

FUNDED BY THE UNITED STATES  
DEPARTMENT OF LABOR

# Independent Midterm Evaluation of Promoting the Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work and Social Dialogue in Egypt

International Labour Organization  
Project Number: EGY/07/03/USA



2010

**ICF** MACRO  
an ICF International Company



**FUNDED BY THE UNITED STATES  
DEPARTMENT OF LABOR**

# **Independent Midterm Evaluation of Promoting the Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work and Social Dialogue in Egypt**

International Labour Organization  
Project Number: EGY/07/03/USA

# 2010



## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

---

This report describes in detail the mid-term evaluation, conducted during October 2010, of Promoting the Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work and Social Dialogue in Egypt. The report was prepared by ICF Macro, according to agreements specified in its contract with the U.S. Department of Labor (USDOL) Office of Child Labor, Forced Labor, and Human Trafficking (OCFT). The evaluation of Promoting the Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work and Social Dialogue in Egypt was conducted and documented by Andrea Prince, an independent evaluator in collaboration with USDOL/OCFT staff, the Promoting the Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work and Social Dialogue in Egypt project team, and stakeholders in Egypt. ICF Macro would like to express sincere thanks to all parties involved in this evaluation: the independent evaluator, International Labour Organization (ILO) and its partners, and U.S. Department of Labor.



*Funding for this evaluation was provided by the United States Department of Labor under Task Order number DOLB089K28215. Points of view or opinions in this evaluation report do not necessarily reflect the views or policies of the United States Department of Labor, nor does the mention of trade names, commercial products, or organizations imply endorsement by the United States Government.*



# TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</b>	<b>iii</b>
<b>LIST OF ACRONYMS</b>	<b>vii</b>
<b>NOTE ON THE EVALUATION PROCESS AND REPORT</b>	<b>ix</b>
<b>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</b>	<b>xi</b>
<b>SECTION A: THE PROJECT CONTEXT</b>	<b>1</b>
1 Introduction	1
2 The National Background	1
2.1 Political and Labor Environment in Egypt	2
2.2 Social Dialogue in Egypt	4
2.3 National Legislation and ILO Conventions	6
2.4 Gap Between Theory and Practice	6
2.5 Project Objectives	6
2.6 Description of the Project Strategy	7
<b>SECTION B: THE EVALUATION PROCESS</b>	<b>11</b>
3 The Evaluation	11
3.1 Qualitative Evaluation Methodology	11
3.2 Evaluation in Practice	11
<b>SECTION C: EVALUATION FINDINGS</b>	<b>15</b>
4 Project Design and Strategy	15
4.1 Situation Analysis That Underpins the Project Design	15
4.2 Institutional Framework	16
4.3 Logical Framework	16
4.4 Assumptions/Risks and Consideration of Alternative Strategies	17
4.5 Identification of Project Target Groups and Cooperation with the Project	17
4.6 Validity of the Strategy	19
4.7 Validity and Achievability of Objectives and Indicators	22
5 Project Performance and Management	26
5.1 Management, Teamwork, and the Project Office	26
5.2 Project Monitoring	27

5.3	Financial Monitoring	28
5.4	Technical Assistance and Activities Undertaken	29
5.5	Obstacles	36
6	Gender	36
7	Project Impact and Sustainability	38
7.1	Project Impact and Sustainability	38
7.2	Innovations	40
7.3	Preliminary Lessons Learned	40
7.4	Are Changes in the Project Strategy Recommended at This Point?	40
8	Conclusions	41
8.1	Validity of Assumptions, Objectives, and Indicators	41
8.2	Project Monitoring, Management, and Performance	42
8.3	Strategy	43
8.4	Replicability and Sustainability	43
8.5	Recommendations	43

## **ANNEXES**

Annex A:	Terms of Reference for the Midterm Evaluation
Annex B:	Final Project Document
Annex C:	List of Documents Provided for the Midterm Evaluation
Annex D:	List of Evaluation Meetings
Annex E:	Final ILO Mission Schedule
Annex F:	List of Project Workshops
Annex G:	Project Monitoring Plan (Converted from Excel to Word)
Annex H:	List of Media Articles
Annex I:	List of Workshop Themes

## **LIST OF ACRONYMS**

---

CEACR	Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations
CTA	Chief Technical Advisor
CTUWS	Centre for Trade Union and Workers' Services
ETUF	Egyptian Trade Union Federation
FECC	Egyptian Federation of Chambers of Commerce
FEI	Federation of Egyptian Industries
ILO	International Labour Organization
ITUC	International Trade Union Confederation
LCC	Egyptian Labor Consultative Council
MoMM	Ministry of Manpower and Migration
NGO	Nongovernmental Organization
NCW	National Council for Wages
PAC	Project Advisory Committee
RETA	Real Estate Tax Authority Union
USDOL	United States Department of Labor
WEA	Workers Education Association



## **NOTE ON THE EVALUATION PROCESS AND REPORT**

---

This evaluation was managed by ICF Macro and was carried out in line with established evaluation standards using a qualitative approach.

The evaluation was carried out by an independent external consultant, Andrea Prince. The desk review and field mission took place in October 2010. The opinions and recommendations included in this report are those of the author and are intended to serve as a contribution to learning, planning, and project delivery.



# EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

---

## INTRODUCTION

The project, Promoting the Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work and Social Dialogue in Egypt, seeks to promote an appropriate legal environment and a culture of consultation and dialogue based on the Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work and embodied in the International Labour Organization (ILO) Declaration of 1998. The project's key targets are the leadership, decisionmakers, senior members, and staff of employers' and workers' organizations. The project has four Immediate Objectives—

- **Immediate Objective 1**—Workers and employers are more knowledgeable of their rights and obligations, and are increasingly engaged in constructive dialogue and negotiations.
- **Immediate Objective 2**—Independent, competent, and representative employers' and workers' organizations are able to better represent and defend the interests of their members.
- **Immediate Objective 3**—The Ministry of Manpower and Migration (MoMM) has the strengthened capacity to prevent and settle labor disputes.
- **Immediate Objective 4**—Labor legislation is reformed to conform to ratified ILO Conventions and the principles of the ILO Declaration of 1998.

The project has proved to be a timely intervention and is responding to a real need identified by the national constituents to promote fundamental principles and rights at work and social dialogue. However, the objectives represent a set of significant challenges within a national labor setting that is influenced by the entrenched attitudes and traditions of labor relations and poor relationships between social partners.

The project has been in operation for 30 months, during which it has sought to increase the knowledge, understanding, and capacity of the social partners on social dialogue and fundamental rights through direct contacts with leaderships and a range of awareness-raising and training events. It has also supported the preparation of materials covering national and international labor laws and procedures, labor relations, and social dialogue issues. The project has 14 months to go.

The project has made reasonably good progress toward the first three objectives, particularly in increasing knowledge of rights and obligations, and building capacity and willingness to enter into dialogue. The fourth objective, relating to labor law reform, did not have the wholehearted support of the constituents when the project was proposed and continues to meet resistance. However, the project has been successful in promoting understanding of an interest in the principles among participants. At the central leadership level, the project has met obstacles that have slowed its progress toward joint/tripartite cooperation. However, the chief technical advisor (CTA), working closely with the project backstop, has been able to adjust the activities and strategy to the circumstances, successfully increasing work at the governorate level, where joint trainings have already led to welcome local changes in labor relations. Despite this progress, the

fragile relations between social partners and the need to build trust has slowed the project's progress and made it unlikely that the project will meet all of its objectives.

## **PROJECT DESIGN**

The project design is broadly appropriate to the project objectives, and the budget is appropriate to the activities envisaged. Targeting has been good, although planning of interventions would have been further assisted by differentiating the target groups (internally), particularly with regard to gender.

The envisaged strategy is coherent, with the first phase of the project foreseeing awareness raising, training, and capacity building for the tripartite partners, moving on to organizational reviews of the Egyptian Trade Union Federation (ETUF) and the Federation of Egyptian Industries (FEI) (the workers' and employers' organizations). It also foresees a full audit of the national labor administration function, followed by targeted training aimed at developing a modern labor administration system. The second phase foresees the creation of a small tripartite group to develop proposals on labor law reform to ensure that Labor Act No. 12/2003 complies with international labor standards, particularly those on freedom of association and the right to collective bargaining.

Understanding and assumptions relating to the national labor environment in the project document have proved to be over-optimistic, prompting the project to concentrate on work with individual constituents and to move slowly toward joint work at the governorate level. There is also a need to build trust between the constituents and the project before audits/reviews can be launched. As a result, the project continues to work within Phase 1 of the strategy.

## **MANAGEMENT**

The energy the CTA has brought to the project and his efforts in building personal relationships with constituents have been a significant factor in achieving progress so far. The CTA is well supported by the project backstop in Geneva and by the ILO Subregional Office Director, as well as an administrative assistant and a driver. He works cooperatively with the Bureau of Workers' Activities specialist in the office, but although other colleagues are aware of the project, they do not necessarily know its objectives; so opportunities for synergy/cooperation may be being missed.

The project's progress and project expenditure are actively monitored by the CTA, with the support of the project backstop, through ongoing reviews and quarterly reports. The CTA has and uses a Performance Monitoring Plan, but it focuses on outputs rather than outcomes and the project would benefit from reconsideration of indicators of progress. Despite the efforts of the CTA, the Project Advisory Committee has not yet met, though it is officially formed.

## **PROJECT ACTIVITIES, INTERVENTIONS, AND IMPACT**

The project has carried out successful awareness raising and capacity building with social partners through a series of workshops/events and through other direct contact with the CTA. Eighty-three workshop activities have been carried out on 38 different themes to improve skills and increase understanding on social dialogue and fundamental rights. Leaders and officials from

MoMM, ETUF, FEI, the Egyptian Federation of Chambers of Commerce, and the Egyptian Investors' Association have benefited from these events, the majority of which were trainings. Participants have also included 119 media professionals, 75 human resources managers, 183 labor court representatives and labor administrators, and a large number of Workers Education Association officers.

The project has incorporated tripartite and bipartite events to build trust and increase the experience of social dialogue among the constituents. So far, these events have had more success in the governorates than at the central level.

Trainees interviewed during the evaluation were positive about the training delivered, as were constituent leaders, and training is regarded as being of high quality and highly relevant to the target groups. Interviewees spoke of their increased knowledge, skills, and confidence as a result of the training. They also reported being more aware of the value of social dialogue and how to conduct it, expressing the desire for increased joint training and other tripartite exposure. Discussions during evaluation meetings revealed a high level of understanding of the issues relating to social dialogue and the nature of fundamental rights at work. *Training of trainer* participants reported using the newly learned participatory techniques in their work, with noticeable results.

Project activities have created verifiable impacts through the organization of a tripartite conference on social dialogue and through success with joint training in the governorates. The latter led to concrete protocols/agreements being signed, thus improving industrial relations that immediately impact unions, enterprises, and workers. This represents a small but welcome signal that the project is supporting progress toward responsive and skilled trade unions and an increased use of social dialogue.

The evaluator believes that the project is helping to ensure that issues relating to social dialogue and reform are discussed and kept on the agenda of participating organizations.

## **PROBLEMS AND OBSTACLES**

The obstacles the project has faced relate to four elements—

- Poor relations and lack of understanding between the social partners
- Entrenched attitudes and traditions of labor relations
- Constituents (developed under strict government control) that represent established power bases invested in the status quo
- The absence of a common vision for the future—however, the CTA has managed to adjust the activities and strategy to these realities.

In addition to the above problems, the Minister is also unhappy with the CTA's approach to managing the project and is seeking greater oversight for the MoMM. ILO has been working to resolve this issue.

## **RELIABILITY AND SUSTAINABILITY**

The strategies adopted by the project appear to be having an impact and could be replicated elsewhere. The combination of work at both the central and regional/governorate levels has been particularly effective in allowing space for continuing progress.

Currently, sustainability of impact is guaranteed only by the protocols signed in two governorates and the continuing role of all trained participants in their organizations. In this regard, targeting those with real influence on labor relations at all levels and on reform (i.e., constituent leaders, labor administrators, human resources managers, officials) has been an appropriate strategy.

## **RECOMMENDATIONS**

In view of the likely impact of the forthcoming elections on the national environment and the fact that the project only has 14 months to go (without extension), it may be time to take a step back and re-strategize. This process should be focused on identifying and planning for interventions that can help the project move forward during the remaining period and achieve maximum sustainability. An exit strategy will need to be an integral part of this process.

This re-strategizing process could usefully include—

- Development of a logframe or improved Performance Monitoring Plan to reduce the focus on outputs and make the links between outputs/activities and impacts more explicit
- Increased focus on establishing functioning models of tripartite and bipartite social dialogue and providing joint experiences and exposures around themes that are not so politically charged
- Focus on sustainability, including reducing the CTA's direct role in training delivery
- Urgent consideration (because of the short time remaining) of launching the emerging trade union leaders training
- Development of a gender-mainstreaming policy and gender indicators.

# **SECTION A: THE PROJECT CONTEXT**

---

## **1 INTRODUCTION**

This midterm evaluation report was prepared in October 2010, 30 months into the life of the project. The project officially began in January 2008, but became operational when the project office opened in April 2008. The anticipated operational period was originally 44 months, ending in December 31, 2011. However, at the time of the evaluation, the donor has informally indicated that a no-cost extension of project work is likely to be approved for at least an additional six months.

The purpose of the evaluation, as set out in the terms of reference (Annex A), is to provide the United States Department of Labor (USDOL), the International Labour Organization (ILO), and other project stakeholders (and wider stakeholders active in promoting an appropriate legal environment and culture based on the ILO Declaration of 1998), with an assessment of the project's experience of implementation to date. The evaluation should also assess the project's impact on realizing Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work. The evaluation results are to be used by ILO and USDOL to continue "to revamp" project strategies, as necessary. The terms of reference outlines the evaluation purpose more precisely, requiring the evaluator to determine/assess the validity of the project strategy, the extent to which the project is on track to achieve its objectives and any obstacles to doing so, and the effectiveness of project strategies and their sustainability (post-project), as well as providing recommendations.

## **2 THE NATIONAL BACKGROUND**

No project can be evaluated without an understanding of the particular national (and often, international) circumstances and environment in which it is developed and operates. However, this is particularly important where, as in this case, the objectives seek to impact politically sensitive and entrenched issues. The terms of reference for this evaluation repeats this goal. They not only require (under B.1 and B.2) an evaluation of the validity of the project strategy, objectives, and assumptions, but also request an examination of the factors contributing to the challenges faced by the government, employers, and workers in Egypt in bringing about change in the legislative framework and in the culture of dialogue.

This section describes the project's background, the reasons why the project was proposed, and the strategy that was adopted within the project. It also describes the national political, economic, and labor environment in which the project is operating, highlighting those factors that are most directly relevant to the project.

As the project strategy was conceived in 2007 and the project began work in 2008, this part of the report includes a description of the labor environment at that time and significant developments since then.

## 2.1 Political and Labor Environment in Egypt

Egypt is a semi-presidential<sup>1</sup> republic and President Mubarak has been in power since 1981. While it now has, in law, a multiparty system, the system is hegemonic, with the President's party, The National Democratic party, being highly dominant. The last election in 2005 confirmed that President Mubarak will remain in office until 2011, with a significant domination of parliament and local councils. Egypt's 24 licensed opposition parties won only 9 seats in the 2005 election. However, the Muslim Brotherhood, which is banned but tolerated, ran a large number of candidates as independents and won 88 seats (20% of the total), making it the largest opposition bloc. A new movement, *National Front for Change*, formed in February 2010, has been seeking to bring together the opposition, although its call for a boycott of forthcoming elections has largely been ignored.

The country is approaching a long election period, with parliamentary elections in November 2010 and then presidential elections in November 2011. Tensions are high, and during the mission period, newspaper reports pointed to an ongoing tightening up by the government. Measures reportedly taken include the arrest of 154 opposition candidates, introduction of a new requirement for prior content approval before transmitting live broadcasts, a requirement to hold a license for sending SMS messages to multiple recipients (SMS aggregators), the sacking of the chief editor of a well-known opposition paper, and the shutting down of 12 private television channels on grounds that they violated broadcasting licenses.<sup>2</sup> A joint press release by the Egyptian Organization for Human Rights, the Cairo Institute for Human Rights Studies, and the International Federation for Human Rights described the "string of recent events" as an "orchestrated attempt to muzzle dissent."<sup>3</sup>

On the economic front, Egypt has been involved in a process of economic reform since the early 1990s. This was instituted by the government, in agreement with international lenders, in the face of a struggling national economy, and has incorporated a massive privatization program (314 services/businesses). For decades, the state had dominated economic activity through its direct control of key industries and the provision of employment guarantees and other social safety nets, among other measures.<sup>4</sup> The economic liberalization policy has meant the abandonment by the state of substantial parts of this social protection role.

The privatization process, as part of wider economic reforms, has continued throughout the decade with a fresh impetus after the 2005 re-election of President Mubarak. Statistics on industrial production have shown a significant growth, from a low of 2.2% in 2004 to a high of 7.5% in 2008. However unemployment figures for 2007, when the project was being planned, were almost identical to those for 2000 (8.98% in 2000 and 8.9% in 2007).<sup>5</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> A system of government in which a president and a prime minister are both active participants in the day-to-day administration of the state. In a parliamentary republic, the head of state is more of a ceremonial figurehead.

<sup>2</sup> *Egyptian Gazette*. (2010, October 11 to 18). Print.

<sup>3</sup> "Egypt: Free speech under attack." (2010, October 17). *New Statesman*. Retrieved on November 1, 2010 from <http://www.newstatesman.com/blogs/the-staggers/2010/10/egypt-media-eissa-government>

<sup>4</sup> Evaluation interview with Ahmed El Bourai.

<sup>5</sup> CAPMAS. (n.d.). *Arab Republic of Egypt, Central Agency for Public Mobilization and Statistics*. Retrieved on November 1, 2010 from [http://www.capmas.gov.eg/end\\_ver/sdds/SDDS3.htm](http://www.capmas.gov.eg/end_ver/sdds/SDDS3.htm)

With the global economic crisis came a reduction in growth, leaving estimated growth for 2010 at 3.9%.<sup>6</sup> Other impacts of the crisis were decreasing investments, and growth and exacerbation of unemployment problems, particularly for women and youth. In addition to the employment situation, the country has suffered growing inflation from 4.9% in 2006 to 18.3% in 2009, while an additional 9% of the population (6.7 million) also fell into the poverty trap between 2005 and 2008.<sup>7</sup>

While Egypt’s economy has benefited over the past eight years from reforms,<sup>8</sup> solid progress toward political and social policy reform is more difficult to pin down, though there were some (symbolic) signs of change on the political front with the creation of the National Council for Human Rights in 2004 and later amendments to the constitution to allow for a multiparty political system and confirm the new orientations of economic policy.

Intensifying labor protests against the privatizations have been spurred by the fear of unemployment<sup>9</sup> and other changes in the employment market, including growth in precarious employment (a trend that has continued).<sup>10</sup> Joel Beinin, Director of Middle East Studies at the American University in Cairo, described the level of protest as “the longest and strongest wave of worker protest since the end of World War II” (as reported in the International Trade Union Confederation [ITUC] Report for 2007).<sup>11</sup>

The following table shows the number of *protests* in Egypt since 2005, according to the annual count conducted by the Land Center for Human Rights.<sup>12</sup>

**Table 1: Number of Protests in Egypt Since 2005, by Year**

Year	2005	2006	2007	2008	2009	First 6 months of 2010
Number of Protests	93	222	756	609	742	300+

Since 2005, the ITUC Annual Survey of Violations of Trade Union Rights has provided a record of mounting protests and violations, including reports of strikers being beaten by police, arrests, and sackings. The survey also reports that the response of the Government of Egypt to the activities of workers’ organizations has included interference with leadership elections and intimidation. Workers, meanwhile, seek to express real and longstanding problems, including complaints of low wages and rising cost of living. They also routinely complain that their trade

<sup>6</sup> U.S. Government. *CIA World Factbook 2010*. Retrieved on November 5, 2010 from <https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/eg.html>

<sup>7</sup> Radwan, Samir. (2010, April). “Economic and social impact of the financial and economic crisis on Egypt.” Print.

<sup>8</sup> U.S. Government. *CIA World Factbook 2010*. Retrieved November 5, 2010 from <https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/eg.html>

<sup>9</sup> Unemployment in the 20 to 25 age group was above 30% in 2007, although it has since dropped to 16.9%. It is noteworthy that 90% of the unemployed are under age 30. UNDP. (2010) *Egyptian Human Development Report 2010*. Retrieved on November 1, 2010. from <http://hdr.undp.org/en/>

<sup>10</sup> *CIA World Factbook*. Of course, these statistics hide significant issues of underemployment and ignore the huge percentage of the population working in the informal sector, and an estimated 20% living below the poverty line (2005 est.).

<sup>11</sup> International Trade Union Congress. (n.d.). “Annual Survey of Violations of Trade Union Rights 2007.” ITUC. Retrieved November 5, 2010 from <http://survey07.ituc-si.org/getcountry.php?IDCountry=EGY&IDLang=EN>

<sup>12</sup> Statistics extracted from a variety of reports by the Land Center for Human Rights.

unions do not properly represent their interests or views. It should be noted that almost all strikes that take place are illegal, as they are not officially backed by the relevant Egyptian Trade Union Federation (ETUF) trade union and do not satisfy legal requirements.

## **2.2 Social Dialogue in Egypt**

For decades, laws, policies, and institutional structures in Egypt undermined or outlawed mechanisms that could truly be recognized as allowing for social dialogue or collective bargaining—meant in the sense of independent, representative parties freely consulting and reaching binding agreements or agreeing on policy/legal reforms. Labor Act No. 12/2003 introduced articles that define procedures for collective bargaining and mechanisms for overcoming difficulties that may arise in the process. The articles also provide for mediation through the Department of Labor Relations in the Ministry of Manpower and Migration (MoMM) and, if needed, arbitration by a tripartite arbitration board. These provisions are a step forward but have been criticized for failing to meet ILO standards and respect fundamental rights. Important divergences with international standards include compulsory arbitration, the silence on penalties for acts of trade union interference and the fact that workers in enterprises with fewer than 50 workers cannot participate directly in negotiations on improvements of working conditions, the institutionalization of a single trade union system, and the requirement for the prior approval of the General Trade Unions for the organization of strike action. Following the introduction of Labor Act No. 12/2003 law, the employers seemed unwilling to dialogue. The government concluded that this was largely because of a lack of knowledge, experience, and understanding of the benefits of social dialogue, and it identified the need for training and awareness raising for social partners. As a result, in 2006/2007, MoMM launched a campaign to raise awareness among workers and employers regarding the importance of collective bargaining and its role in settling labor disputes.<sup>13</sup> The campaign aimed to familiarize the parties concerned with basic information regarding negotiations as a means of addressing the challenges highlighted in the process of liberalizing the economy, especially the privatization process. The timing of the present project and three of its four objectives can be seen as complementing this campaign.

While awareness raising/training is certainly important, historical realities as well as personal, organizational, and institutional interests are also highly relevant. The existing labor administration structure and labor-related organizations were molded during decades of strict government control, effectively preventing progress in the direction of democratic representation.<sup>14</sup> As a result, the organizations the state recognizes as representing workers' and employers'/industries' are neither independent nor truly representative. This lack of representation and independence has meant that the real concerns of workers have not been placed at the top of the agenda and have been ignored or inappropriately compromised, and has engendered a lack of trust in the motivations of leaderships, which has become increasingly public.

---

<sup>13</sup> Study on raising awareness of social partners of the importance of collective bargaining and its role in settling collective disputes, prepared by the Ministry of Labor, 2006, p.7–10.

<sup>14</sup> The State of Emergency has been in place since 1981 and has been used to censor critical writing and quash protest in the past.

During the evaluation interviews, a number of interviewees, including some from ETUF, acknowledged that a common demand of many strikers—sometimes coming before increased wages or better working conditions—is that they be allowed to reject their union if it does not represent their interests. At the same time, trade union membership is only estimated at 24.9% of the workforce.<sup>15</sup> Because of its strong government ties, ETUF has benefited from the compulsory membership (and check-off) imposed on government workers but has a minimal role in the private sector. According to Magdy Sharara, vice president of ETUF local federation for 10th of Ramadan City, there is a strong resistance to the creation of union committees in enterprises. Out of 2,000 factories in the area, only 30 have union committees. Against this background, it is easy to see that the use of formal collective bargaining would be low.

It is relevant to note here that the Egyptian Labor Consultative Council (LCC), established in 2003 for the purpose of consultation and collaboration with the social partners, has not yet met. Egypt's National Council for Wages (NCW), also established in 2003, has also been ineffective because of internal divisions and because its proposals are not binding for the state. On October 28, 2010, the NCW announced its latest recommendation to increase the minimum wage tenfold, to 400 Egyptian pounds (US\$67.70) from its current level of 35 Egyptian pounds (US\$5.90), against the background of an annual rate of approximately a 22% rise in food price in the previous 12 months or so. However, the NCW also pointed out that previous recommendations had not been followed and that the current minimum wage was set in 1984.<sup>16</sup>

Looking now at the personal and institutional interests that influence openness to dialogue and collective bargaining, it is apparent that the hierarchy of employers' and workers' organizations represent significant power bases whose leadership is heavily invested in maintaining their own positions. The competition that this provokes has often led to frayed personal relationships between leaders, especially in recent years. Concerning the drive for self-preservation, the evaluator's meeting with the ETUF leadership was particularly telling. In relation to the ILO governing body's criticism of Labor Act No. 12/2003 and the pressure from it to allow a multiplicity of unions and federations, a senior ETUF leader stated that ETUF would not allow ILO to "sign ETUF's death warrant."

Developments in the labor movement during the last year have seen the creation of the first independent trade union, the Real Estate Tax Authority Trade Union (RETA). Another union, the Independent Teachers Union, has also begun the process of registration, although the registering authority denies having received their papers. Both unions may eventually need to pursue legal cases to complete fully the process of legal recognition; however, their presence is currently being tolerated. This may represent a significant step toward achieving the freedom to have trade unions that are independent of ETUF.

---

<sup>15</sup> Lawrence, S. & Ishikawa, J. (2005). "Trade union membership and collective bargaining coverage." *Social Dialogue Indicators*. Retrieved October 5, 2010 from [http://www.ilo.org/public/english/dialogue/ifpdial/downloads/papers/4\\_3\\_411\\_wp-59.pdf](http://www.ilo.org/public/english/dialogue/ifpdial/downloads/papers/4_3_411_wp-59.pdf)

<sup>16</sup> "Egypt wages council votes to raise minimum pay." (2010, October 28). *Alarabiya*. Retrieved November 5, 2010 from <http://www.alarabiya.net/articles/2010/10/28/124044.html>

## **2.3 National Legislation and ILO Conventions**

Egypt has ratified the eight core ILO Conventions, including No. 87 on the Freedom of Association and Protection of the Right to Organize (1957)<sup>17</sup> and No. 98 on the Right to Organize and Collective Bargaining (1954).<sup>18</sup> However, reports by the ILO Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations (CEACR) record concern going back many years over the failure of national legislation to respect the standards in the conventions.<sup>19</sup>

In 2003, Egypt introduced Labor Code No. 12/2003 to amend existing acts of governing labor relations and trade union rights and to create an overarching labor code. This code continues to govern the protection of workers' rights and support for collective bargaining today. Unfortunately, Labor Code No. 12/2003 failed to rectify a range of pre-existing discrepancies between the conventions and national legislation, including the institutionalization of a single trade union system, the control granted by law to higher-level trade union organizations over trade union elections, the requirement for the prior approval of the General Trade Unions for the organization of strike action, and the requirement to move to compulsory arbitration.

## **2.4 Gap Between Theory and Practice**

In addition to significant discrepancies between national legislation and the conventions, the gap between labor theory and practice was wide at the conception of the project and continues to widen. Routine allegations have included anti-union discrimination, such as the dismissal or the threat of dismissal of activists, the mistreatment and arrests of strikers, and the refusal to register the complaints of trade unionists/trade unions. Disregarding or avoiding employees' protection from dismissal is also common. One dismissal approach has involved employers forcing workers to "resign" their posts and then reinstating them, so that these workers do not reach the length of employment that allows for increased legal protection from dismissal.<sup>20</sup>

There are many more such recorded examples that have served to undermine trust in the government's intention to enforce respect for fundamental rights.

## **2.5 Project Objectives**

In 2007, in the face of continuing industrial unrest, ILO identified the need for the present project to assist in establishing modern labor relations for the future. The introduction to the section headed *Project Objectives* in the project document states that the project "seeks to promote an appropriate legal environment and a culture of consultation and dialogue based on the Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work and embodied in the ILO Declaration of 1998."

---

<sup>17</sup> Ratified November 6, 1957.

<sup>18</sup> Ratified July 3, 1954.

<sup>19</sup> Reports reviewed are those available on line (from 1991) at <http://webfusion.ilo.org/public/db/standards/normes/libsynd/index.cfm?Lang=EN&hdroff=1>

<sup>20</sup> "Report of the Committee of Freedom of Association." (2007). *Committee of Freedom of Association*. Retrieved November 5, 2010 from <http://webfusion.ilo.org/public/db/standards/normes/libsynd/index.cfm?Lang=EN&hdroff=1>

The following immediate objectives, together with timescales, are in the project document (Annex B):

- **Immediate Objective 1 (months 1–36)**—Workers and employers are more knowledgeable of their rights and obligations, and are increasingly engaged in constructive dialogue and negotiations.
- **Immediate Objective 2 (months 1–36)**—Independent, competent, and representative employers’ and workers’ organizations are able to better represent and defend the interests of their members.
- **Immediate Objective 3 (months 1–36)**—MoMM has the strengthened capacity to prevent and settle labor disputes.
- **Immediate Objective 4 (months 18–36)**—Labor legislation is reformed to conform to ratified ILO Conventions and the principles of the Declaration of 1998.

The time periods do not cover the full period of the project, only going to 36 months when the project lasts 44 months, perhaps because the project length was changed at a later date.

## **2.6 Description of the Project Strategy**

The project strategy aims to build awareness of the benefits of social dialogue and increased capacity to carry it forward with the aim of institutionalizing collective bargaining at all levels within the life of the project. It also foresees work with tripartite partners to strengthen the legal environment for labor relations by improving labor structures/administration and addressing discrepancies between ILO Conventions ratified by Egypt and national legislation. The approach includes seeking to address the “specific challenges” faced by the government, employers, and workers in Egypt to promote an appropriate legal environment for and a culture of consultation and dialogue based on the Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work embodied in the ILO Declaration of 1998.

The project strategy directly targets the leadership and decisionmakers in MoMM, together with the leadership, senior members, and staff of employers’ and workers’ organizations. The project also aims to work with members of Parliament, other ministries as deemed necessary, and civil society organizations. In addition, it seeks to reach the public at large through direct information and advocacy campaigns.

The strategy draws upon previous relevant projects and experiences in Egypt and elsewhere, such as the Workers’ Education Project funded by the Danish International Development Agency in the mid-1990s, and proposes a gradual and flexible approach to achieve a change in long-established attitudes.

The project document identifies two strategic phases within the project. The detailed strategy is described through a brief narrative followed by a list of strategic activities.

**Phase 1** of the project is described as being devoted to “laying the groundwork for the implementation process and to bring about changes in legislation.” During conception of the project, this phase was anticipated to last about 36 months. The strategy in this phase foresees awareness raising and the development of simplified guides/technical materials concerning the labor law, legal procedures, social dialogue, and labor rights. These publications are to be developed with MoMM, thereby helping to build trust and cooperation. To reach the public, a media campaign is foreseen.

The range of identified training themes includes international labor standards, national legislation, trade union and employers’ organizations’ functions, management, leadership and publicity, basic economics of an enterprise, dispute prevention, and collective bargaining and negotiation skills. *Training of trainer* courses are also foreseen, leading to the creation of a pool of skilled trainers to support ongoing project work. In addition, training for “emerging trade union leaders,” is proposed, drawing on ILO’s experiences in Indonesia and Morocco.

Exposure of employers to international and regional experiences in relevant fields is envisaged as a factor that can inspire employers to adopt new thinking and practices.

An important element of the strategy in Phase 1 is work to improve the effectiveness of the labor administration system and to achieve more effective use of it through “targeted assistance on developing and improving policy options and enhancing capacity of the labor administration to apply the labor laws, particularly in the area of labor rights and dispute prevention and settlement.” As a result, the strategy targets both the constituent users and labor administrators/relevant government departments. It envisages labor administration audits with the results being used to plan targeted interventions, such as intensive training and assistance to the Ministry in improving planning, policies, structures, personnel policies, and management capacity.

This part of the strategy also includes trust-building activities through joint training on labor management cooperation at the national and sectoral levels, with the objective of improving working conditions and productivity at enterprises.

An aim identified within the strategy is the creation of a national-level Tripartite Labor Advisory Board with the role of reviewing/evaluating national plans and how policies fit with international standards. This will help to establish a climate of dialogue and potentially present a model to be followed at the sectoral level.

Another significant but challenging element of the strategy foreseen at the end of Phase 1 (at two to three years of operation) is to directly address and improve the representation, relevance, and effectiveness of both ETUF and the Federation of Egyptian Industries (FEI). For this purpose, comprehensive reviews are foreseen of the mandates, constitutions, internal regulations, and organizational structures and services of both organizations.

**Phase 2** of the project strategy is envisaged in the project document to begin 18 months from the project’s start date (late 2009) and is directed at promoting a process of reform of certain articles of the labor legislation. This process is focused on the reform of Labor Act No. 12/2003 but incorporates structural reforms of workers’ and employers’ organizations to protect the rights of workers and the rights of unions to better represent their constituency. These reforms should also

address the structure/role of the employers' organization (i.e., FEI) and the need to curtail the government's role in both the ETUF and the FEI to allow for the autonomous growth of workers' and employers' organizations.

This part of the strategy envisages the creation of a small tripartite workgroup supported by national and international consultants, to develop proposals and recommendations for labor code changes while ensuring local ownership and maximizing the transfer of knowledge and experience. It also stresses the importance of promoting and debating the proposals to ensure transparency and good governance.



## SECTION B: THE EVALUATION PROCESS

---

### 3 THE EVALUATION

This section provides a description of the midterm evaluation methodology and process, and the conditions under which it was conducted.

#### 3.1 Qualitative Evaluation Methodology

The focus of the project on social dialogue and the Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work in Egypt is politically charged and merits appropriately sensitive and flexible evaluation methods. The qualitative methodology used in this evaluation both meets the goals and requirements expressed in the terms of reference (under *Purpose and Scope*) and is appropriate to the nature of the project.

Quantitative methods are generally ill-suited as an overall approach to evaluating projects such as this that are focused on promoting/supporting a process of change in understanding and in a legal and cultural environment. Furthermore, formal survey results can be misleading or difficult to obtain where partner and beneficiary organizations have strongly held views and interests that individual beneficiaries, as members of those groupings, can feel unable to set aside. Despite this, some quantitative data are included where considered relevant, most particularly in relation to outputs, training, and inclusion (gender participation), and where they relate to specific indicators of achievement/progress.

It should be noted that the project organized for a pre-evaluation survey of project training participants to be carried out. However, the evaluator has not yet seen the results of this survey.

The evaluation approach chosen was adapted to the particular political/cultural environment and to the practical and time constraints under which the evaluation mission to Egypt took place. It incorporates desk review, personal research by the evaluator, and a series of interviews carried out during an eight-day mission in Cairo.

#### 3.2 Evaluation in Practice

Out of necessity, the starting point for the evaluation involved developing an understanding of the shifting national environment in which the project was designed and operates. This understanding was reached through personal research, document review, and qualitative interviews. All the documents provided for review are listed in Annex C. All the interviews conducted for the evaluation are listed in Annex D, and the final ILO mission schedule is in Annex E.

The evaluator also participated in a pre-mission telephone conference with the evaluation manager, a representative of the donor, and the ILO project backstop—the official responsible for overseeing/supporting the project from ILO headquarters. The backstop was also responsible for drafting the original project document and is a senior ILO declaration officer; therefore, his input was particularly valuable. The evaluator subsequently had the opportunity to meet with the

backstop before the mission, to gain a more detailed overview of the project to that date. Copies of the project document, project quarterly reports, the Performance Monitoring Plan, and a budget overview were also provided in advance of the evaluation mission.

Field research consisted of an eight-day mission to Egypt, spent in and around Cairo, with the furthest visit being to 10th of Ramadan City, about an hour and a half from central Cairo. The mission offered to the evaluator the chance to meet with/interview project staff, particularly the chief technical advisor (CTA), to see the conditions under which the project works, and to meet other ILO staff implicated in the project or who have contact with it. Within the time and geographical constraints of the mission, the CTA successfully scheduled 20 evaluation meetings, with the evaluator arranging a further 5 meetings during that period. In all, the evaluator had the opportunity to interview 78 people during a mix of individual and joint meetings (19 women and 59 men). Sixteen of those interviewed were leaders or hold significant positions among project partners—MoMM, ETUF, FEI, and the Egyptian Federation of Chambers of Commerce (FECC).

In advance of the evaluation, the evaluator asked to meet a sample of training and workshop participants, representing approximately 2% of the total, through a series of roundtable discussions. This was suggested to ensure that a wide range of opinions on the quality, validity, and results achieved was heard. Each of these groups was to be designed to represent different perspectives or experiences of the project, and as far as possible, the members within the groups were not all to be closely associated. Having undertaken the mission, the evaluator was aware of how difficult it would have been to achieve this balance, bearing in mind the nature of the organizations concerned, the reasonable use of resources, and the geographical constraints. In the end, the evaluator met with 6 groups of between 4 and 9 trainees—42 in all (11 women).

According to the list of project activities, there were 3,357 participant places on project activities up to October 20, 2010. However, it is impossible to know how many participants took up multiple places by attending more than one training. The CTA indicated that many participants attended more than one event, and the majority of trainees interviewed during the evaluation mission said they had attended more than one training. Adopting the assumption that there were 3,000 individual trainees, the number of trainees interviewed represents 1.4% of the total (though only 1.25% of the 3,357 total). The group members were identified and brought together by the individual partners and cannot be assumed to be representative of training participants. Most group members were employed by social partner organizations in roles such as trainer, advisor, or researcher, or they held committee/board positions.

Only two groups of trainees (from 10th of Ramadan City Investors' Association and 10th of Ramadan City Local Federation) were directly able to speak about the project's reach to the local union/enterprise level through training for human resources managers and local union representatives.

Although the project has undertaken some training in 10 governorates outside of Cairo, the mission did not allow time for visiting these governorates. The evaluator did, however, have the chance to meet with MoMM representatives from a number of governorates who had participated in project training.

In some group interviews, the presence of senior leaders during the group discussion appeared to impact the participants' ability to express themselves freely. In other interviews, there were clear signs of self-censorship or efforts by one participant to restrict the expression of others with regard to certain subjects. In these cases, the evaluator used questions to crosscheck the opinions expressed and has otherwise done her best to gauge the veracity of these opinions.

Before the mission, the evaluator had drawn attention to the importance of gender representation in the evaluation meetings, and overall, approximately one-third of those interviewed were women, although seven of these women were in one meeting and most other group meetings included only one or two women. This proportion is above the overall percentage of female participation in project activities, which is 20.7%.<sup>21</sup>

In addition, the evaluator also had the chance to meet with representatives of some union-related organizations from outside the state-recognized partners. The evaluator also benefited from meetings with two national experts who have been consultants for the project and from their extensive knowledge on the political and legal environment in Egypt generally, particularly social dialogue and fundamental rights. Together, these meetings provided invaluable assistance to the evaluator in coming to an understanding of the labor relations environment and the obstacles that this presents for the project in analyzing the validity of the current project strategy and in considering strategies for the future.

To ensure the validity and independence of the information/opinions gained during the evaluation meetings, project and ILO staff were excluded from the evaluation unless they were being interviewed themselves, except for the purpose of providing preliminary introductions. One exception to this was the meeting with Dr. Samir Radwan, which took place in the context of a working dinner hosted by Dr. Radwan.

An interpreter appointed by the evaluation manager was present at meetings, and most discussions were conducted through this interpreter. Exceptions to this include meetings conducted in French (with Dr. Ahmed Bourai) and meetings with English speakers (ILO officials and U.S. Embassy representative). During meetings with the Minister of Manpower and Migration—H.E. Aisha Abdel Hady—and MoMM trainees, a ministry interpreter was used.

Unfortunately, the quality of interpretation by the appointed interpreter was not high. She had not worked for ILO before and struggled to translate important information, including organizational structures, (particularly union and federation structures) and roles/positions. As a result, some information, particularly relating to positions held and organization structures, was lost or may have been misinterpreted. The evaluator tried to verify important elements after the interviews.

---

<sup>21</sup> Evaluator's calculation based on the list of project workshops provided by the project.



## **SECTION C: EVALUATION FINDINGS**

---

### **4 PROJECT DESIGN AND STRATEGY**

This section addresses design issues of the project, in particular, those related to the validity of project strategy, objectives, and assumptions (C.1.a and C.1.b in the terms of reference). The starting point for this analysis will be the project document. Issues encountered during the operation of the project are mentioned. However, Section 5 will fully address the matters relating to project delivery, efficiency, and management.

#### **4.1 Situation Analysis That Underpins the Project Design**

The core elements of the project idea emerged in response to needs identified by the social partners during ongoing consultations/work with ILO. It is understood that discussions on the project were carried out with each of the main constituent bodies (MoMM, FEI, and ETUF) during the 12 to 18 months before project approval; they were led by a technical expert from Geneva in cooperation with the ILO Subregional Office in Cairo.

There is no document setting out the approach to these consultations, but the evaluator has been given a letter from the Minister to the ILO director general dated March 2007, in which she refers to “initial discussions” with ILO on possibly developing a “much needed” technical cooperation program. Although the need for the project was common ground among the key constituents, various concerns were expressed during pre-project discussions related to the breadth of the project objectives. In the above mentioned letter, the Minister confirms the need to address “any possible shortcomings in our labour legislation,” and to develop the capacities of the three partners to “ensure better enforcement of national legislation that are in full harmony with the principles of the Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work.” During discussions, however, she indicated her agreement to Phase 1 of the proposed project, but her opposition to Phase 2, which addresses legislative changes, particularly changes to Labor Act No. 12/2003. It is understood that both workers’ and employers’ organization representatives also expressed concern about Phase 2, though each for different reasons. On the one hand, ETUF was concerned that legal changes could lead to fragmentation of the union movement. On the other, FEI wanted to protect its role and was only interested in supporting reforms that eased the burden of employment regulation for employers. These concerns were repeated in evaluation interviews.

Although all these concerns were expressed verbally, they were not expressed in formally at the design stage. At the same time, the donor and ILO considered legislative amendments to be an important outcome for the project and to be in line with the needs expressed formally by the Minister in her letter.

As justification for insisting on the inclusion of Phase 2, ILO can reasonably point to reports of the CEACR and others, which have repeatedly stressed the need for legislative reforms to bring about respect for fundamental rights and to establish the foundations for a more modern labor administration. The government was also publicly committed to labor reform, though not reform of the 2003 legislation, and the project offered the possibility to provide timely support and impetus for this reform process. There is also a clear argument that, without Phase 2, the

project's real ability to make a sustainable impact would have been minimized. However, it appears that pre-project consultations did not result in wholehearted support for the project, could not be regarded as the best launch pad for a politically sensitive project, and did not represent full *buy-in* to all the project's objectives.

Pre-project consultation with social partners helps to ensure that the situation and identified problems on which the strategy and objectives are based are correctly understood. Normally, this understanding would be reflected in the project document.<sup>22</sup> However, despite the extensive expertise related to Egypt that ILO represents, the analysis of the national situation in the project document (from *Background to Problem Identification and Analysis*) presents facts and figures but does not provide significant insights into relationships (rivalries) and entrenched attitudes that were likely to present (and have presented) challenges for the project. For example, MoMM's lack of power (or the lack of respect for this power) that undermines the Minister's ability to bring about tripartite cooperation is highly relevant to strategic planning. It must be acknowledged that a blunt analysis of such issues in the project document was unlikely to be acceptable to constituents. However, diplomatic language can be found to ensure that important problems/issues are acknowledged.

## **4.2 Institutional Framework**

The project document does not contain an institutional framework analysis, which is normally an important point of reference for the CTA when planning activities. As mentioned above, an understanding of real (rather than legal/structural) relationships relevant to project work is vital in sensitive projects such as this. Fortunately, the CTA and ILO backstop both have a high level of understanding of these relationships to counterbalance this omission.

The institutional framework is also important in that it positions the work of the project in relation to other national and international programs or commitments to achieve both specific and wider crosscutting objectives. This can add weight to the project agenda, as well as highlight opportunities for cooperation/partnerships. Although the CTA has sought opportunities for cooperation (e.g., with the General Authority for Investment and Free Zones), it may be that greater synergies could have been developed if a fuller mapping had been done.

## **4.3 Logical Framework**

The logical framework (logframe) is a project-monitoring and management tool. A logframe can take several forms, but it should generally distinguish development objectives, immediate objectives, outputs, and activities, and it should set the means of verification and assumptions in each case. A logframe has not been created for the project, but the evaluator has been provided with a *project monitoring plan*, prepared by a consultant in the early months of the project. This plan has some of the elements of a logframe but lacks the distinctions above, which reduces its usefulness as a monitoring and management tool. Sections 5.3 and 8.2 contain further discussion on monitoring.

---

<sup>22</sup> ILO. (2008). *Improving the Impact of International Standards Through Technical Cooperation—A Practice Guide*. [http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed\\_norm/---normes/documents/publication/wcms\\_100381.pdf](http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_norm/---normes/documents/publication/wcms_100381.pdf)

#### **4.4 Assumptions/Risks and Consideration of Alternative Strategies**

With regard to risks and assumptions, the project document provides that “the main assumptions are that the government, employers’ and workers’ organizations will support the Project with the highest level of political commitment...” This assumption has proved to be only partially correct. Bearing in mind the stance taken by the constituents in pre-project discussions, this cannot be a surprise. No risks were identified in the project document, and consequently, no *what ifs* were included nor were any alternative strategies described for avoiding possible obstacles.

Inevitably, the project has met blockages and problems, such as the initial unwillingness of FEI to cooperate in tripartite meetings. Fortunately, the level of skills and knowledge of the CTA and ILO backstop have meant that re-strategizing “on the run” has been possible. Nonetheless, had these *what if* elements been considered in the project document, this process might have been less time consuming for those involved.

#### **4.5 Identification of Project Target Groups and Cooperation with the Project**

The project strategy centrally targets the leadership and decisionmakers in MoMM, together with the leadership, senior members, and staff of officially recognized employers’ and workers’ organizations. The employers’ and workers’ organizations are described in the project document, but the descriptions are brief and lack differentiation, including the identification of gender-specific characteristics.

The actual level of cooperation of the constituents with the project varies. Evaluation interviews confirmed that, as can be expected, each party is cooperating to the extent that fits with its organizations’ political agenda or meets its identified needs. At the leadership level, ETUF has cooperated most completely with the project, both at the central and governorate levels, taking an active role in strategically planning activities and identifying participants. ETUF have also encouraged project work with the Workers Education Association (WEA) and agreed at an early stage, in principle, to a review of the WEA curriculum.

The stance taken by the Minister, in contrast, has been more difficult for the project. On the one hand, she is supportive of the project; a plan for cooperation on activities is in place, the CTA has been able to undertake work with MoMM on a number of publications, and MoMM participants have benefited from a range of training events. However, the Minister has sought more control and oversight of project activities than ILO (and the CTA) has felt is appropriate. Relations between the Minister and the CTA have deteriorated, and while the Minister has complained on a number of fronts about his conduct (a list of 14 different issues was raised in the evaluation meeting), the substantive problem appears to relate to two issues: (1) the CTA’s insistence upon the independence of the project (that it cannot be controlled by the MoMM), and (2) the Minister’s insistence that the CTA should not have contacts outside of the official project partners (i.e., with labor-related nongovernmental organizations [NGOs] and emerging independent unions).

The combination of the above issues has led to the CTA receiving both verbal and written warnings from MoMM and has made it extremely difficult for the project to make timely progress.

For the employers, FEI was identified as the lead partner for the project. However, from the beginning, FEI was unwilling to attend tripartite roundtable project-related meetings. Although an agreement on cooperation was signed in 2009, their involvement in activities has been very limited, creating an imbalance in the work done with employers, compared with other constituents. According to the FEI representative in an evaluation interview, this delay has resulted from the timing of internal elections and the personality of the former FEI focal point (now changed). He indicated to the evaluator that FEI's cooperation would be more active from now on. FEI's previous stance is one of the reasons why the Project Advisory Committee (PAC), though officially formed, has not yet been able to meet.

In response to the above delay, and to other obstacles at the constituent leadership level, the project has developed cooperation with the Investor's Association and reached out to 10 governorates where central/internal organizational politics are not as influential. Evaluation interviews with leaders and trainees in 10th of Ramadan City Investors' Association confirmed the project's popularity, relevance, and the extent to which it has improved the willingness of enterprises and workers to enter into dialogue. Unfortunately, although the CTA confirms that this strategy was discussed with the Minister on numerous occasions, it has drawn criticism from her for being carried out without express permission from the Ministry.

It is important to acknowledge that, in his first quarterly report (September 2008), the CTA recognized that significant work would be needed to build trust between the leaders of the three constituents and the project, particularly at the central level. As a result, he has appropriately pursued a strategy of working individually with constituent leaderships to build trust and capacity, introducing a push for bipartite or tripartite cooperation when feasible. The evaluator was informed that the governorate-level work, which has been more extensive than originally envisaged, has been able to move more quickly toward bipartite and tripartite cooperation, providing tentative but valuable working models for dialogue elsewhere.

Using the analogy of one of the ILO experts interviewed, it is evident that the coordinator can find his way through the structural/procedural/political labyrinth that the labor relations environment in Egypt represents. This skill is the main reason why the project has been able to progress as much as it has.

In addition to the social partners, the project also aims to work with members of Parliament, other ministries as deemed necessary, civil society organizations, and the public. However, while work with parliamentarians and a campaign for the public are foreseeable, it is almost impossible for the project to work with labor-related NGOs and emerging trade unions because it is unacceptable to the social partners. Evaluation meetings with the Centre for Trade Union and Workers' Services (CTUWS), as well as with RETA and the emerging Independent Teachers' Union,<sup>23</sup> revealed understandable frustration that the project had not been able to work with those they regard as genuinely representing the interests of workers and seek the promotion of genuine social dialogue.

---

<sup>23</sup> Both of these unions were formed after the project began operating.

## 4.6 Validity of the Strategy

### 4.6.1 Phase 1 of the Strategy

The strategy for Phase 1 seems to be a coherent and appropriate approach to achieving the project objectives, save that it fails to identify differentiated strategies, particularly related to gender (see Section 6 for further discussion). It might also have been a good idea to place more stress on awareness raising and trust building, and to have envisaged a longer timeline before later audits/reviews take place, bearing in mind the entrenched attitudes and decades of mistrust that need to be overcome by the project.

As for **awareness-raising campaigns and material development**, nationwide awareness campaign and media training are envisaged that should complement the ongoing process of awareness raising through contacts and training. There is a strong argument that work with the media should go beyond training/awareness raising and toward relationship building (through ongoing contacts, workshops, and information packs) if the project is to reach out to and influence the general public, as is envisaged in the strategy. This would likely lead to increased and more positive exposure of social dialogue and fundamental rights' issues, which in turn would help to increase workers' and employers' knowledge of their rights and obligations in accordance with Objective 1. Unfortunately, the media campaign has not yet been launched because of the estimated costs involved, exacerbated by the limited options and controls on media expression. There is a consultant's report on this issue, which the evaluator has not seen. However, one two-day training for media professionals has been held and was apparently successful, directly resulting in opportunities for media coverage on social dialogue and fundamental rights.

With regard to the **training strategy**, the approach proposed is suited to achieving progress toward all objectives, both related to the themes/skills to be trained and the target audiences. A large amount of successful training has been carried out, providing 3,357 participant places. (See Annex F, *List of Project Workshops*).

The delivery of *training of trainer* courses and the building of a core bank of certified trainers are part of the training strategy that can also contribute to the achievement of Objectives 1 to 3. The project has begun this work and now has a number of trainers to call on (from FEI, ETUF, and MoMM), the majority of whom are already fulfilling a training role. This is important, as it is the trainers' ongoing training role in their organizations after the life of the project that provides sustainability of impact. The training, therefore, contributes to the competence of the organization and provides a multiplier effect, spreading knowledge down to workers and employers.

While the creation of a database of trainers is envisaged and could be seen as a sustainable output, there is no obvious person or body who would (in reality) maintain such a database after the end of the project.

During evaluation meetings with ETUF trainees, a request for certification was expressed. Certification is often important to training participants and constituents seeking to validate the quality of their own work and that of their organization. It is relevant here to refer to the "emerging trade union leaders" training, which is also envisaged in the strategy but has not been

pursued thus far. Whereas the project has so far planned training courses as single events on requested/prioritized themes (without certificates), this would involve developing a series of linked trainings, and certification would be important.<sup>24</sup> The “emerging trade unionist” training strategy referred to in the project document was highly popular in the ILO Indonesian project. The circumstances of the training in Indonesia (after the fall of Soeharto, when the Government of Indonesia was, for the first time, allowing the formation of independent trade unions) are very different from the circumstances in Egypt today. However, introducing the “emerging trade union leaders” training should still be considered a viable strategy for the project. Although it may not produce short-term change, it can contribute to improved organizational competency and improved attitudes to fundamental rights in the long term.

The “emerging trade union leaders” training also has the potential to help the project reach out beyond long-established position-holders in constituent organizations, as selection and participation criteria can be set for age and gender. The project could extend the concept to allow for a similar training for other constituents, also building in tripartite elements, which would provide valuable tripartite experience for the participants and a model for others. However, if the “emerging trade unionist” training is to be pursued, it will need to start almost immediately to provide a credible training period. The project may wish to reconsider the issue of certification at this point.

The range of labor relations themes/skills identified for project training has been appropriately chosen to lift understanding, capacity, and willingness to enter into social dialogue, all of which are directly relevant to all project objectives. Again, an exception to this endorsement is that the trainings provided largely neglect gender-related themes.

The training method (participatory) and nature of the training experience (single constituents or joint) are also important. Regarding both Objectives 1 and 2, the first part of each of these objectives concerns knowledge building, but the second part concerns actively engaging in constructive dialogue. The objectives are concerned with representing, settling, and otherwise taking part in negotiations. During evaluation interviews, all groups of trainees, and the leaders of two of the three constituents, identified the need for tripartite exposure and encounters as a priority. It is difficult to bring constituents together to consider contentious themes relating to fundamental rights, freedom of association, and other important topics. However, adopting a strategy that involves organizing events/training courses covering less politically charged themes could offer a fruitful approach to advancing the social dialogue. It is noteworthy here that during the project period, tripartite constituents have been brought together to consider less politically charged issues, such as safety and health, in a way that would have been almost impossible to with key project themes.

The strategy of **organizing exchanges/exposures** was originally focused on employers, but the CTA has recognized that this could validly be extended to all constituents. During the mission, this element of the strategy was the subject of discussion with the project coordinator, FEI and ETUF representatives, and others during evaluation interviews. Perhaps inevitably, it is a popular idea among constituent leaders for whom the idea of traveling abroad to gain exposure is attractive. However, it was also mentioned by NGOs and emerging union interviewees seeking

---

<sup>24</sup> Some younger trade unionists have benefited from training in the project; a group of these unionists met with the evaluator, but they seemed rather mature (estimated age between 35 and 45).

functioning models and practices that they can follow, and by governorate unions, who want to benefit from shared experience on negotiation and dialogue.

The challenge for the project is how to carry this strategy forward in a way that maximizes the number and quality of exposures and does not sap large amounts of the budget on international travel for a few. The project has already completed one activity (two repeat conferences) adopting this strategy and is actively considering the best way to develop this element.

Also in Phase 1, the strategy foresees organizational reviews of FEI and ETUF to directly address and improve their representation, relevance, and effectiveness through a review of mandates, constitutions, internal regulations, structures, and services. While theoretically a good way to work toward the achievement of Objective 2, the potentially intrusive nature of such complete reviews is striking; the project would have to develop a very high level of trust with constituents before such work could take place.

Another important element of Phase 1 provides for work to strengthen the labor administration system, incorporating labor administration audits followed up by training and assistance to develop both capacity and structure/policy. The same issue of trust building arises here; one has to ask how long it will reasonably take the parties to have sufficient confidence in the project, as well as the motivation, to allow such activities to go ahead. The evaluator finds it unlikely that this point can be reached within the project period. On the other hand, the project is set to achieve a sustainable impact by supporting the process of reviewing curriculum and strategic plans with WEA, a small but significant achievement.

Finally, for Phase 1, the creation of a new tripartite body would provide a valuable functioning model of tripartism at the national level (note earlier comments on the NCW and the LCC in Section 2.2). This would be important symbolically and would provide a direct lead-in to the work on legal reform in Phase 2 (Objective 4). At the present time, this achievement seems a long way off, but that should not invalidate its inclusion. On the contrary, it is at least an important reminder of the continuing need to focus on demonstrating tripartism at the functional level, not just as a training theme.

#### **4.6.2 Phase 2 of the Strategy**

While this phase of the strategy was planned to commence approximately 18 months into the project, the strategy allowed for flexibility in the timeline, which has certainly proved wise. The strategy here is directed at promoting a process of reform for Labor Act No. 12/2003 and structural reforms of workers' and employers' organizations to protect the rights of workers and the rights of unions to better represent their constituency. The strategy is appropriately tripartite, proposing the formation of a small tripartite group to draft proposals, and would represent an appropriate continuation once the strategy in Phase 1 has created the necessary environment of trust in dialogue. However, through no fault of the project, there is still too much work to be done to reach acceptance on the principal for legal reform and to create sufficient trust in tripartism for any of the constituent groups to *willingly* support the delegation of developing proposals for legal reform to a committee outside of their individual control.

In summary, while the strategy is well conceived with regard to the objectives, its timeline is too tight, considering the national realities, and the project is unlikely to be able to move through all stages of the strategy within the planned timeframe. If one adds into this scenario the fact that Egypt is entering a long election period, and that tensions and restrictions seem to be increasing, it may be a good idea to review the latter elements of the strategy—reviews, audits, and Phase 2—to ensure that the strategy provides the best chances of progress during this time.

## **4.7 Validity and Achievability of Objectives and Indicators**

### **4.7.1 Objectives**

As already stated, the immediate objectives of the project are as follows:

- **Immediate Objective 1**—Workers and employers are more knowledgeable of their rights and obligations and are increasingly engaged in constructive dialogue and negotiations.
- **Immediate Objective 2**—Independent, competent, and representative employers’ and workers’ organizations are able to better represent and defend the interests of their members.
- **Immediate Objective 3**—MoMM has a strengthened capacity to prevent and settle labor disputes.
- **Immediate Objective 4**—Labor legislations are reformed to conform to ratified ILO Conventions and the principles of the Declaration of 1998.

Project objectives are normally divided into different levels, or *development objectives and immediate objectives* with associated outputs, outcomes, impacts, and activities. This project does not have any precisely defined development objectives, and although the project document includes statements about the overall objective, none are included in the project monitoring plan.<sup>25</sup> Perhaps as a result of this, and the lack of a written institutional framework, the work of the project is not clearly positioned in relation to wider United Nations and international efforts and goals. For the overall objective, the project document links its achievement to the success of economic reforms, national stability, and the improvement in working conditions.

The four immediate objectives are appropriately expressed as a target to be achieved (a result). They are helpfully short and clear, though Objective 1 might have been better presented as two separate objectives—the first about increased knowledge of rights and obligations, and the second concerning increased engagement in dialogue activities. In the project monitoring plan, this has been entered sensibly as one objective with two monitoring priorities.

The immediate objectives are certainly worthy. Objectives 1 and 3 are less ambitious in seeking an *increase* in knowledge/capacity for workers, employers, and MoMM. However, Objective 2 reads as requiring an absolute, not a comparative, standard of “independent, competent, and representative” employers’ and workers’ organizations, which would represent a fairly revolutionary change arguably unforeseeable during a three-year project. It might be possible to read this objective in a way that requires only one organization at some level to meet these criteria.

---

<sup>25</sup> Found under *Target Groups*, Paragraph 1, and *Project Objectives*, Paragraph 2.

The evaluator's impression from the mission (interviews and press coverage) is that the achievement of Objective 4 within the lifetime of the project, while not impossible, should not reasonably be expected, although it is difficult to foresee the government's response to the continuing pressure it is put under by the CEACR and the ILO governing body, which has asked for a draft proposal on law reform to be submitted to ILO before the end of 2010. In May 2010, in response to the above pressures, MoMM issued a decree to create a technical committee to revise Labor Act No. 12/2003 and Trade Union Act No. 35/1976 to make them conform to ILO standards. The Minister subsequently invited six experts, four of whom were independent, to join this committee, but the independents refused, skeptical about the timing of the announcement made immediately before the ILO governing body meeting. In any event, a draft amendment may be proposed in the medium term, but the nature of the draft is still unclear.

Achieving law reform is clearly extremely important to the application of fundamental principles and rights at work, particularly related to trade union rights. However, by continuing to work with the constituents, the project can make a significant difference to labor relations on the ground. By reducing the gap between theory and practice related to existing labor and trade union rights, an improvement in respect for the employment rights that exist will be felt.

The objectives for this project reflect the analysis in the project document, which is optimistic about the attitude toward reform and cooperation. However, bearing in mind the real obstacles already discussed—lack of democracy over decades, entrenched attitudes, oppositional power bases, lack of any functioning national tripartite models, and other—this optimism may be misplaced, at least in terms of achieving significant change in the short term.

It might also have been useful to consider additional, more limited/defined objectives. The establishment of functioning models of local-/governorate-level tripartite and bipartite social dialogue is one area that could have benefited from a specific objective. The project has shown its potential to achieve positive attitude change to dialogue at the governorate level. A specific objective related to public information/media might also have been beneficial. It was noted during the mission that notions of independence, representation, and choice are widely referred to but with no common concept behind them. Such discussion could be considered to relate to the wider issue of democratization and therefore might not have been approved by one or more constituents.

A key weakness of the objectives is, as mentioned above, the absence of different levels/types of objectives (outputs, outcomes, impacts), which weakens their usefulness as a management and monitoring tool.<sup>26</sup> In particular, it increases the risk that the indicators fail to address all stated outcomes and encourages a focus on outputs. A further important weakness in the objectives is the absence of any gender objectives (see Sections 4.6 and 6).

---

<sup>26</sup> ILO's results-based management system requires that projects distinguish different levels of results: *outputs* (services/products), *outcomes* (results of outputs or products after adoption), and *impacts* (the long-term results on direct recipients and ultimate beneficiaries of the outcomes).

#### 4.7.2 The Indicators of Achievement

As there are a number of differences between the indicators in the project document and those in the project monitoring plan, the report distinguishes between project monitoring plan indicators and project document indicators where necessary (see Annex G, *Project Monitoring Plan*).

The four project objectives represent challenges in terms of describing clear and useful indicators of achievement. The indicators of achievement in the project document are, in fact, a mix of output and outcome indicators and data sources. The project monitoring plan, developed by a consultant during the first six months of the project, identifies “Monitoring Priorities and Objectives” for each of the four immediate objectives, but also mixes outcomes and outputs, and introduces (sometimes inadvertently) some changes from the project document. The key differences are noted in Table 2.

**Table 2: Objectives and Indicators in the Project Document and Project Monitoring Plan**

Objectives	Project Document	Project Monitoring Plan
Objective 1	3 indicators	2 indicators included at data sources. No reference to the third indicator on the increase in media awareness raising or articles. <sup>27</sup>
Objective 2	5 indicators	4 indicators—The final indicator, “Review of decisions from tripartite and bipartite meetings,” is absent.
Objective 3	Indicator 1 provides for pre- and post-training assessments of trainees	Indicator 1 provides only for post-training assessments.

Looking first at the indicators and means of verification for Objective 1, they appropriately provide a means of measuring increases in knowledge and materials, which are directly relevant to the objective. However, the proposal to use an annual survey to measure increased understanding does not match the realities of the training. In particular, it also assumes that training is ongoing for the same trainees over all measuring periods. If this was not the case, the survey would measure new trainees each year and give no information on whether any individual’s understanding is “better.” In fact, the project has not undertaken long-term training of individuals, though some longer term emerging trade union leaders’ training is envisaged.

For Objective 2, three of the indicators measure outputs, with only one (democratic election of employers’ leaders) presenting a measure that goes directly to the issue of increased independence and representation. Indicators often suffer from a lack of clarity, as is the case with the final indicator for this objective (missing from the project monitoring plan), which has, as a means of verification, a “Review of decisions from tripartite and bipartite meetings,” but not who is reviewing the decisions or what the reviewer is looking for.

As for the indicators for Objective 3, the first (pre- and post-training assessment of the knowledge of trained staff) would represent a good measure indicating progress toward increased capacity. However, the remaining two are both output measurements that would be extremely difficult to make. In particular, how can one measure, the increase in “the number of disputes prevented”?

<sup>27</sup> It is assumed that the absence of the media awareness-raising indicator in the project management plan is an error.

The indicator for Objective 4 is valid and appropriate.

All surveys and data-gathering activities are a resource consuming process. According to early quarterly reports, a consultant was hired to prepare survey instruments, but the evaluator was informed during the mission that baseline surveys and data collection were not performed. With regard to materials, the project monitoring plan “Action,” completed in July 2010, shows that the baseline collection of materials was only ongoing at this stage. It is interesting to note in this regard that Indicator 1 for Objective 3 was changed in the project monitoring plan to remove the pre-training survey.

This situation occurs frequently with this kind of project. There is an urgency to move forward on the project at the beginning. Relationships have to be built before information can be demanded. Surveys also have to be designed and put in place. However, without good baseline information impact/change is difficult to measure.

Given the absence of baselines, the CTA will need to consider alternative change measurement approaches at an early date. These are important not only for external evaluation but also as a monitoring tool that can help show if activities are effective and help improve interventions. It would be best if those chosen were easily achieved measuring systems. The evaluator has been informed that a survey was prepared and delivered to some trainees before the evaluation mission. A report has been prepared in Arabic and an English summary was under preparation at the time of the mission, but it has not been received by the evaluator.

#### **4.7.3 Objectives, Indicators, and Gender**

Project objectives normally emerge from the situation analysis carried out pre-project and included in the project document. In the present project, the situation analysis in the project document almost completely lacks references to gender. Therefore, it is not surprising that there are no references to gender in the objectives or indicators. This has not prevented the project from addressing gender-related issues or trying to ensure equal participation by both genders. However, it has certainly weakened the gender mainstreaming and merits correction.

The absence of any gender indicators and the gender-blind nature of the project document analysis is a significant oversight. However, it is not too late to undertake this analysis and to add indicators for the purpose of project guidance and monitoring. Further consideration of gender and an explanation of its relevance to the project objectives is in Section 6.

## **5 PROJECT PERFORMANCE AND MANAGEMENT**

This section considers the performance of the project, including the activities completed, relationships built, outputs produced, and the level of progress made toward the project objectives. It also considers issues relating to management efficiency, coordination with others, efficiency, and sustainability.

### **5.1 Management, Teamwork, and the Project Office**

The CTA is currently implementing the project with the direct support of one administrative assistant, who takes care of typing and administration, including some event organization. She attends many of the training courses and takes care of paying expenses to participants, which are set in accordance with ILO Subregional Office practice. The administrative assistant has considerable experience with ILO and her knowledge of the constituents is an asset to the project. Until September 2010, the project had benefited from the support of a project assistant, who has now left to take up a better post. The evaluator did not meet him. The project benefits from having a driver/messenger for the project vehicle. Relations between project staff seem harmonious, and the CTA's management style is appreciated.

Evaluation interviews with other Cairo-based ILO experts revealed a high level of interest in the project and support for its overall objectives, though limited awareness of the details. There is strong cooperation between the Bureau of Workers' Activities specialist and the CTA. However, a greater level of sharing of information with other colleagues might be beneficial for the project in terms of cooperation (for example with the youth and skills projects), expertise (working conditions and gender), and sharing experiences and lessons learned. A presentation to the Cairo office team on project objectives and activities would also increase the possibilities of project messages being fed into broader ILO work.

The project benefits from the ongoing support of the Subregional Office Director. The Director has had a fairly significant role in providing judicious and calming responses to periodic complaints about the CTA from the Minister, thereby ensuring the continuity of project work. The project backstop is also very engaged in the project and is a ready source of personal and expert support for the CTA and the project.

The project office within the ILO office is small considering that it has housed three staff members. One ILO colleague expressed that it would help the project to be taken more seriously by constituents, particularly employers, if the project had an independent and more executive style of office.

The CTA has developed good relationships with partners and the organization of project activities is good. Interviewees commented on the quality of interventions and publications. However, as previously mentioned, there is the problematic relationship between the Minister and the CTA (Section 4.5). Despite this, both trainees and leaders from MoMM referred to the project in positive terms during evaluation meetings and expressed appreciation for the technical assistance the project provided. This includes both training and the development of a number of publications.

ILO has informed the evaluator that immediately following the evaluation mission the CTA received notice to leave the country. The evaluator has not seen the letter and does not know the details it contains. It is understood that the ILO director for the ILO Subregional Office will be meeting with the Minister to discuss this.

The project has an overall budget of US\$2.4 million, which is seen as sufficient to deliver the strategy and activities foreseen. Almost half the funds, US\$1,117,819, had been spent or committed as of October 4, 2010. The CTA has clearly been careful to ensure that activities are justified within the objectives and are appropriately priced. Considering this and the obstacles faced in progressing activities, this level of delivery is as good as could be expected. The CTA is conscious that the funds for the project are unlikely to be exhausted within the original time period of the project. It is understood that unspent funds at the end of the project period could suffice to fund a six-month, no-cost extension of the project period, if it is deemed appropriate.

## **5.2 Project Monitoring**

It is evident from interviews with the CTA and the project backstop that the progress of the project is actively monitored and reviewed. The backstop has almost daily contact with the coordinator to discuss developments and strategy. In addition, the coordinator delivers quarterly reports on developments, activities completed, and progress toward objectives. Progress is marked against activity plans laid down annually showing activities by month. Individual periodic plans for activities are also prepared with regard to agreed strategies and activities with each constituent group. These plans are prepared by the constituent with support (capacity building) from the project. Delivery of these plans is then jointly monitored. During evaluation interviews, constituent leaders made very specific reference to these plans.

Reference has previously been made to the strengths and weaknesses of the indicators of achievement set out in the project document and transferred, with some changes, into the Performance Monitoring Plan as indicators of progress. No logframe has been created, and the CTA is using the project monitoring plan as a monitoring tool and periodically updates the *Action* column with completed activities that are relevant to the measurements identified. However, because of weaknesses in the project monitoring plan, the focus of this monitoring is pushed toward outputs rather than outcomes. Furthermore, because of the absence of strong baselines, the outputs logged or the method of obtaining the data will not necessarily reveal much about the increase of knowledge, competence, or the capacities that the objectives are referencing.

It is important for the CTA to have a clear way of monitoring the outcomes envisaged in the immediate objectives. Thus, it would be useful to revisit the project monitoring plan or now create a logframe that could provide a more useful and stronger monitoring tool.

Activities and events are recorded on an activity list that records event titles, participating groups, and a gender breakdown of participants. However, the project is unable to say how many participants are attending multiple trainings, which is important for ensuring that the benefit of training is spread out and is reaching identified targets. The list is currently kept in Microsoft Word format (see Annex F), but converting it to Microsoft Excel would facilitate monitoring of differentiated participation.

An initial analysis of consultancies issued by the project was carried out for the evaluator and shows that 56 male and 13 female consultants have been paid by the project. It is believed that most of these consultants were paid a modest amount as trainers. Monitoring of this item should seek to ensure that substantive consultancies, such as the media and survey consultancies, are distributed as far as possible, to grant female as well as male experts the opportunity to benefit from the capacity building and profile that such opportunities bring. This would also serve as another outward demonstration of the project's commitment to gender quality.

At the end of project training activities, participants are asked to complete feedback forms. While the CTA looks at these forms, the opinions/scores given by participants are not summarized to provide a statistical view of satisfaction with the training received. Although the vast majority of trainees interviewed were openly impressed with the quality and style of the training, it is still important to undertake an ongoing analysis of feedback forms. The questions in the forms may be adjusted to allow for a simple but useful statistical analysis of trainee feedback in future.

Media coverage on the project is monitored and a file of clippings is kept (see Annex H, *Summary of Media Articles*). It would be helpful to the project in its media work, but also for monitoring and evaluation purposes, if a basic list of these were developed, noting the newspapers concerned, the issues addressed, and the catalyst for the article. The CTA undertakes a less formal monitoring of media coverage on issues related to project objectives, which informs his planning.

The project document foresees the creation of a tripartite PAC, whose roles includes oversight of project plans and activities related to the objectives. The CTA has made considerable efforts to form the PAC, but its formation and meeting plans rely upon the cooperation of MoMM. To date, although the PAC has been officially formed, it has not met, rendering it useless as a further monitoring tool. Hopefully, the PAC can begin its work soon. In addition to its monitoring role, the creation of the committee would present a valuable tripartite model and exposure to tripartite working for those concerned. It is also possible that its oversight would alleviate some of the mistrust between constituents and between the Minister and the CTA.

Finally, it is noted in the quarterly reports that an interim assessment mission took place on the Project in May 2009. The evaluator has not seen the report from this mission.

### **5.3 Financial Monitoring**

The monitoring provisions for the project appear adequate and appropriate. Expenditure is planned and monitored by both the CTA and the project backstop. The ILO backstop has access to the ILO budgetary platform that enables him to monitor expenditure on a daily basis, and no substantive commitments are entered without the ILO backstop's approval. The CTA has access to budgetary information through the local ILO system. He tracks project expenditure with assistance from the administrative assistant, who helps with the preparation of budgets for activities and the payment of project bills and expenses.

## 5.4 Technical Assistance and Activities Undertaken

The project has provided technical assistance through—

- Delivery of training and awareness-raising activities
- *Training of trainer* activities that have enabled constituent groups to start the process of lifting capacity within their wider organization
- Assistance with strategic planning, including the process of strategic planning of project activities
- Cooperative working with MoMM on the preparation of publications
- Direct facilitation provided by the CTA to help constituents achieve dialogue between social partners at the governorate level

Most of this assistance has been delivered directly by the CTA. While the quality of his hands-on work is a strength of the project, in the interests of sustainability, the CTA will need to find ways of pulling back from this and focus increasingly on building a larger core of capable individuals to take on training and other roles. This is difficult as capacity is generally low. It is probably not coincidental that consultancies issued by the project, such as for survey instruments and the media campaign, have not achieved results so far.

The evaluator was not able to witness any project activities firsthand during the mission. However, the document review and evaluation interviews provided good insights into the relationships built up and the level of assistance the project is providing. All interview responses, with the notable exception of the Minister and some MoMM trainees, reflected positive professional relationships established by the CTA with both trainees and leaders. The vast majority of participants also gave extremely positive accounts of their experiences with project assistance, confirming that they and their organizations benefited from both the quality and the content of interventions and activities.

The CTA has a clear methodology for planning technical cooperation with project partners. This involves raising awareness on social dialogue and fundamental rights issues and encouraging constituents to identify their weaknesses and skill gaps. The constituents are then supported by the CTA to develop a long-term strategic plan incorporating the interventions they seek. The important skills learned through this process were mentioned by a number of interviewees. The evaluator clearly gained the impression that the assistance delivered was of a high standard and delivered in an organized manner.

At the time of the mission, a significant range and volume of activities had been commenced or completed, and the project coordinator was planning a new round of activities with constituent organizations.

#### **5.4.1 Awareness Raising and Campaigns**

The CTA appropriately prioritized awareness raising, through training/conferences and through direct contact. During the mission, the energy that the CTA put into building personal trust and maintaining open communications with constituent representatives was evident. The evaluator could see that the assistance provided by the project was appropriately directed toward raising the knowledge and competence of constituent organizations.

As for the envisaged media campaign, the CTA has employed a consultant to produce a media campaign plan, but the cost of carrying out the proposal, which involved TV advertising, proved too high. It may be that there is an issue here relating to the capacity/understanding of the issues on the part of the consultant, but the official (or public) media in Egypt is also subject to tight controls, leaving limited conventional options for the project to explore. (Note that the evaluator has not seen this report). The project document sets out a varied approach to this campaign incorporating roundtable events, lunchtime talks, and high profile events. Other possibilities could include sponsoring the production of radio or TV documentaries and public competitions for art or writings.

It is relevant here to address the training for media professionals envisaged in the strategy. The project has, so far, undertaken a two-day workshop, attended by 119 journalists, editors, and media representatives, on the role of media in promoting decent work and raising awareness on economic and social transformations. The immediate benefits of this work included good media coverage of the conference, including a two-hour live radio program with the CTA and representatives from MOMM, FEI, and ETUF discussing fundamental principles and rights at work, social dialogue, and their importance to developing stable labor relations. The CTA fully appreciates the importance of the media element of the project's work, particularly with regard to Objective 1, and has plans to revisit it in the coming months.

As far as the awareness-raising work that has been undertaken, discussions during evaluation interviews suggested that this effort was productive with Constituent leaders and representatives willing to discuss, in varying degrees, the issues that the project seeks to address and showing their awareness of where their/the Egyptian position fails to meet international standards. Of course, the evaluator cannot know if this represents a change as a result of project work. Neither should this openness be interpreted as representing a readiness to shift their position on these issues. It is, nonetheless, a good thing.

#### **5.4.2 Printed/Recorded Materials**

Twenty brochures and guides have been developed and printed concerning the labor code, the role of trade unions, and social dialogue. In addition, a CD has been produced containing all ILO Conventions translated into Arabic, together with a printed version. Eighteen of these 20 products were produced in cooperation with MoMM. In addition, the following publications are also in preparation:

- Printed version of the Declaration on the Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work
- Printed version of the declaration on social justice for fair globalization

- Printed version of the global jobs pact
- Booklet regarding the role and activities of the Bureau of Workers' Activities
- Two manuals concerning Occupational Safety and Health at the workplace for textile and tourism sectors

Posters have not yet been printed and could appropriately be considered within the scope of the media campaign.

Project publications are appropriately in Arabic, and the evaluator does not speak or read the language, so cannot personally comment on content. The style of the sample publications provided to the evaluator was generally formal without images in the body of the text (with the exception of one leaflet), giving the impression that they are legal/official texts. The evaluator sought feedback from a number of the evaluation interviewees about the style and quality of these publications, and the feedback was largely positive. However, a number of people commented on the need for alternative publications suited to union members/workers. Representatives from the emerging unions commented that the presentation, language, and themes in the samples represented the status quo and the Ministry's perspective. Clearly, as the brochures were part of the work undertaken with the Ministry, their influence on the style is evident.

Regarding the leaflet containing photographic images of workers, two interviewees commented that the images used do not reflect the reality or range of the working population in Egypt. The choice of images could be given more careful consideration for future publications. More than one interviewee also suggested that they would find it useful to have a leaflet that described the project, which is certainly a good suggestion.

### **5.4.3 Training and Workshop Activities**

In all, the project has completed 83 training, workshop, and conference activities in 30 months of operation. Approximately a dozen of these were directed at central leadership of constituent bodies, including WEA principals, mostly in the first year of the project. The list of activities reflects the shift of strategy at this point to work in the governorates, with training being carried out in 10 governorates in addition to Cairo. The training organized by the project was enthusiastically appreciated by those interviewed (leaders and training participants) giving the clear impression that it is of a high standard, relevant, and well suited to the participants needs. All constituents agreed that the training was extremely useful and should be continued and expanded into new areas and to new participants.

A review of the course participant groups shows that WEA and ETUF representatives and employees have been significant participants in training, attending approximately 40 trainings. Ministry representatives, both centrally and in the governorates, are listed as participants in 16 trainings and workshops. However, in 10th of Ramadan City, local MoMM representatives were also invited and often participated in courses directed at ETUF/general/local unions. This might also be the case in other governorates. Employers' organizations have participated least in project activities, as discussed previously (officially attending less than 10 trainings). Again, this may not be a fair reflection of participation in the governorates.

Among other participants, training has benefited 119 media professionals, 75 human resources managers from 60 companies in 10th of Ramadan City, 336 governorate officers and workers from Helwan, and hundreds from 9 other governorates. To further strengthen the labor administration system, 183 labor court representatives and labor administrators have been trained. In all, 38 different themes have been addressed. Annex I contains a full list of the themes addressed and the number of workshops for each.

The project document states that at least 30 trade unions and 10 employers will be selected and trained as trainers, creating a core of specialist trainers for the project. This process has begun, with considerable work being undertaken by the project with WEA trainers, far surpassing the numbers required. However, it goes without saying that attending one or even a number of trainings does not necessarily create a *training specialist*. The CTA has had 59 *consultants* undertake work on the project, mostly as trainers. Despite this, and as mentioned above, as capacity is low, the CTA personally trains/facilitates, sometimes jointly, on many training courses and workshops. Interviewees almost unanimously praised his style and method of delivery. The only exception to this came from ministry trainees. Three of these trainees echoed complaints made by the Minister, claiming that there had been interference from the project coordinator in ministry training and that this had created “confusion” among participants.

Regarding the themes for training, the Minister and a senior ETUF leader pointed out that the issues addressed through training were not new to them. However, the project gave them the opportunity to highlight and share issues with more colleagues, particularly related to social dialogue. Mr. Hussein Megawar, ETUF President, pointed to the continued need to build trust and lower the fear among employers. He also stated that project training was a good start toward improving fragile relationships between workers and employers.

In contrast to ETUF leaders, ETUF officials and WEA trainers who attended project training emphasized that social dialogue was a new training subject for them. They noted that although the participatory training approach used in the training (and taught in training of trainers) was also new, it was already proving useful to them in their work. The rights-based approach promoted in the training was seen as an important confirmation of the stance that is taken in bargaining, and the support from the project with the process of strategic planning of training services and activities was praised.

As for the employers, representatives from FECC and FEI welcomed the role of the project in promoting tripartite dialogue. The FEI representative felt that the project had already begun to have success through its training activities in getting people to consider listening to each other. Human resources interviewees echoed this, but asked that enterprise owners themselves receive training so that they would accept advice on legal rights and the benefits of dialogue given to them by the human resources managers.

A number of ETUF leaders stressed their desire to have joint workshops and other joint events, though the problem of gaining the cooperation of the employers’ representatives was acknowledged. This was echoed strongly by WEA trainees, who wanted to practice the dialogue approach and skills they had learned. As one trainee put it, “We feel like we have bought the video but have no TV to play it on.” The desire to have bipartite and tripartite exposure was a recurrent theme in evaluation interviews, as previously discussed.

The project's plan to provide tripartite and bipartite events to build trust and increase the experience of social dialogue among the constituents, has had more success so far in the governorates than at the central level. It is noteworthy that only a dozen of the events brought central constituents together (bipartite or tripartite).

The project strategy specifically includes joint training in labor management cooperation at the national and sectoral levels, with pilot exercises at 50 enterprises. The project has not yet planned to directly conduct enterprise-level training of this kind, and the coordinator has appropriately focused activities at the identified project targets. However, ETUF union representatives interviewed were clear that successful joint training activities carried out in 10th of Ramadan City were having an impact on management-worker relations in a number of enterprises.

The most significant central tripartite event, resulting from collaboration between the project and ILO Headquarters, is what is commonly referred to by interviewees as the Sonesta Workshop, a tripartite workshop on *Social Dialogue, Freedom of Association, and Development*, involving the ILO Executive Director, Deputy Director of the ILO Standards Department, ILO Subregional Office Cairo Director, and the leaders and senior representatives from the key constituent bodies. This took place in April 2010. Based on accounts from a number of people who were present that day, high emotions were involved and a good deal of shouting on all sides. Speeches included criticism of ILO from ETUF for calling for the right to freedom of association and an accusation that there is an international agenda to divide the trade union movement in Egypt. While the tenor of the communication could not be described as providing a good model for future social dialogue, the fact that the event took place is an extremely important breakthrough for the project. It was noted that, after the workshop, participants were able to come together for a photograph and reception without obvious problems.

During the evaluation mission, the evaluator learned of another tripartite conference on occupational safety and health that had also proceeded cooperatively, though it took many months of organization, supporting the point that less politically charged themes offer greater possibilities for cooperative dialogue. As mentioned earlier, the project could, in the future, chose to compromise on some workshop themes to bring constituents together. This could be done through supporting work in other areas of ILO work—youth employment, for example—or by highlighting more politically neutral areas relevant to social dialogue and fundamental rights, such as gender, training, or even business management and employee motivation, perhaps using the ILO training package on *Work Improvement in Small Enterprises*. It is interesting to note that an earlier tripartite conference on the financial crisis went more smoothly, though the level of participants was somewhat lower, hierarchically. There is, of course, no guarantee that constituents would cooperate, or would be free to cooperate, with such an approach in this project, particularly if the activities were seen as being outside of the project remit. It could also be argued that this approach would dilute the strong message and focus of the project. While the personal involvement of the CTA in training has helped to guarantee the quality of the training delivered, it places considerable pressure on his time, which is needed to deal with strategic planning, activity organization, communications, monitoring, and general project management. As mentioned in the introduction to Section 5.4, the CTA's involvement is also not good for sustainability, and he therefore needs to find a way to reduce this.

Overall, female participation in project activities is in line with relevant national statistics. Twenty-one percent of the available spaces (695) in events in the list of project workshops were taken up by women. This percentage was boosted by two trainings relating to gender, which were directed at members of *Women's and Children's Committees* and women trainers. No statistics were available to the project concerning the gender balance in the workforces in the governorates/industrial zones targeted, nor for membership of the constituent organizations with whom the project works. This is something the project should consider when re-addressing the project monitoring plan. Female trade unionists are estimated to make up just over 24% of the membership.<sup>28</sup>

The female trainers interviewed, who had attended training organized by the project, greatly appreciated the training they had received and the quality and approach taken by the trainers, mainly the CTA. They, along with other trainees interviewed, felt this training had strengthened their practical negotiation skills and increased their confidence. Three women reported having taken on an increased/more active role following the training. It is noted that, according to the list of project workshops, there were only two workshops with specific gender-related themes; one was for the women's committee and was all female, and the other involved only four men. Nonetheless, when trainees were asked if gender had been raised as part of other training, those who responded felt that it had. However, the impression gained by the evaluator was that their understanding of gender was relatively undeveloped.

On a negative note, an interviewee who had attended the Turin training as a result of the project was outraged that representatives from RETA were present and felt insulted, emphasizing that there is no room for multiplicity of trade unions in Egypt. However, he was able and willing to separate his view of this event from his view of the CTA and the project.

In considering project activities, it is also relevant to take into account the views of those who could not take part. In evaluation interviews, representatives from RETA and CTUWS both expressed disappointment in the project implementation, saying that "the level of bureaucracy," had prevented it from working with their organization. They expressed support for the objectives and appreciation for the presence of the CTA as a source of moral support. One RETA representative went further, describing himself as the CTA's "biggest fan." However, the CTUWS representative felt that CTUWS is delivering more genuine training on the important issues to real trade unionists.

#### **5.4.4 Training for "Emerging Trade Union Leaders"**

As previously mentioned in the section on project strategy, the envisaged training for "emerging trade union leaders" has not yet been incorporated into the project plans. This potentially valuable approach certainly merits further consideration.

One of the problems the project faces consists of gaining access to individuals working within the recognized constituent groups who might support reform in the future; these group members are often younger, less established individuals. Another issue has been achieving cooperation for

---

<sup>28</sup> Lawrence, S. & Ishikawa, J. (2005). "Trade union membership and collective bargaining coverage." *Social Dialogue Indicators*. Retrieved October 5, 2010 from [http://www.ilo.org/public/english/dialogue/ifpdial/downloads/papers/4\\_3\\_411\\_wp-59.pdf](http://www.ilo.org/public/english/dialogue/ifpdial/downloads/papers/4_3_411_wp-59.pdf)

joint training for constituent partners at the central level. A youth/emerging trade union leaders' training strategy provides the project with one legitimate way of doing this participants can be selected through an interview process, according to pre-set criteria, which can include a maximum age limit. The concept could be adapted and opened up to provide parallel training for constituent groups and to incorporate tripartite experience.

#### **5.4.5 Exposure/Exchanges**

Work on exposing employers and other constituents to international and regional experiences in relevant fields has begun. In particular, two successful seminars were organized for the benefit of 6th and 10th of Ramadan City Investors' Association with the presence of Ed Potter, the Director of Global Workplace Rights for Coca-Cola. A conference was also organized jointly with the General Authority for Investment and Free Zones, which Mr. Potter attended. These conferences were greatly appreciated by interviewees; the CTA, with the support of ILO Geneva, is currently considering how to replicate/extend this work to encourage tripartite attendance.

While organizing for beneficiaries to travel abroad to gain exposure is popular with some, the project budget would be used up quickly even if only a limited number of such trips were organized. As a result, the CTA is focusing on ways to provide exposure by organizing for more companies and individuals representing good examples of labor relations, from the region and beyond, to share their experiences directly with constituents in Egypt.

#### **5.4.6 Facilitation of Enterprise-level Dialogue**

During evaluation interviews, ETUF and the Egyptian Investors' Association leaders, trainers, and officials stressed the active role of the project in helping to secure ground-level dialogue. In this regard, mention was made of the CTA's role in bringing different sides together to resolve a print industry dispute in 10th of Ramadan City, and to reach an agreement with mine industry participants in El Menya (see Section 7.1).

#### **5.4.7 Labor Administration, Structural Reviews, and Audits**

One hundred and eighty-three labor administrators and constituent members sitting in the labor court have benefited from a number of training opportunities relevant to this work; they participated in broader workshops concerned with the role of MoMM in activating mechanisms for social dialogue.

In-depth structural reviews of FEI and ETUF as well as an audit of the labor administration function are envisaged, followed up by training and assistance to develop both capacity and structure/policy. This work was originally anticipated to begin between 18 months and 24 months of operation (around April 2010), but it has not yet begun. This delay is appropriate and does not imply any absence of effort by the CTA. This type of activity would involve the project gaining access and providing critical assessments/responses to staff, documents, and policies, as well as analyzing structures/institutional processes that have developed over many years. While theoretically this is a good idea, such work could only be carried forward after significant trust building had taken place.

It is, therefore, hard to imagine that such all-encompassing reviews/audits could have been achieved within the first phase of the project. On the other hand, the project has already been supporting a process for reviewing strategic plans and the training curriculum of WEA. This is an excellent start, which could potentially lead to a sustained impact training content for ETUF trade unionists.

## **5.5 Obstacles**

The national environment in which the project is working is clearly the most significant obstacle it faces. In an early quarterly report, the CTA emphasized this, by pointing to the following key factors:

- Poor relations and lack of understanding between the social partners
- Culture and traditions of labor relations
- Absence of a common vision for the future

One can add to this the fact that constituencies represent established power bases invested in the *status quo*.

These obstacles underline the reasons why the project exists and are what it is working to change. They were also highly foreseeable. Perhaps less foreseeable was the attitude of the Minister toward the project and the CTA. Ultimately, this is also the obstacle that could prevent the project from progressing.

## **6 GENDER**

Gender equality is a crosscutting objective of all ILO work, a Millennium Development Goal, and a core element of Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work. Outcome 4 of the Egypt United Nations Development Assistance Framework for the period 2006–2011 explicitly concerns women’s participation in the workforce, political sphere, and public life. In addition, the Government of Egypt has committed itself to action on discrimination and exclusion through a series of projects and measures, including an equity seal for employers and a quota for women in Parliament (62 from 518 seats). The Minister has a very personal and active commitment to gender issues, which was discussed in the evaluation interview—seven of her nine undersecretaries are female. In the light of the above, it is extremely important that gender be mainstreamed fully into the project.

Unfortunately, as already mentioned, the project document shows no evidence of analysis and differentiation of the target population/beneficiaries. Neither are there any gender-specific objectives or indicators. Yet a brief exploration of gender in Egypt highlights important differentials that should be taken into account in activity planning and design:

- Egypt has one of the lowest female labor participation rates in the world and ranks 120 out of 128 countries in terms of the gender gap.

- In April 2010, Egypt's workforce was over 20 million, but only 6.1 million of these were women.
- In April 2010, women's unemployment was recorded as 22.2% compared with 8.96% for men.<sup>29</sup>
- Women in Egypt still predominately work in the informal sector and earn less than men in formal employment.<sup>30</sup>
- Female trade unionists have been estimated to make up just over 24% of the union membership in Egypt.<sup>31</sup>

Despite the absence of gender as a formal dimension of the project to date, the CTA has made efforts to ensure gender participation, has provided some training on gender issues, and has specifically chosen to undertake work in sectors that have a high number of women workers, such as textiles and foods. These choices provide an excellent opportunity for addressing gender issues and at least a little time remains to accomplish this goal. However, the starting point should be for the project to revisit the objectives, indicators of progress, and strategy to ensure that gender considerations are fully integrated into the project.

Gender goes directly to the issue of representation and fundamental rights, and it is appropriate that gender themes be included more thoroughly in awareness raising and training; this work is as relevant to men as it is to women. The evaluator asked all interviewees about gender as an issue for their organization. With the exception of the Minister and the teachers' NGO, the response given was that they were aware of it and it was not a problem. The interviewees would then point to the one or two women in the meeting as evidence of this.

The project needs to consider how it can increase the in-depth understanding of gender on the part of constituents, which was clearly low. Some of the themes that might usefully be highlighted could include—

- Gender equality at work and in constituent organizations
- The importance of recruiting female workers and encouraging female activists
- Removing the glass ceiling in membership organizations so women can become committee members/negotiators/leaders
- Redressing inequality through positive measures, such as targets for nominations for position opportunities and guaranteed places on decisionmaking committees

---

<sup>29</sup> Arab Republic of Egypt Central Agency for Public Mobilization and Statistics, [http://www.capmas.eg/eng\\_ver/SDDS3.htm](http://www.capmas.eg/eng_ver/SDDS3.htm)

<sup>30</sup> United Nations Development Fund for Women Presentation of Dr. Maya Morsy, Country Coordinator, United Nations Development Fund for Women Egypt.

<sup>31</sup> Lawrence, S. & Ishikawa, J. (2005). "Trade union membership and collective bargaining coverage." *Social Dialogue Indicators*. Retrieved October 5, 2010 from [http://www.ilo.org/public/english/dialogue/ifpdial/downloads/papers/4\\_3\\_411\\_wp-59.pdf](http://www.ilo.org/public/english/dialogue/ifpdial/downloads/papers/4_3_411_wp-59.pdf)

- Work–family balance for women and men, highlighting the constituent organizations
- Issues relating to harassment at work.

Part of the project’s approach could be to encourage internal gender reviews by constituents to lead to gender strategy development. This would provide an opportunity for active capacity building. The ITUC has a useful guide on achieving gender equality in trade unions.<sup>32</sup>

## **7 PROJECT IMPACT AND SUSTAINABILITY**

### **7.1 Project Impact and Sustainability**

Evaluation interviews provide personal, anecdotal accounts of the impact that the project has had on individuals and their organization. The reported impacts include—

- A better attitude experienced from employers to trade union representatives’ interventions in 10th of Ramadan City enterprise
- An increased desire to enter into dialogue and meet with tripartite partners, noted almost unanimously by trainees
- Increased personal and professional confidence
- The adoption of improved training techniques, which trainers have found extremely effective in their training work
- Increased active participation in trade union activities and negotiating, particularly for female trainees.

It is too early to assume the sustainability of any claimed changes in employer attitudes. In contrast, it was clear to the evaluator that trainers trained within the project were convinced of the value of the participatory methods they had learned and would continue to apply them. For female trainees, there is every reason to believe that with continued and hopefully increased attention from the project to women’s empowerment and issues particularly impacting on women, those trained will continue to grow in confidence and experience. One trainee expressed the wish to continue to be trained within the project with the long-term ambition to become the leader of her union.

Though it is impossible to substantiate, the evaluator has gained the impression that the project is helping to ensure that issues relating to social dialogue and reform are discussed/considered and kept on the agenda. However, the views expressed by leaders of the constituents related to their attitudes to supporting fundamental rights and reform appear to reflect the long-term stance that their organizations have taken. During evaluation interviews, FEI’s representative was the only representative of the constituents who supported the project’s objective to press for tripartite

---

<sup>32</sup> ITUC. (2007, November). *Action program on achieving gender equality in trade unions*. Retrieved from [http://www.ituc-csi.org/IMG/pdf/Gender\\_Equality\\_-\\_action\\_programme\\_E.pdf](http://www.ituc-csi.org/IMG/pdf/Gender_Equality_-_action_programme_E.pdf)

agreement on an amendment to Labor Act No. 12/2003 law. However, the changes he wanted to see were related to reducing the expectations of workers and the burden on employers. ETUF leaders emphasized that they would resist reform on the issue of trade union multiplicity.

The impact of this project is difficult to assess more objectively for three reasons. First, the absence of baseline and follow-up survey data—as proposed in the indicators of progress and discussed earlier—makes it impossible to objectively measure improvements in knowledge, capacity, and competency that have occurred during the life of the project. Second, in terms of wider changes, Egypt is under consistent international pressure to reform structures, practices, and laws related to labor and trade union rights. The project is only a small player in this international scene, and it would not be easily possible to claim that specific reforms were due to project interventions. Finally, it is to be noted that the areas of project work that could be expected to have a more easily objectively verifiable impact—organizational reviews, audits, and work on legal reform proposals—have not yet really begun.

There are, nonetheless, two impacts that can fairly be recorded:

- As a result of the project's work in 10th of Ramadan City, a protocol of cooperation was signed between the local branch of the Investors' Association and the local ETUF branch, in the presence of the Minister, to bring greater cooperation between workers federations and employers in the industrial zone. This agreement included direct commitments from employers that they would not retrench workers because of the crisis; a tripartite committee was also formed to help companies find solutions to difficulties stemming from the crisis. The zone contains 2,000 industrial enterprises, whose businesses and workers can be expected to benefit from the agreement for years to come.
- In July 2009, a tripartite-plus workshop on social dialogue held in El Menya Governorate led the governor to hold a tripartite meeting and adopt all recommendations from the workshop. These included the announcement of new regulations for the mining industries in the governorate, a fund dedicated to the eradication of child labor in the industry, and regulations to allow workers to benefit from social security funds. The workshop also resulted in the cancellation of rise in tax paid by quarry employers and a commitment to establish a quarry hospital.

In addition to the above, the project can claim to have played a small supporting role in creating the conditions that allowed the formation, in April 2009, of the first independent union, RETA. This is an event that has potentially long-term implications for labor movement, as it effectively creates multiplicity even though this is not allowed in law. The presence of the project and ministerial commitment to its objectives, plus its day-to-day work in raising the profile of labor issues with the constituents, has contributed to creating an environment in which it was possible for RETA to present its registration papers and very difficult for the Minister to not these papers. Another emerging teachers' trade union took the opportunity to present their papers during a project event; however, they were not accepted.

Although it may not necessarily imply a substantive change in position, it is appropriate to report that the CTA was the first outsider to be invited to the opening of ETUF's General Assembly in 2009, suggesting an increased openness, at least toward the project. If the project can make

progress in its work with WEA, as planned, this has the potential for providing further substantive impact for the project.

If the project reaches all of the immediate objectives, then sustainability will be guaranteed through a reformed labor system maintained by the government and overseen by the tripartite constituents, perhaps through the National Labor Council or other tripartite body. However, if the project is not able to build trust and belief in the social dialogue, it will fall to each constituent organization, and the personnel and elected officers within it, to sustain any positive impacts and changes to its own structures or attitudes.

The work undertaken with leaders, human resources managers, and trainers means that the messages absorbed by these participants are likely to be shared over time. The project publications will continue to be available as a reference for years to come. However, there is no obvious organizational structure, perhaps other than ILO, that could ensure longer-term sustainability at this stage.

## **7.2 Innovations**

Many of the publications produced by the project represent innovations in that it is the first time the subjects or particular information has been made available in print in Arabic. The production of a CD containing all the international labor standard is also an original idea.

## **7.3 Preliminary Lessons Learned**

The key lesson learned so far has been the need for extensive awareness raising and trust building before tripartite work or more intrusive/demanding strategies—such as audits, reviews, and processes for legal reforms—can be pushed for. This has meant accepting a slower timetable for progress toward project objectives.

In addition to the above lessons, as the project experienced blockages to its plans for work within Cairo with constituency leaderships and central officials, it learned to increase the focus of work on the governorates, thereby largely avoiding blockages caused by political positioning.

## **7.4 Are Changes in the Project Strategy Recommended at This Point?**

The CTA has rightly kept the project strategy under review, adjusting focus, emphasis, or pace of work as experience is gained. In terms of activities, the CTA has been successful at avoiding blockages and making the most of new openings. However, with 14 months left, subject to extension, this is a good point for the project to take a step back and reconsider its strategy to ensure that all activities and strategies are clearly linked to achieving the immediate objectives. Ideally, this should involve the development of an improved project monitoring plan or logframe.

The project has been forced to accept a slower pace of advancing through the strategy, meaning that it remains in Phase 1. At the same time, the country is now effectively in a long election period, starting with parliamentary elections shortly and ending after the presidential election in November 2011. Evidence from the media suggests that there is a tightening up of security and possibly a lowering of tolerance from the government. Against this background, progress on law reform will be even more difficult to achieve. One possibility is that a new strategy could involve

the project realigning its agenda to feed into the election process, providing information and workshops for new parliamentarians and aspiring candidates. Working with the parliamentarians is also foreseen in the project document. The plan to expand exposure events now being considered by the CTA could fit within such a strategy.

In reality, the possibility of arriving at law reform through the path of building awareness and encouraging tripartism seems minimal, bearing in mind the distractions of the elections. Election periods are also unpredictable times when radical announcements can be made, but it is best not to be too optimistic and instead establish a realistic strategy that can achieve steps toward all of the immediate objectives.

It is obviously important that the strategy for the remainder of the project takes into account an exit plan and that it focuses on the need for sustainable impacts and outcomes. It is equally important that the project emphasizes the incorporation of gender as a crosscutting issue in all planned work.

## **8 CONCLUSIONS**

### **8.1 Validity of Assumptions, Objectives, and Indicators**

This project is a timely intervention and mainly responds to a real need identified by the national constituents to promote social dialogue. It has met problems not predicted in the project document caused by poor relationships between the social partners, reflected in regular street protests at the shop floor level, entrenched attitudes and traditions of labor relations, social partner organizations developed under an authoritarian regime that represent established power bases invested in the status quo, and the absence of a common vision for the future. However, the CTA and the project backstop are both skilled and highly knowledgeable about the labor environment in Egypt. As a result, they have been able to adjust the activities and strategy to the realities of the national situation.

The project has been in operation for 30 months, during which it has made good progress toward the first three objectives, particularly in increasing knowledge of rights and obligations, and in building capacity and willingness to enter into dialogue. It has sought to increase the knowledge, understanding, and capacity of the social partners on social dialogue and fundamental rights through direct contacts with leaderships and a range of awareness-raising and trainings events. The project has also supported the preparation of materials covering national and international labor laws and procedures, labor relations, and social dialogue issues. The project has another 14 months remaining on its original time span.

The fourth objective, on labor law reform to ensure respect of fundamental principles and rights at work, did not have the wholehearted support of the constituents when the project was proposed and continues to meet resistance. However, the project has been successful in promoting understanding of an interest in the principles among participants.

One weakness is that the absence of any gender objectives or indicators and that some problems exist with measurability. In addition, baseline studies for the indicators of progress have not been

conducted, which means the project needs to identify alternative and user-friendly means of measuring progress on these items.

## **8.2 Project Monitoring, Management, and Performance**

The project is generally well managed, benefiting from a skilled CTA, expert support from the ILO backstop, and ongoing support of the Cairo Subregional Office Director. Project progress and project expenditure are actively monitored by the CTA, with the support of the project backstop, through ongoing reviews and quarterly reports. Project expenditure is appropriate, bearing in mind the national situation, and could fund a short extension. The project budget is adequate and does not represent an obstacle for the project.

It is unfortunate that there is no logframe and that the project monitoring plan pushes the focus on to outputs rather than outcomes. Improvements could also be made in monitoring activity participation, including gender participation and consultancies. Despite the efforts of the CTA, the PAC has not yet been formed.

Regarding technical interventions, in its 30 months of operation, the project has carried out successful awareness raising and capacity building through training workshops and conferences, the development of more than 20 publications, and direct contact by the CTA. Eighty-three workshops and training activities have been carried out on 38 different themes, improving individual's skills and understanding related to social dialogue and fundamental rights, and lifting the capacity of their organizations, as well as MoMM, ETUF, FEI, FECC, and the Egyptian Investors' Association.

The project's plan to incorporate tripartite and bipartite events to build trust and increase the experience of social dialogue among the constituents has had more success in the governorates than at the central level.

The CTA is generally well regarded and has developed excellent communication with all partners and participants, with the exception of the Minister, who is, unfortunately, unhappy with his approach. ILO is working to resolve this issue. Trainees are positive about the training delivered, as are constituent leaders. Training is regarded as being of high quality and highly relevant to the target groups.

Those interviewed for the evaluation reported increased knowledge and confidence. *Training of trainer* participants reported using newly learned participatory techniques in their work, with noticeable results. Interviewees also reported being more aware of the value of social dialogue and how to conduct it, expressing the desire for increased joint training and other tripartite exposure. The discussions revealed a high level of understanding of the issues of social dialogue and the nature of fundamental rights at work. However, the absence of baselines and data makes it difficult to objectively verify the increase in knowledge or change in the capacity of trainees. This is an issue that needs to be addressed in the near term.

Project activities have created verifiable impacts through the organization of a tripartite conference on social dialogue and through success with joint training in the governorates. The latter led to concrete protocols/agreements being signed and improving industrial relations

immediately impacting unions, enterprises, and workers. This represents a small but welcome signal that the project is supporting progress toward responsive and skilled trade unions and an increased use of social dialogue.

Though it is impossible to substantiate, the evaluator has also gained the impression that the project is helping to ensure that issues related to social dialogue and reform are discussed/considered and are kept on the agenda of participating organizations.

### **8.3 Strategy**

The strategy for the project seems to be a coherent and appropriate approach to achieving the identified objectives, but is somewhat overoptimistic about what can be achieved in the lifetime of the project. The project is appropriately targeted, save that the national environment excludes the possibility of cooperation with relevant NGOs and emerging trade unions. Another exception to this endorsement relates to the absence of gender consideration, which should be urgently addressed.

Bearing in mind the difficult national labor environment and the entrenched attitudes displayed, more stress could have been placed on awareness raising and trust building in the strategy, and a longer timeline before later audits and reviews take place. However, flexibility was foreseen.

### **8.4 Replicability and Sustainability**

The strategies adopted by the project appear to be having an impact and could be replicated elsewhere. The combination of work at both central and regional/governorate levels has been particularly effective in allowing space for continuing progress.

Currently, sustainability of impact is guaranteed only by the protocols signed in two governorates and the continuing role of all trained participants in their organizations. In this regard, targeting those with real influence on labor relations at all levels and on reform—constituent leaders, labor administrators, human resources managers, and officials—has been an appropriate strategy.

### **8.5 Recommendations**

Because of the likely impact that the forthcoming elections will have on the national environment and the fact that the project only has 14 months remaining without extension, it may be time to take a step back and re-strategize. This process should involve identifying and planning for interventions that can help the project move forward during the remaining period and achieve maximum sustainability. An exit strategy will need to be an integral part of this effort.

This re-strategizing process could usefully include—

- Development of a logframe or improved project monitoring plan to reduce the focus on outputs and make the links between outputs/activities and impacts more explicit

- Increased focus on establishing functioning models of tripartite and bipartite social dialogue and providing joint experiences and exposures around themes that are not so politically charged
- Focus on sustainability, including reducing the CTA's direct role in training delivery
- Because only 14 months remain, urgent consideration of launching the emerging trade union leaders training
- Development of a gender mainstreaming policy and gender indicators.

---

# **ANNEXES**

---



# **ANNEX A: TERMS OF REFERENCE FOR THE MIDTERM EVALUATION**

---

## **Terms of Reference for the Midterm Evaluation of the Promoting the Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work and Social Dialogue Project in Egypt**

### **I. PROJECT BACKGROUND**

On January 14, 2008, the International Labour Organization (ILO) was awarded a three-year cooperative agreement to implement Promoting the Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work and Social Dialogue in Egypt, to promote an appropriate legal environment and a culture of consultation and dialogue based on the Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work embodied in the ILO Declaration of 1998 and in particular, to freedom of association and the effective recognition of the right to collective bargaining. The responsible USDOL division for this cooperative agreement is the Office of Trade and Labor Affairs (OTLA).

The project seeks to address the specific challenges of government, employers, and workers in Egypt with a particular focus on realizing the Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work as enshrined in the ILO Declaration of 1998. Accordingly, the direct target group for the project is the leadership and decision makers in the Ministry of Manpower and Migration and the leadership, senior members and staff of employers' and workers' organizations working at national, provincial and/or district levels. The project also works with members of parliament, other Ministries as deemed necessary and civil society organizations. In addition, the project reaches out to the public at large through direct information and advocacy campaigns.

The project is designed to promote an appropriate legal environment and a culture of consultation and dialogue based on the Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work embodied in the ILO Declaration of 1998. The project's four Immediate Objectives are: 1) Workers and employers are more knowledgeable of their rights and obligations and are increasingly engaging in constructive dialogue and negotiations; 2) Independent, competent and representative employers' and workers' organizations are able to better represent and defend the interests of their members; 3) the Ministry of Manpower has a strengthened capacity to prevent and settle labor disputes; and 4) Labor legislation is reformed in order to bring it into conformity with ratified ILO Conventions and the principles of the Declaration.

### **II. EVALUATION PURPOSE AND SCOPE**

#### **A. Evaluation Purpose**

This midterm evaluation should provide USDOL, ILO, other project specific stakeholders, and stakeholders working to promote an appropriate legal environment and culture based on the ILO Declaration of 1998, an assessment of the project's experience in implementation thus far and its impact on realizing the Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work. It will also be used by USDOL and ILO to continue or revamp project strategies, as necessary.

The purpose of the midterm evaluation for this project is to:

1. Determine if the project strategy is valid or should be amended;
2. Determine whether the project is on track toward meeting its objectives and identify the challenges encountered in doing so;
3. Assess the effectiveness of the project's strategies and the project's strengths and weaknesses in project implementation and identify areas in need of improvement;
4. Assess whether project activities can be deemed sustainable in Egypt and among local partners, and identify steps that can be taken to enhance the sustainability of project components and objectives; and
5. Provide recommendations toward how the project can successfully overcome challenges to meet its objectives and targets by the time of project end.

## **B. Evaluation Scope**

The scope of the evaluation includes a review and assessment of all activities carried out under the USDOL Cooperative Agreement with ILO. All activities that have been implemented from project launch up until the time of evaluation fieldwork should be considered. The evaluation should assess the achievements of the project in reaching its targets and objectives as outlined in the cooperative agreement and project document.

The midterm evaluation of this project will:

1. Evaluate the validity of the project strategy, objectives and assumptions.
2. Examine the factors contributing to the challenges of the government, employers and workers in Egypt, in bringing about a legislative framework that is in harmony with International Labor Standards and in improving the culture of dialogue and bargaining, particularly challenges in the enabling environment.
3. Evaluate the benefit to or impact on the target population in qualitative terms.
4. Evaluate the effectiveness, efficiency and equity of project implementation to date in terms of activities completed, materials developed and used, work plan and budget execution.
5. Assess the sustainability of the project results, including:
  - a. Identification of the actors, organizational structures and strategies for sustainability
  - b. Coherence between project objectives and sustainability
  - c. Results that establish conditions for sustainability.

6. Assess the project management performance, including the role of the Subregional Office and Declaration in Geneva. The assessment should look at:
  - a. Strategic planning—project cycle, annual, monthly and weekly—based on PMP
  - b. Organizational structure and staff functions at each level of responsibility
  - c. Systematic supervision, monitoring, evaluation and verification
  - d. Leadership at each level, in terms of quality and timely fulfillment of responsibilities, demonstrated capacity to make decisions based on appropriate and adequate criteria, and demonstrated capacity to coordinate activities with other sectors.
  - e. Support from USDOL.
7. Assess the effectiveness of the project monitoring plan on the basis of quality, timeliness and costs.
8. Assess the impact of new methods and techniques, including:
  - a. Training, e.g., guides for workers, training for media, leadership courses for “emerging trade union leaders,” training on International Labor Standards
  - b. Administration, e.g., contracts and budgets
  - c. Awareness raising (in media channels)
  - d. Technical assistance implemented at multiple levels, e.g., assisting the Ministry of Manpower and Migration with improved policies, personnel policies and management capacity; reviewing the curricula of the workers education association; and reform of certain articles of labor legislation.
9. Document preliminary lessons learned.

### **C. Specific Evaluation Questions**

1. Validity of the project strategy, objectives and assumptions:
  - a. Are the objectives and associated indicators realistic given the project timeframe, budgetary resources, and interventions proposed?
  - b. Are the original critical assumptions valid and or have they changed? If so, how?
  - c. Are changes to the project strategy recommended at this point?
2. Describe and analyze factors, such as the enabling environment, contributing to the challenges of the government, employers and workers in Egypt, in bringing about a legislative framework that is in harmony with International Labor Standards.

3. Benefit to or impact on the target population in qualitative terms.
4. Effectiveness, efficiency and equity of project implementation to date in terms of activities completed, materials developed and used, work plan and budget execution:
  - a. Activities: Which activities have been well received by the target audience? Why? Are there any activities that were not well received or were not carried out as planned? Why? Has there been any follow-up to these activities?
  - b. Materials: What training materials have been developed or used by the project? In which venues? How were these materials received by the participants/target audience? Are any changes or additions needed to make these materials more appropriate? Has the project used or shared the new materials with other projects, organizations, or the ministries? Have they been combined with preexisting materials, where appropriate?
  - c. Work plan: Is the current work plan an accurate reflection of the activities that have been, and will be carried out to meet the project objectives? If not, what modifications have been or need to be made?
  - d. Budget: What modifications have been made to the budget? How efficiently has the project operated given the resources allocated?
5. Sustainability of the project results:
  - a. Which actors and/or organizational structures have expressed commitment in terms of the project's sustainability? In what ways have they committed to the project? Have there been any barriers to obtaining this commitment? Explain.
  - b. Is there a written sustainability strategy? Is the plan an accurate reflection of the current activities leading to sustainability?
  - c. Is there consistency between project objectives and the sustainability plan?
  - d. Have the project results thus far indicated adequate conditions for sustainability?
6. Project management performance (personnel and communications):
  - a. What have been the strengths and weaknesses of the project management team in the following areas:
    - i. Strategic planning—project cycle, annual, monthly and weekly—based on PMP
    - ii. Project organization in terms of structure and staff functions at each level of responsibility
    - iii. Systematic supervision, monitoring, evaluation and verification

- iv. Leadership at each level in terms of quality and timely fulfillment of responsibilities, and demonstrated capacity to make decisions and coordinate activities with other sectors?
  - b. What support has USDOL provided? In what ways could this be improved or expanded?
7. Effective project monitoring, on basis of quality, timeliness and costs:
- a. Who is responsible for monitoring the project at its various levels?
  - b. Is the performance monitoring system practical, useful and cost effective?
  - c. Have any problems been encountered with project indicators or the collection and reporting of data?
  - d. How has the ongoing collection of data been used to guide project activities?
8. Impact of new methods and techniques:  
What have been the strengths and weaknesses of the new methods and techniques used by the project, including:
- a. Training, e.g., guides for workers, training for media, leadership courses for “emerging trade union leaders, “ training on ILS
  - b. Administration, e.g., contracts and budgets
  - c. Awareness raising (in media channels)
  - d. Technical assistance implemented at multiple levels, e.g., assisting the Ministry of Manpower and Migration with improved policies, personnel policies and management capacity; reviewing the curricula of the workers education association; and reform of certain articles of labor legislation
9. Lessons Learned:
- a. What has the project done effectively that could be applied elsewhere?
  - b. What specific changes in implementation might produce better results?
  - c. What are some of lessons learned regarding the non-participation in/with the project, in terms of the country, sector/company, other applicable groups (certain unions/NGOs)

### **III. EVALUATION METHODS, TIMEFRAME, DELIVERABLES, AND MANAGEMENT**

#### **A. Methods**

The evaluation methodology will consist of the following:

1. Document review (project document, strategic framework, work plans, quarterly reports, trip reports, training materials, event reports, etc.)
2. Planning meeting: USDOL, ILO Declaration, evaluator, project staff to discuss evaluation protocols, logistics and work plan, methods, type of data required, responsibilities and products
3. Interviews (individual or in groups) of key informants: USDOL project manager, ILO Declaration manager, Subregional office staff, local partners, workshop participants, consultative group representatives, representatives of the Ministry of Manpower and Migration and relevant department staff, and representatives of employers organizations and trade unions, other beneficiaries (e.g. media)
4. Field visits for verification
5. Qualitative questionnaires and corresponding data matrices
6. Post field visit meeting

This is not a formal impact assessment. Findings for the evaluation will be based on information collected from background documents and in interviews with stakeholders, project staff, and beneficiaries. The accuracy of the evaluation findings will be determined by the integrity of information provided to the evaluator from these sources. Furthermore, the ability of the evaluator to determine efficiency will be limited by the amount of financial data available. A cost-efficiency analysis is not included because it would require impact data which is not available.

#### **B. Deliverables**

1. Planning meeting
2. Protocols: objectives, methods, development of activities, conclusions and recommendations
3. Interview data documented in matrices
4. Analysis of data matrices
5. Minutes of post field-visit meeting
6. First draft of report
7. Final Report

## C. Timeline

Tasks	Dates
<b>Pre-Fieldwork</b>	
Desk Review of Project Materials and Interviews with USDOL & Project staff	September 2010
<b>Fieldwork</b>	
International travel (if applicable)	October 10
Field work in Cairo	October 11-14
Post-field visit meeting (project staff only)	October 14 (afternoon)
International travel (if applicable)	October 15
<b>Post-Fieldwork</b>	
Draft report to ICF Macro	November 8
Due to USDOL & ILO for review	November 10
Comments Received from USDOL & ILO	November 26
Finalization of Document	TBD

## D. Report

The evaluator will submit to OTLA and ILO Declaration an evaluation report that includes at minimum the following sections:

- a. Table of Contents
- b. Executive Summary, providing an overview of the evaluation and summary of main findings and recommendations
- c. List of Acronyms
- d. Project Background
- e. Evaluation Purpose and Methods
- f. Findings
- g. Conclusions
- h. Recommendations
- i. Lessons Learned
- j. Annexes, including: data matrices, list of interviews/meetings, documents reviewed, TOR, etc.

The total length of the report will be approximately 40 pages, excluding annexes. The organizational format for the presentation of findings, lessons learned, conclusions, recommendations etc. is at the discretion of the evaluator.

The first draft of the report will be circulated to OTLA and ILO individually for their review. Comments will be consolidated and incorporated into the final reports as appropriate, and the evaluator will provide a response to OTLA and ILO Declaration as to why any comments might not have been incorporated (if applicable). While the substantive content of the findings, conclusions, and recommendations of the report shall be determined by the evaluator, the report is subject to final approval by OTLA and ILO Declaration in terms of whether or not the report meets the conditions of the TOR.

## **E. Evaluation Management and Support**

ICF Macro has contracted with Ms. Andrea Prince to conduct this evaluation. Ms. Prince is a practicing lawyer with specializations in employment law, particularly safety and health. In addition, she has worked on labor and social justice programs as an international consultant. She recently completed an 18-month assignment with ILO Geneva with three components: She managed two programs to improve labor conditions for agricultural businesses in five African countries, and she also evaluated existing ILO training programs and wrote and edited new training modules. The work had funding from several international donors, including DANIDA, the French government, and ILO-IPEC. She has also done project evaluations for the European Commission and for ILO in Indonesia. Ms. Prince earned her law degree at the Guildford College of Law; she also has a post-graduate certificate in professional communications.

ICF Macro will provide all logistical and administrative support for their staff and sub-contractors, including travel arrangements (e.g., plane and hotel reservations, purchasing plane tickets, providing *per diem*, translator costs, ground transportation) and all materials needed to provide all deliverables. ICF Macro will also be responsible for providing the management and technical oversight necessary to ensure consistency of methods and technical standards.

The main contact person for ILO Declaration is Mr. Wael Issa ([wael-issa@ilo.org](mailto:wael-issa@ilo.org)).

## ANNEX B: FINAL PROJECT DOCUMENT

---

### INTERNATIONAL LABOUR ORGANIZATION TECHNICAL COOPERATION PROJECT

<b>Project Number:</b>	EGY/07/03/USA
<b>Project Title:</b>	Promoting the Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work and Social Dialogue in Egypt
<b>Duration:</b>	Three years
<b>Geographical Coverage:</b>	Egypt
<b>Project Office:</b>	Cairo, Egypt
<b>Project Language:</b>	English, Arabic
<b>Executing Agency:</b>	ILO
<b>Donor Contribution:</b>	Approx. US\$2.4 million
<b>National Contributions:</b>	In kind
<b>Starting Date:</b>	14 January 2008 (actual start date 14 April 2008)
<b>Completion Date:</b>	31 December 2011

### BACKGROUND

Since 2004, the Government of Egypt dedicated to reforming the economy, has introduced a number of significant modernizing reforms. Partly as a result of these developments, the economy recorded 6.8% growth in 2005/06, a rate not seen for a decade.

The reform measures of the government led by Prime Minister Nazif, that included a significant reduction of red tape and a simplification of the taxation system, have contributed significantly to boosting the economy. However serious weaknesses remain. Unemployment is growing, as is the budget deficit.

The ILO has followed with great interest the measures taken by the Egyptian government to improve the conditions of labour and to institutionalize social dialogue. While the new unified labour law introduced in 2003 represents a significant improvement over the preceding legislation, there remain a number of discrepancies with ILO Conventions.

There is a growing realization on the part of the government that the changing economic environment of globalization means that appropriate measures should be adopted to develop a globally competitive economy, notably through creating an environment conducive to consultation and introducing a policy of empowerment of individuals by providing them with the necessary means for their affirmation as economic, social and political actors. Awareness of one's rights and duties and the development of independent legal entities to represent and ensure

the expression of those rights and duties are core elements that have to be nurtured to cement a climate of confidence for long-term stability and sustainable development.

Egyptian policy makers and other social partners have a common challenge to face; how to enable the economy to realize its potential in a competitive world. This will only be possible if a solid culture of negotiation and dialogue is developed, as a means to secure nationwide respect for the core labour standards that underpin the ILO Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work.

Social dialogue values and instruments are important components of an effective policy addressing the pressing need to fight poverty and to enhance a climate of consensus and stability. The best way to achieve this is to ensure the engagement of all stakeholders in the process of legislation and its implementation. A long-term strategy for full employment and competitiveness can only succeed if it is jointly owned by a broad spectrum of the population.

## **Social and Economic Situation**

Egypt has come a long way in a short time. In 2005/06, the government's reform policies combined with increased gas exports and strong non-oil growth led to a rise in real GDP growth of 6.8% compared to 4.5% recorded in the previous year. The reform programme, which began in 2004, can already claim significant achievements. Fiscal reforms have helped reduce the budget deficit to 7.9% of GDP in 2005/06, compared to 11% at the turn of the decade; external debt has fallen by 10% in the past four years to 17% of GDP; and the economy enjoys healthy surpluses in the current account. Egypt has substantial success in attracting private investment, particularly from overseas. Privatization proceeds in 2005/06 were £E15,000 million, almost as much as the previous four years combined, and foreign direct investment rose to 5.7% of GDP from an average of 0.6% in the period 2001 to 2004. The implementation of banking reforms has helped boost Central Bank of Egypt reserves to \$23,000 million, up 56% from the end of fiscal year 2003/04, and eradicate the parallel currency exchange market. The growth of gas production has been strong and is expected to reach 8% of GDP by 2010, according to the ratings agency, Standard & Poor's. In 2007, the World Bank ranked Egypt number one for trade-policy reforms out of 155 countries.

Despite strong growth, the issue of unemployment, budget deficit and double digit inflation still need to be addressed. According to the UNDP's 2005 Human Development Report, 43.9% of Egyptians live on less than \$2 a day. The drive to increase the efficiency of local industry inevitably exerts pressure on the job market. The weakness of the education system has created a structural education/skills gap. Unemployment is officially at 10% with youth unemployment measured at 29% according to recent figures from the Central Agency for Public Mobilization and Statistics.

UNDP's 2005 Human Development Indicators rank Egypt 119th out of 177 countries. Given population growth of 2% per year and around 600 000 new entrants to the labour market every year, per capita growth has increased only modestly. In January 2006, Prime Minister Nazif announced in Parliament that the fight against unemployment, extension of social protection and the reform of education and health care would be at the top of his Government's agenda. This vision was reflected in Egypt's Human Development Report for 2005 published in January 2006.

That same year the government produced a courageous National Strategy to combat the worst forms of child labour, with ILO support to refine it; and would now like to address other fundamental principles and rights at work.

## **Political Reforms**

The 2005 elections marked a step forward in the democratization process in Egypt. Despite many restrictive laws related to freedom of association, considerable efforts were exerted by the President to promote development of a multiparty political system by amending Article 76 of the Constitution in May 2005. While many were sceptical about the serious nature of the reforms, this showed a willingness to move away from the legacy of the previous decades and to clearly indicate a break with previous policies and practices and create a momentum for change and progress.

Further amendments were introduced in the Constitution in 2007, designed to reflect and affirm the new orientations regarding economic policy in particular. They also emphasized the principle of citizenship as a basis of political and social freedoms. One of the salient features of these amendments is the affirmation that parties should not be based on religious affiliations, and that religious issues should be kept away from the political sphere.

Another significant thrust was the creation of the National Council for Human Rights in 2004 under the chairmanship of the former UN Secretary-General, Boutros Boutros Ghali. This council was created to promote human rights in Egypt, and prepares an annual report on this issue. This report is submitted to the government and to civil society organizations. This is a positive development, and there are desires to expand its mandate in conformity with relevant international standards. Generally speaking, this council has helped to enhance social dialogue and freedom of expression.

## **Labour Market—Social Partners**

### ***The New Egyptian Labour Code***

The Egyptian Labour Code of 12/2003 is an attempt to adapt to the requirements of the market economy. It is aimed at introducing provisions in conformity with the new economic and social orientations. It represents a significant improvement compared to its predecessor and it intended to settle labour disputes through social dialogue that encompasses all types of negotiations, consultations and data exchange on issues of common interest. This requires building the capacity for consultations and collective bargaining, which constitute the essence of dialogue in keeping with Convention No. 87 on freedom of association and the protection of the right to organize, and Convention No. 98 on the right to organize and collective bargaining. According to the Labour Code, the State has to intervene to create an appropriate climate for the stability of labour relations through the establishment of legislative and institutional frameworks to enhance social dialogue on the basis of consultation and negotiation. This culture should be nurtured in the work place to promote understanding and harmony. For the Egyptian Labour Code to achieve its goal democracy has to be developed further and fundamental rights guaranteed, especially freedom of expression and association.

### **Settlement of Labour Disputes**

The Ministry of Manpower and Migration (MoMM) launched in 2006/2007 a campaign to raise awareness among workers and employers regarding the importance of collective bargaining and its role in settling labour disputes.<sup>33</sup> This campaign aimed at familiarizing the parties concerned with basic information regarding negotiations as a means of facing the challenges created by the liberalized economy, especially the privatization process. In fact, after decades of authoritarian rule, the Egyptian society needs to acquire an understanding of such new concepts. The Labour Code of 2003 contains articles, which define procedures of collective bargaining, and proposes mechanisms for overcoming difficulties that may arise in the process. If it proves difficult to reach an agreement, one of the parties may resort to the Department of Labour Relations in MoMM for mediation. If the mediator chosen by the two parties fails to settle the dispute, arbitration is to be used. The arbitration board on which all parties are represented shall decide and its decision shall be final unless a party chooses to go to court.

Employers tend to refrain from collective bargaining, and are often reluctant to engage in dialogue. This may be attributed to lack of awareness and trained personnel in negotiation and bargaining. In many cases, dialogue faces many difficulties because of rigid attitudes. The Labour Code calls for collective bargaining between employers and workers to settle certain disputes amicably, and defines the conciliation and dispute settlement procedures (please see relevant articles Annex X).

In order to settle disputes, both parties should be fully convinced that their interests lie together. Employers still tend to believe that they have the upper hand, and may underestimate the importance of trade unions. The recent phenomenon of strikes should demonstrate and convince employers that there is a change in culture whereby trade unions should be accepted as partners and as a natural development. Hence, the need for employers to adopt an open-door policy towards them and engage in dialogue and negotiations. On the other hand, trade unions should train their members in the field of collective negotiations, the economics of an enterprise and the rights and duties of workers. This training should be a process, not an event, especially as things are moving quickly. Trade unions should also work wholeheartedly to defend the interests of workers and strengthen the ties with their constituency.

### **The Role of the Government**

Under the 2003 Labour Code, the government should be neutral; its role should shift from that of control to that of protection. It should work to create a conducive environment for labour-management relations. Labour administrators and inspectors should be trained to assimilate the new concepts introduced in the 2003 Labour Code. Their role should be to advise and conciliate between both parties, rather than policing them.

In 2006, the Ministry of Manpower and Migration sent out questionnaires to assess the implementation of the new Egyptian Labour Code of 2003. Responses showed that a certain degree of progress has been achieved, but there is still much room for improvement especially regarding dispute settlement through cordial agreements and negotiations. Many enterprises are

---

<sup>33</sup> Study on Raising Awareness of social partners of the importance of collective bargaining and its role in settling collective disputes, prepared by the Ministry of Labour, 2006, p.7–10.

not even aware of the existence of dispute settlement mechanisms under the new Labour Code. Some employers are still opposed to the formation of union branches in their enterprises.<sup>34</sup>

### ***Employers' and Workers' Organizations***

**The most representative organization of Egyptian employers is the *Federation of Egyptian Industries (FEI)*.** Founded in 1921, at present FEI comprises 15 industrial sectoral chambers representing a total of about 18,000 enterprises, both from the public and the private sectors. The principal functions of this organization are:

- To represent its members' interests with governmental and other official authorities;
- To share views with and consult the Government on industrial policies and strategies, as well as on any national tripartite socio-economic scheme;
- To render services to its member enterprises either directly or through their respective industrial chambers, including retraining and skills upgrading of the labour force;
- To represent its members in negotiations with trade unions;
- To represent the Egyptian employers and their organizations in regional and international organizations.

The federation is composed of 16 Chambers and 12 Decision Support Committees which have the function to develop programs and services to facilitate and support the various industries within Egypt.<sup>35</sup>

The FEI's present structure is composed as follows: the General Assembly, which elects a Board of Directors, presided over by a Chairman. This Board has the executive power within the organisation and appoints a Director General who is in charge of the Secretariat. Three Deputy Directors help the Director to run the FEI services. The Chairman, deputies and seven of the sixteen members of the board of Directors are appointed by the Ministry of Industry.

As for trade unions in Egypt, there are 23 official trade unions, each representing a different industry or service. Total membership was 4.5 million in 2001, which corresponds to 25% of total labour force. Most union members belong to the services sectors and public agencies. Some 25% of union members work in public manufacturing enterprises. Only 25% are private sector workers. At the company level, unions are organized in committees. As of 2000, 1,641 committees had been established. Any trade union must be affiliated to the *Egyptian Trade Union Federation (ETUF)*, which is the only legally recognized trade union federation.

---

<sup>34</sup> Op. cit., p.45–61

<sup>35</sup> <http://www.fei.org.eg/default.asp>

## **Business Associations**

Business Associations are gradually becoming private voluntary organizations aiming to harness the resources of members to work as a powerful force for change. New ones are emerging, driven by a genuine need for reforming the economic climate in their countries.

**The American Chamber of Commerce in Egypt** (AmCham Egypt), one of the largest and most active overseas affiliates of the U.S. Chamber of Commerce, has the mandate to promote economic and investment relations between the United States and Egypt since 1982. It has over 1300 members consisting of U.S. companies doing business in Egypt and Egyptian companies doing business in the U.S. It has been instrumental in promoting corporate social responsibility within the business community.

### ***Egyptian Junior Business Association (EJB)***

The EJB's vision is regrouping Egyptian Junior Business people who are committed to the development of a culture of excellence, ethics and public service. The Association comprises a General Assembly of more than 350 members, representing over 170 thousand employees and labour. The membership base is diverse and covering the majority of sectors in the Egyptian Business Community. In so doing, the members are divided into their committees within the *Business Environment Council* that seeks to assist in the development of sound policies supporting the improvement of the business climate in Egypt. Members are also seeking to strengthen and promote business among them as a means to enhance and network opportunities along with offering a range of training programs to develop their capabilities within the *Business Affairs Council*. Moreover, the members aspire to better the society at large through their contribution in the *Community Development Council*. Each of the three councils has its annual work plan along with the projects they seek to accomplish on an annual basis.

## **Problem Identification and Analysis**

There were some 220 strikes and work stoppages in Egypt in the last two years in 88 work places, including recently (September 2007) a strike in the textile factory of El Mehalah El Kubra that involved 27 000 workers. A strike had already taken place there in December 2006. Despite some claims that the strike has been exploited for political reasons, a number of workers claim that it is a result of serious and long standing problems they have been facing, such as low salaries, rising cost-of-living, soaring prices etc. Some workers claim that the present trade unions do not express their real grievances in a transparent and sincere manner and that government interferes in union affairs. It appears that there is a widening crisis of confidence between workers and trade unions. The government claims that the state has written off a debt of about one billion Egyptian pounds to relieve the burdens of this factory. Even if a compromise seems to have been reached, there remain structural problems related to social dialogue that need to be addressed to avoid similar situations in the future.

Furthermore, the political and economic situation in Egypt has changed in many ways. The privatization process that has gained momentum in the last year witnessed unrest in industrial relations, partly due to certain measures taken by employers to reduce jobs and to restructure

their enterprises. Tension and unrest are exacerbated by unemployment, particularly among young graduates.

While the 2003 Labour Code contains provisions that aim at protecting workers' rights and encouraging collective bargaining, the gap between theory and practice is wide. Further action is still needed to spread the culture of social dialogue, increase awareness, promote collective bargaining and the conclusion of collective agreements. Both workers and employers need to be educated so as to be able to embrace the concepts of modern labour relations. These relations need to be institutionalized at all levels, national, sectoral and enterprise.

### **Legal Framework**

Egypt has ratified the eight core ILO Conventions including C. 87 on Freedom of Association and Protection of the Right to Organize and C. 98 on the Right to Organize and Collective Bargaining. As noted, a new Labour Code was introduced in 2003 to address some of the shortcomings in the legal environment. However, a number of discrepancies remain between the national legislation and the ILO Conventions. These concerns are highlighted in the reports of the ILO Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations (CEACR, 2003)<sup>36</sup> for C. 87 ratified by Egypt and need to be addressed.

With respect to C.98 there is a need to address questions such as compulsory arbitration as opposed to being mutually agreed upon and the silence of the labour Code on the prohibition or imposition of penalties against acts of interference by employers or their organizations into the functioning and administration of workers' organizations and vice versa.

In companies with 50 workers or more, negotiation occurs between the union committee on an enterprise level, the general union on the industry level, and the employer. However, according to the Labour Code, workers in establishments with less than 50 workers cannot participate directly in negotiations on the improvement of working conditions. This is a considerable limitation, given that in Egypt, the majority of total workers in the non-agricultural private sector are employed in establishments with less than 50 workers.

Accordingly, and in order to bring about a legislative framework that is in harmony with International Labour Standards, there is a need to review certain articles in the Labour Code.

### **Target Groups and Partners**

The project will seek to address the specific challenges of government, employers, and workers in Egypt with a particular focus on realizing the Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work as enshrined in the ILO Declaration of 1998.

Accordingly, the direct target group will be the leadership and decision makers in the Ministry of Manpower and Migration and the leadership, senior members and staff of employers' and workers' organizations working at national, provincial and/or district levels.

---

<sup>36</sup> CEACR, an independent body of highly distinguished legal experts established by the ILO in the 1920's to assess the application of ILO Conventions in the individual countries.

The project will also work with members of parliament, other Ministries as deemed necessary and civil society organizations. In addition, it will seek to reach the public at large through direct information and advocacy campaigns.

## **Project Objectives**

The project is designed to promote appropriate legal environment and a culture of consultation and dialogue based on the Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work embodied in the ILO Declaration of 1998.

### ***Immediate Objective 1 (Months 1–36)***

Workers and employers are more knowledgeable of their rights and obligations and are increasingly engaging in constructive dialogue and negotiations.

#### **Indicators of progress:**

- Random sample survey of workers' and employers' knowledge of their rights and obligations.
- Increase in the number of information material on rights at work.
- Increase in the number of media awareness raising programmes and articles.

### ***Immediate Objective 2 (Months 1–36)***

Independent, competent and representative employers' and workers' organizations which are able to better represent and defend the interests of their members.

#### **Indicators of progress:**

- Regular meetings of union members;
- Democratic election of union leaders;
- Democratic election of employers' leaders;
- Number of tripartite and bipartite meetings;
- Review of decisions from tripartite and bipartite meetings.

### ***Immediate Objective 3 (Months 1–36)***

The Ministry of Manpower has a strengthened capacity to prevent and settle labour disputes.

#### **Indicators of progress:**

- Pre-and post-training assessment of the knowledge of trained staff.

- Increase in the number of disputes prevented.
- Increase in the number of disputes settled before going to court.

#### **Immediate Objective 4 (Months 18–36)**

Reform labour legislation in order to bring it into conformity with ratified ILO Conventions and the principles of the Declaration

#### **Indicators of progress:**

- A proposal for revising certain articles in the Labour Code that are inconsistent with ILS, which receives favourable comments from the ILO technical experts.

#### **Project Strategy**

The first phase of the project will be devoted to laying the groundwork for the implementation process and to bring about changes in legislation. The project strategy will draw upon previous relevant projects and experiences in Egypt, such as the DANIDA funded Workers' Education project in the mid 1990s. It could also benefit from similar projects carried in developing and developed countries. For historical and pragmatic reasons, the proposed strategy will adopt a gradual and flexible approach so as to be able to change long-established attitudes, traditions and practices. Evaluation and follow-up activities are to be embedded also in this strategy and in the project as a whole in order to measure progress and avoid shortcomings. Coordination with a national body is also vital for the project. This national body could be a tripartite committee mandated to work closely with the project management team on all project objectives. Periodic meetings between the two sides should be fixed to assess progress in attaining targets. This tripartite committee will be exposed to different International and regional labour relations and legislation experiences.

#### **Awareness Raising and Training**

A nationwide awareness raising campaign will be developed to educate workers and employers alike, especially in areas where factories and enterprises are concentrated such as Cairo, Alexandria and several urban cities in Gharbiya and Upper Egypt.

Due to the size of the population, the project will have to depend heavily on the mass media outlets in the form of TV, Radio and print. The media materials should be as simple and clear as possible to help convey the message. It could also be modified to respond to specific needs and target group's literacy and education level. Editorial round tables will be organized to train and provide media professionals with relevant perspectives and insights in the domain. Media consultants will be contracted to design a set of core communication materials. This will include an introductory guide to the Labour Code and its enforcement process, posters, fact sheets using graphics for none and semi-literate workers, technical briefs which guide the reader through the process of applying specific laws and services and relevant information posted on websites. The project will test the products through message development workshops with the tripartite partners.

Implementation will involve a broad, multi-tiered approach in ensuring that the messages remain accurate and continue to resonate with the audiences. The project will organize a number of high visibility thematic events and encounters with select organizations as part of the campaign. The events will include high-profile roundtables with leading academics, interactive workshops with key representatives of the social partners, foreign investors and the chambers of commerce, and lunchtime talks with personalities who are knowledgeable and supportive of the labour laws and the related services.

This campaign will aim at promoting a culture of dialogue as a means for settling labour disputes, while stressing the common objectives of both workers and employers in order to advance working conditions, productivity and competitiveness. A primary objective of the strategy will be to address the lack of trust between the social partners. Both parties will be educated so as to be fully aware of their duties and obligations, in accordance with the recent Labour Code of 2003. This educational process will also familiarize the parties concerned with the new orientations of the Egyptian economy and the social impact of economic reform.

At the level of employers' and workers' organizations, the project will focus on building their capacity to engage in bi-partite and tri-partite negotiations and collective bargaining.

The aim is to enable employers and workers to conclude collective agreements that cover the broad concerns of both parties.

At least thirty trade unionists and ten employers will be selected and trained as trainers. They will constitute the core of the training specialists to be used by the project. Training workshops will be held, including ToTs on ILS, national legislation, trade union functions, management, leadership and publicity, basic economics of an enterprise, dispute prevention and collective bargaining and negotiation skills for trade unionists. For employers, training will cover ILS, national legislation, the functions of employers' organizations, management and leadership, dispute prevention and collective bargaining and negotiation skills. In this respect, ILO training materials will be used and adapted where necessary to the needs of the country. Candidates for training positions are to be nominated by the tripartite parties. They will be tested and evaluated on the courses covering skills and knowledge, will receive certificates if they pass and have their names registered in a database of "certified trainers" maintained by the project- following ILO guideline for protecting confidential information. The certified trainers will constitute a pool of resource persons available to use by the project in carrying out a large number of training and awareness raising workshops for employers and workers at the provincial and enterprise level.

In addition, courses will be developed to train "emerging trade union leaders" to help develop a knowledgeable and skilled base of workers that can advance the objectives of decent work. This new generation of union leaders will be trained to assume responsibilities in a new era characterized by openness and transparency. The project management team will draw on ILO's similar experiences in Indonesia and Morocco.

Employers will also be targeted to overcome their inherent mistrust of unions. Seminars will be organized to make them fully aware of the benefits of establishing a constructive dialogue and relationship with workers and their representatives. They will be exposed to international and regional experiences in this field.

In collaboration with the social partners, the project will undertake a comprehensive review of the mandates, constitutions, internal regulations and organizational structures and services of the Federation of Egyptian Industries and the Egyptian Trade Union Federation (ETUF), to make them more representative, relevant and effective. ILO specialists from the Bureau for Employers' and Workers' Activities will work together with national consultants in conducting these reviews and developing recommendations. This activity should start at the beginning of year two of the project.

The labour Administration system is a tool at the disposal of governments to achieve safeguarding of fundamental human rights of workers, to enforce labour legislation and to offer solutions to the various and complex problems the world of work faces. According to the ILO, the purpose of Labour Administration is to carry out public administration activities in the field of the national labour policy, in accordance with principle of good governance, participation, credibility, transparency and accountability.

The current legislative framework is dominated by a new comprehensive Labour Code (2003). This Labour Law still requires training of staff in the Ministry and the governmental departments, so as to be able to cope with new developments in the field of industrial relations and to abide by labour standards (enshrined in the ILO conventions). A strategic planning process should be initiated.

### **More Effective Use of the Labour Administration System**

The project will provide targeted assistance on developing and improving policy options and enhancing capacity of the labour administration to apply the labour laws, particularly in the area of labour rights and dispute prevention and settlement.

A first activity will be therefore to draft terms of reference (ToR) for national labour administration audits. The audits will follow ILO methodology: examination of statutory functions in labour laws; analysis of human resource and material capacities, including internal career policies; identification of data collection, analysis and retrieval policies; tracking of staff training programmes; and oversight evaluation and measurement mechanisms.

Upon completion of the audits and using their recommendations as benchmarks, the project will assist the Ministry to achieve improved policies, structures, personnel policies and management capacity. The overall objective is to help the Ministry establish a national plan for improving labour administration policy. Such a plan would include improved reporting system through recognized structures; regular, systematic and planned inspections through workplace visits; education on labour laws and obligations of workers and employers; inspection monitoring, data collection and analysis on labour and employment issues for statistical and research functions; and increased enforcement through application of appropriate sanctions.

Subject to the finding of the audit, the project will embark on a series of intensive training courses aimed at producing labour officers with first class technical knowledge of modern techniques. The first step will be to organize a seminar to determine the training approach; identify existing material that may need adaptation along with ILO materials, as well as local training institutions and the presentation of a sustainable training programme. Partnerships could be envisaged with local training institutions to enhance performance and exchange information.

Training courses would include: key values of integrity, transparency, objectivity, diligence, national labour legislation, training in social dialogue, dispute prevention and settlement, report writing, research and analytical skills etc.

This core group of labour officers will then carry out the agreed training plan, so that all labour officers receive some training during the life of the project.

The project will work with the Ministry in developing easy to use guidelines on the labour legislation and the services offered by the Ministry. These guidelines will be printed in large numbers and distributed widely through the Manpower Offices.

The first phase of the project strategy is designed to lay the foundation for the coming stages in the project life. It defines the general framework of the project and its overall orientations. It should also be flexible enough so as to cope with new developments and variables at both the national and international level. The overall objective of the strategy is to help realize concrete and genuine improvements in dialogue and harmony among social partners while ameliorating working conditions with a view to enhancing economic and social advancement in the country.

Joint training in labour-management cooperation at the national and sectoral level should be undertaken in 10 enterprises in each of 5 selected regions. A total of 50 enterprises will be identified as a pilot exercise for labour-management cooperation with the following objectives at the enterprise level:

- Improve working conditions and productivity
- Improve the quality of collective bargaining agreements

At the national level there is a need to establish a *Tripartite Labour Advisory Board* with the aim to institutionalize it before the end of the project.

The functions of the Board will include the following:

- a. Review of the Annual plan of the Ministry before its adoption. Its comments on the plan shall be conveyed to the parties concerned.
- b. Periodic evaluation of the compatibility between labour policy and legislation on the one hand, and social and economic development requirements as well as International Labour Standards on the other, especially in the following areas:
  - Employment policy
  - Inspection
  - Social consultation
  - Collective bargaining
  - Labour disputes

- Salaries and prices
  - Vocational training
- c. Review of working conditions:
- Social Security
  - Safety and occupational health
  - Training
- d. Study and evaluation of matters related to International Labour Standards, including:
- International Conventions, which have not been ratified yet, and expressing views concerning the pros and cons of this ratification
  - Follow-up of the Annual Reports containing the response of social partners to the observation of the committee of Experts on the application of conventions and Recommendations of the ILO
  - Review of the reports of social partners on both ratified and non-ratified conventions
  - Review of measures taken by social partners regarding the International Labour Conference
  - Review of International Cooperation programmes and projects in the field of labour relations

In carrying out the above-mentioned tasks, the role of the Board is a consultative one. It offers advice to decision makers.

In spite of the consultative nature of its mandate, this Advisory Board could play an important role in promoting tripartite social dialogue. The three social partners are equally represented and each side is expected to defend its interests and to express the views of its constituency. This climate of dialogue and exchange of ideas would augur well for the future of labour relations. It could also serve as a forum for training in the art of negotiations and collective bargaining. It could also be envisaged to establish similar mechanisms on a sectoral basis.

The second phase of the project's strategy which will begin 18 months from the project's start date, will address the reform of certain articles of the labour legislation. Reform, as we know, is a process and not an event. The new legislations should reflect the real progress achieved and pave the way for further progress. Legislative action is also needed to protect the rights of workers, especially as the state's role is receding, while that of the private sector is mounting. New legislation should allow unions to represent their constituency in a better way. This applies also to the employers' organization (FEI). The government's role in both the ETUF and the FEI

should be curtailed, so as to allow for the autonomous growth of workers' and employers' organizations.

In 2005 at the ILC 76th session, the ILO's supervisory bodies had pinpointed to specific legislative changes needed to be harmonized with of the conventions on freedom of association and collective bargaining. A small tripartite workgroup will develop proposals and recommendations for changes to the Egyptian Labour Code of 2003 based on ratified ILO Conventions and the principles of the 1998 Declaration. National legal consultants will work closely with International consultants in supporting the work of the tripartite committee. This will ensure the transfer of knowledge and experience to national consultants and will establish local ownership to the process of reforming legislation. The process of drafting revised legislation should be completed within 12 months (24 months from the start of the project). The draft legislation will be promoted widely to decision makers and parliamentarians. Emphasis will be placed on the process of debating the draft legislation to ensure transparency and to promote good governance.

## **Management Framework**

### ***Institutional Arrangements***

The following institutional arrangement will be put in place in accordance with the agreement signed by the USDOL and the ILO.

The project will be managed by an internationally recruited Chief Technical Advisor (CTA). The CTA will be responsible for the administrative, operational, and technical supervision as well as the implementation of different project interventions. The CTA will also prepare all technical and progress reports required under the project and coordinate with the CTAs of other relevant programmes/projects in Egypt. The CTA will report to the director of the ILO Subregional Office in Cairo and will be provided with administrative support from the same office. Regular technical support and backstopping will be provided by (i) the Specialists in the SRO Cairo; and (ii) relevant HQ technical units, and in particular ACTEMP and ACTRAV. The Social Dialogue, Labour Law and Labour Administration Department will have the overall technical responsibility for the project and will provide regular technical backstopping services. The Declaration Programme will have the overall management and financial responsibility, including approving workplans together with the Social Dialogue Department and approving budget revisions and expenditure as necessary. Declaration will also be responsible for liaising with the donor. A financial and administrative assistant will be recruited to support the CTA. A project office will be established within the premise of the ILO Cairo Subregional Office.

### ***Programme Coordination***

In order to ensure a smooth functioning of the project, a coordinating mechanism in the form of a Project Advisory Committee will be established (PAC). The PAC will be composed of representatives of the Ministry of Manpower and Migration, Federation of Egyptian Industries and the Egyptian trade Union Federation. The PAC will meet at the beginning of the project to review the workplan and advise the CTA thereon. The PAC will then meet every six months. The PAC will be chaired by the Minister of Manpower and will have the Terms of Reference

attached as annex 1. Representatives from other relevant Ministries, such as Trade and Industry and Investment and/or other agencies should be invited to PAC meetings as necessary.

### ***Sustainability***

The project will assist the Ministry of Manpower to maintain a modern labour administration policy keyed into labour law compliance. This policy will be a vital factor in transforming the enforcement system beyond the life of the project to come. It will be supported by institutional capacity- building in the form of a sustainable training plan to ensure that the training activities of the project can be replicated, using, in the first instance, the trainers trained by the project.

Knowledge of the labour law and its enforcement, once learned by workers and employers, will remain. Again, the project will build the institutional capacity of the social partners, certify a core group of trainers and identify means for them to internalize training. In most cases the project will make every effort to use the national training institutions, consultants and individuals to conduct its activities, rather than renting conference facilities. This will contribute to improving their level of services and curricula.

### ***Assumptions***

The main assumptions are that the government, employers' and workers' organizations will support the project with the highest level of political commitment, that they will collaborate fully in the project's activities and that, for certain specific outputs, such as the labour law reforms, they will deliver the final product to the adoption/promulgation machinery (Cabinet, Parliamentary Committees and Parliament, according to the national legislative process). It is also assumed that the government and social partners will exert every possible effort to facilitate the development of the media campaign and minimize the cost of production and broadcasting.

## **Planning, Monitoring, and Evaluation**

### ***Planning and Reporting***

After the design stage of the project is completed, the CTA will recruit national consultants to collect the available base line data for the agreed indicators. The project staff and consultants will also identify the areas where data are not available or not reliable and recommend cost effective ways for improving and systemizing the data collection. Within two months the national consultants will compile the data in a database that will be updated on bi-annual basis to measure progress.

The specific target for each indicator will be determined together with USDOL based on the baseline situation. Accordingly, within the first 90 days of the project, a Performance Monitoring Plan (PMP) will be developed and the project staff will be trained to use it. The plan will specify the source and frequency of collecting data.

### **Monitoring and Evaluation**

The Project CTA, in collaboration with the Ministry of Manpower and the social partners, will prepare a 12-month workplan and present it to the PACs. This workplan will then be submitted to DIALOGUE and DECLARATION for review, endorsement and subsequent transmission to the donor. These ILO HQ management and backstopping units will follow-up and monitor progress using the PMP. The workplan will be up-dated as required in consultation with the PAC and ILO HQ. The CTA will prepare quarterly progress reports based on the formats specified by the donor. These reports will include detailed data on progress against the PMP targets.

Eighteen months from its start, the project will undergo an independent midterm evaluation. USDOL and ILO will review the report and discuss its findings, conclusion and recommendations with the Project Advisory Committee. The outcome of the midterm evaluation will determine the progress of the project into the second phase. USDOL and/or ILO reserve the right to discontinue one or more activities based on the recommendations of the midterm evaluation. At the end of the project, a final and independent evaluation will be carried out. The final evaluation will, among others, assess the project's effectiveness, impact, sustainability and will draw the lessons learned.

## ANNEX C: LIST OF DOCUMENTS PROVIDED FOR THE MIDTERM EVALUATION

---

### List of Documents Provided to the Evaluator for the Midterm Evaluation

Document	Date	Author
Letter from the Minister of Manpower and Migration to M. Somavia, Director General, ILO	30 March 2007	H.E. Aisha Abdel Hady, Minister of Manpower and Migration
Final Cooperation Agreement	1 February 2008	ILO/USDOL
Final Project Document	December 2007	ILO
Social Dialogue Programme in Egypt. Communication Strategy	Undated (est. 2009)	Mustapha Said
List of Workshops	From September 2008 to October 2010	Gamila Abdelhalim, Project Administrative Assistant
Quarterly Monitoring Reports	July to September 2008 October to December 2008 January to March 2009 April to June 2009 July to September 2009 October to December 2009 January to March 2010 April to June 2010	Mustapha Said
Project Monitoring Plan	June 2010	Consultant/Mustapha Said
Statistics on consultants who have worked with the Social Dialogue Project	October 2010	Gamila Abdelhalim, Project Administrative Assistant
Project Work plans	Plans for 2008, 2009, 2010	Mustapha Said



## ANNEX D: LIST OF EVALUATION MEETINGS

Organization/ Department	Name/Description and Sex	Role	Type of Meeting	Contact Details
Federation of Egyptian Industries	Adel El Azeby	Legal Advisor	Individual	Details not available
Egyptian Trade Union Federation (ETUF)	Ahmed Atef Hassan (accompanied by other leaderships members)	Vice-President of Egyptian Trade Union Federation (ETUF), Secretary of Education and Human Development ETUF	Joint	Tel: +20 022873674
Economist/ Consultant	Ahmed El Bourai	Advocate at Court, President of the Department of Social Rights, University of Cairo	Individual	Ahmedalborai_vip@hotmail.com
Investors Association of 10th of Ramadan	Ayman Reda	Director Secretary, Accompanied by a group of 11 trainees	Joint	Association Federation Office
ILO SRO Cairo	Claude Loïselle	Senior Specialist in Occupational Safety and Health and Working Conditions	Individual	loiselle@ilo.org
ILO SRO Cairo	Dorothea Schmidt	Senior Specialist in Employment and Labour Market	Individual	Schmidt@ilo.org
Federation of Egyptian Chambers (FECC)	Dr A Sattar Eshrah	Counsel, FECC Secretary General, Egyptian Committee for ICC Vice chairman, Arab Labour Organization	Individual	aeshrah@hotmail.com
Economist/ Consultant	Dr. Samir Radwan	Senior Economic Advisor	Joint (with Mustapha Said and Wael Issa)	Samir.radwan@efsa.gov.eg
ILO SRO Cairo	Dr. Yousef Qaryouti, Ph.D.	Director ILO SRO Cairo	Individual	qaryouti@ilo.org
ILO SRO Cairo	Gamila Abdel Halim	Project Administrative Assistant	Individual	halim@ilo.org
Ministry of Manpower and Migration	H.E. Aisha Abd Elhadi	Minister of Manpower and Migration (Also present, Dr Nahan Ashraf, Undersecretary responsible for collective bargaining)		
Egyptian Trade Union Federation (ETUF)	Hussein Megawer	President of ETUF, Head of Manpower and Immigration Committee at the People's Assembly of Egypt	Joint	etufpresident@etufegypt.com Meeting 2

Organization/ Department	Name/Description and Sex	Role	Type of Meeting	Contact Details
Centre for Trade Union and Workers' services, Egypt	Kamal Abbas	General Coordinator	Individual	Ctuws.ctuws@gmail.com
The independent Union of Real Estate Tax Authority Employees (RETA)	Kamal abu Eita (accompanied by 3 activists)	Head of Union	Joint	Union Office
ILO SRO Cairo	Luca Azzoni	Senior Specialist, Skills and Employability	Individual	Azgonni@ilo.org
10th of Ramadan City Trade Union Federation	Magdy Sharara	Vice-President (Plus 1 committee member)	Joint	Details not available
10th of Ramadan City Trade Union Federation	Ibrahim Kasamauah	Vice-President	Joint	Details not available
10th of Ramadan City Trade Union Federation	Mostapha Younis	General Secretary	Joint	Details not available
ILO SRO Cairo	Mohamed Trabelsi	Senior Specialist Workers' Activities (ACTRAV)	Individual	trabelsi@ilo.org
ILO SRO Cairo	Mustapha Said	Chief Technical Advisor (Project Manager)	Joint and individual	said@ilo.org
Embassy of the United States	Peter Shea	Second Secretary, Office of Economic and Political Affairs	Individual	SheaPT@state.gov
ILO Programme for the Promotion of the Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work, Geneva	Wael Issa	Senior Declaration Officer, Programme for the Promotion of the Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work (Project Backstop)	Joint and individual	Wael-issa@ilo.org
ETUF/WEA	Trainees groups from leaders/ officials, Women's and Children's Committee members, young officers and trainers			
MoMM	Ministry trainees accompanied by Dr. Nahan Ashraf, Undersecretary responsible for collective bargaining			
Egyptian Trade Union Federation (ETUF)	ETUF training participants and leadership			

## ANNEX E: FINAL ILO MISSION SCHEDULE

### Program for the Evaluation Mission

Day	Date	Time	Meeting	Place
Sunday	10 Oct 2010	19:00	Arrival with MS flight 772 coming from Geneva	
Monday	11 Oct 2010	9:00 2:30	Meeting with Mustapha Said and Wael Issa Ahmed Atef + group of ETUF trained officers	ILO office Workers University
Tuesday	12 Oct 2010	10:30 11:45 14:00 4:30	Dr. Ahmed Bourai Gamila Abdelhalim Hussein Megawer ETUF Peter Shea US Embassy	ILO office ILO Office ETUF office Marriot hotel
Wednesday	13 Oct 2010	11:00 13:00 3:30 17:00 19:00	FECC (Abd Elsatara Echra) Kamal Abbas Dr. Yousef Qaryouti Claude Loisselle, Senior Specialist in Occupational Safety and Health and Working Conditions Dr Samir Radwan	FECC office CTUWS office ILO office ILO Office
Thursday	14 Oct 2010	08:00 10:00 14:00 16:00	Luca Azzoni, Senior Specialist, Skills and Employability FEI Representative ETUF trainers group Mohamed Trabelsi Senior Specialist Workers' Activities (ACTRAV)	ILO Office FEI Office WEA Office ILO
Friday	15 Oct 2010	14:00 17:00	Teachers Union RETA leaders	ECER office Union office
Saturday	16 Oct 2010	11:00 12:00 14:00	Investors Association of 10th of Ramadan Meeting with H.E Aisha Abd Elhadi 10th of Ramadan Local Federation + trainees	Association office 10th of Ramadan 10th of Ramadan Federation office
Sunday	17 Oct 2010	08:00 09:35 10:00	Dorothea Schmidt, Senior Specialist in Employment and Labour Market (focal Point) Wael's Departure to Geneva MS 771 MoMM trainees	Marriot MoMM office
Monday	18 Oct 2010	09:35	Andrea's Departure to Geneva MS 771	



## ANNEX F: LIST OF PROJECT WORKSHOPS

### List of the Workshops During the Period from October 2008 to 30 December 2008

Date	Title	Participants	Place	Number of Participants		
				Total	Male	Female
14 Oct. 08	Workshop on Activating the role of WEA in building SD in Egypt	ETUF Education Officers, Deans of the WEA Special Institutes	Workers Education Association— Workers University	42	33	9
19 to 20 Oct. 08	ETUF and Social Dialogue (Realities and Needs) First Group	Board Members of ETUF, General Trade Union Leaders, Governorates' Federations, Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA	Workers Education Association— Workers University	45	39	6
3 to 4 Nov. 08	ETUF and Social Dialogue (Realities and Needs) Second Group	Board Members of ETUF, General Trade Union Leaders, Governorates' Federations, Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA	Workers Education Association— Workers University	39	33	6
5 to 6 Nov. 08	ETUF and Social Dialogue (Realities and Needs) Third Group	Board Members of ETUF, General Trade Union Leaders, Governorates' Federations, Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA	Workers Education Association— Workers University	39	32	7
24 Nov. 08	Social Dialogue and Stable Labour Relations	The Leaders of the Investors Association in 10th of Ramadan, 10th of Ramadan Workers' Federation (ETUF)	Investors Association on 10th of Ramadan City	40	37	3
22 to 23 Dec. 08	The role of MOMM in activating the mechanisms of Social dialogue to achieve balanced labour and industrial relations	Main staff of Labour Relations Development both from HQ and offices in the governorates of MOMM	Baron Hotel	31	20	11

**List of the Workshops During the Period from January to December 2009**

Date	Title	Participants	Place	Number of Participants		
				Total	Male	Female
18 to 19 Jan. 09	Social Dialogue and Gender Issues	Members of ETUF's Women and Children Committee	Workers Education Association—Workers University	46	8	38
26 to 27 Jan. 09	Social Dialogue as a tool to improve Occupational Safety and Health in Textile and Garment Sector.	Managers of Selected Companies in the textiles sector, Local Union's Leaders and MoMM Officials in Port Said City (QUIZ)	El-Batros Hotel in Port Said	67	45	22
9 Feb. 09	The Role of Labour Relations in Promoting Investment. (Ed. Potter)	Leaders and members of the Investors Association in the 6th of October City	Investors Association in 6th of October City	20	17	20
10 Feb. 09	The Role of Labour Relations in Promoting Investment. (Ed. Potter)	Leaders and members of the Investors Association and the Ministry of Investment	Four Seasons Hotel	20	11	9
11 Feb. 09	The Role of Labour Relations in Promoting Investment. (Ed. Potter)	Leaders and members of the Investors Association in the 10th of Ramadan City	Investors Association in 10th of Ramadan City	31	25	6
17 to 18 Feb. 09	The role of media in promoting decent work and raising awareness on economic and social transformations	Editors, Journalists and Media	Syndicate of the Journalists	119	86	33
26 Feb. 09	Conference on the impact of the financial crises on Employment and labour stability in the 10th of Ramadan City	10th of Ramadan Investors' Association, MOMMM, ETUF, FEI and EIF	Investors' Association Office in the 10th of Ramadan City	300	275	25
24 to 26 Mar. 09	SD as a tool to support productivity and stable working relation (First group)	HR Managers of the biggest companies in the 10th of Ramadan	Investors' Association in 10th of Ramadan	29	27	2
25 Mar. 09	SD role in promoting basic TU rights	Leaders of ETUF, Local Union Leaders, members of workers' Association and the Committee on Women and Children's	Workers Education Association—Kalyoubia	77	65	12

Date	Title	Participants	Place	Number of Participants		
				Total	Male	Female
04 to 05 April 09	Seminar on Strategic Planning to develop the capacity of Helwan Governorate Workers' Federation	Board members of Helwan Governorate Federation and Representative of MOMM, Ministry of Social Solidarity	Helwan Governorate Workers' Federation	36	24	12
12 to 13 April 09	Workshop on the role of Base Unions in developing social dialogue at enterprise level (First group)	Board members of trade union committees in Helwan governorate and MOMM representatives	Helwan Governorate Workers' Federation	40	30	10
15 to 16 April 09	Workshop on the role of Base Unions in developing social dialogue at enterprise level (Second group)	The headers of trade union committees in the country of Helwan and representative of the MOMM	Helwan Governorate Workers' Federation	36	28	8
21 to 26 April	SD as a tool to support productivity and stable working relation (Second group)	HR Managers of the biggest companies in the 10th of Ramadan	Investors' Association in 10th of Ramadan	46	42	4
23 April 09	Tripartite festival on 90th anniversary of the ILO	UN agencies, embassies, ministries FEI, ETUF	Hall at the Cairo International Conference Center	400	275	125
26 to 27 April 09	Workshop on Collective Bargaining	Base Union Officers in charge of Labour Relations	Helwan Governorate Workers' Federation	41	31	9
03 to 04 May 09	Social dialogue as a mean to improve social and health services (First group)	Base Union Officers in charge of social and health services	Helwan Governorate Workers' Federation	43	29	14
05 May 09	Social Dialogue as a mean to develop cooperation between Alexandria Governorate Workers' Federation and Employers Organization (FEI branch)	Board Members and TU Leaders in Alexandria	Alexandria Governorate Workers' Federation	37	34	3
10 to 11 May 09	Workshop on ways to organize new members	Base Union Officers in charge of organizing	Helwan Governorate Workers' Federation	39	30	9
13 May 09	Social Dialogue as a mean to develop cooperation between Assiut Governorate Workers' Federation and Assiut Investor's Association	Board Members and TU Leaders in Assiut	Ministry of Health Office in Assiut Governorate	44	42	2

Date	Title	Participants	Place	Number of Participants		
				Total	Male	Female
13 to 14 May 09	Social Dialogue and improve the level of social and health services (Second group)	Base Union Officers in charge of social and health services	Helwan Governorate Workers' Federation	39	27	12
19 to 21 May 09	The role of MOMM in activating the mechanisms of Social dialogue to achieve balanced labour and industrial relations	Main staff of Labour Relations Development both from HQ and offices in the governorates of MOMM	Sonesta Cairo Hotel, Nasr City	47	33	14
24 May 09	Workshop on Social dialogue and decent work	Base Union Officers in charge of Labour Relations	Helwan Governorate Workers' Federation	34	21	13
31 May to 01 June 09	Workshop on Collective Bargaining	Base Union Officers in charge of Labour Relations	Helwan Governorate Workers' Federation	29	16	13
14 to 15 June 09	Strengthening the role of trade unions in the process of social dialogue	Board Members of ETUF, General Trade Union Leaders, Governorates' Federations, Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA	Ismalia Governorate, Palam Abu Sultan Hotel	15	14	1
13 to 14 July 09	OSH for SD to improve workers quarrying Mania Governorate	Board Members of Local Federations, Leaders of Quarrying Union & Board Members, MOMM, Employers	Mania Governorate, Siva Nefertiti Hotel Mania	41	41	00
25 to 27 Oct. 09	Improving the Capacities of ETUF educators on SD	Managers and trainers of WEA	Ismalia Governorate, Palam Abu Sultan Hotel	29	20	9
3 to 5 Nov. 09	Building the capacities of ETUF's trainers on Social Dialogue	Managers and trainers of WEA	Workers Education Association— Workers University, Nasr City, Cairo	37	28	9
7 to 9 Nov. 09	Building the capacities of ETUF's trainers on Social Dialogue	Managers and trainers of WEA	Workers Education Association— Workers University, Nasr City, Cairo	35	29	6
10 to 11 Nov. 09	Building the capacities of Workers' Representatives at Labour Courts	Representatives of Labour Courts ; Alexandria Governorate Workers' Federations, Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA	Alexandria Governorate, Alexandria Governorate Workers' Federations Building	35	33	2

Date	Title	Participants	Place	Number of Participants		
				Total	Male	Female
12 to 13 Nov. 09	Set the Strategic plan for the local federation of government workers	Alexandria Governorate Workers' Federations, Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA	Alexandria Governorate, Alexandria Governorate Workers' Federations Building	18	16	2
14 to 16 Nov. 09	Building the capacities of ETUF's trainers on Social Dialogue	Managers and trainers of WEA	Workers Education Association— Workers University, Nasr City, Cairo	37	22	15
14 to 16 Nov. 09	Building the capacities of Textile Sector trainers (TOT) on Social Dialogue	Board Members and TU Leaders in Port Said	Mubarak Library in Port Said	12	10	2
18 to 19 Nov. 09	Building the capacities of Workers' Representatives at Labour Courts	Representatives of Labour Courts; Assuit Governorate Workers' Federations, Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA	Assuit Governorate, at Al Watania Palace Hotel, Assuit	19	19	---
19 Nov. 09	The role of SD in promoting investment in Assuit Governorate	Investors Association Leaders in Assuit.	Assuit Governorate, at Al Watania Palace Hotel, Assuit	17	16	1
19 to 21 Nov. 09	Set the Strategic plan for the local federation of government workers	Assuit Governorate Workers' Federations, Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA	Assuit Governorate, at Al Watania Palace Hotel, Assuit	27	27	---
21 to 23 Nov. 09	Building the capacities of Textile Sector trainers (TOT) on Social Dialogue	Board Members and TU Leaders in Port Said	Mubarak Library in Port Said	12	10	2
22 to 23 Nov. 09	Small and Medium projects role in providing opportunities for decent work	Board Members of ETUF, General Trade Union Leaders, Governorates' Federations, Unions Leaders and Principals of F.E.D.A.	Ismalia Governorate, Palam Abu Sultan Hotel	17	14	3
22 to 23 Nov. 09	Building the capacities of Workers' Representatives at Labour Courts	Representatives of Labour Courts; Dakahlia Governorate Workers' Federations, Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA	Dakahlia Governorate, at Marshal Hotel— Mansoura	28	28	---
23 to 25 Nov. 09	Building the capacities of ETUF's trainers on Social Dialogue	Managers and trainers of WEA	Workers Education Association— Workers University, Nasr City, Cairo	36	31	5

Date	Title	Participants	Place	Number of Participants		
				Total	Male	Female
24 to 25 Nov. 09	Set the Strategic plan for the local federation of government workers	Dakahlia & Domyat Governorate Workers' Federations, Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA	Dakahlia Governorate, at Marshal Hotel—Mansoura	13	11	2
1 to 2 Dec. 09	Bulding the capacities of Workers' Representatives at Labour Courts	Representatives of Labour Courts ; Cairo Governorate Workers' Federations, Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA	Workers Education Association—Workers University, Nasr City, Cairo	26	24	2
5 to 10 Dec. 09	Building the capacities of Textile Sector trainers (TOT) on Social Dialogue	Board Members and TU Leaders in Alexandria	Alexandria Governorate, Helnan Palestine Alexandria Hotel	18	15	3
6 to 7 Dec. 09	Building the capacities of Textile Sector trainers in OSH on Social Dialogue	Board Members and TU Leaders in Alexandria	Alexandria Governorate, Helnan Palestine Alexandria Hotel	35	26	9
6 to 7 Dec. 09	Building the capacities of Workers' Representatives at Labour Courts	Representatives of Labour Courts ; Port Said Governorate Workers' Federations, Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA	Port Said Governorate, Al Batros Hotel Port Said	19	19	-----
8 to 9 Dec. 09	Set the Strategic plan for the local federation of government workers	Port Said & Domyat Governorate Workers' Federations, Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA	Port Said Governorate, Al Batros Hotel Port Said	28	28	-----
12 to 13 Dec. 09	Set the Strategic plan for the local federation of government workers	Swiss & Ismalia Governorate Workers' Federations, Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA	Workers Education Association—Workers University, Nasr City, Cairo	30	25	5
15 to 17 Dec. 09	Activate the role of the Union under the Trade Unions Law	Board Members of ETUF, General Trade Union Leaders, Governorates' Federations, Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA	Workers Education Association—Workers University, Nasr City, Cairo	28	24	4
22 to 23 Dec. 09	Set the Strategic plan for the local federation of government workers	Aswan, Kena and Souhag Governorate Workers' Federations, Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA	Aswan Governorate, Teba Hotel—Aswan	47	44	3

Date	Title	Participants	Place	Number of Participants		
				Total	Male	Female
29 to 30 Dec. 09	Set the Strategic plan for the local federation of government workers	Al Gharbia & Kalyoubia Governorate Workers' Federations, Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA	Al Gharbia Governorate, Arafa Hote—Tanta	26	26	---

**List of the Workshops/Activities During the Period from January 2010**

Date	Title	Participants	Place	Number of Participants		
				Total	Male	Female
17 to 18 Jan. 10	Building the capacities of Workers' Representatives at Labour Courts	Representatives of Labour Courts; Port Said Governorate Workers' Federations, Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA	Workers Education Association—Workers University, Nasr City, Cairo	31	30	1
19 Jan. 10	Workshop on the new legislation on Health Insurance in Egypt	Board Members of ETUF, Leaders of the Health Insurance & Board Members, Representatives of the ministries, Employers, Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA	Workers Education Association—Workers University, Nasr City, Cairo	38	27	11
20 to 21 Jan. 10	Building the capacities of Workers' Representatives at Labour Courts	Representatives of Labour Courts; Port Said Governorate Workers' Federations, Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA	Workers Education Association—Workers University, Nasr City, Cairo	25	25	--
20 to 21 Jan. 10	Set the Strategic plan for the local federation of government workers	Al Fayoum & El Wadi El Gedid Governorate Workers' Federations, Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA	Workers Education Association—Workers University, Nasr City, Cairo	28	25	3
26 Jan. 10	ILO & Social Dialogue	Workshop in cooperation with the International Relationships	Workers Education Association—Workers University, Nasr City, Cairo			
10 to 11 Feb. 10	Set the Strategic plan for the local federation of government workers	10th of Ramadan Governorate Workers' Federations, Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA	10th of Ramadan Workers' Federations Building	15	15	--
13 to 14 Feb. 10	Set the Strategic plan for the local federation of government workers	Giza Governorate Workers' Federations, Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA	Giza Governorate Workers' Federations Building	13	10	3

Date	Title	Participants	Place	Number of Participants		
				Total	Male	Female
17 to 18 Feb. 10	Set the Strategic plan for the local federation of government workers	Bani Swif Governorate Workers' Federations, Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA	Mania Governorate Cleopatra Hotel—Mania	10	9	1
17 to 18 Feb. 10	Set the Strategic plan for the local federation of government workers	Mania Governorate Workers' Federations, Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA	Mania Governorate Cleopatra Hotel—Mania	14	14	--
20 to 21 Feb. 10	Set the Strategic plan for the local federation of government workers	Al Monofia Governorate Workers' Federations, Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA	Arafa Hotel—Tanta	14	13	1
20 to 21 Feb. 10	Set the Strategic plan for the local federation of government workers	Al Behara Governorate Workers' Federations, Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA	Arafa Hotel—Tanta	10	9	1
20 to 21 Feb. 10	Set the Strategic plan for the local federation of government workers	Kafr El Sheikh Governorate Workers' Federations, Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA	Arafa Hotel—Tanta	15	14	1
27 to 28 Feb. 10	Set the Strategic plan for the local federation of government workers	Red Sea Governorate Workers' Federations, Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA	Red Sea Governorate Sand Beach Hotel—Hurghada	14	13	1
27 to 28 Feb. 10	Set the Strategic plan for the local federation of government workers	North Sena Governorate Workers' Federations, Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA	Red Sea Governorate Sand Beach Hotel—Hurghada	15	13	2
27 to 28 Feb. 10	Set the Strategic plan for the local federation of government workers	South Sena Governorate Workers' Federations, Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA	Red Sea Governorate Sand Beach Hotel—Hurghada	8	8	--
6 to 7 Mar. 10	Set the Strategic plan for the local federation of government workers	Al Sharkia Governorate Workers' Federations, Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA	Workers Education Association—Workers University, Nasr City, Cairo	20	20	--
29 to 31 Mar. 10	Improving the Capacities of ETUF educators on SD	Managers and trainers of WEA	Ismalia Governorate, Palam Abu Sultan Hotel	30	18	12
20 to 22 April 10	Social Dialogue and the Women Workers (Working Plan for the Women Committee	Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA and the women committee in ETUF	Helnan Port Said Hotel—Port Said	29	----	29

Date	Title	Participants	Place	Number of Participants		
				Total	Male	Female
26 April 10	Tripartite Workshop on Social Dialogue, Freedom of Association and Development	Director, ILO SRO, Cairo, Executive Director—ILO FPRW, Geneva, President—Egyptian Trade Union Federation, President—Egyptian Chambers of Commerce and Minister of Manpower and Migration, Board Members of ETUF and Unions Leaders.	Sonesta Cairo Hotel, Nasr City, Cairo	146	124	22
20 May 10	Social Dialogue and the Women Workers (Working Plan for the Women Committee)	Unions Leaders and Principals of WEA and the women committee in ETUF	Workers Education Association—Workers University, Nasr City, Cairo	10	2	8
01 June 10	The role of social dialogue mechanisms in resolving collective labor disputes	MOMM Leaders and Directors of Areas	MOMM Conference Room, Nasr City, Cairo	39	37	2
02 June 10	The role of social dialogue mechanisms in resolving collective labor disputes	MOMM Leaders and Directors of Areas	MOMM Conference Room, Nasr City, Cairo	28	26	2
03 June 10	The role of social dialogue mechanisms in resolving collective labor disputes	MOMM Leaders and Directors of Areas	MOMM Conference Room, Nasr City, Cairo	32	28	4
07 to 08 July 10	The role of social dialogue mechanisms in resolving collective labor disputes	MOMM Leaders and Directors of Areas	MOMM Conference Room, Nasr City, Cairo	24	20	4
14 to 15 July 10	The role of social dialogue mechanisms in resolving collective labor disputes	MOMM Leaders and Directors of Areas	MOMM Conference Room, Nasr City, Cairo	30	24	6
22 to 23 Sept. 10	The role of social dialogue mechanisms in resolving collective labor disputes	MOMM Leaders and Directors of Areas	MOMM Conference Room, Nasr City, Cairo	28	20	8
25 Sept. 10	Workshop on the preparation of a working group to implement the evaluation form in collaboration with the General Federation of Trade Unions of Egypt	Managers and trainers of WEA	Workers Education Association—Workers University, Nasr City, Cairo	28	23	5

Date	Title	Participants	Place	Number of Participants		
				Total	Male	Female
26 to 27 Sept. 10	Workshop on the development of trade union membership to strengthen the role of trade unions in the process of social dialogue	Chairmen of committees and members of trade union activists	Sand Beach Hotel—Hurghada	26	21	5
28 to 29 Sept. 10	Workshop on the development of trade union membership to strengthen the role of trade unions in the process of social dialogue	Chairmen of committees and members of trade union activists	Sand Beach Hotel—Hurghada	25	19	6
13 to 14 Oct. 10	The role of social dialogue mechanisms in resolving collective labor disputes	MOMM Leaders and Directors of Areas	MOMM Conference Room, Nasr City, Cairo	29	18	11
19 to 20 Oct. 10	Workshops on Organizing New Members in the Private Sector & Informal Economy in cooperation with the ETUF	Members of the Board of Directors Committees Association of Tourism and the hotels in Cairo	Workers Education Association—Workers University, Nasr City, Cairo	21	20	1
19 to 20 Oct. 10	Workshops on Organizing New Members in the Private Sector & Informal Economy in cooperation with the ETUF	Members of the Board of Directors Committees Association of Press and Printing in Cairo	Workers Education Association—Workers University, Nasr City, Cairo	21	18	3

## ANNEX G: PROJECT MONITORING PLAN (CONVERTED FROM EXCEL TO WORD)

### Performance Monitoring Plan For Egypt

Monitoring Priorities and Indicators	Data Source and Measurement	Instructions for Indicators/ Measurement	When	Action
<b>IO 1: Workers and employers are more knowledgeable of their rights and obligations and are increasingly engaged in constructive dialogue and negotiations</b>				
Workers and employers better understand and apply their rights and responsibilities.	Randomly survey employers and workers trained by the project.	A survey instrument is developed by DOL-ILO.	(1) Annually by the CTA to determine training effectiveness.	A questionnaire was adapted, trainees were selected, data will be processed and sent
			(2) At the end of the project by an evaluator to determine impact.	
Increase in the number of information material on rights at work	Pre and Post surveys of available materials	(1) Survey materials available to the tripartite stakeholders at project beginning;	Project beginning, mid and end points.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Collecting available material at MOMM, ETUF, and FEI is in process</li> <li>2. 18 brochures were developed and printed in cooperation with MOMM, simplifying labour code</li> <li>3. 1 brochure about social dialogue was developed and printed</li> <li>4. CD concerning all ILO convention and recommendation was developed (in Arabic) and printed</li> <li>5. 1 brochure about the role of trade union was developed and printed in cooperation with ETUF</li> <li>6. Printing the fundamental principles rights at work declaration</li> <li>7. Printing the social justice for a fair globalization declaration</li> <li>8. Printing the global jobs pact</li> <li>9. Developing and printing booklet regarding ACTRAV roles and activities</li> <li>10. Developing and printing 2 manuals concerning OSH at workplace for both textile and tourism sectors.</li> <li>11. Developing 2 brochures on ACTEMP work and role to be printed</li> </ol>
		(2) Survey materials available to stakeholders at project midterm and final		

Monitoring Priorities and Indicators	Data Source and Measurement	Instructions for Indicators/ Measurement	When	Action
<b>IO 2:</b> Independent, competent and representative employers' and competent employers and workers' organizations which are able to better represent and defend the interests of their members				
Regular meetings of union members	Union records	Every year from sample of unions trained	Annually by CTA	Data collection is in process
Democratic election of union leaders	Reports from international human rights and labor organizations	Conduct on-going review of press clippings and review of ITUC, ILO, State Department, etc.	Press reports throughout duration of project	It will be evaluated according to the next election in 2011, however ITUC and HRO declared that 2006 election was undemocratic The congestion at the workers' arena during the trade union elections—which embodied the actual absence of a genuine organization—was clearly reflected on the workers movements which demanded solution of their trade union committees.
Democratic election of employers' leaders	New legislation provides FEI with more independence and freedom	The Official Gazette	End of Project	FEI will have its elections which will be done in August 2010, FECC finalized its elections where new chairman was elected
Increase in tripartite and bipartite meetings	Records of meetings.	Baseline = zero. CTA will collect the records.	Immediately prior to midterm and final evaluations.	A wide tripartite meeting was held on SD, FOA and Development
<b>IO 3:</b> The Ministry of Manpower has a strengthened capacity to prevent and settle labour disputes.				
Post training assessment of the knowledge of trained staff	Questionnaire used to survey a sample of those trained by the project.	Questionnaire to be developed by DOL-ILO will provide quantitative information data such that scores can be derived.	Midterm and final	Questionnaire was received, reviewed and adapted to measure the required information, TOR was finalized to contract an expert to execute the job
Increase in the number of disputes prevented	Records of the Ministry of Manpower	Establish the number per annum during the past five years.	Immediately prior to final evaluation	Arrangements to be prepared with MOMM
Increase in the number of disputes settled before going to court.	Records of the Ministry of Manpower	Establish the number per annum during the past five years.	Immediately prior to final evaluation	Arrangements to be prepared with MOMM

Monitoring Priorities and Indicators	Data Source and Measurement	Instructions for Indicators/ Measurement	When	Action
<b>IO 4:</b> Reform labour legislation in order to bring it into conformity with ratified ILO Conventions and the principles of the Declaration				
A proposal for revising certain articles in the Labour Code that are inconsistent with ILS, which receives favorable comments from the ILO technical experts	Comments by the ILO Experts on the draft legislation.	The degree to which the draft is in harmony with conventions.	Whenever it may happen.	Tripartite meetings are planned to discuss labour law by end of 2010



## **ANNEX H: LIST OF MEDIA ARTICLES**

---

Some Newspapers articles on the fundamental principles and rights at work and social dialogue project (25 October 2010)

1. Al-Ahram newspaper: 21/06/2008—Launching of a project to strengthen the principles and fundamental rights at work
2. Al-Wafd Newspaper: 22/6/2008—ILO implements a project in Egypt aiming at promoting the principles and rights at work
3. Al-Akhbar—Aisha Abdel Hadi: Decent work is the basis of progress
4. Al-Ahram newspaper: 24/6/2008—Aisha and Megawer in the celebration of the launching ceremony of a project to strengthen the basic rights: Egypt is keen on the application of international labor standards and confirms the concept of decent work
5. Al-Ahram newspaper: 26/6/2008—Megawer: Union workers prepare amendments to the Trade Unions Law without any outside intervention
6. October Magazine—Why Egypt refuse trade union pluralism?
7. Labour Magazine: November 2008—workshop on Activating the role of labor towards building a culture of social dialogue in Egypt
8. Labour Magazine: December 2008—activating the role of the Workers Education Association to assist in constructing effective social dialogue
9. Labour Magazine: December 2008—promoting social dialogue deepens the investment and provides new job vacancies in a workshop in Tenth of Ramadan City.
10. Al Akhbar: 23/12/2008—activating the mechanisms of social dialogue to achieve a balanced working relationship in a workshop between the ILO and the Ministry of Manpower and Migration.
11. Al-Ahram: 23/12/2008—within the project of social dialogue under the auspices of “Prime Minister Nazif” the creation of an advisory committee to create balance in labour relations
12. Al Masry Al Youm: 8/1/2009—Hussein Megawer: the coming period requires further social dialogue between trade unions, employers and government, in order to avoid shocks in the future
13. Al Shurok Newspaper: 19/02/2009—The increasing role of the private sector require to stabilize the labour relations first

14. Al Ahally Newspaper: 18/2/2009—ILO calls for decent work in Egypt during the workshop, started yesterday and ends today at the journalists Syndicate, which is organized by the Social Dialogue Project in Egypt
15. Al-Alam Al Youm Newspaper: 23/02/2009—journalists dream of “decent work”.. And missing to discuss their working conditions
16. Al-Akhbar—26/3/2009—training courses for human resources managers in plants of Tenth Ramadan City.
17. Labour Magazine: (March 2009) Social Dialogue—Issues of development and globalization and the role of journalism and its future work on the agenda of the workshop (the media’s role in promoting decent work and raising awareness of the economic and social transformations 17 to 18 February 2009)
18. The-seventh day Newspaper: 18 April 2009—“Manpower” is working to make the project of social dialogue successful
19. Al Ahram Weekly: 30 April to 6 May 2009—A way out

This week the International Labour Organisation (ILO) turns 90. Built on a tripartite structure, the ILO is the only UN agency where governments, employers and workers are represented. It considers social dialogue a cornerstone of social stability. Mustafa Said, chief technical adviser, ILO’s Social Dialogue Programme in Egypt, speaks to **Nesmahar Sayed** about social dialogue as a means of achieving the “decent work” concept

---

### **What does the concept of “decent work” mean and what is its importance?**

The idea of “decent work” emerged when people began discussing the idea of globalisation with a social dimension. Globalisation will mean nothing for hundreds or millions of people if it has no social dimension. Increased unemployment and poverty as a result of today’s world economic order is pushing many to accept jobs at whatever cost.

This prompted the ILO to launch this concept to make workers aware of their rights, which in turn would lead to their safety and increased productivity.

The ILO says that having decent work means that everybody can benefit from globalisation.



**Mustafa Said**

This concept reflects the main mandate of the ILO. It is a means to achieve social stability and peace nationally and on a global scale.

### **What are the pillars of the “decent work” concept?**

“Decent work” promotes the importance of having a job, decent working conditions and salaries, social protection, social dialogue between the employer, employees and the government, and a discrimination-free work environment. These pillars are part of the ILO’s Declaration on Social Justice for a Fair Globalisation issued in Geneva in 2008.

### **How is this concept dealt with in Egypt?**

We are developing a “decent work” country plan for Egypt which is centred upon social dialogue. This project was formally launched in June 2008. Much work has been achieved in Egypt since the adoption of the new Labour Law 12/2003, which is a cornerstone in promoting decent work. The implementation of the Decent Work Agenda in general has its difficulties. Each country approaches this agenda according to its economic and social structure. It is important to guarantee the will of the three key parties to dialogue: the Ministry of Manpower and Migration, the Federation of Egyptian Industries and the Egyptian Trade Union Federation (ETUF). It is the role of the ILO to promote dialogue between the three parties to achieve real decent work in Egypt. It is a cumulative process.

But implementing it is not as smooth as planning it. Different elements are factored in. Nowadays, the financial crisis has its impact on the country and this impact means that the government has to prioritise certain issues. It has to develop certain programmes and allocate money for this purpose.

### **Is any of the three parties showing signs of reluctance?**

To be objective, they are all in a way reluctant. Each has its own concerns and calculations. However, employers may have more concerns. But this reluctance is no obstacle. It can be tackled through discussion.

### **Why do we need social dialogue now?**

During the past 25 years, and ever since the privatisation process started, Egypt’s private sector has grown stronger to become a key main employer. It is telling that nine million workers in the private sector are not represented through trade unions. And the trade union movement in Egypt is totally concentrated in the publicly owned enterprises. In a state owned enterprise workers can negotiate and pressure the government to get what they want. In the private sector the situation is different. What we want to do is to build up a new tradition based on the new labour code, which stresses tripartism. You can find that it encourages dialogue and collective bargaining between workers and employers.

### **Do we need a change of regulations to allow for private sector labour unions?**

It is not just a matter of regulation. It is part of the culture that employers feel trade unions are a threat. We need time, trust and mutual interaction between workers and employers.

### **To what extent do Egypt's laws conform to the ILO's conventions?**

Egypt has ratified 64 conventions including the eight core conventions. There are some comments from our committee of experts which is in charge of following up the implementation after ratification. This committee has found out that the labour law refers to only one trade union, the ETUF. From the experts' point of view this is considered against Convention 87, one of the eight core conventions that mentions the right to organise. The ILO's committee of experts considers that a single union should not be imposed by law and workers can decide by themselves whether to have a single union or multiple unions.

In addition, in Egypt there are public sector workers, private sector workers and another group working informally which is huge in number, who should also be represented. From the ILO's point of view any worker should be protected. Having unions means that workers have a voice so they can be consulted. This will lead to improving their working and living conditions which has an impact on society in general. But it is a matter of the main parties deciding the limits of that change.

This issue is now being discussed. ETUF President Hussein Megawer has in fact declared on more than one occasion that the federation is working together with the Minister of manpower and migration on amending the trade union law.

### **How do you explain the increase in the number of strikes in Egypt recently?**

That has a simple and direct explanation: when you do not have social dialogue then what other options do you have? Social dialogue is the mechanism to settle disputes and to discuss all the issues that can arise, in a very democratic way. When you have more freedom, all the social groups can express their views using different ways. This is where social dialogue comes in. Any issue can be discussed and should be discussed before going out onto the street. For this reason when we talk about social dialogue we talk about integrating everybody to discuss issues of common interest to find solutions which are suitable for everybody and which everybody can defend.

### **How do you see the issue of unemployment in Egypt?**

I have met many employers who claim to have vacancies which workers are not accepting. Employers need their workers to have certain qualifications, but they cannot find the right candidates. This situation reveals many problems, foremost among which is the level of education and training.

A second problem is the type of vacancy being offered. Is it a decent one and does it offer a decent salary? In order to develop our training skills, education system, the output of

universities or develop the remunerations from jobs offered, we need to have social dialogue. Employers should stop complaining about the qualification of workers and think about improving their skills.

**How can the salaries be amended through social dialogue, either in the private or public sectors?**

The Higher Council for Wages mentioned in the Labour Law 12/2003 is the solution. And this should be discussed through a social dialogue which brings together the employers, employees and the government.

**In light of today's economic slowdown, do Egyptians have the luxury to find decent work?**

According to the ILO any work and any job should be decent. The United Nations Development Programme report about Egypt showed discrepancies between the rural and the urban areas. There are about 40 villages in Upper Egypt that are described as the poorest in the country. So when we go for a decent work agenda here, it should be a gradual one. I think this is the target of the Ministry of Manpower as well. The economic crisis may not be a good time to discuss this issue, but it is something that Egypt should work on. It is not a matter of choice from our point of view. When we talk about descent work we are talking about greater social justice, and a more stable society.

**But to what extent can dialogue succeed in light of the fact that there is a lack of information?**

It needs cooperation from all parties as well as social and political will. All should be convinced that sharing information will result in an improved situation for the country and its people.

20. The-seventh day Newspaper: 03 May 2009—the Minister noted that the social dialogue project which is implemented by the Ministry in cooperation with the International Labour Organization has achieved good steps in this regard and that the project was able during the last year of executing many activities in 13 provinces, and it was able to develop the capacity of 950 trainees.
21. ETUF Newspaper “Workers”: 8 November 2009—The Businessmen—Workers Dialogue, “Mustafa Said, director of” Social Dialogue Project, “International Labour Organization (ILO can’t oblige businessmen to have dialogue with workers).



## **ANNEX I: LIST OF WORKSHOP THEMES**

---

Activate the role of the Union under the Trade Unions Law	1
Building the capacities of ETUF's trainers on Social Dialogue	8
Building the capacities of Workers' Representatives at Labour Courts	7
Conference on the impact of the financial crises on Employment and labour stability in the 10th of Ramadan City	1
ETUF and Social Dialogue (Realities and Needs) First Group	3
ILO & Social Dialogue	1
Improving the Capacities of ETUF educators on SD	2
OSH for SD to improve workers quarrying Mania Governorate	1
SD as a tool to support productivity and stable working relation	2
SD role in promoting basic TU rights	1
Seminar on Strategic Planning	8
Set the Strategic plan for the local federation of government workers	10
Small and Medium projects role in providing opportunities for decent work	1
Social Dialogue and Gender Issues	1
Social Dialogue and improve the level of social and health services	1
Social Dialogue and Stable Labour Relations	1
Social Dialogue and the Women Workers (Working Plan for the Women Committee	1
Social Dialogue as a means to develop cooperation between Alexandria Governorate Workers' Federation and Employers Organization	2
Social dialogue as a means to improve social and health services	2
Social Dialogue as a tool to improve Occupational Safety and Health in Textile and Garment Sector.	1
Strengthening the role of trade unions in the process of social dialogue	1
The Role of Labour Relations in Promoting Investment. (Ed. Potter)	3

The role of media in promoting decent work and raising awareness on economic and social transformations	1
The role of MOMM in activating the mechanisms of Social dialogue to achieve balanced labour and industrial relations	2
The role of SD in promoting investment in Assuit Governorate	1
The role of social dialogue mechanisms in resolving collective labor disputes	6
Tripartite festival on 90th anniversary of the ILO	1
Tripartite Workshop on Social Dialogue, Freedom of Association and Development	1
Workshop on Activating the role of WEA in building SD in Egypt	1
Workshop on Collective Bargaining	2
Workshop on Social dialogue and decent work	1
Workshop on the development of trade union membership to strengthen the role of trade unions in the process of social dialogue	1
Workshop on the new legislation on Health Insurance in Egypt	1
Workshop on the preparation of a working group to implement the evaluation form in collaboration with the General Federation of Trade Unions of Egypt	1
Workshop on the role of Base Unions in developing social dialogue at enterprise level	2
Workshop on ways to organize new members	1
Workshops on Organizing New Members in the Private Sector & Informal Economy (with ETUF)	2
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>83</b>