Task Force on Apprenticeship Expansion

March 15, 2018 | In-Person Meeting
Opening Remarks

R. Alexander Acosta
Secretary
U.S. Department of Labor
Co-Chair Remarks

Betsy DeVos
Secretary
U.S. Department of Education
Co-Chair Remarks

Wilbur L. Ross, Jr.
Secretary
U.S. Department of Commerce
1. Subcommittee on Education and Credentialing
2. Subcommittee on Attracting Business to Apprenticeship
3. Subcommittee on Access, Equity, and Career Awareness
4. Subcommittee on Administrative and Regulatory Strategies to Expand Apprenticeship
Subcommittee Report

Subcommittee on Expanding Access, Equity, and Career Awareness
## Subcommittee Members

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Member</th>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Principal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cari Dominguez</td>
<td>Manpower, Inc.</td>
<td>Cari Dominguez</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>William Irwin</td>
<td>Carpenters</td>
<td>Douglas McCarron</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carrie Houtman</td>
<td>DOW</td>
<td>Andrew Liveris</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adam Jones</td>
<td>Actor</td>
<td>John Ratzenberger</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ron Marlow (Chair)</strong></td>
<td>Urban League</td>
<td>Marc Morial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tom Kriger</td>
<td>NABTU</td>
<td>Sean McGarvey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greg Sizemore</td>
<td>ABC</td>
<td>Michael Bellaman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patrick Weber</td>
<td>Governor, State of South Dakota</td>
<td>Gov. Dennis Daugaard</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shelly Weir</td>
<td>AHLA</td>
<td>Katherine Lugar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jennifer Worth</td>
<td>AACC</td>
<td>Walter Bumphus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laurie Rowe</td>
<td>DOL</td>
<td>Secretary Acosta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ebony Lee</td>
<td>ED</td>
<td>Secretary DeVos</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Subcommittee Recommendations**

**Awareness Meta-Message:** Build brand awareness of apprenticeship through a multi-faceted campaign that promotes faster, more respected, and more diverse pathways to employment.
- Use high impact digital and social media vehicle that speaks to multiple generations.
- Promote apprenticeship as a positive earn and learn pathway that can benefit both new employees as well as current employees seeking to move up career ladders.
- Assess and align existing federal resources to promote apprenticeship.
- Identify and promote information on the monetary return on investment of employing and training American apprentices.

**Access Meta-Message:** Recognize and fund Industry-Recognized Apprenticeship as a model that creates and expands pathways of opportunity and incentivizes the utilization of an earn and learn model for both the employer and apprentices.
- Streamline credit for prior learning and/or work experiences to accelerate the time to full employment.
- Develop linkages for digital platforms and/or social media channels where employers and potential apprentices can more easily connect.
- Promote the use of technology for all learners to access information about industry-approved apprenticeship programs early on in their education.
- Use federal investments to specifically expand and support pre-apprenticeship activities in middle and secondary schools for career and technical education (CTE) and/or other educational certificates.
- Examine and reduce barriers that exist around reciprocity.
**Equity Meta-Message:** Equity is about ensuring that each American has equal access and opportunity to the benefits of apprenticeship and employment.

- Sponsors and/or certifiers should develop a comprehensive outreach plan to ensure equity and inclusion.
- Recommend a regulatory mechanism that is “substantially equivalent” to policy embodied in 29 CFR, at a minimum, and in particular: Apprenticeship Agreements, 29 CFR 29.12 Complaints and Complaint Resolution, and Equal Employment Opportunities.
- Deliberately identify and federally fund partners that will encourage the recruitment and enrollment of historically-under-utilized persons as outlined in 29 CFR 30.6 and 30.7.
- Responsibility should be vested principally with industry sponsors and/or certifiers, but secondarily with the Office of Apprenticeship.

**Additional Recommendation:** Recommend that identified and agreed upon improvements to the Registered Apprenticeship system be pursued and implemented.
Subcommittee Report

Subcommittee on Administrative and Regulatory Strategies to Expand Apprenticeship
## Subcommittee Members

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Member</th>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Principal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gardner Carrick</td>
<td>NAM</td>
<td>Jay Timmons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dane Linn</td>
<td>BRT</td>
<td>Josh Bolten</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Tom Kriger (Chair)</strong></td>
<td>NABTU</td>
<td>Sean McGarvey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joseph Powell</td>
<td>SMART</td>
<td>Joe Sellers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jason Tyszko</td>
<td>US Chamber</td>
<td>Thomas Donohue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brenezza DaParre Garcia</td>
<td>APLU</td>
<td>Mark Rosenberg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emily Stover DeRocco</td>
<td>E3</td>
<td>Emily Stover DeRocco</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stephanie Groen</td>
<td>Governor, State of Iowa</td>
<td>Gov. Kim Reynolds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denise Peppard</td>
<td>Northrop Grumman</td>
<td>Wesley Bush</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Catherine Ross</td>
<td>NIMS</td>
<td>Montez King</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laurie Rowe</td>
<td>DOL</td>
<td>Secretary Acosta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dave Langdon</td>
<td>DOC</td>
<td>Secretary Ross</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In Brief

• The Subcommittee has discussed potential reforms to the existing Registered Apprenticeship (RA) system for DOL to consider as it undertakes reforms to this system per the OMB Unified Regulatory Agenda.

• Following are the recommendations and outstanding questions for consideration as the new Industry-Recognized Apprenticeship Program (IRAP) is developed.

• Because RA and IRAP will be parallel and complementary apprenticeship systems, their simultaneous reform and launch creates uncertainties for companies, trade or industry groups, educational institutions, labor unions, and other key stakeholders, which could slow the needed expansion of apprenticeships in the United States. Our recommendations highlight key uncertainties for the Administration to address.
**Subcommittee Recommendations**

**IRAP Specific**

- Begin IRAP program with pilot project in industry without well-established RA programs to test process for reviewing certifiers, better understand how to support industry groups working to develop standards and materials for IRAPs.

- IRAPs should focus on mastery and competency, not just seat time or training hours. Sectors should set standards based on industry needs; within a given sector there could be different requirements in technical vs professional occupations.

- Fundamental to the success of apprenticeship is well-designed, highly structured work experience. This is where most learning takes place. IRAP program standards and quality guidelines must support this structured learning experience, as well as ensure the safety of apprentices/coworkers.

- IRAP participants cannot be considered as apprentices for the purpose of meeting Davis-Bacon Act wage requirements.

- IRAPs are not required to follow specific wage progression rules, but must make clear to apprentices what wages they will be paid and under what circumstances wages will increase.
**IRAP Questions**

- How will DOL differentiate between high/low quality certifiers, especially since no potential certifiers will have prior experience administering an IRAP program?

- How often will certifiers be reviewed and under what conditions would the positive recommendation be removed?

- What safeguards will be put in place to prevent conflicts of interest on the part of certifiers that are also membership organizations?

- What does it mean for a certifier to be “recommended” by DOL?

- How will trade associations and industry groups that do not have expertise in developing curriculum negotiate college credit on behalf of their members? Colleges control prior learning assessment and transfer of credit issues, and while certifiers could encourage partnerships between employers and colleges, they could not enforce these partnerships or prior learning credit agreements.
Closing Remarks

Task Force on Apprenticeship Expansion

Next Meetings:
April 10 (virtual meeting)
May 10 (in-person meeting)
APPENDIX

Recommendations from Subcommittee on Attracting Business to Apprenticeship:

• To recruit more businesses to apprenticeship, we need to identify precisely which problems a business or sector is trying to solve and then provide data and case studies to demonstrate how apprenticeship can help.

• Challenges addressed by apprenticeship include: Diversifying the workforce, Improving employee retention, Upskilling incumbent workers, Reaching new communities of potential employees, Retaining institutional knowledge of the aging workforce, Financial Return On Investment Subcommittee Progress Report, and Recommendations.

• In order to attract more employers to apprenticeship, and in particular smaller and medium sized businesses, industry groups must develop and make centralized resources readily available.

• These resources include: Industry-developed, competency-based apprenticeship standards, Curricula that align with those standards (made available through a central provider or a network of providers), Instruction and resource guides for trainers/educators, Instruction and resource guides for mentors, Industry-developed occupational competencies Subcommittee Progress Report, and Recommendations.

• Companies need to understand how to optimize their training investments (including current expenditures) to yield desired outcomes, Need to better understand how employers currently invest training dollars, what are their goals, how much do they spend, what are the outcomes? Case studies or other tools could be developed to help industries quantify their current expenditures and evaluate the effectiveness of those investments.
APPENDIX

Recommendations from Subcommittee on Education and Credentialing:
Critical to the work of the full Task Force is an understanding of, and an agreement to, a set of terms and definitions to guide our deliberations. The subcommittee on Education and Credentialing has created a glossary of terms for discussion by the full Task Force today.

GLOSSARY:

• **Apprenticeship**: An arrangement that includes a paid-work component and an educational or instructional component, wherein an individual obtains workplace-relevant knowledge and skills.

• **Industry-Recognized Apprenticeship**: A high-quality apprenticeship program that includes a paid-work component and an educational or instructional component, wherein an individual obtains workplace-relevant knowledge and skills. Programs will be developed by third parties and may include trade and industry groups, companies, non-profit organizations, unions, and joint labor-management organizations. Developed programs are those that can be certified as a high-quality program by a third-party certifier that has received favorable determination from DOL.

• **Job Training Programs**: A Federal program designed to promote skills development or workplace readiness and increase the earnings or employability of workers, but does not include Federal student aid or student loan programs.

• **Blended Learning**: Multiple learning modes are available to engage an individual, including theory-based classroom instruction, simulations and online or distance learning, and other innovative learning modes. This is coupled with, and supplemented by, performance-based or “hands-on” learning in the work environment.
Credit for Prior Knowledge & Experience: Individuals who have developed knowledge and skills through prior educational and work experience can receive credit for their demonstrated abilities.

Industry Skill Standards & Credentials: Curriculum/training is based on industry skill standards, while third-party assessments (including industry credentials) measure and acknowledge individual proficiency.

Mentorship: Employer mentors support an individual during his/her work-based learning experience, providing guidance on company culture, specific position functions, and workplace policies and procedures. In many cases, mentors help develop learning objectives for a mentee and assist in measuring his/her progress and proficiency.

Paid-Work Experience & Advancement Opportunity: An individual will earn a wage during the work-based learning portion of the program. Work, full or part-time, is usually paid and tied to an academic credit from a secondary or post-secondary school partner. Wages/workplace responsibilities will often increase at defined milestones as determined by an employer based on the individual’s advancement.

Program Completion Certificates: Individuals who complete the program receive nationally portable, industry recognized credentials, program certificates and/or degrees that have demonstrable consumer and labor market value.
Recommendations from Subcommittee on Education and Credentialing:

• Better connect employers and learning providers to ensure competency-based instruction is aligned to the knowledge, skills, and abilities needed on the job.

• Industry credentials integrated into apprenticeship must be standards-based, industry-recognized, and nationally portable.

• Work with industry certifiers to ensure industry recognized apprenticeships incorporate the key criteria of:
  – blended learning,
  – credit for prior knowledge and experience,
  – industry skill standards and credentials,
  – mentorship,
  – paid-work experience and advancement opportunities, and
  – program completion certificates.

• Industry recognized apprenticeship must include work based learning and performance assessment to ensure the individual can apply knowledge, skills, and abilities related to the job.

• Recognizing the Work and Learn Model Continuum, the goal is to expand more traditional work and learn models to incorporate the criteria of modern apprenticeship and to ensure better outcomes for workers and employers.

• Reform Registered Apprenticeship program to modernize the system and encourage greater involvement by employers and industry sectors.
Work-and-Learn Model Continuum

LOW TOUCH Work-and-Learn
- Less structured
- Low engagement/resources needed from the employer
- General career knowledge for the working learner

Career Fair, Career Expo/Job Fair
Industry Tour
Job Shadowing
Externship
Pre-Apprenticeship
Mentorship
Clinical Training/Practicum
Returnship
On-the-Job Training
Internship
Cooperative Education/Co-Op
Apprenticeship
Registered Apprenticeship

HIGH TOUCH Work-and-Learn
- Very structured
- High engagement/resources needed from the employer
- Full immersion and career/industry knowledge for the working learner

ADDTritional Recommendations from Subcommittee on Education and Credentialing:

- TO EXPAND EDUCATIONAL OPPORTUNITIES NEEDED TO ENSURE MORE INDIVIDUALS CAN ENROLL IN AND COMPLETE AN APPRENTICESHIP
  [in addition to one in the original 6: Expand more traditional work and learn models, e.g., co-ops and internships, to incorporate the criteria of modern, industry-recognized apprenticeships to ensure better outcomes for workers and employers]
  - Clarify and/or align the use of Perkins and WIOA funds to support IRAPs
  - Use H-1B resources for competitive grants to partner business organizations and learning providers to build more and non-redundant competency-based educational pathways with integrated work experiences

- KEY STRATEGIES FOR INCREASING CONSISTENCY AMONG PROVIDERS OF RELATED TECHNICAL INSTRUCTION
  - Where there are standards-based, nationally portable, industry-recognized credentials in the field, require integration and evidence that curriculum is aligned to the theory- and performance-based learning outcomes required for the credentials
  - Create a technical assistance website[s] to showcase promising practices in building competency-based educational pathways aligned to industry credentials

- KEY STRATEGIES FOR MAKING TECHNICAL INSTRUCTION MORE AFFORDABLE FOR APPRENTICES AND EMPLOYERS
  - Partner with virtual learning providers to expand reach and reduce costs of technical instruction
  - Identify or produce foundational, core curriculum in each sector and “open source” it for learning providers
  - Where duplications are evident, the federal government should stop funding development of “the same curriculum”
APPENDIX

ADDITIONAL Recommendations from Subcommittee on Education and Credentialing:

• KEY STRATEGIES FOR RELYING ON STANDARDS-BASED, NATIONALLY PORTABLE, INDUSTRY-RECOGNIZED CREDENTIALS AS A KEY ELEMENT OF QUALITY ASSURANCE AND ACCOUNTABILITY

[in addition to one in the original 6: Industry credentials integrated into apprenticeship must be standards-based, nationally portable, and industry recognized]

➢ Articulate the requirements for standards-based, nationally portable, industry-recognized credentials
➢ Develop/support a broad communications strategy about industry-recognized credentials
➢ Charge business organizations with educating their members about industry-recognized credentials

• KEY STRATEGIES TO ENCOURAGE THE AWARD OF COLLEGE CREDIT FOR ON-THE-JOB LEARNING EXPERIENCES

[NOTE: The AACC and APLU had a private discussion with the subcommittee chair and could not support the inclusion of this bullet or related recommendations into the formal subcommittee recommendations.]

The subcommittee chair believes this is a critical issue and offers the following recommendation for full subcommittee consideration:

➢ Develop strategies for ensuring that non-credit courses that are part of an apprenticeship program can be awarded credit for those who wish to continue their education and earn a degree.