

FUNDED BY THE UNITED STATES
DEPARTMENT OF LABOR

Independent Final Evaluation of Combating Exploitive Child Labor Through Education in Colombia

WorldVision

Cooperative Agreement Number: E-9-K-4-0059



2008

M INTERNATIONAL INC.
MACRO

This page left intentionally blank.

**FUNDED BY THE UNITED STATES
DEPARTMENT OF LABOR**

Independent Final Evaluation of Combating Exploitive Child Labor Through Education in Colombia

World Vision

Cooperative Agreement Number: E-9-K-4-0059

2008

Funding for this evaluation was provided by the United States Department of Labor under Task Order number DOLQ059622437. Points of view or opinions in this evaluation report do not necessarily reflect the views or policies of the United States Department of Labor, nor does the mention of trade names, commercial products, or organizations imply endorsement by the United States Government.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF ACRONYMS	v
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	vii
I PROJECT CONTEXT	1
1.1 Institutional Framework for Improving Education and Eradicating Child Labor	1
1.2 The Municipalities of Funza and Madrid	2
II EVALUATION GOALS	5
III METHODOLOGY AND SCOPE OF EVALUATION	7
IV EVALUATION FINDINGS	9
4.1 Design Analysis	9
4.2 Outcome Analysis	12
4.3 Monitoring Analysis	21
4.4 Analysis of Coordination and Alliances	22
4.5 Analysis of Management and Administration	23
4.6 Analysis of Sustainability	23
V LESSONS LEARNED AND GOOD PRACTICES	25
VI CONCLUSIONS	27
VII RECOMMENDATIONS	28

ANNEXES

Annex A: List of Persons Interviewed

This page left intentionally blank.

LIST OF ACRONYMS

CINDE	<i>Centro Internacional de Educación y Desarrollo Humano</i> (International Center of Education and Human Development)
ETI	Eradication of Child Labor (project)
FAH	<i>Fundación Alcalá de Henares</i> (Alcalá de Henares Foundation)
FVG	<i>Fundación Volvamos a la Gente</i> (Get Back to the People Foundation)
IPEC	International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour
IRE	Educational Risk Index
IPO	<i>Instituto Politécnico de Occidente</i> (Western Polytechnic Institute)
ILO	International Labour Organization
NGO	Nongovernmental Organization
PMP	Performance Monitoring Plan
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
USDOL	United States Department of Labor

This page left intentionally blank.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

World Vision implemented the Eradication of Child Labor project in the municipalities of Madrid and Funza, in the department of Cundinamarca, Colombia, from October 2004 to December 2008. The project attended to children between the ages of 5 and 17 who worked in different activities, providing them with formal and informal educational services to ensure that they would enroll and remain in school.

In the beginning, the projects suffered from an inadequate design, which, given the reference terms of the U.S. Department of Labor's (USDOL's) call for proposals, led it to put forth problems that were irrelevant to its area of intervention. Additionally, the original proposal of World Vision did not alert the donor to the mistakes contained in the diagnosis of the original call for proposals. Once the baseline demonstrated mistakes in how the problems were laid out, it became necessary to work on assumptions questioned by the baseline study, and the logical framework was reformulated for a second time. These design problems led to inaccurate project targets, hindering the project's efforts at eliminating and preventing child labor.

In spite of these faults, the project did succeed in identifying and putting into practice a series of educational innovations that contributed to improving education, and, in turn, preventing school desertion. Specifically, it developed six formal and informal educational strategies that sought to improve social, family, and academic environments, making them areas that would encourage child learning. These models attack specific problems, such as overage children, the absence of alternatives for using free time, the lack of vocational education, and scant parent participation in school learning; the models are directed at specific age groups.

The project made use of pedagogic innovations already in place and tested in the country, tailoring them to the educational needs of the population. For example, it expanded the New School (*Escuela Nueva*) methodology already used in primary schools to secondary schools. It also implemented accelerated learning programs in primary and secondary schools, applied a methodology for personal growth and using free time, and launched a model to teach parents how to support their children's schooling.

Furthermore, the project made use of the experience and know-how of several national and local organizations to achieve its goals. We would like to highlight the participation of *Fundacion Volvamos a la Gente*, which supported the design and implementation of New School; *Universidad Nacional* and *Universidad Los Andes*, which conducted studies; and *Instituto Politecnico de Occidente* and *Fundacion Alcalá de Henares*, local nongovernmental organizations that implemented some of the pedagogic models. Furthermore, the project coordinated with the Secretariat of Education of Cundinamarca and the municipalities of Funza and Madrid, whose development plans included a component to improve the quality of education and eliminate child labor.

As regards management, the project suffered from high turnover of key personnel and field staff, as well as delays in execution. This, on top of the design problems, prevented the project from achieving its initial targets.

In addition, given the large heterogeneity of the population and the project's poor design, the project had difficulty focusing its intervention on children performing dangerous work, and the majority of its activities did not distinguish between working and nonworking children. Thus, the project was more geared toward improving the quality of education than eradicating child labor.

In light of the project's problems, the sustainability of its actions is weak, because the real-time implementation of its educational models has been two years in some cases and one year in others. This period has not been enough to achieve the institutional adoption of the models or their approval by local organizations.

The following recommendations are considered the most important:

1. We suggest that World Vision draft a solution plan for the area of intervention that ensures the sustainability of the project's most important actions, in coordination with educational and municipal authorities.
2. We suggest that USDOL consider the possibility of extending by one more year the period of execution of some of the projects that have suffered extreme delays, which would help ensure the success and sustainability of the outcomes.
3. We recommend that the Secretariat of Education provide technical support to the municipalities where the project worked to continue strengthening the position of educational policy in municipal planning and budgets, in addition to consolidating the implementation of Accelerated Learning (*Aceleracion del Aprendizaje*), Education by Cycles (*Educación por Ciclos*), and Seedbed School (*Escuela Semillero*).
4. We recommend that Partners of the Americas engage in a healthy exchange of information with World Vision, with the aim of learning the lessons that emerged during the project's work in the municipalities of Funza and Madrid.

I PROJECT CONTEXT

World Vision implemented the Eradication of Child Labor (ETI) project in the municipalities of Madrid and Funza, in the department of Cundinamarca, Colombia, from October 2004 until December 2008. The goal of the project was to help 4,500 children between the ages of 5 and 17 who worked or were at risk of working in the farming sector. By designing or implementing educational activities and family and community support measures, the projects sought to prevent children from working or to withdraw those already participating in labor activities.

To properly understand the contributions and challenges of the ETI project being carried out in Colombia, it behooves us to begin this report with a succinct presentation of a few of the contextual elements of the country's educational and child labor policies, as well as some of the characteristics of the municipalities in which the project was implemented.

1.1 INSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK FOR IMPROVING EDUCATION AND ERADICATING CHILD LABOR

More than a decade ago, Colombia embarked on an education-administration decentralization process, in which the Ministry of Education was given the role of regulating the sector and establishing policy. Nevertheless, the role of implementing policy fell to the municipalities. This educational decentralization also awarded the municipalities an important role in handling economic resources, given that almost all of the funds for education allocated to them are administered by the municipal governments and included in their annual budgets. When the municipality does not have the technical or administrative capabilities to manage the education sector, the job falls to the respective departmental secretariat of education. The municipalities where the project worked (Funza and Madrid) have yet to assume administration of the education sector. Hence, they depend on the Secretariat of Education of the Department of Cundinamarca.

The rural institutional-education structure is made up of school networks consisting of one central school and several adjacent schools. While the latter offers only primary education (grades 1 to 5), the central schools offer complete primary and secondary education. Given the shortage of classrooms and the high demand, the central schools hold three different daily sessions: morning, afternoon, and night.

The Rural Education Project is the country's most important initiative to improve quality and to broaden academic coverage in rural areas. It offers a portfolio of pedagogic models (developed in Colombia as well as in other countries) whose effectiveness has been verified. Two of these models have been adopted by the ETI project and are part of its pedagogic proposal: New School (*Escuela Nueva*) and Accelerated Learning (*Aceleracion del Aprendizaje*). With the support of the U.S. Agency for International Development (USAID), New School came into being in Colombia in 1975 as an instrument to improve the educational quality of single-teacher, rural schools. Since then, the methodology has spread throughout the country and has been officially adopted by the Ministry of Education. Furthermore, Accelerated Learning is a model that emerged in Brazil to address the problem of children beginning school at a late age. It has officially been replicated in Colombia. The two models have been validated and applied up to grade 5 in basic primary education.

Additionally, the Colombian Government is implementing the Families in Action project, which consists of awarding direct monetary support to the beneficiary's mother, on the condition that her family meets certain obligations in education (i.e., ensuring that all minors attend school) and in health (i.e., ensuring that all boys and girls attend growth-monitoring appointments). This program targeted the poorest quintile of the population. It bears mentioning that 26 percent of the children who participated in the ETI project belong to this quintile.

The Facts and Rights (*Hechos y Derechos*) National Strategy is an initiative spearheaded by the Office of the Attorney General of the Nation, *Instituto Colombiano de Bienestar Familiar*, *Federacion Nacional de Departamentos*, and the United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF) to promote stronger public policies on childhood at the national and local levels. This strategy is helping to institutionalize municipal planning and budgets as well as all actions aiming at improving the living conditions of children, including educational improvements and protection against child labor.

Concerning national policies to eradicate child labor, we must stress that Colombia has a coherent and comprehensive legal framework in place, aligned with international regulations, provided by Law 1098 on Childhood and Adolescence, the Fundamental Labor Code, and Resolution 1677 of 2008 on banned jobs. Furthermore, Colombia also has a Commission for the Eradication of Child Labor that has been operating for more than 10 years under a solid institutional framework. Accordingly, it has implemented three child labor eradication plans whose assessments have revealed increasingly positive outcomes;¹ in 2008 it formulated the National Strategy for Preventing and Eradicating the Worst Forms of Child Labor and Protecting the Child Worker with the support of the National Planning Office, the entity tasked with the country's government planning. This "strategy" seeks to make viable and efficient the aims set forth in the legal framework and in child labor eradication plans by establishing concrete action mechanisms for the national and local authorities in charge of enforcing public policy.

The foregoing allows us to affirm that the legal and institutional frameworks for improving education and wiping out child labor in Colombia are strong and among the most solid in Latin America. Nevertheless, enforcement of the law is weak, and therefore the country faces the challenge of strengthening its governmental and nongovernmental institutions, above all at the municipal level. The goal is to be able to design, finance, and implement public policies that help to enforce the law effectively.

1.2 THE MUNICIPALITIES OF FUNZA AND MADRID

The project was carried out in the municipalities of Funza and Madrid, which form part of the outskirts of Bogota. Therefore, their socioeconomic status is strongly associated with the city. The majority of the population lives in the municipal seats (92 percent in Funza and 86 percent in Madrid), and many people work in Bogota in both the formal and informal economies. The farming sector has been defined by its development on larger properties, or production units, with high technological investment; such is the case with flower plantations. Small holdings,

¹ Vela, Gloria, 2006, Contribution to the consolidation of the National Policy for the Prevention and Elimination of Child Labor in Colombia. Final Evaluation Report, Bogota: mimeograph.

therefore, do not exist in this region. Given these traits, the two municipalities may not be defined as urban or rural, but rather a *rural-urban continuum*.²

According to the study conducted by the project in 2006, approximately one in four children and adolescents between the ages of 5 and 17 in Funza and Madrid primarily works in farming, trade, domestic services, and construction, thus confirming the idea that in these municipalities rural and urban activities coexist.³

² In a rural-urban continuum, the population is neither totally rural nor urban. Rather, it exists in a gradual distribution along the continuum between these two points.

³ Universidad Nacional de Colombia, project baseline study, 2006.

This page left intentionally blank.

II EVALUATION GOALS

The principal objectives of this evaluation are—

- To help the organization identify high-performance areas and areas where the project could improve its implementation.
- To help the U.S. Department of Labor (USDOL) understand what works and what does not work in terms of conceiving and designing projects.
- To assess how well the project's objectives are met.
- To evaluate the project's progress in terms of children's labor and educational situations.

To reach these aims, the following aspects of the project's design and implementation will be discussed:

- Project design and implementation
- Coordination and alliances
- Management and budget
- Sustainability and impact.

This page left intentionally blank.

III METHODOLOGY AND SCOPE OF EVALUATION

The following techniques were used to collect information.

DOCUMENT ANALYSIS

The following documents were reviewed: Project Document, Cooperative Agreement, Solicitation for Grant Applications, Management Procedures and Guidelines, Progress Reports, Technical and Financial Reports, Performance Monitoring Plan (PMP), Workplan, Research Reports (*Centro Internacional de Educación y Desarrollo Humano* [CINDE] and *Universidad Los Andes*), baseline study, tools and indexes developed during project implementation, and other background documents.

INTERVIEWS AND FOCUS GROUPS

Interviews were conducted with the following people:

- World Vision's National Director in Colombia.
- Project Director.
- Education Specialist.
- Monitoring and Evaluation Specialist.
- Project field staff.
- Representatives of national government agencies: Ministry of Education, Secretariat of Education of Cundinamarca, Ministry of Social Protection, National Commission for the Eradication of Child Labor.
- Municipal Governments of Funza and Madrid.
- Representatives of the Commission for Social Development in the municipalities of Funza and Madrid.
- Representatives of the International Labour Organization's International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (ILO-IPEC).
- UNICEF Children's Rights Official.
- Nongovernmental organization (NGO) representatives and partners of the project: *Fundación Volvamos a la Gente* (FVG), *Instituto Politécnico de Occidente*, *Fundación Alcalá de Henares*.
- Teachers of the schools participating in the project.

Focus groups were held with parents, children benefiting from the project, and teachers of the participating schools, both in Funza and in Madrid.

FEEDBACK

Once the job of gathering information was complete, a workshop was held in which the preliminary results of the evaluation were presented to the various people involved in the project.

IV EVALUATION FINDINGS

4.1 DESIGN ANALYSIS

The original design of the project consisted of a proposal to eliminate child labor on flower plantations in the municipalities of Madrid and Funza, in response to the reference terms published by USDOL.⁴ Nevertheless, the project design underwent two significant changes.

The first change occurred during the first six months of the project's implementation, when it became apparent that the flower industry in the area did not employ underage workers, thus verifying the statements of the *Asociación Colombiana de Exportadores de Flores* (Colombian Association of Flower Exporters) and the Ministry of Social Protection on this matter.⁵ This setback led to two negative repercussions during the first two years of the project's execution. First, it was necessary to modify considerable aspects of the project after it learned the results of the baseline study that confirmed the irrelevance of child labor on flower plantations, causing a delay in meeting the initial timeline. Secondly, some organizations were left with a skeptical perception of the project. These organizations believed that the problem of child labor in flower plantations was inexistent and therefore gave no priority to the work in the municipalities of Funza and Madrid, thus creating an unsuitable initial climate for developing inter-institutional relationships.⁶

The second change occurred during the fourth year of the project's execution as a result of the recommendations made in the intermediate evaluation and the change in key staff members.⁷ This second change triggered a new logical framework, which was accompanied by a request to extend the project since it became clear that achieving the established goals within the original timeframe was infeasible. The following important changes were made: (1) the reorganization of the logic of educational intervention and increase of the formal and informal forms of helping children; (2) the elimination of some of the activities planned in the 2005 logical framework that would have been difficult to complete, including those related to boosting public policies directed at eradicating child labor in rural areas (Outcome 5) and those related to the development of local initiatives to support projects benefiting child laborers (Outcome 4). These measures, which emerged as suggestions in the intermediate evaluation and were adopted in a joint agreement with USDOL, allowed World Vision to simplify the project and focus resources and efforts on local educational activities.

It bears mentioning that USDOL agreed to extend the project for an additional quarter (from October to December 2008) at no additional cost, but never formally approved the logical framework drafted in 2008 (although World Vision requested approval in writing and received verbal approval from the official in charge of the project). This created a misunderstanding between USDOL and World Vision concerning which logical framework should be reviewed in

⁴ Federal Register, Vol. 69, No 143; Tuesday, July 27, 2004; Notices.

⁵ Intermediate Evaluation Report.

⁶ Ibid.

⁷ As we will demonstrate later, the project's first team (director, specialists, and the Ministry of Education) left their positions between April and May 2007; the new staff assumed their duties between June and November of the same year.

the evaluation. The evaluator deemed it appropriate to use the logical framework drafted in August 2005, used in the intermediate evaluation, after taking the following factors into account: (1) the 2008 logical framework was presented late, with barely eight months left before the completion of the original timeframe and more than 80 percent of the allotted time already gone by, limiting its use as an instrument of strategic planning; (2) the 2008 logical framework does not reflect all the activities that the project carried out, limiting retrograde analysis; and (3) the analysis of the project's successes and problems in terms of the 2005 logical framework is more suitable for identifying the lessons learned and the recommendations for the institutions involved.

The changes to the project are the reflection of an unsuitable initial design that failed to take into account three important aspects: (1) floricultural companies in the region generally do not hire children; (2) Funza and Madrid are not rural municipalities and, hence, the phenomenon of child labor there has different characteristics than in rural areas; and (3) the legal and institutional frameworks to improve the quality of education and eradicate child labor promote decentralization and are very developed at the national level—however, the challenge of developing public policy at the municipal level is still incipient in most of the country.

The baseline not only demonstrated a small number of children working on flower plantations, but also that the two municipalities represented a rural-urban continuum. In spite of this, the reformulated logical framework (August 2005) focused its strategy on the rural areas given that (1) the aim and purpose are geared to the eradication of child labor in rural areas; (2) a CINDE investigation of rural areas was scheduled; and (3) the fifth outcome establishes the development of public policies for rural areas. This gap between strategy and reality produced a disconnect between the outcome of the implementation of educational models and the outcomes of the activities to stamp out child labor in rural areas. For example, the research conducted by CINDE made no significant contribution to achieving the educational outcomes, and the initial education strategy was designed by thinking more about the homogeneous characteristics of rural areas, with agricultural-based economies, than the heterogeneous characteristics of Funza and Madrid.⁸

According to the midterm evaluation, not taking into proper account the country's legal and institutional frameworks left the project from the beginning without a strategy for tackling the municipalities. It also led to missteps over the first three years in terms of inter-institutional coordination.

In addition, the spectrum of interventions initially proposed by the project was very broad. Not only did it include activities to raise public awareness, offer elementary education services, and promote the pursuit of local education policies; it also included the development of projects to improve family income, create community projects to eradicate child labor, and influence national policy. As we will demonstrate later, these last aims were not met effectively, not only because of the management problems that hindered the project, but because they proved to be too ambitious within the context of a heterogeneous and large population, such as those of Funza and Madrid.

⁸ Proof of this is that, during the first two years of the project, it promoted the introduction of three educational innovations, but, in the end, promoted seven to address the different educational problems of children and adolescents.

The previously mentioned faults in design prevented the project from having an effective strategic direction, leading to constant administrative and operational problems. Although the project’s goal was to offer formal and informal education to rural working or at-risk children, in practice it focused on improving the quality of education for all children, regardless of their working status, in non-rural areas. Although the project attempted to focus its actions on working children during its last year, given its weak design it lost specificity and was unable to structure a strategy capable of preventing and eliminating child labor through formal and nonformal education.

In spite of the foregoing, the project was tailored to the country’s policies on child labor and targeted the goals of USDOL’s Education Initiative. In effect, the project aimed at meeting the following objectives set forth in the 2003–2006 National Plan for the Elimination of Child Labor: (1) raise awareness about the problem of child labor; (2) foster the prevention of child labor; and (3) transform cultural patterns that legitimize and promote child labor.⁹ Additionally, the educational models promoted by the project are included in the portfolio of innovations of the Ministry of Education.

As was mentioned above, to assess the outcomes achieved by the project, we used the 2005 logical framework, whose aims, purposes, and results were as follows:

Table 1: Framework and Results

Framework	Description
Aim	Child labor in Colombia’s central farming area has been reduced and prevented.
Purpose	Working or at-risk children in the rural area targeted by the intervention are participating in formal and nonformal education programs developed by the project.
Outcome	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Parents, authorities, and local leaders are aware of the importance of education for working children. 2. Formal and informal educational pilot programs suitable for working or at-risk children have been created. 3. Parents support formal and informal education and prevent child labor. 4. Local institutions and community organizations have decided to develop and support projects that prevent and reduce child labor. 5. Public policies concerning child labor in rural areas have been reassessed, enforced, or reformulated by the authorities.

⁹ ILO, 2003, 3rd National Plan for the Elimination of Child Labor and the Protection of Underage Workers 2003–2006, ILO; Bogota.

4.2 OUTCOME ANALYSIS

Outcome 1

Parents, authorities, and local leaders are aware of the importance of education for working children.

The project expected to achieve this outcome using a strategy based on conducting a study on the nature and magnitude of child labor in Funza and Madrid. The project would then use the subsequent publication of the findings as a means to raise awareness at the local, departmental, and national levels. For this purpose, it contracted *Universidad Nacional*, which conducted the Baseline Study on Child Labor in the municipalities of Funza and Madrid. The outcomes of the investigation were presented to several audiences at the local and national levels.

Furthermore, the project hired CINDE to conduct a study entitled “Description of the Child Labor Situation in Certain Crops of the Farming Sector and Its Associative Factors in Eight Colombian Municipalities,” with a view to extending its benefits beyond Funza and Madrid. Furthermore, CINDE held workshops to make the research outcomes known among the primary actors of the eight municipalities.

The intermediate evaluation report found that although the studies were of undeniable technical and academic value, their dissemination was very limited. Therefore, the recommendation was made to design accessible material for disseminating the information among a broad, unspecialized public; however, the project did not welcome this suggestion.

To date, the studies conducted by the project have been only marginally effective at raising the profile of the importance of education for working children. Furthermore, the contribution to the country’s existing knowledge about the issue is unknown.

In practice, the activities that most contributed to raising awareness among local actors were those that constantly lobbied municipal authorities and pushed for the involvement of several public and private institutions in providing the educational services created by the project. Additionally, the application of the Home Curriculum (*Currículo del Hogar*), the Accelerated Learning, and the Education by Cycles models was the most effective means of raising awareness among parents about the negative effects of child labor.

Of the conversations held with municipal authorities and teachers, we can deduce that the project has raised awareness regarding the importance of implementing educational activities for working children, particularly for those who are overage; since they are rejected by the school system, their only option is to work, and, in some cases, dedicate themselves to illegal activities, which, in turn, pose a risk to their personal security and that of others as well. The attention given to the problem of overage children is one of the project’s significant merits, insofar as it was previously unknown to municipal and educational authorities.

Outcome 2

Formal and informal educational pilot programs suitable for working or at-risk children.

The project centers its actions on this outcome, which receives most of its resources and efforts. Initially, the development of three pedagogic models was envisioned: Seedbed School, Home Curriculum, and Accelerated Learning. During its last year, the project developed four additional models: Education by Cycles, Job Skills (*Competencias Laborales*), Centers of Interest (*Centros de Interés*), and Academic Leveling (*Nivelación Académica*). The following table summarizes the aim and target population of each model.

Table 2: Pedagogic Models Developed by the Project

Type of Intervention	Pedagogic Model	Aim	Target Population
Experimental	Seedbed School ¹⁰ (New School)	Improve the quality of education with a view to boosting achievement and preventing desertion	Language and mathematics students, grades 7–10
	Home Curriculum	Improve parents' contribution to their children's education	Parents
	Combination Seedbed School and Home Curriculum	Improve the quality of education with a view to boosting achievement and preventing desertion, in addition to improving parents' contribution to their children's education	Language and mathematics students, grades 7–10, and their parents
Non-experimental	Accelerated Learning	Educate children who have stopped attending school for 3 years or more and provide them with an appropriate learning model	Working children with overage who have not completed primary schooling, grades 1–5
	Education by Cycles	Educate children who have stopped attending school for 3 years or more and provide them with an appropriate learning model	Overage working children who have completed primary schooling, grades 6–11
	Academic Leveling	Provide academic reinforcement to children with poor academic performance	Students of grades 1–5
	Centers of Interest	Provide opportunities for using free time creatively	Students of grades 6–9
	Job Skills	Provide vocational guidance and training	Students of grades 10–11

¹⁰ During the first stage, the project named this model New School, later changing the title to Seedbed School.

The project divided the models into two categories: experimental and non-experimental. The first was part of a study to determine in what grade their application made the largest contribution to child learning. Four groups were created in the schools to scientifically observe the effects of the models: one control group without any pedagogic interventions; a Seedbed School group; a third group for only Home Curriculum; and a final group that participated in the two models. The non-experimental models were created for the purpose of attacking the specific problems facing working children.

Seedbed School

New School is a pedagogic model with a long history of implementation in Colombia; however, it has been limited primarily to single-teacher primary schools in rural areas, where it has enjoyed enormous success. The project sought to introduce this same model in the schools of Funza and Madrid that provide basic secondary education. *Fundacion Volvamos a la Gente* was hired by the project to design the academic material and train teachers. The model was implemented in grades 7 to 9 during 2007 and in grades 8 to 10 during 2008. After the first phase, the project changed the denomination of this model from New School to Seedbed School.

The introduction of this new model has benefited students and teachers. The focus groups conducted during the fieldwork, the extensive existing bibliography on the subject, and the experience of *Fundacion Volvamos a La Gente* leave no doubt about this model's positive impact on child learning. Nevertheless, we must point out that although the model entails the introduction of the methodology in every school center, insofar as it sought to change the institutional culture, the project worked only in language and math, bypassing other subjects. This strategy isolated math and language classes from the rest of the academic dynamic, mitigating the transformational effect of the pedagogic methodology.

Furthermore, the project never linked the implementation of this model with a strategy for eradicating and preventing child labor. The model amounted to an intervention with strictly pedagogic aims, under the assumption that the improvement in the quality of education leads to lower dropout rates, thus acting as a preventive factor in child labor. In addition, approximately 20 percent of the children who participated in this model did not work nor were at risk to do so.

Several problems emerged concerning the model's sustainability that are best considered in three different environments: (1) the participating educational institutions; (2) the municipalities of Funza and Madrid; and (3) the Secretariat of Education of Cundinamarca. The introduction of the model in the centers is far from sustainable because, as we have pointed out, it only worked only with the teachers of mathematics and language, leaving aside all other subjects and the entire pedagogic school structure. There was also no intervention in grade 11. In light of this, it is unlikely that the changes introduced last beyond the classrooms of the few teachers who decide to continue using the method. Furthermore, the municipalities involved in the project have only superficial information about what has been done in this field. They are in no way committed to supporting the method's consolidation. Concerning the Secretariat of Education of Cundinamarca, the outlook is different because it is a technical entity that places more value on the project's efforts and views the results of Seedbed School with interest. In particular, it is

hopeful about the potential of the Educational Risk Index (IRE) as an early-alert and school performance indicator.

Home Curriculum

Home Curriculum sought to improve the family environment in favor of children's education by providing information and educating parents about the necessary conditions for children to perform well in school. The method was applied by way of six meetings held throughout the academic year. The project implemented this model between 2006 and 2007 in the group of experimental schools. According to what we saw in focus groups, parents who participated in Home Curriculum managed to identify some aspects of their family dynamic that they needed to change in order to support their children's performance in school. In addition, children appreciated the changes in their family routines and environments. This model created a bridge between the school and the family, an element that is often absent in educational interventions, but one that plays a very important role in children's academic success. Nevertheless, one of the biggest problems this model faced was poor parent attendance, above all among fathers, given that the majority of them worked and did not have time to go to the meetings. Since this model was part of the experimental intervention, affecting the participation of children in labor activities was not a direct aim; therefore, its effect on reducing child labor cannot be determined.

Accelerated Learning and Education by Cycles

These models are the only ones implemented by the project that exclusively targeted working children and adolescents. Accelerated Learning is the answer for children and adolescents who have abandoned primary school for more than three years and, as a consequence, are no longer admitted to regular school. The model consists of providing children an accelerated curriculum that condenses primary education (grades 1 to 5) into one year, during 157 days of four-hour daily classes. The children who complete the model receive a certificate verifying completion of the first cycle that allows them to later enroll in regular schools. World Vision collaborated with another NGO (Social Vision) to train the teachers who work in this model.

The Education by Cycles model is based on the same methodological principles as Accelerated Learning, but targets adolescents who have finished primary school and are now between grades 6 and 11. The accelerated program lasts three years, one for every two years of regular schooling, and was implemented only in Madrid by a local NGO (*Alcalá de Henares*).¹¹

The two models proved successful for the different actors involved: children, parents, teachers, and school and municipal authorities. Their success is due to the fact that a suitable pedagogic alternative was offered to a group of children marginalized by the educational system. Students interviewed indicated that the teaching methodology allowed them to learn at their own rhythm while their teachers gave them personal attention. Many parents commented that they had never seen their children attend school before with such enthusiasm. School authorities believe that the model solves the problem that overage children create in classrooms. Municipal authorities,

¹¹ This model was not implemented in Funza because the municipality already had Telesecundaria, an alternative program targeting the same population.

moreover, believe that these models prevent adolescents not receiving formal education from taking part in illegal activities.

Although the sustainability of these models is not guaranteed since they have no public budget, the majority of the actors involved appear willing to continue the experience and keep the models in place. In particular, municipal authorities are aware of the benefits they provide and believe it is necessary to maintain them.

The project, moreover, has envisioned the reincorporation into normal schooling of the children targeted by both methods. Nevertheless, teachers and parents who participated in the focus groups believed that this would lead children to drop out of school, given that they lack the skills to adapt to the regular dynamic and methods and would surely be stigmatized because of their age.

Learning Leveling

Learning leveling consists of academic reinforcement activities for primary school children (grades 1 to 5) with poor academic performance in the 40 schools of Funza and Madrid. Classes were given by the same teachers of the schools, three days a week, two hours each day between March and June 2008.¹² World Vision trained the teachers and gave them a bonus for every hour of work.

This activity was not exclusively directed at working children, since it included all children with poor academic performance, working or not. From the project's point of view, this is a preventive mechanism, insofar as it prevents school desertion, thus keeping children from working. Although teachers believe that the experience helped diminish desertion and foster learning, the educational units are not expected to be replicated next year.

Job Skills

This model targeted students in grades 10 to 11 in Funza and Madrid. Its purpose was to offer them vocational guidance and training. It was implemented in 2007 and 2008 by *Instituto Politécnico de Occidente* in Madrid. During the first year, classes were taught for aspiring logistics operators and business assistants as well as in information systems and electronic trade. During 2008, classes were given for business assistants and in information systems, computer maintenance, mechanics, and accounting. Every subject entailed a total of 200 hours in class on Saturdays for 36 weeks.

In theory the classes targeted working children who studied, but in practice nonworking children also enrolled. Additionally, the selection criteria for students did not take into account whether the adolescents performed dangerous jobs or not, making it difficult to establish this model's contribution to eradicating and preventing child labor. Nevertheless, the classes were welcomed by students and parents alike, above all during the second year, because they covered the local demand unmet by this type of educational service.

¹² Leveling classes were taught on the days when the children did not have their normal classes.

Although the institute positively assessed the experience with these classes and is interested in continuing them, it does not have the resources to replicate them next year, making it unlikely that they will be offered again.

Centers of Interest

In 2008 the Centers of Interest offered children and adolescents in grades 6 to 11 the opportunity to use their free time creatively and also offered them recreational opportunities. This was done through two types of activities: recreational and personal growth workshops during school time and artistic training workshops on non-school time.¹³ The school day workshops lasted two hours and were held once a week for three weeks. They were given by the project promoters to all children, working or not. The chosen methodology was adapted from a model used by *Fe y Alegría*.¹⁴ Furthermore, the artistic training workshops were given by promoters in the municipalities of Funza and Madrid, by way of an agreement with World Vision, and primarily targeted working children. They also lasted three months, with weekly two-hour sessions.

Of all the models implemented by World Vision, this is the one that captured the largest number of beneficiaries. It was very well received and appreciated by students and parents insofar as it offered the children learning and recreational opportunities that they had never had before. Nevertheless, the duration was very short (three months), and its effectiveness at preventing or eradicating child labor is dubious, because it did not exclusively target working or at-risk children (above all in the school workshops), nor did it affect any of the variables associated with the phenomenon.

We must mention that the model of cooperation between World Vision, the schools, and the municipalities have paved the way for greater sustainability of the workshops. Hence, the municipalities will continue to offer them next year, given that the appropriate staff members are in place, along with the equipment and instruments donated by World Vision. Furthermore, some schools are interested in having their own teachers offer personal growth workshops.

General Observations on the Project's Educational Intervention

The educational models promoted by the project may be divided into three categories, based on the type of beneficiaries aided:

- Models that primarily helped working children: Accelerated Learning and Education by Cycles.
- Models that attended to the entire population in a broad group of schools: Centers of Interest, Learning Leveling, and Job Skills.
- Models that attended to the entire population in a small group of schools (experimental group): Seedbed School and Home Curriculum.

¹³ Morning schools offered the activities at afternoon and afternoon schools in the morning.

¹⁴ *Fe y Alegría* is a well known national program of the Catholic Church, consisting primarily of a network of schools for children with limited resources.

Table 3: Beneficiaries of the Project by Educational Model¹⁵

Strategy	Total Number of Children Involved	%
Working children		
Accelerated Learning	168	2.1%
Education by Cycles	154	1.9%
General population in broad school groups		
Centers of Interest	5,347	66.3%
Learning Leveling	1,224	15.2%
Job Skills	262	3.2%
General population in small school group (experimental group)		
Seedbed Schools	584	7.2%
Experimental control group	116	1.4%
Experimental Home Curriculum group	211	2.6%
Total	8,066	100.0%

Table 3 demonstrates that 85 percent of the beneficiaries are included in the models that helped the entire population of a broad group of schools. Furthermore, 66 percent of all beneficiaries participated in Centers of Interest. This model had the smallest impact on the problem of child labor and made the smallest contribution to improving the quality of education because it was implemented over a very short time. The models exclusively targeting working children helped 4 percent of beneficiaries, and those included in the experimental group helped 11 percent.

Furthermore, only the beneficiary groups of Education by Cycles and Accelerated Learning show a working or at-risk rate that is significantly higher than in the other groups (Table 4), indicating that the other models did not target working children.

Table 4: Beneficiaries by Educational Model and Activity Status at the Beginning of the Project

Strategy	Total Number of Children Involved	Number of Children Working Before the Intervention	Number of Children at Risk for Work	Number of Children who did not Work
Education by Cycles	154	25.3%	74.7%	0.0%
Accelerated Learning	168	19.6%	78.6%	1.8%
Job Skills	262	27.9%	54.6%	17.6%
Seedbed School	584	16.8%	62.0%	21.2%

¹⁵ Some 1,412 children must be added to the total number of beneficiaries. These children received different educational services in 2006, but do not fit under any of the models mentioned here. Many of them received educational grants to study in private schools. Others indirectly received benefits because the project donated equipment and material to the schools where they study.

Strategy	Total Number of Children Involved	Number of Children Working Before the Intervention	Number of Children at Risk for Work	Number of Children who did not Work
Experimental control group	116	19.8%	55.2%	25.0%
Learning Leveling	1,224	8.3%	60.7%	31.0%
Experimental Home Curriculum group	211	13.7%	53.6%	32.7%
Centers of Interest	5,347	19.8%	45.8%	34.4%
Total	8,066	18.0%	51.1%	30.9%

Additionally, no relationship has been found between the educational models and the working activity of the children before and after their participation in the project, given that the control group (which was not the target of project intervention) shows a higher percentage of children who stopped working than in the Education by Cycles and Accelerated Learning models. This indicates that the models did not reduce child labor.

Table 5: Beneficiaries by Educational Model and Activity Status Before and After the Project

Strategy	Number of Children Working Before the Intervention	Number of Children who Continued to Work	Number of Children who Stopped Working
Education by Cycles	39	59.0%	41.0%
Learning Leveling	101	56.4%	43.6%
Accelerated Learning	33	54.5%	45.5%
Centers of Interest	1,058	39.7%	60.3%
Seedbed School	98	13.3%	86.7%
Experimental control group	23	8.7%	91.3%
Experimental Home Curriculum group	29	6.9%	93.1%
Job Skills	73	0.0%	100.0%
Total	1,454	25.1%	74.9%

Nevertheless, if we analyze the project's intervention from an exclusively educational point of view, we see that it was successful at mobilizing the educational community around improving education at every level. The project knew how to make use of local private institutions (*Instituto Politécnico de Occidente* [IPO] and *Fundación Alcalá de Henares* [FAH]), the resources of public institutions (education and municipal centers), and existing methodologies (New School, Accelerated Learning, *Fe y Alegría*) to launch an educational support process for the children living in the two municipalities. The catalogue of interventions developed by the project is a useful tool in the development of local educational policies and may be used by other municipal governments in the country, given that it takes into account the different problems facing

children according to their age. Additionally, the project developed educational materials and the methodology for two important national blueprints: New School and Accelerated Learning.

Given the project's delay in formulating the list of educational models, there was not enough time for systematization and for municipal appropriation. If the project had devised the educational strategy from the beginning, it probably would have been more effective and sustainable.

Outcome 3

Parents support formal and nonformal education and the prevention of child labor.

This outcome envisioned two effects: (1) increased parental support of formal and informal education for their children and preventing child labor; (2) increased parental ability to economically support their children's education. To achieve the first effect, the project employed the Home Curriculum model, discussed in the previous chapter. To achieve the second, an organic farming project was developed with the mothers of children enrolled in Accelerated Learning and Education by Cycles.

Initially, the organic farming project anticipated helping some 400 people by utilizing six hectares of land offered by the municipality of Madrid. Nevertheless, the project's new engineer, who started in November 2007, believed that it was more suitable, given the participants' daily realities,¹⁶ to pursue a project allowing mothers to use their own homes for orchard crops. For this, the project was given a smaller plot of land by the municipality of Funza to be used for growing specific crops and teaching the beneficiaries specific farming techniques that would later be applied on the small plots of land at home. Given the insignificant size of production, this activity was geared more toward improving the families' diets than increasing their earnings.

Without a doubt, the people who participated in the organic farming project benefited from it. Some made better use of what they learned than others did, and, although this is not certain, may be able to support a group of workers and, with the help of the municipality, achieve a certain amount of profitability in the future. Nevertheless, seen within the context of the project, this activity has not contributed to or improved education, nor has it helped eradicate child labor. It has been a marginal project activity for a small group of women contributing little to its main objective, which was education.

Outcome 4

Local institutions and community organizations have decided to develop and support projects that prevent and reduce child labor.

The intermediate evaluation report indicated that, given the project's emphasis on developing and implementing educational models and the scant contact with community organizations, it

¹⁶ The initial project was based on the assumption that the beneficiaries possessed land and minimal capital for inputs and seeds. This was incorrect.

was unlikely for this outcome to crystallize properly. In effect, the report was right, and, with the verbal approval of USDOL, this activity was eliminated from the logical framework prepared in 2008. In addition, this outcome was not aligned with the rest of the intervention for two reasons: (1) the project's emphasis was on improving the quality of education, not preventing and reducing child labor, limiting the grounds on which local organizations may have made proposals; (2) to achieve its aim, the project did not maintain ties with grassroots organizations, and the local institutions with which it was associated were hired to provide services—a situation that did not lend itself to the creation of a network of institutional relationships needed to identify and build alliances for the project's development.

Outcome 5

Public policies concerning child labor in rural areas have been reassessed, enforced, or reformulated by the authorities.

Concerning this outcome, the intermediate evaluation also predicted that the project would make little headway, and, once again, this was accurate. As was explained in previous chapters, this was due in part to the fact that the municipalities of Funza and Madrid are not rural, and therefore the experience did not lead to a reformulation of public policy in this area. Additionally, the CINDE research project, which hoped to lay the foundation for World Vision to work with other rural municipalities, did not produce this result. We must point out that the logical framework drafted in 2008 defined the outcome in terms of local public policy.

The area where the project has had an impact on public policy has been in the municipalities of Funza and Madrid. During last two years of activities, the project achieved greater alignment with the municipalities and was successful at introducing actions to improve education and prevent child labor at the municipal level, particularly in Madrid. Today the two municipalities have chapters on these matters—a significant success for the project. Furthermore, the main authorities became aware of the importance of these two issues and actively involved in the project's work.

As we mentioned before, the design and execution of public policy are decentralized in Colombia, and the experience in Madrid can serve as a good example for other municipalities interested in improving education and preventing child labor. Nevertheless, this municipality also requires monitoring of the process and technical assistance to be able to put into practice the ideas that have been generated.

4.3 MONITORING ANALYSIS

The instrument used to observe the effects of the models in the experimental category was the Educational Risk Index (IRE). Using associated variables, the index seeks to predict the risk of student desertion. The reports available up until now confirm the instrument's methodological validity, but they do not make it possible to identify which of the experimental pedagogic models was most successful.¹⁷

¹⁷ Pizarro, Raul, 2008, Índices de Riesgo Educativo (IREs): Informe Técnico Resumido.

Another important monitoring instrument was the six-month survey on the educational and job activities being done by the children benefiting from the project. These surveys were used to draft the donor reports and were given at the beginning and at the conclusion of each one of the educational models.¹⁸ The data given in Section 4.2, Outcome 2, come from these surveys.

Regarding the definitions of exploitive child labor, the project faced two challenges that arose first from working with a population that was very heterogeneous and, second, with legislation¹⁹ that included almost every job performed by children in this category. As stated in the intermediate evaluation report, “The definition of exploitive child labor is particularly complex in this project, because, unlike other projects concentrated in communities with a high incidence of one particular kind of exploitive child labor, this one works with an economically and socially heterogeneous population without a single main productive activity.” This is why the monitoring system did not distinguish between the type of work being performed by children and adolescents. This, in part, explains the deficiencies in the project’s targets.

Furthermore, as demonstrated before, the use of the categories “preventive” and “eradicated” are not always pertinent, given that the majority of the models were not designed for the purpose of removing children from child labor, but rather as a means to improve their education, thus indirectly preventing them from working. We must remember that with the exception of Accelerated Learning and Education by Cycles, working and nonworking children participated in the models.

4.4 ANALYSIS OF COORDINATION AND ALLIANCES

In the area of inter-institutional coordination, the project successfully established agreements with prestigious organizations to implement study components, design education materials, and train teachers. In point of fact, it collaborated with *Universidad Nacional*, *Universidad Los Andes*, and CINDE to conduct studies, and with FVG, *Fundación para el Desarrollo Económico Social y Cultural* (Foundation for Economic, Social, and Cultural Development), and Social Vision to create education materials and train teachers. We must point out that all of these organizations are specialized and have extensive experience in implementing the jobs that they have been tasked with by the project. In addition, the project has forged an alliance with Telefonica’s PRONIÑO program to transfer the IRE’s pedagogic and methodological models.

The project has also successfully established a constructive relationship with the Secretariat of Education of Cundinamarca. This relationship has made it possible to officially recognize the implementation of pedagogic models, such as Accelerated Learning and Education by Cycles, in addition to students’ completion of these programs. Furthermore, during the last phase, the project maintained mutually cooperative relations with the National and Departmental Commission for the Eradication of Child Labor, ILO-IPEC, and the Ministry of Social Protection. Along these lines, it was able to overcome the difficulties in inter-institutional coordination seen during the first two years.

¹⁸ Over the last year, the surveys were given every three months in the majority of models.

¹⁹ Specifically, the Ministry of School Protection Resolution 1677 of 2008, which replaced Resolution 4448 of 2005, which was in effect during the majority of the project’s life. The two resolutions are almost identical with regard to banned jobs for children under 18.

At the local level, cooperation agreements were reached with the municipal Governments of Funza and Madrid, and with local private institutions such as *Alcalá de Henares* and *Instituto Politécnico de Occidente*. The project also played an important role in strengthening municipal capacity to undertake actions aimed at improving educational quality.

4.5 ANALYSIS OF MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION

During the first three years of operation, the project was affected by management problems. The intermediate evaluation report summarized these problems according to three groups: (1) lack of alignment between team members; (2) absence of an external communications strategy; and (3) failure to stick to the schedule. After the intermediate evaluation (March 2007), World Vision restructured the key personnel in an effort to rectify the situation. Nevertheless, it was unable to complete its technical team until November of that year (barely 10 months before concluding the activities). Over the course of four years, the project had three directors (two stable and one manager), three Monitoring and Evaluation specialists, and three education specialists. The field team also experienced high turnover.

These elements when added to the foregoing defects in project design, led to the failure in meeting the schedule. Nevertheless, over the last year, the project managed to find a productive working rhythm that allowed it to invest almost all of the planned resources and establish a positive image among the agents involved and the beneficiaries.

4.6 ANALYSIS OF SUSTAINABILITY

Given the problems with the project's design, targets, and management, its sustainability appears weak. The majority of educational models have just recently been implemented and will need another year or two before they are appropriated by educational and municipal authorities. For example, Seedbed School will need to be transformed from a program focused on language and mathematics into an institutional approach that seeks to transform educational centers with a view to introducing a new pedagogic model in the municipality. Furthermore, the Accelerated Learning and Education by Cycles models have yet to be institutionally accepted. Although the municipalities acknowledge their importance and are interested in continuing the experience, the resources needed have yet to be assigned for next year, and there are doubts concerning several technical and operational aspects, which the project must help to resolve. Additionally, the project's work to foster municipal public policy supporting education is still in the making. The municipalities still require technical assistance to help them get off the ground in dealing with this issue.

If the project is viewed as a social process and not as a program/budget, we could say that the current phase involves fine-tuning the educational models, whose transfer would still be premature.

This page left intentionally blank.

V LESSONS LEARNED AND GOOD PRACTICES

LESSONS LEARNED

- If the assumptions about the characteristics of the population are not confirmed using baseline data, a complete review of the logical framework is advisable, in addition to a reformulation of the project's aims and purposes.
- When the population is heterogeneous, targeting beneficiaries requires much more attention. It is also important to define with detail the dangerous jobs that will become the focus of the intervention. Although legally speaking, almost all jobs can be considered dangerous, it is always possible to identify those that present the greatest risk and focus the project's efforts in that direction.
- Within the context of a country with a solid legal and institutional framework, the component of strengthening policy, coordination, and alliances must be thoroughly designed by taking into account the role of the different actors who are participating, as well as the financial, institutional, and methodological resources available. Discussing the contents of these components in an official forum is advisable, one that allows compromises to be formalized and makes optimum use of all institutional resources.
- Support activities to improve family income must have clear aims and purposes. They must target a specific population in a way that makes it possible to precisely establish from the beginning how these activities will contribute to the eradication and prevention of child labor.
- Although specialized literature recognizes that high-quality educational services help prevent children from working, educational projects must envision specific mechanisms for eradicating and preventing child labor. These in turn must be implemented only with working or at-risk children.

GOOD PRACTICES

- Improving educational quality requires specialized technical know-how. Forming alliances with institutions that have experience in this type of work ensures that the educational models work properly.
- Educational models and innovations must be designed by taking into account the age of children and adolescents, because problems and their solutions vary in accordance with the age of the child.
- The creation of educational innovation portfolios by age group helps municipal and educational authorities to consider the entire spectrum of learning problems facing children and adolescents, and, along these lines, generates plans that contain solutions for the most important problems.

- Generating public educational policy requires simultaneous work in the different territorial areas where these policies are created: municipal, departmental, and national. Each one of these areas is assigned a specific role by taking into account the authority and obligations that the legal framework grants them.
- The implementation of accelerated educational models is an effective way to educate working children who are overage, either in primary or secondary education.
- Training parents to create a supportive family dynamic around the education of their children is an effective way to improve their academic performance.

VI CONCLUSIONS

The project enjoyed several favorable external conditions that forecast its success: (1) a highly consolidated national and institutional legal framework on education and child labor; (2) an executive organization with a longstanding presence in the country; (3) easy access to the project site and proximity between the local and national offices; (4) little trouble hiring qualified personnel; and (5) national organizations with expert know-how in education and child labor. Nevertheless, a proposal was designed that did not provide how to make use of these conditions, and, conversely, that established objectives and action strategies that were not suitable for the characteristics of the environment.

In the beginning, the project suffered from an inadequate design, which, given the terms of reference of USDOL's call for proposals, put forward irrelevant problems in the area of intervention. Additionally, the original proposal of World Vision did not alert the donor to the mistakes contained in the diagnosis of the original call. Subsequently, once the baseline demonstrated that the proposed problems were inaccurate, work carried on using assumptions that the same study questioned. In addition, without taking into account Colombia's ample bibliography on the issue, studies were designed that contributed little to meeting the project's objectives while slowing down the implementation of field activities. On top of this, there were some faults in project management, making the desired outcomes even harder to attain. One problem that bears mentioning was the difficulty of focusing the project's attention on the eradication and prevention of child labor, in addition to the high turnover in key personnel and field staff.

In spite of these faults, the project did succeed in identifying and putting into practice a series of educational innovations that contributed to improving education and preventing school desertion. Specifically, it made partial contributions to expanding an educational model (New School), which has proved to be successful in Colombia and may help reduce school desertion and increase academic performance in secondary schools. It also successfully designed and launched an accelerated educational program for secondary education, which, if expanded, could be the solution for many working children who no longer receive educational services. All of this work was done in coordination with municipal and educational authorities. Nevertheless, the central goal of the project, which was the prevention and eradication of child labor, was diluted due to improper targeting, which, in turn, was linked to an extremely heterogeneous population.

In light of the project's problems, the sustainability of its actions is weak, because the real-time implementation of its educational models has been two years in some cases and one year in others. This period has not been enough time for the models to earn institutional status or the appropriation of local organizations.

This page left intentionally blank.

VII RECOMMENDATIONS

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR WORLD VISION

It is of the utmost importance that World Vision establish an exit strategy in the area of intervention that ensures the continuation and sustainability of the educational models. Much has been achieved in terms of improving the quality of education in the municipalities of Funza and Madrid, but if this process does not continue, the risk exists that this progress will be undone. Additionally, the project has generated social demand and expectations for the Seedbed School, Accelerated Learning, and Education by Cycles models; so far, municipal and educational authorities have been unable to meet this demand. It is important for the project to work with these authorities until it can be determined how this can be done.

We recommend that World Vision reinvest this experience for the benefit of future institutional actions in the areas of education and child labor. To do so, World Vision would do well to consider the incorporation of some of the members of the project team into its staff and to conduct an analysis of the models in terms of technical, operational, and financial aspects, with a view to creating manuals and making it possible to implement them in other areas.

We also recommend that an agreement be reached with different institutions that have collaborated on the project (FVG, IPO, FAH) regarding their participation in ensuring the continuation of the models. In particular, we advise clarifying FVG's role in developing the rest of the components of Seedbed School, if World Vision decides to follow this course.

We recommend using the IRE data to establish the contribution of the experimental models to the students' academic achievement. Furthermore, we suggest drafting dissemination documents, in publicly accessible formats, that explain the IRE methodology and the outcomes of its application in the project. This could lead to their adoption by the Secretariat of Education of Cundinamarca and the Ministry of Education.

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR USDOL

We recommend that USDOL improve its project-support system for drafting the logical framework. Providing more training on the fundamental concepts of the PMP is also advisable. We also suggest establishing flexible rules of the game for modifying the logical framework if the situation demands it. We recommend that USDOL consider the possibility of extending by one more year the timeframe for carrying out some of the projects that have suffered extreme delays, which jeopardize the success and sustainability of the outcomes. This extension should not involve additional funds.

Due to the communication problems between World Vision and USDOL concerning the approval of the 2008 logical framework, we recommend establishing tighter monitoring mechanisms for projects whose implementation deviates from the norm.

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR PARTNERS OF THE AMERICAS

We recommend exploring the possibility of pursuing a strategy that involves the municipalities in the implementation of the educational innovations promoted by the project, with a view to incorporating them in time into municipal policy. Partners of the Americas' intervention could stand to benefit from the lessons learned in the World Vision project on building municipal capacity for improving educational quality. Therefore, we recommend a healthy exchange of information between the two institutions. In this regard, we recommend using the experiences and resources generated by UNICEF's Facts and Rights project.

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE SECRETARIAT OF EDUCATION OF CUNDINAMARCA

We recommend that the Secretariat of Education provide technical support to the municipalities where the project worked, for the purpose of continuing to consolidate the position of educational policy in municipal planning and budgets, in addition to consolidating the implementation of Accelerated Learning, Education by Cycles, and Seedbed School.

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE MUNICIPALITIES OF FUNZA AND MADRID

We recommend that the municipalities of Funza and Madrid establish, during a period of no less than four years, the resources to continue the Accelerated Learning and Education by Cycles models. After this period, it would be advisable to assess the educational models for the purposes of considering a new financing period.

We also recommend petitioning UNICEF and the Office of the Attorney General for the resources and technical assistance of the "Facts and Rights" project. This could help them to continue the experience of creating public policy targeting children.

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE COMMISSION FOR THE ERADICATION OF CHILD LABOR AND ILO-IPEC

We recommend that the commission support the continuation of the process underway in the municipalities of Funza and Madrid, both in terms of improving education and eradicating child labor. In particular, we recommend lobbying the Secretariat of Education and the municipalities to ensure that the actions taken by the project are implemented in a sustainable manner.