



International Labour Organization

IPEC

International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour

IPEC Evaluation

**Program for the prevention and
progressive elimination of child
labour in small-scale traditional gold
mining in South America**

Phase II

P.260.03.200.052 - RLA/02/P50/USA

An independent final evaluation

March 2005

NOTE ON THE EVALUATION PROCESS AND REPORT

This independent evaluation was managed by ILO-IPEC's Design, Evaluation and Documentation Section (DED) following a consultative and participatory approach. DED has ensured that all major stakeholders were consulted and informed throughout the evaluation and that its independence was not compromised during the process.

The evaluation was carried out by an external consultant*. The field mission took place in March, 2005. The opinions and recommendations included in this report are those of the authors and do not compromise the ILO or any other organization involved in the project.

Funding for this project evaluation was provided by the United States Department of Labor. This report does not necessarily reflect the views or policies of the United States Department of Labor, nor does mentioning of trade names, commercial products, or organizations imply endorsement by the Government of the United States.

* Mauricio García Moreno

Table of Contents

1. Executive summary	1
2. The evaluation's objectives and methodology	3
2.1. Objectives.....	3
2.2. Methodology	3
2.3. Constraints and scope.....	4
3. The project's background and description	6
4. Social and institutional context.....	9
5. Findings of the evaluation	13
5.1 Program design.....	13
5.2 Program implementation.....	16
5.3 Program's achievements	19
5.4 Sustainability.....	28
6. Conclusions and lessons learnt.....	32
6.1 Conclusions	32
6.2 Lessons learnt.....	34
7. Recommendations	36
8. Annex.....	37

1. Executive summary

The International Program for the Elimination of Child Labor (IPEC) of the International Labor Organization (ILO) executed the “Program for the Prevention and Progressive Elimination of Child Labor in Small-Scale Gold Mining in South America” in Bolivia, Ecuador and Peru, counting with the financial support of the United States Department of Labor (USDOL).

The program started on August 2000. Initially the project’s execution would take two years. However, its duration and funding expanded to a second phase, which took place between September 2002 and September 2004. This paper presents the second phase evaluation.

The program’s development objective was “To contribute to the elimination of child labor in small-scale mining in Bolivia, Ecuador and Peru”. Its specific objectives were: 1) to raise awareness and mobilize key organizations in the three countries in support of the eradication of child work in small-scale mining, 2) to develop child-labor monitoring systems in the selected communities, 3) to implement replicable models for the prevention and withdrawal of children from dangerous child labor in selected mining communities, and 4) to propagate these models.

The program had regional, national and local components. The regional components consisted of awareness and occupational health cross-cutting Action Programs (AP’s). The national AP’s were aimed at strengthening national organizations essential for fighting against child work in small-scale mining, and the local AP’s were aimed at developing replicable models to intervene in mining communities.

The evaluation found that the program’s design was a relevant, coherent and comprehensive social change proposal that responded to the complexity of the problem it endeavored to solve. However, some of its objectives were inappropriately formulated as they overrated the achievements that could be accomplished in countries with a weak institutional development of their social policies.

It was found that the program was adequately implemented and that some of its characteristics are the timely submitting of products, the efficient use of resources, the generation of learning conditions and an efficient management.

The selection of the agencies in charge of executing the second phase AP’s was adequate as all of them carried out their work professionally and efficiently. In the case of the NGO’s that carried out the AP’s at the mining communities’ level their commitment and dedication to their work under very adverse conditions stands out.

The information collected during the evaluation permits asserting that there is a positive relationship between the resources invested and the outcomes accomplished. At the regional level, the costs of the management and technical assistance actions were within the international standards and were justified by the quantity and quality of the products prepared. On the other hand, the costs of the technical actions at the local level were even lower than the standard and its interventions were also of good quality and produced positive results.

The program achieved the following results: 1) to position within the countries an issue previously unknown, 2) to generate flexible intervention models that can be adapted to any mining community, 3) to build the NGO's capacities to tackle this issue and, 4) to take important steps toward establishing a public policy aimed at eradicating child labor in small-scale mining.

With regard to the direct beneficiaries, the program was able to withdraw 1365 children (90% of the target population) from mining work, and to prevent 3670 children (73% of the target) from entering it.

From all the successful intervention elements for the eradication of child labor in the mining communities, four stand out that are worth mentioning: 1) technology transformation and organization for production, the best example of which is the work carried out in Santa Filomena, 2) the setting in motion of a local development process with strong social participation executed in Bella Rica, 3) the health and education services provided in all the AP's, and 4) the work performed with children and teenagers outside school in order to enable them to develop a new vision of their own lives, which was more vigorously applied in Potosi and Llallagua.

With regard to the sustainability of the results concerning the withdrawal and prevention of child labor, several different degrees can be expected in accordance with the kind of work they perform, their age and the mining community they live in. The communities where organizations (enterprises or cooperatives) that prove to be more formal carry out the mining activities show greater possibilities for sustainability.

It was also found that the local development processes are sustainable and will go on after the program's termination. The lasting effect of the interventions in the public policies sphere is less predictable as it depends largely on broader political and institutional factors.

2. The evaluation's objectives and methodology

2.1. Objectives

1. The evaluation's objectives are:
 1. To give account to the key actors, including the government agencies and counterpart organizations in Bolivia, Ecuador and Peru, as well as to the donor, of the activities performed by the "*Program for the Prevention and Progressive Elimination of Child Labor in Small-Scale Gold Mining in South America (Phase II)*" and its achievements.
 2. To analyze the experience in order to improve the future interventions specifically in the field of child work eradication in small-scale mining and child labor in general.
2. In general, the evaluation intends to present relevant conclusions and recommendations based on the project's implementation experience and in relation with the proposed objectives. It takes in consideration the intervention's effectiveness and efficiency, its effects on the target population, on the communities and on the three countries' and the Sub Andean Region's social and political environment, as well as the sustainability perspectives of the impact it generated.

2.2. Methodology

3. The following documents were analyzed: project design (first and second phases); final and mid-term evaluation reports for the project's first and second phases; Action Program outlines for Peru, Bolivia and Ecuador; thematic evaluation on child labor in small-scale mining; systematization paper on good practices and lessons learnt; action programs and project reports.

Documents analysis

4. The following documents were analyzed: project design (first and second phases); final and mid-term evaluation reports for the project's first and second phases; Action Program outlines for Peru, Bolivia and Ecuador; thematic evaluation on child labor in small-scale mining; systematization paper on good practices and lessons learnt; action programs and project reports.

Interviews

5. The following persons were interviewed:
 - IPEC technical and administrative staff at Lima, La Paz and Quito.
 - Staff in charge of the Action Programs in Peru, Bolivia and Ecuador.

Final evaluation: Program for the prevention and progressive elimination of child labor in small scale traditional gold mining in South America. Phase II

- Project counterpart government authorities at Lima, La Paz and Quito.
- Representatives of mining cooperatives and enterprises.
- Representatives of project partner institutions.
- Leaders of the Action Programs beneficiary communities.
- Directors of the Edufuturo project in Peru and PETIM in Bolivia, both financed by USDOL.

Field observation

6. Field visits were carried out in each one of the communities where the Action Programs were put into operation.¹

Focus groups

7. Two focus groups were carried out in the places where the Action Programs were executed, one of them with adults (parents, teachers, community representatives) and another one with children 12 to 14 years old.

Feedback

8. Two mechanisms were used to collect the information needed to give feedback to the evaluation report: first, a meeting with the interested parties at the end of the fieldwork, where the evaluator presented the first findings and received comments from the participants, and second through written comments on the report draft.

2.3. Constraints and scope

9. Although the program's life has two clearly distinct phases regarding programming and administrative issues, those phases form one single track where it concerns the process to secure the objectives and the intervention to achieve social change. The program's second phase is at the same time a product and a continuation of the first phase. Its objectives are rooted in the actions carried out during the first phase, and the products anticipated are a consequence of the developments obtained during the previous years.
10. Therefore, although the objective of this evaluation is to analyze the second phase, it is impossible to do it without examining and taking into consideration the first phase since the chief tendencies were forged in the course of it. On the other hand, in some cases it is fitting to analyze the achievement of the objectives in view of the situation existing before the program started as that is the only way to assess its real impact.

¹ The field visit to Tipuani, Bolivia, could not be carried out as the coca leaf growers organization paralyzed the traffic to that area during the days planned for the trip. La Rinconada was not visited either because the meetings took place in Puno.

11. Finally, it need be mentioned that this evaluation is a general analysis of the program and not an exhaustive study of the AP's as each one of them deserves a separate analysis in full in accordance with its own logical framework and particular context. A comprehensive vision of the program is possible because all the AP's aimed at achieving regionally established products and objectives though a shared strategy.

3. The project's background and description

12. The International Program for the Elimination of Child Labor (IPEC) of the International Labor Organization (ILO) executed the "Program for the Prevention and Progressive Eradication of Child Labor in Small-Scale Gold Mining in South America" in Bolivia, Ecuador and Peru with the financial support of the United States Department of Labor (USDOL).
13. The program started on March 2000. It was initially programmed to last for two years. However, the staff responsible for its execution realized that in order to reach the proposed objectives, its duration and financing needed to be extended. Therefore, once the first phase was completed, a "bridge phase" was devised in order to draw to a close some actions in progress and to prepare a second phase, which is the subject matter of this evaluation. The following chart shows the start and end dates of each one of the phases mentioned.

Phase	Start	End
First phase	August 2000	July 2002
Second phase	September 2002	March 2005 ²

14. It must be also mentioned that IPEC developed this program based on the experience gained through the execution of a project carried out in the Santa Filomena and Mollehuaca mining communities, Peru, between 1998 and 2000. The work in Santa Filomena continued throughout the second phase.
15. The program's objectives and products are presented in the following table.

² Originally the project was intended to be executed in 24 months (September 2002 - September 2004); however, its execution was extended to March 2005.

Table of objectives and products

DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVE:		
To contribute to the elimination of child labor in small-scale mining in Bolivia, Ecuador and y Peru.		
IMMEDIATE OBJECTIVES	SUB OBJECTIVES	PRODUCTS
<p>Immediate objective 1 At the end of the project, key public and private organizations at the national and local levels will be aware and mobilized toward the elimination of child work in small-scale mining in the three countries.</p>	<p>1a Public opinion and mining communities are informed of the negative consequences of child labor in small-scale mining.</p> <p>1b There is enough capacity in key public and private organizations in the three countries to face the problem of child labor in the small-scale mining sector.</p>	<p>1.1 Mass media and public opinion staff are aware and trained on the issue.</p> <p>1.2 Awareness campaigns have been carried out in the selected mining communities.</p> <p>1.3 Key institutions have been trained to plan, implement and monitor actions against child labor in small-scale mining.</p> <p>1.4 Inter-institutional cooperation networks are firmly established.</p>
<p>Immediate objective 2 At the end of the project, consolidated and sustainable child labor monitoring systems will exist in mining communities.</p>		<p>2.1 All the key organizations at the national and local levels are committed to participate in the monitoring system of the selected mining communities.</p> <p>2.2 Key public and private organizations in the three countries and the selected mining communities have enough capacity to participate in child labor monitoring systems.</p>
<p>Immediate objective 3 At the end of the project, replicable models for the prevention and withdrawal of children from dangerous work in mines will be developed and implemented as part of sustainable local development processes in selected mining communities.</p>	<p>3.a Small-scale miners and mining communities have organized and mobilized to protect their interests, including the elimination of child work.</p> <p>3.b The basic services provided by the government in the selected mining communities have increased.</p> <p>3c There exist income-generating activities not directly related with mining.</p> <p>3d New technologies have been adopted.</p>	<p>3.1 The local development plans worked out by key actors in the mining communities include the elimination of child labor in mining.</p> <p>3.2 Legislation and policy proposals by small-scale mining organizations for sustainable development of small-scale mining formulated.</p> <p>3.3 Coordination between the actors involved in providing high quality and wide reaching public services improved.</p> <p>3.4 Complementary educational services implemented.</p> <p>3.5 Miners and local health personnel in the mining communities trained in work security and preventative health.</p> <p>3.6 Improved capacity to forward economic activities has been implemented.</p> <p>3.7 Managerial capacity to administrate revolving funds has been built.</p> <p>3.8 New opportunities to generate income fostered.</p> <p>3.9 Training and technical assistance for miners that adopted new technologies have been strengthened.</p> <p>3.10 Information on the use of alternative technologies is widely disseminated among the miners.</p>
<p>Immediate objective 4 At the end of the project, replicable intervention models will be widely disseminated.</p>		<p>4.1 Intervention models analyzed and systematized with key actors' participation.</p> <p>4.2 The issue of child labor in mining and the intervention models have a place in the regional integration process.</p> <p>4.3 The relationship with key actors capable of replicating the models established.</p>

16. The project planned to directly benefit 6552 children and 2026 families, as shows the following table.

Beneficiary families and children by country and community

Country and community	Number of children	Number of families
Bolivia		
Potosi	1,330	300
Llallagua	452	150
Tipuani	1,615	426
Ecuador		
Bella Rica	659	200
Peru		
La Rinconada	2,000	500
Santa Filomena	496	450
TOTAL	6,552	2.026

17. It must be also mentioned that this program was formed by 10 projects or, according to IPEC's terminology, action programs (AP's) executed by 10 NGO's. Five³ AP's were in charge of generating the intervention models for mining communities (objective 3), two others had a regional scope as they prepared products for the three countries, and the three remaining AP's were in charge of institutional strengthening in Bolivia, Ecuador y Peru. Each AP had programming unity (logical framework) and its own budget. The NGO's that carried out the AP's were the following.

AP's implementing agencies by country and community

Country and community	Implementing agency
Bolivia	
Potosi	CEPROMIN - MEDMIN
Llallagua	CEPROMIN
Tipuani	MEDMIN
Institutional strengthening	Fundacion Arco Iris
Ecuador	
Bella Rica	Desarrollo y Autogestion (DyA)
Institutional strengthening	PMT
Peru	
La Rinconada	CARE
Santa Filomena	COOPERACCION
Institutional strengthening	CESIP
Regional	
Awareness and communication	Comunicadores Asociados
Occupational health	ISAT

³ Although six communities were involved, only five AP's were designed as CEPROMIN's work in Llallagua and Potosi was part of one single AP. In spite of this, each one of these communities will be analyzed separately in this paper.

4. Social and institutional context

18. There are several important aspects of the social and institutional context that must be analyzed to put into perspective this evaluation's findings. They refer to: 1) Bolivia's, Ecuador's and Peru's institutional structure, 2) the characteristics of the mining communities and child labor, and 3) the experience and previous knowledge on interventions concerning child work in small-scale mining.

The sub-region's institutional context

19. During the last decade, weakness, lack of continuity and insufficient budget has characterized the public policies aimed at social development in the region, particularly those concerning education and health. These common characteristics form the larger political and institutional context in which the program had to carry out its activities, especially those regarding institutional strengthening.
20. Before this program began, no public policies and national strategies aimed at eradicating the worst kinds of child labor existed and even less the administrative departments or units in charge of implementing them. In fact, it was just during the first years of this decade that the three countries signed ILO's Conventions 138 and 182. What is more, the child labor issue was treated by some NGO's almost exclusively through projects in the urban areas. The presence in Bolivia and Peru of NGO's that regarded child work as a right was important and influential although limited to the small circle of persons and organizations interested in this issue.
21. In short, the program was executed in the middle of a sort of institutional void where almost everything was waiting to be done. No more than the legal basis stemming from the ratification of the above-mentioned agreements was installed, although it was not always included in the corresponding national legislation.

Characteristics of the mining communities

22. During the second phase, the program worked in six mining communities: Potosi, Llallagua, Tipuani⁴ in Bolivia, Bella Rica in Ecuador and La Rinconada and Santa Filomena in Peru. Two kinds of communities are clearly identified: the mining settlements (Tipuani, Bella Rica, La Rinconada and Santa Filomena), and the urban centers (Llallagua y Potosi). The urban centers shelter miner population but their economies and dynamics do not depend exclusively on mining. On the other hand, exclusively miners compose the mining settlements. They do not have environmental sanitation services and the houses are built from

⁴ In Tipuani the work was actually carried out in two close mining communities: Chima and Chuqini.

precarious materials. There are no public authorities in the settlements and before the program's intervention there were no community organizations capable of undertaking improvements for the population or that had received support from outside organizations to foster their development. IPEC and its executing agencies were the first organizations that supported social development in the mining communities.

23. In spite of the differences between the mining settlements and the urban centers, several factors are common to all the mining communities⁵. In all of them intense migratory movements are produced because of the metal price variations and of the mines' productivity changes. This has shaped a quite heterogeneous social assembly formed by individuals and families from many different places, without local attachments or community identity and with little social cohesion. Frequently, the social relations are conflictive and marked by the presence of two groups: one with power and resources, and another one that only own their labor. To a greater or lesser degree, alcohol consumption and prostitution play a part in this picture. At the local level, therefore, the program had to face serious problems such as the lack of social cohesion, the low organizational capacity and the absence of governmental and non-governmental organizations.
24. On the other hand, every mining community has a particular social organization for production. The following table summarizes their organizational forms and establishes their most important characteristics with regard to the property of the mining exploitation (equality and inequality between the miners for the mines exploitation) and the kind of work relations (established formally or informally). It is necessary to take into account the characteristics of the mining communities because this is one of the factors that explain the different achievements and impact of the program in different places.

⁵ By mining community we understand the social conglomerate formed by the miners and their families, regardless of the kind of settlement they live in.

Characteristics of the social organization for production in the mining communities

	SOCIAL ORGANIZATION FOR PRODUCTION	OUTSTANDING CHARACTERISTICS
Bolivia		
Llallagua	The mining cooperatives own the concession. The cooperative members work individually helped by their families. There is no joint work between the cooperative members.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Property equality • Informal work relations
Potosi	The cooperatives are awarded the concession. Their members recruit miners and organize teams that exploit specific shafts. The teams divide among their members the product obtained through a system based on seniority in the job and the workers' status (cooperative members and non-members).	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Property inequality • Informal work relations
Chimay Chuquini	The members of the cooperative recruit miners to whom they permit to exploit the mine during an hour in exchange of seven hours of work for the cooperative.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Property inequality • Informal work relations
Ecuador		
Bella Rica	A cooperative is the owner of the mining concession. The cooperative associates hire labor force to work. The cooperative owns the land where the mining settlement is located and the road to it.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Property inequality • Formal work relations (paid workers) •
Peru		
La Rinconada	A complex system where a corporation formed by members with historic rights owns the concession title. That corporation permits the cooperatives to exploit the mines. The cooperative associates hire miners through the "cachorreo" system: in exchange for working 28 days for the owner, the worker has the right to exploit the mine during two days.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Property inequality • Informal work relations
Santa Filomena	The small-scale miners are the shareholders of the mining firm that owns the concessions and exploits the mine.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Property equality • Formal work relations

Child labor in mining

25. Child labor in small-scale mining is by and large classified in two categories: 1) that performed by male children under 14⁶ years old, girl children and female teenagers, which consists of picking from the waste or materials rejected by the miners whatever material still contains

⁶ This age is referential only and can fluctuate between 12 and 15 years of age depending on the children's degree of maturity and the completion of the elementary school level.

valuable ore⁷, and 2) the work performed by older children (usually boys) as part of the adult men's mining activities. The first kind of work is not paid although many children sell the ore they obtain and keep part of the money they get. The second kind of work may or may not be paid.

26. In general, the miner population regards boys over 14 as fit to work with the adults. On the other hand, they perceive that the *pallaqueo* activities performed by boys and girls are not real work but rather a help for themselves and their families.

The regional experience on the issue

27. The only regional experience prior to this program was the project executed by IPEC in Santa Filomena and Mollehuaca from 1998 to 2000. This fact gives the program a pioneer and experimental quality in the treatment of a complex and until then unknown issue.

⁷ This activity is known as *pallaqueo* (Peru and Bolivia) or *janqueo* (Ecuador). In Chima and Chuquini this activity is called *barranquilla* and consists of recuperating from the water the gold not captured by the miners.

5. Findings of the evaluation

This section will analyze four aspects of the program: 1) design, 2) implementation, 3) achievements and 4) sustainability.

5.1 Program design

28. In general, the project was a relevant, coherent and comprehensive proposal for social change that responded to the complexity of the issue it intended to tackle.
29. It was *relevant* because it dealt with one of the worst forms of child labor, which is widely spread throughout the region (especially in Peru and Bolivia) and for which no other significant interventions had existed.
30. It was *coherent* because it analyzed solidly and systematically the issue it faced and presented a strategy that dealt with the causes of the problem. This strategy⁸ claims that to reduce significantly the incidence of child labor in small-scale mining in the national context, it must act simultaneously on three areas: 1) building of national public policies and increase of the public opinion awareness on the issue, 2) sustainable development of the mining communities, and 3) reproduction of the intervention models among the mining communities. In each of these areas, the project identified key aspects that had to be tackled in order to reduce child labor. The logical framework took this strategy into account and incorporated it in its objectives.
31. The proposal was *comprehensive* because it intended to affect different aspects of the reality in order to achieve its objective as it understood that a problem as complex as child labor could not be met through partial interventions. This comprehensive approach was particularly visible in the way the elimination of child labor in mining communities was handled as it promoted changes in social services, on the community's perception and social organization.
32. The previous assertions notwithstanding, the program's objectives 1b and 2 overrated the achievements that could be attained given the real capacities of the national and local organizations and institutions. Objective 1b determined that at the end of the program there would be: "*enough capacity in key public and private organizations in the three countries to face the issue of child labor in the small-scale mining sector*". Although during the first phase significant advancements were reached regarding the building of the organizations' capabilities for action, these advancements were not enough to reach the proposed objective, at least not with the available resources and time⁹. It would have been

⁸ The project paper proclaims its strategy as its "*theory for change*".

⁹ The first phase's evaluation report concludes that in the public policies area "significant advancements have been reached on the legal subject and the commitments arrived at as the

convenient to keep the objective as it was formulated for the first phase, but with new indicators. It must be mentioned that the assumption on which the objective was based asserted that the States were willing to advance in the application of Convention 182¹⁰. However, the commitments acquired by the States and the pronouncements made by the authorities not always become facts due to the weak institutional system, the discontinuity of actions and the low priority of the social policies in the three countries.

33. The project did not present any assumption for objective 2 (*“At the end of the project, consolidated and sustainable child labor monitoring systems will exist in mining communities”*). The achievement of this objective implies that there is an organization or institution in the mining communities that, with the proper training, is capable of carrying out the complex technical actions the project requires. However, as was analyzed before, one of the characteristics of such communities is precisely their low organization capacity and the absence of governmental and non-governmental organizations. Although during the first phase this situation was improved, at the beginning of the second phase there were still no organizations capable of undertaking such task; therefore, this objective seems overrated too.
34. The program’s design presents a regional general strategy, combined with a locally planned action in accordance with the mining communities’ characteristics and conditions. This gives it perspective and strategic orientation as well as flexibility to adapt to the local conditions.
35. In general, the design for the program’s second phase incorporated the experience gained in the first phase and the recommendations made in its evaluation. The following aspects stand out.

Insufficient duration of the AP’s

36. During the first phase the need to extend the program’s execution time and its resources was made evident. The second phase is a direct consequence of that finding.

The need for widely applicable products and exchange of experiences

37. The first phase evaluation recommended systematizing and exchanging the approaches and concepts which form the basis of the program. The design of the awareness and occupational health AP’s responds to this need. Likewise, the second phase took into account the systematization of the AP’s good practices and an analysis of the community monitoring

first steps or conditions for IPEC’s work. In the future it will be necessary to strengthen the democratic government organizations to lead and watch over the putting in practice of the policies aimed at eradicating child labor”.

¹⁰ The assertion was stated as follows: “The States are willing to advance in the ratification and effective application of Convention 182 in the three countries. This entails defining the mining activities as one of the worst kinds of child labor to be eliminated and adapting the national legislation.”

systems. In addition, the implementation of regional meetings between the members of the AP's to exchange knowledge and experience was planned.

Monitoring system

38. The evaluation also suggested reinforcing the use of participatory methodologies and citizens surveillance to monitor child labor. The program's objective 2 points precisely in that direction although, as was analyzed before, the goal set was too high.

Failures of some executing agencies

39. During the first phase, it was detected that the organizations that executed the AP in Potosi (Centro de Desarrollo Regional - CDR) committed some administrative irregularities, for which reason the counterpart organization for the second phase was changed. Likewise, the organization that executed the first phase in La Rinconada (Red Titikaka) did not comply with the technical and administrative requisites and therefore did not continue operating during the second phase.
40. On the other hand, the program's design took into account that other projects aimed at improving education as a means to eliminate child labor (USDOL funded projects) were being executed in Potosi and La Rinconada. Therefore, in Potosi the program worked in a different sector to the one where the other agency was working. In La Rinconada it did not deal with educational issues.
41. The program also took into account the existence of other actions initiated by IPEC. In Ecuador, it planned for a very close financial, programming and administrative relationship with the Time Bound Program. The program's coordinator was also the technical and administrative supervisor of the project being executed in Colombia for the eradication of child labor in mining. In Peru the project coordinated and made use of ILO's Regional Office's knowledge and resources.
42. With regard to the indicators, it must be mentioned that the logic by which they were built implies a correspondence between the program indicators, which are regional, and the AP's, which are national or local. Thus, the fulfillment of the program's goals depends on the degree of fulfillment of the AP indicators. The analysis of the logical frameworks shows that such correspondence exists but that there is lack of accuracy in AP indicators wording. Although the regional indicators can be general, the AP indicators must be specific, something that not always happens. As an example, the indicator for regional objective 1, "Initiatives and measures implemented by key organizations", includes

too broad national indicators such as “number of initiatives or measures implemented by key organizations”¹¹.

43. On the other hand, some AP’s indicators give account of the performed activities instead of the objectives’ achievement. For example, “the number of social communicators made aware” indicates the number of journalists that attended information workshops instead of the degree to which “the public opinion is informed on the negative consequences of child labor in small-scale mining”.
44. In any case, it is worth highlighting that the program has made an important contribution to the building of indicators that give account of change processes regarding child labor in small-scale mining. Additionally, the weaknesses mentioned above do not contradict the fact that the program did have a monitoring system that responded to its complex design.
45. The selection of the communities where the program was applied was well-aimed as it enabled the program to develop intervention models for a wide variety of situations including urban and far-away rural communities, communities located in low regions and in the highlands, by gold, silver and tin producers, formed both by mostly indigenous and by non-indigenous population, and with different social and technological ore extracting systems. This rich gamut of options has given the program the capacity to offer specific responses to particular situations and to develop general strategies that can just as well be applied to different geographical and social contexts.
46. With regard to the program’s duration, it must be mentioned that it would have been better if the program lasted four consecutive years and had not been divided in phases. This would have reduced the time and energy invested in administrative issues and would have created a more certain framework for the AP’s. Then again, the complexity of this issue requires that the interventions last a minimum of four years in order to be able to see lasting effects in the communities and in the national and local public policies. Additionally, that time would have made possible to allocate better the resources invested in the implantation, execution and closing of the program.

5.2 Program implementation

47. In general, the program has been adequately implemented and its main characteristic was the timely submitting of products, the efficient use of resources, the generation of learning conditions, and an efficient management.

¹¹ In this case we can ask if the word “key” should refer to the measures that previously identified organizations must take. On the other hand, the words “initiatives” and “measures” refer to very different things and should not be mixed.

48. The selection of the AP's executing agencies was adequate as all of the performed a professional and efficient work. In the case of the NGO's that carried out the AP's in the mining communities, their commitment and dedication to their work under very adverse conditions must be highlighted.
49. During the evaluation mission, it was found that all the AP's activities had come to an end, that their financial resources had been totally used up and that the reports had been submitted.
50. According to the opinion of the personnel in charge of the AP's, the resource flow was better than during the previous phase as the technical and financial reporting systems were improved and the organizations had more experience with these tasks¹². Although the funds were not allocated in the times planned because of a delay in IPEC's transfer procedures, this postponement was not significant and did not cause inconveniences for the execution of the AP's.
51. The organizational structure (please see item # 16) enabled the program¹³ to develop adequately its objectives as it combined the regional tasks (strategic steering, follow-up, cross-cut products) with the national (institutional strengthening) and local tasks (intervention models).
52. Unfortunately, the cross-cut products (communication and occupational health materials and strategy) were finished when the AP's were about to come to an end. For that reason they did not receive follow-up from the NGO's that worked in the mining communities.
53. The communication between IPEC's regional office, its national office and the national NGO's was smooth and took place in a mutual learning atmosphere. The regional meetings helped to encourage this atmosphere and to foster the technical exchange between the NGO's.
54. The personnel in charge at the NGO's referred positively to the periodical visits of the program's director and officer. They thought these visits were important for a good organizational communication and to receive timely feedback on the AP's developments.
55. The information collected during the evaluation allows to asserting that the relation between the results achieved and the resources invested gives a positive balance. The costs of the managerial and technical assistance actions were within the international standards and were justified by the quantity and quality of the products prepared. Then

¹² The project generated a data-base for the quarterly reports, which was of great help for the AP's.

¹³ The program's staff was formed by a regional director, a programs officer, a regional administrative assistant, and two national administrative assistants (one in Bolivia and another one in Ecuador). To this staff the personnel hired by the NGO's to execute the AP's was added. As a rule, the national teams were formed by a coordinator and about one to two field technicians, plus occasional consultants. Approximately 23 persons worked in the three countries with an exclusive dedication to the program.

again, the costs of the technical actions at the local level were even lower than the standard and demanded from the NGO's more effort than the average project. Nevertheless, their interventions were also of good quality and produced positive results.

56. The AP's were able to generate several spaces and opportunities to cooperate with other organizations. Among the most important ones, the strategic relation between project GAMA¹⁴ and COOPERACCION, and between DyA and the Cooperativa Bella Rica must be mentioned. Some NGO's established relations with other donors in order to continue with their activities after the program's funding was finished: MEDMIN obtained funds from CECI¹⁵, CARE from CIDA, and CEPROMIN from the Dutch aid service.
57. We should also mention that CEPROMIN¹⁶ is part of an alliance with CARE Bolivia to execute an USDOL funded project in Potosi and Llallagua, and that World Learning executed in La Rinconada a project funded by USDOL. Both CARE Bolivia and World Learning were invited to participate in several events organized by the program and maintained cooperation links with CEPROMIN and with CARE Peru, respectively.
58. However, the relation between CARE Bolivia, CARE Peru, World Learning and CEPROMIN could have been even more fruitful, with greater technical and experiences exchange, taking into consideration that they work in neighboring countries and with a very similar population.
59. With regard to the monitoring of child labor, it must be mentioned that in most cases the AP's looked for the voluntary or paid cooperation of the community people. The operational strategies and the methodological approaches used were diverse. At the end of the program a consultant performed an analysis of the monitoring experiences results in the three countries.
60. Most of the mid-term evaluation recommendations were attended to. The actions toward fulfilling the programming were particularly prioritized and a phasing-out plan was devised for the NGO's withdrawal from the communities. IPEC did not draw a new project for the communities that still needed support, as the evaluation suggested, but as part of the program's activities the NGO's developed their own projects meant to continue giving support to the mining communities.
61. The AP's strategy to face the change of government officers at the national level was based on the following elements: a) permanent

¹⁴ An environmental project that received funds from Switzerland Cooperation and technical assistance from Peru Government .

¹⁵ A Canadian NGO.

¹⁶ CEPROMIN also executes a child-labor related project in Llallagua funded by Terre des Hommes.

information to the officers on child labor issues and on the developments in the AP's, and b) building of alliances with other NGO's to advocate for the continuity of the policies and actions initiated. In general, it was found that the NGO's always managed to obtain political support for the execution of their AP's. The presence of IPEC-ILO was essential to achieve this as its prestige draws the support of the government authorities, the employers and the workers organizations.

62. Although the governments have supported the program and the AP's, their commitment was weak as they have not invested resources in meeting this problem and have not shown political decision to implement efficient administrative, legal and financial measures. The child labor issue, in general, is not yet part of the three countries' government priorities, largely because of the weak position of the social sector in the public policies.
63. Both in Ecuador and in Bolivia a close coordination work with UNICEF was found, especially in the national policies area.
64. The mining cooperatives and enterprises participated in the AP's in different ways. Both in Santa Filomena and in Bella Rica that participation was essential for achieving the results, as will be seen further on in this document.
65. The program provided the AP's with training and adequate instruments for the preparation of technical and administrative reports. On the other hand, the AP's staff had a good understanding of the project's key concepts (withdrawn and prevented children); however, differences in other methodological and conceptual issues were found.
66. As was mentioned before, the program went through three programmatically different phases that supposed the creation of three different programming and budget units. This fact influenced its design and execution in at least two ways. First, the first phase was designed based on assumption that the program would last two years with a given budget. These conditions posed to the planners a different scenario than if they had known that the project would take three more years and would have twice the resources. Second, the program's and the executing agencies' staff in the three countries invested much more administrative work in the projects as it had to open, evaluate and close two projects, an in some cases three, instead of just one project.

5.3 Program's achievements

67. The program has been able to position in the governments and the societies an issue unknown to the region even in recent times. It has generated flexible intervention models that can be adapted to any mining community in the three countries. It has built capacity in NGO's to meet this issue and has taken important steps toward establishing a public

policy for the eradication of child labor in small-scale mining. These achievements are very significant taking into consideration that at the beginning of the program no actions or knowledge about this issue existed.

68. The program has also made impact on the direct beneficiaries, their families and communities. In particular, it was able to withdraw 1,517 children (79% of the expected number) from mining work and to prevent 3,579 children (71% of the target) from entering it¹⁷. The program was not able to withdraw all the children from labor because in the mining communities there still were families in very vulnerable economic conditions that refused to withdraw their children from labor despite the APs' efforts. Furthermore, it need be mentioned that in Potosi the number of children working in mining was overestimated, and consequently the goal fulfillment percentages are low, which influences the general average. This problem arose because the information collected during the first phase by the NGO in charge of the AP was wrong.
69. On the whole, the program fulfilled quite well the planned goals. Most of the indicators show a fulfillment rate close to 100%.

Objective 1a: Public opinion and mining communities are informed of the negative consequences of child labor in small-scale mining.

70. It was found that in the selected mining communities the adults, children and teenagers are informed of the negative consequences of child labor in mining. This is a direct effect of the actions the AP's have carried out during all their phases.
71. It must be noted that, as a general rule, the miners define child labor (a word that has a negative connotation among them) as "the activities performed by children under 14 inside the tunnels or with adult men" as they do not consider the youngsters over 14 as children. For many miners, a boy 15 years old or older is able to start performing "easy" mining tasks. Only in Santa Filomena and Bella Rica was it found that the population associated "child work" with the activities performed by young people under 18 as the firm (SOTRAMI) and the cooperative, in each case, prohibited work in mines for children under 18. In addition, not everyone believes that *pallaqueo*, *jancheo* or *barquilleo*¹⁸ is harmful for children under 14. Even there are children that value such activity as an income source that occasionally enables them to obtain money for their expenses. It was also found that the mothers had a better inclination toward recognizing the harmful effects of child labor and to restrain their children from working.

¹⁷ Program Final Report

¹⁸ This work consists of picking among the waste or the materials rejected by the miners for valuable ore.

72. With respect to the public opinion, it is noticeable that the officers of the national and local agencies with which the program has worked not only know the harmful effects of child labor in small-scale mining but also several other aspects concerning this issue. Furthermore, they are aware of the need to eradicate this kind of child labor.
73. In the three countries the support and collaboration of the national and local media to the actions undertaken by the AP's could be appreciated. Their mobilization was significant for the fulfillment of the institutional strengthening activities. Nevertheless, it was also found that in some cases the articles in the mass media upset the mining communities and they even affected the relations with the local development APs. In such cases the miners perceived that the media accused them of exploiting the children. This compelled the AP's to be more careful in the way they described the situation of the mining communities to the media.

Objective 1b: There is enough capacity in key public and private organizations in the three countries to face the problem of child labor in the small-scale mining sector.

74. The evaluation of this objective takes us, in the first place, to its formulation. As was analyzed in the chapter concerning the program design, this objective focuses on a situation difficult to reach in the short term given the political and institutional contexts in the three countries and the time-limit and resources allocated to it. The evaluation of the objective as it is formulated would have to express that at least at the national level not "enough capacity" has been built in public institutions to face the problem of child labor in small-scale mining and that probably that objective is still out of reach. Such assertion, however, would not let us appreciate the significant progress the program has achieved in this area.
75. At the national level the program has contributed to increase the public institutions' capacities to tackle this problem by training their staffs, particularly at the Ministries of Labor and Mining. It has positioned this issue in all the levels that deal with it in one way or another and has managed that both the political authorities and the technical staff acknowledge the need to tackle it. At the same time, it has promoted the involvement of the mining sector to the actions in favor of the eradication of child labor in Bolivia (through REFORMIN project and the inclusion of this issue in the National Mining Plan), in Ecuador (through the alliance with the Chamber of Mining) and in Peru (through the relationship with AMASUC). However, the Ministries of Labor still appear weak to assume the functions that correspond to them by law in the fight against child labor, as they do not have the human or financial resources for it. Attempting to overcome these problems, the Ministries of Labor of Ecuador and Peru have recently created internal bureaus (national departments) to handle the child labor issue. This initiative

could contribute considerably to the institutionalization of child labor eradication policies, the outcomes of which could be assessed in the coming years.

76. The program has also supported the institutionalization of National Commissions for the Eradication of Child Labor and the creation of National plans on this matter, paying special attention to the mining communities' problems. The activities of the institutional strengthening APs contributed to strengthen the Commissions, to diffuse their mission and to train its members. In spite of that, the commissions are still weak bodies that need support and a stable technical leadership, counting upon more political support. The NGOs participating in these commissions usually are the most involved actors.
77. The countries' capacity to face the issue of child labor in small-scale mining has increased significantly though the experience developed throughout these years by the NGO's that implemented the APs. At present, in the three countries NGOs specialized in the eradication of child labor in small-scale mining exist, with capacity to execute projects, to advise the government on this subject and to transfer knowledge to other NGO's.
78. It must be highlighted that all this work has been performed despite the constant change of the public authorities due to the complex political context the three countries have gone through in the last years.

Objective 2: At the end of the project, consolidated and sustainable child labor monitoring systems will exist in mining communities.

79. The program proposed "the implementation of national and local monitoring systems, not only as a project activity but as a sustainable element of the national strategies against child labor". Similarly to objective 1b, such goal seems to have overrated the APs' and the communities' real capacities because a degree of institutionalization and an evaluation culture that the involved communities do not possess is required to be able to install such systems.
80. The AP's were able to carry out child labor monitoring activities with the participation of community members. These persons worked voluntarily or with a payment under the guidance of the program's staff collecting information on the children's work activities. The methodology used was different for all the cases, although several AP's got inspiration from the procedures applied in Bella Rica.
81. The monitoring activities provided the AP's information on withdrawn and prevented children but cannot be considered in any way a system and even less a sustainable community-based system. In fact, even in Bella Rica the personnel in charge stopped monitoring child labor after the AP concluded its activities.

82. What does seem to work is the prohibition passed by Cooperativa Bella Rica and by the firm SOTRAMI in Santa Filomena that bans work for children under 18. This implies some kind of monitoring as those organizations watch closely that children or teenagers are not hired. In certain mines at La Rinconada that possess top technology, the guards also impede children under 14 from entering the shafts.

Objective 3: At the end of the project, replicable models for the prevention and withdrawal of children from dangerous work in mines will be developed and implemented as part of sustainable local development processes in selected mining communities.

83. To fully understand the program's achievements regarding this objective it is necessary to briefly portray the achievements of each AP as each one produced different outcomes and gave emphasis to different components to respond to the particular characteristics of the populations they worked with.
84. The following table summarizes the action programs' main achievements. It is not intended to synthesize all the achievements, which are many more than those here described, but to present the most relevant and characteristic to the APs.

Country and AP	Characteristics
Bolivia	
Llallagua	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Established effective non-formal education services for working children and health services for all the population. • Mobilized the town council, children advocacy office and the neighbors' boards in favor of the eradication of child labor in small-scale mining. • Gave impulse to micro-enterprises for mothers/fathers of children that had been working in mining.
Potosi	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Established effective non-formal education services for working children and health services for all the population. • Improved the technology for mining exploitation and introduced improvements in the health conditions and job security.
Tipuani	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Improved initial (pre-school), primary and secondary education. • Gave impulse to grass-roots organizations among the poorest miners (<i>barranquilleros</i>) and the population in general. • Improved the <i>barranquilleros</i> technological and health conditions as well as their job security. • Gave impulse to production projects to improve their nutrition.

Country and AP	Characteristics
Ecuador	
Bella Rica	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Gave impulse to a local development process with the cooperative, the town council and other public agencies participation. • Obtained that the cooperative stops hiring children under 18. • Gave impulse to the creation and consolidation of grass-roots organizations. • Improved the initial (pre-school) and primary educational services and designed and financed a project to create a high school.
Peru	
La Rinconada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Obtained the installation of social (education, health, child care) and sanitation (waste collection, latrines) services. • Fostered the dialog and coordination between local actors, which end result was a Local Development Plan. • Achieved that the regional organizations and authorities take into account the problems of La Rinconada.
Santa Filomena	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Fostered and successfully executed the 1998 and 2005 local development plans with all the actors' participation. • Developed a productive system by means of better technologies, which has improved the families' income and does not hire workers less than 18 years of age. • Improved the child care, education and health services. • Strengthened the grass-roots organizations. • Generated income-producing alternatives for women.

85. The APs have reached different degrees of maturity through their experience generating replicable models for the prevention and withdrawal of children from labor in small-scale mining.

86. However, although during the first phase the components of all the AP's were similar, during the execution process each AP emphasized different components so that in the second phase each experience shows a unique combination of the originally conceived components.

The following degrees of development of the AP's can be established:

Ready to systematize and transfer

87. This is the case of Bella Rica and Santa Filomena. The intervention has produced in these places long-lasting changes. A development system is under way sustained by the cooperative and the town council of Ponce Enriquez in Bella Rica, and by SOTRAMI in Santa Filomena. The NGOs that carried out these experiences continue assisting these mining communities with resources from other donors and in other local development issues. The experiences can be used as replicable models for other communities but two aspects still need to be worked on: 1) appropriate systematization of the processes, methodologies and

instruments, and 2) development of concrete transference mechanisms (who, how, at what costs).

Require support to complete the process

88. This is the case of Llallagua. The experience need to be rounded up through two actions that aim at complementary goals: 1) to achieve that the mining cooperatives deal efficiently with the issue of child work in the tunnels and in the ore processing family tasks, and 2) to achieve that the town council includes eradication of child labor as part of the local development municipal agenda¹⁹. None of these goals will be reached quickly and easily but they are essential to make the experience sustainable and transferable to other towns with similar characteristics. Additionally, Llallagua has the adequate opportunities (market) to build further the alternatives for family income that have been implemented so far.

Require support to continue the process

89. Such is the case of La Rinconada, Tipuani y Potosi. In La Rinconada and Potosi several different NGO's participated during the first and second phases, which lessened the process's continuity. In Tipuani, although the NGO did not change, the change of field staff from one phase to the next had the same effect. This, together with the geographical, demographic and social characteristics of the three communities explains why these AP's reached a lesser degree of maturity than the other ones.

Objective 3a: Small-scale miners and mining communities have organized and mobilized to protect their interests, including the elimination of child work.

90. In general, substantial progress was found in the mining communities' organizations. As was mentioned previously, before the program started only the organizations essential for mine exploitation existed (cooperatives) and they not always belonged to the miners. The program has been able to encourage other organizations that do represent the interests of the excluded: *barranquilleros* (Tipuani), *palliris* (Potosi, La Rinconada, Bella Rica, Santa Filomena), and teenagers (Potosi, Bella Rica, Llallagua). In all cases the organization process has improved the social cohesion and has installed in the population the feeling that "things can be changed".
91. A particularly important fact is that the program has been able to improve the position of women in the social structure of some communities (Bella Rica, Santa Filomena, Llallagua) as a result of the support given to their organization and to the execution of independent production activities.

¹⁹ To include the child labor issue in the local politics it must be given a systematic space in the municipal objectives, budget, bylaws and programming in the mid-term.

92. Likewise, it was found that the children enjoy a better status than before and that the adults are more concerned about and pay more attention to their education.
93. Nevertheless, the degree of development of the organizations varies significantly according to the mining community's geographic, demographic and social characteristics and the depth of the intervention. In La Rinconada, for instance, the organization is incipient while in Santa Filomena it has developed to such a degree that they will start the relocation of the whole mining settlement.

Objective 3b: The basic services provided by the government in the selected mining communities have increased.

94. The program has achieved a significant success regarding this objective. In all the mining communities the education and health services tended to reach all the population and to improve its quality. In many cases the AP's have been able to obtain additional resources to improve these services.
95. The main actions in the educational field have been: improvement of the educational infrastructure, supplying of teaching equipment and materials, teachers training, non-formal educational activities, and securing of permanent posts for teachers. Improving education has in all cases caused a decrease in child labor.
96. The health measures have been mostly of preventative nature (vaccination, de-parasitizing, growth control, oral hygiene). The health services have been supported directly or indirectly by facilitating their access to medicines and obtaining permanent posts for doctors and nurses. Some AP's have made clinical exams to the children and their families and have used this information to train the community on the hazards of mining.
97. In La Rinconada, Potosi, Bella Rica and Santa Filomena child-care centers have been installed to make sure that the mothers who work in *pallanqueo* have a safe place to leave their small children and do not need to take the children with them. This strategy has helped to keep the children away from the dumps and, in the mid-term, will contribute to change the perception that the presence of children in such places is normal.

Objective 3c: There exist income-generating activities not directly related with mining.

98. In general, the income-generating activities not directly related with mining were of little consequence. No significant impact of these activities on the elimination of child labor in the communities was found, either through the generation of more income for the families or by

appealing to the older children to get engaged in other activities. Some families benefited from these activities, but that benefit was not significant enough so as to make an impact on the community's economy and, in most cases, it was only a complement of the family income.

99. This situation can be explained by the following factors: aside from the limited resources the program allocated for this component, this is not an area in which IPEC or the participant NGO's have much experience and knowledge. On the other hand, the possibility of being successful with this kind of activities is limited to a small group of persons that have an enterprising spirit. Therefore, this strategy could not be generalized to all the families. Moreover, the success possibilities in a mining community are small because the size of the market is limited to a few hundred families and other businesses are already functioning.

Objective 3d: New technologies have been adopted.

100. This objective was fully achieved in Santa Filomena, where it was found that a technology for mining exploitation was developed that not only has modified the production organization but that such modification has influenced on the eradication of child labor. This experience's success seems to be linked to the intervention's maturity (six years), the kind of organization for production (the miners are the enterprise's stockholders), the kind of mining community (small) and the resources invested. The experience of Santa Filomena shows how a change in the mining production structure can contribute to the long-standing eradication of child labor.
101. It should be mentioned that also in Potosi technological innovations were applied in some cooperatives. These innovations contributed to significantly increase the mining productivity and the workers' income. However, they were not designed to have direct incidence on the elimination of child labor and therefore did not cause effects on that area.
102. Other APs such as Bella Rica and Llallagua tried to foster the development of new technologies during the first phase, but the short time-limit they had did not help consolidating viable projects. Although this was not the only factor that obstructed this component's development (in Bella Rica there was opposition from the cooperative's members and in Llallagua the production was lower than required), the APs could have developed interesting initiatives if they had had a longer execution time-frame.

Objective 4: At the end of the project, replicable intervention models will be widely disseminated.

103. During the evaluation mission it was found that the representatives of organizations significant for the elimination of child labor in small-scale

mining knew and valued positively the actions carried out by the program as it organized activities at the national and regional levels specific to this objective. Beside the national and regional activities organized by IPEC and the NGO's to disseminate their experiences, they took advantage of all possible means at hand to meet this objective. Even some members of the mining communities were able to learn about the experiences carried out in other communities and countries.

104. Nevertheless, the following comments must be also made. Although the key players know the experiences developed by the program and partial documents that can serve as reference for other organizations willing to replicate these experiences exist, a complete material that methodically and systematically gathers the documents produced and serves as a user's guide does not exist. The *paper on good practices* describes the actions that have had success in the APs but it is not a complete instrument for the transference of knowledge and systems. Both for its contents and its style, this document is an investigation report intended for professionals specialized in this field and constitutes an important input for the transference of experiences, but does not contain the instruments and methodologies that have been designed by the program and APs, such as the awareness-raising, job security and monitoring. What is needed is a manual capable of transmitting in a didactic way what has been learnt about child labor eradication in the mining communities plus useful tools.

5.4 Sustainability

On the strategies for sustainability

105. The strategies for the project's sustainability at the local level were community awareness and participation, the strengthening of public and private organizations and the development of inter-institutional networks. At the national level the building of public and private organizations' capacities and support to the development of public policies were proposed. The creation of national child labor in small-scale mining monitoring and verifications systems was proposed as a general sustainability mechanism. Finally, the dissemination of the project's successful outcomes would also make the program's effects lasting.
106. At the local level, the community's awareness and participation in the project have been key elements for the both the acceptance of the project and for lasting results. The goodness of this sustainability strategy is thus confirmed.
107. The impulse given to institutional networks has been useful to bring together public and private organizations to work on behalf of the eradication of child labor. However, the continuity of these networks' work has largely depended on the call made by the NGO's in charge of

the AP's. In many cases those networks are still in an embryonic phase and therefore are not yet a sustainability factor for the AP'S impacts. A special case is the Childhood Council of Ponce Enrique, fostered by DyA. This council groups several public and private organizations and is a body that formulates public policies on behalf of the children, whose action is sheltered by the Code for Children and Adolescents. Although it is also still in a budding stage, a greater sustainability than the other networks is anticipated as it enjoys a formal status and its actions are protected by the law. Bolivia's and Peru's children defense bureaus are similar cases, but their role is linked to the restitution of individual rights rather than to policies drafting.

108. The building of the national organizations capacities and the monitoring system was analyzed above. Here it must be added that in spite of the work done, it can not yet be expected that the governments will take on the task of eradicating child labor in mining and are therefore not a sustainability element but rather one that needs to be sustained. With regard to the monitoring system, it did not work as a sustainability mechanism because it could not be installed as planned.
109. The dissemination of the project outcomes has contributed to show to the mining and child labor related organizations that successful and low-cost interventions can be made, which enables them to be spread to other communities.
110. Finally, it must be noted that the organizational strengthening APs performed all their actions under the umbrella of the Child Labor Eradication Committees in order to give those initiative sustainability and to build the committees' image and technical capacities.

On the sustainability of the outcomes

With regard to the outcomes sustainability, the following was found:

111. The elimination of work in tunnels and in adult men's tasks for children under 14 will be maintained although during the holidays there may be children between 12 and 14 years of age at work. . This could happen if the holiday activities organized by the APs would come stop. Those activities seem to have been an important tool to keep the children away from the mining activities.
112. The withdrawal of children over 14 from the tunnels and the adult men tasks is firm and lasting in Bella Rica and Santa Filomena due to the commitment of the Cooperativa Bella Rica and SOTRAMI. The same luck cannot be anticipated in other places. Although the APs have withdrawn many children and the community is more aware, the work of the teenagers largely depends on the parents' will and, above all, of their own decision. In some focus groups it was evident that some children reduced their work hours but they still see mining as the only viable alternative to obtain income to meet their needs. Moreover, it is

also expected that more children will work during the school vacations due to the lack of alternative activities.

113. . The withdrawal of boys under 12 and girls under 18 from the *pallanqueo* and ore processing could be maintained under the condition that the schools and community organizations insist on the hazards of this activity. Probably most of the children that participated in the program will stay away from the *pallanqueo* or will at least dedicate only marginal times to it, but it must be remembered that new families with children arrive every day to the mining communities and that *pallanqueo* is an activity anyone can perform freely. Therefore, the sustainability of this achievement depends in the long run of the implantation of exploitation and mineral processing technologies that exclude child labor from all the system and at all times. Among this group of children a tendency to work during the vacation periods for lack of adequate free-time alternatives was found.
114. It is expected that the local development will continue progressing in Santa Filomena, Bella Rica, La Rinconada, Tipuani and Llallagua at different rhythms and with different styles. The situation is different in Potosi. There it is possible that the mining organizations will continue developing but advancement in the local development is not expected as the mining community is scattered across several city quarters.
115. It is also expected that the health and education systems will continue living service at least with the same quality and reach achieved until now.
116. The technological changes reached in Santa Filomena and Potosi will continue progressing. The process in Santa Filomena, however, is more mature and predictable than that of Potosi.
117. With regard to the institutional capacities achieved, it is expected that four of the five NGO's that executed the AP's in local communities will continue in the mid term carrying out activities related with the eradication of child labor in small-scale mining with resources from other donors. These organizations have gathered a valuable experience, are institutionally solid, have trained staff and are committed to this objective. Only in the case of MEDMIN there is some uncertainty because this NGO's the key staff that worked in the AP in not any more in it and it is apparently going through an institutional crisis²⁰.
118. In addition, the program recently contributed to train the NGO's in charge of the institutional strengthening AP's in child labor in small-scale mining issues²¹.

²⁰ However, MEDMIN was able to obtain funds to carry out actions with children and families in Tipuani and Guanuni (Oruro).

²¹ CESIP (Peru) participated during the program's first phase in Mollehuaca. Arco Iris and PMT had never before handled the mining issue.

119. With respect to the engagement of the national government organizations, it is probable that they will not prosper without IPEC's follow-up. Those bodies' institutional weaknesses foretell this outcome, particularly of those in charge of social policies. Fortunately, IPEC has permanent staff in Peru and Ecuador that could carry out this follow-up. In Bolivia IPEC will also stay during the next years.

6. Conclusions and lessons learnt

6.1 Conclusions

120. The program faced a very difficult and unknown issue in geographically, demographically and socially complex communities. This was done through the experience IPEC accumulated throughout almost a decade of work in Latin America, with the learning gained from the work in Santa Filomena and Mollehuaca, and through the involvement of NGOs with a long work experience in their respective countries. It proposed a comprehensive strategy to tackle the problem's main causes and acted at the local, national and regional levels.
121. The program's design was the result of the previous execution phases and therefore gathered a rich experience. In general, it is well conceived and responds adequately to the problem it intends to meet. However, some objectives were inappropriately formulated as they overrated what could be achieved in countries with a weak institutional development regarding social policies.
122. In general, the program was adequately implemented and their characteristics were the timely submitting of products, the efficient use of resources, the generation of learning conditions and an efficient management.
123. IPEC's contribution was very important for the strategic steering of the program, to give it a regional vision and to introduce it in the official public sphere where it enjoys prestige and good reputation.
124. During the second phase the program created a learning community that enabled the knowledge acquired by the AP's to be disseminated among them. It also disseminated this knowledge among organizations related to mining and the elimination of child labor. In addition, it produced several materials and working instruments as well as a document on good practices. In spite of that, all that material still needs to be organized and systematized in order to make it available to the countries so that the organizations can use it as a guide for new interventions.
125. The program was able to increase the organizations' capacities to tackle child labor in small-scale mining. However, the level of such capacity is still low mainly due to the institutional weakness of the social sector in the three countries.
126. The program has been successful creating institutional networks and introducing the child labor issue in action plans of different nature as a mechanism to increase the institutional capacity to fight against child work. However, these actions may not give fruit due to the lack of resources to finance the planned activities (something predictable in the

three countries). The political will to put at hand the resources needed to act is lacking. On the contrary, all the interviewed officers (particularly in Bolivia) expect the international aid to continue financing this kind of activities.

127. Among the successful intervention elements for the eradication of child labor in mining communities four worth mentioning stand out: 1) the transformation of technology and organization for production, the best example of which is the work performed in Santa Filomena, 2) the putting into effect of a local development process with intense social participation executed in Bella Rica and Santa Filomena, 3) the health and educational services provided in all AP's, and 4) the extra-school work performed with children and teenagers in order to enable them to create a new vision of their lives, which was most emphatically applied in Potosi and Llalagua. Most of these elements have been developed in all the APs, although they were more successful in the ones mentioned.
128. It is proposed as a hypothesis that the degree of formality of the production relations in mining affects the depth of the changes registered: the greater the degree of formalization, the greater the transformation possibilities. The two most successful experiences seem to confirm this as SOTRAMI in Santa Filomena and Cooperativa Bella Rica work as an enterprise. Formalization through the creation of regulations contributes to a better organization of the production activities and consequently of the mining communities, and this influences the capacity for change. Likewise, it enables the building of leadership in the communities and therefore the generation of authorities. Regulations and authorities acknowledged by everyone are key elements for any change process, and that is exactly what is observed in Bella Rica and Santa Filomena. On the contrary, in the other mining communities the authority is diluted and the elasticity of the regulations is much larger. The following examples are sufficient to illustrate the importance of these elements: child labor cannot be eliminated if an authority capable of establishing the prohibition of working in shafts for children under 18 does not exist; it is not possible either to carry out production transformation initiatives without the support of an organization in charge of this task. However, there is another element that also plays an important role in these communities' capacity for change, and it is the type of property over the mining resources. As a general rule, the rights to exploit the minerals belong to a group of persons associated in a cooperative or enterprise. In many cases these persons hire unskilled laborers to exploit the mineral. In other cases the associates themselves perform the mining activities. This determines the greater or lesser equality of the relations regarding the property of the mining resources. When the relations are more equal, possibilities of generating changes

are greater as there is more social cohesion and less social conflicts²². Santa Filomena is precisely the example of what, according to these criteria, would be a mining community with high change potential as it combines equality in the property of resources with a high degree of formality. La Rinconada would be in the other end, with a low potential for change: extreme inequity regarding property and low degree of formality, together with the predominance of pre-capitalist hiring relations. The experiences carried out by the APs seem to confirm these hypotheses. Finally, it must be mentioned that the demographic characteristics of the mining communities are another factor that influence the potential for change. Smaller communities show better conditions than the larger ones.

129. With regard to the mining policies, the program was able to introduce the issue of child labor in Ecuador's Indicative Plan on the National Mining Policy, in Bolivia's Mining Reactivation Plan, and in Peru's Law for the Promotion of Formalization and Sustainable Development of Small-Scale Mining.
130. In the respective chapter it was analyzed that the lasting effect of the withdrawal and prevention of child labor is in relation to the children's ages, the kind of work they perform, the mining community they belong to, and the actions of the local institutions and organizations. It must be mentioned that the sustainability of such changes also depends on the general environment, that is to say the progress made in the elimination of child labor in other mining communities. Such communities are not isolated; on the contrary there is a great mobility between them. In the case of Potosi, Llallagua and Tipuani the AP's worked in communities that are part of much larger mining complexes. If child labor eradication actions are not undertaken in the whole complex, it is very probable that the achieved outcomes are lost.

6.2 Lessons learnt

131. With regard to the program's design, the main lesson is that it is not convenient to aspire to generate sufficient capacity in the State toward the eradication of child labor when the institutional conditions in the social sector are weak and the political context is unstable. Under these conditions, it is convenient to propose more modest but more attainable objectives.
132. Additionally, it is fitting to design project with a minimum duration of four years as the project's implantation phase takes up at least half of the first year and the changes that must take place in the communities are complex and take at least three years.

²² The table in paragraph 23 summarizes the characteristics of the mining communities studied.

133. The experience has shown the convenience of executing transverse and regional APs that gather the richness of the execution of local APs and that at the same time produce materials and methodologies for general use. These programs should be executed from the start of a regional program.
134. The participation of the mining organizations in child labor eradication tasks is a key aspect to achieve this objective and to give it sustainability. The initial relation with such organizations is established mainly through the improvement of technology and the organization for production as this constitutes the heart of their interests and concerns. Santa Filomena's experience has demonstrated that the activities for technology improvement must be associated from the beginning with goals and actions aimed at eliminating child labor from the mineral exploitation tasks. Additionally, the improvement of the health and educational services is also a concern of the mining organizations and an opening that makes it possible to introduce the child labor issue in the communities' agenda. The work carried out in Bella Rica demonstrates that some mining organizations are capable of contributing substantially to the improvement of educational services and through that to contribute to the elimination of child labor. ISAT's experience, on the other hand, shows that occupational health is another issue that concerns the mining organizations and that at the same time makes it possible to raise the child labor issue in the community. In any case, the involvement of the mining organizations with the specific purpose, but not the only one, of eliminating child labor, is key to the project's development and should therefore have a main position in the programming and in the programs' resources.
135. Given the great importance that the base line has for the execution of the APs, it was learnt that the adequate resources, time and technical assistance must be available for its proper execution. If possible, it should be prepared before the execution of the program.
136. It was learnt that the implantation of community monitoring systems is complex and takes more time and effort than the program had calculated. With the experience acquired the coming programs can develop more efficient, effective and sustainable monitoring systems.
137. With regard to the awareness raising component, it was learnt that the APs need to have a well supported communication strategy. Careful attention should be given to the relationship with the media as the experience has shown that they tend to transmit news that shock the public opinion and can therefore endanger the relation between the NGOs and the mining communities. The products prepared by Comunicadores Asociados are a good sample of the specific lessons learnt in this field during the program's execution.

7. Recommendations

138. The most important recommendation is to start a systematization process of the experiences in order to prepare material that can disseminate in a detailed, systematic and complete way the knowledge obtained. As was mentioned before, the *paper on good practices* is not the most adequate tool to achieve this purpose. It is suggested that a manual is prepared where, based on that document, the instruments, software and materials produced by the APs are included and which other institutions can use in new projects. It would also be convenient to include the program's strategy, the basic definitions used, the methodology and instruments used to draw the base line, the materials to raise the children's and adults' awareness, and the monitoring software, among other essential elements. It is suggested that such manual makes a difference between the strategies used to fight child labor in different age groups since, as analyzed, the problems and solutions differ when dealing with children under 14 or over 14. Finally, it is advisable to design practical transference mechanisms for such knowledge, that is, who, how and at what cost technical assistance can be offered to the institutions interested in replicating the experiences.
139. It is also recommended to perform an exhaustive analysis of the regional and local indicators used in the program. Such analysis would enable to build an array of proven indicators to help in the programs' management.
140. Another recommendation is to continue financing specific aspects of the less mature experiences so that at some point they will actually become models such as the Santa Filomena and Bella Rica AP's.
141. Once the child labor issue is introduced in the three countries' mining policies, it is convenient to progress in the identification of specific child labor eradication activities that the ministries of mining could execute as part of their regular activities and using -their own resources.
142. It is recommended to analyze the capabilities the new child laws in Latin America give to the policy drafting and rights defense bodies in order to look for a rationale for community monitoring. Many of those laws promote decentralization and dispose municipal and local action to enforce the children's rights. These laws should be examined as a whole together with the labor regulations and, taking into account the social context of child labor in small-scale mining, establish the best legal and institutional framework options for the monitoring.

8. Annex

LIST OF PEOPLE INTERVIEWED AND PARTICIPANTS IN FOCUS GROUPS

BOLIVIA

La Paz

María Elena Reyes	Administrative Assistant IPEC
Nancy Poppe	Coordinator CEPTI
Mari-Noel Choquette	Volunteer CECI
Rodolfo Eróstegui	Deputy Minister of Labor
Rouzena Suazo	CARE Bolivia
Yvan Crepeau	Director REFORMIN Project
María Cristina Ramírez	Child Rights Official - UNICEF
Eliodo Sandi	Ministry of Mining
Darío Alanoca	Coordinator AP Capacity Building

Potosí

Program staff

Cecilia Molina	Coordinator NATS CEPROMIN
Claudia Ricaldi	AP Coordinator
Geri Vargas	Medical Doctor

Focus group: Adults

Mario Bravo	Representative Cooperativa Caracoles
Leonardo López	Representative Cooperativa 26 de Marzo
Clementina Guisa	Representative Cooperativa Caracoles
Fabián Arano	Representative Cooperativa 26 de Marzo
Paulina	Official Palliris Association
Emiliana Tumiri	Representative Cooperativa 26 de Marzo

Focus group: Adolescents

Jhony Bejarano

Final evaluation: Program for the prevention and progressive elimination of child labor in small scale traditional gold mining in South America. Phase II

Elio Pinto

Juan Carlos Villaroel

Abel Ramos

Beatriz Islas Cruz

Wilson Islas

Antonia Huarache

Leonor Cruz

Vanesa Coro

Iris Coro

Javier Parara

Gonzalo Quispe

Mauricio Flores

Llallagua

Program Staff

Cecilia Molina

Coordinator NATS CEPROMIN

Claudia Ricaldi

AP Coordinator

Freddy Quispe

Medical Doctor

Kety Ortega

Health expert

Maria Guarayo

Nurse

Vladimir Cruz

Expert in Productive Units

Focus Group: Adolescents

Romina Quispe

U.E. 1º de Mayo

Wilfredo Santos

SENTEC

Kelvin Fuentes

U.E. Siglo XX

Jonther Fernández

U.E. Siglo XX

Juan M. López

U.E. Siglo XX

Daniel Romero

SENTEC

Teachers of Educational Units (U.E.)

Amelia Claros

U.E. Franz Tamayo

Sandra Acevedo

U.E. Libertad

Final evaluation: Program for the prevention and progressive elimination of child labor in small scale traditional gold mining in South America. Phase II

Efraín García	U.E. Bolivia
Gregorio Serrano	U.E. 1º de Mayo
Humberto Ledesma	U.E. Siglo XX

Members of Health Committee

René Hurtado
Helena Sola

Field visit and informal interviews with members of the following workshops: mechanics, garments and shoe making.

Tipuani

Program staff	
Mario Luna	AP Coordinator
Carmiña Antesala	Accountant MEDMIN
Carola Soruco	Social worker AP

ECUADOR

Quito

Program staff	
Gustavo Guerra	Director DyA
Maró Guerrero	Coordinator Child Labor Area
Bladimir Chicaiza	IPEC
Mónica Zambrano	Director PMT
Alexandra Bonilla	Coordinator AP Capacity Building
Alfredo Sebastia	Director Mining Chamber
Galo Romoleroux	Former Deputy Secretary of Mining

Bella Rica

Víctor Narváez	AP Coordinator
Rosa Reyes	Former Ponce Enríquez Major
Fernando Vélez	Manager Cooperativa Bella Rica

Association of Bella Rica Ladies

Janet Vivanco

María Mendieta

Pilar Sánchez

Focus group: Adolescents and Young People

Pablo Chiquimarca

José Vásquez

Mario Quezada

Darwin Torres

Carlos Chávez

Ángel Sinche

Group of Gold workers

Teresa Abad

María Chamba

Dora Labanda

José Ordóñez

Luz Pesantez

Bárbara Chalán

María Torres

PERU

Lima

IPEC Lima

César Mosquera

Project Director

Rocío Valencia

Program Officer

Carmen Moreno

ILO Regional Specialist on CL

Eduardo Araujo

Programming Officer ILO

Elena Saura

IPEC Sub-regional Coordinator

Patricia Villegas

Financial Assistant IPEC

Staff of partners and implementing agencies

María Katia Romero	AP coordinator in Santa Filomena
Anita Luján	ISAT (coordinator AP Occupational Health)
Liliana Berth	Comunicadores y Asociados
Carmen Cabrera	Comunicadores y Asociados
Nora Cárdenas	Comunicadores y Asociados
Javier Ruiz	MIMDES
Isaac Ruiz	CECIP
Yolanda Erazo	Director of Child Protection (Min. of Labor)
Doris Portocarrero	GIN
Felix Hrushka	GAMA Project
Manuel Reinoso	AMASUC

La Rinconada

León Quispe	AP Coordinator
Ernesto García	Director World Learning
Elio Rosel	Coordinator RIEL (former Counsellor Puno)
Flora Yucra	Member Miners Association La Rinconada

Meeting with members of RIEL network

Santa Filomena

Laureano Huamani	President SOTRAMI Company
Héctor Chávez	Manager SOTRAMI Company

Focus group: Adults

Doris Huanta	Association Women Entrepreneurs
Flabia Condori	President Assoc. Women Entrepreneurs
Gloria Vásquez	Association Women Entrepreneurs
Benancia Bautista	Association Women Entrepreneurs
Víctor Hurtado	SOTRAMI
Ubaldo Huamani	SOTRAMI