Opening Remarks

R. Alexander Acosta
Secretary
U.S. Department of Labor
Co-Chair Remarks

Betsy DeVos
Secretary
U.S. Department of Education
Task Force Subcommittees

1. Subcommittee on Education and Credentialing

2. Subcommittee on Attracting Business to Apprenticeship

3. Subcommittee on Expanding Access, Equity, and Career Awareness

4. Subcommittee on Administrative and Regulatory Strategies to Expand Apprenticeship
Subcommittee Progress Report

Subcommittee on Education and Credentialing
Subcommittee Recommendations

Recommendations from Subcommittee on Education and Credentialing:

1. Referencing the Work and Learn Model Continuum, the Industry-Recognized Apprenticeship program should expand more traditional work and learn models to incorporate the criteria of modern apprenticeship and to ensure better outcomes for workers and employers.

2. Industry-Recognized Apprenticeships must include work-based learning and performance assessment to ensure that the individual can apply knowledge, skills, and abilities related to the job, as well as obtain the education credentials needed to advance on the job and in his/her career.

Certifiers of Industry-Recognized Apprenticeships should help ensure those apprenticeships incorporate the core components of the most successful work and learn models, namely:
   a. Blended Learning
   b. Credit for Prior Knowledge and Experience
   c. Industry-Recognized Skill Standards and Credentials
   d. Structured Mentorship
   e. Paid Work Experience and Advancement Opportunities
   f. Portable, Industry-Recognized Credentials, Program Completion Certificates, and/or Degrees with Demonstrable Labor Market Value

3. Where there are standards-based, nationally portable, industry-recognized credentials in the field of new Industry-Recognized Apprenticeships, the Industry-recognized Apprenticeship program should ensure integration of the opportunity to earn the credential[s] and evidence that related technical instruction is aligned to both the theory- and performance-based learning outcomes required for the credentials.
4. To rely on standards-based, nationally portable, industry-recognized credentials as a key element of Industry Recognized Apprenticeship programs quality assurance and accountability, the public-private sector partners implementing these programs should articulate the requirements for standards-based, nationally portable, industry-recognized credentials.

5. As Industry Recognized Apprenticeship programs’ federal partners, the U.S. Departments of Labor and Education should implement and/or support strategies for making technical instruction more affordable for both apprentices and employers, by:
   a. Partnering with virtual learning providers to expand the reach and reduce costs of technical instruction;
   b. Identifying or producing foundational, core curriculum in each sector and “open sourcing” it for learning providers;
   c. Where duplications are evident, cease federally funding development of duplicative curriculum or assets.

6. This subcommittee also recommends federal action to:
   a. Identify and make available capacity-building resources for Industry Recognized Apprenticeship program certifying organizations to ensure they are equipped to provide quality services in support of Industry-Recognized Apprenticeships;
   b. Identify and make available capacity-building resources for institutions of higher education, other service providers, and employers to partner in planning for and building needed capacity;
   c. Reform the Registered Apprenticeship program to modernize the system and encourage greater employer and industry sector involvement.
7. Continuum

Work-and-Learn Model Continuum

LOW TOUCH Work-and-Learn
- Less structured
- Low engagement/resources needed from the employer
- General career knowledge for the working learner

Career Fair, Career Expo/Job Fair
- Industry Tour
- Job Shadowing
- Externship
- Pre-Apprenticeship
- Mentorship
- Clinical Training/Practicum
- Returnship
- On-the-Job Training
- Internship
- Cooperative Education/Co-Op
- Apprenticeship
- Registered Apprenticeship

HIGH TOUCH Work-and-Learn
- Very structured
- High engagement/resources needed from the employer
- Full immersion and career/industry knowledge for the working learner

Critical to the work of the full Task Force is an understanding of, and an agreement to, a set of terms and definitions to guide our deliberations. The subcommittee on Education and Credentialing has created a glossary of terms for discussion by the full Task Force.

8. **Apprenticeship:** An arrangement that includes a paid-work component and an educational or instructional component, wherein an individual obtains workplace relevant knowledge and skills.

9. **Industry-Recognized Apprenticeship:** A high-quality apprenticeship program that includes a paid-work component and an educational or instructional component, wherein an individual obtains workplace-relevant knowledge and skills. Programs will be developed by third parties and may include trade and industry groups, companies, non-profit organizations, unions, and joint labor-management organizations. Developed programs are those that can be certified as a high-quality program by a third-party certifier that has received favorable determination from DOL.

10. **Job Training Programs:** A Federal program designed to promote skills development or workplace readiness and increase the earnings or employability of workers, but does not include Federal student aid or student loan programs.

11. **Blended Learning:** Multiple learning modes are available to engage an individual, including theory-based classroom instruction, simulations and online or distance learning, and other innovative learning modes. This is coupled with, and supplemented by, performance-based or “hands-on” learning in the work environment.
12. **Credit for Prior Knowledge & Experience:** Individuals who have developed knowledge and skills through prior educational and work experience can receive credit for their demonstrated abilities.

13. **Industry Skill Standards & Credentials:** Curriculum/training is based on industry skill standards, while third-party assessments (including industry credentials) measure and acknowledge individual proficiency.

14. **Mentorship:** Employer mentors support an individual during his/her work-based learning experience, providing guidance on company culture, specific position functions, and workplace policies and procedures. In many cases, mentors help develop learning objectives for a mentee and assist in measuring his/her progress and proficiency.

15. **Paid-Work Experience & Advancement Opportunity:** An individual will earn a wage during the work-based learning portion of the program. Work, full or part-time, is usually paid and tied to an academic credit from a secondary or post-secondary school partner. Wages/workplace responsibilities will often increase at defined milestones as determined by an employer based on the individual’s advancement.

16. **Program Completion Certificates:** Individuals who complete the program receive nationally portable, industry recognized credentials, program certificates and/or degrees that have demonstrable consumer and labor market value.
Subcommittee Progress Report

Subcommittee on Attracting Business to Apprenticeship
Subcommittee Recommendations

Recommendations from Subcommittee on Attracting Business to Apprenticeship:

17. Improved Risk-Sharing Tools and Streamlined Processes to Manage Them
   a. Update federal funding criteria to:
      i. Ensure Registered Apprenticeship programs and Industry-Recognized Apprenticeship programs are treated equally;
      ii. Encourage the development of apprenticeship programs for new hires as well as incumbent workers;
      iii. Encourage the reallocation of state resources to apprenticeship
   b. Streamline state grant access by creating a single application to reduce the tremendous burden on multi-state firms that are new to apprenticeship.
   c. Explore sector-led financial options to help scale Industry-Recognized Apprenticeship and Registered Apprenticeship programs. Examples include new models of public/private partnership, income sharing agreement models with private sector capital, and others that can be developed across sectors.
   d. Evaluate all Federal Government workforce development programs according to a robust set of criteria and realign funding for underperforming programs to Industry-Recognized Apprenticeship programs as a strategy to kick start the adoption of the model across industry sectors.
Subcommittee Recommendations

18. **A Robust Needs Analysis to Narrow Down the Areas of Most Acute Skills Shortage**

   a. Via the U.S. Department of Labor apprenticeship website, the Department should include a needs analysis adaptable to businesses of all sizes and catered to priority Industry Recognized Apprenticeship program sectors, as cited in the Executive Order and the President’s 2019 budget.

   b. The Bureau of Labor Statistics and the U.S. Census Bureau should develop a joint project to measure businesses’ skills shortages and training investments through existing surveys, administrative, and third-party data. The Bureau of Labor Statistics should develop a supplement to the Job Openings and Labor Turnover Survey, and the U.S. Census Bureau should develop a module to the new Annual Business Survey as potential new survey vehicles.

   c. The Department of Labor’s Office of Apprenticeship should establish a partnership with the Census Bureau to research and publish metrics on the long-term employment outcomes and retention of apprentices relative to other workers. This project could build upon an existing joint project between the U.S. Census Bureau, the National Association of Manufacturers, and the National Skills Clearinghouse.

   d. Industry associations should be encouraged to play a critical role in gathering data from sector employers. As a means of evaluating effectiveness and broadening awareness, associations could produce sector-wide case studies to help companies quantify the return on investment for both apprenticeship programs and other training programs where employer dollars are being spent. As companies and trade associations gather this return on investment data, the Federal Government should enable the dissemination of this information, as well as other aspects of a well-rounded return on investment, including incentives, recognitions by the Department and the applicability of Registered Apprenticeship and Industry-Recognized Apprenticeship programs to college credit or articulation.

   e. To allow widespread adoption of apprenticeship, certifiers of Industry-Recognized Apprenticeship programs should keep consistent data and metrics as established by the U.S. Department of Labor to indicate their program success as well as showcase proof of concept to enable industry expansion.
19. **Centralized Apprenticeship Resources**

- a. The Apprenticeship Playbook
- b. The Benefits & Costs of Apprenticeship: A Business Perspective
- c. Industry-developed occupational competencies
- d. Industry-developed, competency-based apprenticeship standards
- e. Curricula that align with those standards (made available through a central provider or a network of providers)
- f. Instruction and resource guides for trainers/educators
- g. Instruction and resource guides for mentors
- h. Resources on how to develop online learning programs that can be used to complement or replace traditional classroom training, when appropriate
- i. National certification for IRAP and RA programs
- j. Research that assesses the effectiveness of various models of work-based learning
- k. Detailed company case studies spanning industries targeted for apprenticeship expansion, such as manufacturing, health care, and cybersecurity
Subcommittee Report

Subcommittee on Expanding Access, Equity, and Career Awareness
20. **Awareness**: The Subcommittee believes that building brand awareness of apprenticeship through a multi-faceted campaign will promote faster, more respected, and more diverse pathways to employment.

   a. Financial support of online campaigns that use high impact digital and social media vehicles that speak to multiple generations;
   b. Promotion of apprenticeship as a positive earn and learn pathway that can benefit new and current employees seeking to move up career ladders through the utilization of all federal funding mechanisms to ensure both the traditional trades as well as non-traditional industry sectors are engaged through apprenticeship;
   c. Funding the research and promotion of the findings of the monetary return on investment of employing and training American apprentices through the Registered Apprenticeship, Industry Recognized Apprenticeship program and other industry based programs.

21. **Access**: The Subcommittee believes that the Federal Government has acknowledged the necessity of apprenticeship programs - as a model that can expand pathways of opportunity and incentivizes utilization of an earn and learn model for both the employer and apprentice.

   a. Use federal investments to specifically expand and support pre-apprenticeship activities in middle and secondary schools for career and technical education and/or other educational certificates;
   b. Examine and reduce barriers that exist around reciprocity;
   c. Promote the use of technology for all learners to access information about industry-approved apprenticeship programs early on in their education;
   d. Streamline credit for prior learning and/or work experiences to accelerate the time to full employment;
   e. Develop linkages for digital platforms and/or social media channels where employers and potential apprentices can more easily connect.
22. **Equity:** The subcommittee believes that equal access to employment opportunities, will be a defining element of Industry Recognized Apprenticeship programs. Equity is about ensuring that each American has equal access and opportunity to the benefits of apprenticeship and employment. In some cases, the subcommittee has recognized that regulatory benchmarks are important, but can prevent industries from participating due to burdensome compliance or overly bureaucratic or inconsistent processes.

   a. The U.S. Department of Labor should implement clear guidelines that reinforce the principles of equity and define certifier, sponsor and Office of Apprenticeship responsibilities;
   
   b. Certifiers and sponsors should develop comprehensive outreach strategies to reach diverse populations;
   
   c. The U.S. Department of Labor should continue funding community-based organization efforts to expand access to populations who have historically suffered from unequal access and under-utilization to Registered Apprenticeship programs and expand funding to Industry Recognized Apprenticeship Programs.

23. **Additional Recommendation:** Recommend that identified and agreed upon improvements to the Registered Apprenticeship system be pursued and implemented.
Subcommittee on Administrative and Regulatory Strategies to Expand Apprenticeship
Industry Recognized Apprenticeship program Recommendations

24. Begin Industry Recognized Apprenticeship program implementation with a pilot project in an industry without well-established Registered Apprenticeship programs to test the process for reviewing certifiers, and to better understand how to support industry groups working to develop standards and materials for Industry Recognized Apprenticeship programs.

25. Industry Recognized Apprenticeship programs should focus on mastery and competency, not just seat time or training hours. Sectors should set standards based on industry needs; establish different requirements in technical vs professional occupations within sectors.

26. Fundamental to the success of apprenticeship is a well-designed, and highly structured work experience. This is where most learning takes place. Industry Recognized Apprenticeship program standards and quality guidelines must support this structured learning experience, as well as ensure the safety of apprentices and their coworkers.

27. Industry Recognized Apprenticeship program participants cannot be considered as apprentices for the purpose of meeting the Davis-Bacon Act wage requirements.

28. Industry Recognized Apprenticeship programs are not required to follow specific wage progression rules, but must make clear to apprentices what wages they will be paid and under what circumstances wages will increase.
Industry Recognized Apprenticeship program Questions and Recommendations

**Question 1:** What will the U.S. Department of Labor do if there are multiple trade or business associations within an industry sector and they develop conflicting or inconsistent industry standards? What safeguards will be put in place to prevent conflicts of interest on the part of certifiers that are also membership organizations?

29. The U.S. Department of Labor should solicit proposals for governing or oversight bodies that include multiple trade or business associations within an industry sector. This governing body should be required to reach agreement on certification standards as a criterion for the Department’s approval. Leadership of this governing body should rotate on an annual basis between members to ensure a balanced perspective over time.

**Question 2:** How will trade associations and industry groups who do not have expertise in developing curriculum negotiate college credit on behalf of their members? Colleges control prior learning assessment and transfer of credit issues, and while certifiers could encourage partnerships between employers and colleges, they could not enforce these partnerships or prior learning credit agreements.

30. Industry-based governing bodies, in consultation with the U.S. Department of Labor, should be responsible for developing the Industry-Recognized Apprenticeship program credential standards, as well as confirming that these standards are achieved through the work-based learning and related technical instruction requirements. Industry-based governing bodies should be able to influence or negotiate with employers and colleges to partner on transfer or credit agreements, before verification of the credentialing standard.


**Industry Recognized Apprenticeship program Questions and Recommendations**

**Question 3:** How will State Apprenticeship Agencies interact with the Industry-Recognized Apprenticeship programs, and can states distribute federally-funded, state administered grant funds to sponsors or participants in the Industry-Recognized Apprenticeship system?

31. The U.S. Department of Labor should clarify whether training funds are available for the Industry-Recognized Apprenticeship programs and, if training funds will be available, how these training dollars will be distributed to credentialing bodies. Given that the new Industry-Recognized Apprenticeship programs should require consistency in credentialing standards within industry sectors and uniform reporting requirements at the state and federal levels, states should be able to distribute federally-funded, state-administered grant funds, consistent with funding guidance.

**Question 4:** What systems will the U.S. Department of Labor put in place to collect and verify outcomes data for Industry-Recognized Apprenticeship programs?

32. The new Industry-Recognized Apprenticeship program system should have a single reporting platform that is utilized at both the state and federal levels. Funding may need to be available for state efforts to align to the Department’s-designed reporting platform.
Industry Recognized Apprenticeship program Questions and Recommendations

**Question 5:** How will the U.S. Department of Labor differentiate between high/low quality certifiers, especially since no potential certifiers will have prior experience administering an Industry-Recognized Apprenticeship program?

**Question 6:** How often will certifiers be reviewed, and under what conditions would the positive recommendation be removed?

**Question 7:** What does it mean for a certifier to be “recommended” by the Department?

**Question 8:** How will the Department differentiate between high value and low value credentials?

**Question 9:** What constitutes “sufficient support and input from sector participants” for potential Industry-Recognized Apprenticeship program certifiers?
Registered Apprenticeship program Recommendations

33. WIOA should include waivers/set-asides to make it easier for sponsors to receive WIOA funding, allow sponsors to serve incumbent workers moving up the career ladder.

34. WIOA outcomes measures must take into account that apprentices are employed from start of programs, so pre- and post-program earnings may appear to be smaller than for other programs designed to serve those unemployed until their program is over.

35. WIOA outcome measures must recognize that apprenticeships take longer to complete, and persistence in an apprenticeship program, earning credentials and moving through wage progression schedules should serve as positive interim outcomes.

36. Reform wage and hour rules to allow apprentices under 18 to work on manufacturing floor, use hoists and lifts in healthcare settings, use power tools and equipment, etc. when properly supervised – only in non-high-risk occupations. Since apprentices are paid a wage, they are prohibited from participating in these activities.
Closing Remarks

Task Force on Apprenticeship Expansion

Next Meeting:
May 10 (in-person meeting)