promising Futures is very technical and requires a different level of staffing than many of the more typical USDOL-funded projects. In the evaluator's opinion, the replication of the SSC model in other governorates is a complex process for a number of reasons. On the one hand, at mid-term, there seemed to be a lack of agreement about where the SSC model should be replicated. On the other hand, there seemed to be an absence of consensus regarding the best practices for work modalities. The SSC model is unique in Jordan. Promising Futures attempts to improve the performance of SSC as well as replicate the model in other areas. This requires coordination between and amongst line ministries (MOE and MOL) that traditionally do not cooperate or coordinate their efforts in combating ECL. At mid-term the resistance from SSC and absence of oversight from JOHUD increased the complexity of the process. Technically, the education requirements are far less demanding than those of the livelihood component. The education component builds on existing MOE work and the department of non-formal education at MOE is familiar with issues of child labor due to exposure from other USDOL projects. However, the non-formal education department does not traditionally work with the formal education department within the MOE. The technical requirements of the livelihood component are far greater than any other component. This could be attributed to the novelty of the approach – linking child withdrawal and prevention to livelihood opportunities. It is also worth mentioning that the project does not offer livelihood opportunities directly (no service delivery); rather, it creates the necessary linkages between families and service providers while monitoring the implementation of these services and accessing their impact. The project could have made use of a civil society expert/officer who could have worked on creating those linkages and monitoring the impact of these activities.

Of similar significance is the fact that the project has invested a lot of resources and effort in developing the capacities of the SSC team members, especially in relation to monitoring and evaluation. Promising Futures has developed case assessment and follow-up forms. SSC staff members have received training on these forms; however, they are not being used. Last but not least, teachers and volunteers working with children and their families are highly

dedicated and committed. However, not all teachers working with children have received training. The project should focus on increasing teacher and volunteer capacities to be able to render support to children enrolled in project activities.

5.3 Monitoring System and Beneficiary Monitoring System

At the time of the mid-term evaluation, the project had developed a comprehensive Direct Beneficiary Monitoring System; however, the project database's physical infrastructure still needed to be completed and the forms developed, as the backbone of the DBMS remained unused to a large extent. Notably, the design of the database structure was completed.

Monitoring the work status of children is perhaps one of the biggest challenges that the project is currently facing, along with difficulty in working with the JOHUD-managed SSC. This evaluation found that this was only being conducted before TPRs were due. Whereas this is the requirement of USDOL, it means that no comprehensive monthly follow-up has been conducted to ensure the effectiveness and efficiency of the project's interventions on preventing and withdrawing children from WFCL. Monitoring the work status of children has been done by the SSC, only at the request of STC and has not been carried out by the teachers or the counselors. Rather, the monitoring has been done by directly asking the children or their parents whether they continue to be engaged in ECL or WFCL. Monitoring the work status of children is an important component that reflects on the work of the project and needs to be carefully crafted and designed to ensure that accurate data is being collected and reported. This requires a focus on children's attendance and performance in school and non-formal education classes to be able to establish whether the children continue to work or not.

During the course of this evaluation, key concerns voiced by STC and SSC have been with the number of indicators and the absence of a collective vision behind the project indicators. The SSC uses the MOL-approved indicators to report back to the MOL on the progress of the center. These indicators are not totally aligned with project indicators. STC faces substantial challenges in ensuring that the SSC is reporting on the project. There is an evident need to mainstream the indicators being used by both entities to ensure that reporting is done in a timely and effective manner. It would also be useful to ensure that the documentation and monitoring of project activities have the necessary linkages to show the impact of one activity on the outcomes of another activity/component (i.e., the provision of livelihood affects the withdrawal/prevention of children, case by case).

Perhaps, once the physical beneficiary database monitoring system is available and operational the project's difficulties in monitoring activities will be reduced. However, it is important to note that without the adequate support from JOHUD and the buy-in from SSC to the new procedures and work modalities, the project will continue to face difficulty in monitoring its indicators.

5.4 Lessons Learned and Promising Practices

The project presents many lessons learned in terms of efficiency and particularly in financial and human resource management and monitoring systems, as follows:

- Experiencing delays in project start-up greatly impacted the ability of the project to meet its targets.

- Designing the organizational structure of the project and staffing requirements in a careful manner will help the project set realistic and achievable targets.
- Building the capacity of government structures and models is an efficient and responsible strategy to conduct development work with a special focus on sustainability.
- Ensuring the functionality of the core of the DBMS (i.e., the database) is important for effective and efficient monitoring of project activities.
- Developing concrete partnerships and clarifying roles and responsibilities of various partners involved in project implementation can increase project efficiency.

VI. Impact

This section assesses the positive and negative changes produced by the project, intended and unintended, direct and indirect, as well as the changes in the social and economic environment in the country, as reported by respondents during the field visit and by the evaluator's observations.

6.1 Change in the lives of Direct Beneficiaries

According to the project's M&E documents, as of March 2012, the project provided educational services to 1,118 children and livelihood services to 452 families. During the course of this mid-term evaluation, the evaluator held focus group discussions with a total of 38 children (27 boys and 11 girls) attending non-formal education programs and VTC programs. The evaluator also held two focus group discussions with parents of children and recipients of livelihood services in Abu Sayah village. Additionally, the evaluator had a chance to observe the interaction between the children and the teachers in the SSC during class activities. Finally, representatives of parents and children were present during the stakeholder meeting.

Discussions with direct beneficiaries during the course of the evaluation indicated that the project had positive impacts on their lives. There is an evident change in perception regarding child labor and the value of education. Many of the children interviewed aged 12-16 explained that they used to think that it was better to work before starting their classes in the SSC. Children spoke very positively of their teachers and counselors. One focus group was conducted with child laborers from Zarqa who had only been enrolled in SSC services and classes for two weeks at the time of the focus group. These children continued to believe that working was much more useful than getting an education and that working at a young age did not have negative implications on their lives. When asked why they decided to join the SSC, they almost unanimously explained that attending classes would give them the opportunity to access the VTC and a chance at improving their lives later on. This group should be considered in comparison to children who have been part of the project activities for a longer duration (a year or more). Children who have received services from the SSC through project interventions were articulate and could easily explain the value of education and the negative implications of child labor. This group of children spoke highly of the level of support they received in the SSC compared to their experience in school. Girls particularly appreciated the opportunity to go out of their houses and continue their education. Girls interviewed further explained that the availability of counselors greatly affected their ability to perceive their futures in a different way.

At mid-term, project activities had already led to positive changes in the lives of girls and boys alike. Generally speaking, children interviewed showed high levels of confidence and shared their dreams to continue their education and work in different fields. The ability to link girls to VTC in particular will have a positive impact on the lives of previously homebound girls. Parents of former child laborers and/or homebound girls started to develop a more positive perception about the education of their children and about the possibility of their daughter's employment once VTC training was completed.

The project has already provided children facing learning disabilities with individual teaching and coaching, which will help these children develop better futures and gain access to education and vocational training. Parents of children with learning difficulties remarked that this service was most appreciated and would positively impact the lives of their children. Parents of children enrolled in SSC services, particularly parents of girls, explained that they felt a positive change in the behavior and attitude of their children since they started attending the classes. Furthermore, parents of non-Jordanian children attending SSC services believed that the SSC offered their children an opportunity to access education that they would have otherwise been denied due to their legal status and/or financial situation.

The project's livelihood services, particularly the financial literacy training and the establishment of saving and lending groups, help empower women. Besides the obvious expected outcome of improving their household incomes, coaching women to become self-sufficient entrepreneurs will have a lasting, positive impact of their lives and subsequently on their families. The project provides families not only with financial literacy training but also with literacy classes and awareness-raising activities, allowing them to make informed decisions pertaining to their and their children's lives.

The project could increase its impact on the lives of beneficiaries by strategically linking its livelihood services to the withdrawal and prevention of children from the labor market. In other words, by paying close attention to the selection of families receiving livelihood support and by monitoring how the livelihoods services are contributing to the withdrawal and prevention efforts. Moreover, once access to the CECLE database is organized, Promising Futures can prioritize families of children not fully-withdrawn from ECL. Furthermore, coaching, providing product development advice, and linking saving and lending groups to market outlets will offer additional support to the project and will have positive impacts on the lives of the project's beneficiaries.

6.2 Expected Impact on Partners and Other Institutions

The Promising Futures project works on strengthening the procedures and regulations of the SSC and creating linkages between the SSC and other service providers in the community. This component of the project has already resulted in positive changes in the way the SSC conducts its work. According to the SSC director interviewed during the course of this evaluation, the project has supported the work of the SSC by building the capacity of its staff and providing the center with the ability to expand its services to other locations, such as Zarqaa, Mafarq, and Maan. The SSC director further explained that the introduction of career counseling to the work of the teachers in the center has also added to the effectiveness of the work of SSC, and will enable the center to provide better services to the children. It was further noted that the partnership work and the MOUs developed by the project helped to institutionalize the transfer of children from the SSC to the VTC. The SSC director remarked

that this will have a long lasting impact on the work of the center and subsequently on the services provided to the children.

The project is also expected to have a positive impact on improving the learning environment available to the children in the locations where the project operates. Intended activities in the schools, including infrastructure upgrading and the establishment of community-based committees for child labor will support the project's overall efforts to combat child labor by ensuring the presence of a monitoring body inside the school that could continue to monitor the work status of children and systematically work on preventing more children from dropping out of school due to poor educational performance or otherwise. The project is already building on previous work by Save the Children International in Jordan, where child-to-child methodologies were introduced to 120 of the country's schools. The project will build on this work, and further its implementation, which will increase the impact of the project.

The learning environment could also be strengthened by increased teacher and counselor training on how to identify and work with children at risk, teaching methods, and working with children engaged in child labor.

The project's work modality, i.e., working in partnership with various stakeholders and bringing untraditional partners together, could have a positive impact on the way partners and government could work in the future. The project was successful in establishing a technical steering committee for the project within the MOE. This committee encompasses individuals from different departments within the MOE who traditionally do not work together, although they ought to do so. For example, the counseling department works through the formal education department, whereas much of its work is needed to address the root causes of child labor and child laborers enrolled in non-formal education schemes. This collaboration could ultimately lead to improved collaboration and coordination between the various departments within the same ministry, which could have a positive impact on the learning environment available to children in Jordan.

Another positive impact, on both partners and other institutions working on child labor issues, will be the project's research work. The increase in the body of literature concerning the situation of child laborers and the mapping of service providers in Marka, Zarqa, Mafraq, and Maan will enable other institutions to build effective strategies based on empirical evidence. Then too, it will allow future interventions to identify gaps in services based on empirical evidence.

Lastly, CPCs are expected to increase awareness of child labor issues and support interventions geared toward addressing the problem and its root causes. Thus, the CPCs are expected to fill an important gap in the planned national tracking system of child labor in Jordan. The linkages yet to be created between the CPCs and the GCL committees will help CPC members refer and solve cases of child labor in the best interest of the child.

6.3 Impact on Government and Policy Structures

The project's coordination efforts with other USDOL projects in Jordan, particularly with ILO-IPEC, have supported the activation of the Technical Committee to Combat Child Labor. The project has further complemented the work of the TCCCL by ensuring that national plans

to combat child labor take into account the voices and roles of community groups, such as the project-established CPCs.

The capacity building activities and teachers' training will have a positive impact on the work of the MOE and MOL through the training of VTC trainers. The capacity building of MOL supported SSC by providing technical training, offering on the job coaching, institutionalizing the relationship between SSC and VTC, and simplifying procedures and systems, all of which will lead to positive change.

Finally, the planned expansion and replication of the SSC model in two governorates, Mafraq and Maan, will further increase the number of available classrooms and services that could be available to child laborers and support government efforts to combat child labor in these two relatively remote governorates.

6.4 Education Quality

This evaluation found that, at mid-term, the project had already positively contributed to the quality of education in the SSC. The project has provided TOT to teachers in the SSC enabling them to provide career counseling to children enrolled in SSC services. Moreover, in order to accommodate more children, particularly those from Zarqa district, the project positively contributed to improving the infrastructure in the SSC by building four new classrooms. Likewise, the project completed the needs assessment for 16 schools and the planned infrastructure work inside these schools will have a positive impact on improving the learning environment for these children, too.

The impact of the project on education quality could be further supported by increasing teachers' training on teaching and learning methods, such as the introduction of active learning methodologies and child-centered learning schemes. Teachers in SSC and schools alike could benefit from an increased awareness of their role in combating child labor and a deeper understanding of the characteristics of working children.

Lastly, the project has already contributed to increasing children's access to education by the infrastructure work done at the SSC. And, the project is expected to expand to Mafraq and Maan. The project could increase its impact on education quality by preparing the classrooms in terms of furnishing and materials in a way that promotes child safety and child-centered learning.

6.5 Emerging Trends and Issues That the Project Will Take Further

During the course of this evaluation, the evaluator had a chance to discuss the effects of the Syrian crisis on the various stakeholders, including the MOE, MOL, as well as NGOs. It was noted that the increase in the number of Syrians considered persons of concern by GoJ could have a direct impact on increasing incidences of child labor in Jordan, both for Jordanian and non-Jordanian children.

According to Save the Children Jordan, incidence of child labor could be observed in the Zaatari camp in what was referred to as the 'black market' or '*souq*.' The Secretary-General of the MOL indicated that Syrian labor in Jordan could push many Jordanians out of the labor market due to the Syrians' perceived higher skills and friendlier approach with customers. This could have implications for many families. The head of the Child Labor Unit at MOL further explained that labor inspectors have already detected many cases of child labor

amongst Syrians residing in Jordan and considered it of concern to the government; but, at present, no action could be taken due to the humanitarian condition of this group.

Discussions with various stakeholders show that the Syrian crisis is two-fold at the moment. On the one hand, there seems to be an increase in Syrian child labor in Jordan, as well as a potential to increase incidence of child labor of other non-Syrians residing in Jordan. The project is carefully keeping track of the situation. Plans to start work in Mafraq (where many Syrian persons of concern to the GoJ reside outside the camp) and in Zarqa (should plans to open a new camp materialize) will be of significant importance to combating child labor in Jordan. It was noted that several government officials (including the Jordanian Prime Minister) were keen on the project's activities starting in Mafraq to support efforts at combating child labor.

Another key emerging trend that the project will take further is the homebound girls' phenomenon. A survey carried out in October 2011 by the project in East Amman (Marka) among vulnerable households suggests that at least 4% of nearly 400 interviewed girls were homebound. They tended to work long hours and were kept in social isolation, confined to their homes. The reason for them dropping out of school and getting into household work was often more cultural than economic: their families wanted to protect them from what they perceived as an unsafe environment, either at school or on the way to and from school. They were not then or currently acknowledged as child laborers by the Government of Jordan, although their working conditions appear to be very similar to those of child domestic workers, except for the fact that they do not get paid and work in their own homes. Promising Futures acknowledged that this issue required specialized interventions and successfully secured funds from the Dutch Embassy in Jordan to implement project components specifically targeting homebound girls. For more detail on planned project activities regarding homebound girls, please see Annex 4.

6.6 Lessons Learned and Promising Practices

The Promising Futures project is a carefully designed project that supports combating ECL in Jordan. At mid-term, the project had already positively impacted the lives of many children and their families. The key lessons learned from the project were as follows:

- Providing transportation to children could ensure higher retention rates in project activities, thus increasing the impact of project interventions.
- Building local capacity and increasing community ownership and involvement in project activities through the establishment of the CPCs will increase awareness about ECL and will support project activities in the community.
- Improving the learning environment and education quality could greatly support efforts to eliminate ECL in Jordan.
- Creating partnerships between various stakeholders requires time and resources, which could have an impact on the project implementation rate.
- Reviewing project activities and building on lessons learned on a regular basis could increase the impact of the project.
- Focusing on research could help the project uncover new trends and issues, and could allow it to develop the necessary interventions to increase its impact.

VII. Sustainability

This section examines whether the project has taken steps to ensure the continuation of project activities after the completion of the program, including securing sources of funding, partnering with other organizations and/or the government, and identifying areas that need to be strengthened or that offer lessons learned for the future.

7.1 Sustainability Plan and Exit Strategy

The project design is geared toward sustainability of project interventions and work modalities. The project works through a government approved and endorsed model of the SSC and uses approved government curricula in the non-formal education program. The project works on refining existing tools and replicating the SSC model to other governorates in Jordan. The project strategically works through a multi-sectoral approach to increase the effectiveness of its interventions and to ensure the sustainability of its efforts. Planned sustainability activities, namely the development of plans with MOL, MOE, NAF, and JOHUD have not yet started. The project has plans to involve the private sector in the efforts to combat child labor in Jordan. However, these activities have also not started.

At the time of the mid-term evaluation, the project had not developed a sustainability matrix as stipulated in the Cooperative Agreement between STC and USDOL. Developing a sustainability matrix or plan will support monitoring of the project's sustainability efforts and allow it to develop a clear vision about the required exit strategy at the end of the project.

7.2 Leveraging Non-project Resources

The project has been successful in leveraging non-project resources to support and complement the work of the project in Jordan. STC is building on previous work conducted in the schools where child-to-child methodologies have been introduced. The project is also successful in integrating new resources, such as:

Figure 7.1 Non-project Resources and Their Impacts

Source	Impact on Project
Dutch Embassy	Homebound Girls Project
Overall NGO (Dutch NGO)	Recreation space and shade
Pro-bono work	Class room rehabilitation
Right to Play	Life Skills Through Sport
Action Aid	Music and art extra-curricular activities
Save Sweden	Collaborate on training of CPCs

The project has been most successful in identifying a source of funding for a specialized project for homebound girls. The project continues to investigate potential resources to scale up and complement its work. At the time of this evaluation, the project was involved in discussions with possible German and Swiss sources of funding to complement the work of the project.

7.3 Challenges and Successes in Initiating and Maintaining Partnerships with Other USDOL Projects

Promising Futures has been most successful in partnering with the ILO-IPEC project in Jordan. As previously discussed in Section 4.9 of this report, collaboration and coordination with ILO-IPEC has ensured that there is no duplication of effort between the two projects and that the work of one project complements the work of another. Delays in establishing the GCL committees have affected the project's abilities to further its policy work.

However, initiating and maintaining partnership with CECLE has not been as successful. Promising Futures, CECLE, and ILO-IPEC projects held several coordination meetings while CECLE was still active and they participated in each other's events. When the Cooperative Housing Foundation (CHF) phased out, a final meeting was held with the CECLE director to allow Promising Futures to hear any lessons learned and to build on achievements. As previously discussed elsewhere in the report, Promising Futures has faced some difficulties in getting access to the CECLE database. The project would have liked to have access to the children who were not fully withdrawn from WFCL due to the absence of a livelihood component in CECLE. However, due to ownership issues, the project was unable to access this information. According to the Promising Futures program director, access to CECLE database has been promised and now needs to be organized by the two projects. The delay in the start-up of the Promising Futures livelihood component was also a lost opportunity for CECLE, which concluded its activities in July 2012.

7.4 Local/National Involvement and Impact on Government Capacity

Promising Futures has been successful in establishing local and national partnerships with a variety of stakeholders at government and NGO levels. The project strategically partnered with JOHUD for the implementation of its activities. This has allowed the project to work through an existing model that is endorsed by the Jordanian government and will support the sustainability of the project.

The project has been successful in ensuring national involvement in project activities through the formation of the steering committee at MOE and by developing and signing the appropriate MOUs with MOL and MOE. The project has also maintained close coordination with the Technical Committee to Combat Child Labor. The project regularly liaises with the ILO-IPEC project on policy and advocacy efforts and regularly attends the meetings of the TCCCL. In like manner, the project presented the findings of the Needs Assessment Study in Marka to the National Committee on Child Labor, chaired by MOL. This ensured that government partners were kept informed of project activities and supported project implementation efforts.

The establishment of the community-based Child Protection committees has ensured that local capacity to combat child labor is established and supported. The role envisaged for the CPCs, along with the upcoming establishment of the GCL, will help increase national involvement in combating ECL and WFCL.

The project has been successful in building and maintaining partnerships and coordination mechanisms with other international and national institutions, such as the Dutch Embassy, Right to Play, Action Aid, Save the Children Sweden, and Save the Children Jordan. These relationships and collaboration efforts have secured additional resources for the project and better services for the project beneficiaries.

Coordination and collaboration efforts with Save the Children Sweden and Save the Children Jordan have also contributed to eliminating any duplication of the work done by the project in relation to building the capacity of CPCs. Besides that, it has supported the creation of the necessary linkages between the project-established CPC sub-committee on child labor and sub-committee on child protection established by Save the Children Jordan.

7.5 Additional Steps for Sustainability

The project successfully concluded MOUs with MOE and MOL. There is a need to mediate an MOU between the MOE and MOL to further support the sustainability of the project efforts.

The project could also enhance its sustainability efforts by advocating for institutionalizing the CPCs and finding the appropriate mechanisms to provide resources and support to the work of the CPCs. These community structures provide a good model for sustainability if they can be tied to the national tracking and referral system, currently being designed by the GoJ.

During the stakeholders meeting held at the end of the evaluation fieldwork, many stakeholders explained that there are many agreements between various line ministries and decrees to foster coordination and collaboration amongst them. The project could further its sustainability effort by investigating these agreements and attempting to activate them.

7.6 Lessons Learned and Promising Practices

The lessons learned from sustainability are as follows:

- Designing a project based on existing government approved and endorsed models will ensure sustainability of project interventions.
- Success in leveraging non-project resources would allow greater impact of project activities and interventions, particularly services available to children.
- Working in partnership with other projects ensures lack of duplication and consolidates the efforts exerted to combat WFCL.
- Establishing community-based local structures requires careful monitoring and support for creating lasting linkages to increase sustainability
- Keeping close relation with government can support efforts at eliminating ECL by activating existing policies and coordination mechanisms between various line ministries instead of mediating new agreements.

VIII. Recommendations

This section identifies the most important outcomes, lessons learned, or promising practices that should be considered by future projects working on child labor issues in Jordan, or elsewhere, as appropriate.

8.1 Key recommendations

- The project should resolve the partnership issues with JOHUD. Systematic efforts are needed to ensure that project implementation is not being affected by problems in communication and/or coordination with the SSC. STC should insist that JOHUD lives up to its obligation toward the project.
- The project can consider, pending availability of funds, hiring project coordinators to oversee the work of the project in Mafraq and Maan. The project could also consider hiring a project manager in Marka to oversee the implementation of project activities in Marka and Zarqa. This person should report directly to the program director.
- As soon as possible, start using a beneficiary monitoring database that would facilitate follow-up on project activities and rates of implementation.
- This endeavor should work with USDOL to ensure clarity and common understanding of the various reporting requirements among all project partners.
- Promising Futures should research existing decrees and coordination mechanisms amongst the various line ministries and activate those relevant to project implementation.
- They should ensure that the livelihood component is clearly linked to prevention and withdrawal of children from WFCL through active monitoring of this component.
- In light of the delays incurred by the project, they should consider reducing the number of target beneficiaries; particularly the beneficiaries of livelihood opportunities and the number of schools where the project plans to operate.
- Promising Futures should develop a sustainability matrix and end-of-project exit strategy as well as a plan of action to ensure the sustainability of project activities.

8.2 Other Recommendations for the Project

- Reconsider the role of volunteers and make attempts to afford them sufficient time for recruitment of children.
- Reconsider bus schedules for students enrolled in VTC services and ensure the sustainability of these efforts through the provision of livelihood opportunities to parents of these children.
- Re-examine the criteria for providing livelihood opportunities to be able to provide services to families of children enrolled in SSC services, as well as in schools.
- Provide additional training to teachers to allow them to continue to use child-friendly methodologies and enable them to focus on the behaviors and attitudes of working children.
- Support the procurement of classroom furniture that is conducive to active learning and child-centered learning methodologies.

- Strengthen the role of the CPCs by institutionalizing their referral and tracking systems and linking them to the GCLs and the national referral system.
- In light of the delays in the start-up of the project, consider, if possible, a no-cost extension for project activities to enable the project to meet its stated targets if reductions in the number of beneficiaries would not be feasible.
- Concentrate on identifying and recruiting children engaged in WFCL sectors as identified in the project document.

IX. Conclusions

Promising Futures is a carefully designed project that takes into consideration the various factors affecting the children. The project pays special attention to providing children with quality education and improving the learning environment in non-formal as well as formal education structures. The provision of livelihood opportunities to parents of working children without providing direct financial support to replace the income lost as a result of withdrawing children from WFCL is an effective, efficient, and sustainable way to conduct development work. The project is successful in identifying WFCL in Jordan. The focus on geographic areas, as well as WFCL sectors, will help increase awareness about ECL and WFCL in Jordan, in general.

The project implementation suffered from delays due to the political situation in the region and its subsequent impacts on the political and economic situation in Jordan. However, project implementation plans are now on track. The project works through existing structures and programs, such as the SSC, and the non-formal education program greatly supports the project's efforts at sustainability.

Establishing new structures, such as the CPCs, and linking them with the GCLs will have a lasting impact on increasing the number of stakeholders involved in combating child labor in Jordan. The project needs to create the necessary links that would ensure the sustainability of its efforts in increasing community participation in combating child labor.

Increasing the monitoring and evaluation of project activities and revising the management structure and work modalities of the project will have an increased impact on the project's ability to meet its stated objectives.

X. ANNEXES

Annex 1: Project Components and Activities

Annex 2: Proposed Itinerary, Mid-Term Evaluation of Promising Futures

Annex 3: Stakeholders Meeting Agenda and List of Participants

Annex 4: Overview of Homebound Girls Project

Annex 5: Flow Chart, Child Labor

ANNEX 1: PROJECT COMPONENTS AND ACTIVITIES

Table 1: Promising Futures Project—Key Components and Activities

Components ¹	Key Activities
1.1 Educational Services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Identify tailored educational programs for children (formal, non-formal, and vocational educational services) • Enroll children in identified services • Monitor attendance and academic performance of children
1.2 Livelihoods	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Enroll adults from targeted households in vocational training at vocational training centers; provide mentorship during training period • Build capacity of finance institutions, including microfinance institutions, to respond to needs of targeted households • Link households with needed financial services • Provide illiterate adults in targeted households with basic literacy training; provide households with cash management training
2. Strengthening Government Coordination	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Establish Governorate Committees for Combating Child Labor (GCLs) • Develop standard operating plans (SOPs) and channels of communication between the Ministry of Labor’s National Steering Committee/Technical Committee on Child Labor (NSC/TCCL); GCLs; and Child Protection Committees (CPCs) • Train CPCs and GCLs on child labor case management; build capacity of GCLs and NSC/TCCL to respond to and resolve issues from lower levels
3. Awareness	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Develop targeted communications messages • Hold mass community meetings and awareness-raising events through tribal guest houses, mosques, and community-based organizations • Support CPCs, GCLs, and the NSC/TCCL in disseminating key messages
4. Research	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Conduct small-scale research studies (topics identified in collaboration with national government stakeholders) • Organize roundtables to disseminate results to government and private sector stakeholders • Integrate research findings to media and community-based messages
5. Sustainability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Establish sustainability plans with key government and non-governmental organization stakeholders • Mobilize government and private resources in support of sustainability plans

¹ Project Component 1, Direct Services, encompasses both education and livelihood services.

ANNEX 2: PROPOSED ITINERARY, MID-TERM EVALUATION OF PROMISING FUTURES

Day	Date	Time	Location	Schedule, morning	Time	Location	Schedule, afternoon
Monday	1-Oct	9:00	SCI	Meeting PF team	14:00	SCI	Document review
Tuesday	2-Oct	9:30	MOE	MOE	14:00	JOHUD	JOHUD management
		11:00	MOL	MOL			
Wednesday	3-Oct	10:00	SSC	Meeting SSC management team	12:00	SSC	Meeting SSC field teams/teachers
Thursday	4-Oct	10:30	SSC	Meeting SSC students, Marka	12:00	SSC	Meeting SSC parents
Sunday	7-Oct	10:00	SSC	Meeting SSC students, Zarqa	14:30	ILO Office	ILO
					16:00	Second Cup	
Monday	8-Oct	10:00	Abu Sayah Village	Saving and lending group	14:00	VTC	VTC HQ
Tuesday	9-Oct	10:00	SSC	CPC Marka	12:00	VTC/girls Marka	VTC staff
					15:00	Save Jordan	Save Jordan
Wednesday	10-Oct	10:00	Mafraq CDC	Mafraq CDC	12:00	Mafraq VTC	Mafraq VTC
Thursday	11-Oct	9:00	Marka	School			
		11:00	SSC	VTC students			

Day	Date	Time	Location	Schedule, morning	Time	Location	Schedule, afternoon
Sunday	14-Oct	9:00	SCI	Budget	13:00		
		11:30	JOHUD	Debrief findings			
Monday	15-Oct	9:30	Geneva Hotel	Stakeholder meeting	14:30	SCI	Debrief

KEY

CDC – Community Development Center
CPC- Child Protection Committee
HQ - Headquarters
ILO- International Labour Organization
JOHUD-Jordanian Hashemite Fund for Human Development
MOE- Ministry of Education
MOL- Ministry of Labor
SCI-
SSC- Social Support Center
VTC- Vocational and Technical Center

ANNEX 3: STAKEHOLDERS MEETING AGENDA AND LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

Stakeholders Meeting Agenda

10:00-10:30 Registration

10:30 – 11:00 .. Opening and Welcome Notes

11:00 – 12:30... Group Activity

12:30 – 12:45... Coffee Break

12:45 – 1:45 Presentation of Initial Findings and Discussion

1:45 – 2:00 Final Remarks and Close

Participants Stakeholder Meeting

		Position
MOL		NFE Division
		Head of the CLU
VTC		DG Assistant for Training Affairs
		Admin & Technical Coordinator
		Coordinator /Mafraq VTC
NCFA		Program Assistant
ILO		CTA
		Country Representative
CHF		CHF Representative - Jordan
JOHUD		Director
		Social Communication Officer
SSC		Director
		Administrator
		Head of Counseling
Marka CPC		CPC member
Zarqa CPC		CPC member
Saving and Lending Groups		Saving and Lending Group member
Youth Committee		Youth Committee member
		Youth Committee member
		Youth Committee member
Parents		Saving and Lending Group member

ANNEX 4: OVERVIEW OF HOMEBOUND GIRLS PROJECT

ACTIVITY OF THE PROJECT

Description of the activities planned for the project

For an intervention targeting homebound girls to be successful, it needs to meet three criteria: trusted community leaders need to be involved, the space where the intervention takes place needs to be acceptable to the parents and caretakers, and the safety of the girls needs to be ensured when they move between their homes and this space. The project concept is based on the premise that if homebound girls are not allowed to go to school, school will have to come to them. The activities will focus on educational services brought to a trusted environment, where girls can meet and build their capacities, socially, academically, and financially. All girls identified during the survey have been out of school for over two years, which makes it impossible for them, by the regulations of the Ministry of Education, to return to formal education. While the “GIRLS CAN” project will be focusing on serving girls that cannot be reintegrated into formal education, continuous coordination with the *Promising Future* project and MoE Directorate will be designed to ensure the early detection of female drop-outs and their ensuing reintegration into formal education.

Benefitting from the research carried out under *Promising Futures*, the project will identify homebound girls in the four target areas of the *Promising Futures* project: East Amman – Marka district, Zarqa, Mafraq and Ma’an. A training package will be developed on the basis of existing (Save the Children and MoE) material, comprising of life skills and functional literacy and financial literacy, which will include the establishment of voluntary saving and lending groups (VSLG).

Ten MoE seconded teachers will be trained on the package and on teaching skills adapted to the target group. The teachers will work through, and be supported by, the Social Support Center in Marka, which serves both Marka and Zarqa and replicates the centers in Mafraq and Ma’an established by the *Promising Futures* project. The SSC has been providing educational and counseling services to child laborers and school drop-outs for the past five years. Linking the homebound girls to the SSC means that they will be monitored and that their families will be provided with a variety of services, aimed at increasing awareness of the importance of education and the hazards of child labor, as well as improving their livelihoods. Should they be allowed to attend school after the training, the SSC can enroll them in non-formal education at the center or vocational training at the VTC.

Over the course of two years, the teachers will train two different cohorts, each consisting of 200 participants (100 homebound girls and 100 mothers or older female sibling from targeted households), over a period of 10 months. It is critical that mothers or older female siblings are targeted as direct beneficiaries so that they can provide needed support to targeted homebound girls. Mothers and older siblings will ensure fathers’ and older male siblings’ acceptance and will help overcome traditional and social norms that might hinder girls’ participation in the project. In addition, mothers and older siblings will be trained to act as advocates in their local communities, encouraging other households to open up their doors and allow their girls to participate in the project activities. The training will start with two months of life skills, followed by simultaneous classes in financial literacy. From the start of the training, the participants will be encouraged to save regular amounts of money, no matter how limited, to invest in their own small income generating activities. The last month will

focus on the establishment of saving and lending groups and the development of business plans for income generating activities. The project will link interested participants (mothers and girls) to private lending schemes.

To gain the confidence of the families, the project will identify spaces where the girls can meet (the home of a trusted community member, a mosque, etc.). Awareness raising sessions will be held by community and/or religious leaders to convince parents and caretakers (including elder brothers) of the importance of education for all. In addition, the girls' mothers will be invited to take part in the training with their daughters. This is likely to increase the parents' trust in the activities but will also have the concomitant advantage of building the mothers' capacities, which may lead to the economic strengthening of the household. Over the life of the project, 200 girls and 200 mothers will be trained.

The project will work in close collaboration with the Ministry of Education and make sure that key staff are aware of the challenges and specific needs of homebound girls. It will advocate with the ministry for the maintenance and expansion of the trainings and training staff. The results of the research and the pilot trainings will be used to advocate with the National Steering Committee on Child Labor for the inclusion of homebound girls in the next National Child Labor Survey¹, and in key policy documents, such as the National Framework on Child Labor. Lessons learned and good practices will be shared with national stakeholders through a round table conference.

¹With the 2007 Child Labor Survey, homebound girls were not acknowledged as child laborers. A national Child Labor Survey normally takes place once every ten years, but the International Labour Organization is currently looking at scheduling the next survey for 2014.

ANNEX 5: FLOW CHART, CHILD LABOR

