



International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC)



International
Labour
Office

IPEC Evaluation

“Programme of Support to the Time-Bound Programme Implemented in El Salvador To Eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour Through Education in El Salvador’s Time-Bound Programme (Education Initiative)”

ELS/01/P50/USA - ELS/02/P02/USA

An independent final evaluation by a team of external consultants

November 2006

This document has not been professionally edited.

NOTE ON THE EVALUATION PROCESS AND REPORT

This independent evaluation was managed by ILO-IPEC's Design, Evaluation and Documentation Section (DED) following a consultative and participatory approach. DED has ensured that all major stakeholders were consulted and informed throughout the evaluation and that the evaluation was carried out to highest degree of credibility and independence and in line with established evaluation standards.

The evaluation was carried out a team of external consultants¹. The field mission took place in November 2006. The opinions and recommendations included in this report are those of the authors and as such serve as an important contribution to learning and planning without necessarily constituting the perspective of the ILO or any other organization involved in the project.

Funding for this project evaluation was provided by the United States Department of Labor. This report does not necessarily reflect the views or policies of the United States Department of Labor nor does mention of trade names, commercial products, or organizations imply endorsement by the United States Government.

¹ **DWIGHT ORDOÑEZ, PhD**
(International Consultant – Team Manager)
RAFAEL AYALA
(National Consultant – Expert)

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Executive Summary	4
Glossary of Acronyms.....	6
Introduction	7
3. Findings.....	9
3.1 Design.....	9
3.2 Implementation.....	11
3.3 Achievements and Performance.....	14
3.4 Sustainability.....	45
4. Good Practices.....	48
5. Lessons learned from the first phase that can be passed along to second phase.....	49
6. Conclusions	50
7. Recommendations	51
ANNEXES	60
Annex 1: List of questions and other aspects suggested for the standard evaluation framework	60
Annex 2-A: List of institutional representatives interviewed	63
Annex 3: List of programmes assessed/sites visited	69
Annex 4: List of documents reviewed by the assessors	70
Annex 5: Stakeholders Meeting for the presentation and discussion of preliminary results of the assessment.....	71
Annex 7: Recommendations for the second phase of the TBP in El Salvador, formulated by the attendants to the stakeholders meeting on November 10, 2006.....	73
Annex 8: Methodological appendix: Reflections and recommendations on the elaboration of a standard framework for the extended final assessment of projects of support to TBPs	75
Annex 9: Assessment Tool Matrices.....	82

Executive Summary

Both the Project of Support to the TBP and the Education Initiative have made important contributions to the eradication of the worst forms of child labour in El Salvador, laying the groundwork for a national action framework against the worst forms of child labour and in support of education. At the planning and institutional strengthening levels, the TBP enabled the establishment of a national plan on the eradication of the worst forms of child labour and contributed to strengthen the institutional capacities of DIGESTYC and the Ministries of Labour and Education. Likewise, the TBP has contributed in a substantive way towards improving the legal framework for dealing with the worst forms of child labour, particularly as regards commercial sexual exploitation. Pertaining to public opinion and awareness-raising among the government and private sectors, the projects have given visibility to the issue, placing it on the agenda of government and private sector institutions, and promoted the population's adverse opinion of the issue of child labour. In like manner, the projects have contributed to position education as an alternative to child labour and as an effective tool in the combat of this scourge.

Within this framework, the projects have validated and given sustainability to the after-school centre model as an alternative to enhancing the quality of education and student retention within the school system, as well as improved the technical and operational capacities of schools and educators and their comprehension of the problem of child labour in the country and its negative effects on education. A particularly important attainment of the projects has been the performance of joint actions to reduce the supply of child labour through combining actions geared towards reducing also the demand for it. The fact that this has been done in a relatively successful fashion with the participation of public institutions (Ministry of Labour, National Civilian Police, Municipalities, Ministry of Education) as well as private ones (sugarcane mills, NGOs) is encouraging. From this perspective, the effectiveness of the project is high in terms of children removed from labour (65.3% in fishing and 52.5% in sugarcane according to the tracer study, figures which might have indicated full attainment of the goal of withdrawing 50% of the children and adolescents engaged in the worst forms of child labour in the targeted districts –in which said WFCL were majority–, if it were not for the fact that said effectiveness was a great deal lower in the case of children withdrawn from CSE (less than 25%).

However, despite progress in the aforementioned areas, the projects show several deficiencies and constraints that must be addressed in the second phase. Thus, the vocational training and occupational health component and the social protection of adolescents have had a reduced application and a very low impact. As regards CSE, a viable and successful model has yet to be constructed and disseminated that is also sensitive to gender differences. Although in general it has been substantial, in many cases community mobilisation to combat child labour lacks continuity and autonomy –its successful implementation being limited to Local and Interinstitutional WFCL Monitoring Committees.

Likewise, the proposed income generation alternatives had a limited, rather marginal, impact on household incomes. Therefore, high poverty levels can be a determining factor for children removed from child labour eventually dropping out of school and returning to child labour when the project is withdrawn from the geographical areas they live in. For that reason, it is advisable

“Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

that during the second phase of the project several additional actions be implemented in some of the geographical of the first phase, so as to enhance the sustainability of achieved progress.

The main recommendations are grouped around various axes, such as the need to foster institutional strengthening and coordination that can lead to the full application of the National Plan on the Eradication of the worst forms of child labour; to make the issue a cross-cutting theme on the agenda of the various public agencies, including those programmes oriented to fight poverty; to support MINED's autonomous actions and capacities in the fight against the worst forms of child labour and the increase of educational coverage and quality; to perform different actions to improve indicators and establish a monitoring system of the National Plan; to develop actions to promote the implementation of an effective model for addressing the CSE from an interinstitutional standpoint; to study the schemes of public opinion sensitisation developed so far in greater depth; to consolidate a parallel approach to CSE, so as to combine those actions to promote the reduction of the supply of child labourers with others having an impact on the demand; and to improve upon training and income-generation schemes, the latter being an indispensable component in terms of the medium-term sustainability of attained goals. Because child labour is directly linked to household economics, actions during the second phase of the project should include more in-depth work in this field.

Glossary of Acronyms

ADESCO	Community Development Association (Asociación de Desarrollo Comunal)
AJE	Young Entrepreneurs Association (Asociación de Jóvenes Empresarios)
AP	Action Programme
BID	Inter-American Development Bank (Banco Interamericano de Desarrollo)
CARE	Cooperative for American Remittances Everywhere
COMURES	National Corporation of Salvadoran Municipalities
CONAMUS	Salvadoran Women's National Coordinating Committee
CSE	Commercial Sexual Exploitation
DIGESTYC	National Directorate of Statistics and Censuses
EDUCO	Education With Community Participation
EI	Education Initiative Project
FEDISAL	Salvadoran Foundation For Integrated Education
FEPADE	Entrepreneurial Foundation for Education Development
FUNDAZUCAR	Salvadoran Sugar Association
FUNDEMUN	Women and Children Development Foundation
FUSAI	Salvadoran Foundation for Integrated Support
FUSAL	Salvadoran Foundation for Health and Human Development
GTZ	German Technical Cooperation Agency
ILO-IPEC	International Labour Office's International Programme on the Eradication of Child Labour
IMO	International Migrations Organisation
INSAFORP	Salvadoran Vocational Training Institute
ISDEMU	Salvadoran Women's Development Institute
ISNA	Salvadoran Institute for the Integrated Development of Children and Adolescents
JICA	Japan International Cooperation Agency
MINED	Ministry of Education
MINTRAB	Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
OEF	Women's Entrepreneurial Association
PADECOMSM	Foundation for Community Development in Morazán and San Miguel
PAHO	Pan-American Health Organisation
PASCA	Central American AIDS Action Project (Proyecto de Acción SIDA de Centroamérica)
PEI	Institutional Education Project Document
PNC	National Civilian Police
SIBASI	Basic Integrated Health System
TBP	Time-Bound Programme
TS	Tracer Study
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
USDOL	United States Department of Labor
WFCL	Worst Forms of Child Labour

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador's Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

1. Introduction

ILO-IPEC executes two projects in support of the Time-Bound Programme in El Salvador, both financed by USDOL. These projects have sought to facilitate the creation of an atmosphere conducive to combating the worst forms of child labour at the national level, including direct action with children and families in four sectors prioritised by the country, focusing especially on strengthening education. The implementation of the project “Combating the Worst Forms of Child Labour in El Salvador –Supporting the Time-Bound Programme on the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour in El Salvador” (henceforth referred to as the “TBP”) started officially in September, 2001 and it is expected to conclude in September, 2006. The intervention’s total budget was USD 4,966,851: a USD 4,034,351 contribution was provided by USDOL, whereas the Government of El Salvador pledged a national contribution equivalent to USD 822,500. Additionally, IPEC also implements the project termed “Combating Child Labour Through Education in El Salvador’s Time-Bound Programme” (also known as the Education Initiative and henceforth referred to as “EI”), which started officially in April, 2002, and is scheduled to end in March, 2007. The total budget for this project was 4 million USD, financed by USDOL’s Initiative for Education. ILO-IPEC was trusted with its execution through a competitive tendering process.

These projects promote the creation of an atmosphere which is propitious for the progressive elimination of child labour in the country through increasing awareness of the total population and of strategic social actors (government agencies, employers, labourers and NGOs). This includes also the dissemination of information regarding the magnitude and characteristics of the issue in order to advance that the existing national laws be adapted to the commitments assumed with the ratification of Conventions 138 and 138. The projects also include actions to be carried out in the most affected areas geared towards removing child and adolescent labourers from work and reinserting them into the education system. Moreover, the projects seek to generate an “installed capacity” of social and human resources at the local level in order to allow for the creation of social monitoring and security networks to overcome the problem in the shortest possible time. Finally, the projects undertake to lay the foundation for the future sustainability of accomplished actions through the creation of strategic cooperation alliances with government and non-government actors.

2. Extended Final Assessment Objectives and Methodology

This “extended” final assessment, which combines the elements of an impact assessment with the elements of an independent final assessment, had the objective of performing an evaluation of the global results of the ELS/01/P50/USA (Programme of Support to The Time-Bound) and ELS/02/P02/USA (Education Initiative) projects, and promote their coordination together with the main institutional actors working in the field of child labour in El Salvador. The said assessment comprises:

1. An analysis of the actions oriented towards strengthening the capacities of local institutions in the fight against the worst forms of child labour (through increasing the population’s level of awareness of the issue of child labour, developing legislation, developing national information systems, promoting institutional strengthening within the Ministries of Labour and Education and of other public actors, establishing interinstitutional networks, elaborating a National Plan Against Child Labour and developing child labour monitoring systems, among others).
2. An analysis of the implementation process and results of the diverse action programmes and other activities of prevention and removal of child labourers from 4 of the worst forms of child labour (sugarcane harvesting, fishing, garbage scavenging and commercial sexual exploitation) in different geographical regions of the country.
3. Support to the initial design and subsequent analysis (and integration into the assessment report) of the results of an impact or “tracer” study conducted between August and October, 2006 by consultant Ana Jimenez based on a sample of direct beneficiaries of the programme.
4. Suggestions emanated from the aforementioned experience for a proposal to create a standard assessment methodology for Time-Bound Programmes that can be replicated to evaluate similar programmes (See Annex 8).

The expanded final assessment shall also provide relevant information on the following aspects:

- Achievement areas of the national TBP process (nature and causal factors)
- The contributions of the different partners to the attainment of these achievements
- The contribution of ILO-IPEC’s project of support (activities and key factors) to the attainment of said achievements (the project’s key legacy)
- Areas in which intervention models that are feasible to be replicated exist
- Areas which need to be further developed or leveraged
- How the assessment’s conclusions and results can be used to provide feedback and improve the continuation of the TBP

In addressing tasks 1 and 2, mentioned above, the assessment shall consider the following axis of analysis, typical of a final evaluation:²

- Design validity
- Implementation
- Results (relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, unexpected effects³)
- Sustainability

² The terms of reference of the evaluation comprised 45 questions, which appear listed in Annex 1.

³ This point should integrate and comment on the results of the tracer study.

“Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

3. Findings

The main findings of the assessment in relation to the said axes were:

3.1 Design

Summary: The project's design is of an integral nature in that it addresses in a coordinated manner diverse aspects concerning the issue of the worst forms of child labour in El Salvador; however, the feasibility of some of its assumptions was not verified prior to execution. Project goals were very ambitious and the time frames intended for their execution proved too short.

In the case of both the TBP and the EI, coordination in terms of the general objective, purpose, results and activities of both projects appeared logical and coherent. Sensitisation and research (actions to which a great deal of the Time-Bound Programme's efforts and resources were devoted to as part of a strategy to position the issue at the institutional and public level)⁴, are reasonably valid actions which, even when their results are difficult to measure, produce evident attitudinal change in their recipients. Such actions amalgamate institutional strengthening activities and more focalised eradication action/programme activities.

In the framework of the EI and in the field of "demonstrative" actions, three important effects can be observed (in decreasing order): a) the after-school centres (whose success has been significant enough for the strategy to be adopted in the short term by the Ministry of Education); b) the inclusion of the worst forms of child labour into the matriculation census (which allows recording data that in turn give the issue more visibility); and c) the materials produced for different purposes (initial teachers' training, WFCL-related information, etc.). Equally relevant in the case of the EI is the fact that the project considered the inclusion of key actors from across the entire the educational sector; not just national-level managers and technical staff, but personnel from local-level as well (i.e.: the schools).

However, even though at design level planned results lead to immediate results, and immediate results lead to the development objective, causal links between certain TBP logical framework elements and the EI were not necessarily correct, that is, the correlation between activities and outcomes did not necessarily hold true (e.g.: the direct effects of school attendance on child labour, or the effects of vocational training on income increase).

Whereas the TBP presents ambitious goals while providing insufficient times for their execution, the EI's execution timeframes were adequate and sufficient. On the other hand, while funding for both projects seems adequate, assigned staff was insufficient in numerical terms to lend the required periodic assistance, follow-up and supervision to the implementing agencies in the field, watch the efficient and effective fulfilment of contract provisions, and perform interinstitutional coordination tasks and political lobbying.

⁴ The "public and institutional level" is defined as the main cities and localities within the area of influence of a project.

"Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour" and "Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador's Time Bound Programme" (Education Initiative)

Another limitation of project design was an inadequate prioritising of activities: with all components priorities ranking at almost the same level, some products turned out to be indistinguishable from others (e.g., products 1D and 2E of the TBP are almost identical in the way they are formulated even though they are aimed at different target audiences).

Likewise, project design did not consider the creation of field data verification systems (e.g., for verifying the data from the matriculation). Additionally, the project's monitoring system is only able to record just one instance of a child being removed from labour, not allowing to verify whether said action was sustainable over time. In some cases, the design incorporates non-relevant indicators (e.g. the "healthy schools," which are programme dependent), or hardly measurable/relevant ones (e.g. the number of cases denounced in court, instead of the number of actual sentences given).

Moreover, all subsequent delays in execution considered, the design does not appear to have been based on a process in which all counterpart institutions were involved to reach a mutual agreement. The design was derived from a series of assumptions including the taking into account of various State entities in the allocation of matching funds and actions without evidencing previous approval by these organisations (e.g. the participation of education consultants, the availability of teachers and principals for project activities, investments by MINED, inclusion of a Child Labour Unit within MINED, the utilisation of INSAFORP for the training of persons whose profile fell outside the institution's guidelines, the participation of PAHO in actions against child labour, etc.).

In the case of the EI, project design did not account for departmental- nor regional-level management (operative authorities, specially as relates to training). This creates a coordination gap which hinders system spread and promotes a separation (in practice) between the schools and the remaining ministerial authorities (however, despite this fact several education Directorates are aware of and value the work of the project). Furthermore, project design did not realistically consider the possibilities of engaging certain authorities for the attainment of planned activities (e.g. education consultants who could address the issue within schools in the context of the curriculum adaptation process).

In general, various social, educational, and economic problems which require greater attention or call for a different approach were not considered as part of the design. Certain paths were assumed that did not necessarily prove to be correct (e.g., that vocational training leads necessarily to an increase in income, in the case of economic activities). Conceptually, it is generically assumed in the design that schools prevents children from engaging in labour, but no age distinctions are made so as to allow differentiating in a precise manner the weight and impact of each specific strategy on each relevant age range.

In general, it can be stated that design for both projects was overly ambitious in the formulation of goals and aspects to be addressed (a fewer number of objectives might have resulted in less scattering of efforts and a greater focalisation of achievements) and either underestimated the incidence of certain factors or overestimated the capacity for execution of certain institutions. Because of its particular characteristics and the different range of institutional actors it implies,

" Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour" and "Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador's Time Bound Programme" (Education Initiative)

the problem of CSE might call for a special approach that is independent of other WFCL (i.e. a specific project).

No clear evidence was found to conclude that the gender perspective carried real weight in project design beyond its importance being cited and the fact that the variable was included in the organisation of the projects' databases.

Finally, it was observed that the TBP design lacks an “increasing input or decreasing output” strategy allowing to lay the foundation for the execution of sustainable, time-bound actions by third-party institutions provided for by both projects.

3.2 Implementation

Summary: Even though by the end of both projects a substantial amount of goals was reached, the implementation of the projects was characterised by a series of ups and downs and delays as a result of political obstacles, lack of institutional coordination and delays in budget execution, aspects that were continually overcome by a committed team with a great capacity for execution. In general, programme execution was able to face and find ways around a diversity of difficulties and weakness in a flexible and adequate way, which allowed the team to advance the fulfilment of the greater part of the goals of both programmes.

During the last 5 years, ILO-IPEC has worked as a promoter and binding element of the various institutional efforts existing in relation to the issue of the worst forms of child labour in El Salvador. IPEC has strived to place value on and coordinate the activities of the various public and private institutional actors and international agencies involved in providing a multidimensional answer to the problem of the worst forms of child labour in the country, turning interinstitutional coordination spaces into an important element for the discussion and organisation of efforts against the worst forms of child labour.

The programme managed to establish excellent relationships with partners, and even though the strategies to this end seem to have been developed around an intentional design which oriented the actions from the start, the experience and knowledge of the public and private sector institutions has allowed influencing positively on several organisations, especially the Ministry of Labour, the Ministry of Education and the Attorney General's Office, among others.

In this framework, both the TBP and the EI projects –conceived by IPEC as a combination of efforts in support of the actions against the worst forms of child labour in El Salvador– were implemented in a coordinated way.

Likewise, coordination of activities with the Ministry of Education maintained a very good level and produced good results, which constitutes a contribution to the sustainability of part of the results. Two seminars on the worst forms of child labour were conducted, one in the town of Apaneca and another at MINED's headquarters, aimed at middle and high management. The meeting in Apaneca proved more effective, being the first attempt to encourage MINED to place concrete and direct actions against child labour on its agenda.

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador's Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

At the same time, consultants were hired to analyse MINED's programmes and determine which of them were relevant to the programme's purposes. Once selected, implementing agencies were oriented so they could drive them forward (gardens in schools, schools for fathers, accelerated education, etc.).

As a complement to the seminars, systematic individual visits for discussing the topic were made to MINED's key personnel. As a result of the Apaneca workshop, a planning effort was conducted through which MINED's authorities integrated viable actions to combat WFCL (matriculation census, identifying the offer of flexible education modalities, priority attention to and quality of education). With the emergence of the National Education Plan 2021, the opportunity arises for giving visibility to the topic by assisting MINED with the realisation and financing of consultative workshops aimed at children victims of the worst forms of child labour.

Even though the project was able to implement most of its intended activities, implementation times varied significantly in some cases against what was planned in the project's original document. This was due to both El Salvador's institutional context factors and ILO-IPEC's procedures themselves. Relating to the former, the National Committee's emphasis on operative aspects during the first two years of the TBP execution, as well as a disproportionate attention to detail and bureaucratisation of action-programme approval processes, hindered the rapid start-up of action programmes. Likewise, the complexity of ILO-IPEC's internal institutional administrative procedures implied an additional work overload to project staff and contributed to the delaying of the approval and start of certain activities. Nevertheless implying strong setbacks to execution schedules, these aspects improved substantially starting 2005.

Similarly, certain communication problems between the Sub-Regional Office and ILO Headquarters in Geneva, and between the donor and ILO-IPEC offices in El Salvador, regarding access to EI funds and the immediate possibilities of implementing certain actions, caused important delays in the effective start of this project.

Despite the programme's great scope, which often implied work overloads for the staff, the project's executing team demonstrated great commitment, organisation and capacity for execution. The activities for the production and dissemination of sensitisation and training materials on the WFCL, as well as the monitoring of the results of the implementation of both programmes, have been conducted with professionalism. Similarly, the ILO-IPEC team has adequately handled advocacy actions and media relations. ILO-IPEC's staff in El Salvador possesses the capacity and people-skills to interact with ease and in a productive way with the public and private institutional sector.

Due to the factors mentioned above, budget execution suffered important delays in the beginning, which translated into higher than planned expenditure and greater pressure to fulfil goals during the last two years of project execution. Despite the above, it can be stated that ILO-IPEC's managing and administrative staff in El Salvador has demonstrated having great capacity for providing flexible answers to the different external and internal factors that hindered or delayed the timely implementation of some of the components and activities of the programmes, including natural disasters, like tropical storm Stan.

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador's Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

The screening of candidates for executing agencies was in general adequate, with various tendering processes being completed for the hiring of the counterparts. The National Steering Committee participated actively in the proposal approval process. In most cases, the institutions chosen as main executing agencies were those which possessed ample experience in implementing social development projects as well as projects in other fields (e.g. Fundazucar, FUSAL, OEF) and some which were linked to or supported by the local entrepreneurial sector. However, as mentioned above, the proposal screening and approval processes were excessively long and cumbersome, which had an impact on the effectiveness of the project.

The gathering of monitoring and assessment information experienced some delays due to difficulties implementing the local monitoring committees in a homogeneous way, and the difficulty of activating intermediate inter-institutional monitoring bodies in the two projects' different intervention areas. The "loss" of some of the initial target groups (e.g., the population at several dumpsites and populations victim of CSE in interventions in the periphery of the city of San Miguel –see below) led to a shift caseload size. Something similar happened with part of the baseline target-population in a sugarcane zone, which for practical reasons was partially substituted by the responsible implementing agency for more "concentrated" populations in other settlements.

Gender concerns were not given any relevant specific treatment beyond the recording of the gender of beneficiaries and the inclusion of vocational training alternatives culturally ascribed to either gender. In the case of sugarcane and fishing, the girls-to-boys ratio in the after-school centres did not show great disparities. In the case of the Commercial Sexual Exploitation of children, the issues of gender discrimination and violence against women were clearly and adequately identified as part of the victimisation process. However, the implementation of programmes of attention to victims of CSE were heavily gender-biased in that no alternatives for the attention of boy victims of CSE were generated, despite the fact that the number of underage boys victims of CSE is not much lower than that of girls in the case of San Salvador, according to institutions working on the issue. The sample taken in San Miguel and the programme implemented by PADECOMSM also suffered from a similar bias.

Among the most relevant lessons learned from the implementation process⁵ are the following:

- a. Project design should account for the opening of spaces that engage the participation of the institutions that will be involved (the partners) such that they can point to the most optimal pathways to follow, the limiting factors to take into account and the commitments (technical, administrative, infrastructural and financial) they are able assume.
- b. Project design should incorporate opinion surveys in order to measure the impact of the sensitisation campaigns through the mass media.
- c. Execution should consider, besides time durations allotted to activities, realistic times for the development of (demonstrative) processes, local and institutional capacity development (e.g. after-school centres and teachers, monitoring committees), generation

⁵ See Section 5, "Lessons Learned in Phase I to be transferred to Phase II."

"Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour" and "Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador's Time Bound Programme" (Education Initiative)

and consolidation of positive and lasting changes in the population, and development of input and output strategies.

- d. Execution times should be accelerated as government authorities give an issue sufficient priority. Within this framework, project planning should include realistic "political" time estimates, as required by some processes.
- e. With a view to ensuring the sustainability of interventions at community level, it is important to strengthen and consolidate the structure and role of the interinstitutional committees and the local committees against the worst forms of child labour.

3.3 Achievements and Performance

Considering the progress achieved towards the elimination of the worst forms of child labour in El Salvador, it can be stated that both projects have satisfactorily carried out their general objectives.⁶

3.3.1 Support to the national TBP process

Overview: As regards the social environment and the educational community, the projects have fulfilled their goal of creating an atmosphere conducive to the eradication of child labour. Thus, at the organisational level there currently exists an active National Committee on the Eradication of the worst forms of child labour and a National Plan that setting forth actions to follow in each sector. Likewise, actions as well as a successful demonstrative experience that is the after-school centres model (whose cost of continuation have been assumed by MINED) have been implemented ,geared toward eradicating the worst forms of child labour.

Likewise, the results of the follow-up on or evolution of the baseline population laboural status are encouraging in several WFCL categories (see below).

The TBP and the EI have had an impact on the sensitisation and training of MINED's technical and managerial staff, the inclusion of the issue of the worst forms of child labour into the annual matriculation census, the inclusion of innovative educational methodologies, the recognition of the issue of the worst forms of child labour as a cross-cutting theme within MINED's scope of action, as well as on the technical assistance provided for the elaboration of teacher's education modules and other contributions. However, even though the national capacities for replicating and maintaining education initiatives have been enhanced, the effectiveness of the latter for independently reducing the worst forms of child labour will be seen only after MINED fulfils its commitment of undertaking the continuation of the after-school centres.

In the same vein as the generation of useful information for monitoring the evolution of the phenomenon of child labour in El Salvador and as the making of decisions by State agencies,

⁶ Namely: **P260/08/225/050/PD**: "The Programme will contribute to the eradication of the worst forms of child labour in El Salvador" and **ELS/02/02P/USA**: "The Programme, in coordination with other initiatives included in the TBP, will contribute to the eradication of the worst forms of child labour in El Salvador"

"Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour" and "Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador's Time Bound Programme" (Education Initiative)

starting 2005 a permanent module on child labour has been incorporated into the Multipurpose Households Survey, under the section of employment and income.

3.3.2 Achievements of the EI as regards improving the quality of education with a view towards eradicating the worst forms of child labour:

a. In general, the EI has made a relevant effort of giving visibility to the issue of the worst forms of child labour and mobilise key actors at national level. This is demonstrated by the production of informative materials destined to impact the teaching community and the general public. The development of systematic actions aimed at making the issue of the worst forms of child labour known has made it possible for the urban population sectors of important cities and rural localities within the programme's area of influence to identify the issue as a real problem.

The educational community in general and the localities tended to by the programme, show an acceptable level of sensitivity to the issue of the worst forms of child labour that they did not previously have, and even though the levels attained may seem minimal in their impact (a few thousand beneficiaries), it also is important that one measures them from a "zero level" set at the start of the intervention.

For example, in the case of sugarcane, the Tracer Study established that 87.1% of former beneficiaries traced agreed with the statement that "children under the age of 14 should not work but just go to school." The percentage in agreement was even greater among girls and non-labouring children in the age group of under 14 years. Likewise, 78% of parents, guardians, or informants agreed that children under the age of 14 should attend school exclusively, with 20.5% holding a contrary opinion. The percentage in disagreement is even higher among those whose families are numerous families. The majority points out that with the implementation of the ILO programme, the communities' attitudes on child labour have been modified in some way. Most families of children and adolescents coincide in pointing out that parents today are more aware that small children—a term generally applied to children under age 12 and in some cases to children under age 14—should not engage in hazardous labour involving the handling of sharp tools like the machete. Minors above those ages are no longer considered to be children, but adolescents. In general, there is consensus that adolescents should work, at least those who do not want to continue in school or cannot do it either because of the lack of education centres teaching adequate grade levels or the lack of economic means. According to the Tracer Study, some leaders reject and resent the law to eradicate the worst forms of child labour because they feel it interferes with the rearing of children, specially during the difficult stage of adolescence. Besides, they feel it is at odds with predominant cultural patterns.

In the case of fishing, 86.9% of beneficiaries interviewed for the tracer study agreed that children under the age of 14 should not work but just go to school, and 94% agreed that children learn more useful things by going to school than working at a young age. 86.2% of parents of children beneficiaries in the fishing sector agreed that children under the age of 14 should not work but just go to school, and 94.1% agreed that children learn more useful things by going to school than working at a young age.

On the other hand, it has been achieved to position education as a strategy to improve the quality of life of children engaged in the worst forms of child labour ("it is important that we go to school to improve

"Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour" and "Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador's Time Bound Programme" (Education Initiative)

Expanded Final Evaluation

our future opportunities,” “we need to relate to others in order to educate ourselves,” “[children] ought to go to school so they won’t run the same luck as I did”).

Despite the above, it has been recognised as a weakness that the sensitisation process had its greatest impact in the urban areas, namely the country's largest cities. The issue is little known in small cities, and lesser known still in rural localities. Small cities, even those which are important by tradition (e.g. La Libertad, according to information provided by a partner institution) have not yet been impacted by the sensitisation actions.

Likewise, the weak impact of the sensitisation processes is still evident in schools, where many teachers evade their responsibility to the children engaged in the worst forms of child labour, educational options are not offered for their insertion or reinsertion into the formal education system, and where some cases go as far as to be discriminatory when they are outright denied enrolment in schools.

Similarly, the actions carried out by both the TBP and the IE require greater follow-up in order to have an impact on positive and lasting behavioural change in the attitudes of the families (specially the parents) in relation to the rearing of their children engaged in the worst forms of child labour (for instance, some parents in the focus groups stated that “if the sugar mill allowed it, my children would go back to work,” “when the project ends, they’ll work.” “it is important that children are able to work,” etc.).

b. The EI made it possible that the issue of child labour became a cross-cutting theme with MINED’s highest authorities. Thus, even though the initiative to create a Unit on Child Labour within MINED was not accepted by the institution, the issue of the worst forms of child labour has been included operatively within MINED’s “We are All Equal” Programme, which addresses the question of diversity and attention provided to populations having special characteristics within the framework of the educational processes. Also, the after-school centres, because of the demonstrated success in improving student learning and capacity development, are about to be undertaken by MINED as part of new complementary strategies of scholastic attention to guarantee that children from impoverished sectors of the population may also attend school and learn.

However, although the efforts oriented towards making the issue of the worst forms of child labour a cross-cutting theme in MINED’s work has had an adequate level of effectiveness among the institution’s high and middle management, more has to be done in order to strengthen the institution’s regional and departmental levels. Likewise, work has to be done in order to influence that the issue of the worst forms of child labour appear as a cross-cutting theme in the modules of the School for Parents.

c. The EI provided technical assistance for the elaboration and reproduction of modules to be used in initial teacher education . These materials were distributed to all higher education institutions in the country which offer a teaching career. Members of the Directorate of Higher Education of MINED, besides ILO-IPEC officials, participated in this action. The distribution of the materials was accompanied by the development of conferences in which were included the worst forms of child labour as context theme as well as contents on the utilisation of the modules themselves (use, scope of application, links to classroom work, etc.). It is nevertheless necessary to design a system to allow measuring the impact of trainings and materials produced.

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

d. The programmes achieved moderate results regarding the rate of retention attained within the school system. This finding, as it relates to the programme’s direct beneficiaries (that is, the child and adolescent labourers), partially corroborates the general information received from different sources regarding total operations in this area, namely that matriculation increased and that dropout rates decreased. Indeed, it is possible that schools in different areas had experienced an increase in matriculation, as can be seen in Table 1 below (referring to the case of Fishing), which concentrated in the 5-9 age range, whereas matriculation remained without any statistically significant increment in the 10-14 age range, only to diminish drastically, almost by half, in the 15-17 age range.

The tracer study showed the following age range distribution of children in fishing who attended school in 2006:

Table 1: School-going population in Fishing (2003 vs. 2006)

5 years and older		5-9 years		10-14 years		15 a 17 years		18 years and older	
2003	2006	2003	2006	2003	2006	2003	2006	2003	2006
76.2	64.6	69.4	88.2	85.0	86.1	65.2	33.7	0	24.2
76.2	69.7	Does not include the 18 and older group							

Source: Tracer Study, Unimer, Dec. 2006

In relation to years of schooling, in the case of fishing a slight increment can be observed in all age ranges, particularly in the 10-14 age range.

Table 2: Years of schooling –fishing sector (2003 vs. 2006)

5 years and older		5-9 years		10-14 years		15 a 17 years		18 years or older	
2003	2006	2003	2006	2003	2006	2003	2006	2003	2006
3.1	4.4	1.5	1.7	3.2	4.2	6.4	6.9		8.5

Source: Tracer Study, Unimer, Dec. 2006

The global decrease in school attendance observed towards 2006 as the age of the beneficiaries increases might be indicative mainly of coverage limitations of the school system (lack of high-school level infrastructure in many areas where the programme was implemented) and of the inclusion of overage beneficiaries in the sample.

The tracer study shows the following age range distribution of children in sugarcane who attended school in 2006::

Table 3: School-going population in Sugarcane (2003 vs. 2006)

5 and older		5-9 years		10-14 years		15-17 years		18 or older	
2003	2006	2003	2006	2003	2006	2003	2006	2003	2006
89.8	63.4	93.5	100.0	92.3	81.4	71.1	55.0	0	36.0

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Expanded Final Evaluation

89.8	69.0	Does not include the 18 and older group
------	------	---

Source: Tracer Study, Unimer, Dec. 2006

In the case of sugarcane a similar phenomenon to that of fishing is observed, in that the 5-9 age group experienced a 100% increment in matriculation, whereas among the 10-14 and 15-17 age groups there is a tangible decrease in school attendance.

As the following table shows, there is an noticeable increment in schooling particularly among students older than 17 years.

Table 4: Years of schooling –sugarcane sector (2003 vs. 2006)

5 and older		5-9 years		10-14 years		15-17 years		18 or older	
2003	2006	2003	2006	2003	2006	2003	2006	2003	2006
4.2	6.3	2.1	2.6	4.4	5.0	7.3	7.7		10.0

Source: Tracer Study, Unimer, Dec. 2006

However, these results must be taken with some caution because, as we will see below, they hide important disparities between one area/implementing agency and the other within the same sector, as far as coverage and the effective attendance of children to the support programs (i.e., the after-school centres, and others destined to promote student retention within the school system) are concerned.

Additionally, according to the results of the tracer study, in the case of sugarcane the percentage of beneficiaries who are literate increased from 83.4% to 95.9% between 2003 and 2006 and is higher among children under 18 than among those 18 or older. When only former beneficiaries that were traced who were 10 years old or older are compared with their equivalent age group today, an improvement is likewise observed though in a slightly lesser degree as the literacy rate went from 90.6% to 95.8%. In the case of fishing, 84.7% of beneficiaries in the tracer study stated to be literate, which represents an increase in the literacy rate compared to the baseline (67%).

According to the tracer study, in the case of sugarcane those who do not currently attend school argued lack of interest, school schedules conflicting with work hours, and the cost of education as the main reasons for non-attendance. However, it is observed that the reasons for non-attendance are very different for minors under 14 years, because in general they do not attend school for reasons of health problems, shame about being overage for their grades, their teachers' refusal to explain the lessons in greater detail, or lack of interest. In the case of fishing, when comparing non-attendance reasons between the tracer study and the baseline, it can be observed that the percentage of children and adolescents who do not go to school because they have to work has diminished in 10.8 percent points. A considerable decrease took place in cases where parents themselves do not want their children to go to school and others where the problem lies in their lack of money for purchasing school supplies and uniforms. All of these changes can be

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

explained by a lack of awareness about the importance of education and about the existence of an effort driven by ILO whereby school supplies can be obtained free of charge.⁷

In the case of sugarcane, the tracer study established that the level of grade repetition increased slightly between 2003 and 2006, as the percentage that stated to have never repeated a grade fell from 81.3% (baseline) to 78.2% (tracer study). Most teachers who were interviewed in depth in the tracer study coincided in pointing out that to a large extent the problems of non-attendance, grade repetition and desertion owe to the lack of incentives in the homes to encourage children to go to school. Also, among other reasons, they pointed out that many families suffer from lack of resources for sending their children to school. Only 21.4% of former beneficiaries that were traced in the fishing sector mentioned to have repeated a grade at least once. Despite this being a low percentage, it is slightly greater than that reported on the baseline (19.5%). The level of grade repetition tends to be greater among children younger than 9 years. In the opinion of teachers, grade repetition is caused by the low school achievement experienced by children and adolescents that work, a consequence of absenteeism and the fatigue they suffer from working long hours.

In the case of garbage dumps, given that in this case information from 2006 could not be compared with information from a former baseline (since it was nonexistent), there seems to have been inhibition factors that led to variableness in the responses given by those who were interviewed, which renders this information unreliable (thus, for instance, only in 37.7% of the cases, interviewees admitted to have worked in garbage dumps before the start of the programme). This impression is confirmed by existing information on the beneficiary targeting and monitoring processes performed on the basis of actual visits to dumpsites; said information allowed establishing originally that these children were effectively child or adolescent labourers.

Considering the small size of the sample and the methodological difficulties encountered during the data collection process, CSE data presents the same limitations that prevent that a reliable analysis of the results be made. Upon examination of the PADECOMSM database, it was found that of 72 records only 18 people (25%) had gone back to school (this was equivalent to 56% of the 32 people with which the programme had managed to maintain some sort of contact, regular or irregular). Because of the age of most of the beneficiary girls (16 and older) and the years they were behind in school, to many of them reinsertion was not an attractive alternative.

e. The relevance and quality of the education provided in the districts targeted by the project was improved through several intervention types:

1. The after-school centres increased the quality of the services offered by the schools, making them more attractive and relevant to children and adolescents engaged in the worst forms of child labour. Complementarily, a strategy for the strengthening of school principals and teachers was implemented, by which they received technical assistance through the implementing agencies in order to generate processes of mutual

⁷ Despite the above, in the case of fishing the teachers interviewed by the tracer study point out as the main reasons absenteeism, schedule clashes between work and school, physical exhaustion, and a lack of interest on the part of parents that their children go to school regularly.

“Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

learning between the school and the after-school centres having a direct impact on the quality of the educational services offered.

In general, the after-school centres have proved to be a successful initiative not only because of its innovative methodology (facilitators, techniques, materials, etc.) but because of demonstrated results and teachers' recognition of them.

2. Along the same lines as the improvement of the quality of education, the EI has provided technical assistance for the modification of the syllabi of First and Second Cycles of basic education and, simultaneously, for the elaboration of supporting teaching materials (textbooks, workbooks and teacher guides), in order to include the issue into the official curricula nationwide.

3. Likewise, FEPADE has provided technical assistance to schools for the elaboration of the Institutional Educational Project. However, despite FEPADE's efforts, it is necessary to overcome the fact that even though the PEI (Institutional Education Project) is as document that schools are officially required to prepare, it suffers in practice from a puny implementation and a lack of scope regarding the activities provided for in it.

f. The objective of providing access to education to children engaged in the worst forms of child labour was facilitated through several actions.

1. In first place, a diagnosis of the needs of the school systems in the target districts was made in order to proceed later on to provide support in the form of equipment and educational materials. Moreover, the implementing agencies also arranged for the obtainment of miscellaneous materials from sources other than ILO-IPEC. Resources from local actors were mobilised for the equipping of schools and students (e.g. Golden Wings' provision of notebooks at cost price, Mercedes Benz' * (La Universal??**) donation of computers, etc.). By improving the quality of the educational environment and equipment, school was made more appealing.

2. Likewise, in order to facilitate children and adolescents engaged in the worst forms of child labour access to school, successful arrangements were made to reduce and/or eliminate school entrance fees and to exempt programme beneficiaries from wearing uniforms to school. In this framework, from 2004 a gratuity bonus was made official in public schools from nursery school through the 9th grade, and "voluntary fees" were eliminated (matriculation, tuition fees and "contributions"). Nevertheless, compulsory matriculation and monthly tuition fees in middle-school continue to be a deterrent to school attendance for programme beneficiaries in higher grade levels.

3. Likewise, the provision of school supplies to children and adolescents has contributed to incrementing school access. School supplies were delivered to all students included as programme beneficiaries, contributing to diminishing the costs of schooling for families and enhancing the possibilities for children to attend school and become inserted into the formal education system. In some cases the Minister of Education was personally involved in the deliveries to give force to the validity of the model and the

" Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour" and "Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador's Time Bound Programme" (Education Initiative)

impact of education as a strategy to look after children engaged in the worst forms of child labour.

However, the necessarily “assistential” nature of the actions destined to improve access to the education system presents some important future risks. Thus, for instance:

- Given the frequent rotation of principals and teachers in schools, specially in the rural areas, the sustainability of programme actions to eliminate entrance fees and exempt student beneficiaries from wearing uniforms to school could be threatened.
- Likewise, when the TBP and the EI end and school supplies stop being delivered to students, these children may stop attending school and go back to work in some of the worst forms of child labour.

3.3.3 Interinstitutional action against the WFCL

a. Even though coordinated actions amongst government agencies, civil society organisations, syndicates, employer associations and international donors geared towards eliminating the WFCL in El Salvador within a coherent institutional and legal framework are still incipient, the ILO-IPEC team has generated a productive synergy between the levels of action (national/local) and their objectives and strategies (prevention/attention).

Be it the National Civilian Police, the Attorney General's Office, the Ministries of Labour and Education or non-government organisations implementing action programmes, networking has allowed leveraging the efforts of a diversity of institutional delegates and promoting in many cases adequate institutional ownership of intervention strategies.

In this sense, the mobilisation of public and private bodies (inspectors of the Ministry of Labour, sugarcane industry personnel, the rural and naval police, municipal staff designated for the administration of dumpsites) for controlling the demand for child labour constitutes an incipient but promising achievement in the fight against the WFCL, which must be explored in greater depth and generalised.

Likewise, a worktable against child commercial exploitation is in place, through which public, private and international institutions coordinate their efforts on this issue. This space for institutional coordination, reactivated with support from the TBP since 2003 has allowed the training of representatives from its constituent institutions while promoting the institutional strengthening of said entities.

b. In connection with the matter of defining the WFCL in El Salvador, a broad consultative process was conducted with regional and municipal entities, the government, workers, employers and members of the civil society, including NGOs, such as to identify and reach consensus on a listing of Worst Forms of Child Labour as well as on their location, causes and consequences.

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

This contributed in an important manner to generating a propitious atmosphere for the formulation and approval of the National Plan against the WFCL. However, even though interinstitutional consensus exists in identifying the WFCL as embodied by the National Plan, it is necessary to have an additional legal instrument (law or regulations) that typifies them as such, in a manner so as to make their banning more readily demandable from a legal standpoint.

c. At the end of September 2006 the National Plan on the Eradication of the Worst Forms of Child Labour in El Salvador 2006 – 2009 was made public. The plan prioritises areas of intervention, establishes time-bound objectives and strategic guidelines, as well as designates responsibilities for its implementation amongst different public, private and civil society institutions. Likewise, the National Plan includes the principle of gender equity within the guiding principles of its implementation.

Even though the National Plan did not achieve the purpose of channelling collective efforts in this first phase of the project because of the delays suffered in its elaboration and public presentation, going forward it is intended that the Plan constitute an important instrument which should allow for the interworking of all the different actors together in a confluence of efforts in to combat the WFCL.

However, for this to be possible it will be necessary to overcome two important omissions in this document:

- The quantification of the goals of the National Plan on an annual and incremental basis, which will allow for following up on the progress of its fulfilment.
- Explicitly establish the global budget allocation needed for its execution as well as present a detail of financial allocations and investments by sector and institution, necessary for the implementation of the different actions considered in the Plan.

The latter point is particularly important for the second phase of the ILO-IPEC project in El Salvador, for if both these clarifications are not be made the project runs the risk of becoming a dead letter.

d. There is a National Steering Committee for the Prevention and Eradication of Child Labour presided over by the Ministry of Labour. The Committee has a technical staff of advisors from each sector and meets periodically to analyse the problem of the WFCL and the advance of the programmes. The Committee's Technical Secretary is employed by the Ministry of Labour.

Previously, during a first stage until midyear 2004, the Committee met in a limited way and addressed issues mainly of an administrative nature, such as the approval of investment proposals, which hampered the exercise of its steering function of formulating and supervising policies on child labour, including the formulation of the National Plan.

Currently the capacity of the Ministry of Labour for concerting WFCL-related actions has been significantly strengthened through the creation and strengthening of a Unit on the Eradication of

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Child Labour. It is estimated that under its current mode of operating, and considering the political will expressed by the administration of President Saca, the National Committee would have the authority and capacity for leading the process of implementation of the actions contained in the National Plan.

e. The project substantially strengthened the national capacities for collecting reliable, gender-sensitive information on the worst forms of child labour.

Thus, the institutional capacities of DYGESTIC were strengthened for the ongoing gathering of reliable, gender-sensitive information on the worst forms of child labour, by including since 2005 a basic module on child labour into the National Households Survey (which polls more than 17,000 homes). This action constitutes an important comparative advantage of the local statistics institute over its Latin American counterparts in relation to the topic of child labour. Additionally, a special child labour module and an opinion/attitudes module on the issue are available.

In like manner, the capacities of the Directorate of Evaluation of the Ministry of Education were strengthened through the provision of computer equipment and technical assistance for the design of useful variables for inclusion in the matriculation census to facilitate collecting data on children engaged in the WFCL as well as a study on pedagogical practices. The inclusion of these variables into the matriculation census, besides giving visibility to the problem within MINED, also helps generate effective spaces for taking care of it institutionally, since "no information is produced that will not be utilised."

Despite advances in the generation of information, some limitations still persist in this field:

- Certain limitations exist as regards the possibility of using household survey extensions for monitoring the number of child labourers by region or category. Survey extensions are useful references at the macro level, but in some cases, depending on the factor used, may tend to overestimate or reduce the magnitude of certain phenomena by simple "statistical effect." Using this information to assess the "increase" or "fall" in the number of child labourers is not adequate.
- No mechanisms are in place for spot-checking the information from the matriculation census.
- There is a lack of reliable and adequate means to conduct periodic studies on the issue of commercial sexual exploitation. The exercise performed and the instruments used in the elaboration of the baseline and the tracer study present many limitations in the case of the CSE. In this sense, the capacities of national institutions such as ISNA or ISDEMU has not been developed/consolidated in order to gather information on the issue of CSE on an ongoing and reliable basis. The role of these institutions in the issue of CSE and in the TBP is relatively incipient. Even though ISNA has a general system for the annual reporting of cases handled by the institution (established with support from the Inter-American Children's Institute), ISNA's action over the course of the TPB was unsatisfactory and its execution capacity was limited, the reason being that the information that this institution is

"Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour" and "Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador's Time Bound Programme" (Education Initiative)

able to provide is fragmentary and not representative. In the case of ISDEMU, this institution started reporting on the cases it attends to since 2006. However, with a view to generating a useful information system for planning institutional actions and services, it is necessary to generate information about those populations in situation of CSE detected outside the institutions (potential demand for services) and not only use the limited number of cases they receive.

3.3.4 Facilitating Context

a. It was not possible to consolidate actions of an interagency donors committee and a consultative committee of child care organisations in support of the National Plan against the WFCL with. However, ILO-IPEC conducted a variety of coordinating efforts with international cooperation institutions, both within the UN system (UNICEF, IMO) and outside of it (GTZ, JICA, PASCA-USAID), including the realisation of several studies and publications (e.g. “Understanding Child Labour” with UNICEF). Moreover, the support of other institutions like the Inter-American Development Bank was obtained for promoting action against the WFCL.

There has been complementarity with the work of other cooperation agencies and institutions, avoiding duplicity of efforts through the development of joint or complementary activities. For instance, with UNICEF, PASCA-USAID and IMO, lobbying, awareness-raising, and the legislative reform have been leveraged; with national and international NGOs, there's been a convergence of interinstitutional coordination spaces, etc. A positive synergy was achieved with the Organization of Ibero-American States in support of educational processes in the schools (e.g. through the rotacajas or "travelling libraries" programme). Likewise, building on the experience of the after-school centres in the sugarcane areas, a pilot termed “An Enterprise in my School” was implemented as an integrating approach which promotes entrepreneurial education while developing other aptitudes in children.

In like manner, the percentage of child labourers aged 5-17 years has been included as an impact indicator in the United Nations Development Assistance Framework 2007-2011 and, together with ILO-IPEC contributions, contributions of other agencies has been included, like UNICEF contributing with US\$ 200,000.

In summary, even though the issue of the WFCL has been given visibility at the level of international cooperation bodies and NGOs, there is a need to create effective mechanisms to promote and allow for the channelling of resources and technical assistance from international cooperation in support of the National Plan.

b. Regarding the formulation of legal modifications, in the years 2003 and 2004 respectively, through Decrees No. 210 and 457, the Government of El Salvador made important reforms to the Penal Code regarding the definition and sanction of CSE and the trafficking in persons. Likewise, in 2004, through Decree No. 458, the Government of El Salvador made complementary reforms to the Procedural Penal Code. These modifications took into account the international standards and the specific characteristics of children.

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

The regional workshop on minimum penalties, first promoted by the ILO-IPEC Sub-regional Project on CSE, had an important direct effect on the sensitising of legislators and the driving and approval of Law 210 (reform to the Penal Code, October 2003). There exists also a general witness protection law and the draft of a victims' protection law is in underway.

Moreover, in Santa Ana, San Miguel and San Luis Talpa local regulations were formulated against child labour in garbage dumps.

However, the formulation and approval of the following instruments, complementary to the above, remain pending:⁸

- A Law that typifies and sanctions the worst forms of child labour
- A Law of protection of victims of CSE
- An update to the Code on Children's and Adolescents
- The establishment of municipal regulations at national level, and above all in the main urban centres of the country, contributing to the control of the operation of and access to minors to dumpsites, and to the eradication of child labour from such places, and
- The establishment of municipal regulations that will allow for a more efficient combat of CSE.

c. The reinforcement of the relevant public institutions' capacity for applying the new legislation, including the prosecution of child CSE-related crimes was another important goal of the TBP. For instance, the WFCL theme has been institutionalised in MINTRAB's structure through the creation of a Unit on the Eradication of Child Labour within this Ministry, which has demonstrated proactivity developing actions and generating interinstitutional synergies against the WFCL. Thus, since 2006, the Unit on the Eradication of Child Labour of the Ministry of Labour has a dozen labour inspectors assigned to the issue of the WFCL, which constitutes a comparative advantage over other countries of the region.

Furthermore, the active involvement of different public and private organisations –like the Sugar Producer's Association of El Salvador and in some cases the Rural Police– in the fight against child labour in sugarcane harvesting and dumpsites has been achieved.

Likewise, it has been achieved that in one dumpsite the municipal authority regulated and prevented the access of children to the grounds. This, plus the closure of other informal dumps, led to a reorientation of the target population's labour-related activities.

As regards the commercial sexual exploitation of children, the equipment and training of the staff of the Public Ministry, the National Civilian Police and other institutions was enhanced, reinforcing the fight against this scourge. By counting with a regional initiative on CSE at Central American level, El Salvador has benefited from the resources, trainings and models it has generated. Likewise, an outcome of the TBP, the National Civilian Police counts with an institutional operating plan and a manual of police procedures to combat CSE, which at the same time propelled the creation of a workgroup for

⁸ This could constitute one of the objectives of the second phase of the ILO-IPEC project of support to the TBP, to be initiated in 2007.

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador's Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

combating child pornography, comprised of specialised staff of the National Civilian Police, INTERPOL and the Attorney General's Office.

In like manner, in a combined effort of ISNA's Eastern Delegation and ISDEM, an ordinance against CSE was drafted and presented to the mayors and municipal counsels for its acceptance and subsequent approval, the matter of establishing municipal policies for addressing prostitution, particularly CSE, still pending.

The fight against the commercial sexual exploitation of children faces a number of adverse institutional and legal factors, which if not modified will hinder the effectiveness of implemented actions. Thus, for instance, a Code on children and adolescents or a law of integrated protection does not exist. The system for the attention of children, mentioned in the Code on the Family has but an incipient operation. There have been previous national plans that have addressed the issue of CSE with very limited success. Moreover, the weakness and inadequacy of the institutional systems for the rehabilitation of victims frequently have negative or iatrogenic effects in part of the cases of victims removed from CSE.

In like manner, the interinstitutional coordination mechanisms among the National Civilian Police, the Attorney General's Office, ISNA and other institutions dealing with the problem of CSE are insufficient, leading to operations being carried out with only limited results against this crime. In this respect, the rotation of previously trained and specialised National Civilian Police staff hinders the continuity and sustainability of the actions to fight CSE.

On the other hand, the weak knowledge of legislation by national judicial authorities implies that more than half of the legal actions brought for CSE are stayed or their authors exculpated. Thus, for instance, despite the existence of a penal law establishing differentiated crime typifications, its incorrect application, and eventually corruption, derive in the fact that in 2004, of 13 cases of CSE denounced by the Public Prosecutor's Office in Trafficking (with 26 suspected exploiters detained), all were acquitted. In 205, of 25 cases of victims of CSE (with 56 suspected exploiters detained), 50% has been acquitted and 50% await public hearing.

The existence of these multiple problems, added to the fact that commercial sexual exploitation constitutes the one WFCL in which least progress was made during the first phase of the TBP, should lead to the issue receiving most important attention during the second phase of the TBP.

d. The establishment of a community-based WFCL monitoring system was a goal towards which important advances were made in some geographical locations. Thus, it has been possible to promote the organisation of the grassroots, as well as to appoint local monitoring committees in some parts of the areas of influence of the project, who in many cases have participated in actions of monitoring and sensitisation of families. There is in the communities much willingness to support the action of the local WFCL monitoring committees, their members having conducted diverse verification actions (visits to the children's homes and workplaces) and sensitisation of families to the WFCL. A positive interaction likewise exists among the members of the said committees, some committees keeping detailed records of their work. In the case of FUSAL, there exist ,additionally, youth committees.

However, implementation of the Monitoring Committees was not homogeneous in all areas nor was given the same weight by all implementing agencies. Therefore, monitoring committees do not exist in

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

all of the impact areas of the project, and it may even be the case that one agency may have set them up and driven them in one area but not in another.

In general, it can be stated that on the part of the implementing agencies there was more of an urgency for achieving the nominal goals of the programme than for emphasising and rooting the processes institutionally. Thus, the monitoring committees in some cases got put aside in favour of carrying out the goals.

Based on the above, it can be stated that the sustainability of the monitoring systems and community actions against child labour is still limited, as local monitoring committees have not been instituted in an important part of the communities, including those communities receiving technical assistance from OEF. In certain areas of execution of action programmes, the work of the ADESCOS and the community leadership has been limited or almost inexistent and the community monitoring committees have not been implemented. In their stead, after-school centre facilitators have partially filled in this function, recording themselves the information on the situation of the children and the schools. In other cases, household economic needs and the time demanded by the monitoring committees conspire against the continued involvement of their members. In general, it can be stated that the trainings received by the local monitoring committees have had a limited impact in most places and that it is doubtful that their sustainability can be ensured beyond the project's termination date.

Also, the implementation of the interinstitutional WFCL monitoring committees has been very limited and scarcely viable (only one departmental monitoring committee is in operation in Jiquilisco). In general, no autonomous intermediate and final entities are in place on the monitoring system's data chain (beyond those implementing institutions providing constant surveillance and technical assistance) for collecting and processing information and sending it back to the users for timely decision-making.

e. Concerning the TBP and EI general monitoring:

The programme implements a software-based project monitoring system termed Cipotes, which has turned out to be an original and valuable initiative requiring optimisation.

The indicators used for assigning the "removed" status of to a child engaged in the WFCL present some limitations, namely:

- The "static" way of recording a child's retirement from labour (the "removed" status can only be entered once, not allowing to change the status, say, from month to month if necessary);
- Even though the system includes visits to the homes and verification at the workplaces, it was not always possible to apply them in a homogeneous way in all cases, which is why frequently proxy variables are used to establish the "removed" status, which are not necessarily valid in all cases (attendance to school, attendance to the after-school centre);
- It does not include performance standards to allow guaranteeing the quality of entered information (e.g., minimal attendance implies attendance to 80% of classes or to 80% of the monthly sessions of the after-school centre), which does not allow establishing significant differences between target population subgroups (on this, see Section 3.3.3.a below, in which various effectiveness rates

"Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour" and "Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador's Time Bound Programme" (Education Initiative)

Expanded Final Evaluation

observed by the different implementing agencies of the Action/Retirement Programmes are shown);

- It does not allow entering in the list of beneficiaries of certain activities (e.g. the after-school centres) the names of those who did not receive the benefit/did not show up that month).
- The "removed under another mode" status in practice does not guarantee effective withdrawal from the WFCL.

Finally, significant changes in caseload compared the original baseline (particularly the inclusion of population from other geographic locations –OEF's sugarcane cases, CSE, and dumpsites), distorted the results of certain action programmes and complicated the TBP impact assessment regarding direct withdrawal actions.

f. Regarding the efforts towards the sensitisation of authorities, employers, labourers, families and communities about the harmful effects of the WFCL, and about the legal provisions and government agencies appointed to apply the law, protect children and adolescents and carry out withdrawal actions, it can be stated that the project has given the issue of the WFCL significant visibility among the Salvadoran society and the institutions dealing with the problem, this being a problem that did not receive relevant attention before the implementation of the TBP.

In 2003 and 2006 national campaigns for the prevention of WFCL were developed and disseminated through radio broadcasts, the written press, outdoor advertising and other supporting materials, having as their two sequential thematic axis (a) the eradication of the WFCL and (b) children's exclusive school attendance.

There is growing positive change regarding the conceptualisation and attitudes about child labour. For instance, between 2003 and 2006, the percentage of persons who considered that it was dangerous to work in the sugarcane harvest went from 58.6% to 74.7% in general, and from 57.9% to 70.5% in the rural area.⁹

Likewise, ILO-IPEC has developed a successful strategy for the inclusion of the issue into spaces of opinion making. The featuring of ILO-IPEC staff on this sort of programmes and press releases making reference to the WFCL has given the issue prominent visibility. Permanent outreach and sensitisation actions have been developed with the media for disseminating opposing views about the WFCL and child labour in general in a reasoned way.

Education, one of the elements identified a few years ago as key to the development of social capital in the country, has also been identified at public level as one of the principal means to combat the WFCL. Regarding direct or presential actions, a broad set of actions against WFCL has been developed to promote the involvement of the main institutional actors in concrete actions and in the elaboration of the National Plan on the Eradication of the WFCL. Likewise, there has been a positive impact on vocational training and the academic sector through dedicated University courses.

⁹ SOURCE: Study entitled *Changes in Salvadoran public opinion regarding child labour and education 2003 – 2006*, ILO-IPEC, Nov. 2006.

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

However, whereas more than 90% of the national population has manifested themselves in favour of the eradication of the WFCL, only 9% is aware of the efforts in this field and the recognition of child labour as an important problem to be dealt with fell from 69.4% to 57.2% at community level.¹⁰ In general, this could be due to the fact that investment in sensitisation campaigns nationwide may have been too limited and that the farthest-reaching medium of television has not been used intensively, a deficiency that must be corrected during the second phase of the TBP.

Likewise, the high rotation of staff within the institutions appointed to the fight against the WFCL, whose members must be sensitised to the problem, in addition to the inherent complexity of the issue result in a lack of awareness of relevant WFCL information and applicable legislation, regardless of the institution.

On the other hand, the rotation of journalists within media organisations has the effect that part of the investment spent on the training of this professional sector has to be reimplemented on a periodic basis. Perhaps it is partially due to this factor, despite observable advances in the media's approach to the issue of CSE (e.g. use of the word "victim" instead of "child prostitute"), that the written media treat the issue in a way that is re-victimizing and sensationalist, particularly in the case of CSE. It should be noted that the project has maintained permanent media coverage of the issue through the coordination with other entities of joint actions aimed at the sensitisation of journalists.

g. The capacity of national authorities, labourers, employers, NGOs and community-based organisations for conducting combined and independent actions against child work was incremented.

Some external and context variables seem to have had a favourable effect on the increase of public and private-enterprise awareness and on governmental political will to advance the eradication of the WFCL. Thus, the need to enforce the provisions of the chapter on labour of CAFTA, the pressure of opinion groups abroad regarding the eradication of child labour in certain economic sectors in El Salvador, including the paradigmatic case of Coca-Cola, the changes in political will regarding the WFCL resulting from changes in the national government itself, have all been factors contributing positively to an emerging, more proactive attitude in addressing the issue of child labour, compared to the situation prevailing during the first two years since the start of the TBP.

Coinciding with the formulation and approval of the National Plan on the Eradication of the WFCL, the Salvadoran State seems to be assuming its responsibility in this field with greater resolution and commitment. MINED, for instance, has incorporated the problem of child labour and education as an important thematic axis. Likewise, several public and private actors (like the Sugar Producers Association, the Rural Police and MINTRAB) have improved their operating capacities and developed independent or joint actions against child labour or established systems to contribute to their eradication (observance of codes of conduct in the sugar production chain, visits by police or labour inspectors, and application of the national legislation in general). In other cases, syndicate members have received training and the issue has been included in the institutional agenda of these organisations.

Because actions oriented towards the eradication of the WFCL are still incipient, more work has to be done to achieve their universalisation and sustainability. NGOs involved in actions of withdrawal of

¹⁰ **Op. cit.**

“Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

children and adolescents engaged in the WFCL are committed to this cause and possess technical capacities to this end, but lack the economic resources that will allow them to conduct this effort in a sustainable way.

3.3.5 Targeted Interventions

a. Analysis of the results of the processes of prevention and eradication of the WFCL (fishing, sugarcane, dumpsites, commercial sexual exploitation) in the districts selected, based on information provided by the Tracer Study.

The TBP set out to reduce by 50% the number of children and adolescents involved in the WFCL in selected districts, according to baseline studies carried out in the sectors of fishing, sugarcane, dumpsites and commercial sexual exploitation. As we will see below, according to the Tracer Study conducted in October 2006, the effectiveness of the TBP as regards the withdrawal of child and adolescent labourers was 65.3% in the fishing sector and 52.5% in the sugarcane sector,¹¹ with which, in principle, the TBP would have met its initial goal in these two sectors (constituting also the largest part of the global goal), provided that the original caseload had remained the same.

Based on the tracer study information, it was established that in the period the programme was in operation, the average age at which children begin to work increased in general by one year. Whereas in 2003 the average age was 9.1 years, by 2006 the average age was 10.6 years. However, in the specific activity of sugarcane production, the average age at which children begin to work is greater (11.4 years). In addition, on average, in the case of former beneficiaries from the fishing sector who participated in the tracer study mentioned to have begun to work at 9.5 years of age, two years more than the age of 7.5 years established in the baseline study. The average age at which children start to work in fishing is 9.7 years. Independently of however this is interpreted, the average age at which work is entered into does not correspond to what the Salvadoran legislation establishes (14 years).

According to the tracer study, in 2003 the average duration of a day's work in the sugarcane sector was approximately 4 hours and 18 minutes. After the programme, that average rose to 5 and a half hours for the 14 and older age group, specially among adolescents older than 18, as the average number of hours worked daily by children below age 14 is 3 hours and 54 minutes. On their part, girls work on average 1 hour and 12 minutes more than boys each day. The average number of hours worked each day for girls is 6 hours and 20 minutes and for boys 5 hours and 6 minutes. On average, beneficiaries traced in the fishing sector work almost 5 hours a day (4 hours and 54 minutes), a measurement that has not varied in relation to the baseline. The duration of a day's work is, on average, slightly shorter than this average: 4 hours and 36 minutes. The amount of hours worked each day seems to be connected with the gender

¹¹ There has been an important reduction in the percentage of child labourers in general and of children engaged in the specific activity of sugarcane production. However, according to the tracer study and based on information collected in group sessions with community leaders, in the case of sugarcane, it can be inferred that to a large degree this change can be explained by the promulgation of the law that regulates child labour in sugarcane and the strict control that the Police and the Ministry of Labour have exerted on the sugarcane cooperatives. In this sense, the persons responsible for conducting the tracer study indicate that "Under these conditions, the possibility cannot be ruled out that the percentage of incidence of child labour could be underestimated in the survey, because in the face of legal penalisation some former programme beneficiaries could feel compelled to declare that they are not working at present."

"Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour" and "Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador's Time Bound Programme" (Education Initiative)

and age of former beneficiaries that were interviewed, since it tends to be greater for males as their age increases.

In the case of sugarcane, the average number of days worked has not decreased by much in the last three years, falling from 5.8 days as recorded in the baseline to 5.2 years in the tracer study. In the case of minors below the age of 14, this average is 4.1 days, while it reaches 5.1 and 6.0 days for the age ranges of 14-17 and 18-above, respectively. Former beneficiaries who used to be engaged in fishing worked 3.7 days a week (baseline), compared to ___ days a week set by the tracer study. However, specifically in the case of fishing, the average is 4.1 days per week.¹² 75% of children that work in fishing stated doing so all year long; the remaining 25% do it mainly on the weekends, during the sowing or harvesting season, or when there is no ban on fishing. On analysing the results, it can be observed that the tendency to work during the whole year increases with the age of the children. In like manner, it can be observed that among former beneficiaries that were traced, children under 14 are more likely to work only in certain times of the year and the remaining majority work only on the weekends.

In the case of dumpsites, inconsistency in the responses regarding the number of children that had worked in this sector before (expected be set around 100% but only admitted by 37.7%) leads one to question the validity of the information supplied by these subjects on any alleged subsequent reduction in this WFCL.

In the case of CSE, methodological difficulties encountered by the tracer study (limited availability/access to sample subjects), do not allow using this instrument to evaluate the results in this field. However, after a realistic case analysis of the different experiences implemented by the TBP in this field and of the evolution of PADECOMSM's caseload by the assessors, it can be stated that the effectiveness of child withdrawal in this sector did not exceed 25% of the expected goal (this, in PADECOMSM's case is equivalent to 16 out of 72 people).

According to the tracer study, those who at the moment of the interview continued working in the sugarcane sector, emphasised that they do it to support their families (43.6%) or to complement the family income (23.4%). 20.2% also stated to work to earn their own salary, an argument that becomes more and more common as the age of the interviewees increases. In the case of sugarcane, whereas 78.6% of children under 14 that work do so as a way to help a relative without obtaining a salary, 75% of women reported earning a salary or working under contract. On exploring the reasons provided for not working today, 53.7% of former beneficiaries that were traced said that they were attending school –a proportion that reaches 60.3% in the case of children under 14 and 57.4% for children in the 14-17 age group–, 15.4% stated that they had not been able to find a job, 5.5% cited their extreme youth, and another 5.5% remarked that their family did not allowed them to work. According to the tracer study, in the case of fishing almost one half of former beneficiaries that work do so without receiving any reward for their work, as they do it as a way to help a relative. Whereas 32.1% receive a salary from an employer, 23.2% work independently on their own. These figures

¹² It is interesting to observe that the baseline shows a clear tendency of beneficiaries to work on weekends. However, the tracer study shows that this tendency is on the decrease, with an increase in the proportion of former beneficiaries that work from Monday through Friday. This is in agreement with the fact that some of them are already adults and have incorporated into labour in a permanent way. Thus, it can be observed that among over-18s the proportion that works from Monday to Friday is above 90%, whereas among children under 14 this proportion does not reach 50%.

“Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

have varied compared to the baseline, in which the percentage of children and adolescents that worked to help a relative represented almost three fourths of the sample. (72.8%). The percentage of people that are self-employed or are hired by an employer increase as the age of the children increases.¹³

According to the results of the tracer study, in the case of fishing, 4 of every 10 beneficiaries reported not working because they attend school, which is an indication of the effectiveness of ILO programmes aimed at promoting the importance of children’s education. Also cited to a lesser degree are reasons such as “I’m too little” or “my family won’t allow me to work,” that can be taken as signs of the level of awareness acquired by both the parents and the beneficiaries themselves about the rights and duties of children. On the other hand, former beneficiaries that continue to work argue that they do so to support their family, in order to complement the family income. The minority put forward own-benefit reasons, such as earning their own salary or learning a trade, as justification for working.

Moreover, the initial beneficiary database of the programme (the old caseload) was disaggregated as follows:

Table 5: Target population as per the baseline studies

Sector	Agency implementing the baseline study	Baseline population
Sugarcane	Fundazúcar	4753
Fishing	Fedisal	3480
Dumpsites	Unimer	149
Commercial sexual exploitation	Huellas de Ángel Programme (Médicos del Mundo, España)	125
Total		8507

In the cases of sugarcane and fishing, new beneficiaries were added over the course of the programmes, increasing the initial goals of withdrawal and prevention from 9,400 to 9,800 cases and from 16,780 to 17,474 cases, respectively.¹⁴ However, as shown in the table below, the TBP’s reported results exceeded the proposed goals.

Table 6: TBP goals vs. reported results

Programme results			
		Removal	Prevention
Goals	Initial goal	9,300	16,780
	New goal	9,800	17,474

¹³ In general, according to the tracer study, daily wages are higher among men and as age increases. Disparities are more pronounced in the case of fishing, because men over 14 earn more than the general average, and women and children under 14 earn less than the average. 65.5% of children and adolescents that receive wages in cash share this income out with their families, while 24.1% hand it over in full to their families.

¹⁴ The original population in dumpsites and CSE was subsequently substituted for subjects from other localities because of various operative reasons. Therefore, the assessment of results in these two WFCLs had to be done based on a new caseload. In practice, this implies that, at least in the case of CSE, it can be stated that success was not achieved even though actions were implemented with the majority of original beneficiaries in San Salvador. These difficulties were owed to the refusal of the institution that prepared the CSE baseline in San Salvador to provide the names of the child beneficiaries in order to “protect their identity,” as well as to operative limitations of ISNA in implementing effective actions to remove child victims from CSE.

“Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Reported results	Total	9,952	26,175
	Sugarcane	5,710	9,304
	Fishing	3,583	5,965
	Dumpsites	356	487
	CSE	19	200
	Other (markets)	284	426
	Schools	0	9,803

Source: Cipotes Monitoring System

From the above it can be observed that at some point the project included on the beneficiary report child labourers employed in markets who were not initially a part of the TBP target population. It is yet to be determined whether this worst form of child labour fits in with the other WFCL addressed by the project as regards its hazardousness. Thus, although the level of effectiveness reached based on the results of the tracer study satisfies the project’s initial intended goal (i.e., to attain a retirement rate of 50%), in the end the TBP’s actual caseload was made up of an assemblage of “added” segments (as is the case of the child labourers in markets) and “substitute” populations (as is the case of the original populations of child labourers in dumpsites, CSE, and an important part of the OEF’s sugarcane programme caseload –totalling nearly 1,000 “substitute” subjects), implying the presence within the programmes’ final caseload of more than 1,500 “substitute” subjects not considered in the original baseline. Independently of the success rate registered by the tracer study and the practical implications of it (which range from the technical limitations of some programmes to the need to reduce the geographic dispersal of the target populations of others), those 1,500 people constitute a segment of the original goal that the TBP would have left unattended.

In the case of sugarcane, the tracer study established that the principal types of benefits received by the interviewees or their relatives were: school supplies (61.7%), attendance to the after-school centres (45.8%), talks of sensitisation to the risks of child labour (38.0%) and vocational training (36.6%). Additional benefits include literacy training (11.9%), accelerated classrooms (8.8%), travelling libraries (4.7%), seed capital creation (4.1%), microenterprise formation (3.1%) and income generation activities (1.4%). According to the beneficiary report, in the case of fishing children and adolescents received the benefit of the following programmes: School supplies (77.2%), after-school centres (60.9%), sensitisation talks on the risks of child labour (31.6%), vocational training (25.5%), and literacy programmes.

In the light of the results of the tracer study, it can be seen that the Cipotes reporting system, because of its own deficiencies as regards its method of registry, tends to report more “removed” children than actually withdrawn from WFCL, probably because the “removed” status was verified only once at some point over the course of the project without taking into account possible changes in the laboural status of the children and adolescent labourers beyond that point.

The following analysis of fishing and sugarcane cases will allow understanding this point better, while showing the variations in the effectiveness rates observable among the different agencies.¹⁵

¹⁵ It should be noted that “old caseload” refers to the amount of beneficiaries on the project’s original baseline, whereas “additional caseload” refers to the amount of beneficiaries included afterwards by the implementing agencies; and the “baseline/total ratio” refers to “Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Table 7: Effectiveness of the programmes of removal of children from child labour in the fishing sector, by agency and by total, as reported by each implementing agency using Cipotes data vs. results of the tracer study based on a representative sample.

1		2a			2b			3	4
Institution/WFCL/ Area		Fusal - Fishing			OEF – Fishing			Cipotes Fishing Total	Unimer/ Fishing
		Caseload	Removed	Efficiency %	Caseload	Removed	Efficiency %		
a.	<i>Initial</i>	1383	1340	96.9	1456	840	57.7	76.7	
b.	<i>Added</i>	287	202	70.4	1247	1071	85.9	82.9	
c.	<i>Total</i>	1670	1542	92.3	2703	1911	70.7	78.9	65.3%
d.	Removed children: baseline/total ratio (a/c)		87%			44%			
e.	<i>Baseline</i>	1702			1778				
f.	Effective coverage (a/e)	81%			82%				

Source: Cipotes Monitoring System, Tracer Study 2006 – UNIMER

It can be observed that the tracer study reports a lower percentage of removed cases (65.3%) than that of the old caseload reported by the implementing agencies (76.7%). At the same time, it can be observed that whereas the majority of the cases removed by Fusal (87%) correspond to subjects in the original sample/baseline the TBP will be evaluated against, this is only true for less than half of the cases handled by OEF (44%). Considering that both institutions showed similar percentages of coverage of the subjects within their original baseline caseloads, the above could mean that FUSAL had a higher efficiency rate than OEF, because in practice OEF might have been able to retire a greater number or the majority of the “old” beneficiaries within its target population.

the proportion of children removed from child labour who were part of the original baseline against which the programme should be assessed.

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Expanded Final Evaluation

Table 8: Effectiveness of the programmes of removal of children from child labour in the sugarcane sector, by agency and by total, as reported by each implementing agency using Cipotes data vs. results of the tracer study based on a representative sample.

1	2a			2b			2c			3	4
	Institution/WFCL/Area	Fundazúcar			Fusal - Sugarcane			OEF - Sugarcane			Cipotes sugarcane total
	Case load	Removed	Efficiency rate	Case load	Removed	Efficiency rate	Case load	Removed	Efficiency rate	Efficiency rate	Efficiency rate
a. Initial	2004	1385	69.1	1042	941	90.3	402	207	51.5	73.4	94.6% (off season – Oct 2006)
b. Added	757	651	86.0	939	421	44.8	2032	1818	89.5	77.5	
c. Total	2761	2036	73.7	1981	1362	68.8	2434	2025	83.2	75.5	52.5% (harvest season 2005)
d. Removed (baseline) / total ratio (a/c)		68%			69%			10%			
e. Baseline	2003			1290			1460				
f. Effective coverage (a/e)		100%		81%			27%				

Source: Cipotes Monitoring System, Tracer Study 2006 - UNIMER

As observed, the tracer study reports a lower percentage of retired children (52.5% that did not work during the last harvest season) than that of the old caseload reported by the implementing agencies (73.4%). At the same time, it can be observed that whereas the majority of the cases retired by Fundazúcar (68%) and Fusal (69%) correspond to subjects in the original sample/baseline the TBP will be evaluated against, this is only true for 10% of the cases handled by OEF (which shows a lower efficiency rate than that of the rest of the agencies). The fact that OEF's coverage of the subjects within its original baseline caseload is only 27% (compared with Fundazúcar and Fusal, which show coverage rates of 100% and 81% respectively), is indicative of OEF's having substituted a large amount of the subjects on the original baseline listings assigned to the institution for others from other communities or areas.

As mentioned above, trace study dumpsite data shows that discrepancies in the responses of child labourers and/or their families regarding whether children had worked in this sector before the start of the programme (an indispensable criteria for inclusion on the programme), undermines the validity of the declaration that of the initial one third prior to the start of the programme only 5.2% of them continues to work in the sector today (and that, therefore, the TBP would have an effectiveness rate of almost 95% in this category).

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Expanded Final Evaluation

b. Usefulness of the baseline studies for programme planning: Initially, various baseline studies were developed (fishing, sugarcane and dumpsites in 2003 and commercial sexual exploitation in San Salvador in 2004) which contained reference information allowing both the development of action programmes in each area (e.g. the beneficiary databases) and the ulterior impact assessment of the programmes through a similar study termed a “tracer study.” However, the initial baseline studies took longer than expected due to an overestimation of the agencies execution capacities, which delayed the start of the action programmes.

The databases generated from the baseline studies were the main source of beneficiary listings fed into the Cipotes information system, serving project monitoring functions. That is, the baselines were used more as a monitoring tool (in the sugarcane and fishing sectors) than as a programming tool, and was updated to that end.

In the case of the dumpsites and CSE, the programme was not executed with the majority of beneficiaries appearing on the original baseline (covering less than 10 of 149 child and adolescent labourers in 10 dumpsites –most of which were closed down). For this reason even the tracer study had to be based on samples taken from subsequent projects.

Moreover, in the case of CSE, IPEC did not receive the names of the girl beneficiaries on the baseline because the implementing institution decided to “protect the identity of the victims,” which prevented follow-up and assessment of the programme. The baseline of San Salvador was then substituted for the baseline of the city of San Miguel a couple of years later.

As seen from the recent tracer study experience, data collection instruments and their application seem inappropriate for obtaining reliable results as regards the population victims of CSE.

c. The after-school centres developed a teaching methodology based on the ludic and social aspects of learning, as well as on the proper characteristics of children and adolescents engaged in the WFCL. As demonstrative process, the after-school centres represent a successful initiative because of its innovative methodology engaging local facilitators, its use of appropriate techniques for handling knowledge development and the students themselves, and the use of appealing teaching materials. The process met the recognition of school teachers, who attested to the quality of the education taught in the after-school centres vs. the regular classrooms, and readily referred low-attaining students to the after-school classes. The centres, however do not differentiate between the specific needs of each gender.

MINED is taking up the centres among its complementary strategies oriented towards raising the quality of education in benefit of the students, an action greatly strengthening the sustainability of part of the programme actions. However, this also poses certain risks given that MINED’s target population is constituted by the superset of all the students in the country, independently of particular conditions or profiles, making it likely that on the short and medium term the after-school centres undergo an important conceptual shift, putting priority attention to children victims of WFCL aside.

Likewise, it can be affirmed that the process of consolidation of pedagogic achievements and capacities learned from the experience of the after-school centres has not been homogeneous.

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Thus, although the quality and relevance of the education has been strengthened at the local level (i.e., the schools), this has not been necessarily the case at the district, departmental and regional levels, where a second phase of the TBP must work with greater impact.

Pertaining action programme coverage, on average the after-school centres tended to between 28% and 40% of child and adolescent labourers depending on the sector (unfortunately, the information provided by one implementing agency did not differentiate between direct beneficiaries and their siblings in the “total” column, thus it was not possible to ascertain what the total coverage of this alternative was).

Table 9: Proportion of beneficiary population attending the after-school centres

AGENCY	CENTRES	BOYS	GIRLS	TOTAL	AP	%	
FUSAL SUGARCANE	12	352	236	588	1567	37.5	
FUNDAZUCAR	31	425	121	546	1750	31.2	
ASAPROSAR SUGARCANE	3	40	40	80	191	41.9	
OEF SUGARCANE	17	1290	831	2121	1700	124.8	incl. siblings
OEF DUMPSITES	4	115	68	183	180	101.7	incl. siblings
OEF FISHING	11	984	898	1882	1964	95.8	incl. siblings
COMUS SUGARCANE	2	18	18	36	123	29.3	
FUSAL FISHING	14	311	195	506	1800	28.1	
TOTAL	94	3535	2407	5942	9275	?	

Source: Cipotes Monitoring System

In some cases, the coverage of the after-school centres varied more or less abruptly from month to month. Thus, for instance, we were able to establish the following values between June 04 and May 06 for some implementing institutions:

Table 10: Variations in after-school centre coverage from one monthly period to another

AGENCY	Jun-04	Feb-05	Dec-05	Feb-06	May-06
FUSAL SUGARCANE				40.90%	45.00%
FUNDAZUCAR					
ASAPROSAR SUGARCANE					
OEF SUGARCANE	47.57%	35.90%		42.84%	
OEF DUMPSITES		74.12%	96%		
				49.42%	52.40%
OEF FISHING	24.97%	18.78%			
COMUS SUGARCANE					
FUSAL FISHING				31.32%	31.58%

Note: Fusal Fishing - Jan and Apr 06

Note: Fusal Sugarcane – Jan and Mar 06

Additionally, in the case of Fusal/Fishing attendance to the after-school centres in Jul-06 was 545/1541, i.e. 35% of the assigned caseload.

In general, it can be stated that the attendance of child and adolescent labourers to the after-school centres was irregular in many cases, as could be ascertained after reviewing the school records kept by the facilitators.

Moreover, attended largely by children under age 12, the after-school centres are not a viable nor attractive option for older adolescents. It is therefore necessary to find adequate educational strategies for retaining the population of adolescent labourers in school.

d. Even though **vocational training workshops** based on the preferences and needs of adolescent boys and girls were taught in some of the areas of influence of the TBP, some of the workshops did not meet technical standards as regards the duration of their implementation in order for beneficiaries to receive the full benefit of them. In general, it is necessary to establish certain minimum implementation parameters pertaining to the following: Participants attendance, course duration, participant screening criteria, training scope (post-project technical and administrative assistance), provision of a basic kit of supplies to support putting learnings into practice, inclusion of cross-cutting themes, etc.

Lack of clarity in relation to these parameters led to a failure in putting the acquired skills into practice in a relevant way once the training was over.

According to the tracer study, in the case of sugarcane 38% of former beneficiaries stated having received vocational training courses. Of those who participated in the courses, 83% took them to

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

completion, considering them important to develop aptitudes for future employment and when the opportunity arose they took them (one programme offered them). 57.3% was involved in non-formal education initiatives like the after-school centres (91.7%) and literacy programmes (16.6%). 9.5% cited participating in accelerated education programmes. Those who were most involved in this type of education were older beneficiaries who at present are between 14-17 years old. In the case of fishing, 24.8% of the beneficiaries traced mentioned receiving some kind of vocational training. The incidence of these courses increases with the age of the interviewees. According to former beneficiaries, the main reason that motivated them to take a vocational training course was to develop aptitudes for future employment (43.8%). Other reasons mentioned were: taking advantage of the opportunity offered by a programme (30.1%), it was the parents' decision (13.7%), a desire to learn something new (6.8%), or simply because they didn't have anything else to do (4.1%). 69.9% of attendees to vocational training courses managed to complete them, women over 18 representing the highest proportion of participants completing the courses.

In general terms and following the results of the tracer study, in the case of sugarcane, the services that in the opinion of interviewed children had the most positive impact on their lives were those related to education (provision of school supplies, the after-school centres, literacy programmes and accelerated classrooms). Following in positive impact were the sensitisation to the risks of child labour and the number of vocational training options as well as other contributions aimed at a reorientation towards less hazardous forms of labour (the generation of seed capital and formation of microenterprises). In the case of fishing, the tracer study determined that former beneficiaries pointed out that the services contributing most positively to a change in their lives were the after-school centres and the provision of school supplies, coinciding with the programmes that benefited a largest number of children and adolescents. Also mentioned were the talks on the risks of child labour and vocational training, followed closely by the travelling libraries and literacy programmes.

e. Specific **transitional programmes have not been implemented** as part of the project nor the application of alternative forms of education (e.g. distance secondary education) leveraged, even when they are part of MINED's official "menu."

Rather, technical assistance was provided for the modification of the syllabi of cycles I and II of basic education and, simultaneously, for the elaboration of supporting teaching materials (textbooks, workbooks and teacher guides), with a view to including the issue into the national official study programmes.

Furthermore, the implemented literacy programmes tended to focus more on the adult population. Participants in the literacy circles improved in general their reading skills, but not their writing skills. This may have been partly due to the insufficient duration of some of these courses (between 3 and 8 months, as could be confirmed). In general, in order to produce more sustainable results, the literacy programmes should have an effective duration of around 9 months and then move up to the next level (neo-reading) for 12 months more.

f. In the case of certain action programmes, the itinerant health teams, and in other cases, the SIBASIs, developed actions of promotion and provision of general health care among the target

"Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour" and "Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador's Time Bound Programme" (Education Initiative)

population, not necessarily related to laboural risks. The improvement of the laboural conditions of adolescents and adults (with special emphasis on the needs of girls and women), understood as an improvement in occupational health and safety conditions, was not in practice a priority component in the execution of the TBP. Despite ILO and MINTRAB's possessing the knowledge and capacity to generate actions for the dissemination occupational health and safety information adapted to the needs of the target population, this activity was developed in an irregular, limited and slow manner, also disregarding gender concerns. The number of child and adolescent labourers who received occupational safety training in 2006 and utilised means to protect themselves from labour hazards was small (around 550) in comparison with the total target population.

However, when comparing the types of tasks former beneficiaries were designated to perform in the harvest of sugarcane prior to the baseline and tracer studies, a notable decrease was observed in the number children and adolescents that worked in the slash of sugarcane with machetes, accompanied by a greater number of less hazardous tasks children and adolescents were assigned to do. Indeed, most of the task of slashing today is assigned to former beneficiaries who now are adults. However, this does not mean that younger labourers in sugarcane had stopped using sharp tools completely. Whereas in the baseline the machete was used by 87.1% of beneficiaries, this percentage was reduced to 72.9% in the tracer study (64.7% among children below the age of 14). In the case of sugarcane, in 2003 46.9% of former beneficiaries stated to have suffered injuries at work. By 2006 this figure fell slightly, according to the tracer study, to 39%.

According to the tracer study, among former beneficiaries that are still engaged in fishing, the most common occupation continues to be the extraction of shellfish. In three years, fishing with cast nets decreased, whereas fishing with trammels and fishhooks increased. While men perform different types of fishing, women and children under 14 concentrate in the extraction of shellfish. Although it was not mentioned during the collection of quantitative data nor the individual interviews, youths commented in group sessions that an activity occurring more and more among children is the hunting for turtles and their eggs. Although this activity only requires that children walk on the beach, it must be carried out exclusively during night hours, therefore becoming inadequate and unsafe for children to do. 88.1% of former beneficiaries traced who are engaged in fishing use some sort of utensil or tool to carry out their work. This percentage rather high compared to the baseline, in which 61.6% of children stated using some sort of tool in their work. In relation to the risks beneficiaries in the fishing sector are exposed to, 2 of 10 declared to have suffered injuries in the performance of their work. These injuries were experienced more or less frequently. The incidence of work-related injuries has decreased compared to the baseline, which reported 44.2% of cases of children that experienced some type of lesion.

g. The project's greatest achievements in connection with the development of CSE prevention, protection and counselling models were verified in the development of preventive actions against this scourge. Thus, for instance, the prevention programme executed jointly with CONAMUS focused on the reduction of vulnerability factors and the increase of protection factors for 200 children beneficiaries (that is, work was done under the principle of reducing the possibility that children become caught in CSE). The radio spots developed with CONAMUS constitute a good example of a product intended for mass dissemination having a clear objective geared towards a specific audience (to prevent potential victims from becoming engaged in CSE).

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Along another vein, the framework of prevention of the demand for child labour was developed with support from the ILO-IPEC Sub Regional Project and the participation of the Attorney General's Office in its function as social preventor of crime. Both prevention models included information and awareness-raising campaigns aimed at the target population.

Moreover, as regards the provision of attention to the victims of CSE, ILO-IPEC in the Central American Sub Region counts with an articulated institutional methodology for addressing CSE by the restitution of rights through first and second order interventions. Together with the support given to certain direct action/removal programmes, the TBP undertook to disseminate this model in El Salvador with the technical consultancy and support in the form of training materials provided by ILO-IPEC's sub-regional programme on CSE.

Unfortunately, the local institutions' response on this point has been inconsistent. Thus, although institutions like ISDEMU have shown an interest in developing alternative systems of protection to victims (this institution even has trained members of its technical team on the issue of CSE at the national level, initiated victim protection actions in San Salvador and assumed the follow-up of girl beneficiaries –with PADECOMSM as implementing agency– until the end of 2006 in San Miguel with ILO-IPEC's support), ISNA, the guiding institution in the field of child care in El Salvador, lacks the institutional capacities for implementing successful projects in this field, which was reflected by the limited performance in terms of projects implemented by this institution in San Salvador and San Miguel.

In general, the very institutional context and practices of care of at-risk children in El Salvador are unfavourable to innovation and improvement. Thus, contrary to that proposed by the articulated intervention model, certain institutions make excessive emphasis on institutionalisation as a first step for approaching the problem. In other cases, the institutions providing protection present functional and budgetary weaknesses undermining their capacity to implement in a successful and timely manner actions of prevention and removal. Thus, for instance, in transitory shelters it is frequent to find technical deficiencies and risks endangering the integrity of potential girl beneficiaries. In general, the interinstitutional coordination networks in this field have only a nominal existence and therefore their action is limited.

Even in the case of those programmes that received support from the TBP, the intervention models are detached from open medium (street and others) and permanent recruitment strategies for capturing new beneficiaries, being limited to institutional referrals or counter-referrals. The implemented model presents in addition other deficiencies such as the fact that the action programme execution times in CSE are too short and insufficient considering the complexity and average duration of rehabilitation processes. Moreover, there are no alternatives for the treating of drug consumption among beneficiaries from the CSE sector, nor for the promotion of responsible parenthood to avoid precocious pregnancies that reinforce that girls be re-victimised. Attending to these needs is a priority. A particular deficit in relation to the attention to victims of CSE implemented by the TBP is the lack of alternatives for the approach and rehabilitation of boys in CSE (the fact being that the rate of transmission of HIV-AIDS is greater among boys than it is among girl victims of CSE, according to data provided to the assessor in February 2006 by the coordinator of the World Doctor's Huellas de Angel Programme); in general it can be

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador's Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

stated that the programme suffers from the inadequate application of the gender-perspective in this field.

The above-mentioned factors have caused at this point that the programme become unstable and incoordinate, resulting in turn in a lessened capacity of various action programmes for reaching their goals as well as an extremely low level of effectiveness. In the light of the results of the tracer study and the revision of PADECOMSM's cases by the assessors, it can be stated that the CSE sector constitutes the one WFCL where the TBP has shown the least rate of success.

Despite the above, it is important to mention that PADECOMSM was able to articulate viably the vocational training and the reinsertion of part of its girl beneficiaries into the rehabilitation processes, which constituted a success from both the point of view of social/labour reinsertion and the economic viability of the production alternatives implemented.

h. Girls and young mothers benefited from increased access to employment opportunities, income generation and micro-credit funds, which in principle constitutes a success. In a few cases, the occupational skill trainings were developed in an adequate and relevant way and adapted to the needs and requirements of the beneficiaries. Thus, for instance, some entities implementing removal programmes executed integrated productive activities (professional training, seed capital creation) on a small scale.

However, in general terms, it could be ascertained that the TPB programmatic offering in this area was, in practice, disarticulated and insufficient. In the first place, the implementation sequence (training in literacy, training in occupational skills, training in management skills, provision of loans and/or productive inputs) was not fulfilled in most cases, nor was necessarily executable in a good many cases.

In like manner, some of the alternatives intended for this component were not well designed. Thus, for instance, because of the particular characteristics and standards of INSAFORP's institutional offering, which is aimed at a different type of public, this institution's services could not be utilised as intended. In general, there were serious deficiencies as regards variances in quality and duration of this component, as much as in the distribution of productive inputs to participants.

There was a lack of precision in relation to ILO-IPEC's institutional expectation regarding certain projects. There was incoordination and inadequate communication and collaboration between executing entities of the productive component and entities entrusted with the execution of other components in each area. ILO-IPEC needed to play more of a mediating role to achieve greater coordination between the different implementing agencies.

In general, a significant number of FF could not be reached that offered alternatives combining occupational skills training and entrepreneurial training with a contribution of inputs/seed capital. The small initiatives of the executing agencies were not sufficient to significantly palliate or compensate for the general lack of contributions of productive inputs to the families.

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Likewise, neither enough time was assigned for providing subsequent follow-up/technical support to the businesses since, nor sufficient work was done to establish access channels to markets. Further, no realistic scheme was implemented at all for granting micro-loans to beneficiaries (in some cases donations of tools and inputs were granted as though they were "loans," conveying an ambiguous message to beneficiaries, as was particularly the case of the project executed by CARE), and no previous market studies were conducted to determine what training alternatives would be made available.

Because of the reasons mentioned above, the majority of the people that were trained were not able to start a business.

Within this framework and according to the tracer study, in the case of sugarcane most families contacted in 2006 (254) did not notice a significant change in their economic condition since the start of the programme under assessment. However, approximately 1 of 5 families reported an improvement due largely to their receiving different economic aids (in the form of school supplies or groceries) in support of domestic economy, relieving some of the economic pressure on the families. Several other families declared to be satisfied because they acknowledged an improvement in the academic attainment of their children and because since the start of the programme they reflected on the importance of children going to school. In the case of sugarcane, salaried work (57.1%), self-employment (33.5%) and remittances (7.5%) are the main sources of family income. Three of four families live obtain their income from agricultural activity (76.0%). In second place come the provision of services (9.0%), commerce (8.1%), domestic work (5.0%) and industry (4.5%). Only 16.7% of the families traced received a loan in 2006, very similar to the proportion of families who received a loan three years before (14.9%). Also in sugarcane, according to the tracer study, over the duration of the programme 8 of 10 informants did not perceive a substantial change in family health.

According to the tracer study, in the case of fishing, most parents, 68.6%, were of the opinion that their economic situation has remained the same, compared to 25.5% that stated that their economic condition had improved and 4.2% that reported that their economic situation had worsened. Only 16.6% of the families traced received a loan in 2006, very similar to the proportion of families who received a loan three years before (15.7%). ***** 36.0% of the families have experienced some sort of economic adversity due to flooding or drought (33.7%), illnesses or accidents (24.4%), a poor harvest (22.1%). In the case of fishing, most families interviewed during the tracer study reported self-employment (66.5%) and salaried work (31.0%) as main sources of family income. Only 7.5% receives remittances, while the rest (less than 1%) cited other means of subsistence. Specifically, income is obtained from two principal activities: fishing (59.6%) and agriculture (30.9%). 77.8% of parents interviewed considered that family health remained the same, versus the 17.6% who were of the opinion that their family health had improved and the 3.3% who believed, on the contrary, that it got worse.

In general, it is possible to affirm that even though the development of vocational training and income generation initiatives permitted the ILO-IPEC team to acquire certain experience in preparation for the second phase of the project, the limited success of this component constitutes

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

a factor that could affect the sustainability of project achievements in other areas if the poverty conditions of the families of children engaged in the WFCL in El Salvador persist.¹⁶

3.3.6 Links and networks

a. In relation to improving municipalities' access to local development funds that can benefit the target population, particularly girls and women, this component was not prioritised by the TBP and rather it was implemented in a very incipient form only towards the end of the project by providing support to the preparation of municipal plans to that end. With a view to a second phase of the TBP, it would be advisable to review the applicability of this strategy in El Salvador, as well as the usefulness of keeping this product within the framework of subsequent actions. In general, it is estimated that the effects of this component on the problem of the WFCL are of a very indirect and long-term nature.

b. In relation to increasing awareness among local authorities, labourers, employers, community-based organisations and families of the target communities about the harmful effects of child labour, the programme has made the problem of child labour, its risks and consequences clearly visible in the communities where it has worked, promoting greater awareness and attitudinal change among the population. Parents and leaders of beneficiary communities were sensitised to the risks of child labour through workshops and talks facilitated by community technical staff. Community radio stations supported the effort by transmitting messages aimed at raising awareness among the target population about the risks of child labour and the need to prioritise children's education.

However, despite progress in this area, knowledge of the scope of the legal reforms, the agencies charged with their execution, and the provisions of the National Plan on the Eradication of the Worst Forms of Child Labour is still limited. For this reason, a second phase of the TBP should strive to continue disseminating information and sensitising the population to these important aspects.

c. Likewise, as regards the increase in the capacities of local authorities, labourers, employers, community-based organisations and families of the target communities for developing joint or independent actions against the WFCL, it can be observed that, even though achievements in this field are still incipient, the sugar mills have become aware of the problem and developed actions to eradicate child labour in the sugarcane harvest, at the same time that different target communities in fishing and sugarcane developed actions oriented towards the prevention of child labour and promoting that children go to school.

¹⁶ For instance, in focus groups during the tracer study community leaders from the fishing sector mentioned two principal problems in relation to the programmes offered by ILO. The first has to do with their duration, which they considered as being too short for effectively developing occupational skills in parents and children that can be used as livelihood or for obtaining additional income, or for avoiding that beneficiaries or new generations relapse into child labour and school absenteeism. The second problem has to do with the initial economic investment that has to be made in order to turn these activities into a profitable business, which families do not have the capacity of assuming. These two problems are the cause that after the programme finishes, acquired learning will not be followed-up on as expected. Leaders mentioned the need to make this programmes permanent or at least prolong their duration such that the process is ended once the communities have achieved a significant level of economic improvement allowing that their children do not have to work.

“Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

d. In relation to networked actions, more efforts are needed to create synergies and achieve a greater dissemination of the contents of the National Plan on the Eradication of the WFCL, the national legislation and the ILO-IPEC programmes in El Salvador. For instance, in the case of the TBP and the EI, most implementing and partner agencies were familiar with the contents related to their area of execution or project, but were to a large extent unaware of the whole of the efforts carried out by IPEC.

In general, the objectives and components of the National Plan should become the articulating axis and the guiding principle of the efforts of the public and private sector against the WFCL. The creation of specialised units within MINTRAB on the Eradication of child labour, and within the Police for combating the trafficking in children for commercial sexual exploitation purposes constitutes an important advance in the fight against the WFCL, but that calls for more efficient and close coordination of the work of NGOs and government agencies.

The business sector is readily involved in certain activities which are key to controlling the demand for child labour (in the sugar mills, for instance), and several international agencies and businesses have shown a disposition to invest in the issue of child labour, which represents a window of opportunity for developing synergies. However, it is necessary to develop a strategy to secure greater support from the private sector and employer and worker's organisations in the fight against the WFCL. It is recommendable also to seek alliances and maintain coordination with other cooperating agencies to add to the efforts already in progress in this field and make cooperation more efficient by channelling these resources towards those institutions/sectors with greater need for financial leverage.

The existence of platforms for interinstitutional coordination (e.g. the National Steering Committee on the Eradication of the WFCL, the Interinstitutional Table on CSE) and the nascent development of public policies on these issues, constitute an instrument for sustainability, provided that the allocation of State resources for their implementation is guaranteed. Because of the above, it is of the greatest importance that in a second phase of the project the annual goals and the financial resources to provide for the implementation of the National Plan are defined precisely.

3.4 Sustainability

Summary: The project intends to boost the institutional commitments reached during the first phase and develop different actions to follow-up, strengthen and consolidate institutional capacities in order to improve the chances of sustainability of the results.

Even though various factors exist that contribute to the continuity of the achievements attained by the TBP and the EI, there are others that threaten their sustainability.

In relation to the factors favouring the sustainability of the efforts carried out against the WFCL in El Salvador it is apparent that:

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

- **On a technical level**, the National Plan on the Eradication of the WFCL constitutes an important instrument on which to build and orient a synergy of efforts with which to contribute sustainability to the national processes against the WFCL. Likewise, the development of training processes aimed at the staff of the institutions implies a transfer of knowledge and potential capacities for developing actions geared towards prevention and removal.
- **On a social level**, the processes of sensitisation generated by the different communication initiatives of the project have contributed to increasing the visibility of the issue of the WFCL in the country, while the involvement and mobilisation of community leaders, promoters, school principals, teachers and other persons and institutions at the local level in actions of prevention and removal constitute a first social base on which to build more sustainable capacities for action.
- **On an economic (and technical) level**, MINED made the commitment of assuming, initially for two years as a pilot, the responsibility for the execution and financing of 98 after-school centres nationwide.

On the other hand, among the factors having a negative effect on the sustainability of the efforts developed against the WFCL in El Salvador are the following:

- **At the institutional development level**, there is still the lack for a consolidated institutional framework for implementing integrated national actions against the WFCL. Executing organisations responsible for the various programmatic areas have yet to consolidate enough institutional capacities to develop actions against the WFCL in an autonomous way. The institutions designated to look after the needs of children do not possess the financial and human resources to provide children and adolescents adequate protection from the WFCL. Likewise, in relation to the fight against CSE, the police authorities and the public prosecutor's office do not possess enough financial and human resources to carry out all the necessary actions needed for the investigation of CSE crimes.
- **On a technical level**, the intermediate structures of the public institutions at the regional and departmental level (of MINED, for instance) have not been sufficiently involved in the National Plan implementation processes. The process of transfer of responsibilities, key to ensuring the continuity of benefits and services provided to beneficiaries, is still very weak. In relation to the fight against the commercial sexual exploitation of children, a service platform model may be operational as long as opportune, efficient and quality services are provided in a compassionate way; if high service value is not kept, the model's operation will suffer from serious limitations or altogether come to a standstill.
- On the social level, there is still a gap in the knowledge, attitudes and practices of the adult and children population of the target communities regarding child labour, which poses a risk to the sustainability of programme achievements. The persistence of poverty among the families and communities intervened by the programme and the lack of effective income alternatives, continue to be a long-term obstacle to the programmes' eradication efforts. In this sense, and as a result of the finalisation of the TBP and the EI, the sudden interruption in the delivery of school supplies to the families at the start of the school year 2007 may generate counterproductive effects as regards

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

school enrolment or a relapse into the WFCL. This is a conjunctural problem that must be addressed as a priority during the second phase of the TBP.

- On an economic level, the national budget does not yet consider allocating sufficient resources to finance the fight against the WFCL in its different aspects in a sustainable way. Furthermore, project results as regards household economic development are limited, which constitutes an important unresolved vulnerability factor undermining the sustainability of the achievements attained in the removal of children from the WFCL.

4. Good Practices

Among the innovative good practices emerged from the implementation process applicable to future projects are the following:

- a. The combining in one project the implementation of parallel actions geared to reducing the supply of child labour (e.g. the after-school centres), as well as the demand for it (e.g., inspections of sugarcane plantations and dumpsites by MINTRAB, the rural police, the sugar mills themselves or the interinstitutional committees against child labour).
- b. Actively engaging the Agricultural Producer Associations (in the case of sugarcane) in the fight against the WFCL.
- c. The implementation of after-school centres as an education alternative for reinforcing basic skills and abilities and preventing grade repetition and school desertion and as a complement to the removal of children from the WFCL.
- d. The inclusion of a module on child labour into the National Households Survey.
- e. The verification of the laboural status of children and adolescents within the matriculation census conducted every year in the schools.
- f. Establishment of a written agreement between the parents of child beneficiaries and the implementing agency OEF, making the benefits provided by the programme conditional on the verifiable removal of children from the WFCL.
- g. The institutionalisation of the issue of child labour by MINTRAB through the creation of a Specialised Unit on the Eradication of Child Labour within the organisational structure of the Ministry.

5. Lessons learned from the first phase that can be passed along to second phase

- a. A second phase of the programme should consider longer execution times that are more adequate to the achievement or implementation of certain goals and action programmes.
- b. In future programmes it will be advisable to develop baseline studies concurrently with action programme implementation and, eventually, as an action programme component, so as to avoid subordinating action programme execution to baseline completion, as well as disparities between project caseload and baseline data. However, action programmes should be executed on the basis of foreseeable, non-movable geographical frameworks (i.e., fixed districts and communities).
- c. During the second phase of the programme it will be likewise important to focus on MINED, MINTRAB and other institutions' staff at the regional-level (technical, training and supervision) and the departmental-level (directors, consultants and liaisons), without overlooking the national, district (groups of schools), and community levels.
- d. It is necessary to reduce the workload on the team designated for the second phase by better focusing on objectives and avoiding a scattering of activities and target populations. It will be helpful to unite field supervision criteria and methodologies by integrating the contributions and good practices of team members into a common effort. It is advisable that ILO-IPEC design and implement a training plan aimed at the field staff of the institutions implementing the action programmes, in order to strengthen their skills in relation to social promotion techniques, the facilitation of processes and events, local development promotion, the carrying out of impact actions, the importance of the eradication of the WFCL within the context of local development, and managing projects for public and private institutions, among others.
- e. This plan should be obligatory on all implementing agencies, and its execution should be entrusted to specialists selected by ILO-IPEC in order to guarantee quality and homogeneity in the treatment of topics and the quality of expected results in terms of the practical application of learned concepts.
- f. It will be of utmost importance that, drawing on lessons learned in the first phase, the second phase offer more integrated and effective income generation alternatives to the beneficiary families.
- g. It is important that prior to the implementation of the programmes to prevent and treat CSE a diagnosis be made of the public institutional offering to address this problem on the sites where the said programmes will be implemented, that the availability of institutions working on this field be realistically assessed, and that a strengthening plan be elaborated that is specific to the institutions concerned. In order to guarantee the ulterior sustainability of the actions, before initiating a project to deal with the issue of CSE it is necessary that the State counterpart commit the allocation of specific, suitable and dependable human and material resources, exclusively for project use. It will be also advisable to consider that prior to the start of a project to deal with CSE a period of at least 4 months is required to install the project institutionally and train the personnel.

6. Conclusions

Both the Project of Support to the TBP and the Education Initiative Project have made an important contribution towards the eradication of the WFCL in El Salvador, laying the groundwork for the establishment of a national action framework against the WFCL and in support of education. At the planning and institutional strengthening levels, the TBP has made it possible to establish a national plan on the Eradication of the WFCL and has contributed towards the strengthening of the capacities of Digestyc, the Ministry of Labour and the Ministry of Education. Likewise, the TBP has contributed in a substantive way towards improving the legal framework related to the worst forms of child labour, particularly that involving the commercial sexual exploitation of children. As regards public opinion and awareness-raising in the government and private sectors, the projects have contributed to giving visibility to the issue and placing it on the agenda, thus promoting an adverse opinion of child labour among the population. In like manner, the projects have contributed towards positioning education as an alternative to child labour and as an effective tool in the combat of this scourge. In this sense, the project has validated and given sustainability to the after-school centres model as an alternative to improving the quality of education and the retention of students in school, as well as enhanced the technical and operative capacities of schools and teachers and improved their understanding of the problem of child labour in the country and the negative effect it bears on education.

In particular, it is an important achievement of the projects to have combined actions geared towards reducing the supply of child labour with actions to counteract the demand for it as well. The fact that this was carried out in a somewhat successful way with the participation of public institutions (MINTRAB, National Civilian Police, municipal governments, MINED) and private ones (sugar mills, NGOs) is an encouraging indication. From this perspective, the effectiveness of the projects as regards the removal of children from the WFCL is high (65.3% in fishing and 52.5% in sugarcane, according to the tracer study), which would have allowed fulfilling the goal of retiring 50% of children and adolescents from the WFCL in the target districts in which said worst forms were most widespread, although said effectiveness is lower (less than 25%) in the case of CSE.

However, despite verified progress, the projects present several deficiencies and limitations that must be addressed in the second phase. Thus, schemes for vocational training, occupational health promotion and social protection of adolescents have had a limited application and a very low impact. As far as CSE is concerned, it has not yet been possible to neither build nor disseminate a viable and successful model to address this problem that is also gender-sensitive.

As regards community mobilisation in the fight against child labour in general, although it has been important, in many cases still lacks continuity and autonomy, the number of successful implementations of Local and Interinstitutional WFCL Monitoring Committees being very limited. Likewise, the proposed family income generation alternatives had a reduced and rather marginal impact. For this reason, the poverty conditions in which families live can determine that when the projects are withdrawn from their area and material support is taken away, many children may abandon school and relapse into labour. Therefore, it is recommended that during the second phase several actions be implemented to support certain geographical areas intervened during the first phase in order to contribute to the sustainability of achieved progress in those areas.

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

7. Recommendations

The following recommendations can contribute to optimise, according to the area in which they are applied, the execution of the second phase of the TBP.¹⁷

7.1 In relation to institutional strengthening:

- According to the provisions of the National Plan on the Eradication of the WFCL, it is necessary to implement a institutional strengthening plan including actions to sensitise the personnel to the WFLC and the role of institutional strategies in this field, such as the selective reinforcement of certain operating units. For example, in the case of MINTRAB, it is necessary to increase the number of child labour inspectors nationwide. Through its support to the National Committee and dialogue with MINTRAB, ILO-IPEC finds itself in a privileged position to conduct advocacy efforts on this point, without which institutional strengthening, key to the execution of the National Plan, would be incomplete.
- It is recommended also to develop easy to understand intervention protocols aimed to public and private operators of the different components of the National Plan (Legal Framework, Monitoring, Attention to Education, Attention to Health, Recreation, Culture and Sports, Income Improvement, Communication and Sensitisation).
- It is necessary to seek and attain an active engagement of the intermediate management (regional and departmental) of Salvadoran State institutions in the development of actions against WFCL and the implementation of the National Plan.

7.2 In relation to the fostering of the execution of the National Plan on the Eradication of the WFCL:

- It is important to carry out at the beginning of 2007 a broad dissemination of the objectives, strategies and scopes of the National Plan on the Eradication of the WFCL among the population as well as to strengthen the leadership of the National Committee on Eradication.
- In order to enable the implementation of National Plan actions, it will be necessary that its goals be operationalised through a document scheduling its annual execution, which will likewise facilitate follow-up of its implementation by the relevant entities.
- It is necessary to incorporate into the National Plan a detailed budgetary estimation by sector/institution and support the allocation of financial resources to them.
- Pertaining to legislation improvements, approval must be sought of a Law that typifies, lists and prohibits those forms of labour to be considered from that point forward as worst forms

¹⁷ Recommendations from the different public and private institutions that attended the stakeholders' workshop (a preliminary presentation of the results of this assessment) are listed on Annex 7 of this report.

“Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

of child labour. Likewise, different aspects of the legislation on WFCL that has been promulgated in the last years in El Salvador must be harmonised with the Code on Children and Adolescents.

- Considering that a new administration will assume power in El Salvador during the second phase of the TBP and considering also the impact this might have on the emphasis given to the issue of child labour by the new government, it is necessary that ILO-IPEC build bridges with the various political sectors represented in the national government and with the various sectors of the ruling party (ARENA), in order to carry out a process of sensitisation of the main opinion makers in each sector, engaging their personal commitment to support the continuity of the efforts of prevention and elimination of the worst forms of child labour as a State policy, placing its execution before any differences that may exist among the different sectors. Likewise, in sensitising political actors it would be advisable to address the issues of the elimination of the worst forms of child labour and the minimum age to be admitted into labour, not only as a matter related to the respect of human rights or the fulfilment of the Convention on the rights of the Child and Conventions 138 and 182 of ILO, but also as part of the commitments acquired by the Central American States with the ratification of CAFTA, which in chapter XVI, article 16.8 deals with labour matters. Thus, the need to promote actions aimed at prevention and elimination of the WFCL would be further harmonised with the country's economic and commercial policy.

7.3 *In relation to sensitisation actions, including the use of mass communication media:*

- It is important that the TBP make greater investments in this field with the implementation of yearly sensitisation campaigns on the mass communication media, including television, a little employed option so far. The gap in the number of people to be sensitised, those who maintain attitudes of indifference or approval towards child labour still remains at 20% of the total population.
- Likewise, it is advisable to promote the realisation of small opinion surveys on the attitude of the general public towards child labour and the WFCL, in order to establish the impact of the sensitisation campaigns disseminated through the mass media.
- The sensitisation processes must be broadened, both as far as methodology (information campaigns using local mechanisms and media made appropriate to each specific area and population) and coverage (including less urbanised or populous areas of the country where the incidence of the WFCL is highest) are concerned.
- It is important to involve media professionals in a permanent and active way through specific sensitisation activities. This aspect important as a high rotation of personnel exists in the media, and therefore it is important to exert an influence on this opinion-making segment year after year.

- Likewise, it is recommended that information modules on the occupational risks faced by teen labourers 16 years or older engaged in the WFCL be developed and massively disseminated in selected geographic areas. The participation of the target population in said information activities should be accompanied by the delivery of personal protection gear (gloves, etc.) according to the occupational tasks performed. MINTRAB labour inspectors could be an important vehicle for the training of adolescent labourers, if duly trained to perform this complementary function.
- Likewise, in relation to sensitisation activities, it would be advisable to systematise and disseminate those successful experiences in the fight against the WFCL that dealt with controlling the demand for child labour in sugarcane and dumpsites and followed up on the application of the law by public and private sugar mills.

7.4 In relation to direct actions to control the demand for child labour and eradicate the WFCL:

- In a second phase of the TBP it is important to spread the successful coordination experiences implemented to control the demand for child labour to other areas and communities with a high incidence of WFCL,¹⁸ promoting that MINTRAB and other public institutions work in coordination with private institutions like the sugar mills and others. Based on the results obtained in the sugarcane sector during the first phase of the TBP, it is advisable that actions geared to controlling the demand for child labour be simultaneously combined with actions to control the supply of child labour, through boosting formal education and the economic development of the communities.
- It would be advisable to replicate and spread the model of control of the demand for child labour implemented in the sugarcane sector to the case of dumpsites, which are largely under municipal jurisdiction/ownership and whose access could be controlled for minors of age. ILO-IPEC should seek the political support of the Corporation of Municipalities in El Salvador (COMURES), which brings together 262 municipalities, such as to promote the participation of its affiliates in the fight against the WFCL. Standardised models of municipal regulations should be disseminated to regulate dumpsite operation including access to dumpsite grounds with a view to eradicating child labour in these areas.
- Articulating the actions of MINTRAB's Unit on the Eradication of Child Labour with those of the municipal governments and the national civilian police and rural police would allow to better monitor and control certain worst forms of child labour nationwide. A similar recommendation applies in the case of fireworks production.

¹⁸ Identifying those populations among which the WFCLs are more prevalent and/or education coverage is weakest can be done, apart from using on government and private reports and baselines, based on the analysis of the results of the annual matriculation census and the national census of 2007.

“Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

7.5 In relation to education as a strategy for eradicating the WFCL:

- MINED's "We Are All Equal" programme should be strengthened in order to develop an efficient installed capacity for addressing the issue of the WFCL within MINED.
- ILO-IPEC should support MINED in extending the education intervention model implemented during the first phase of the TBP to other areas and communities where and important presence of WFCL is detected.
- ILO-IPEC should support MINED in its efforts to expand education coverage in rural and peri-urban areas, particularly as regards an increase in the coverage of basic (grades 7 through 9) and high school education, as well as of distance education.
- It is important to take inventory of the elements making up the teaching community and establish agile, simple, high-impact strategies to develop effective sensitisation processes with each of them. In connection with the above, it will be pertinent to establish indicators signalling the level of sensitisation reached by each group through observable conducts demonstrating positive and sustained behavioural change.
- It is important to consolidate the role of the after-school centres within the schools' pedagogic process, strengthening MINED's technical capacities for further developing the centres. Strategic means should be sought to allow the after-school centres to continue providing the current quality of attention to children rescued from the WFCL to whom the centres owe their creation, while enabling MINED to strengthen this initiative as a permanent complementary education strategy.
- It is very important to ensure the continuity of the delivery of school supplies for the 2007 school year in those communities at greater risk, in order to avoid generating an adverse reaction affecting the sustainability of attained achievements, utilising funds of the Education Initiative ending in March 2007 or of the new project/phase just beginning. It is estimated that continuation of said assistance will be indispensable in 2007 and that work should be carried out with the communities and the schools in order that by 2008 at least half of the schools will not require this assistance from ILO-IPEC, or that through ILO-IPEC's arrangements it could be attained to substitute this contribution for that of third parties (perhaps of Telefónica Foundation's Pro-Niño programme, or MINED itself?) for cases of greatest necessity.

7.6 In relation to the actions geared to improving the productive capacity of families and the generation of income:

- It is necessary to improve substantially the project implementation model and scheme in this area. All professional training activities should include a component for the provision of inputs for starting a business, as well as technical follow-up and support in order to improve a business' chances of interworking successfully with the market. As way of example:

"Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour" and "Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador's Time Bound Programme" (Education Initiative)

Before conducting any given type of professional training, say in sewing, the local market should be studied for that particular activity (several of the activities on which beneficiaries received training during the TBP were not necessarily in demand in their locality) and those beneficiaries trained should be supported either with the provision of the minimum inputs or implements they need to initiate themselves on a particular activity or by “hooking up” their product or service with the existing demand for them in their region (for instance, during the TBP, those beneficiaries who were able to better implement what they had learned in the sewing courses were the ones who were additionally supported with the provision of small sewing machines)

- Contrary to what happened in the first phase of the project, with ILO-IPEC’s contracting the delivery of the trainings in productive alternatives to third party institutions (FUSAL, FUNEMUN, AJE, CARE), independently of the actions that the project’s main implementing agencies –FUNDAZUCAR, FUSAL and the OEF– were then executing and which caused great incoordination, going forward training services in this area should be an integral part of the main projects they serve. It is the implementing institutions that should acquire these services from third parties.
- Likewise, it would be advisable that future programmes coordinate the labour alternatives offered to the families of children in the WFCL with MINTRAB’s employment intermediation programme.
- As regards youth training programmes, it is necessary to establish minimum implementation parameters for said courses, including a standardised duration and post-training technical and administrative assistance to beneficiaries. Otherwise, the vocational training activities and the support to productive alternatives would experience isolated and discontinuous operation, thus failing to meet the objective of improving family income and that of becoming an effective part of a strategy against the WFCL.

7.7 The issue of the WFCL as a cross-cutting theme in other areas of social policy

- It is important to see that the issue of the WFCL become a cross-cutting theme within the focus of attention, operating plans and programmes of other government institutions, based on the objectives set forth in the National Plan on Eradication of the WFCL itself (for instance, both as an objective of attention and a criteria for inclusion in programmes to combat poverty based on conditional money transfers (CMTs), such as the Solidarity Network programme being implemented by the Salvadoran State and also, as a criterion for the provision of priority attention in health promotion and prevention programmes executed by the Ministry of Health).
- Making the issue of the WFCL a basic criteria for the screening of beneficiary communities of the Solidarity Network programme and a condition for the exchange of subsidies in

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

CMT/poverty reduction programmes, would constitute an important achievement that would allow placing the issue of child rights protection at the centre of social policy.

- Additionally, it could be sought that the community-based committees of the Solidarity Network programmes serve as local child labour monitoring bodies in the different places where programmes of eradication of the WFCL are implemented.

7.8 Specific recommendations on the monitoring of the WFCL.

7.8.1 Recommendations regarding the programme's monitoring system applicable to the monitoring of the National Plan on the Eradication of the WFCL.

- Monitoring actions in the second phase should lead to the construction of capacities and the establishment of the National Plan for the Eradication of the WFCL's own monitoring system.
- It is necessary to analyse the construction of the monitoring and evaluation model in greater depth in order to design in a realistic manner the responsibilities of each level and determine its hierarchical structure. In a second phase it will be helpful to designate control groups in the communities where programmes of eradication of the WFCL are not implemented, in order to have a better basis for comparison of the impacts of said programmes when a final tracer study is made.
- It is advisable that the recording of cases of children retired from labour be done in two successive instants and over a longer period of observation than is currently in use, in order to increase the chances of sustainability of this action. At the same time, it would ensure that case follow-up is performed over a longer stretch of time. Likewise, it is recommendable to establish other reliable sources of records for the verification of the withdrawals, such as visits by members of the monitoring committees to the children's homes or workplaces, results of visits by MINTRAB staff, etc.
- With the purpose of following up on the sustainability of the actions of withdrawal of children from the WFCL, it would be helpful that during the implementation of the following phase of the programme sudden spot-checks continue to be performed every year based on representative samples and using different sources of information. In the first phase of the TBP a protocol was elaborated to this end, whose application may continue to be useful.
- Likewise, it is advisable to reformulate certain criteria and indicators of the programme monitoring system (see section 3.3.2.e above), such as to strengthen the system in the face of problems that could lead to an overestimation of the qualitative results of the programme during the second phase.

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

- Regarding indirect sources of information on the WFCL, it is convenient to promote the introduction of sample verification systems in the field to ensure the reliability of the data of the matriculation census.
- Additionally, it will be of great utility to compare the results of the national survey of 2006 with those of the national census of 2007, cross-checking the information from both sources, using cross-sections of the 10-13 and 14-17 age ranges. Because of their universal nature, census have greater validity than household surveys. In the same vein, it would be helpful to include several items on child labour in 5-17 year age range into the Agricultural Census to be conducted in 2007.
- Moreover, it is important to work on the creation of an independent information system about the magnitude and distribution of CSE based on data gathered from different sources, based both on observations made in the field and reports from police and justice authorities and from organisations dedicated to the rehabilitation of CSE victims.

7.8.2 Recommendations specific to the replication in other municipalities of community-based monitoring systems.

- The local monitoring systems to be established in a second phase of the project, under the responsibility of specific committees, should be conceived as an integral part of the Monitoring System of the National Plan on the Eradication of the WFCL.
- It is important that the local community-based monitoring committees are established at the start of each project, and that institutional expectations regarding the support to be provided to members of the community be explicitly established and that its fulfilment be given continuous follow-up.
- The organisational and operational aspects of the local monitoring committees should be strengthened by developing promotion and impact capacities at community level, seeking and obtaining resources from the local governments, and advocating before them for the inclusion of the issue into the local development plans.
- To this end, considering MINED's growing commitment in this area and the role of the school as a key axis in the fight against the WFCL, the Local Monitoring Committees' functional responsibility of coordination, as well as that of maintaining a database on the WFCL, could be incorporated into the job description of the school principals (this responsibility would then be executable through the supervised delegation of duties to members of the community, after-school centre facilitators and teachers, among others). It is also advisable to coordinate the work of the local child labour monitoring committees with that of the interinstitutional committees, which should also be strengthened.
- It is also important to engage the local committees in concrete actions of control not only of the supply of child labour but of the demand for it as well. The experiences of the monitoring

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

committees should be systematised, and based on this design a validated model responding to the specific characteristics of the actors, their surroundings, and their scopes of action and reference.

7.9 Specific recommendations regarding CSE as the sector in which the TBP had the least impact

Ideally, the problem of the CSE, because of the peculiarities it presents, merits an independent approach in the framework of specific projects for this sector. However, because the problem will continue to be addressed by the second phase of the TBP and because of its complexity in terms of the facets and institutional networks the phenomenon is linked to, a few recommendations specific to this issue are included also in this report. Thus:

- At legislative level, the passage of a Law of protection of CSE victims and witnesses in judicial proceedings is required. Likewise, it is necessary to establish municipal policies for addressing the problem of CSE and of prostitution in general, as well as municipal regulations that allow combating CSE in a more effective way.
- However, even though the advance of the legal reforms constitutes an element guaranteeing the future sustainability of sanctions of CSE crimes, the main obstacles as regards the effectiveness of the legal framework against CSE in El Salvador have to do less with the quality or integrality of it than with its limited application. In general, it is necessary to strengthen the justice administration mechanisms and reduce the eventual impact of corruption on the application of justice by mobilising trends in public opinion and interinstitutional action that are favourable to the strict fulfilment of the Law, so that offenders are effectively penalised. At present, judges usually elevate the obligation of a plaintiff to a suit, so that it is advisable to promote a dialogue with the Judicial Branch in order to achieve that an adequate record of CSE crimes is kept (CSE offences are not registered as a separate category within the Judiciary information system, which complicates follow-up of CSE cases).
- In relation to the National Civilian Police and other agencies entrusted with the application of the law, it is convenient to reduce as much as possible the number of institutions participating in repressive operations against CSE, so as to guarantee the confidentiality of the information. Likewise, it is important to protect the investment made in the specialisation of the entities that fight against the crime of CSE, by diminishing the rotation of personnel to other divisions, as well as consolidating permanent intervention teams, and cultivating synergies between the San Salvador police and the police departments of other regions of the country.
- Concerning the operators of the systems for the rehabilitation of victims and victimisers and those in charge of persecuting this crime, it is necessary to consolidate interinstitutional coordination mechanisms and establish and socialise clear intervention protocols and flowcharts among those institutions charged with combating the CSE. Likewise, it is

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

necessary that rehabilitation centres have specialised personnel and optimal conditions to perform their intended function, something that in general is missing in El Salvador. Overall, it is necessary that programmes of rehabilitation of CSE be allotted longer execution times than provided for in the first phase of the TBP.

- Interinstitutional coordination mechanisms need to be reinforced, legally formalised and constituted in order to incorporate other members in a more permanent way. It is necessary that ISNA, the national institution in charge of tending to the problems of children and adolescents, play a more proactive role in the management of interinstitutional spaces. Even though it is important to promote the involvement of the local governments in the various aspects of CSE prevention and attention, coordination of the platform of services to victims of CSE should be driven by ISNA as the steering institution in this area.

ANNEXES

Annex 1: List of questions and other aspects suggested for the standard evaluation framework (original-language version)

Project Design

- How logical and coherent was the project design/strategy? What was the strength of the causal links that connected the various elements of the logical framework? In other words, did the completed activities lead to the desired outputs? Did planned outputs lead to the immediate outcomes? And, did the immediate outcomes lead to the development objective?
- How adequate were the human resources?
- How adequate was the time allowed to carry out project activities?
- How adequate were the funds allocated to the project?
- How adequate was the gender perspective?

Project Implementation

- How did the EI and the TBP able to coordinate activities?
- How was the EI able to coordinate its activities with the Ministry of Education?
- Have project activities been carried out as planned? If not why not?
- Has monitoring and evaluation information been collected as planned? If not why not?
- Have gender issues been addressed as planned? If not why not?
- What innovative good practices have emerged for implementing projects?
- What lessons have been learned during project implementation?
- How adequate was the selection of the partners' agencies? –It's necessary analyze the impact of the intervention of National Steering Committee in this decision-

Results

- What progress has been made by relevant toward the elimination of WFCL in EI Salvador?
- How was the national capacity enhanced to expand and sustain education initiatives proven effective in reducing WFCL?
- How effectively was the EI able to mobilise key actors at the national level?
- Was the EI able to mainstream child labour issues into MINED?
- How effectively was the EI able to include child labour issues in teachers' training programs?

- How successfully were targeted children retained in the educational system?
- How did the relevance and quality of the education offered in selected districts improve?
- How effectively was access to education for targeted children facilitated?
-
- What coordinated actions have governmental agencies, civil society organisations, workers, employers and international donors undertaken to eliminate the worst forms of child labour in El Salvador within a coherent legal and institutional framework?
- How has national capacity for gathering reliable, gender sensitive information on child labour, especially in its worst forms, been enhanced?
- What regional and national consultations took place on the worst forms of child labour?
- Was a National Plan of Action against the worst forms of child labour developed that sets clear targets, time frames, responsible institutions and budgetary allocations, with special consideration of the situation of the girl child?
- Have the National Steering Committee the capacity for carry out the responsibilities includes in the National Plan against the worst forms of child labour?
- What work was accomplished by the Inter-agency committee of donors and the NGO Consultative Committee on Children supporting the National Time-Bound Plan against the worst forms of child labour?
- What new legislation and/or regulations on the worst forms of child labour were implemented? Did it include commercial sexual exploitation, according to international standards and did it take into consideration the specific characteristics of boys and girls?
- How was capacity enhanced for enforcing existing and newly developed legislation and regulations in relevant public institutions, including the prosecution of crimes related to the commercial sexual exploitation of children?
- Was a community-based monitoring system on the worst forms of child labour established? How many reports were produced?
- How effectively were national authorities, employers, workers, families, and communities made aware of the problem of WFCL and its negative consequences, as well as the legal provisions related to child labour, and of the government agencies designated to enforce legislation, and withdraw and protect children?
- How was the capacity of national authorities, workers, employers, NGOs and CBOs with increased capacity for joint and separate action against child labour?
- What evidence is there that the incidence of selected worst forms of child labour (commercial sexual exploitation, dump sites, fishing and sugarcane plantations) in selected districts is reduced, on average, by half?
- Was baseline information updated on selected target groups for programming purposes, taking into consideration the characteristics of boys and girls?

- Did after-school centres provide counselling and guidance for target groups and recreational activities that considered the special needs of boys and girls?
- Did Vocational education and training provided to children aged 12 to 17 consider the special needs of boys and girls?
- Did transitional and non-formal education programs for child labourers and children at risk consider the specific needs of boys and girls?
- How did working conditions improve for adolescents and adults? Did the improvements consider the specific situation of girls and women, in targeted sectors (fishing and sugarcane) and areas?
- What intervention models were developed for prevention, protection and counselling related to commercial sexual exploitation?
- Did targeted families have a better access to micro-credit funds and employment opportunities without their work-load being increased?
- Did municipalities have a better access to local development funds that benefited the targeted population, especially women and girls?
- How aware did local authorities, workers, employers, community-based organisations and families in communities targeted become of the problem of child labour, its negative consequences, including the dangers associated with hazardous occupations and other WFCL, as well as the legal provisions related to child labour and the relevant government agencies?
- Did local authorities, workers, employers, social partners and families in the communities targeted have increased capacity for joint and separate action against child labour, particularly in its worst forms?

Sustainability

- What lessons learned from this phase of the project can be passed along to the next phase?
- Are there specific recommendations for the replication of the community based child labour monitoring system in other municipalities?

Annex 4: List of documents reviewed by the assessors

- Project documents of phases I and II of the TBP and project document of the EI
- Work Plan/Project Timetable
- DED Guides and ILO procedure guides
- TBP's mid-term assessment
- Tracer Study methodological manuals and instruments
- TBP and EI progress reports (TPRs)
- Action Programmes and Mini-programmes
- TDRs and Contracts with action-programme implementing agencies
- Technical reports on action programme progress/completion, diverse materials on processes and criteria used in these programmes, action programme assessments
- Conceptual proposals of the sensitisation campaigns
- Sensitisation campaign materials (radio spots, press releases, etc.)
- Baseline studies (fishing, sugarcane, garbage dumps, CSE - ILO-IPEC, 2003 and 2006)
- Final report of the tracer study conducted by Unimer (Dec. 2006)
- Summaries of diverse workshops
- Systematisation of the information from the SPIF workshop
- Local level planning documents drawn up by implementing agencies
- Specific reports on and generated by the CLMS
- Databases/Lists of beneficiaries
- United Nations Development Assistance Framework in El Salvador, 2007-2011
- Relevant documents on programme policy and programme development (National Plan on the Eradication of the Worst Forms of Child Labour in El Salvador, 2006-2009, documents on the Penal and Procedural Reforms on CSE, etc).
- Public opinion and KAP reports –“Study of Sensitisation Campaign Media and Messages,” ILO-IPEC, 2004; “Investigation on the changes in public opinion on child labour in the municipalities intervened by the programme and measurement impact of the media and messages used in the sensitisation campaigns 2003-2006,” UNIMER, June 2006; “Salvadoran Public Opinion on Child Labour and Education (national study, ILO-IPEC, Oct. 2004); “Changes in the public opinion of Salvadorans on child labour and education 2003-2006,” (national study, ILO-IPEC, Nov. 2006)
- Picardo, Oscar, After-School Centres in El Salvador (CARE, CRS, ILO-IPEC, May 2006)
- Documents in connection with strategies, monitoring plans and reports, costs
- Documents on the situation of El Salvador and the context of child labour (“Understanding Child Labour in El Salvador, 2003” –ILO-IPEC; “Understanding Child Labour in El Salvador, 2003-2005” –ILO-IPEC)
- Working Document: Child Labour Monitoring System Guidelines, ILO-IPEC, El Salvador
- Working Document: Present Situation of the Local and Institutional Child Labour Committees, ILO-IPEC, El Salvador

Annex 5: Stakeholders Meeting for the presentation and discussion of preliminary results of the assessment

(November 10, 2006, Holiday Inn, San Salvador)

8.00 – 8.30 am	Registration of participants
8.30 – 8.45 am	Opening session
8.45 – 9.00 am	Brief description of the objectives of the assessment
9.00 – 9.30 am	Time Bound Programme (TBP): Strengths and weaknesses
9.30 – 10.30 am	Discussion
10.30 – 10.45 am	Coffee break
10.45. – 11.15 am	Education Initiative (EI): Strengths and weaknesses
11.15 – 12.15 pm	Discussion
12.15 – 1.30 pm	Lunch
1.30 – 2.00 pm	Sustainability: Presentation
2.00 – 3.00 pm	Discussion
3.00 – 3:15 pm	Coffee break
3.15 – 4.15 pm	Recommendations for developing a second phase of the projects
4.15 – 4.30 pm	Closing

Annex 7: Recommendations for the second phase of the TBP in El Salvador, formulated by the attendants to the stakeholders meeting on November 10, 2006.

1. In some areas, the after-school centre model has not yet been incorporated into the PEIs drawn up by the schools.
2. Seek positive strategies for the engaging the involvement of local governments (for instance seek involvement the mayor's offices in the local development plans, which should be continued even in the case of a change in the local government)
3. Drawing on the experience from the first phase, propose and seek the private sector's social commitment to the population, a component in the follow-up of intervention areas
4. Strengthen the process of identifying those child labourers that are not incorporated into the school system, so that MINED can provide follow-up and create different strategies for providing attention to this population sector
5. Establish microcredit lines and encourage business development for families in order to avoid recurring to sending children to work in order to obtain additional family income
6. Coordinate the development of productive alternative programmes with MINTRAB in order to provide relevant training and generate salaried- or self-employment opportunities.
7. Strengthen the departmental levels of the different government and non-government institutions in order to support actions against child labour in the operating plans.
8. Elaborate the operative design of and systematise the integration processes.
9. Create a mechanism for collecting and analysing information on the issue including all institutions involved in the effort.
10. Implement a locality-based (territorial), organisational and integrated approach to guarantee sustainability.
11. Strengthen sensitisation actions and integrate key actors. It is important to include the mayor's offices provided this effort is strengthened with the direct intervention of ILO.
12. Take the work in the area of occupational health forward by incorporating this component from project start.
13. Strategy on teenage pregnancy.
14. Develop a curriculum more suited to teenagers' needs.
15. Determine who will be responsible for driving the "basic scholastic basket."
16. Further exploit the sensitisation component by engaging greater participation by civil society (e.g.: through the twinning of private and public schools).
17. Promote that ILO do not withdraw totally from the areas served by phase I.
18. Advocate for the timely approval of the Code on Children and review it to guarantee that it adequately addresses the problem of child labour.

19. Promote that the Ministry of Health assume the occupational risk sensitisation and surveillance components in the communities. Include also the issue of occupational risk into the sensitisation programmes.
20. Address the problem of rehabilitation of victims, their families and victimisers.
21. Include seed capital funding for those populations trained in occupational skills.
22. Include a marketing and commercialisation strategy to guarantee sustainability.
23. As regards the productive alternatives component, reduce the number of attendants per workshop in order to ensure quality results.
24. Ensure that youths in the vocational training workshops get practical work experience.
25. Education quality standards. Standardise a teacher training programme in order to make classroom teaching more appealing to students.
26. Strengthen the juridical framework of protection of children and adolescents.
27. Include a food strategy driven by State institutions.
28. Better coordinate and arrange the relevant institutions' field work as regards functions and responsibilities.
29. Include literacy training programmes that are better structured, monitored and evaluated.
30. Continue to support the schools in the elaboration of their PEIs. Use the PEI document to institutionalise the issue of child labour within the schools.
31. Use already validated strategies to respond to the needs of overage students (e.g. accelerated education classrooms).

Annex 8: Methodological appendix: Reflections and recommendations on the elaboration of a standard framework for the extended final assessment of projects of support to TBPs

1. On the extended assessment in three stages.

It turned out to be very useful to conduct the assessment in three stages, namely:

- a. A first visit in preparation for the tracer study (review and adjustment of instruments, design of the sampling framework –a stratified probability sample survey, more balanced as regards gender and age– definition of timeframes, selecting the local programme implementer), an initial interview with the team responsible for TBP implementation, selection of the geographical areas and projects to be included in the final assessment, establishing a checklist of additional information to request from IPEC, planning the assessment’s itinerary and calendar, and assignment of the geographical areas and designated tasks among the members of the evaluation team.
- b. A reasonable interval of at least two months was allowed to elapse between the first and the second visit for the assessment of the programmes by the evaluation team in the field in order to develop the Tracer Study and report on its findings. Considering the difficulties inherent to this study and the need for the evaluating team to have a copy of it at least 15 days before making its second visit (which did not happen during the assessment of the TBP in El Salvador, in which the tracer study report was completed during the assessment itself), going forward it is advisable to anticipate that the minimum period of time to complete this intermediate study (the tracer study) be no less than three months.
- c. A second visit to the field was made by the evaluating team with the purpose of analysing the (actions of institutional strengthening) institutional strengthening actions carried out by the TBP and the processes of implementation and results of the various action programmes in each sector around the country.

This scheme of extended assessment in three stages, which combines the analysis of different quantitative (impact on target populations) and qualitative aspects (medium- and long-term impact), seems appropriate and therefore it is suggested that it be continued.

2. On the adjustments of the instruments of the tracer study

- a. The adjustment of instruments to be done in this first phase should include the harmonisation of the instruments proposed by the tracer study (beneficiary questionnaire, family questionnaire, etc.) with the contents of the instruments originally applied in the baseline study, such as to eliminate non-traceable items which were not included on the baseline and include rather others that were included and are not considered by the instruments of the tracer study.

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

- b. It was observed that the “during” module of the tracer study is of little usefulness because of the short timeframes allotted to the implementation of action programmes supported by ILO-IPEC and the little time elapsed between their finalization and the realisation of the tracer study, and because asking similar questions in reference to two different moments (“during” and “after” the programme) can lead to confusion or the mechanical repetition of answers by interviewees, and when a baseline is not available for a particular sector, as was the case for garbage dumps, would render the application of the questionnaire too extensive and hardly manageable. It is suggested therefore that the “during” module be eliminated, or that its application be limited to just a few questions regarding the laboural activity and school attendance of the children and adolescents.

3. *On the effective potential for the generalisation of the results of the tracer study*

The correct application of the tracer study and the potential for the generalisation of its results would require that the ulterior direct beneficiaries of the projects implemented over the course of the duration of the TBP be the same beneficiaries registered on the baseline. This, however, does not always hold true, as between the time elapsed from that “unique and initial moment” in which the information of the baseline was gathered and the subsequent moments in which, months later, the various action programmes are approved and started, part of the population registered by the baseline may have migrated definitely or may no longer be placeable by the implementing agencies.

Considering what was observed in the case of most of the action programmes of the TBP in El Salvador, the magnitude of “target population loss” can be placed anywhere between 10 and 20 per cent of the total. However implementing agencies may attempt to compensate for such a gap by adding new subjects (regardless of these subjects not necessarily appearing in the baseline or their corresponding to more recent cases and therefore having been less exposed to the benefits of the action programmes) to complete their action programme goals, the results of the tracer study can only be applicable to a smaller segment, between 80 and 90 per cent, of the TBP’s total population.

The problem is further complicated, as was verified in the case of the OEF’s intervention in sugarcane, when the allowance is made of substituting an important part of the original baseline population for a “new” one from other communities (for the case at hand, it meant more than 1,000 cases, i.e. more than 10% of the total goal). This plays down the tracer study’s capacity for generalising its results.

Recommendations on this point are manifold:

- a. This type of problem should be detected and communicated frankly by the implementers of the TBP to the evaluating team BEFORE the design of the tracer study in order to make necessary adjustments to the sampling framework well in advance.
- b. Should ILO-IPEC consider to continue to regularly apply the tracer study as part of its extended assessment model, a minimum tolerance value must be set for any proposals involving massive caseload/target area substitutions which, by reason of facilitating goal

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

attainment, may introduce important modifications into the context in terms of the original target population the TBP was formulated for. This includes likewise not allowing the incorporation of other child labour categories that are not a part of the original target groups (this includes, in the case of El Salvador, the latter inclusion that was made of 509 children and adolescents labouring in markets).

- c. With the purpose of overcoming/compensating for the risk pointed to in the first part of item b, as well as reducing the risk of “population target loss” due to the long time elapsed between the gathering of baseline data and the start of action programme implementation, it is advisable to time-segment the baseline study through the progressive –versus “static”– collection of information as programmes go about being implemented. In this manner, baseline data gathering would go on to constitute a requisite first instant of every action programme to be implemented in a given region by each implementing agency. The information from each of these "micro studies" would then be progressively processed by ILO-IPEC or whomever ILO-IPEC designates.
- d. Finally, it is recommended that going forward baseline studies be accompanied, in each case, by a parallel baseline module applied to one or more control groups, which would allow giving greater consistency to the methodology used, so that the tracer study may constitute itself into a true impact study.

Moreover, where a baseline study was not available (e.g., the case of garbage dumps), a problem was observed in which the statements made by subjects whose names were on the lists of child and adolescent engaged in child labour openly contradicted the very fact that they had been involved in such activity. This lack of reliability of the information can be attributed to the sense of shame children and adolescent labourers and their families feel regarding the particularly degrading characteristics of this type of labour, but could also owe, per se, to limited reliability in the application of the "before" and "after" modules in the absence of a previous baseline. Further inquiry is suggested to clear up this point.

4. *On the difficulty of obtaining sufficient and reliable data on the issue of commercial sexual exploitation from the tracer study*

As could be verified in the case of the El Salvador assessment, the application of standard questionnaires to children and families in the drawing up of the baseline and the tracer study does not constitute a useful medium for assessing the evolution of the condition of children engaged in CSE.

- a. For better assessing the effectiveness of these programmes, it is suggested that ILO-IPEC provide the implementing agencies with a checklist containing information categories useful for case assessment, that would be included on the files of each beneficiary to facilitate subsequent comprehensive analysis by the evaluating team during the final assessment (e.g., beneficiary's gender, age on entering the programme, time involved in the CSE, pregnancies, drug use, involvement in gangs, number of times beneficiary abandoned/returned to the programme, regularity of participation in programme activities, school attendance, vocational training, labour reinsertion, family reinsertion, institutionalisation, involvement of relatives in prostitution/drugs/drug traffic/gangs, etc.).

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Expanded Final Evaluation

It was observed that institutions do not process nor use the useful information they possess in order to make programmatic decisions.

- b. Additionally, it is suggested that one or more focus groups be carried out with programme beneficiaries and (separately) with their families, in order to obtain information in a more relaxed group setting on the common characteristics of the target group and the variables that contributed to their process of recovery and the adequacy and quality of the institutional response to their needs.

Such a scheme was applied when evaluating PADECOMSM’s programme on CSE in San Miguel.

5. *On the need to additionally introduce performance standards for programmatic alternatives implemented by the TPB*

The TBP monitoring system design should include minimum performance standards for programmatic alternatives implemented, whose fulfilment may be later analysed for the purpose of a final assessment. For instance, in the case of the after-school centres, the literacy training courses, the vocational training programmes and all other alternatives of similar characteristics, their coverage, duration, contents/minimum processes and attendance records should be included as elements of analysis to be used by the implementing agency and the local ILO-IPEC and evaluating teams.

6. *On the discrepancies between the percentages recorded by the CLMS and the Cipotes system and the results obtained from the tracer study*

Considering that two different methodologies applied over the course of different periods and to different populations are being dealt with, it is not possible to establish a comparison between the results of both methodologies.

One would expect however that ILO-IPEC make efforts in the future to homogenize the databases of the baselines with those used by its programmes. This, combined with the introduction of more than one measurement of the laboural and scholastic status of the subjects into the monitoring systems over the course of the life of a project, should allow that the tracer study additionally serve as a medium for the indirect assessment of the reliability of such monitoring systems.

7. *Key issues suggested for inclusion as axes of analysis in a final extended assessment of a TBP*

It is suggested that, within the traditional axes of analysis of a programmatic assessment, a TBP’s assessment include at least the following key assessment issues:

Axis of analysis	Key assessment issue
1. Design validity	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Design logic and coherence. Articulation of the different strategies in the logical

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Axis of analysis	Key assessment issue
	<p>framework.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Concatenation among inputs, activities, products and results. • Pertinence of human resources and funds allocated to the project. • Pertinence of planned implementation time frames. • Integration of the gender perspective into the project's design.
2. Implementation	<p>a. Implementation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Articulation of the subprojects comprising the TBP. • Integration of project activities with key State institutions related to the issue of the WFCL (the Ministries of Labour, Education, Health, Social Development, the justice administration system, etc.). • Operation and quality of the monitoring and evaluation system; periodic articulation of baseline information. • Integration of the gender perspective into project design. • Articulation of the project with the efforts of other international cooperation agencies, the government sector, NGOs and civil society organisations, including employers and trade unions. Rapid consultation systems and access to key actors. • Introduction of legislative modifications and their articulation with the project; pertinence and rationality of such modifications. • Role and operation of the National Steering Committee. • Existence of a National Plan against the WFCL • Good practices derived from project implementation. • Lessons learned. • Externalities <p>b. Pertinence</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Pertinence of the strategies employed regarding the project's socio-cultural and economic context. • Pertinence of the strategies employed regarding the capacity of implementing agencies, government institutions and the beneficiaries themselves. • Pertinence of the selection of implementing agencies and project partners.
3. Results	<p>a. Efficacy</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Specific impact of the project on the worst forms of child labour in the country in the project target areas (tracer study results versus accumulated information from the TBP monitoring system). • Impact of the different strategies used by the project on TBP objective attainment. • Project effect on the capacities for implementation of national bodies (the Ministries of Labour, Education, and others) concerning the issues of child labour and education. • Converting the issue of child labour into a cross-cutting theme at different levels within MINED (curriculum adaptation, teachers' capacities, matriculation census, scholastic retention, improving quality of and access to education) • Appreciation of the effect and pertinence of the strategies of after-school centres, vocational training, accelerated education, and non-formal education alternatives. • Effect of the project on the national organizations' capacities for collecting information and following up the issue of child labour. • Effect of the project on the CLMS's data collection and monitoring capacity. • Effect of the project on the capacity of government institutions for applying the law and persecuting CSE-related crimes. • Results of the KAP and public opinion surveys: Effects of the project on the level of sensitisation of target-populations and the general public to child labour and the WFCL. • Effect of the project on the level of sensitisation of key national institutions and

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Expanded Final Evaluation

Axis of analysis	Key assessment issue
	<p>opinion makers to child labour and the WFCL.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Effect of the project on the individual institution's capacities in the fight against child labour and for articulated networking. • Effect of the project on the income and employability of adults and adolescents from target areas, with particular attention to project sensitivity to beneficiary gender. Effect of the programmes of access to micro-credits. • Pertinence and effectiveness of the models for addressing the CSE implemented by the project, with particular attention to their sensitivity to gender differences.
	<p>b. Efficiency</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Workplan fulfilment • Fulfilment of the project's budgetary implementation • Pertinence of the changes eventually made to the original budget • Fluidity of communication among local and regional offices and IPEC Geneva headquarters. • Fluidity of communication with implementing agencies and government institutions • Pertinence of the criteria for identifying the action programmes. • Pertinence of implementing agency screening criteria. • Opportuneness of the action programme approval process. • Opportuneness of the action programme resource allocation process. • Existence of a project progress information system • Existence of a feedback system at the local, national, sub-regional, and headquarters levels.
4. Sustainability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Effect of the project on the mobilisation of key actors at national level. • Appreciation of project sustainability regarding the transfer of technical capacities, the involvement by institutional and community actors in the fight against the WFCL and the establishment of public policy and financial commitments on the part of decision makers in this field.

8. *Data collection techniques and suggested data sources for the final extended assessment of a TBP.*

In the final extended assessment of a TBP, the use of the following information collection techniques is recommended:

- Literature review
- Semi-structured interviews
- In-depth interviews
- Focal groups
- Overseeing of activities and visits to project sites

It is suggested to use as sources of information for the assessment, the following:

- Project documents: Project documents of the TBP and any other eventual complementary projects to the TBP and the EI, action programmes, financial reports, TBP progress

“Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

reports and action programmes, procedure guides, preventive, promotional and training materials generated by the project, press releases, papers, SPIF systematisations and others.

- Miscellaneous studies, including baseline and KAP studies with regard to child labour and public opinion studies.
- Data bases/information from TBP monitoring systems and action programmes.
- Direct beneficiaries of the project (child and adolescent beneficiaries and their parents).
- Indirect beneficiaries of the project (teachers, community leaders and others)
- Staff members of the implementing agencies of ongoing or completed action programmes.
- Administrative staff of ILO-IPEC in the country (Project Coordinator and key supporting officials).
- Representatives of partner institutions to the project (government counterparts, national and local committees, representatives of the Ministries of Labour, Education and others, action programme implementing institutions, contracts and mini programmes, representatives of labour unions, employers and the media).
- Representatives of institutions that, without being direct partners of the project, develop programmes concerning children and adolescents or related matters.

Annex 9: Assessment Tool Matrices (Project Table & Action Programme Table)

Annex 9.1: Project Table

I. Time-Bound Programme

Project Area of Work	AP in that area if any	Achievements of the project as per I/A report or statements by implementing agency		Achievements as per project management (Comments, additions)	Comments/Observations by evaluation team	Proposed follow up Next steps
		Target Groups	Other Qualitative			
Ia. Problem information and mapping ²⁰						
Ib. Policy and legislation development	Care provided to girls in situation of CSE in the municipality of San Salvador and surrounding areas	The project comprised providing attention to 49 girls aged 12-17 in situation of CSE in the city of San Salvador, including their family group	An important achievement with this action programme has been the formulation of attention protocols or guides used by the implementing institution	Since the CSE is a crime subject to aggravated penalties in the country as per recent penal reforms, the phenomenon has become more clandestine and difficult to identify. The above illustrates some of the difficulties and obstacles faced during programme implementation concerning the implementation of actions of direct attention oriented towards removal and social rehabilitation of child labourers. What is important is that a State entity like ISDEMU will continue to use said protocol of attention for any cases that arise.	The main achievements of the programme in this field were the strengthening of the National Committee Against the WFCL and the promulgation by the government of El Salvador of the National Plan against the WFCL. The advocacy and support to the modification of the penal code and the procedural penal code were the main factors boosting the development of a specific law on the matter.	The implementation of the National Plan against the WFCL, starting by providing it with a budget and annually programmable goals, must be a priority of future actions in this sector. It is necessary to promote the promulgation of the Code on Children and Adolescents as well as a law on integrated protection. It is important to

²⁰ Actions in this area were executed through a Services and Mini Programmes Contract.

“Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Project Area of Work	AP in that area if any	Achievements of the project as per I/A report or statements by implementing agency		Achievements as per project management (Comments, additions)	Comments/Observations by evaluation team	Proposed follow up Next steps
		Target Groups	Other Qualitative			
					Under the preceding perspective, the text included in columns 2 and 5 of this subheading seems out of context.	support the strengthening of the system of attention to children mentioned in the Code on the Family, which has an incipient operation.
	Direct action and removal of children from CSE in the city of San Miguel	Care provided to 32 boys, girls and adolescents in CSE aged 5-17, attaining the removal of 19 adolescent women.	What is relevant in this case is the development of two guides: One dealing with detection and another with attention, important inputs for the ambulatory care phase of the intervention.	The situation of CSE in San Miguel has manifold and for safety reasons the programme focused on providing attention to children found standing outside of bars, strip clubs, and other establishments offering some sort of security, witness accounts attesting to the difficulty of approaching and establishing contact with the victims of this scourge.	Under the preceding perspective, the text included in columns 2 and 5 of this subheading seems out of context and appears to reproduce part of the text of the AP table.	(cont'd) It is necessary to look after the application of the provisions set forth in the National Plan against the WFCL, since previous national plans have addressed the issue of CSE, but their implementation has been very limited.
	Prevention of child CSE in the city of San Salvador.	200 boys, girls and adolescents aged 5-17 from 16 marginal communities of District III of the city of San Salvador.	A guide or protocol was also formulated for the prevention of CSE in vulnerable populations.	The prevention of CSE, which implies working with populations on the critical path towards CSE, consists of making effective the exercise of the human rights of children	Under the preceding perspective, the text included in columns 2 and 5 of this subheading seems out of context and appears to reproduce part of	N/A

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Project Area of Work	AP in that area if any	Achievements of the project as per I/A report or statements by implementing agency		Achievements as per project management (Comments, additions)	Comments/Observations by evaluation team	Proposed follow up Next steps
		Target Groups	Other Qualitative			
				and adolescents. It implies likewise the realisation of a series of protective actions to prevent that minors under age 18 become caught in CSE.	the text of the AP table.	
Ic. Application of the law and monitoring	Eradication of hazardous child labour in the production of sugarcane in the municipalities of Sonsonate, Izalco, Cuisnahuat, Armenia and Nahuizalco Eradication of the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Fishing in the municipalities of Jiquilisco and Puerto El Triunfo Eradication of the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Fishing in the municipalities of Usulután, Jucuarán and San Dionisio	Creation of a little over 35 local child labour monitoring committees.	A successful child labour monitoring pilot was conducted in target population communities, which took into account the levels of organisation attained by the different community organisation processes.	The openness of the communities was highly positive for programme implementation, allowing the building of a child labour monitoring model with the participation of leaders and parents from the communities.	Work has been done to promote community organisation as well as to constitute local monitoring committees in part of the project's areas of influence, which in many cases have participated in monitoring and sensitisation actions aimed at family groups. The communities have been very willing to support the actions of the local monitoring committees. Despite the above remarks, the monitoring system's data collection and processing chain has not built autonomous intermediate and final entities are in place on the monitoring	Work should be done to improve the sustainability of the monitoring systems and community-based actions against child labour, as it has not yet been possible to constitute local monitoring committees in an important number of communities. In certain action programme areas, work with ADESCOS and community leaderships must be reinforced, as work has been either limited or inexistent. The implementation of the interinstitutional

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Project Area of Work	AP in that area if any	Achievements of the project as per I/A report or statements by implementing agency		Achievements as per project management (Comments, additions)	Comments/Observations by evaluation team	Proposed follow up Next steps
		Target Groups	Other Qualitative			
					system's data chain (beyond those implementing institutions providing constant surveillance and technical assistance) for collecting and processing the information and sending it back to the users for timely decision-making.	WFCL monitoring committees must be promoted, which so far has been very limited in its viability (only one departmental committee is operating in Jiquilisco).
	Institutional Strengthening for the prevention, investigation and persecution of child CSE crimes.	The National Civilian Police, its areas and units with competencies in the combat of CSE crimes.	During the implementation of this action programme, the training of a total of 1500 police officers, 284 chiefs and higher-rank officials, 45 multipliers, plus 11 CIVIS (Interinstitutional Committees against violence) was achieved. Likewise, a Manual of Police Procedures for CSE-related crimes was drawn up, and an operating institutional plan is being carried on the basis of it.	The strengthening of the national institutions involved in the sanctioning of CSE crimes has been deemed necessary by virtue of their obligatory competency in these cases. To this end, several strengthening processes are under development regarding materials, the sensitisation and qualification of staff, and the adoption of effective practices in dealing with this type of offence.	This intervention axis has been an important achievement of the TBP. The equipment and training programmes of the staff of the Public Ministry, the National Civilian Police and other institutions has been enhanced in order to fight the scourge of the CSE. By counting with a regional initiative on CSE at Central American level, El Salvador has benefited from the resources, trainings and models it has	It is necessary to strengthen the interinstitutional coordination mechanisms within the PNC, the Attorney General's Office, ISNA and other institutions for addressing this problem and avoid developing ineffectual operations against CSE crimes, as has often been the case so far.

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Project Area of Work	AP in that area if any	Achievements of the project as per I/A report or statements by implementing agency		Achievements as per project management (Comments, additions)	Comments/Observations by evaluation team	Proposed follow up Next steps
		Target Groups	Other Qualitative			
					generated.	
1d. Sensitisation and social mobilisation	<p>Eradication of hazardous child labour in the production of sugarcane in the municipalities of Sonsonate, Izalco, Cuisnahuat, Armenia and Nahuizalco</p> <p>Eradication of the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Fishing in the municipalities of Jiquilisco and Puerto El Triunfo</p> <p>Eradication of the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Fishing in the municipalities of Usulután, Jucuarán and San Dionisio</p> <p>Progressive Elimination of Child Labour in the sugarcane sector in the municipalities of Zacatecoluca, Tecoluca, Verapaz and Guadalupe (San Vicente)</p> <p>Eradication of hazardous child labour in the production of sugarcane in the municipalities of Aguilares, El Paisnal, Nejapa, Guazapa and Suchitoto</p>		<p>The sensitisation and awareness-raising processes concerning the eradication of child labour in the WFCL (sugarcane, fishing, dumpsites and CSE) were effective, above all in the communities and surrounding areas where the action programme was implemented</p>		<p>The project has given significant visibility to the problem of the WFCL in the eyes of the Salvadoran society and of the institutions charged with addressing it. In 2003 and 2006, national campaigns for the prevention of WFCL were developed and disseminated over the radio, written press, outdoor advertising and supporting materials.</p> <p>There is growing positive change regarding the conceptualisation and attitudes about child labour. For instance, between 2003 and 2006, the percentage of persons who considered that it was dangerous to work in the sugarcane harvest went from 58.6% to 74.7% in general, and</p>	<p>It is important that the TBP make greater investments in this field with the implementation of yearly sensitisation campaigns on the mass communication media, including television, a little employed option so far. The gap in the number of people to be sensitised, those who maintain attitudes of indifference or approval towards child labour still remains at 20% of the total population. Likewise, it is advisable to promote the realisation of small opinion</p>

“Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Project Area of Work	AP in that area if any	Achievements of the project as per I/A report or statements by implementing agency		Achievements as per project management (Comments, additions)	Comments/Observations by evaluation team	Proposed follow up Next steps
		Target Groups	Other Qualitative			
	Eradication of child labour in sugarcane in the municipality of Chalchuapa				from 57.9% to 70.5% in the rural area. ²¹	surveys on the attitude of the general public towards child labour and the WFCL, in order to establish the impact of the sensitisation campaigns disseminated through the mass media.
	Prevention of the phenomenon of CSE in the urban area of the city of San Miguel.	Boys, girls and adolescents identified as being on the critical path towards CSE in the city of San Miguel. Relatives of the above. A strengthened network against child CSE.	This action programme only managed to develop one informative campaign promoting the denunciation of the CSE.			
2a. Baseline information ²²	Direct action and removal of children from CSE in the city of San Miguel	Development of the baseline with information on 65 girls and adolescents said information served not only the purpose of characterising the problem of CSE in San Miguel, but also that of defining the target population to be attended to.	This action programme developed at the same time the drawing up of a baseline and the delivery of services to the programme's target population The fact that it was conducted by the same implementing agency allowed having first-hand information to quickly establish the programme intervention strategy, while identifying and		The information appearing in columns 2 to 4 of this subheading appears to be very limited, as it refers only to CSE. In actuality, despite delays in implementation and difficulties in incorporating the information captured during the implementation of the programmes, the TBP produced baselines in	It is advisable that future programmes develop baseline studies concurrently with action programme implementation and, eventually, as an action programme component, so as to avoid subordinating action

²¹ Source: Study on *Changes in Salvadoran Public Opinion regarding child labour and education 2003-2006*, ILO-IPEC, Nov. 2006.

²² Actions in this area were executed through a Services Contract, except for the baselines for the programme of removal of children from CSE in San Miguel and CSE prevention in San Salvador, which were part of the Action Programme.

“Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Project Area of Work	AP in that area if any	Achievements of the project as per I/A report or statements by implementing agency		Achievements as per project management (Comments, additions)	Comments/Observations by evaluation team	Proposed follow up Next steps
		Target Groups	Other Qualitative			
			tracking down 65 girls and adolescents in the city of San Miguel, specifically in parks, streets and several brothels.		the four target-sectors as per the objective set. Additionally, DIGESTYC's institutional capacity for the periodic collection of reliable information on child and adolescent labour was strengthened, with relevant items included on the National Households Survey making it sensitive to the particular needs of child labourers aged 5 and older. In like manner, the capacities of the Directorate of Evaluation of the Ministry of Education were strengthened through technical assistance for the design of useful variables to be included in the matriculation census to facilitate collecting child labour data.	programme implementation to baseline completion, as well as disparities between project caseload and baseline data. However, action programmes should be executed on the basis of foreseeable, non-movable geographical frameworks (i.e., fixed districts and communities).
	Prevention of children CSE in the city of San	A baseline was drawn up identifying children	This Action programme developed,		Information from this baseline, whose	It is important to be able to identify

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Project Area of Work	AP in that area if any	Achievements of the project as per I/A report or statements by implementing agency		Achievements as per project management (Comments, additions)	Comments/Observations by evaluation team	Proposed follow up Next steps
		Target Groups	Other Qualitative			
	Salvador.	and adolescents engaged in some type of child labour (mainly peddling products) in order to prevent them on the risks of the CSE.	concurrently with the implementation of strategic actions, the drawing up of the population baseline with which the APSO will be developed. Initially, there was information on 125 children and adolescents, and later was added information on 75 more, totalling 200 registered children and adolescents		developers opted for concealing the names of the people on it, did not allow for the subsequent follow up of beneficiaries by a tracer study.	by name those people included on the baselines, even if it calls for discretion, in order to be able subsequently follow up on the programme's impact on these people.
2b. Education and vocational training	<p>Eradication of hazardous child labour in the production of sugarcane in the municipalities of Sonsonate, Izalco, Cuisnahuat, Armenia and Nahuizalco</p> <p>Eradication of the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Fishing in the municipalities of Jiquilisco and Puerto El Triunfo</p> <p>Eradication of the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Fishing in the municipalities of Usulután, Jucuarán and San Dionisio</p> <p>Progressive Elimination of Child Labour in the</p>	Removal of 9964 children from child labour in sugarcane, fishing, garbage dumps and CSE, and prevention of child labour in 26,175 more.	. Work with the schools, where after-school centres were implemented, was strengthened The after-school centres contributed to the insertion of children into formal education, reducing absenteeism and desertion, improving learning, reducing grade repetition, and guaranteeing student retention by the school system. Moreover, teachers were trained and the schools for	Results achieved regarding planned goals were satisfactory not only as regards sole removal and prevention but also as regards the provision of schooling to child labourers and children at risk of entering child labour. Education was supported with after-school centres, which were assisted with technological support to facilitate the use of ludic education tools.	Going forward, it will be convenient to take as a reference the results of the programmes as per the tracer study, wherever these results may be valid. The TBP and the EI have had an impact on the sensitisation and training of MINED's technical and managerial staff, the inclusion of the issue of the worst forms of child labour into the annual matriculation census, the inclusion	MINED's "We Are All Equal" programme should be strengthened in order to develop an efficient installed capacity for addressing the issue of the WFCL within MINED. ILO-IPEC should support MINED in extending the education intervention model implemented

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Project Area of Work	AP in that area if any	Achievements of the project as per I/A report or statements by implementing agency		Achievements as per project management (Comments, additions)	Comments/Observations by evaluation team	Proposed follow up Next steps
		Target Groups	Other Qualitative			
	<p>sugarcane sector in the municipalities of Zacatecoluca, Tecoluca, Verapaz and Guadalupe (San Vicente)</p> <p>Eradication of hazardous child labour in the production of sugarcane in the municipalities of Aguilares, El Paisnal, Nejapa, Guazapa and Suchitoto</p> <p>Eradication of child labour in sugarcane in the municipality of Chalchuapa</p> <p>Eradication of hazardous child labour in the slash of sugarcane in La Carrera Cooperative</p> <p>Progressive elimination of child labour from garbage dumps in the municipality of Tecoluca (San Vicente)</p> <p>Progressive elimination of child labour from garbage dumps in the Municipality of San Luis Talpa (La Paz)</p>		<p>parents were strengthened.</p> <p>Another relevant aspect was the delivery of school supplies to the schools where the strategy was implemented.</p>		<p>of innovative educational methodologies, the recognition of the issue of the worst forms of child labour as a cross-cutting theme within MINED's scope of action, as well as on the technical assistance provided for the elaboration of teacher's education modules and other contributions.</p> <p>However, even though the national capacities for replicating and maintaining education initiatives have been enhanced, the effectiveness of the latter for independently reducing the worst forms of child labour will be seen only after MINED fulfils its commitment of undertaking the continuation of the after-school centres. The after-school centres increased the</p>	<p>during the first phase of the TBP to other areas and communities where and important presence of WFCL is detected.</p> <p>ILO-IPEC should support MINED in its efforts to expand education coverage in rural and peri-urban areas, particularly as regards an increase in the coverage of basic (grades 7 through 9) and high school education, as well as of distance education.</p> <p>It is very important to ensure the continuity of the delivery of school supplies for the 2007 school year in those communities at greater risk, in</p>

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Project Area of Work	AP in that area if any	Achievements of the project as per I/A report or statements by implementing agency		Achievements as per project management (Comments, additions)	Comments/Observations by evaluation team	Proposed follow up Next steps
		Target Groups	Other Qualitative			
					<p>quality of the services offered by the schools, making them more attractive and relevant to children and adolescents engaged in the WFCL.</p> <p>Likewise, in order to facilitate children and adolescents engaged in the worst forms of child labour access to school, successful arrangements were made to reduce and/or eliminate school entrance fees and to exempt programme beneficiaries from wearing uniforms to school.</p> <p>Likewise, the provision of school supplies to children and adolescents has contributed to incrementing school access.</p>	<p>order to avoid generating an adverse reaction affecting the sustainability of attained achievements, utilising funds of the Education Initiative ending in March 2007 or of the new project/phase just beginning</p>
2.c Health and social protection	Eradication of the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Fishing in the municipalities of Jiquilisco and Puerto El Triunfo Eradication of the Worst		It was achieved to improve the health conditions of the target population through the effective and efficient coordination with the	Trainings in occupational safety were developed benefiting 550 adolescents	Itinerant health teams, and in other cases the SIBASIs, developed actions of promotion and provision of general health care not	Concerning the operators of rehabilitation systems and those in charge of persecuting this

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Project Area of Work	AP in that area if any	Achievements of the project as per I/A report or statements by implementing agency		Achievements as per project management (Comments, additions)	Comments/Observations by evaluation team	Proposed follow up Next steps
		Target Groups	Other Qualitative			
	<p>Forms of Child Labour: Fishing in the municipalities of Usulután, Jucuarán and San Dionisio</p> <p>Progressive Elimination of Child Labour in the sugarcane sector in the municipalities of Zacatecoluca, Tecoluca, Verapaz and Guadalupe (San Vicente)</p>		SIBASIs. In addition, nutritional meals were distributed to children at the after-school centres.		<p>necessarily related to laboural risks among the target population. Despite ILO and MINTRAB's knowledge and capacity to generate actions for the dissemination of occupational health and safety information adapted to the particular needs of the target population, this activity was developed in an irregular, limited and untimely manner, also disregarding gender concerns. The number of child and adolescent labourers who have received occupational safety training in 2006 and employ means to protect themselves from labour hazards was small compared with the total target population. The local institutions' response to the rehabilitation of victims of CSE has been inconsistent.</p>	<p>crime, it is necessary to consolidate the interinstitutional coordination mechanisms and establish and socialise clear intervention protocols and flowcharts among those institutions charged with combating the CSE. Likewise, it is necessary that rehabilitation centres possess specialised personnel and optimal conditions to perform their intended function, something that is missing from El Salvador. In general, it is necessary that programmes of rehabilitation of CSE victims make use of longer</p>

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Project Area of Work	AP in that area if any	Achievements of the project as per I/A report or statements by implementing agency		Achievements as per project management (Comments, additions)	Comments/Observations by evaluation team	Proposed follow up Next steps
		Target Groups	Other Qualitative			
					Although institutions like ISDEMU have shown an interest in generating alternative systems of protection to victims, ISNA, the guiding institution in the field of childcare in El Salvador, lacks the institutional capacities for implementing successful projects in this field, which is reflected by the limited performance of projects implemented by this institution in San Salvador and San Miguel.	implementation times than those provided for in the first phase of the TBP.
2d. Income generation alternatives ²³	Direct action and removal of children from CSE in the city of San Miguel	Care provided to 32 boys, girls and adolescents in CSE aged 5-17, achieving the removal of 19 adolescent women.	Some of the girls victims of CSE received courses in vocational training, entrepreneurship and business administration, as well as seed capital for starting a business (beauty salons, piñata workshops)	Here it is important to point out, in the case of child labourers in fishing, sugarcane and garbage dumps, ²⁴ that in the different areas of intervention of the programme, community initiatives on vocational training and self-employment (piñata	This component favoured as beneficiaries young and adult mothers, which in principle constitutes an important decision. In a few cases, the occupational skill trainings were developed in an	The limited success of this component constitutes a factor that could affect the sustainability of project achievements in other areas if the poverty

²³ Actions in this area were executed through a Services and Mini Programmes Contract, except for the programme of direct attention and removal of children from CSE in San Miguel.

²⁴ The actions of the productive component were executed mainly through Services and Mini Programmes Contract.

“Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Project Area of Work	AP in that area if any	Achievements of the project as per I/A report or statements by implementing agency		Achievements as per project management (Comments, additions)	Comments/Observations by evaluation team	Proposed follow up Next steps
		Target Groups	Other Qualitative			
				making, rope weaving, tin embossing, coconut preserve making, cooking, etc.) were promoted through mini programmes oriented at generating productive skills and capacities in the child and adolescent labourers as well as in their parents.	adequate and relevant way and adapted to the beneficiaries' special needs and requirements. However, in general terms, it could be ascertained that the TPB programmatic offering in this area was, in practice, disarticulated and insufficient. In general, there were serious deficiencies as regards variances in the quality and duration of this component, as much as in the distribution of productive inputs to participants. There was incoordination and inadequate communication and collaboration between implementing entities of the productive component and entities entrusted with the implementation of other components in each area. Most people trained were not able to start a	conditions of the families of children engaged in the WFCL in El Salvador persist. It is necessary to improve substantially the project implementation model and scheme in this area. All professional training activities should include a component for the provision of inputs for starting a business, as well as technical follow-up and support in order to improve a business' chances of interworking successfully with the market. Going forward training services in this area should be an integral part of the main projects they serve. It is

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Project Area of Work	AP in that area if any	Achievements of the project as per I/A report or statements by implementing agency		Achievements as per project management (Comments, additions)	Comments/Observations by evaluation team	Proposed follow up Next steps
		Target Groups	Other Qualitative			
					business of their own.	the implementing institutions that should acquire these services from third party institutions.
2e. Community mobilisation	<p>Eradication of hazardous child labour in the production of sugarcane in the municipalities of Sonsonate, Izalco, Cuisnahuat, Armenia and Nahuizalco</p> <p>Eradication of the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Fishing in the municipalities of Jiquilisco and Puerto El Triunfo</p> <p>Eradication of the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Fishing in the municipalities of Usulután, Jucuarán and San Dionisio</p> <p>Progressive Elimination of Child Labour in the sugarcane sector in the municipalities of Zacatecoluca, Tecoluca, Verapaz and Guadalupe (San Vicente)</p> <p>Eradication of hazardous child labour in the production of sugarcane in the municipalities of</p>		It was achieved to promote community organisation in the target communities.	The implementation of these action programmes allowed for greater awareness and community mobilisation against child labour. It is noteworthy that the level of social organisation attained at community level has allowed for the joining together of efforts by key local actors, state institutions and civil society in the area.	In relation to increasing awareness among local authorities, labourers, employers, community organisations and families living in the target communities about the harmful effects of child labour, the programme has made the problem of child labour, its risks and consequences clearly visible in the communities where it has worked, promoting greater awareness and attitudinal change among the population. Leaders and parents of beneficiary communities participated actively in actions against child labour. Likewise, ample awareness and commitment were	It is important to take inventory of the elements making up the teaching community and establish agile, simple, high-impact strategies to develop effective sensitisation processes with each of them.

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Project Area of Work	AP in that area if any	Achievements of the project as per I/A report or statements by implementing agency		Achievements as per project management (Comments, additions)	Comments/Observations by evaluation team	Proposed follow up Next steps
		Target Groups	Other Qualitative			
	<p>Aguilares, El Paisnal, Nejapa, Guazapa and Suchitoto</p> <p>Eradication of child labour in sugarcane in the municipality of Chalchuapa</p> <p>Eradication of hazardous child labour in the slash of sugarcane in La Carrera Cooperative</p> <p>Progressive elimination of child labour from garbage dumps in the municipality of Tecoluca (San Vicente)</p> <p>Progressive elimination of child labour from garbage dumps in the Municipality of San Luis Talpa (La Paz)</p>				<p>developed regarding the need to prioritise those activities geared toward children's education.</p>	

II. Education Initiative Programme

Project Area of Work	AP in that area if any	Achievements of the project as per I/A report or statements by implementing agency		Achievements as per project management (Comments, additions)	Comments/Observations by evaluation team	Proposed follow up Next steps
		Target Groups	Other Qualitative			
1.a Key actors mobilised at national level to ensure that education alternatives are provided to children in or at risk of entering the WFCL. ²⁵						
1.b The issue of child labour becomes a cross-cutting theme in MINED's work. ²⁶						
1.c The issue of child labour is included into the teacher training programmes. ²⁷						
2.a The relevance and quality of the education available in the target-regions is improved. ²⁸						
2.b. Access to education is facilitated to beneficiary children. ²⁹						

²⁵ Ditto as 1a and 1d of the Time-Bound Programme.

²⁶ Ditto as 2b of the Time-Bound Programme, specifically with regards to the after-school centres. Other actions have been carried out through workshops.

²⁷ Actions in this area were executed through a Services and Mini Programmes Contract.

²⁸ Actions in this area were executed through a Service Contract (PEI) and Colext. Other actions same as 2b of the Time-Bound Programme.

²⁹ Ditto as 2b of the Time-Bound Programme.

“Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Annex 9.2: Action Programme Table

Action Programme	Achievements as per IA report or statements made by IA		Achievements as per project management (Comments, additions)	Comments/ observations by evaluation team	Proposed follow-up Next steps
	Target Groups	Other Qualitative			
Progressive elimination of high-risk child labour in the extraction of shellfish on Espiritu Santo Island in the municipality of Puerto El Triunfo	Total: 146 children and adolescents distributed as follows: 62 boys, 56 girls aged 7-10 years. 13 adolescent boys and 15 adolescent women aged 16-18 years.	A contribution was made towards improving the quality of life of these children as regards their age, nutrition, schooling and school attainment. Strengthening of the families of the child beneficiaries through human, entrepreneurial and professional training opportunities.	The present action programme was one of the ones implemented. It allowed gaining experience and learning on the field. Attained achievements were satisfactory. It was demonstrated in practice that it was possible to remove boys and girls from hazardous child labour.	Even though this programme was not evaluated directly, programme achievements were evident on the date of the evaluation. Through a focus group held with entrepreneuring youths who participated in this programme and another programme conducted by AEJ, it was ascertained that they were about to implement a point of sale for their production (picture frames and other crafts decorated with seashells) in Puerto El Triunfo.	The youths still need to be oriented in relation to the format/size of the products they can sell to tourists (some are rather large).
Eradication of the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Fishing in the municipalities of Usulután, Jucuarán and San Dionisio	Removal of 1,910 boys and girls from child labour in the fishing sector and prevention in 2,865 others.	The schooling of 100% of those children withdrawn and/or prevented from child labour was achieved. The sensitisation and awareness-raising processes concerning the eradication of child labour from fishing were effective in the communities and surrounding areas where the action programme was implemented. The programmed achieved to	Results achieved regarding planned goals were satisfactory not only as regards removal but also concerning support to the schooling of child labourers and children at-risk. The openness of the communities was highly positive from the start of this programme's implementation. Education was supported through the establishment of	The programme had a great impact on the community. It mobilised the awareness of children and adults about the problem of the worst forms of child labour and particularly that of child labour in fishing. The results of the removal of children from fishing activities were important and encouraging.	Insofar as the second phase of the TBP will not continue to pursue actions in said area, it is important to ensure that children are provided with the school supplies they used to receive from the project during at least the duration of the school year 2007. It is essential to

“Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Action Programme	Achievements as per I/A report or statements made by I/A		Achievements as per project management (Comments, additions)	Comments/ observations by evaluation team	Proposed follow-up Next steps
	Target Groups	Other Qualitative			
		benefit teachers, community leaders, volunteer youths and the families of the child labourers.	after-school centres assisted with technological support to facilitate the use of ludic education tools.		reinforce the role of the local monitoring committees, by designating school principals as the driving force behind them, and promoting the actions of the interinstitutional committees.
Eradication of the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Fishing in the municipalities of Jiquilisco and Puerto El Triunfo	The action programme achieved the removal of 1,542 boys and girls from different activities in fishing. It also developed prevention processes to prevent that more than 2,790 children started labouring in this sector. More than 500 families were benefited with the development of occupational training activities, literacy programmes and health campaigns.	The schooling of 100% of school-age child labourers and children prevented from entering child labour was achieved. The sensitisation and awareness-raising processes concerning the eradication of child labour in the fishing sector were effective, favourably influencing the communities and surrounding areas where the action programme was implemented. The programme achieved to benefit teachers, community leaders, volunteer youths and the families of the child labourers. The schools as a whole were strengthened, particularly through the after-school centre component, which contributed determinedly to inserting children in school,	The implementation of this action programme allowed for greater community awareness and mobilisation against child labour. It is noteworthy that social organisation efforts at community level took advantage of the capacities installed by FUSAL in the area allowing for the joining together of efforts by key local actors, state institutions and civil society in the area. Results achieved regarding planned goals were satisfactory not only as regards sole removal and prevention but also as regards the provision of schooling to child labourers and children at risk of entering child labour. The openness of the school centres to carry out joint efforts with parents, implementing agencies, civil	The programme had a great impact on the community. It mobilised the awareness of children and adults about the problem of the worst forms of child labour and particularly that of child labour in fishing. The results of the removal of children from fishing activities were important and encouraging. The monitoring committees operated in a limited way. It is essential to reinforce the role of the local monitoring committees, by designating school principals as the driving force behind them, and promoting the actions of the interinstitutional committees. The impact of the productive activities was limited; it is necessary to reformulate the way	Insofar as the second phase of the TBP will not continue to pursue actions in said area, it is important to ensure that children are provided with the school supplies they used to receive from the project during at least the duration of the school year 2007. With a view to implementing new similar projects, it is necessary to improve the after-school centre attendance records and help the schools and committees to develop actions anticipating school desertion.

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Action Programme	Achievements as per I/A report or statements made by I/A		Achievements as per project management (Comments, additions)	Comments/ observations by evaluation team	Proposed follow-up Next steps
	Target Groups	Other Qualitative			
		reducing absenteeism, preventing and reducing desertion, improving academic achievement, reducing grade repetition and ensuring retention.	society and state organisations was noteworthy. A successful child labour monitoring pilot was conducted in target population communities? that took into account the levels of organisation achieved by the different community organisation processes, some of them dating back 10 years. Concerning the productive component, more than 30 families received seed capital for starting micro businesses.	productive projects are implemented in the communities, in order to attain greater sustainability of the businesses undertaken.	
Eradication of hazardous child labour in fishing at the San Marcelino School Centre. ³⁰	Through the programme, 130 students of this centre were withdrawn from labour, and 300 more were prevented from entering labour.	It was achieved that students of the centre stopped working, attended the after-school centre regularly, and improved their academic achievement.	It was one of the few action programmes developed directly with a school centre, a successful strategy as regards results. Likewise, the school principal served as multiplier of the experience in the area sensitising his colleagues to the consequences of child labour on education. It is worth citing as a valuable experience that the high-school students acted as facilitators of the literacy training process by teaching illiterate child labourers to read and write.	No comments; this experience was not visited during the assessment.	No recommendations

³⁰ Mini programme.

“Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Action Programme	Achievements as per I/A report or statements made by I/A		Achievements as per project management (Comments, additions)	Comments/ observations by evaluation team	Proposed follow-up Next steps
	Target Groups	Other Qualitative			
Eradication of hazardous child labour in the production of sugarcane in the municipalities of Sonsonate, Izalco, Cuisnahuat, Armenia and Nahuizalco	The action programme achieved the removal of 1,858 child labourers and prevention in 2,787 more.	The schooling and/or attendance to vocational training of 100% of the working or at-risk child population were achieved. The sensitisation and awareness-raising processes concerning the eradication of child labour were effective in the communities where the action programme was implemented. The programmed achieved to benefit teachers, community leaders, volunteer youths and the families of the child labourers.	Results achieved regarding planned goals were satisfactory not only as regards removal but also concerning support to the schooling of child labourers and children at-risk. The openness of the communities was highly positive for programme implementation, allowing the building of a child labour monitoring model with the participation of leaders and parents from the communities. Likewise, effective communication was achieved with departmental-level authorities, which will allow for the child labour follow-up model to be further developed. A child labour monitoring system was piloted in the target-population areas, which operated with important degree of success. Concerning the productive component, more than 30 families received seed capital for starting micro businesses.	No comments; this experience was not visited during the assessment.	No recommendations
Progressive Elimination of Child Labour in the sugarcane sector in the municipalities of	2073 child labourers and 3117 children at risk benefited directly from the action programme implemented by OEF in sugarcane production.	The schooling of 100% of school-age child labourers was achieved. The sensitisation and awareness-raising processes concerning	Results achieved regarding planned goals were satisfactory not only as regards removal but also concerning support to the	The programme had a very important impact on the community, generating awareness among children, parents, teachers, authorities	Insofar as the second phase of the TBP will not continue to pursue actions in said area, it is important to ensure

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Action Programme	Achievements as per I/A report or statements made by I/A		Achievements as per project management (Comments, additions)	Comments/ observations by evaluation team	Proposed follow-up Next steps
	Target Groups	Other Qualitative			
Zacatecoluca, Tecoluca, Verapaz and Guadalupe (San Vicente)	It should be noted that their families also benefited from the programme.	the eradication of child labour were effective in the communities where the action programme was implemented. The programmed achieved to benefit teachers, community leaders, volunteer youths and the families of the child labourers.	schooling of child labourers and children at-risk. The openness of the communities was highly positive from the very start of the programme implementation, beginning by the commitment shown by the school principals. The effective involvement by the rural police was achieved in the area in support of the sensitisation and monitoring processes. A good team of local leaders was always willing to assist in the monitoring of child labour and in the efforts to promote the removal of children from hazardous labour in sugar cane production. Several area schools stood out with regard to the results obtained by students in grades 1 through 3 on the national scholastic attainment test.	and sugar-industry representatives about the need to eradicate child labour in the sugarcane production sector. The programme's original caseload (as per the baseline) was substituted for the most part for beneficiaries from communities other than those originally considered. The involvement the by school principals in the sensitisation and monitoring processes was very positive as regards results on the eradication of child labour from this sector. OEF (the implementing entity) did not adequately promote the actions of the interinstitutional monitoring entities.	that children are provided with the school supplies they used to receive from the project during at least the duration of the school year 2007. It is essential to reinforce the role of the local monitoring committees, by designating school principals as the driving force behind them, and promoting the actions of the interinstitutional committees.
Eradication of hazardous child labour in the production of sugarcane in the municipalities of Aguilares, El Paisnal, Nejapa, Guazapa and Suchitoto	2,036 child labourers in sugar cane production who were removed from child labour were the direct beneficiaries of this action programme. Likewise, a population of 3,000 children at risk of entering child labour also benefited from this action programme.	The sensitisation and awareness-raising processes concerning the eradication of child labour from sugarcane production were effective, above all, in the communities and surrounding areas where the action programme was implemented. The	The implementation of this action programme allowed for greater community awareness and mobilisation against child labour in sugarcane. It is noteworthy that the level of social organisation attained in the communities has allowed for the joining together of efforts by key local actors,	The programme had a very important impact on the community, generated awareness among children, parents, teachers, authorities and sugar-industry representatives about the need to eradicate child labour in the sugarcane production sector.	Insofar as the second phase of the TBP will not continue to pursue actions in said area, it is important to ensure that children are provided with the school supplies they used to receive from the project during at

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Action Programme	Achievements as per I/A report or statements made by I/A		Achievements as per project management (Comments, additions)	Comments/ observations by evaluation team	Proposed follow-up Next steps
	Target Groups	Other Qualitative			
		<p>programme achieved to benefit teachers, community leaders, volunteer youths and the families of the child labourers. Likewise, adolescents and adults were benefited through vocational training programmes.</p>	<p>state institutions and civil society in the area. Results achieved regarding planned goals were satisfactory not only as regards sole removal and prevention but also as regards the provision of schooling to child labourers and children at risk of entering child labour. The openness of the school centres to carry out joint efforts with parents, implementing agencies, civil society and state organisations was noteworthy. The sustained involvement was achieved of area sugar mills, which provided financing for activities in favour of the schooling of child labourers, providing an important boost to the process of sensitisation against the engagement of children in sugarcane production.</p>	<p>Close coordination by the implementing agency (FUNDAZUCAR) with other sugar industry representatives, allowed establishment by the trade unions of standards in favour of the implementation of control systems on the supply of child labour (through school-, family- and community-based initiatives) and the demand for it (by promoting the non-hiring of minors in sugarcane production activities).</p>	<p>least the duration of the school year 2007.</p>
<p>Eradication of child labour in sugarcane in the municipality of Chalchuapa</p>	<p>The removal of 169 children from sugar cane production was achieved as well as prevention in 400 children, all of whom were assisted in their schooling process through non-formal education activities.</p>	<p>The schooling of 100% of school-age child labourers and children prevented from entering child labour was achieved. The sensitisation and awareness-raising processes concerning the eradication of child labour from this sector were effective, and</p>	<p>The implementation of this action programme allowed for greater community awareness and mobilisation against child labour in sugarcane. It is noteworthy that the level of social organisation attained by the communities has allowed for the joining together of efforts by key local actors,</p>	<p>No comments; this experience was not visited during the assessment.</p>	<p>No recommendations</p>

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Action Programme	Achievements as per I/A report or statements made by I/A		Achievements as per project management (Comments, additions)	Comments/ observations by evaluation team	Proposed follow-up Next steps
	Target Groups	Other Qualitative			
		the involvement by institutional and community actors in favour of the actions promoted by the programme was achieved.	state institutions and civil society in the area. Results achieved regarding planned goals were satisfactory not only as regards sole removal and prevention but also as regards the provision of schooling to child labourers and children at risk of entering child labour. The openness of the school centres to carry out joint efforts with parents, implementing agencies, civil society and state organisations was noteworthy.		
Eradication of hazardous child labour in the slash of sugarcane in La Carrera Cooperative	70 children engaged in the slash of sugarcane were withdrawn from this WFCL. A like number was prevented from engaging in this type of hazardous labour.	Sensitisation activities were carried out within the cooperative, which in the end played an important role in the removal of children from hazardous labour in the slash of sugarcane.	The experience turned out to be successful to the extent that there was a determined involvement by community-based organisations and cooperative authorities. Likewise, are schools were actively involved in actions against child labour. Over the course of the action programme it was possible to really appreciate the magnitude of the problem's incidence on the surrounding areas, which gave rise to the planning of an upcoming intervention in this sector.	No comments; this experience was not visited during the assessment.	No recommendations
Progressive elimination of child labour from garbage	The action programme achieved the removal of 68 child scavengers from garbage	The schooling of 100% of those children withdrawn and prevented from child	Child labour in garbage dumps directly impacts family income on a daily basis,	The programme had a very important impact on the community, generating	Insofar as the second phase of the TBP will not continue to pursue

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Action Programme	Achievements as per I/A report or statements made by I/A		Achievements as per project management (Comments, additions)	Comments/ observations by evaluation team	Proposed follow-up Next steps
	Target Groups	Other Qualitative			
dumps in the municipality of Tecoluca (San Vicente)	dumps, as well as prevented 100 at-risk children from becoming engaged in this WFCL.	labour was achieved, and work with the schools, where after-school centres were implemented, was strengthened The after-school centres contributed to the insertion of children into formal education, reducing absenteeism and desertion, improving learning, reducing grade repetition, and guaranteeing student retention by the school system. Moreover, teachers were trained and the schools for parents were strengthened.	making its eradication more difficult. However, it is encouraging to see that expected objectives were fulfilled and that an important process of communal and social organisation and mobilisation against child labour in general, and particularly against child labour in garbage dumps, was achieved.	awareness among children, parents and teachers about the need to eliminate child labour in garbage dumps. An important level of commitment by the school was observed in this process of eradication.	actions in said area, it is important to ensure that children are provided with the school supplies they used to receive from the project at least during the school year 2007. It is essential to reinforce the role of the local monitoring committees, by designating school principals as the driving force behind them, and promoting the actions of the interinstitutional committees.
Progressive elimination of child labour from garbage dumps in the Municipality of San Luis Talpa (La Paz)	The action programme achieved the removal of 90 child labourers from garbage dumps, as well as prevented 135 at-risk children from becoming engaged in this WFCL.	The schooling of the total population of child labourers and/or at-risk children was achieved. Likewise, work with the school centres was strengthened through the establishment of an after-school centre. The after-school centre contributed to the insertion of children into formal education, reducing absenteeism and desertion, improving learning,	It is encouraging to see that an important process of communal and social organisation and mobilisation against child labour in general, and particularly against child labour in garbage dumps, was achieved	The programme was well received by teachers, parents, and children in the community.	Insofar as the second phase of the TBP will not continue to pursue actions in said area, it is important to ensure that children are provided with the school supplies they used to receive from the project at least during the school year 2007.

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Action Programme	Achievements as per I/A report or statements made by I/A		Achievements as per project management (Comments, additions)	Comments/ observations by evaluation team	Proposed follow-up Next steps
	Target Groups	Other Qualitative			
		reducing grade repetition, and guaranteeing student retention by the school system. Moreover, teachers were trained and the schools for parents were strengthened.			
Eradication of child labour from La Barranca Honda dumpsite in the municipality of Chalchuapa.	The action programme achieved the removal of 40 child labourers from the municipal dumpsite as well as preventive 15 at-risk children from becoming engaged in this worst form of child labour.	The totality of withdrawn children was schooled, and three area schools were strengthened and now carry out actions against child labour. In addition, sensitisation activities were conducted with parents and an interinstitutional network against child labour was also consolidated. Unfortunately, a real involvement by municipal activities in seeking a solution for this problem was not achieved.	It is highly encouraging that planned results had been achieved, since this was a smaller action programme implemented in an area in which no previous work had been done. It is noteworthy that an important communal and social organisation and mobilisation process against child labour in general, and against child labour in dumpsites in particular, was achieved, which to a large extent substituted the role that should have been played by the local authorities. The involvement and commitment by the implementing agency was noteworthy.	No comments; this experience was not visited during the assessment.	No recommendations
Attention to girls in situation of CSE in the municipality of San Salvador and surrounding areas	The project comprised providing attention to 49 girls aged 12-17 in situation of CSE in the city of San Salvador, including their family group.	The action programme allowed knowing the reality and concrete conditions in which CSE occurs, presenting difficulties at each stage of the programme. From the	Since CSE is a crime subject to aggravated penalties in the country as per recent penal reforms, the phenomenon has become more clandestine and difficult to identify. At the core of the problem underlie	The evaluation team is of the opinion that the main factor undermining the success of this project was the institutional weakness and the lack of capacity of the implementing agency,	With a view to implementing new projects in this sector, ILO-IPEC should previously develop institutional assessment and

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Action Programme	Achievements as per I/A report or statements made by I/A		Achievements as per project management (Comments, additions)	Comments/ observations by evaluation team	Proposed follow-up Next steps
	Target Groups	Other Qualitative			
		moment a case is detected, handled, processed and attended to, immense difficulties are revealed which hinder the combat of the phenomenon. Lessons learned from this action programme allow having a parameter of the costs implied in adequately approaching the issue, and of the multiple difficulties encountered in dealing with it, particularly as regards the removal of children from commercial sexual exploitation. An important achievement with this action programme has been the formulation of attention protocols or guides used by the implementing institution	interest groups serving as intermediaries or procurers (many of which are linked to Mafia networks and organised crime) and the families of exploited children living in dire conditions of poverty. The above illustrates some of the difficulties and obstacles faced during programme implementation concerning the implementation of actions of direct attention oriented towards removal and social rehabilitation of CSE victims.	ISNA.	strengthening processes of the implementing agencies. The engaging of entities experienced in the development of residential systems for providing care to women victims of violent (like ISDEMU), could be a provisional alternative in the implementation of programmes against child CSE. It is important to introduce a gender-based approach into these projects: care for male victims of this scourge is inexistent.
Direct action and removal of children from CSE in the city of San Miguel	Care provided to 32 boys, girls and adolescents in CSE aged 5-17, attaining the removal of 19 adolescent women.	The action programme allowed drawing up a baseline identifying 65 victims, 19 of which (all girls) were withdrawn through an ambulatory care programme, and establishing a service platform with services provided by different public entities according to their particular competencies. In	The situation of CSE in San Miguel has manifold and for safety reasons the programme focused on providing attention to children found standing outside of bars, strip clubs, and other establishments offering some sort of security, witness accounts attesting to the difficulty of approaching and establishing contact with the victims of this scourge.	The project target comprised 72 girls and adolescent women (no male subjects were included), 22 of whom by the end of the project maintained some kind of contact with the institution, and it could be stated that at least 19 had been rescued from CSE. PADECOMSM, the implementing agency, has	Together with providing gender-indifferent care, future interventions in this area should also concentrate on the drug rehabilitation of CSE victims. Drug abuse dangerously shackles the opportunities of CSE victims to escape this

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Action Programme	Achievements as per I/A report or statements made by I/A		Achievements as per project management (Comments, additions)	Comments/ observations by evaluation team	Proposed follow-up Next steps
	Target Groups	Other Qualitative			
		addition, it was achieved to involve the family in the recuperation process, strengthening family ties and fostering the exercise of the human rights of children from within the confines of the home. Likewise, two guides were developed: One dealing with detection and another with attention, important inputs for the ambulatory care phase of the intervention. Some of them received seed capital for starting a business (beauty salons)	Moreover, it was possible to establish that the problem is linked to other crimes like drug dealing, domestic violence, and active participation in gangs.	developed a valid (and hospitable) model of intervention, even though it neglects the masculine population. The fact that the work team was constituted exclusively by women positively influenced the team's capacity of gaining access to "difficult" places.	scourge.
Prevention of the phenomenon of CSE in the urban area of the city of San Miguel.	Boys, girls and adolescents aged 5-17 years identified as being on the critical path towards CSE in the city of San Miguel. Relatives of the above. Targeted communities aware of the phenomenon. A strengthened network against child CSE.	This action programme only managed to develop one informative campaign promoting the denunciation of the CSE. Because of internal situations within the implementing agency, the action programme was not executed in its totality. Coordination was established among different institutions of the city of San Miguel, which increased their knowledge on the subject.	The prevention of CSE, which implies working with populations on the critical path towards CSE, consists of making effective the exercise of the human rights of children and adolescents. It implies likewise the realisation of a series of protective actions to prevent that minors under age 18 become caught in CSE.	The project had scarce impact and relevance. ISNA's institutional limitations caused that a large amount of the allocated budget was not implemented and had to be re-allocated to other uses.	Although ISNA is legally the guiding organism on children matters, it would be advisable to evaluate alternative channels for the implementation of this type of projects, while ISNA is involved in a process of institutional strengthening and learning.
Prevention of children CSE in the city of San Salvador.	200 boys, girls and adolescents aged 5-17 from 16 marginal communities of	Between 2005 and 2006 it was achieved that 95% of children were schooled. Of	The prevention of CSE, which implies working with populations on the critical path	Working with children from at-risk communities does not necessary have an	To better focus actions on this sector, it is necessary to build

"Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour" and "Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador's Time Bound Programme" (Education Initiative)

Action Programme	Achievements as per I/A report or statements made by I/A		Achievements as per project management (Comments, additions)	Comments/ observations by evaluation team	Proposed follow-up Next steps
	Target Groups	Other Qualitative			
	District III of the city of San Salvador.	these, 7% did not pass their grade in school, and the remaining 5% did not attend school but were enrolled in vocational training workshops. Likewise, the programme managed to develop a platform of services provided by the public entities. A guide or protocol was also formulated for the prevention of CSE in vulnerable populations.	towards CSE, consists of making effective the exercise of the human rights of children and adolescents. It implies likewise the realisation of a series of protective actions to prevent that minors under age 18 become caught in CSE.	impact on the population at risk of CSE. The presence of social violence, youth gangs and other phenomena do not necessarily represent a proxy variable of CSE.	a “CSE risk profile” which takes into account, besides socio-economic variables, family-related variables as well.
Institutional Strengthening for the prevention, investigation and persecution of child CSE crimes.	The National Civilian Police, its areas and units with competencies in the combat of CSE crimes.	During the implementation of this action programme, the training of a total of 1,500 police officers, 284 chiefs and higher-rank officials, 45 multipliers, plus 11 CIVIS (Interinstitutional Committees against violence) was achieved. Likewise, a Manual of Police Procedures for CSE-related crimes was drawn up, and an operating institutional plan is being carried out on the basis of it.	The strengthening of the national institutions involved in the sanctioning of CSE crimes has been deemed necessary by virtue of their obligatory competency in these cases. To this end, several strengthening processes are under development regarding materials, the sensitisation and qualification of staff, and adoption of effective practices in dealing with this type of offence.	This programme had a relevant impact on the improvement of the operative capacities and commitment of the members of the Public Ministry and the National Civilian Police. The issue is now on the work agenda of both institutions. Unfortunately, idleness – and in some cases, corruption– observable at the interior of the Salvadoran Judicial Organism prevents that a large number of cases brought before the judicial authorities are opportunely sanctioned. The frequent rotation of	It is important to develop actions of sensitisation and training aimed at the penal courts of the Republic in order to promote their involvement in the fight against the CSE. With a view to future trainings with members of the National Civilian Police, it is important to establish an institutional commitment in order that those that are trained remain at least 2 years on the specialised units after

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Action Programme	Achievements as per I/A report or statements made by I/A		Achievements as per project management (Comments, additions)	Comments/ observations by evaluation team	Proposed follow-up Next steps
	Target Groups	Other Qualitative			
				skilled police staff conspires against the continuity of the efforts against CSE.	their instruction.



International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour
ILO/IPEC

Terms of Reference
For

Expanded Final Evaluation
(use of impact assessment studies)

of

THE PROGRAMME OF SUPPORT TO THE TIME-BOUND PROGRAMME IMPLEMENTED IN EL SALVADOR TO ERADICATE CHILD LABOUR (child labour component)

ELS/O1/P50/USA

And

COMBATING CHILD LABOUR THROUGH EDUCATION IN THE TIME BOUND PROGRAM OF EL SALVADOR (EI component)

ELS/02/P02/USA

“TBP Project of Support”

July – October 2006

ILO Project codes:	ELS/O1/P50/USA ELS/02/P02/USA
ILO Project code	P26008225050 ?
Country:	El Salvador
Starting date:	September 2001
Ending dates:	September 2006
Programme location:	El Salvador
Programme language:	Spanish/English?
Executing agency:	ILO-IPEC
Financing agency:	USDOL
Donor contribution	ELS/O1/P50/USA: US\$ 4,034,351 this is taken from the prodoc, plus US\$ 110'000 in Sept 05 budget revision. Any further funds? ELS/02/P02/USA: USD 4 million Total:

Project Background

Background to Project and Status

1. The aim of IPEC is the progressive elimination of child labour, especially in its worst forms. The political will and commitment of individual governments to address child labour—in cooperation with employers' organizations, trade unions, non-governmental organizations and other relevant parties in society—is the basis for IPEC action. IPEC's strategy includes raising awareness on the negative consequences of child labour, promoting social mobilization against it, strengthening national capacities to deal with this issue and implementing demonstrative direct action programs (AP) to prevent children from child labour and remove child labourers from hazardous work and provide them with appropriate alternatives.
2. El Salvador has ratified the international conventions on child labour. The Minimum Age Convention, 1973 (N1 138) was ratified in January 1996 and the country has established that the minimum age for admission to employment is 14 years old. The Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 (N1 182) was ratified in October 2000. This convention calls for the immediate elimination of the worst forms of child labour (WFCL). Ratifying countries commit to the implementation of time-bound measures to achieve this goal. In this context, El Salvador is implementing a Time Bound Program for the elimination of selected WFCL.
3. El Salvador has been one of the first countries in implementing the TBP modality, together with Nepal and Tanzania. The objective of the TBP in El Salvador is the elimination of WFCL with an initial focus on five priority sectors, established by the National Steering Committee on Child Labour: (i) commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC); (ii) children scavenging in dump sites; (iii) hazardous child labour in sugar cane production and harvesting; (iv) fishing; and (v) fireworks production. Work in these and other WFCL is expected to be scaled up in order to make significant progress towards the elimination of all WFCL in the country as a matter of urgency. The TBP is also intended to promote an enabling environment for child labour action, including—among other features—a sound legislative and policy framework, an appropriate level of awareness and mobilization and a comprehensive knowledge base on this issue.
4. An estimated 18 million children aged between 5 and 14 years are economically active in the Latin American and Caribbean region. “The majority of economically active children work in the informal sector and toil long hours for wages that are significantly less than those paid to adults for equivalent work. Moreover, indicators exist that show that a growing number of children are engaged in hazardous or exploitative forms of work.” (ILO, 2001:18)
5. ILO-IPEC is implementing two projects in support to the TBP in El Salvador, both funded by USDOL. These projects have tried to facilitate the creation of an enabling environment at the national level to facilitate action against WFCL and include direct action with children and families in four of the sectors prioritised by the country, focusing especially in strengthening the education sector. The implementation of the project “Combating the Worst Forms of Child Labour in El Salvador - Supporting the Time-Bound Program for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour in El Salvador” started officially in September 2001 and is expected to end in September 2006.³¹ The total budget of the intervention was set at **USD 4,856,851; a total amount of USD 4,034,351** was provided by USDOL, while the Government of El Salvador pledged a national contribution in kind equivalent to **USD 822,500**. Additionally, IPEC is also implementing the project “Combating Child Labour through Education in the Time Bound Program of El Salvador” (better known as the Education Initiative – EI), which started officially in April 2002

³¹ The team in charge of implementing the project started working in January 2002.

and is scheduled to end in March 2007. This project, of a total budget of **USD 4 million**, is funded through USDOL's Education Initiative. Its execution was entrusted to ILO-IPEC following a competitive bidding process.

6. These projects promote the creation of a conducive environment in the country to progressively eliminate child labour by raising awareness among the population as a whole and among the social actors defined as strategic (governmental agencies, employers, workers, and NGOs). This also includes the dissemination of information about the magnitude and characteristics of the problem and to advance toward the modification of existing national legislation in order to adapt it to the commitments assumed with the ratification of Conventions 138 and 182.
7. The projects also include actions to be carried out in areas identified as the most affected by the problem in order to withdraw children and adolescents at risk and to reinsert them in the educational system. Moreover, the projects intend to generate social and human resources to leave "installed capacities" in the local areas; this would be done in order to allow for the creation of social monitoring networks and safety nets to overcome the problem in the shortest time possible. Finally, the projects try to establish the bases for the future sustainability of the achievements by creating cooperation strategic alliances with governmental and non-governmental actors.
8. The two projects are managed and implemented in a coordinated manner and have been conceived as IPEC's combined effort in support of action against the WFCL in El Salvador.
9. According to the document entitled "Understanding Child Labour in El Salvador (ILO IPEC, 2003:11), there are 222.479 working children and adolescents in the country, representing a child labour incidence rate of 11.5%. Of these, an estimated 30,000 are engaged in the worst forms of child labour. The percentage of working boys (16.0%) is more than double that of females (7.0%). Similarly, the proportion of children working in rural areas (15.7%) is more than double that of urban areas (7.7%).
10. Likewise, it is important to mention that children and adolescents' labour force participation is not homogeneous, but varies significantly with age. While 1.5% of children aged 5 to 9 years are working, approximately 13% of the 10 to 14 age group and 27.6% of adolescents aged 15 to 17 years are working. To this must be added that only 77 of every 100 children attend school.
11. Almost half of the children and adolescents that work (49.1%) do so in agriculture, hunting, forestry and fishing, a proportion increasing to almost 70.0% in the rural areas. Another important aspect about working youngsters is the high percentage of them (63.0%) who toil as unpaid family workers.
12. The defined immediate objective of the project is to reduce WFCL incidence in the targeted departments on average by half upon project completion. To that end, its strategies are focused on two levels:
 - **The national level**, promoting the strengthening of institutional capacities and the sensitisation of the general population in order to provide greater visibility to the issue of child labour and its causes. It also includes the harmonisation of national legislation and regulations with Convention 182, as well as the enforcement of the said Convention.
 - **The local level**, identifying those families whose children are engaged in WFCL, from which they are to be removed through the direct action of the programme. This level comprises of three fundamental components:
 - **"Social attention,"** which promotes the access of children to education, including assistance through non-formal education, health and other basic services geared to improving their quality of life and ensuring an enabling environment to integrate children into the school system.

- **“Sensitisation and social mobilisation,”** that seeks to achieve that parents, community and local authorities understand the risks to which children engaged in WFCL are subject to, including the negative consequences of these activities on their physical, mental and social development. Moreover, it seeks to promote the value education and increased respect for the human rights of boys and girls.
- **“Supporting parents’ productive capacities”** through strategies such as the promotion of micro enterprises, professional training and support to the municipalities to involve the parents of children engaged in the WFCL in the process of defining local development plans.

13. The IPEC projects in support of the TBP in El Salvador have already undertaken several initiatives. **The following list includes some of the most relevant.**

Concerning the creation of an enabling environment:

- Training and technical assistance provided to national statistics institution and the Minister of Labour’s Child Labour Unit on child labour data collection methodologies and techniques; specific training is also being provided to labour inspectors and for employers’ organizations (such as FUNDAZUCAR). FUNDAZUCAR no es una organización de empleadores, sino una fundación. La organización de empleadores es la ASOCIACIÓN SALVADOREÑA DEL AZUCAR. FUNDAZUCAR is not an employers organization but an NGO. The employers organization is the ASOC. SALVADOREÑA DEL AZUCAR.
- A proposal for legislation reform has been drafted and will be discussed in the near future; specific measures leading to reforms to the Penal Code have already been undertaken.
- Networking and partnerships between national institutions have been promoted, leading to the creation of a network for supporting actions against CSEC.
- Awareness raising campaign activities at the local and national level have been developed, including activities in conjunction with the National Mail Office and specific activities with key groups such as teachers. Children and adolescents are actively participating in this effort, as shown by the organization of six performances focusing on child labour during the Annual Theatre Festival in October 2003. Hay que destacar la implementación del programa SCREAM en los diferentes centros de estudio de las zonas meta del proyecto. It needs to be highlighted the implementation of the SCREAM programme in the different drop-in center of the targeted areas of the project.
- For the development of the knowledge base, besides the activities on the four selected target groups (see below), two studies on hazardous child labour in the fishing sector (covering other areas than those targeted by the project) and in the sugar cane sector are finished; an assessment of the governmental capacity to deal with CSEC is also being developed.
- IPEC carried out two Knowledge, Attitude and Practices (KAP) surveys in 2003 that established a baseline against which to assess the program's effort to raise awareness about child labour and education. One of these surveys was done in the local communities of the Phase I interventions, and the other was done at the national level through the annual household survey of DIGESTYC. In addition to establishing baselines for KAP, these surveys also helped the program determine the media and messages to be used in awareness raising campaigns.

Concerning the targeted initiatives on the selected WFCL:

- Baseline surveys and specific studies on the four selected WFCL have been undertaken, enhancing the available knowledge and allowing for effective programming; workshops for information sharing in the sugar cane areas have already been undertaken and similar initiatives are planned for the fishing and dumpsites sectors.
- **Twelve (12) Action Programs (APs) are currently being implemented or are about to start in the context of the two projects.**³² APs are sub-contracts with implementing agencies for the provision of services (especially educational services, including literacy courses, transitional

³² The list of ongoing Action Programs and Action Programs in the pipeline (as of March 2004) is included as Annex 2.

education and vocational training) to the target population in the areas of intervention. Activities are ongoing in two sectors (fishing and sugar cane) and are about to start in the other two.

- An income generation strategy for families of targeted children was developed, starting with specific economic-labour market assessments in the areas of intervention (ongoing).

Mid-Term In-Country Review/Evaluation

14. A mid-term in-country review/evaluation was done in July - August 2004 consisting of background report, as stakeholder evaluation meeting and a specific review and follow-up meeting. The purpose of that the review was to review the implementation of IPEC Project of Support to the TBP and the EI so far and consider any changes in strategy on the basis of emerging experiences; to examine current proposed activities and make an assessment of their potential contribution to the implementation of the strategy; to assess the existing as well as potential linkages between IPEC Project of Support to the TBP partner agencies and other development partners and review strategies for co-operation; and to propose adjustments in the IPEC Project of Support to the TBP strategy where necessary.

Background to the Expanded Final Evaluation

15. ILO-IPEC projects are subject to end of project evaluations ad per ILO TC policies and procedures and in agreement with the donor. As this project is one of the first generation projects of support to the TBP approach formulated as a comprehensive framework for implementation the provisions of C. 182, the final evaluation of this and other similar projects of support to the TBP processes in other countries will be done as a *expanded final evaluation* (combined target group impact assessment study and final evaluation) and based around a set of core areas of achievement or suggested aspects to be used across all final evaluation for TBP projects of support. Expanded final evaluation are essential evaluations with a number of complementary impact assessment studies that allows for a more in-depth quantitative and quality assessment of impact of the project in identified areas and in the context of more broader and longer term impact.

Standard Framework for final evaluations of TBP projects of support

16. As one of the first implementations of a final evaluation of full phase of a project of support to TBP, the design has been influenced by the initial work on the development of a standard framework for the evaluation of TBP projects of support. While currently a number of core questions (see below) have been identified and elements of the proposed standard evaluation framework have been used here, it is expected that the expanded final evaluation and others of the first generation will allow for the full development of such evaluation framework to be used for sub-sequent generations of TBP projects of support.
17. Using such a standard framework will allow for a broader, more comprehensive approach that in addition to serve as project evaluation will allow for further and broader development of the national TBP framework, including identifying future action. Using a consistent approach across the ILO-IPEC projects of support will allow for a number of core questions and aspects to be addressed and provide a comparative perspective to draw lessons learned from. In this way it is part of the ongoing review process in ILO-IPEC on the TBP concept and it can possibly provide an opportunity for involving other stakeholders and development partners in the evaluation process. It is very possible that the proposed approach could also be done as a joint evaluation of either the whole national TBP framework, including the different component projects of support, or for clusters of IPEC projects of support.

18. Ideally such a standard evaluation framework could also become the basis for broader joint evaluation of several projects of support or components within the national TBP process as implemented by a number of development partners.

Impact Assessment in IPEC

19. Impact assessment is a fundamental pillar in IPEC’s evaluation system. Impact assessments looking at broader and longer term changes are particularly being developed as part of the development of the Time Bound Programme methodology, where the first considerations and discussions on impact assessment have taken place.

20. Work has been done on an Impact Assessment Framework as source book to guide the work on impact assessment of child labour programmes, both IPEC and non-IPEC. An initial focus has been on measuring the direct impact on children and families of directly benefiting from IPEC interventions through developing methodologies for tracer studies³³ and tracking³⁴ systems. The tracer studies are being pilot tested in six IPEC projects in six locations. Three tracking methodologies are under development in three IPEC projects in three different locations.

21. Work has also been done by some individual projects on Knowledge, Attitude and Practices (KAP) surveys where these surveys are carried out at the beginning and at the end of the project in order to identify and document changes that have taken place.

22. In the context of larger programmes such as time bound programmes it is therefore proposed, to include target group impact assessment studies (and repeat KAP surveys where appropriate) as a way to follow-up on baseline studies to obtain an initial assessment of the changes or impact in the target areas as a result of project activities, in particular those directly targeting children and families. The intention is for the results of such “repeat baseline” or follow-up studies to provide valuable input in to the assessment at the end of the project of the possible broader and medium-to- longer term changes as part a final evaluation.

Combined Impact Assessment and Final Evaluation

23. A combined impact assessment/final study will therefore combine impact assessment attempts to assess short-term project impact by repeating selected parts of the baseline study that was carried out at the start of the project with a final evaluation. The results from this impact assessment would feed into the final evaluation of the project. Often the framework for final evaluations – particularly in small and medium projects - leaves little time and resources to do a repeat baseline and to be able to use those results for the final evaluation. A second reading of the baseline survey that was conducted at the start of the project would give valuable indication of how IPEC’s work has affected a target population in the timeframe of the project. Existing tracer methodologies could as appropriate be used. Data pertaining to issues not covered in the baselines studies or seen as useful for the final evaluation, could, as identified by stakeholders, be gathered using as appropriate supplementary impact assessment tools such as ex-post capacity assessment, focus group discussion and detailed field observation.

Scope and Purpose

³³ **Tracer studies** in IPEC are a one-off study, looking back at the evolution of the situation of a sample of children, giving us a ‘before and after’ picture.

³⁴ **Tracking studies** in IPEC are a continuous following of a sample of children targeted in a series of interventions. This is a forward-looking inquiry approach that will assess impacts as they occur in the future.

24. The evaluation will focus on the ILO/IPEC Project of Support, its achievements and its contribution to the overall broad national efforts to achieve the elimination of WFCL and especially the overall national TBP framework.
25. In addition to the overall scope indicated above, the specific scope as a final project evaluation is the whole project, including all specific interventions in the form of Action Programmes implemented by local partners and other activities of the programme since the beginning of the programme. Any preparatory work would also be considered if relevant for the assessment of the project. It should focus on the project as a whole, the linkages and synergies between each component and how the project in addition to achieving specific project objectives, have contributed the national TBP approach and to the broader strategic areas and the issue of child labour in the country, and how it has linked to other ILO and ILO/IPEC activities.
26. The evaluation should emphasize assessment of key aspects of the programme, such as strategy, implementation, and achievement of objectives. It should assess effect and impact of the work done during the implementation, using particularly data collected on the indicators of achievement and using the associated impact assessment studies and the KAP surveys to provide detailed assessment of achieved and potential impact. The evaluation should evaluate effectiveness, relevance, and elements of sustainability of the programme activities carried out.
27. It should be conducted with the purpose to draw lessons from experience gained during the period, and how these lessons can be applied in programming future activities, existing or planned ILO/IPEC interventions as well as in broader terms of action against child labour in the context of the Time Bound Programme process.
28. In addition the evaluation should serve to document potential good practices, lessons learned and models of interventions that were developed in the life cycle of this project. It should serve as an important information base for key stakeholders and decision makers regarding any policy decisions for future subsequent activities in the country.
29. Some more specific purposes have been suggested by stakeholders as:
 - To determine and assess the workability of models and interventions on WFCL and how to refine these as necessary for the future
 - To find out whether or not the interventions on WFCL are sustainable and determine the level and extent of national ownership
 - To establish whether projects objectives and strategies have been achieved or not
 - To measure the impact of interventions against baseline information in key selected impact areas
 - Provide guidance to the 2nd phase of ILO-IPEC project of support, including further areas in which to carry out impact assessment studies as part of contributing to the knowledge base on which interventions work
 - To review linkages between IPEC Project of Support to the TBP partner agencies and other development partners and its contribution to the national TBP framework
 - To assess the level and nature of contribution of project support to the enabling environment
 - To identify key project legacies and why from the first phase
 - To assess how well this project is tying into the national discourse on poverty alleviation, child protection, and education strategies
 - Assess the extent to which the first phase of the IPEC program of support to the El Salvador Time bound was successful in encouraging El Salvador development and implementation of its own national Time bound Program. In short, as a result of phase 1 of the program, did a national Time bound Program to eliminate the worst forms of child labour take shape in El Salvador or are national stakeholders still looking to ILO-IPEC to champion this cause?

- Review the major activities and outputs of the phase 1 project and assess the relevance, effectiveness and impact of IPEC efforts to eliminate child labour in El Salvador
 - Given that a second phase of this project has been funded, assess (1) which activities from phase one proved most effective and deserving of replication in phase two; (2) what major gaps in IPEC’s effort to build a sustainable effort in El Salvador to combat the WFCL should the second phase of the program of support be most focused on addressing?
30. In view of the focus on contribution of the IPEC Project of Support to the general TBP process, in the promotion of an enabling environment, and as a facilitator in the overall national TBP strategic programme framework, the review will have to take into account relevant factors and developments in the national process. The focus however will be on IPEC Project of Support as a component of the national TBP process.
31. As one of the “pilot” countries for the Time Bound Programme approach, the innovative nature and element of “learning by doing” should be taken into account. The TBP concept is intended to evolve as lessons are learned and to adapt to changing circumstances. The identification of specific issues and lessons learned for broader application for the TBP concept, as a whole would be a particular supplementary feature of this review.
32. The purpose of the target group impact assessment study is to obtain more detailed information on the beneficiaries target groups and to give a before and after snapshot of the target population after the IPEC project. The results of the target group impact assessment study and the KAP studies will be used as data for the final evaluation. The impact assessment study will also feed into the larger Impact Assessment Framework of IPEC in that it will test the possibility of conducting repeat baseline studies at the end of the project for evaluation findings.

Suggested Aspects to Address

33. As an evaluation exercise that serves as mid-term evaluation, the review should in general address the ILO established overall evaluation concerns such as relevance, effectiveness and sustainability (please see *ILO Guidelines for the Preparation of Independent Evaluations of ILO Programmes and Projects, section 1.2, November 1997*).
34. The current list of core aspects and questions to address developed as part of the Standard Framework for evaluation of TBP Projects of Support (attached as Annex I) will provide key suggested aspects to add. The focus will be on the contribution of the IPEC Project of Support to the national TBP framework.
35. Annex II contains some further specific suggested aspects that have been identified at this point for the evaluation to address. These have been identified based on consultation with key stakeholders and prior analysis by the Design, Evaluation and Documentation (DED) section. Other aspects can be added as identified by the evaluation consultants in accordance with given purpose and in consultation with DED. One of the tasks for consultants is to decide, which ones based on the evidence and findings available, are the most important aspects to address in meeting the purpose of the evaluation.
36. The analytical framework for the evaluation (evaluation instrument) to be prepared by the consultants (see section IV, below) should indicate priorities and further selected specific aspects to be addressed.
37. Given the focus on district level work both in enabling environment and for targeted action, the evolution and key factors in the development and implementation of that model is a key aspect to look at.

Aspects for Impact Assessment

38. For the impact assessment studies, the specific aspects should be based on the impact areas that have been covered under the baseline studies in the four selected sectors, aspects identified during the further consultation process in these TORs and on general considerations of the issues and areas of impact identified as part of the IPEC Impact Assessment Framework and in particular the methodology for tracing and tracking studies. See also paragraphs 43 – 46 for further details.
39. The KAP surveys carried out in 2003 were repeated in 2006 in order to assess any changes in these areas. The local KAP survey methodology featured semi-structured interviews, in-depth interviews with key informants and focus group discussions. Interviews and focus group discussions were carried out with the participation of target group parents, teachers, children, health clinic workers, and community leaders, among others. A total of 420 interviews were conducted in areas with the four selected sectors of trash dumps, sugar cane, fishing and CSEC.
40. The national level KAP survey was carried out from March to May 2006 in all 14 provinces of El Salvador. Heads of households from households selected by DIGESTYC's broader Multi-Purpose Household Survey were interviewed regarding their knowledge, attitudes and practices regarding child labour and education. A total of 4,027 households were interviewed, of which 1,768 were in urban areas and 2,259 were in rural areas.
41. The findings of these KAP surveys and of the target group impact assessment studies will feed into the Final Evaluation.

Methodology and Time Frame

1. Methodology and Schedule

42. The following is the suggested methodology for the Expanded Final Evaluation. The methodology can be adjusted by the evaluation team if considered necessary for the review/evaluation process and in accordance with the scope and purpose of the evaluation. This should be done in consultation with the Design, Evaluation and Documentation Section of ILO/IPEC.

1.1 Target Group Impact Assessment Studies in selected targeted district

43. A Local Partner Agency will design and implement a target group impact assessment study that will consist of quantitative survey of a sample of the beneficiaries complemented with limited focus group discussions and collection of information on external and contextual factors.
44. The purpose of the present impact assessment study is to obtain more detailed information on the beneficiaries target groups and to give a before and after snapshot of the target population after the IPEC project. The results of the impact assessment study will be used as data for the expanded final evaluation and the overall evaluation report.
45. A detailed study plan is prepared outlining the specific approach to this study including sampling, questionnaires, methodology, agenda for focus groups and proposed analytical structure for reporting the data for the overall evaluation.
46. The study will be designed using the manual and experience of IPEC on impact assessment in general and tracer studies in particular.

1.2 Detailed Desk Review by National Consultant

47. A National evaluator or consultant will conduct a detailed desk review and prepare a background report. The desk review will focus existing documentation such as progress reports, strategic papers, studies, documents and plans that the project has provided input to, output of project monitoring documents, outputs of the project and action programmes, feature articles, etc.
48. The National Consultant will present the **Background Report** to the team leader and international consultant.
49. The National Consultant will report to DED and the Team Leader of the Final Evaluation. Additional backup, also administrative, may be drawn from the ILO/IPEC Team in El Salvador.

1.3 Evaluation Mission by Team Leader (International consultant)

50. The evaluation team leader will conduct an evaluation mission in-country that will consist of the following:
 - Initial briefing meeting with ILO-IPEC staff
 - Working session with national consultant and local study partners
 - Interviews with key national stakeholders and informants
 - Field visit to selected districts with target action
 - National Stakeholder Evaluation Workshop
51. The international consultant and national consultant will work together as a team for this part, including division of work in talking to key national stakeholders. The evaluation team will prepare the final report.
52. The evaluation team will interview the donor representatives, IPEC HQ, and ILO/IPEC regional persons through a conference call early in the evaluation process, preferably during the desk review phase.

1.4 National Stakeholder Evaluation Workshop

53. A national stakeholder evaluation workshop will be held to review achievements of the national TBP process and the contribution of the ILO IPEC Project of Support. While the focus as such is on the role of the first phase of the PEC project of support to the national TBP process, the workshop should be seen as an opportunity for supporting the ongoing planning and mobilisation process for the national TBP framework, including identification of action and revision of the strategies for the IPEC Project of Support Phase II based on lessons learned and existing gaps from phase I.
54. The evaluation team will prepare the workshop programme and process and act as facilitators for the national stakeholder workshop such as manage the process of the review meeting including preparation, meeting techniques and ensuring summing and documenting outcome of meeting.
55. The national stakeholder workshop is to cover the following:
 - Areas of achievement of the National TBP process (nature and causal factor)
 - Contribution of different development partners to those achievements
 - Contribution of ILO/IPEC project of support – key activities and factors (key legacy of the project of support)
 - Areas in which there are viable models of interventions for replication
 - Areas still to be developed
 - How the findings and outcome of the evaluation can best be used in the continued work on TBP process

56. Some elements of the Strategic Programme Impact Framework (SPIF) approach can be used.
57. Proposed participants at the workshop will be the direct key stakeholders in the project of support but should to the extent possible also include other national partners in the TBP framework as of the feedback, including international development partners.
58. Project Management will provide a list of key stakeholders for possible participation in this workshop. This list will also serve as list of potential key informants to consult. A detailed schedule of visits will be prepared by project management.
59. The evaluation team should solicit the opinions of a wide variety of stakeholders, including children, community members in areas where awareness-raising activities occurred, parents of beneficiaries, teachers, government representatives, legal authorities, union and NGO officials, the action program implementers, and IPEC staff.
60. If considered appropriate, each institution represented could be asked to give a short five (5) minute presentation on:
- Areas of achievement of the national TBP process
 - The contribution of the IPEC Project of Support as they see it
 - Their own role in the process and what they have learnt from that
61. Table I provides a complete overview of phases, tasks, responsibility, duration/schedule and expected outputs.

2. Roles and Responsibility

62. The following are the precise profile and responsibilities of the international team leader, national consultant and local study partner.

International Team Leader	
Responsibility	Profile
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Overall lead consultant for the Expanded Final Evaluation • Desk review • Analysing the datasets and information from the questionnaires supplied by the local partner agency for use in final evaluation. • Act as independent evaluation consultant for the final evaluation of the project and covering other evaluation related issues during a two week in-country field visit. • Prepare a short note on the methodological issues and lessons learned during the evaluation process • Prepare evaluation report 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Extensive experience in evaluation of development projects, in particular with local development projects • Experience working with impact assessment, tracer or tracking studies is appreciated • Relevant regional experience in the region • Prior experience with or knowledge of the TBP project of support type of projects • Familiarity with and knowledge of specific thematic areas • Experience working with local organisations/local partners agencies • Experience in UN system or similar international development experience • Previous experience in statistical analysis of raw data and/or developing questionnaires • Experience evaluating gender issues.

National Consultant	
Responsibility	Profile
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Carry out the in- country review based on its envisaged scope and tasks. • Prepare the Background Report • Submit a draft of the background report to IPEC/DED staff for comments and inputs • Present the background report at a stake-holders review meeting 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Extensive knowledge of development in El Salvador, preferable Child Labour • Documented experience in evaluation to international standards • Experience with work at policy level and in multi-sectoral and multi-partner environment, including networking • Previous experience with stakeholder workshops and

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Support the preparation of the final report of the in-country review together with facilitator • 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • preparation of background reports • Prior knowledge of ILO/IPEC an advantage
---	---

Local Partner for Target Group Impact Assessment	
Responsibility	Profile
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Design study, including questionnaire and data collection instrument with support from Technical Support Officer from IPEC/DED • Use the procedures outlined in the methodology to produce a gender sensitive sample of former IPEC beneficiaries (children and families) from project lists and data sets. • Use the developed instruments to carry out data collection in the field. This will consist of Focus Group Discussions as well as quantitative methods of data collection and will include using a team of enumerators • Develop a systematic method of collating and organising the data collected during the fieldwork stage. • Analyse the data collected and present findings using a report structure provided by the consultants as a guide. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Familiarity with impact assessment debates or experience implementing impact assessment evaluations • Experience in conducting both quantitative and qualitative social research • Experience in data collection (questionnaires, training enumerators) • Experience in analysing raw data and reporting on findings • Experience in fieldwork-based research, such as sampling, household surveys, focus groups and community profiling • Have trained in-house enumerators with experience in fieldwork or have access to a pool of similarly trained enumerators. The group of enumerators should have a balance of men and women. • Experience in training enumerators • Capacity to analyse both quantitative and qualitative data and prepare report as per agreed format, preferably in English • Willingness to travel to the project sites to carry out the fieldwork • Experience in the field of child labour or a relevant area and familiarity with child focused social research and data collection methods are highly desirable • Be a nationally based organisation

63. The tasks of DED will be:

- Brief the international consultant and project management
- Provide methodological support to design of studies and evaluation instrument
- Provide support and methodological check of impact assessment report
- Manage the final evaluation process as per procedure

64. The tasks of the Project will be:

- Identifying and recruiting local partners in consultation with DED
- Ensuring project monitoring system is up to date and easily accessible
- Preparing a description of all the possibly relevant sets of data and sources of information on the beneficiaries
- Provide support to the international consultant and local partner agency during the design of the combined impact assessment study and final evaluation
- Provide support and advice to local partner agency in conducting training and carrying out the collection of data
- Provide support to the final evaluation and provide logistic support to international consultant throughout the process.

3. Sources of Information and Consultations/Meetings

65. The following are the kind of sources of information and documentation that can be identified at this point:

Sources of Information and Consultations/Meetings

“ Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)

Available at HQ and to be supplied by DED	Project document (phase I and phase II) DED Guidelines and ILO guidelines Mid-term country review/evaluation
Available in project office and to be supplied by project management	Progress reports/Status reports Evaluation and similar reports at the action programme level Technical and financial report of partner agencies Other studies and research undertaken Action Programme Summary Outlines Project files National workshop proceedings or summaries Country level planning documents SPIF documents Master list and records of beneficiaries Action Programme Progress Reports Baseline reports and information
To be located as appropriate	Relevant national development programme and policy documents PRPS documents such as strategies, monitoring plans and reports, costing Relevant documents on the development situation in El Salvador and context of child labour

66. As part of the preparatory work a complete list of such documents will be prepared.

67. Project Management will provide a list of possible key informants and others to consult. Specific consultation to be carried out with:

- Project management and staff
- ILO/IPEC technical and backstopping officials, including headquarters and sub-regional
- Partner agencies
- Boys and Girls that were withdrawn or prevented as a result of direct action APs undertaken in the core countries.
- Parents of girls and boys that were withdrawn or prevented
- Social partners Employers’ and Workers’ groups
- Community members
- Government representatives, legal authorities etc as identified by evaluation team
- Local government officials
- Development partners and others working on this issue of child labour and involved in the process
- Telephone discussion with USDOL

68. Project management will prepare a proposed detailed schedule for these consultations.

Expected Outputs

69. The expected outputs to be delivered by the evaluation team are:

- By local partner for target group impact assessment study
- Data collection plan and methodology, including questions
 - Analytical report presenting the data and key analysis
 - Electronic version of the data for further analysis
 - Meeting with team leader and national consultant

By National Consultant

- Desk review
- Background report of relevant information

- Participation in briefing meeting with local partner for target group impact assessment
- Support to international team leader during evaluation phase
- Co-facilitation of national stakeholder evaluation workshop
- Input and support to the preparation of the final evaluation report

By International Team Leader

- Desk review
- Briefing meeting with local partner for target group study
- Interviews and consultations with key stakeholders
- Preparation and facilitation of national stakeholder evaluation workshop, including workshop programme and background note
- Debriefing with project staff and key national partners
- Draft report
- Second and final version of report, including any response to consolidated comments
- Notes on the experience of the evaluation and suggestions for the further development of the standard evaluation framework

70. The final report should include:

- Executive Summary with key findings, conclusions and recommendations
- Clearly identified findings
- Clearly identified conclusions and recommendations
- Lessons learned
- Potential good practices and effective models of intervention.
- Appropriate Annexes including present TORs
- Standard evaluation instrument matrix

71. The total length of the report should be a maximum of 30 pages for main report, excluding annexes; additional annexes can provide background and details on specific components of the project evaluated. The report should be sent as one complete document and the file size should not exceed 3 megabytes. Photos, if appropriate to be included, should be inserted using lower resolution to keep overall file size low.

72. All drafts and final outputs, including supporting documents, analytical reports and raw data should be provided both in paper copy and in electronic version compatible for Word for Windows. Ownership of data from the evaluation rests jointly with ILO-IPEC and the consultants. The copyright of the evaluation report will rest exclusively with the ILO. Use of the data for publication and other presentations can only be made with the written agreement of ILO-IPEC. Key stakeholders can make appropriate use of the evaluation report in line with the original purpose and with appropriate acknowledgement.

73. The final report will be circulated to key stakeholders (those participants present at stakeholder evaluation workshop will be considered key stakeholders) for their review. Comments from stakeholders will be consolidated by the Design, Evaluation and Documentation Section (DED) of ILO/IPEC Geneva and provided to the team leader. In preparing the final report the team leader should consider these comments, incorporate as appropriate and provide a brief note explaining why any comments might not have been incorporated.

74. It is recommended to structure the final reports along the lines of the elements in the core questions given in Annex II and at minimum with the following headings

- TBP and project of support preparatory process
- Process of development and design of
 - National TBP

- Project of Support
- Action Programmes
- Implementation Process
- Performance and Achievement
 - Support to National TBP process
 - Enabling environment
 - Targeted Interventions
 - Networking and Linkage
 - Evidence of sustainability and mobilisation of resources

75. For independent evaluations, the following **Final Report Submission** procedure is used:

- The team leader will submit a draft report to IPEC DED in Geneva
- IPEC DED will forward a copy to key stakeholders for comments on factual issues and for clarifications
- IPEC DED will consolidate the comments and send these to the evaluation team leader by date agreed between DED and the evaluation team leader or as soon as the comments are received from stakeholders.
- The final report is submitted to IPEC DED who will then officially forward it to stakeholders, including the donor.

Resources and Management

Resources

76. The following resources are required

- For target group impact assessment study
 - As accepted proposal from selected local partner
- For national consultant
 - 6 weeks of work
 - Local travel cost
- For International team leader
 - 7 weeks of work (35 days)
 - International travel and expenses
 - Local travel
- Stakeholder Evaluation workshop
- Participation of ILO/IPEC headquarters staff (possible)

Please note that the budget for KAP Studies is not included in this list as those studies have already been budget for and carried out.

77. A detailed complete budget is available separately. A number of separate contracts will be prepared for the complete TORs as per procedures.

Management

78. The evaluation team will report to IPEC DED in headquarters and should discuss any technical and methodological matters with DED should issues arise.

79. The management of the ILO/IPEC Project of Support and the ILO Office in the respective country will provide administrative and logistical support during the evaluation mission.

Table 1: SUMMARY OF METHODOLOGY TIME SCHEDULE BY PHASE

Phases	Tasks	Responsible	Duration	Outputs
Phase One	Briefing with IPEC DED and preparatory desk review (August 2006)	International consultant	Phone-call One week for desk review	Brief inception note on the approach to the Impact Assessment and Expanded Final Evaluation
Phase Two	Design of the Study Plan and Evaluation instrument focusing in particular on a) Overall study plan for the Expanded Final Evaluation b) Impact Assessment Sub-Studies to be carried out by local partner agencies This should involve further consultation with key stakeholders in-country (August 2006)	International Consultant (lead consultant for expanded evaluation)	One week in-country design	Study design document with identified impact assessment process methodology and identified aspects and sectoral specific study issues
	Discussion between Intl. Consultant and DED in Geneva upon completion of Study Design	Local Partner Agency	Two week, including one week design with intl. consultant	
Phase Three	Study design for sub-studies to be finalized and carried out by the local partner agency with technical support by the international consultant.	Local Partner Agency	5 weeks	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Draft Questionnaires (to test on a small sample) and Data Collection Plan and Instruments • Enumerator training • Data collection
	Based on experience from the tracer studies, it is highly recommended that the questionnaires be field tested on a small target group before they are used by enumerators. (end August 2006, September 2006)	International consultant	Regular support during implementation	
Phase Four	The datasets and results of the sub-studies to be analysed and reported by local partner agency (September 2006)	Local Partner Agency	One week	Report
Phase Five	Final evaluation process consisting of - Consultation with key stakeholder on preliminary findings and to identify further issues for the final evaluation - Field work, interviews and data collection as part of normal final evaluation - Stakeholder evaluation workshop - Preparation and commenting on reports as per normal procedures - Managed per procedure by DED and carried out by the international consultant including field visits and using information from the impact assessment study. (October –November 2006)	International consultant With DED support	4 weeks total of which one week in-country	Final version of Evaluation Instrument Draft version evaluation report Final evaluation report

“Programme of Support to the Time Bound Programme implemented in El Salvador to eradicate Child Labour” and “Combating Child Labour through Education in El Salvador’s Time Bound Programme” (Education Initiative)